

国民政府 西藏政策的 实践与检讨

(1927~1949)

徐百永 著

A Research on
the Implementation
and Review of
the Nationalist
Government's

Tibet Policies,
1927-1949



社会科学文献出版社
SOCIAL SCIENCES ACADEMIC PRESS (CHINA)

徐百永
著

国民政府 西藏政策的 实践与检讨 (1927~1949)

A Research on
the Implementation
and Review of
the Nationalist
Government's

Tibet Policies,
1927-1949



社会科学文献出版社
SOCIAL SCIENCES ACADEMIC PRESS (CHINA)

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

国民政府西藏政策的实践与检讨: 1927 ~ 1949/徐百永著.
—北京: 社会科学文献出版社, 2013. 7
ISBN 978 - 7 - 5097 - 4364 - 5

I. ①国… II. ①徐… III. ①民国政府 - 民族政策 - 研究 - 西藏 - 1927 ~ 1949 IV. ①G693. 72

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字 (2013) 第 070152 号

国民政府西藏政策的实践与检讨 (1927 ~ 1949)

著 者 / 徐百永

出 版 人 / 谢寿光

出 版 者 / 社会科学文献出版社

地 址 / 北京市西城区北三环中路甲 29 号院 3 号楼华龙大厦

邮政编码 / 100029

责任部门 / 皮书出版中心 (010) 59367127

责任编辑 / 高振华

电子信箱 / pishubu@ssap.cn

责任校对 / 王伟涛

项目统筹 / 高振华

责任印制 / 岳 阳

经 销 / 社会科学文献出版社营销中心 (010) 59367081 59367089

读者服务 / 读者服务中心 (010) 59367028

印 装 / 北京鹏润伟业印刷有限公司

开 本 / 787mm × 1092mm 1/16

印 张 / 22.25

版 次 / 2013 年 7 月第 1 版


字 数 / 353 千字

印 次 / 2013 年 7 月第 1 次印刷

书 号 / ISBN 978 - 7 - 5097 - 4364 - 5

定 价 / 65.00 元

本书如有破损、缺页、装订错误, 请与本社读者服务中心联系更换

 版权所有 翻印必究

摘 要

西藏地处我国西南边疆，自元代被正式纳入中国版图以来，历代中央王朝和政府均十分重视对西藏的管辖和治理，尤其是清政府形成了一整套管理西藏事务的体系。但是至清末时，随着清王朝的日益衰败，英国对西藏发动了侵略战争，将西藏裹挟进近代西方殖民体系之中。在此历史背景下，清王朝在全国推行新政改革，并意图强化对西藏等边疆地区的治理，实现边疆与内地的政治一体化。然而，在此过程中，西藏地方与中央政府的关系却逐渐疏离。1911年辛亥革命爆发，西藏地方将清中央驻藏大臣、驻军以及汉人尽数逐出西藏，致使形成了西藏地方与中央隔离的严重局面。西藏地方与中央的政治关系首次处于一种不正常的状态。至1927年南京国民政府成立时，这种局面仍未改变。南京国民政府曾经制定了政治、经济、教育、宗教等方面的一系列政策，力图消除这种隔离局面，恢复中央对藏原有的政治统属关系。但是，经过20余年的努力，国民政府除维持住了对藏主权之外，对藏治权的施行与清代相比已不可同日而语。

本书分以下部分：

绪论阐述了本研究的选题意义，介绍了本研究的资料情况，并对学术界的研究现状进行了简单的回顾和总结，最后叙述了本书的研究方法和研究内容。

第一章叙述了辛亥革命后民国政府对西藏事务的处理。内容包括民国政府对西藏变乱的因应及为“规复旧制”所进行的努力；本部分还阐述了民国政府的治藏政策，包括确定西藏在中华民国内的法律地位，成立专门的中央机构——蒙藏事务局和蒙藏院，专司蒙藏事务。

