

“外研社杯”全国大学生英语辩论赛官方指定教材

[美]罗伯特·崔普 (Robert Trapp) 等 著

# BUILDING GLOBAL RELATIONS THROUGH DEBATE

## 思辨精英

英语辩论——构筑全球视角

详述中美辩论的历史、道德标准和基本概念

介绍英国议会制辩论，介绍辩手的不同职责及责任

讲解如何反驳和重建论证、如何质询等等

剖析论证的各要素、结构、分类、如何有组织地论点及分析谬误

从裁判和组织者角度讲解如何裁决辩论和组织辩论

“外研社”

英语辩论赛官方指定教材

[美]罗伯特·崔普(Robert Trapp)等著

# BUILDING GLOBAL RELATIONS THROUGH DEBATE



# 思辨精英

## 英语辩论——构筑全球视角

## 图书在版编目 (CIP) 数据

思辨精英：英语辩论：构筑全球视角 / (美) 罗伯特·崔普 (Robert Trapp) 等著. ——  
北京 : 外语教学与研究出版社, 2016.8

ISBN 978-7-5135-7983-4

I. ①思… II. ①罗… III. ①英语—辩论 IV. ①H311.9

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字 (2016) 第 213113 号

出版人 蔡剑峰  
责任编辑 王霖霖  
执行编辑 田小琴  
封面设计 彩奇风  
出版发行 外语教学与研究出版社  
社 址 北京市西三环北路 19 号 (100089)  
网 址 <http://www.fltrp.com>  
印 刷 三河市紫恒印装有限公司  
开 本 787×1092 1/16  
印 张 20.5  
版 次 2016 年 8 月第 1 版 2016 年 8 月第 1 次印刷  
书 号 ISBN 978-7-5135-7983-4  
定 价 98.00 元

购书咨询: (010) 88819926 电子邮箱: club@fltrp.com

外研书店: <https://waiyants.tmall.com>

凡印刷、装订质量问题, 请联系我社印制部

联系电话: (010) 61207896 电子邮箱: zhijian@fltrp.com

凡侵权、盗版书籍线索, 请联系我社法律事务部

举报电话: (010) 88817519 电子邮箱: banquan@fltrp.com

法律顾问: 立方律师事务所 刘旭东律师

中咨律师事务所 殷 斌律师

物料号: 279830001

# 本书作者简介

1. 埃里克·巴恩斯（Eric Barns），美国霍巴特和威廉史密斯学院（Hobart and William Smith Colleges）副教授、辩论指导。
2. 陈向京，西安交通大学外国语学院院长、教授。
3. 何静，复旦大学讲师、英语辩论队教练。
4. 杰克逊·米勒（Jackson Miller），美国俄勒冈州林菲尔德学院（Linfield College）教授、辩论指导。
5. 凯瑟琳·斯普林（Kathleen Spring），美国俄勒冈州林菲尔德学院（Linfield College）助理教授、图书馆馆藏管理负责人。
6. 罗伯特·崔普（Robert Trapp），美国俄勒冈州威拉米特大学（Willamette University）教授、辩论指导。
7. 梅丽莎·弗兰克（Melissa Franke），美国西雅图大学（Seattle University）助理教授、辩论指导。
8. 特蕾莎·格林（Teresa Green），美国俄勒冈州威拉米特大学（Willamette University）中国辩论教育网络项目协调人。
9. 杨戈，大连民族大学讲师、英语辩论队教练。
10. 尤娜·基姆齐-格斯（Una Kimokeo-Goess），美国俄勒冈州威拉米特大学（Willamette University）讲师、辩论副指导。

# Acknowledgments

This book would not have been possible without the good work of all of the Chinese and U.S. partners of the China Debate Education Network (CDEN). The Chinese partners include: Chen Xiangjing, Chen Ying, Chen Zhengwu, Ji Tingting, Li Chaoyuan, Li Qianmei, Li Yong, Liu Chunyang, Liu Xin, Luo Miao, Ma Shuang, Pei Lei, Sun Lin, Wu Chunxiao, Xu Min, Yang Ge, Yang Xigang, and Zeng Qingxi. The partners from universities in the USA were Eric Barnes, Derek Buescher, Yinquin Cheng, Melissa Franke, Una Kimokeo-Goes, Robert Margesson, and Jackson B. Miller.

