

# 意趣與機杼



“明清繪畫透析國際學術討論會”特展圖錄

New Interpretations of Ming & Qing Paintings





ISBN 7-80512-866-9



9 787805 128665 >

# 意趣與機杼



“明清繪畫透析國際學術討論會”特展圖錄  
New Interpretations of Ming & Qing Paintings

上海書畫出版社

(滬)新登字 112 號

趣味與機杼

——明清繪畫透析國際研討會圖錄

出版者 上海書畫出版社出版發行

上海衡山路二二七號

郵政編碼：200031

編者 研討會編委會

製版 蛇口以琳彩印製版有限公司

承印 利豐雅高印刷(深圳)有限公司

經銷者 各地新華書店經銷

開本：787×1092 1/8 印張：21

1994年11月第一版 1994年第一次印刷

印數0.001—2,000

書號：ISBN7-80512-866-9/J.712

定價：240元



## 前言

美術史研究從一開始即與圖像和文獻資料的收集收藏活動緊密地交織着，並起着理想概念之參照和功能性實體的雙重作用。在這方面發揮得最為淋漓盡致者乃是本世紀中對中國美術的研究，其對作品的歸屬考據和風格劃分的不可或缺的依賴十分明顯。因此，大規模的資料彙集成為這一研究領域裏無處不在的重要組成部份。這個展覽及其圖錄中收錄的中央美術學院及其附屬中學收藏的逾百件明清兩朝繪畫作品，從某種意義上看恰與我們近十五年來所從事的以中華人民共和國境內的藝術收藏為基點而建立視覺和文獻資料體系的努力相輔相承。這本圖錄收錄、評介許多罕為人知的繪畫作品，甚至有些根本未出版發表過。

因此，本圖錄的功用有二：介紹這一鮮為人知的收藏和評說其收藏品。值得注意的是視覺圖像資料體系的建立不是單純的數量之擴充，在大多數情況下，許多已匯集的資料並未真正得到美術史學的眼光之青睞和審視。

中央美院和附中這一明清繪畫收藏特展中的作品多為未受青睞者。與那些固限於正統流傳書畫的目的、口味和興趣的收藏品相比，中央美院及其附中的收藏由於形成於近四十年，多依賴於收購和捐贈，因此，反較之前者更顯示出其收藏面之廣而為本學科提供了更為寬綽的活動疆域。這一收藏的另一優勢是不囿於被歷史圈定的狹窄收藏面中那些雅室清玩之必品或流傳有緒的畫史名作，因此給我們展示了本世紀中葉在中國社會上流傳的各種藝術作品類型。作於十九世紀的作品為這一收藏之優勢，又更以功能性作品為豐。美術史的研究方向常為其所研究的對象左右，特別是那些新出版的作品，因此，這一特展不但能引發許多新穎的研究命題（有些在圖說撰寫中露出端倪），而且也從另一角度為許多已經起步的研究課題加以確認。

展出作品中有許多原被定為有史籍盛名的畫家所作，其中有些極為傑出，乃愛之欲其生而託名於大師之故。但是這些作品應被客觀地更正為出於傳派之手，是在已經定型了的著名主題特徵和風格類型的影響下製作的。這樣的作品產生於已形成的畫家之社會盛名，並且託此盛品而得以流傳。這一收藏中的許多作品出於小名家或史籍無名者之手。特展中收入了大量功能性較直接的作品：節慶或紀念類的作品，吉祥祈願類的作品，作為社會地位象徵的作品，以及表現宗教和民間傳說中人物的作品。佔據明顯位置的一點是這個展覽中有些作品的多聯性：成系列的通景屏或扇面，成組的通俗文化中的人物形象，如“三星圖”，或是圍繞某類藝術風格，如陳洪綬或浙派而出現的作品群；這一切都為我們造成了一個不可多得的文化 and 歷史的合聲。這些作品雖多不是傳世名作，但卻體現了當時大眾的美術品味。

雖然這一收藏的結果並非事先設計的，卻相對於常見的收藏價值標準而形成獨特的珍貴之處。通常，藝術品的收藏集精力於史籍有名者，凸顯出名作之罕見和收藏標準的重要性。這種偏見的積累結果造成一種文化過濾現象，造成了史籍無名者的作品和功能性作品，在著名的藏家的展出作品中佔據着微不足道的比例。這類作品多淪落於不見天日的庫房，和以室內裝點為中心的畫廊。然而近些年來，美術史研究致力於揭示以往被忽略了的部份；這部份正好由中央美院和附中的收藏品所代表而由研究的外圍移入注意力之焦點。本特展及其圖錄的出現，積極地介入了美術史研究中心的移位運動，我們在此的努力將有望在未來進一步引發以往未涉及的研究命題。

對有些視覺圖像之研究不再限於其獨特性，而在於它從屬於整體圖像體系的規範之結果如何。首先，研究焦點將從作為資深鑒定家依賴對象的筆墨符號的個體特殊性移至社會通用的圖像、符號的品類。其次，作品收藏不再為狹隘的收藏品味所左右，而是由流傳在社會上的多種作品類型自然綜合而成。再次，這些作品不再僅以其罕見稀有的自身價值取勝，而是以其社會流通渠道之特點見長，因而可以日之為作為社會產物的藝術，或曰藝術之社會生產的萌芽因素。同時，對藝術的理解則由局部與局部的方位關係轉向對整個視覺形象體系的連屬性之思考——無論是從其內涵，其生產製作，抑或是流傳交換的角度來考察。



對這些作品的筆墨之微妙處的考察無法回避的一點是其複雜性猶如尺水之含衆像，例如一個常見的神祇形象的刻劃中融入了陳洪綬的藝術風格；也就是俗文化的形象藉以雅文化的形象語言加以描述刻劃。另一個例子是錢慧安那如同工廠規模般的扇面設計以其豐富多變的主題內容，由略帶色情，英雄情調到優雅的詩意之間的變幻把十分有限的構圖和人物造型雍容而又隨意地發揮到極致；其表現手法之靈動和暢更在一些半隱半現或反射、投射的面孔中和彎彎搖曳在月亮形窗前的柳枝中得到充分地體現。