第二章主要介绍国民政府处理边疆问题的基本政策，叙述国民政府的



西藏政策，内容包括：根本大法确定西藏的地位，沿袭和修订清代治边法律；在西藏谋求推行训政和地方自治，培养西藏的训政人才，追求民族平等等等。

第三章至第六章，以时间为序，分四个阶段阐述了国民政府治藏政策的实施情况。

在第三章，本书阐述了国民政府成立了辖理西藏等边疆事务的中央机构——蒙藏委员会。该机构制定了训政时期的施政纲领，并积极筹备西藏会议；国民政府撤销了前代中央政府所设的驻藏办事长官，并积极派员赴藏联络和宣慰，沟通汉藏感情，并促成西藏在内地设立办事处，使得西藏地方与中央的关系在一定程度上得到改善。

第四章重点论述了抗战前国民政府治藏政策实施的曲折过程。康藏纠纷的发生终结了国民政府与西藏地方之间改善关系的进程。在处理康藏纠纷事务的过程中，国民政府基本上奉行着和平调解的策略。在此期间，十三世达赖喇嘛圆寂，国民政府派遣黄慕松入藏册封和致祭，在一定程度上增进了双方关系。为进一步解决西藏问题，国民政府确定了以有限武力护送九世班禅和平返藏的政策，意图借助班禅返藏，实现中央对西藏地方的有效控制和治理。但是由于英国支持下的西藏地方政府反对仪仗队入藏，而造成班禅返藏功败垂成。

第五章探讨了抗战时期国民政府对藏治权的部分恢复与政策的调整。国民政府派遣吴忠信入藏，主持了十四世达赖喇嘛的认定和坐床，在较大程度上恢复了对藏治权，并在藏设立了正式的中央机构（蒙藏委员会驻藏办事处）。但好景不长，达札摄政后开始背离亲善中央的政策，阻修中印公路，擅设“外交局”，酿成西藏地方与中央对峙的僵持局面。此种形势促使双方调整政策，局势得到缓和；为巩固边疆和维护国家的统一，蒋介石发表了《中国之命运》一书，提出了民族“一源论”的主张，表现出国民政府对西藏等边疆政策的新思路。

第六章重点探讨了抗战胜利后国民政府治藏政策的实施情况。战后，国民政府拟赋予西藏“高度自治”，将之纳入战后中国的宪政轨道，但最终无果而终。在此期间，国民政府处理热振事件的表现凸显其政策的失当与无奈，对其治藏全局产生深远影响，并在一定程度上促成“驱汉事件”

发生。“驱汉事件”标志着国民政府西藏政策实践的终结。

第七章至第九章为本书的专题部分，分别从国民政府对藏宗教政策、经济贸易政策、教育政策等方面，横向考察了国民政府治藏政策的实施情况。

第七章论述了国民政府治藏宗教政策。本章阐述了国民政府对藏传佛教的管理政策，考察了在维持政教合一制还是实施政教分离问题上，国民政府在政策层面上进行的诸多考量；论述了国民政府熬茶布施政策的实施状况。此外，本章还从汉僧事务的视角分析了国民政府鼓励汉藏宗教文化交流，促进汉藏感情，消除隔阂的政策。

第八章叙述了国民政府对西藏的经济贸易政策。本章介绍了经济贸易政策实施的背景，叙述了国民政府在改善双方经贸联系所做的种种努力，并以“康茶筹藏”为例叙述了政策的落实情况。

第九章主要论述了国民政府的西藏教育政策。本章考察了国民政府的边疆教育政策在西藏的实施情况，着重探讨了国立拉萨小学的创办及演变状况，并对国民政府治藏教育政策的实践情况进行了反思。

第十章为本研究的结语部分。本章对国民政府时期的西藏政策及其实施情况进行总结和反思。在总体肯定国民政府治藏政策实施效果的基础上，认为此政策具有较为浓厚的传统治边政策的印迹，进而指出国民政府缺乏“自治藏政策”；并分析了国民政府治藏政策难以落实的主要因素，以及政策实践机制和治边人才方面存在的诸多局限性。