Teresa Green provided very competent work as our CDEN coordinator. Without her good work I would never have been able to keep things running on schedule.

Lu Xing, both a personal and professional friend, author of three books about Chinese rhetoric, provided immense help with parts of the text that dealt specifically with argumentation from a Chinese perspective.

I especially want to thank my editor and proof-reader, Sharon Bowker. The book reads better because of her work. Also, because of her proof-reading and editing work, the community will be spared of the many errors I otherwise would have made.

I also want to acknowledge the work of David Douglass who worked with me on many aspects of the project and directed the China Advocacy Institute for three years.

# Preface

This textbook resulted from work produced by a team of people instrumental in the creation of CDEN over a three-year period from 2012 through 2015. CDEN is a loose association of teachers and students from six universities in the United States and 380 universities in the People's Republic of China. Over the course of the first three years of CDEN, over 5,700 students and almost 2,000 teachers and judges have participated in debate events held in various provinces of the People's Republic of China.

The formal mission of CDEN is to provide opportunities for Chinese university students along with students from other nations, primarily the United States, to come together in friendly competition to discuss issues of global importance. The goal of CDEN is to transcend individual national viewpoints, developing individuals who learn from one another toward becoming not only citizens of PRC and USA, but global citizens as well. Toward that end, this book is titled *Building Global Relations Through Debate*.

The chapters that follow explain how to participate in a debate format called *Worlds-Style debate*. The authors of the text present ways readers may become effective debaters, emphasizing that an effective debater is an ethical debater whose goal is to transcend the limited aim of winning the debate toward finding ways to respectfully and effectively manage global conflicts. In this text, the authors teach students to use informed and reasoned bases for creating and then engaging vital and sometimes tense clashes of significant ideas. Using integrity, skill, and high regard for the process and other individuals in the process, these effective debaters argue with reason and evidence to fashion viable ways to manage disagreement toward a peaceful solution.

