

牛津应用语言学丛书



Formulaic Language: Pushing the Boundaries

公式化语言： 探索研究

Alison Wray

牛津应用语言学

Formulaic Language: Pushing the Boundaries

公式化语言： 探索研究

Alison Wray



外教社

上海外语教育出版社

SHANGHAI FOREIGN LANGUAGE EDUCATION PRESS

Formulaic Language: Pushing the Boundaries

ALISON WRAY

出版说明

本世纪初，外教社先后引进“牛津应用语言学丛书”（19种）和“牛津应用语言学丛书（续编）”（10种）。这些图书由于内容权威、选择精当而受到了外语界的好评，在科研论文中被广泛引用，对推动我国外语教学和研究的发展起到了重大作用。

近年来，随着研究的不断扩展和深入，国内学界对研究资料有了新的需求，像“任务型教学法”、“英语作为国际通用语”、“二语习得的跨学科研究”等逐渐成为了热门的话题。有鉴于此，我们又从牛津大学出版社出版的应用语言学图书中精选了10本，以更好地满足广大教师和科研人员的需求。希望这次出版的这10本图书，能够和以前的29本一起，反映出国际应用语言学重要领域研究的前沿，为全面、深入推动我国外语科研起到新的作用，做出新的贡献。

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

公式化语言: 探索研究/ (英) 瑞 (Wray, A.) 著.

—上海: 上海外语教育出版社, 2012

(牛津应用语言学丛书)

ISBN 978-7-5446-2906-5

I. ①公… II. ①瑞… III. ①应用语言学—研究—英文

IV. ①H08

中国版本图书馆CIP数据核字 (2012) 第234099号

图字: 09-2011-691号

Every effort has been made to obtain permission, but in the event of negligence or particular difficulty of obtaining permission we shall be pleased to come to a suitable arrangement with the rightful owner.

Formulaic Language: Pushing the Boundaries was original published in English in 2008. This bilingual edition is published by arrangement with Oxford University Press.

Licensed for sale in the People's Republic of China excluding Hong Kong, Macau and Taiwan.

本书由牛津大学出版社授权上海外语教育出版社有限公司出版。仅供在中华人民共和国境内(香港、澳门、台湾除外)销售。

出版发行: 上海外语教育出版社

(上海外国语大学内) 邮编: 200083

电 话: 021-65425300 (总机)

电子邮箱: bookinfo@sflep.com.cn

网 址: <http://www.sflep.com.cn> <http://www.sflep.com>

责任编辑: 苗 杨

印 刷: 同济大学印刷厂

开 本: 890×1240 1/32 印张 10.25 字数 452千字

版 次: 2013年1月第1版 2013年1月第1次印刷

印 数: 2 000 册

书 号: ISBN 978-7-5446-2906-5 / H · 1417

定 价: 33.00 元

本版图书如有印装质量问题, 可向本社调换

Preface and Acknowledgments

My aim in the present book and my previous work has been to assemble specific evidence regarding the nature of formulaic language and to develop theoretical models that can explain it. Part of that endeavour entails evaluating the applicability of an explanation at the extremes of its range, and that is why this book is about boundaries. As the Introduction explains, it is not to be expected that all linguists agree with my conclusions, nor does it matter. What matters is that we continue to extend our exploration until, by degrees, we establish clearer boundaries between what is and is not formulaic.

The book has been in the planning for several years, during which I have talked to many people, engaged in huge amounts of email correspondence, read a lot of books and papers, and listened to a great many conference presentations. Some forums have been particularly valuable in inspiring new ideas, including the 2005 Phraseology conference in Louvain-la-Neuve, the 2007 Formulaic Language Symposium at Milwaukee, and the Cardiff meetings and international postgraduate conferences of the Formulaic Language Research Network. Even though I try to keep notes of conversations, useful quotes and so on, it is certainly possible that I have appropriated others' ideas without realizing it. If I have, I apologize, and trust it will be construed as flattery.