Abstract

Tibet lies in the borderland of southwest China. All the past dynastic central governments have attached great importance to the administration and governance of Tibet since it formally became a part of China during the Yuan Dynasty. The Qing government in particular, formed a complete governing system for Tibet. However, during the declining late Qing period, the British invaded Tibet, and brought Tibet into the western-dominated modern colonial system. The Qing government tried to strengthen the governance of Tibet and other borderlands and to realize integration of borderlands and inlands through reform, but resulted in the further alienation of Tibet from the central government. After the Revolution of 1911, the High Commissioner, Qing government's army and the Han people were all expelled from Tibet. This led to the serious separation between Tibet and the central government, thus an abnormal political relationship appeared for the first time. The Nanking Nationalist Government's establishment in 1927 brought no change. The Nanking government constituted a series of political, economic, cultural and religious policies to eliminate this separation and resume Tibet's subordination to the central government. However, after more than 20 years' efforts, while sovereignty over Tibet was maintained, the Nanking government's administrative power over the region was much weaker than during the Qing period.

This book contains the following parts:

Introduction contains research purpose, literature review, research

methods and the outline of the whole book.

Chapter 1 illustrates the newly founded Nationalist Government's governing of Tibet after the 1911 Revolution. This part includes the Nationalist government's dealings with the Tibet Rebellion and its efforts to "resume the old rule". The Nationalist Government defined Tibet's legal status as a part of China, and established two special agencies in charge of Mongolian and Tibetan affairs—the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Bureau and the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Department.

Chapter 2 introduces the Nationalist Government's basic borderland policies and its policies toward Tibet. They defined Tibet's legal status through the basic law, revised Qing's borderland laws, implemented self-governance, trained Tibetans for political tutelage, and pursued ethnic equality.

Chapters 3 to 6 illustrate the Nationalist Government's Tibet policies over four periods.

Chapter 3 is about the establishment of the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission, a central government agency in charge of Tibetan and other borderlands affairs. This agency drew up policy guidelines for the political tutelage and actively arranged Tibetan Conference. The Nationalist Government eliminated the official positions set up by previous administrations, and sent commissioners to Tibet to foster friendship. Tibetan offices were set up inland. The relationship between Tibet and the central government improved to some extent.

Chapter 4 discusses the difficult implementation of the Nationalist Government's Tibetan policies on the eve of the Sino – Japanese War. The Xikang-Tibet dispute was peacefully settled. At the time of the death of 13th Dalai Lama, Huang Musong was sent to Tibet to confer upon him an honorary title and to attend funerary ceremonies, which resulted in the improvement of bilateral relations. The Nationalist government decided to escort 9th Banchan Lama back to Tibet with a small military contingent to resume effective control and governance of Tibet. However, supported by the British government,



The Local Tibetan government refused to let the honor guards enter Tibet. Banchan Lama's return turned out to be a failure.

Chapter 5 discusses the partial resumption of and adjustment to the Nationalist Government's administrative power over Tibet during the Sino - Japanese War. Wu Zhongxin was sent to Tibet to preside over the affirmation and inauguration of the 14th Dalai Lama, and the Tibet office of the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission was set up in Tibet. Good time didn't last long, however After Taktra Rimpoche came into power, the pro-central government policies was abandoned. Tibet government obstructed the construction of the Sino-Indian Road and set up the so-called "Foreign Affairs Bureau", which resulted in the confrontation and stalemate in Tibet's relations with the central government. To ease the situation, Chiang Kai-shek published *China's Destiny*, and put forward new thinking on solving ethnic problems—"Theory of Common Ancestry" theory.

Chapter 6 is about the implementation of the Nationalist Government's Tibetan policies after the Sino - Japanese War. After the war, the Nationalist Government planned to offer Tibet "High Degree Autonomy", and bring Tibet to constitutionalism, but this ended with no result. The improper dealing of the Radreng Incident had far-reaching effects on the overall Tibetan policy, and partly led to the "Expelling Han People Incident", which marked the end of the Nationalist Government's execution of its Tibet policies.

Chapters 7 to 9 cover special topics, including the Nationalist Government's religious, economic and educational policies toward Tibet.