# **CONTENTS**

## **Part One Introduction to Educational Debate**

---

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Chapter 1 Debate as a Valuable Social Process and a Unique Educational Tool</b> .... | 003 |
| Robert Trapp and He Jing  |     |
| 1.1 Why Study Debate? .....   | 003 |
| 1.2 An Historical Look at Argumentation and Debate in China and the United States ..... | 005 |
| 1.2.1 Argumentation and Debate in China .....   | 006 |
| 1.2.1.1 Argumentation in China.....   | 006 |
| 1.2.1.2 Debate in China.....  | 007 |
| 1.2.2 Argumentation and Debate in the United States .....                               | 009 |
| 1.2.2.1 Argumentation in the United States .....  | 009 |
| 1.2.2.2 Debate in the United States.....  | 010 |
| 1.3 Contemporary Developments in Argumentation, Debate, and Persuasion.....             | 012 |
| 1.4 Developments in Educational Debate .....  | 015 |
| 1.4.1 Educational Debate in the United States.....                                      | 016 |
| 1.4.2 Educational Debate in China .....   | 016 |
| 1.5 From Educational Debate to Generative Debate .....                                  | 017 |
| 1.6 Summary .....   | 020 |
| 1.7 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 1.....  | 021 |
| 1.8 Discussion Questions for Chapter 1.....   | 021 |
| <br><b>Chapter 2 Ethical Considerations in Debate</b> .....                             | 023 |
| Robert Trapp  |     |
| 2.1 The Ethical Debater .....   | 023 |
| 2.2 Four Features of Debate.....  | 024 |
| 2.2.1 Communicating Responsibly with Others .....                                       | 024 |
| 2.2.2 Using Arguments to Resolve Disagreements.....                                     | 025 |
| 2.2.3 Using an Adjudicator to Resolve Differences.....                                  | 025 |
| 2.2.4 Reaching an Outcome to a Conflict .....   | 026 |
| 2.3 Some Guidelines for Developing a Code of Ethics in Debate.....                      | 026 |
| 2.3.1 Employ Ethical Guidelines for the Use of Evidence .....                           | 027 |
| 2.3.2 Employ Ethical Guidelines for Choosing Arguments and Reasoning Patterns .....     | 028 |
| 2.3.3 Implement Mutual Equality .....   | 029 |
| 2.3.4 Interact Respectfully with Others Prior to, During, and After Debates .....       | 030 |
| 2.3.5 Champion Clashes of Ideas and Eschew Personal Attacks.....                        | 031 |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 2.3.6 Engage the Clash of Ideas Toward Creating the Most Elevated, Comprehensive, and Well Reasoned Arguments ..... | 031        |
| 2.3.7 Debate as a Global Citizen, Active and Participatory, Toward Generatively Embracing Vital Issues .....        | 032        |
| 2.4 Summary .....   | 032        |
| 2.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 2 .....   | 034        |
| 2.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 2 .....  | 034        |
| <b>Chapter 3 Concepts Fundamental to Debating .....</b>   | <b>035</b> |
| Robert Trapp  |            |
| 3.1 Two Sets of Related Concepts .....  | 035        |
| 3.1.1 Persuasion and Debate .....   | 035        |
| 3.1.2 Arguments and Argumentation .....   | 037        |
| 3.2 Components of Arguments .....   | 037        |
| 3.3 Kinds of Claims .....   | 038        |
| 3.4 Claims and Supporting Material .....  | 039        |
| 3.4.1 Claim Supported by Evidence .....   | 039        |
| 3.4.2 Claim Supported by Explanation .....  | 039        |
| 3.4.3 Claim Supported by Analogy .....  | 040        |
| 3.4.4 Claim Supported by Other Claims .....   | 040        |
| 3.5 Principles and Consequences as Means of Evaluation .....  | 041        |
| 3.6 Summary .....   | 042        |
| 3.7 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 3 .....   | 043        |
| 3.8 Discussion Questions for Chapter 3 .....  | 044        |
| <b>Chapter 4 Analyzing a Debate Topic .....</b>   | <b>045</b> |
| Robert Trapp  |            |
| 4.1 Analyzing Topic Background .....  | 045        |
| 4.2 Analyzing Topic Type .....  | 046        |
| 4.3 Analyzing the Definition and Interpretation of the Topic .....  | 047        |
| 4.4 Analyzing Potential Issues .....  | 049        |
| 4.4.1 Stock Issues for a Value Motion .....   | 049        |
| 4.4.2 Stock Issues for a Policy Motion .....  | 050        |
| 4.4.3 Government Approach to Stock Issues .....   | 051        |
| 4.4.4 Opposition Approach to Stock Issues .....   | 053        |
| 4.5 Summary .....   | 054        |
| 4.6 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 4 .....   | 055        |
| 4.7 Discussion Questions for Chapter 4 .....  | 055        |
| 4.8 Exercises for Chapter 4 .....   | 055        |