There are many people to thank for their various contributions. I have had inspiring and challenging conversations and/or email exchanges about formulaic language with, amongst others, Ben Bergen, Chris Butler, Georgie Columbus, Ding Yenren, Nick Ellis, Britt Erman, Charles and Lily Wong Fillmore, Tess Fitzpatrick, Lise Fontaine, George Grace, Jeff Holman, Martin Kayman, Kon Kuiper, Camilla Lindholm, Iain McGee, Eugène Mollet, Kazuhiko Namba, Christine Pegg, Ann Peters, Qi Yan, John Schumann, Mike Stubbs, Su Yanling, Paul Tench, Sam Tomblin, Gordon Tucker, Diana van Lancker Sidtis, Arie Verhagen, Ulrich Von Hecker, and Beatrice Warren.

Susan Hunston, Mike Stubbs, and Gordon Tucker read and commented on an early draft of Chapter 3, and Chris Butler, Tom Cobb, and Henry Widdowson provided extensive very helpful comments on the entire manuscript. The final version is much the better for the efforts of these contributors, though any or all of them may, I fear, still take exception to some of the things I say. Benedetta Bassetti, Irina Dahlmann, Sioned Davies, Boyd Davis, Seza Dogruoz, Monika Dóla, Nick Ellis, Tony Fairman, Fanny Forsberg, Pauline Foster, Sylvia Grant, James Hegarty, Jeffrey Holman, Ragnhild Knutsson, Kon Kuiper, Ian MacKenzie, Richard Ogden, Rebecca Shaftman, Norbert

Schmitt, and Alessandra Tanesini all came up with good ideas, sent me information, or answered questions on aspects of their work. With respect to trumpet and bugle calls, I have had much help from experts David Edwards, Major Richard Powell, Crispian Steele-Perkins, and Major Gordon Turner. Graham Rock kindly helped with the preparation of the musical figures. My limited understanding of motor sport flags was patiently augmented by track marshall and long-term Formula One fan, Peter Butcher.

Parts of the empirical research reported in this book were supported by research funds from the Arts and Humanities Research Board/Council, the Nuffield Foundation, and IELTS.

For permission to reproduce material I am grateful to various colleagues with whom I have co-researched and/or co-written: Janet Cowper, Stephen Cox, Tess Fitzpatrick, Kazuhiko Namba, and John Staczek. Thanks also to Mary Goebel Noguchi, Dawn French, Sue Hunter, Sarah Lloyd, Jon Plowman, and various publishers of material already in the public domain for helping me obtain permission to reproduce it. For support in the development of the idea for the book, and the preparation of the manuscript, my sincere thanks to Natasha Forrest, Julia Sallabank, Cristina Whitecross, Maggie Shade, and Henry Widdowson.

Finally, for putting up with me, even when it meant sitting indoors instead of walking outdoors, and for unstinting encouragement, support, and inspiration, huge thanks to Mike Wallace.

Copyright statement

Every effort has been made to trace and contact copyright holders. Any apparent infringement of copyright is unintentional, and the publisher will be pleased to rectify any errors or omissions at the earliest opportunity.

Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments – *xiii*

PART ONE Determining boundaries – 1

1 Introduction – 3

Boundaries – 3

At the boundaries – 4

Five questions about formulaic language – 5

The structure of the book – 6

2 Conceptualizing formulaic language – 9

Introduction – 9

Orientation: what is formulaic language? – 9

Definition: the morpheme equivalent unit – 11

Three key conceptual claims about morpheme equivalent units – 12

– The mental lexicon is heteromorphic – 12

– The content of the lexicon is determined through
Needs Only Analysis – 17

– MEUs enable the speaker to manipulate the hearer – 20

3 Working at the boundaries – 23

Introduction – 23

Conflicts between formulaicity and novelty – 23

– A clash of irregular and regular forms – 23

– Humour – 25

– When the impossible becomes possible – 25

– When the morpheme equivalent unit constrains
expression – 26

– Speech errors – 27

How idioms are processed – 28

The question of novelty – 33

Exploring morpheme equivalent units – 34

- 4 **Formulaic language and the oral tradition – 37**
 - Introduction – 37
 - Autonomy – 37
 - Formulaic language and the oral tradition – 38
 - Oral texts – 38
 - The nature of formulas in oral texts – 40
 - Formulas as a mark of antiquity: solving an ancient mystery – 41
 - The transition to written record – 43
 - Formulas in written compositions – 45
 - Writing: a cause or symptom of change? – 46
- 5 **Formulaicity in speech and writing – 49**
 - Introduction – 49
 - Literacy and perceptions of language and the world – 49
 - How we engage with language – 49
 - Literacy and our world view – 50
 - Written text and information – 51
 - Formulaicity in language across domains – 51
 - Levels of autonomy in speech and writing – 52
 - Expressive autonomy in closed and open societies – 53
 - Conclusion: formulaicity as a measure of autonomy – 56

PART TWO Locating boundaries – 61

- 6 **Morpheme equivalent units in the bigger picture – 63**
 - Introduction – 63
 - The desiderata for a comprehensive model of language – 64
 - Three parameters: patterns, their causes, and the principles behind them – 64
 - Interactions across boundaries – 67
 - Locating formulaic language in a comprehensive model – 68
 - Points of reference: causes of formulaic language – 69
 - To the interface – 70
- 7 **Evaluating models at the interface – 73**
 - Introduction – 73
 - Generative theory – 74
 - Functional grammar – 77

- Corpus-driven models – 80
 - Pattern grammar – 81
 - Frame semantics – 83
- The cognitive approach – 84
- Conclusion – 87
- 8 Identifying formulaic material in real texts – 93**
 - Why is identification so difficult? – 93
 - Identification and definition – 93
 - Types of definition, and their implications for identification – 94
 - How definitions apply to examples – 97
 - Example approaches to identification through definition – 99
 - Definition and identification in the case studies in this book – 99
 - Two purposes of identification – 100
 - Frequency – 101
 - Phonological indicators of formulaicity – 102
 - Form – 104
 - Idiosyncrasies – 105
 - Spelling – 106
 - Intuition – 107
 - Published lists and corpora – 109
 - Mixed criteria – 110
 - Bespoke designations – 110
 - Conclusion – 111
- 9 A diagnostic approach to identifying morpheme equivalent units – 113**
 - Introduction – 113
 - Intuition as a tool – 113
 - The criterion-based approach – 114
 - Validation – 115
 - Notes on applying the diagnostics effectively – 115
 - Eleven diagnostic criteria for assessing intuitive judgements about formulaicity – 116
 - Using the diagnostic criteria – 121
 - Examples of the diagnostic criteria in action – 122
 - Conclusion – 126

PART THREE Studies at the boundaries – 129

- 10 **TESSA: a case study in machine translation – 131**
 - Overview – 131
 - The design of the TESSA system – 131
 - TESSA and morpheme equivalent units – 135
- 11 **TALK: a formulaic approach to supporting communication in the speech-disabled – 137**
 - Overview – 137
 - Introduction – 137
 - TALK in action: some observations – 140
 - Conclusion – 141
- 12 **Formulaic language learning: the beginner – 143**
 - Overview – 143
 - Introduction – 143
 - The study – 144
 - The data – 145
 - Analysis – 147
 - To what extent were memorized strings successfully recalled? – 147
 - Where were errors and pauses located? – 148
 - What errors were made? – 149
 - Conclusion – 151
- 13 **Formulaic language learning: advanced – 153**
 - Overview – 153
 - Introduction – 153
 - Design – 154
 - Participants – 154
 - Procedure – 155
 - Data – 156
 - Quantification – 157
 - Analysis – 158
 - Were all participants equally able to memorize and recall nativelike material? – 158
 - What were the limitations on reproducing memorized material in a real conversation? – 158
 - What sorts of conversations were most receptive to the anticipation and effective reproduction of useful material? – 159