那末在這個展覽中究竟哪些作品最能代表某種作品之類型？答案是：一類是作為民間宗教和傳說以及祭祀所用的宗教畫；其中包括“三星”、“鍾馗”和其他祈願福、祿、壽的種種作品；這類作品一部分出於無名氏之手，另一部分則出於如閔貞之類的名家，再一類是文學作品中人物和歷史人物在俗文化圈流傳過程中而形成的固定形象。肖像畫在這個圖錄中亦佔有相當重要的部分，而這又是向為美術史研究所忽略的部分。在肖像畫中又可分為無名人氏之肖像群和有具體人物的肖像，如十九世紀頗為著名的畫家任伯年所為主顧和其他有關人作的肖像。這兩大類型的肖像畫都基於社會之功用性，或傳達、紀念某一事件的內容，或記錄、描述人與人之間的關係狀態，甚至有時也用作於宗教儀式的記錄描述。展出作品中另有一組令我們窺入日常生活方式的風俗畫，或者說是在文化觀念中已經成為程式的風俗畫主題類型：“農家樂”、“漁樂圖”、“嬰戲圖”、“肉販圖”或“相馬圖”。另外幾件仕女圖則提醒我們注意到曾在社會廣為流傳但未受到研究之重視的春宮畫。

展品的收藏面之廣，內容之豐又表現在其花鳥畫、山水畫和地誌山水畫上所體現的美術史或文化之理想典範形象。在山水畫中有兩組絕妙的清初作品，一是袁江的十二通景屏，另一個是龔賢的三條山水軸。這些作品從另一個側面揭示了當時已成名的畫家的作品產量之大，主顧之多，以及所受到的聲名和市場壓力之大。

圖錄中還有幾件作品以往完全被忽略了，其一是兩件顯露了明顯的西方藝術特徵之影響，如那表現《母與子》的掛軸無疑借用了北歐藝術特點中所強調的肌膚感和沉重的衣褶刻劃。這件作品的內在蘊力之大以致於排除了一切色情的聯想，同時以其寫實性，物質性的軀體刻劃引導其觀者回溯這一表現手法之橫跨而過的文化空間而最後歸位於其母文化，歐洲文化的淵源。另一幅非凡的紀念性作品是《宮中慶壽圖》，圖中採用了源自歐洲的透視原理並完整地從社會空間的角度記述了這一慶典。作品中描繪了戲班子的表演與熙熙攘攘的客人交織的場面，按品位排列有致的人們和四下張掛的裝飾性繪畫都從不同角度強調了這一場面之隆重、盛大，以至於其本身都似乎帶有舞臺之鋪張和表演意味。這件作品以文化雜交而成的藝術手法展示的社會秩序之極端性及其所達到的畫面效果令人感到不可思議。這兩件作品可以作為將來研究中西文化互滲和呼應現象的前兆，同時也顯露了這一研究方向的潛在重要性。同理，編撰這一本文化上相互交叉和滲透的圖錄之本身也使我們親身感知這跨文化學術活動的個中滋味。

文以誠，斯坦福大學美術史系教授  
高居翰，伯克利，加州大學美術史系教授

## 明清繪畫特展序

本世紀以來，對中國美術史的研究漸成世界性的學問，成了作為人文科學的美術史學的一個重要分支。不僅擁有張彥遠以來悠久傳統的中國學者在西學東漸下致力着中國美術史研究的現代化，五十年代中葉更建成了隸屬於中央美術學院的中國的第一個美術史系，擔負起本專業教學研究中心的任務；而且，歐美學者也把十八世紀以來不斷完善的西方美術史研究擴大到中國美術史領域，形成了若干大學美術史系中的研究重鎮。中西學者不約而同的努力，彼此間日益擴大的交流，推動了中國美術史學科在世界範圍的發展，促進了兩、三代學者的成長。

以現代觀念研究中國美術史，當然不應忽視對宋元以前中國美術的探討，實際上在五十年代以前，中外學者已給予了高度重視，幾十年來取得了可觀的成果。今後隨着美術文物的出土，仍將是一個可以大有作為的領域。然而，明清繪畫的研究同樣是一個愈益引起重視的方面。早在四十年前，西方獨具隻眼的杜伯秋(J.P.Dubosc)就已看到，把明清繪畫視為沒落時代衰落藝術的偏見曾經阻礙了人們對明清美術的實事求是的瞭解。近三、二十年來，隨着中國美術史研究的廣泛展開，中外學者日益清楚地認識到，由於作為明清繪畫史研究資料的存世真跡和文獻記載無比豐富，所以無論從全面而系統地認識中國美術的後期演進和根究中國繪畫古今轉型的特殊軌跡上，還是深入剖析獨創風格的形成及其包含的特有文化意蘊與審美特質上，抑或是運用傳統方法或嘗試新的研究方法以開闢新的研究方向上，明清繪畫的研究都有着不可替代的重要意義並顯示了富於吸引力的無限可能性。

惟其如此，中外學者研究明清畫家個案者日增，致力明清畫派者日多，探究美術作品深層內涵及其所以然的內外部條件方面也在明清繪畫範圍內表現得更為充分。已經不斷擴大的學術交流，更把明清繪畫的研究推向愈益廣泛深入的境地。雖然中西學者對明清繪畫的研究因治學傳統與社會歷史原因的不同，存在着方法與認識上的差異，然而，從研究對象為明清繪畫，研究資料為作品與文獻而言卻並無二致。

改革開放以來，中外美術史界學術交流的頻繁，中國國內各博物館和民間收藏明清繪畫的大量刊布，衆多明清古籍的再度印行，書畫收藏鑒定熱潮的興起，若干所美術學府已經或即將成立的美術史系，促成了年輕一代美術史學者對明清繪畫研究的投入。從關注明清繪畫研究並力圖推動研究的深入而言，中國學者已與外國同行相應而互動。