Chapter 7 discusses the religious policy. The Nationalist Government attached much importance to whether adopt the unification or the separation of monastery and state in Tibet. The implementation of the Tea Brewing and Donation Policy, the management of Tibetan Buddhism and the policy of encouraging Han-Tibetan religious exchanges to promote mutual understanding and to eliminate estrangement are discussed in this chapter.

Chapter 8 is about the Nationalist Government's economic and trade

policies toward Tibet. This chapter introduces the background of the economic and trade policies, illustrates the Nationalist Government's efforts to improve bilateral economic and trade relations, and discusses the implementation of the policy using "selling Xikang Tea to Tibet" as a case study.

Chapter 9 discusses the Nationalist Government's educational policies toward Tibet. This chapter investigates the implementation of the Nationalist Government's borderland educational policies in Tibet. The establishment and development of National Lhasa Primary School is also an important topic.

Chapter 10 is the concluding chapter. This chapter summarizes and examines the Nationalist's Tibet policies and their implementation. While generally speaking, the policies are positive and constructive, there do exist remarkable traces of traditional borderland policies. The Nationalist government had no governing Tibet policy of its own. This Chapter analyzes the main factors hindering the implementation of the Nationalist Government's Tibet policy, including the limitations to implementation mechanism and personnel recruitment.



目 录

绪 论	1
第一章 西藏变乱善后与民国政府治藏政策	11
第一节 西藏变乱和民国政府的因应之策	11
第二节 “规复旧制”的尝试——和谈	17
第三节 民国政府对西藏政策的制定与实施	21
第二章 国民政府成立后治藏的基本原则	27
第一节 国民政府边疆政策的确定	28
第二节 国民政府初步制定西藏政策	32
第三章 国民政府治藏政策的初步实施及与西藏地方关系的改善	41
第一节 国民政府设立边政机构	41
第二节 驻藏办事长官的撤销	47
第三节 西藏会议的筹备与失败	49
第四节 派员赴藏与西藏驻内地办事机构的成立	61
第四章 抗战前国民政府治藏政策的实施	71
第一节 1930年代康藏纠纷与国民政府的对策	71



第二节	十三世达赖喇嘛圆寂与黄慕松入藏致祭	84
第三节	九世班禅返藏与国民政府治藏政策的局限性	102
第五章	抗战时期国民政府对西藏治权的部分恢复与政策的调整	123
第一节	吴忠信入藏主持十四世达赖喇嘛的坐床典礼	123
第二节	达札活佛摄政与国民政府治藏政策的调整	140
第三节	《中国之命运》的出版与国民政府治藏政策的调整	162
第六章	抗战胜利后国民政府的治藏政策	171
第一节	“高度自治”抑或地方自治	171
第二节	热振事件与国民政府治藏政策实施的失误	187
第三节	“驱汉事件”与国民政府治藏政策实施的终结	197
第七章	国民政府治藏宗教政策及实施	204
第一节	国民政府对藏传佛教的政策	204
第二节	政教合一, 抑或政教分离	213
第三节	政治运用下的熬茶布施政策	227
第四节	“从宗教上以推动政治”: 对藏宗教政策视野下的汉僧事务	238
第八章	国民政府治藏经济贸易政策及实施	252
第一节	国民政府治藏经济贸易政策的制定及其实施	252
第二节	“一线牵合之力”: 国民政府的“康茶筹藏”政策	264
第三节	关于国民政府治藏经济贸易政策的简评	272
第九章	国民政府治藏教育政策及实践	273
第一节	国民政府治藏教育政策的制定及实施	273
第二节	国民政府时期的国立拉萨小学及其创办之意义	283
第三节	关于国民政府治藏教育政策的反思	299

第十章 关于国民政府治藏政策实施的检讨·····	304
第一节 特殊历史场域下的国民政府西藏政策·····	304
第二节 国民政府治藏政策实践的限制条件·····	309
第三节 事权分散的政策实践机制·····	315
第四节 余论·····	324
参考文献·····	327
后 记·····	337