## **Part Two   Worlds-Style Debate**

---

|  |         |
|--|---------|
| <b>Chapter 5   Worlds-Style Debate as a Model of Educational Debate.....</b> | 059     |
| Robert Trapp and Yang Ge   |         |
| 5.1 Parliamentary Systems and Worlds-Style Debate.....                       | 059     |
| 5.2 Worlds-Style Debate Format.....  | 061     |
| 5.3 Responsibilities for Speakers in Worlds-Style Debate.....                | 063     |
| 5.3.1 Prime Minister .....   | 064     |
| 5.3.2 Leader of Opposition .....   | 065     |
| 5.3.3 Deputy Prime Minister.....   | 067     |
| 5.3.4 Deputy Leader of Opposition.....                                       | 067     |
| 5.3.5 Member of Government.....  | 068     |
| 5.3.6 Member of Opposition.....  | 069     |
| 5.3.7 Government Whip.....   | 070     |
| 5.3.8 Opposition Whip.....   | 070     |
| 5.4 Summary .....  | 071     |
| 5.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 5.....                                   | 071     |
| 5.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 5.....                                  | 072     |
| 5.7 Exercise for Chapter 5 .....   | 072     |
| <br><b>Chapter 6   Arguments by First Government Teams.....</b>              | <br>073 |
| Robert Trapp and Yang Ge   |         |
| 6.1 Role of the Prime Minister.....  | 073     |
| 6.1.1 Analyze the Motion.....  | 073     |
| 6.1.2 Create a Case for the Motion .....                                     | 074     |
| 6.2 Outline of a Prime Minister Speech Supporting a Value Motion .....       | 079     |
| 6.3 Outline of a Prime Minister Speech Supporting a Policy Motion .....      | 080     |
| 6.4 Role of the Deputy Prime Minister.....                                   | 082     |
| 6.5 Summary .....  | 083     |
| 6.6 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 6.....                                   | 083     |
| 6.7 Discussion Questions for Chapter 6.....                                  | 083     |
| 6.8 Exercises for Chapter 6 .....  | 084     |
| <br><b>Chapter 7   Arguments by First Opposition Teams.....</b>              | <br>085 |
| Robert Trapp   |         |
| 7.1 Role of Leader of Opposition .....                                       | 085     |
| 7.1.1 Provide a Clear Statement of the Opposition Stance in the Debate.....  | 086     |
| 7.1.1.1 The Opposition Stance When Debating a Policy Motion.....             | 086     |
| 7.1.1.2 The Opposition Stance When Debating a Value Motion .....             | 088     |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 7.1.2 Refutation of the Case of the Prime Minister .....                                   | 089        |
| 7.1.3 Construct Arguments to Oppose the Prime Minister’s Interpretation of the Motion..... | 089        |
| 7.2 Role of the Deputy Leader of Opposition.....   | 091        |
| 7.3 Common Kinds of Opposition Arguments .....   | 091        |
| 7.3.1 Arguments Against a Policy Motion .....  | 091        |
| 7.3.1.1 The Model Will Not Solve Problems.....   | 092        |
| 7.3.1.2 Principled Arguments Against the Model.....  | 093        |
| 7.3.1.3 The Model Will Create More Problems Than It Solves.....                            | 094        |
| 7.3.1.4 A Counter Proposal Is Better.....  | 096        |
| 7.3.2 Arguments Against a Value Motion .....   | 097        |
| 7.4 Summary .....  | 098        |
| 7.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 7.....   | 099        |
| 7.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 7.....  | 099        |
| 7.7 Exercises for Chapter 7 .....  | 099        |
| <b>Chapter 8 Extending the Debate in Member Speeches.....</b>                              | <b>101</b> |
| Robert Trapp and Teresa Green  |            |
| 8.1 Refuting Arguments in Member Speeches.....   | 101        |
| 8.2 Extending Arguments.....   | 102        |
| 8.2.1 Qualities of a Good Extension .....  | 103        |
| 8.2.2 Types of Extensions .....  | 104        |
| 8.2.3 Extending the Debate: Important Considerations .....                                 | 107        |
| 8.3 Using Preparation Time to Prepare for Member Speeches.....                             | 107        |
| 8.4 Summary .....  | 108        |
| 8.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 8.....   | 109        |
| 8.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 8.....  | 109        |
| 8.7 Exercises for Chapter 8 .....  | 109        |
| <b>Chapter 9 Summarizing the Debate in Whip Speeches .....</b>                             | <b>111</b> |
| Eric Barnes  |            |
| 9.1 Overview of Whip Speeches.....   | 111        |
| 9.2 Summarizing: What to Discuss.....  | 113        |
| 9.3 Summarizing: How to Organize .....   | 116        |
| 9.3.1 The Repeating Method.....  | 116        |
| 9.3.2 The Regrouping Method .....  | 117        |
| 9.3.3 Reframing Method .....   | 118        |
| 9.4 The Response Trap.....   | 122        |
| 9.5 Summary .....  | 124        |
| 9.6 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 9.....   | 126        |
| 9.7 Discussion Questions for Chapter 9.....  | 126        |
| 9.8 Exercises for Chapter 9 .....  | 126        |