進一步開展明清繪畫的研究，自然首先要面對作品，要比前人更明辨地解決真偽混雜的作品斷代與作者歸屬問題，但美術史的研究畢竟不同於文物鑒定，它既要在鑒定的基礎上理清美術風格嬗變的來龍去脈和圖像語言體系的因革變異，又要考究風格圖像之變所體現的審美認識與文化觀念的演進，進而在藝術的自律與它律的互動中洞察美術各門類及其與社會文化的內在聯結，尋找藝術發展的根源與動力。這一認識不但已為國內外美術史學者所認同，也得到了關心美術史事業的中國美術家乃至高等美術學府領導的重視。

為了在新時期更好地發揮中國第一個美術史系教學研究中心的作用，提高研究水平，拓展研究思路，繼承發揚既有傳統，吸收消化西方的有益經驗，促進適應改革開放形勢下美術史人才的成長，中央美術學院領導一方面支持在美術史系內開設書畫鑒定專業，以現代思維總結古來書畫鑒定經驗並使之與西方的風格分析方法相結合，把歷來的感性經驗上升為理性認識，把零碎的知識貫穿為學術系統，以培養新型的鑒定人才，滿足社會的需要。

另一方面，中央美院領導特別是靳尚誼院長和杜健副院長則提出了中外合作召開明清繪畫討論會的構想，以便在國際交流中深化中國美術史研究，探索新的研究方向，嘗試新的研究方法，促進面向21世紀的美術史人才的成長。這一設想不僅得到了故宮博物院領導和楊新副院長的大力支持，而且由於朱竹女士和曹星原女士的努力，更得到了美國加州大學柏克萊分校美術史系高居翰教授(Prof. James Cahill)和美國斯坦福大學美術史系文以誠教授(Prof. Richard Vinograd)的熱烈響應，

其後在中國上海書畫出版社和美國盧絲基金會 (Luce Foundation) 的經濟支持下,中美四方聯合舉辦的首次《明清繪畫透析中美學術討論會》最終確定於1994年12月在北京召開。

爲了配合這一學術討論會,推動今後的明清繪畫研究,合辦者決定舉辦兩個展覽,同時出版圖錄,推出少爲人知在主題或藝術表現上具有研究價值的明清繪畫作品。一個是由故宮博物院獨立籌辦的《明清繪畫展覽》,將系統展出明初至清末各時期各地區畫派大小名家的重要作品,在較全面地反映明清繪畫淵源流變的同時,突出富於特殊文化內涵的隱居圖、園林圖、交酬圖、紀游圖、行樂圖、雅集圖、風俗圖和肖像畫。另一個則是與《明清繪畫展覽》相爲印證補充的《明清繪畫特展》,由中央美術學院暨其附屬中等學校出品,中央美術學院籌辦。

中央美術學院收藏繪畫,以明清爲主,始於它的前身國立北平藝專,鄧以蜚教授主持教務時期即有入藏,大多藏品是五十年代以後陸續購入的,也接受了幾次捐贈,歷任院長和前輩美術史學者都爲擴大藏品付出過心力。目前的收藏雖然還做不到各家備格,但大小名家或無款作品都具備一定的研究價值,或藝術上獨特高妙,或風格圖式與文化內含上別具代表性,足以閃現時代文化心理與審美趣尚,總共約800餘件。中央美術學院附中的繪畫收藏,起步於五十年代,得益於前校長丁井文先生的尋訪搜求,亦有一定數量,尤以“海派”諸家作品爲精。上述藏品的大多數早已經過了書畫鑒定專家的驗定,少量作品在辦展過程中又得到了徐邦達先生的確認。

特展作品選定於1993年夏季,在美方主持人的積極參預下進行。選者無意展現中央美院暨其附中收藏明清繪畫的一切優秀作品,而是依照這次學術討論會的宗旨,既選入有助於深化明清繪畫研究的大小名家之作,也選入了少部份無款或改款卻有利於拓展研究視野的作品,既照顧了明清兩代不同時期不同地域的藝術風貌,也考慮了同一時期同一地域畫家作品的不同個性及其蘊含的文化信息。

從觀察時代風格的更替與地域風格的特色着眼,特展還有明前期浙派、明中期吳門派、明後期松江派和清初活動於安徽、金陵、清中期活動於揚州、清末活動於上海的一些大小名家之作。晚明蘇州畫壇出現的袁尚統、李士達、張宏之作,也以其引人注意的特點被適當展出。

從考察一種風格的歷史延續和多種風格的共時並存致思,不僅選入了傳爲前期浙派畫家戴進、吳偉的作品,也選入了後期浙派畫家張路、鄭文林的作品,如張路的《桃源問津圖》、《歸樵圖》和鄭文林的《二僊圖》、《女僊圖》;還選入了清代中葉在杭州延續浙派畫風的鄭昉的作品《三星圖》。不但選入了吳門派大家沈周立意與畫法獨特的《雲水行高圖》;也選入了發展沈周風格的謝時臣之作《蓬萊訪道圖》;還選入了偶爾效法謝時臣風格的李士達作品《匡廬泉圖》,在李士達作品中,它是別具一格的。不祇選入了清初擅畫黃山的安徽名家梅清的《山水圖》和《光明頂圖》,也選入了其後八九十年黃山畫僧一智繼承新安派傳統的《黃山峰頂圖》和《古洞松風圖》。特展雖然沒有陳列清代中葉正統派的作品,但也不爲畫風狂放的揚州名家作品所局限。在選入黃慎的《水僊圖》、《雪景山水圖》以及同類風格的作品之外,特別選入了某些畫風精整的揚州畫家的作品,如顧符禎的《山深樹密圖》、王雲的《人物圖》、蕭晨的《祝壽圖》和袁江的出色作品《山水十二條屏》。其中二流名家對傳統風格的繼承、變異與開拓及其所以如此的文化情境,尚沒有被更多學者充分研究過。

從深入研究個別名家的思想和藝術而言,特展選入了吳彬早期在北京所作的《洗象圖》、八大山人晚年的《松鶴芝石圖》、祁豸佳早期效法董其昌沒骨山水的《仿張僧繇畫山水圖》、藍瑛淵源於米、高文人風調的《仿高房山山水圖》、方以智寄託亡國之恨的《山水六條屏》、任熊完成於《大梅山館詩意圖(冊)》之前的精心之作《瑤池祝壽圖(屏)》、任伯年來滬之始爲胡公壽所作肖像《橫雲山民行乞圖》、他成熟期的肖像畫代表作《何以誠肖像》以及錢慧安晚年的《墨筆畫稿(冊)》等。這些作品分別從風格形成、創作觀念和社會功能方面爲深入研究提供了有益的啟示。

