

明清"封建论"研究

田勤耘 著



D691 115

明清"封建论"研究

田勤耘 著





中国社会科学出版社

D691

014033888

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

明清"封建论"研究/田勤耘著.一北京:中国社会科学出版社, 2013.7

(中南财经政法大学青年学术文库)

ISBN 978 -7 -5161 -3070 -4

I. ①明··· II. ①田··· III. ①封建制度 - 研究 - 中国 - 明清时代 IV. ①D691

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字(2013)第 178652 号

出版人 赵剑英 责任编辑 李 是 责任校对 韩海超 责任印制 王炳图

出 版 中国社会4年出版社

社 址 北京鼓楼西大街甲 158 号 (邮编 100720)

网 址 http://www.csspw.cn

中文域名: 中国社科网 010-64070619

发 行 部 010-84083685

门市部 010-84029450

经 销 新华书店及其他书店

印 刷 北京奥隆印刷厂

装 订 北京市兴怀印刷厂版 次 2013 年 7 月第 1 版

印 次 2013年7月第1次印刷

开 本 710×1000 1/16

印 张 19.75

插 页 2

字 数 335 千字

定 价 59.00元

凡购买中国社会科学出版社图书,如有质量问题请与本社联系调换 电话: 010-64009791 版权所有 侵权必究

《中南财经政法大学青年学术文库》 编辑委员会

主 任: 吴汉东

副主任: 郭道扬 刘可风 方世荣

委 员: 王金秀 刘后振 刘胜湘 朱新蓉

许家林 张新国 李剑波 李道荣

苏少之 陈景良 姚 莉 胡贤鑫

徐双敏 曹新明 黄志伟 葛翔宇

董邦俊

主 编: 刘可风

总 序

一个没有思想活动和缺乏学术氛围的大学校园,哪怕它在物质上再美丽、再现代,在精神上也是荒凉和贫瘠的。欧洲历史上最早的大学就是源于学术。大学与学术的关联不仅体现在字面上,更重要的是,思想与学术,可谓大学的生命力与活力之源。

中南财经政法大学是一所学术气氛浓郁的财经政法类高等学府。范文澜、嵇文甫、潘梓年、马哲民等一代学术宗师播撒的学术火种,五十多年来一代代薪火相传。世纪之交,在合并组建新校而揭开学校发展新的历史篇章的时候,学校确立了"学术兴校,科研强校"的发展战略。这不仅是对学校五十多年学术文化与学术传统的历史性传承,而且是谱写 21 世纪学校发展新篇章的战略性手笔。

"学术兴校,科研强校"的"兴"与"强",是奋斗目标,更是奋斗过程。我们是目的论与过程论的统一论者。我们将对宏伟目标的追求过程寓于脚踏实地的奋斗过程之中。由学校斥资资助出版《中南财经政法大学青年学术文库》,就是学校采取的具体举措之一。

本文库的指导思想或学术旨趣,首先在于推出学术精品。通过资助出版学术精品,形成精品学术成果的园地,培育精品意识和精品氛围,以提高学术成果的质量和水平,为繁荣国家财经、政法、管理以及人文科学研究,解决党和国家面临的重大经济、社会问题,作出我校应有的贡献。其次,培养学术队伍,特别是通过对一批处在"成长期"的中青年学术骨干的成果予以资助推出,促进学术梯队的建设,提高学术队伍的实力与水平。再次,培育学术特色。通过资助出版在学术思想、学术方法以及学术见解等方面有独到和创新之处的科研成果,培育科研特色,以形成有我校特色的学术流派与学术思想体系。因此,本文库重点面向中青年,重点面

向精品, 重点面向原创性学术专著。

春华秋实。让我们共同来精心耕种文库这块学术园地,让学术果实挂满枝头,让思想之花满园飘香。

2009年10月

Preface

A university campus, if it holds no intellectual activities or possesses no academic atmosphere, no matter how physically beautiful or modern it is, it would be spiritually desolate and barren. In fact, the earliest historical European universities started from academic learning. The relationship between a university and the academic learning cannot just be interpreted literally, but more importantly, it should be set on the ideas and academic learning which are the so—called sources of the energy and vitality of all universities.