- What sorts of changes were made when memorized material was not perfectly reproduced? – 160
- Can individual profiles of performance indicate linguistic strengths and weaknesses? – 162

Conclusion – 164

14 Meanings of the parts and meaning of the whole – 165

Overview – 165

The case – 165

What does ‘coonass’ *really* mean? – 167

How we make meaning – 168

Conclusion – 170

15 Formulaicity and naturalness in a French and Saunders sketch – 173

Overview – 173

Introduction – 173

Naturalness as a goal in acting – 175

The Extras by French and Saunders – 176

Naturalness in *The Extras* – 176

Symptoms of ‘naturalness’ and ‘unnaturalness’ – 177

- Why did French and Saunders sound more natural than Briers and McEwen? – 180

Modelling the routes to naturalness in *The Extras* – 182

The risks of ‘naturalness’ – 183

Conclusion – 184

PART FOUR Examining the boundaries – 187

16 Formulas as the default – 189

Introduction – 189

Evidence for the default – 189

Unawareness and tolerance of irregular forms within morpheme equivalent units – 190

- The ‘Royal Highness’ paradigm – 190

- Harry Potter and the formulaic spells – 190

Incomplete intuitions, relative to objective evidence – 191

- Accounting for poor intuitions – 192

- The acquisition of logical forms – 194

- The default position in *extremis* – 195
- Clinical evidence for formulaicity as the default – 196
- Idiom comprehension – 200
- Conclusion – 202

17 Origin and dynamics of formulaic language – 205

- Introduction – 205
- How would the default have come about? – 205
- Formulaicity and language evolution – 205
- Formulaic language to the rescue – 206
- Formulaic language first – 207
- A modern example – 209
- Continuity – 210
- Shifting the default boundary – 210
- Idealized scenarios of language use and language change – 210
- Realizations of esoteric and exoteric communication – 213
- Different default boundaries and communication – 214
- Different formulaic knowledge – 214
- Choices about group membership – 216
- Conclusion – 217

18 Formulaic language learning in adults – 221

- Introduction – 221
- Establishing the boundary between formulaic and analytic engagement – 221
- Units of language knowledge – 223
- The circumstances of learning – 223
- Learning in different situations – 225
- Making formulaic learning work – 227
- Limitations of formulaic learning in adulthood – 229
- Opportunities for learning in a new way – 232
- Conclusion – 233

19 Teaching language to computers – 235

- Introduction – 235
- What units are most appropriate for natural language processing by computer? – 235
- The representation of meaning – 237
- Unit size – 239

Could computers acquire a language like a child? – 241
– Applying NOA to computer language learning – 242
Conclusion – 244

20 Formulaicity under pressure – 247

Introduction – 247
Formulaicity for basic proficiency – 247
Formulaicity for fluency – 248
Formulaicity for fidelity – 249
Formulaicity for greater accuracy – 250
Risk-taking in memorization – 251
– Verbatim memorization in acting – 252
– Taking risks in memorization – 253
– The calculation of risk by language learners – 254
– Risk as an index of proficiency – 255
Memorization as a route to success – 256
Conclusion – 257

21 Formulaic language, formulaic thought – 259

Introduction – 259
Formulaic sequences for social control – 259
Formulaic language as a straitjacket – 261
– The inherent constraints on creativity of a holistic
protolanguage – 261
Modern-day constrained signalling systems – 263
– Motor racing flags – 264
– Nautical flags – 266
– Military trumpet and bugle calls – 267
– Patterns of constraint in limited signalling systems – 272
Conclusion – 273

22 Across the boundaries – 277

Introduction – 277
Taking stock at the boundaries – 277
Formulaic language and the challenges of
communication – 279
– How formulaic language assists communication – 279
– Addressing the complex problem using formulaic
language – 283

Opportunities for future research – 284

– Adult language learning – 284

– Computational linguistics – 285

– Forensic linguistics – 285

– Performance – 285

– Communication disorders – 285

Final word – 286

References – 287

Index – 303

PART ONE

Determining boundaries