從選材立意所蘊含的人生旨趣與審美願望而論,特展着重選取了三類作品。一是描寫生活風俗並且時或用於滿足城鄉小民審美感情的畫幅,如明人《歲朝圖》、《漁家樂園》、傳上官周《農樂圖》、任薰的時裝美人《紫薇仕女圖》和任伯年《賣肉圖》。二



是描繪深入人心的民神和傳奇故事以適應社會習俗的作品，如華岳、鄭岱和尚雲臣的《三星圖》，閔貞、管希寧、任薰的《鍾馗圖》，任伯年、任雨華、錢慧安的《風塵三俠圖》和任伯年的《魁星圖》等。三是以諧音吉語生發畫意以表達納福迎祥之意的作品，如錢應元的《喜報連升圖》、清人無款《三多圖》和丁觀鵬的《五福呈祥圖》等。這三類作品在明清繪畫中大量存在，很值得深入考察。

特展還選入了因融合西法而不難窺見西畫東漸之跡的作品和時下引起學者研究興趣的女畫家作品。前者如冷枚的《蕉蔭讀書圖》、無款《人物（聖母子）圖》和無款《慶壽圖》。後者如袁鏡蓉《女僊圖》和任霞《風塵三俠圖》。它們為發展已有的研究成果提供了新的資料。

爲了對特展中百餘幅作品進行初步研究進而出版附有說明的圖錄，《明清繪畫透析中美學術討論會》的雙方主持人決定，圖錄的說明由雙方組織學者和研究生撰寫，中方參加撰寫圖說者除本人外，有單國強先生、袁寶林先生、江文先生、趙力先生、杜娟女士和傅東光、李晨、王小梅、赫俊紅、邵彥諸同學。美方參加圖說撰寫的專家學者和博士研究生爲高居翰先生（James Cahill）、文以誠先生（Richard Vinograd）、徐澄淇女士（Ginger Hsü）、曹星原女士（Hsingyuan Tsao）、瑪麗安·羅傑斯女士（Mary Ann Rogers）、路易斯·尤哈思女士（Louise Yuhas）、馬孟晶女士、安濮女士（Anne Burkus-Chasson）、布瑞塔·艾瑞克森女士（Britta Erickson）、李佩華小姐（Peihua Lee）、胡素馨小姐（Sarah Fraser）、蒂姆·馬柔恩君（Tim Maraun）、鄧偉權君（Taug Wei-kuen）、查爾斯·梅森先生（Charles Mason）和南京藝術學院訪美學者張弘星先生。美方除按雙方分工完成了己方全部圖說外，還對中方分工寫作的七件作品也撰寫了圖說，因撰寫者見解不完全相同，爲便於深入研究，亦予編入。儘管展出並印入圖錄的作品只是明清繪畫的滄海一粟，但通過他們的努力，將在圖說中進一步考定作品分析風格揭示特有的意義，推動研討會和研討會後明清繪畫研究的深入展開。

在籌辦特展出版圖錄的全過程中，包括揀選作品、拍攝圖片、著錄作品和撰寫圖說中，研討會中方秘書長朱竹女士和美方秘書長曹星原女士做了大量通訊聯絡與組織協調工作。中央美術學院美術館的副館長王曉先生，館員楊林森先生、趙寶琪女士，中央美術學院附中的張維之校長和楊光河副校長大力支持配合，提供方便。谷小波先生逐一攝影，保證了圖片質量。尹吉男先生、趙力先生和杜娟女士測量了各幅作品的尺寸並主持或參與了作品的文字著錄，爲撰寫圖說提供了必要的素材，上海書畫出版社更慨然予以出版。正是由於他們的努力，這本特展圖錄纔能夠順利面世，在此謹向他們表示衷心的感謝。

薛永年

中央美術學院教授美術史系主任

1994年7月

## Foreword

Art history as a systematic discipline has from its beginnings been closely intertwined with the archive, both as ideal concept and as functioning institution. This is nowhere more the case than with Chinese painting studies in this century, where the prominence of projects of attribution and stylistic classification is clearly dependent upon, and scarcely conceivable without, the formation of largescale visual archives, in ongoing efforts almost everywhere the field has been actively pursued. The present exhibition and catalogue, which documents more than one hundred works of Ming and Qing dynasty paintings from the collections of the Central Academy of Fine Arts and its Affiliated Middle School, in some ways serve as part of an ongoing archival project, which in the last fifteen years has been focused most energetically on paintings in the People's Republic of China. This catalogue documents and discusses many little-known paintings, most previously either seldom discussed or entirely unpublished, in ways that can serve as both introduction and guide to those collections. We should recall, however, that archives function not so much through simple expansion as through focused acts of attention and inquiry. At most times, large parts of the archive are overlooked, remaining unarticulated beneath the field of historical vision.

The Ming and Qing paintings from the Central Academy collections exhibited here belong in many cases to the aesthetics of the overlooked. While many collections of Chinese painting have been shaped within clear horizons of vision, taste, and interest, originating from centers ranging from the imperial to the connoisseurial and curatorial, the Central Academy collections, built by market acquisitions and donations mostly in the last forty years, cast a very broad net into a field of opportunity and circumstance. Rather than a selection of favored types or masterpieces, confined and filtered by narrow considerations of taste or doctrines of historical importance, the Central Academy collection seems instead very much a sample of paintings in circulation in mid-twentieth century China, noticeably richer in recent, nineteenth-century, works than those of earlier periods, and with a substantial presence of functional paintings. The agenda and direction of art historical scholarship have always been strongly shaped by its objects of study, especially those newly discovered or published. The character of the Central Academy painting collections will certainly stimulate research on a range of new topics, already signalled in the essays in this catalogue, but it also confirms the interest and importance of some directions of scholarship already under way in the field.