Zhongnan University of Economics and Law is a high education institution which enjoys rich academic atmosphere. Having the academic germs seeded by such great masters as Fanwenlan, Jiwenfu, Panzinian and Mazhemin, generations of scholars and students in this university have been sharing the favorable academic atmosphere and making their own contributions to it, especially during the past fifty – five years. As a result, at the beginning of the new century when a new historical new page is turned over with the combination of Zhongnan University of Finance and Economics and Zhongnan University of Politics and Law, the newly established university has set its developing strategy as "Making the University Prosperous with academic learning; Strengthening the University with scientific research", which is not only a historical inheritance of more than fifty years of academic culture and tradition, but also a strategic decision which is to lift our university onto a higher developing stage in the 21st century.

Our ultimate goal is to make the university prosperous and strong, even through our struggling process, in a greater sense. We tend to unify the destination and the process as to combine the pursuing process of our magnificent goal with the practical struggling process. The youth's Academic Library of Zhongnan University of Economics and Law, funded by the university, is one of our specif-

ic measures.

The guideline or academic theme of this Library lies first at promoting the publishing of selected academic works. By funding them, an academic garden with high - quality fruits can come into being. We should also make great efforts to form the awareness and atmosphere of selected works and improve the quality and standard of our academic productions, so as to make our own contributions in developing such fields as finance, economics, politics, law and literate humanity, as well as in working out solutions for major economic and social problems facing our country and the Communist Party. Secondly, our aim is to form some academic teams, especially through funding the publishing of works of the middle - aged and young academic cadreman, to boost the construction of academic teams and enhance the strength and standard of our academic groups. Thirdly, we aim at making a specific academic field of our university. By funding those academic fruits which have some original or innovative points in their ideas, methods and views, we expect to engender our own characteristic in scientific research. Our final goal is to form an academic school and establish an academic idea system of our university through our efforts. Thus, this Library makes great emphases particularly on the middle - aged and young people, selected works, and original academic monographs.

Sowing seeds in the spring will lead to a prospective harvest in the autumn. Thus, let us get together to cultivate this academic garden and make it be opulent with academic fruits and intellectual flowers.

direction of the substitution of the substitut

中文摘要

周秦之际乃天下一大变局,政制由分割之封建而归于统一之郡县,政体由贵族之分权而改为君主之专制,士侯士卿之贵族世袭则变为中央任免的流官制,特定的中国"封建时代"基本终结。但自秦汉以来,历代政治家、史学家大都看重封建与郡县之区别,认定这是前后两种不同的政制,围绕封建及相关问题的争论,即本书所说的封建论,自秦至清始终不断。

封建原本只是实行于周代的一种政治制度,为什么到了明清时期,当时的学者、思想家依然热衷于这一问题的探讨?他们通常从什么角度来谈论此一问题?他们提出了哪些问题,解决了哪些问题?他们封建论的背后又反映了怎样的现实关怀?这些正是本书作者所关注的问题。

本书由绪论、六章和结语八部分组成。绪论部分探讨"封建"、"郡县"的概念及封建与郡县之争的由来,同时梳理了学界已有研究成果。第一章追溯了明清以前的封建论。其中又分为宋代以前的封建论及宋代封建论。检视这一时期封建论的发展轨迹,可见封建论由先前的体制之争逐渐转变为郡县制下"道统"对于"政统"的一种思想批判武器。秦汉以降及至隋唐,封建制相对于郡县制虽已式微,但时有反复,尤其是汉初及魏晋时期,因此,总的来讲,这一时期的封建论更多的是一种体制之论,即从"治道"角度分析封建与郡县两种体制哪种更加有利于维护君主统治。宋代,随着理学兴起,理学家为重建人间秩序而推崇"三代之治",封建因之成为"三代圣人"治天下之大器。理学家往往以"道统"的承继者自任,从而展开对以君主为核心的"政统"的批判。

第二章探讨明代初期的封建论。明初封建论基本上是一种支持与反对 封建的现实政策之论。明初朱元璋迫于当时的政治军事形势,为防范北元 势力和西北边患及巩固全国的统治,分封诸子为王,并给予诸王行政与军 事大权。然而朱元璋死后不久即爆发了"靖难之役"及汉王朱高煦叛乱等 几起藩王反叛事件。明初封建论正是在这样的大背景下展开的。为巩固新 生政权,有论者主张封建,以为封建内可笃亲亲之道,外可抵御北方强敌侵扰,方可成磐石之固。而与此同时亦有论者反对封建,以为封建易成尾大不掉之势,反而不利于朱明王朝的长治久安。