## **Part Three Debating Skills**

---

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Chapter 10 Refuting and Rebuilding Arguments.....</b>          | 129        |
| Robert Trapp  |            |
| 10.1 Refuting Arguments .....                                     | 129        |
| 10.1.1 Methods of Refutation .....                                | 130        |
| 10.1.1.1 Internal Refutation .....                                | 130        |
| 10.1.1.2 External Refutation .....                                | 132        |
| 10.1.2 Deciding What to Refute.....                               | 133        |
| 10.1.3 Four-Step Method of Refutation.....                        | 134        |
| 10.2 Rebuilding Arguments .....                                   | 135        |
| 10.2.1 Five-Step Method of Rebuilding an Argument.....            | 136        |
| 10.3 Summary .....  | 138        |
| 10.4 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 10.....                      | 139        |
| 10.5 Discussion Questions for Chapter 10.....                     | 139        |
| 10.6 Exercises for Chapter 10.....                                | 140        |
| <b>Chapter 11 Points of Information .....</b>                     | <b>141</b> |
| Robert Trapp  |            |
| 11.1 Offering Points of Information.....                          | 142        |
| 11.1.1 Purposes of Points of Information .....                    | 142        |
| 11.1.2 Developing Effective Points of Information .....           | 144        |
| 11.1.3 Procedures for Offering Points of Information .....        | 145        |
| 11.2 Responding to Points of Information.....                     | 146        |
| 11.3 Summary .....  | 148        |
| 11.4 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 11 .....                     | 148        |
| 11.5 Discussion Questions for Chapter 11 .....                    | 148        |
| 11.6 Exercise for Chapter 11 .....                                | 149        |
| <b>Chapter 12 Research Strategies for Debate.....</b>             | <b>151</b> |
| Kathleen Spring   |            |
| 12.1 Developing Good Research Habits.....                         | 151        |
| 12.2 Selecting Appropriate Resources & Formulating Searches ..... | 152        |
| 12.3 Evaluating Websites .....                                    | 154        |
| 12.4 Summary .....  | 156        |
| 12.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 12.....                      | 156        |
| 12.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 12.....                     | 157        |
| 12.7 Exercise for Chapter 12 .....                                | 157        |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Chapter 13 Listening and Taking Notes .....</b>         | 159 |
| Jackson Miller   |     |
| 13.1 Listening in Debates .....                            | 159 |
| 13.2 Paraphrasing.....                                     | 160 |
| 13.3 Flowing the Debate.....                               | 161 |
| 13.4 Summary .....   | 162 |
| 13.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 13.....               | 163 |
| 13.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 13.....              | 163 |
| 13.7 Exercise for Chapter 13 .....                         | 163 |
| Appendix A—SAMPLE DEBATE FLOW SHEET.....                   | 165 |
| <br><b>Chapter 14 Delivery .....</b>                       | 167 |
| Melissa Franke   |     |
| 14.1 Becoming a Proficient Speaker.....                    | 167 |
| 14.2 General Features of Effective Delivery in Debate..... | 168 |
| 14.2.1 Speak to the Judges.....                            | 168 |
| 14.2.2 Extemporaneous Delivery.....                        | 169 |
| 14.2.3 Language Context .....                              | 169 |
| 14.3 Using the Body in Delivery .....                      | 170 |
| 14.3.1 Stance .....  | 170 |
| 14.3.2 Maintaining Eye Contact .....                       | 171 |
| 14.3.3 Facial Expressions .....                            | 171 |
| 14.3.4 Gestures.....                                       | 172 |
| 14.4 Using the Voice in Delivery .....                     | 172 |
| 14.4.1 Speaking Rate .....                                 | 172 |
| 14.4.2 Pauses.....   | 173 |
| 14.4.3 Volume .....  | 173 |
| 14.4.4 Tone.....   | 173 |
| 14.5 Summary .....   | 174 |
| 14.6 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 14.....               | 175 |
| 14.7 Discussion Questions for Chapter 14.....              | 175 |
| 14.8 Exercises for Chapter 14.....                         | 175 |