This exhibition includes many paintings attributed to historically notable individual painters, and some superb individual works. Nonetheless, a substantial number of the attributed paintings should be more accurately understood as paintings in the manner of a given master, with characteristic themes and style features that draw on an established artistic image. Such paintings traded on the aura of fame and associated cultural values that circulated around the renowned masters. Many others of the Central Academy paintings are the products of littleknown or anonymous painters. There is a large representation of paintings with direct functional purposes: paintings which commemorated social or festival occasions, symbolically conveyed blessing or good wishes, portrayed the identities and social positions of persons, or imaged the potent figures of popular religion and mythology. There are notably many multiples: painted sets of hanging scrolls or fans; popular and often-repeated iconographic clusters such as the figures of the "Three Stars;" and historically resilient stylistic manners like that circulating around Chen Hongshou and related Chekiangarea painters, which served to convey notions of refinement and historical resonance. They are, for the most part, less masterpieces than examples of paintings in the mass.

However unintentional, there is a curious reversal of customary collecting values manifested in this array. The emphasis on notable painters in most collections presumes the rarity of the masterpiece, as well as certain standards of quality and importance. The cumulative result of this bias in collecting and preservation has been a filtering effect, so that anonymous and functional paintings have been relatively poorly represented in the exhibited portions of major collections, consigned instead to storage, to the galleries devoted to interior decor, or to

the revaluated former masterpieces relegated to study collections or deaccession. In recent years, however, art history has become more aware of the interest to be found in reconnoitering the previously overlooked, so that the types of painting strongly represented in the Central Academy collections have moved from the margins of attention closer to center stage. The present exhibition and catalogue participates in this shift of interest; in turn, the understandings produced here are likely to encourage further explorations of previously disregarded topics.

What are some of the implications of imagery whose interest lies not in distinctiveness, but primarily in membership in a large group or mass phenomenon? First, the focus of attention is moved from signs of particularity -- the nuanced brushstroke, effortfully distinguished by the experienced connoisseur -- or the easy recognizability of a widely shared iconography, a semiotics of the ordinary. Secondly, the paintings are oriented not to the closure of private collection and personal significance, whether for the artist or recipient, but to the more public arena of broad circulation and shared, popular understanding. Third, the paintings are less repositories of rarity-value than vehicles or instruments of exchange in wide circulation, elements of a burgeoning image industry. And the orientation of interest and understanding moves from local relationships to participation in systems -- of meaning, production, and circulation.

There is still room for nuance in such images, but it tends toward a nuanced manipulation of complex stock elements. An image of popular deities in a standard tableau is overlaid with references to archaic figurations in the manner of Chen Hongshou, for example; the popular or folk is drawn into entanglement with a more knowing and elite-referential style. The nearly factory-scale fan designs of Qian Huan are rich variations on limited compositional and figural conventions, saved from monotony by the associations of the subjects -- variously erotic, heroic, or poetic -- and an accompanying witty modulation of presentation and representation: hidden or reflected visages; the arcing of a tree branch to create a natural moon window frame.

Which are the categories of painting most represented in this sample, acknowledging that the paintings in this exhibition are a selection from a still larger group? Religious paintings, as ritual objects or icons, are here a subcategory of a much larger group of images belonging to popular religion and mythology. These include the "Three Stars", "Zhong Kui" and various pictures conveying wishes for long life, good luck, and blessings. Among these are both anonymous works and those by notable painters such as Min Zhen. Images drawn from literary and historical stories comprise another significant group, drawing on a wide familiarity with a lore of types and texts. Portraits are another category substantially represented in these collections, and broadly underrecognized in standard art historical accounts. These include anonymous group and individual portraits as well as the better known 19th century portraits of artist-associates and patrons by Ren Bonian. Both of these groups foreground the social functions of painting, as commemorations of occasions of passage, documents of status and relationship, and even as residues of ritual or ceremonial events. A diverse group of genre pictures offer glimpses of everyday lives and events, or of the values constructed around those social tropes: pleasures of farmers and fisherfolk, children at play, buying meat in the market, or judging horses. Several paintings of female beauties exemplify the widespread but often unacknowledged circulation of images of the erotic and alluring.

The collections include as well a full spectrum of more standard and widely practiced pictorial genres, including bird-and-flower paintings and landscapes that are variously topographical, art historical, and settings for culturally ideal or normative figures and activities. The landscapes include two superb sets from the early Qing, a twelve-panel set by Yuan Jiang representing sojourners, gentlemen in pavilions, and women weaving and preparing cloth amid an elaborated setting of streams and hills, and a powerfully architectonic three-scroll set of gates and pavilions in a dense mountainscape by Gong Xian. These are extraordinary examples of types of painting produced in some abundance, which embody the pull of patronage and the pressures of reputation and marketplace in engagement with mature and confident artistries.

A few of the Central Academy paintings offer glimpses of categories of painting almost entirely unexamined. Two such works betray strong admixtures of elements from European pictorial traditions. A hanging scroll of a mother suckling a naked child must draw on some Northern European sources for its fleshy presence and distinctive, heavily shaded costumes. The painting has the power of a somewhat uncouth exoticism, with the additional effect of reflecting back across cultural space some distinctive qualities of physicality and bodily engagement most often naturalized in the experience of purely European pictures. A very different, monumental picture of a palace birthday celebration uses a European perspectival system in the service of a full documentation of social space and ceremony. The presence of a theatrical troupe, amidst the crowds of formal portrayals, mingling guests, and ordered ranks of decorative pictures, reinforces an effect of spectacle, if not of outright theatricality. The display of an ordered social vision in a form of such extreme lucidity, along with the hybridization of visual cultures, ends in an effect nearly visionary, or uncanny. Both images are reminders of the potentials of intercultural encounters to generate unexpected adaptations and responses. It is the challenge and opportunity of this intercultural catalogue project to find in the encounters of scholars and paintings parallel kinds of unanticipated insights.