第三章探讨明代中叶的封建论。明中叶封建论以揭露和批判君主专制为鹄的。明朝建立后,朱元璋一面废丞相,设三司,一面实行分封制,大量分封藩王以"藩屏帝室"。朱棣夺取政权后继续推行削藩,藩王军事上尾大不掉之势基本解除,但到了明代中后期却导致一系列经济、社会问题,诸如庞大的宗禄问题、诸王宗室广占良田、宗室内部的叛乱倾轧及为害乡里等等。检视此时的封建论,尽管论者对待封建或支持,或反对,但他们无疑都围绕着明代君主专制,尤其是宗藩问题给社会所带来的无穷祸患而生发。这些论议多带理想政治色彩,唯其如此,其对此时君主专制的揭露和批判更显深刻。

第四章探讨明末清初的封建论。以明末清初为一个时段来进行考察,这时的封建论有两个主题,一是随着江南经济的发展,江南士大夫阶层中地方意识逐渐增长,从而导致基于对区域利益的认同及地方分权所生发之封建论;二是随着明王朝的灭亡及清王朝的兴起,大批明遗老遗少借助封建论,或从郡县制的本质,或从郡县制的制度设计层面对明亡清兴进行反思与检讨。由于上述经济的及政治的重大因素的影响,这一时期既是历史上讨论封建问题相对较为频繁,同时也是最为全面和深刻的时期。包括顾炎武、黄宗羲、王夫之、陆世仪及颜元在内的一大批思想家都参与其中。

第五章探讨清代中叶的封建论。清中叶的封建论更多的是对封建基于道义的同情与肯定。从顺治到康熙,已过去近八十年(1644—1722年),对明王朝的依恋渐渐被淡忘,人们的空间认同与种族认同,已经由汉族文明为中心的"大明帝国"扩展到了满、蒙、汉共同体的"大清帝国"。随着清王朝思想专制的日渐强化,整个知识阶层自己所拥有的独立空间已越来越小,于是在清中叶,尽管封建论者依旧在沿着宋以来士大夫阶层以知识权力对抗政治权力的路数在日渐狭窄的空间继续着自己的封建论,但这样的封建论多数显得比较隐晦,多是基于道义上的同情与肯定,如袁枚、刘鸿翱等,只有陆生楠、曾静等极少数论者敢于大胆直接倡言封建以对抗君主专制。

第六章探讨清代晚期的封建论。晚清时期,中国历史经历"三千年未有之变局",受此影响,此时的封建论带有明显的近代意识,更多地着眼

于地方分权与地方自治。面对晚清内忧外患的局势,尽管有论者着眼于封建"寓兵于农"的精意,主张封建以御外侮,但由于晚清日益深重的衰世症候及随之而来的太平天国运动使得地方乡绅重新活跃起来,在镇压太平天国运动的过程中督抚势力又得到膨胀,随之督抚专权,在活跃的地方乡绅支撑下,演出了地方主义的活剧,清末新政在西方地方自治思潮影响下又给登上政治舞台的乡绅们的活动披上了现代性的外衣。所有这一切都为这时的封建论打上了地方分权和自治的烙印。

结语部分就明清封建论的发展阶段、主要内容及其与中国传统文化之间深层次的关联作了初步探讨。笔者认为明清封建论在很大程度上凸显了儒家"道统"与"政统"之间的尖锐对立,封建论因其承载了儒家"公天下"的政治理想,而与代表法家政治理想实践的郡县制之间存在着根本的对立和冲突,封建论也因此成为以"道统"自居的士大夫阶层以知识权力对抗政治权力的思想武器。同时,君主专制制度之下绵延赓续的封建论对于郡县制种种弊端的揭露和批判对于我们现今社会仍然具有某种启迪和现实参考价值,例如如何处理中央与地方、集权与分权的关系,在社会治理中如何加强伦理道德建设,如何处理"法治"与"德治"的关系,等等。

关键词:明清;封建;郡县;封建论;君主专制

Abstract

The Zhou and Qin Dynasties were a time of great change. The administrative system underwent from the dividedness of feudal to the unity of prefecture-county system; the regime went from divided power among aristocrats to autocracy of the monarch; hereditary succession was replaced by appointment of the central government. The special "feudal period" of China virtually came to an end. Since the Qin and Han Dynasties, most statesmen and historians have laid importance to the distinction between feudal (feng-jian) and bureaucratic (jun-xian), seeing them as different systems of government. Disputes concerning feudal and its related issues never ceased to be between the Qin and the Qing Dynasties.