---

## Part Four Elements of Argument and Argumentation

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Chapter 15 Elements of Argument: Claims and Exceptions.....</b> | 179 |
| Robert Trapp   |     |
| 15.1 Claims .....  | 179 |

|  |         |
|--|---------|
| 15.1.1 Kinds of Claims .....                               | 182     |
| 15.1.1.1 Claims of Description and Definition .....        | 182     |
| 15.1.1.2 Claims of Association .....                       | 184     |
| 15.1.1.3 Claims of Evaluation.....                         | 185     |
| 15.1.2 A Taxonomy of Claims .....                          | 185     |
| 15.2 Exceptions.....                                       | 187     |
| 15.3 Summary .....   | 188     |
| 15.4 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 15.....               | 188     |
| 15.5 Discussion Questions for Chapter 15.....              | 189     |
| 15.6 Exercises for Chapter 15.....                         | 189     |
| <br><b>Chapter 16 Elements of Argument: Evidence .....</b> | <br>191 |
| Robert Trapp   |         |
| 16.1 Categories of Evidence .....                          | 191     |
| 16.1.1 Evidence Based on Reality .....                     | 192     |
| 16.1.1.1 Facts .....                                       | 192     |
| 16.1.1.2 Theories.....                                     | 195     |
| 16.1.1.3 Presumptions.....                                 | 196     |
| 16.1.2 Evidence Based on Preference.....                   | 197     |
| 16.1.2.1 Value.....  | 197     |
| 16.1.2.2 Value Hierarchies .....                           | 198     |
| 16.1.2.3 Value Categories .....                            | 199     |
| 16.2 Citing and Documenting Evidence .....                 | 199     |
| 16.3 Summary .....   | 200     |
| 16.4 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 16.....               | 201     |
| 16.5 Discussion Questions for Chapter 16.....              | 201     |
| 16.6 Exercise for Chapter 16 .....                         | 201     |
| <br><b>Chapter 17 Linking Evidence to Claims .....</b>     | <br>203 |
| Robert Trapp   |         |
| 17.1 Argument by Authority .....                           | 205     |
| 17.2 Argument by Generalization .....                      | 205     |
| 17.3 Argument by Analogy .....                             | 207     |
| 17.4 Argument by Causality.....                            | 208     |
| 17.5 Argument by Principle .....                           | 210     |
| 17.6 Argument by Incompatibility .....                     | 211     |
| 17.7 Argument by Dissociation.....                         | 212     |
| 17.8 Summary .....   | 213     |
| 17.9 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 17.....               | 213     |
| 17.10 Discussion Questions for Chapter 17.....             | 214     |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 17.11 Exercise for Chapter 17.....                                       | 214        |
| <b>Chapter 18 The Structure of Arguments.....</b>                        | <b>215</b> |
| Robert Trapp   |            |
| 18.1 Simple Arguments.....   | 216        |
| 18.2 Combined Arguments .....  | 218        |
| 18.3 Independent Arguments .....   | 219        |
| 18.4 Summary .....   | 220        |
| 18.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 18.....                             | 221        |
| 18.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 18.....                            | 221        |
| 18.7 Exercise for Chapter 18 .....                                       | 221        |
| <b>Chapter 19 Argumentation, Consequences, and Principles .....</b>      | <b>223</b> |
| Robert Trapp   |            |
| 19.1 Evaluation Based on Consequences of Action.....                     | 223        |
| 19.2 Evaluation Based on Principles of Duties and Rights .....           | 226        |
| 19.3 Summary .....   | 229        |
| 19.4 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 19.....                             | 230        |
| 19.5 Discussion Questions for Chapter 19.....                            | 230        |
| 19.6 Exercises for Chapter 19.....                                       | 230        |
| <b>Chapter 20 Combining Claims Coherently .....</b>                      | <b>231</b> |
| Robert Trapp   |            |
| 20.1 Supporting a Main Claim with a Series of Sub-Claims .....           | 231        |
| 20.2 A Pattern for Combining Sub-Claims to Support a Primary Claim ..... | 231        |
| 20.2.1 Sub-Claim One: Description or Definition .....                    | 232        |
| 20.2.2 Sub-Claim Two: Association .....                                  | 233        |
| 20.2.3 Sub-Claim Three: Evaluation.....                                  | 233        |
| 20.2.4 The General Pattern: Describe, Associate, Evaluate.....           | 233        |
| 20.3 Using the General Pattern to Create Arguments .....                 | 233        |
| 20.3.1 Supporting a Primary Claim of Value Using Consequences.....       | 234        |
| 20.3.2 Supporting a Primary Claim of Policy Using Consequences .....     | 235        |
| 20.3.3 Supporting a Primary Claim of Value Using Principles .....        | 236        |
| 20.3.4 Supporting a Primary Claim of Policy Using Principles .....       | 239        |
| 20.4 Summary .....   | 241        |
| 20.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 20.....                             | 242        |
| 20.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 20.....                            | 242        |
| 20.7 Exercise for Chapter 20 .....                                       | 242        |