Richard Vinograd, Professor of Art, Stanford University  
James Cahill, Professor of Art History, the University of California,  
Berkeley



## Preface

Since the beginning of this century, the study of art history has gradually become a part of international scholarship, as well as one of the important branches of the humanities. Chinese art history not only has a long tradition, beginning with Zhang Yanyuan of the 9th century, but Chinese art historians have made efforts to modernize the field under the impact of Western approaches. In the mid-1950s, the first art history program in China was founded in the Central Academy of Fine Arts, Beijing. Furthermore, European and American scholars have also extended the tradition of Western art history, which began in the 18th century, to China. Gradually, more and more institutions have founded their own art history programs. Chinese and Western scholars, working together, gradually have engaged in a mutual dialogue aimed at accelerating the development of Chinese art history within a worldwide context, already having an impact on two or three generations of scholars.

While using modern concepts to research Chinese art history of the Ming and Qing periods, naturally we should not neglect the study of the periods before the Song and Yuan. In fact, even before the 1950s, Chinese and non-Chinese scholars have paid great deal of attention to this area, and in the last few decades, there have been great achievements in this area. In the future, along with the excavations of artistic relics, this early period will remain a promising area of research. However, the study of Ming-Qing art is a similarly exciting area. As early as forty years ago, J. P. Dubosc already had foreseen that to look at Ming-Qing painting as the product of a declining era is a prejudice that prevents us from a true appreciation of this period. In the last two or three decades, along with the development of Chinese art historical studies, Western scholars realized that the richness of the historical materials relating to this period is incomparable. Furthermore, the Ming-Qing period can be seen as an important transitional era between traditional and modern painting. This era allows us to observe the development of individual styles, and to apply both traditional and modern methods of analysis.

More and more scholars, Chinese and non-Chinese alike, have devoted themselves to the study of this period. Under these circumstances, it is important to study painting from the viewpoints both of internal form and external contexts. The dialogue between Chinese and Western scholars has broadened and deepened the study of Ming-Qing painting. Although scholars from China and the West come out of different social, historical, and cultural backgrounds, with methodological and epistemological differences, they share common subjects of study and research materials, in the form of paintings and texts. After the recent opening of China, opportunities for exchange between China and the rest of the world increased, and both public and private Chinese collections of Ming-Qing painting have been published in large numbers, and numerous Ming and Qing texts have been reprinted. The authentication of painting and calligraphy has been enthusiastically pursued. Several art history programs or art institutions have been established, sufficient to allow a generation of historians to delve into Ming-Qing painting studies. In terms of attention to painting studies and efforts in promoting the extension of research, Chinese scholars and their foreign counterparts have already effectively interacted.

To further advance Ming-Qing painting studies, we must of course first deal with the works of art and more clearly differentiate authentic from spurious works, and resolve questions of dating and authorship. In the end, although art historical study is not the same as the authentication of objects, it must be based on authentication and accurate dating in order to clarify origins and changes of style, and the operative system of visual language. Only in this way, can we further discover the inner relationships between artistic and sociocultural factors, as well as the sources and motivations for artistic developments. These ideas have not only been recognized by scholars inside and outside of China, but have received attention from all levels of artistic leaders.

In order better to make use of the first art history program in China in this new period, to raise our standard of research, to broaden our outlooks, to carry on our traditions, to absorb and digest useful Western experience, to produce more and better practitioners of art history, the Central Academy undertook several projects. On the one hand the Academy supported a new program of authentication, using modern methods to complete traditional authentication practices, transforming intuitive insight into more rational understanding, and systematizing miscellaneous knowledge. The goal was the training of a new kind of authentication expert, responsive to social needs.

On the other hand, the leaders of the Central Academy, especially Director Jin Shangyi and Vice-Director Du Jian, suggested conceiving a symposium on Ming-Qing painting, cooperating with foreign scholars. In this way, we could deepen our research in art history through

furthering international dialogue. We could also test for new methodological directions in our research, to produce the kinds of experts who will be ready for the challenges of the twenty-first century. This suggestion not only received support from Vice-Director Yang Xin and other leaders of the Palace Museum but also, through Ms. Zhu Zhu and Ms. Tsao Hsingyuan's efforts, obtained enthusiastic response from Professor James Cahill of the Department of Art History, University of California, Berkeley, and Professor Richard Vinograd of the Department of Art at Stanford University. Finally, with the financial assistance of the Shanghai Calligraphy and Painting Press and the Luce Foundation in New York, we determined to carry out this suggestion to hold the first American-Chinese cooperative symposium on "New Interpretations of Ming-Qing Painting Studies" in December 1994 in Beijing.

To accompany this academic symposium and further encourage further study of Ming-Qing painting, the organizers decided to hold two related exhibitions and publish two catalogues. The choice of paintings to be exhibited emphasized painting subjects and styles what have rarely been recognized but which nonetheless have great research interest. One of the exhibitions has been organized solely by the Palace Museum. It will systematically exhibit works from the beginning of the Ming to the end of the Qing, including examples from all areas and schools, major and minor artists, while attempting to reflect the full spectrum of Ming-Qing painting. Particular emphasis was placed on choosing paintings with special cultural significance, such as images of living in reclusion, garden scenes, paintings reflecting friendship and social obligations, topographical painting, pictures of enjoyable activities, elegant gatherings, genre paintings, and portraits. The other exhibition is a special exhibition of Ming-Qing painting organized by and drawn from the collections of the Central Academy and its Affiliated Middle School.

Ming and Qing paintings occupy a major part of the collection of the Central Academy. This collection started from the predecessor institution of the Central Academy of Fine Arts, called the Beiping National Art Academy. At that time professor Deng Yizhe was in charge of this collection, but most of the collection was acquired after the beginning of the 1950s along with a few donations. All of the directors and artists of our Academy have devoted their energies to this collection. At the present time, although the collection does not include works from every major school or by every famous artist, all of the paintings have research value in terms of stylistic or cultural interest, or as a reflection of the taste of the period. The total number of paintings in the collection is over 800 pieces. The collection of the Central Academy Affiliated Middle School began to be formed in the 1950's, mainly put together by former Director Ding Jingwen. Works of the Shanghai school of the nineteenth century are especially prominent in this group of paintings. Most of the works in these two collections have been authenticated by experts. The status of some of these works has been reconfirmed by Mr. Xu Bangda in the course of working on this exhibition.