Contents

Foreword	/ 1
Chapter 1 Tibet Rebellion and Tibetan Policies of the Republic of China	/ 11
Section I Tibet Rebellion and the Response of the Republic of China	/ 11
Section II The Efforts to “Resume the Old Rule”: Peace Negotiations	/ 17
Section III The Formulation and Practice of Tibetan Policies	/ 21
Chapter 2 The Nationalist Government’s Basic Policies toward Tibet	/ 27
Section I The Nationalist Government’s Borderland Policies	/ 28
Section II The Initial Drafting of Tibetan Policies by the Nationalist Government	/ 32
Chapter 3 Preliminary Implementation of Tibetan Policies and the Improvement in the relationship between the Nationalist Government and Tibet	/ 41
Section I The Establishment of Agencies in Charge of Borderland Affairs	/ 41
Section II The Elimination of the Resident Commissioner in Tibet	/ 47
Section III The Preparation for and Failure of Tibetan Conference	/ 49

Section IV	Sending Delegates to Tibet and Establishing Department of Tibetan Affairs Inland	/ 61
Chapter 4	The Difficult Implementation of the Nationalist Government's Tibetan Policy at the Eve of Sino – Japan	/ 71
Section I	The Xikang – Tibet Dispute during the 1930s and the Nationalist Government's Policy Responses	/ 71
Section II	The Parinirvana of the 13th Dalai Lama and Huang Musong's attendance of Funeraries Ceremonies representing the Nationalist Government	/ 84
Section III	Escorting the Ninth Banchan Lama back to Tibet and the Limitation of Tibetan Policy	/ 102
Chapter 5	The Partial Resumption of and Adjustment to the Nationalist Government's Administrative Power over Tibet during the Sino – Japanese War	/ 123
Section I	Sending Wu Zhongxin to Tibet to Preside over the Affirmation and Inauguration of the 14th Dalai Lama	/ 123
Section II	Taktra Rimpoche Acting as Regent and the Adjustment to Tibet Policies	/ 140
Section III	<i>China's Destiny</i> and the Tibet Policies of the Nationalist Government	/ 162
Chapter 6	The Implementation of the Nationalist Government's Tibetan Policies after the Sino – Japanese War	/ 171
Section I	“High Degree Autonomy” or Local Autonomy	/ 171
Section II	The Radreng Incident and the Improper Dealing of the Nationalist Government	/ 187



Section III	“The Expelling Han People Incident” and the End of Nationalist Government’s Tibetan Policies	/ 197
Chapter 7	Nationalist Government’s Religions Policy Toward Tibet	/ 204
Section I	Nationalist Government’s Buddhist Policy toward Tibet	/ 204
Section II	Unification or separation of Monastery and State in Tibet	/ 213
Section III	The Tea Brewing and Donation Policy as a Political Tactic	/ 227
Section IV	Promoting Politics using Religious Policy; Han Monks Affairs from the Perspective of Nationalist Government’s Religious Policy towards Tibet	/ 238
Chapter 8	The Nationalist Government’s Economic and Trade Policies toward Tibet	/ 252
Section I	The Formulation of Economic and Trade Policies toward Tibet	/ 252
Section II	“a Faint Force to Maintain”: the policy of “Selling Kham Tea to Tibet” of the Nationalist Government	/ 264
Section III	Commentary on The Nationalist Government’s Economic and Trade Policies toward Tibet	/ 272
Chapter 9	The Nationalist Government’s Educational Policies toward Tibet	/ 273
Section I	The Formulation of the Educational Policies toward Tibet	/ 273
Section II	The Primary School of Lhasa and its Significance	/ 283
Section III	Reflection on the Educational Policy toward Tibet	/ 299

Chapter 10	A Review on the Implementation of Nationalist Government's Policies toward Tibet	/ 304
Section I	The Nationalist Government's Tibet Policies against Special Historical Background	/ 304
Section II	The Restrictive Conditions on the Implementation of the Nationalist Government's Tibet Policies	/ 309
Section III	The Decentralized Management System of Policy Implementation	/ 315
Section IV	Conclusion	/ 324
References		/ 327
Postscript		/ 337