## **Chapter 21 The Quality of Arguments: Fallacies in Argumentation.....243**

Robert Trapp

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 21.1 Criteria for Logical Assessment of Arguments ..... | 243 |
| 21.1.1 The Standard of Acceptability.....               | 245 |
| 21.1.2 The Standard of Relevance .....                  | 247 |
| 21.1.3 The Standard of Sufficiency.....                 | 247 |
| 21.2 Three Basic Fallacies .....                        | 248 |
| 21.2. 1 Problematic Premises.....                       | 249 |
| 21.2.1.1 Begging the Question.....                      | 249 |
| 21.2.1.2 The Fallacy of Incompatibility.....            | 250 |
| 21.2. 2 Irrelevant Reason .....                         | 251 |
| 21.2.2.1 Argument Ad Hominem.....                       | 251 |
| 21.2.2.2 An Argument of Straw .....                     | 252 |
| 21.2.2.3 A Red Herring Fallacy .....                    | 253 |
| 21.2.2.4 Poisoning the Well .....                       | 253 |
| 21.2.2.5 Guilt by Association.....                      | 253 |
| 21.2.2.6 An Appeal to Fear .....                        | 254 |
| 21.2.2.7 An Appeal to Popularity.....                   | 254 |
| 21.2.2.8 An Appeal to Tradition.....                    | 254 |
| 21.2. 3 Hasty Conclusions .....                         | 254 |
| 21.2.3.1 Hasty Generalization.....                      | 254 |
| 21.2.3.2 Slippery Slope Arguments .....                 | 255 |
| 21.2.3.3 Two Wrongs .....                               | 256 |
| 21.2.3.4 Improper Appeal to Practice .....              | 256 |
| 21.2.3.5 Fallacy of Composition.....                    | 256 |
| 21.2.3.6 Fallacy of Division.....                       | 256 |
| 21.2.3.7 Post Hoc Fallacy .....                         | 256 |
| 21.2.3.8 Faulty Analogy.....                            | 256 |
| 21.3 Summary .....                                      | 257 |
| 21.4 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 21.....            | 257 |
| 21.5 Discussion Questions for Chapter 21.....           | 258 |
| 21.6 Exercise for Chapter 21 .....                      | 258 |

## **Part Five Teaching and Coaching Debate**

### **Chapter 22 Judging and Evaluating Debates .....261**

Una Kimokeo-Goes

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 22.1 Mechanics of Judging Worlds-Style Debate ..... | 261 |
|---|-----|