Feudal was merely a kind of political system practiced in the Zhou Dynasty. Then why did scholars, thinkers still interested in the discussion of this idea in the Ming and Qing Dynasties? From what angle did they usually talk about this issue? What questions were raised and solved? What realistic solicitude were reflected in their discussions? These are precisely the issues of concern in this book.

The book is composed of eight parts, including the introduction, six chapters and epilogue. The introduction part clarifies concepts such as feudal, bureaucratic, theory of feudalism, and offers information on the source and significance of the present study, related studies, research method adopted, the structure and creative points of the present study.

Chapter 1 is on the theory of feudalism before the Ming and Qing Dynasties which traces its source. The author holds that the Song Dynasty was a clear dividing point. The pre-Song theory of feudalism was basically disputes on political systems, which centred upon whether an how to confer titles of princes. In the Song Dynasty, as Neo-confucianism (rationalistic confusion philosophical

school) was rising, in which an ideal three-generation society was constructed with great care, feudalism, nine-square system (the farming system believed to have existed in China's slave society) and patriarchal ideology were considered as the essential features. The simple theory of system changed into arms of making attacks on social evils brought by the autocrat centralized politics.

Chapter 2 is about the theory of feudalism at the beginning of the Ming Dynasty. The theory of feudalism in the early Ming Dynasty is essentially a practical policy debate on the feudal system, which centers around how to consolidate the new regime. Some commentators have supported the feudal system, thought that the feudal system can consolidate the new regime and make it forever because it could not only allow rulers united, but also resist foreign invasion. At the same time, other commentators opposed the feudal system. They thought that the feudal system could easily lead to lost of control of the situation and was not conducive to long-term stability of the new regime.

Chapter 3 is about the theory of feudalism in the middle of the Ming Dynasty. In the mid and late Ming Dynasty, with the development of absolute monarchy to its peak, land acquisition had become increasingly serious, financial crisis had become more and more serious, peasant uprising took place one after another, whose scale expanded gradually, troubles on the frontier became more and more serious. During this period, some people opposed to the feudal system and supported the county system, while others were the opposite. There was no doubt that their discussion revolved around absolute monarchy and series of social problems caused by absolute monarchy. Their idealistic proposition was actually a criticism of social reality, especially an exposure and criticism of absolute monarchy in the Ming Dynasty.

Chapter 4 is about the theory of feudalism in the late Ming Dynasty and the early Qing Dynasty. In this period of, there are two main themes in the theory of feudalism. On the one hand, with the socio-economic diversity of Jiangnan, the public class continued to grow and formed an independent force. They enhanced the awareness of identity for the local regional interests, so they took the form of the theory of feudalism to express their growing localism, which evolved into a local decentralization thinking. On the other hand, with the demise of the Ming

Abstract 3

Dynasty and the rise of the Qing Dynasty, a large number of thinkers, historians and even ordinary public talked with reflections on the fundamental changes of Ming replacing Qing, a time when feudal was discussed relatively frequently and in a more comprehensive and profound way. The theory of feudalism at this time seemed to have become an outer vehicle for reflections on the social reality, containing many political, economic, military and cultural ideas.

Chapter 5 is about the theory of feudalism in the Mid-Qing Dynasty. At that time, the rule of the Qing Dynasty was on a consolidated base with the acceptance of middle-class officials and ordinary public, most of whom were in favor of bureaucratic rather than feudal. However, at the same time, the extreme autocratic monarchy was nurturing profound social crises under the surface stability. Under such circumstances, though talks about feudalism was strictly banned, thinkers represented by Yuan Mei, Liu Hongao, Zhuang Youke, Cui Mai still made voices in favor of feudal from different perspectives so as to criticize monarch autocracy. At the same time, Lu Shengnan, Zeng Jing, a very small number of commentators had the courage to directly proclaim the principles of the feudal in order to resist the absolute monarchy.