The selection of this special exhibition was made during the summer of 1993 with the active involvement of the American organizers. Our main aim has not been to show the best works in our collections, but rather to further the main goal of our symposium. We not only included the paintings that would be useful for deepening our understanding of Ming-Qing painting, but also included some anonymous or attributed paintings in order to broaden our sphere of research. From the viewpoint of stylistic change and regional styles, this exhibition includes paintings from the Zhe School of the early Ming, the middle Ming Wu School, and the Sungjiang School of the late Ming. As for the Qing dynasty, we included paintings from early Qing Anhui and Nanjing, middle Qing Yangzhou, and the late Qing Shanghai. We also made a special effort to exhibit a few artists from late Ming Suzhou, such as Yuan Shangtong, Li Shida, and Zhang Hong.

In order to analyze styles both chronologically and synchronically, we included in this exhibition works of both early Zhe school artists Dai Jin and Wu Wei and late Zhe school artists such as Zhang Lu and Zheng Wenlin; examples are Zhang Lu's *Seeking the Ford of the Peach Blossom Spring* and *Returning Firewood-gatherer* and Zheng Wenlin's *Two Immortals* and *Female Immortals*. We also chose works by Zheng Dai, the Qing dynasty successor of the Zhe school, for instance *The Three Stars*. Not only is *Traveling Amid Clouds and Water*, a work of the Wu school master Shen Zhou that is unusual in concept and painting technique exhibited, but also *Searching the Way at Penglai*, a painting by Xie Shichen, who further developed Shen Zou's style. We also included *Kuanglu Spring*, a work by Li Shida, who occasionally worked in the style of Xie Shichen; within Li's oeuvre, this painting is unique. In this exhibition are not only two works by the early Qing Anhui artist Mei Qing -- *landscape* and *Summit of Supreme Brightness* -- but also *Summit of Huangshan* and *Ancient Cave and Pine Wind* by the monk painter Yizhi, who carried on the Xinan school eighty to ninety years later. The Peaks of Mt. Huang We exhibited neither works of the mid-Qing orthodox school, nor typically wild paintings of the Yangzhou Eight Eccentrics. After selecting Huang Shen's *Narcissus* and *Seaching for Blossoming Plum in a Snowy Landscape*, we also chose some particularly straight forward works by Yangzhou artists, such as Gu Fuzhen's *Deep Mountains and Dense Trees*, Wang Yun's *At the Gate of a Palace*, Xiao Chen's *Birthday Scene*, and Yuan Jiang's masterful landscape in twelve scrolls. A problem seldom addressed by scholars is the role of secondary artists in carrying on, transforming, and expanding traditional styles of painting, and the relationship of that process to the socio-cultural environment.

For the purpose of more deeply studying the thought and art of a few well-known outstanding painters, this exhibition included Wu Bin's early Beijing painting *Washing the Elephant*, Bada Shanren's late work *Pine and Cranes*, Qi Zhijia's early work after Dong Qichang's boneless style *Landscape After Zhang Sengyu's Method*, Lan Ying's *Landscape in the Manner of Gao Fangshan* in Mi family and Gao Kegong style, and Fang Yizhi's *Six Scrolls of Landscape*, painted as a reminiscence of the lost Ming dynasty. From later periods we included Ren Xiong's *Celebrating a Birthday at the Jasper Pond*, which was painted before his famous album *New Year's Morning* as well as Ren Bonian's *Hu*

*Gongshou's Portrait*, painted by Ren during his early years in Shanghai, and a work of his mature period, *Portrait of He Yicheng*, along with Qian Huian's *Album of Ink Sketches*. From the perspectives of formation of style, conception of creativity, and the aspect of social function, these works offer us inspirations for our further research.

In order to demonstrate qualities of life and aesthetic outlooks, this exhibition has emphasized three categories of works. One of them is genre painting, which describes the life styles and artistic and emotional satisfactions of people in both urban and rural society; examples of these are the anonymous ming works *New Year's Celebration*, and *Jays of Fisherfolk; Pleasures of Farming* attributed to Shang-Guan Zhou, Ren Xun's painting of a *Beautiful Lady* in contemporary fashion, and Ren Bonian's *Selling Meat*. The second special category comprises works which penetrate popular psychology and transmit unusual stories to reflect social customs, such as paintings of *Three Stars* by Master Hua, Zheng Dai, and Shang Yunchen; paintings of the *Demon-Queller Zhong Kui* by Min Zhen, Guan Xining and Ren Xun; illustrations of Three knights Errant by Ren Bonian, Ren Yuhua, and Qian Huian; and paintings such as Ren Bonian's personified *Constellation*. The third emphasized category includes paintings used to convey ideas of good fortune and auspicious wishes, such as Qian Yingyuan's *Continuous Ascendancies*, the anonymous Qing painting *Three Abundances*, and Ding Guanpeng's *Five Good Fortunes and Auspices*. large numbers of paintings of these three types survive from the Ming and Qing periods, and are deserving of more thorough investigation.

This special exhibition paintings that synthesize Western methods, in which the infiltration of Western styles is not difficult to discern as well as paintings by women artists, of the sort which have drawn much scholarly attention recently. In the former category are Leng mei's *Woman Reading in the Shade of Banana Palms*, and the anonymous painting of an elaborate Birthday Celebration. paintings by women artists include Yuan Jingrong's *Female Immortal* and Ren Xia's *Three knights Errant*. These offer new materials for developing earlier research.

The organizers of the symposium from both sides decided that in order to further research on the more than one hundred paintings included in this exhibition an illustrated catalogue with explanatory texts accompanying the paintings would be produced by the joint efforts of the organizing scholars and selected colleagues and research students. Participants in writing the explanatory notes on the Chinese side included myself, Mr. Shan Guoqiang, Professor Yuan Baolin, Mr. Jiang Wen, Mr. Zhao Li. Ms. Du Juan, Mr. Fu Dongguang, Mr. Li Chen. Ms. Wang Xiaomei, Ms. He Junhong, and Ms. Shao Yan. Participants in writing the notes on the American included Professor James Cahill, Professor Richard Vinograd, Ms. Ginger Hsü, Ms. Hsingyuan Tsao, Ms. Mary Ann Rogers, Ms. Louise Yuhas, Ms. Ma Menjing, Ms. Anne Burkus-Chasson, Ms. Britta Erickson, Ms. Peihua Lee, Ms. Sarah Fraser, Mr. Tim Maraun, Mr. Tang Wei-kuen, Mr. Zhang Honxing, and Mr. Charles Mason. In order to show different treatments of a same painting between American and Chinese scholars, we also included a few entries written which were originally written in both languages. Although all the paintings published here can be said to be merely a drop in the ocean, through the efforts of these entry writers to unfold the significance of these paintings in terms of style and subject matter, the result should be an inspiration for the symposium and activities to follow.