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 22.2 Guidelines for Speaker Points.....                      | 263        |
| 22.3 Judge as Educator .....                                 | 267        |
| 22.4 Summary .....   | 269        |
| 22.5 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 22.....                 | 269        |
| 22.6 Discussion Questions for Chapter 22.....                | 269        |
| <b>Chapter 23 Administering a Debate Tournament .....</b>    | <b>271</b> |
| Jackson Miller and Chen Xiangjing                            |            |
| 23.1 Benefits of Hosting a Tournament .....                  | 271        |
| 23.2 Tournament Logistics.....                               | 272        |
| 23.2.1 Tournament Size and Location .....                    | 272        |
| 23.2.2 Space Requirements.....                               | 273        |
| 23.2.2.1 Central Gathering Area .....                        | 273        |
| 23.2.2.2 Registration Area .....                             | 273        |
| 23.2.2.3 Ballot Area .....                                   | 274        |
| 23.2.2.4 Tabulation Room.....                                | 274        |
| 23.3 Personnel and Their Responsibilities.....               | 274        |
| 23.3.1 Tournament Host and Tournament Director .....         | 274        |
| 23.3.2 Tabulation Director .....                             | 275        |
| 23.3.3 Chief Adjudicator.....                                | 276        |
| 23.3.4 Judges.....   | 277        |
| 23.3.5 Volunteers and Swing Teams .....                      | 277        |
| 23.3.6 Other Staff.....                                      | 278        |
| 23.4 Tournament Invitation.....                              | 278        |
| 23.5 Summary .....   | 279        |
| 23.6 Terms and Concepts from Chapter 23.....                 | 279        |
| 23.7 Discussion Questions for Chapter 23.....                | 279        |
| Appendix A—CHECK SHEET FOR HOSTING A DEBATE TOURNAMENT ..... | 280        |
| Appendix B—TOURNAMENT INVITATION TEMPLATE.....               | 283        |
| Appendix C—TABULATION TASKS FOR EACH DEBATE .....            | 286        |
| Appendix D—SAMPLE JUDGE HANDOUT .....                        | 288        |
| Appendix E—SAMPLE TOURNAMENT ENTRY FORM.....                 | 291        |
| <b>Works Cited .....</b>                                     | <b>293</b> |

# 中文目录（供参考）

## 第一部分 教学性辩论入门

|                               |     |
|-------------------------------|-----|
| <b>第一章 辩论的社会意义和教学意义</b> ..... | 003 |
| 罗伯特·崔普 何 静                    |     |
| 1.1 为什么要学习辩论.....             | 003 |
| 1.2 中美两国议论和辩论历史.....          | 005 |
| 1.2.1 中国的议论与辩论传统.....         | 006 |
| 1.2.1.1 中国的议论发展.....          | 006 |
| 1.2.1.2 中国的辩论发展.....          | 007 |
| 1.2.2 美国的议论与辩论传统.....         | 009 |
| 1.2.2.1 美国的议论发展.....          | 009 |
| 1.2.2.2 美国的辩论发展.....          | 010 |
| 1.3 议论、辩论与说服技能的当代发展.....      | 012 |
| 1.4 辩论教学的发展.....              | 015 |
| 1.4.1 美国辩论教学现状.....           | 016 |
| 1.4.2 中国辩论教学现状.....           | 016 |
| 1.5 从教学性辩论到生成性辩论.....         | 017 |
| 1.6 小结.....                   | 020 |
| 1.7 概念与术语.....                | 021 |
| 1.8 课后讨论.....                 | 021 |

|                                |     |
|--------------------------------|-----|
| <b>第二章 辩论中的道德问题</b> .....      | 023 |
| 罗伯特·崔普                         |     |
| 2.1 道德的辩手.....                 | 023 |
| 2.2 辩论的四个特点.....               | 024 |
| 2.2.1 负责地与他人交流.....            | 024 |
| 2.2.2 用论证解决纷争.....             | 025 |
| 2.2.3 用裁判裁决分歧.....             | 025 |
| 2.2.4 给冲突一个结果.....             | 026 |
| 2.3 几条建议：如何在辩论中遵循道德规范.....     | 026 |
| 2.3.1 在呈现论据时遵循道德准则.....        | 027 |
| 2.3.2 在选择论证和说理方式时遵循道德准则.....   | 028 |
| 2.3.3 遵循相互平等原则.....            | 029 |
| 2.3.4 在辩论前、辩论中和辩论后对他人保持尊重..... | 030 |
| 2.3.5 就事论事，避免人身攻击.....         | 031 |