Chapter 6 is about the theory of feudalism in the later part of the Qing Dynasty. Faced with combined home crisis and foreign invasion, feudal was advocated from a new perspective—saving the country in resistance of foreign aggressors and repressing farmer uprisings by current personalities such as Liu Pei, Chen Qishu, Wen Tingshi, etc. In the period of the Heavenly State (tai-ping tian-guo), revival of local gentry, expansion of the power of governors-general and inspectors-general and the coming in of western thought of autonomy gave a western color to the theory of feudalism at that time. In the declining years of the Qing Dynasty, with the rising of anti-Manchu forces, Zhang Taiyan saw the positive side of feudal, attempting to realize his revolutionary ideal and to establish modern constitutional government with the aid of influential Han governors-general and inspectors-general. Later, Zhang shifted to be against feudal and an avid advocator of centralized state power out of consideration for practicing revolution ("Xin-Sheng") and maintaing national unity.

The conclusion is about the stage of development, the main content of the

theory of feudalism in the Ming and Qing Dynasties, the deep-rooted association between the theory of feudalism and the traditional Chinese culture. The author believes that the theory of feudalism in the Ming and Qing dynasties to a certain degree was a reflection of the acute conflicts between Leagalist institutional culture and Confucian classic teachings. At the same time, the theory of feudalism in the Ming and Qing still have some kind of inspiration and practical reference value for our society today, such as how to deal with the relationship between the central and local governments and the relationship between centralization and decentralization, how to strengthen the ethical construction of social governance, and how to deal with the relations between "rule of law" and "rule of virtue".

Key words: Ming and Qing Dynasties; feudal; bureaucratic; the theory of feudalism; absolute monarchy

目 录

绪论	(1)
第一节 封建、郡县及"封建论"的由来	(1)
- 封建	(1)
二 郡县	(6)
三 封建论	(9)
第二节 选题的由来及研究的意义	(12)
第三节 有关明清封建论的研究现状	(14)
一 有关明清封建论的宏观研究	(14)
二 有关明清封建论的个案研究	(16)
三 对于以往研究的检讨	(19)
第四节 研究方法及本书的基本结构	(20)
一 研究方法及思路	(20)
二 本书的基本结构	(22)
第一章 明清以前之封建论:从"治统"渐向"道统"的转化 ····· 第一节 中央集权制早期的封建论	(25)
——秦汉至魏晋时期的封建论	(26)
一 秦汉时期的封建论	(26)
二 三国两晋南北朝时期的封建论	(35)
第二节 中央集权制中后期的封建论	
——隋唐宋元时期的封建论	(40)
一 隋唐时期的封建论	(40)
二 宋元时期的封建论	(46)
第二章 明代初期之封建论:立足于现实的政策之论	(55)
第一节 明初封建论的政治及思想文化背景	(56)
第二节 程通、解缙、梁潜从宗法角度提倡封建:"为政而薄	

于本支,是自撤其城藩而割其手足"	(62)
第三章 明代中期之封建论:以反对君主专制为鹄的	· (78)
第一节 明代中期封建论的政治及思想文化背景	(78)
一 宦官专权	(79)
二 朋党之争	· (83)
三 朝政荒废	· (84)
四 土地兼并日趋严重	· (85)
五 财政危机日渐加深	(89)
六 王学崛起及传播,自我意识的觉醒	(92)
第二节 胡居仁、黄省曾等以"公天下之心"为封建辩护:	
"未尝有爱养斯民之诚心,如何行得封建?"	(93)
第三节 章潢基于明中后期社会情势所发之封建论: "须即	
二者较其利害多寡,为万世计长久可也"	(106)
第四节 杨慎、柳稷等以"势"论封建:"天下定于一"与	
"天下之不可兼得者,势与权"	(120)
第四章 明末清初之封建论:地方意识与明亡之省思	(131)
第一节 江南社会经济的多元化发展及地方意识的增长	
一 明代中后期商品经济的发展	
二 江南经济的多元化发展及市镇的勃兴	
三 市民阶层力量的兴起及其维护地方利益的努力	
第二节 明清更迭的社会动荡及"经世致用"思想的兴起	(139)
第三节 陆世仪等基于厚植地方实力所发封建论:"以三代	
之治治天下乡者王化之所由基也"	(143)
第四节 顾炎武、黄宗羲等的封建论:发掘封建之积极意蕴	
以"补天"	(152)
第五节 颜元、陆求可等的封建论:力求"复古"封建以	
"回天"	(174)
第六节 王夫之、李塨等以"势"、"理"论封建、郡县	(184)
第五章 清代中期之封建论:基于道义的同情与肯定	(199)
第一节 清中叶社会政治、经济、文化发展状况	
第二节 袁枚、崔迈等的封建论:"道可行而势不可行"	