During the process of preparing the exhibition and publishing the catalogue, including the selection of paintings, making photographs and transparencies, the dating and recording of works, as well as the writing up of the entries, both executive secretaries on the Chinese and American sides, Ms. Zhu Zhu and Tsao Hsingyuan, have done an enormous amount of work in organization, communication, and coordination. The Vice-Director of the Central Academy art Gallery, Mr. Wang Xiao, and his staff members, Mr. Yang Linseng and Ms. Zhao Baoqi, as well as the Director and Vice-Director of the Affiliated School of the Central Academy, Mr. Zhang Weizhi and Mr. Yang Guanghe, have supported this entire project with their entire effort and provided us with every convenience. Mr. Gu Xiaobo, our photographer, produced very high quality transparencies. Mr. Yin Jinan and Ms. Du Juan, along with Mr. Zhao Li, measured every work in the exhibition, and also participated in the writing of the basic catalogue data. Beyond everything, the Shanghai Calligraphy and Painting Press, generously offered to publish this catalogue. Because of all these joint efforts, this catalogue has finally come to fruition. I would like here to express my most sincere gratitude to all those involved.

Professor Xue Yongnian,  
Director of the Department of Art History,  
The Central Academy of Fine Arts  
July 1994.



## 凡 例

一、本圖錄選錄皮藏於中央美術學院及其附屬中學的明清兩朝繪畫略逾百件，一組作品以一件計。

二、圖說正文以中英兩種文字撰寫，兼對譯每條之提要為另一種文字，每條中文圖說和提要後附撰寫人姓名或譯名，英文後面則一概以字母縮寫表示。

三、姓名縮寫表：

ABC 安瀨  
BE 布瑞塔·艾瑞克森  
CM 查爾斯·梅森  
DJ 杜娟  
FDG 傅東光  
GH 徐澄淇  
HJH 赫俊紅  
HT 曹星原  
JC 高居翰  
JW 江文  
LC 李晨  
LY 游露怡  
MAR 瑪麗·安·羅傑斯

MMC 馬孟晶  
PL 李佩華  
RV 文以誠  
SF 胡素馨  
SGQ 單國強  
SY 邵彥  
TM 蒂姆·墨朗  
TWK 鄧偉權  
WXM 王小梅  
XYN 薛永年  
YBL 袁寶林  
ZH 張弘星  
ZL 趙力

## EDITOR'S NOTE

This catalogue includes paintings of the Ming and Qing dynasties from collections of the Central Academy of Fine Arts and its Affiliated Middle School. We did not make our choices based on the conventional reputation of the artists, but rather looked for works that were either little-known or entirely unpublished with great research value for our understanding of Ming and Qing paintings.

Entries were written by American and Chinese scholars in their native languages; an abstract of each entry appears in translation. At the end of each entry, the abbreviation of the author's name is indicated, in the case of English, or his or her full name, in the case of Chinese.

### Authors of Entries:

ABC:	Ann Burkus-Chasson
BE:	Britta Erickson
CM:	Charles Mason
DJ:	Du Juan
FDG:	Fu Dongguang
GH:	Ginger Hsü
HJH:	He Junhong
HT:	Hsingyuan Tao
JC:	James Cahill
JW:	Jiang Wen
LC:	Li Chen
LY:	Louise Yuhas
MAR:	Mary Ann Rogers
MMJ:	Ma Menjing
PL:	Peihua Lee
RV:	Richard Vinograd
SF:	Sarah Fraser
SGQ:	Shan Guoqiang
SY:	Shao Yan
TM:	Tim Maraum
TWK:	Tang Wei-kuen
WXM:	Wang Xiaomei
XYN:	Xue Yongnian
YBL:	Yuan Baolin
ZH:	Zhang Hongxing
ZL:	Zhao Li

## 目 錄

(有款作品大體按時間先後排列,明顯偽款及無款作品列於最後)

1.明戴進(?)《松下奕棋圖》軸	19
2.明戴進(?)《雪景山水》軸	21
3.明沈周(?)《雲水行窩圖》卷	22-23
4.明吳偉(?)《觀瀑圖》軸	22
5.明吳偉(?)《牧牛圖》軸	22
6.明張路《桃源問津圖》軸	24
7.明張路《歸樵圖》軸	25
8.明謝時臣《蓬萊訪道圖》軸	25
9.明陸治《桃源圖》軸	27
10.明吳彬《洗象圖》軸	27
11.明鄭文林《二僮圖》軸	28
12.明鄭文林《女僮圖》軸	28
13.明李士達《匡廬泉》軸	29
14.明劉原起《風雪夜歸人圖》軸	30
15.明沈士充《淺絳山水》軸	31
16.明張宏《松聲泉韻圖》軸	31
17.明張宏《牧牛圖》軸	32
18.明錢應元《喜報連升圖》軸	32
19.明袁尚統《崆峒訪道圖》軸	34
20.明藍瑛《仿高房山山水》軸	34
21.明祁豸佳《仿張僧繇畫法山水》軸	36
22.明文震亨《設色山水人物圖》軸	37
23.明澆公《秋山獨釣圖》軸	37
24.清方以智《山水》六條屏	39—40
25.清龔賢《天半峨眉圖》屏	42—43
26.清龔賢《山林曉市圖》軸	44
27.清樊圻《溪山林壑圖》軸	45
28.清梅清《山水》軸	45
29.清梅清《光明頂圖》軸	46
30.清朱耷《松鶴圖》軸	48
31.清顧符稹《山深樹密圖》軸	48
32.清王概《山卷晴雲圖》軸	48
33.清王雲《人物》軸	49
34.清蕭晨《祝壽圖》軸	49