



**LAW**  
and the **HUMAN BODY**

Property Rights, Ownership and Control

Rohan Hardcastle

# Law and the Human Body

## Property Rights, Ownership and Control

Rohan Hardcastle



• HART •  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2007

Published in North America (US and Canada) by  
Hart Publishing  
c/o International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213-3786  
USA  
Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190  
Fax: +1 503 280 8832  
E-mail: [orders@isbs.com](mailto:orders@isbs.com)  
Website: [www.isbs.com](http://www.isbs.com)

© Rohan Hardcastle 2007

Rohan Hardcastle has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988,  
to be identified as the author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system,  
or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart Publishing,  
or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic  
rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above  
should be addressed to Hart Publishing at the address below.

Hart Publishing, 16C Worcester Place, OX1 2JW  
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530 Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710  
E-mail: [mail@hartpub.co.uk](mailto:mail@hartpub.co.uk)  
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data  
Data Available  
ISBN: 978-1-84113-601-1 (hardback)

Typeset by Hope Services, Abingdon  
Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

---

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

This book grew out of a doctoral thesis I completed at the University of Oxford with the generous assistance of the Menzies Memorial Foundation and Magdalen College. As with a generation of Oxford doctoral students, I was fortunate to receive guidance and inspiration from Professors Jim Harris and Peter Birks. Initially, Jim Harris was my supervisor. Subsequently, Peter Birks took on this role as the thesis evolved to finality. Jim and Peter were warm and generous individuals to whom I will always be indebted. Tragically, both died in 2004. I am particularly grateful to Professors Ewan McKendrick and Robert Chambers for supervising the final stages. Professor Margot Brazier and Roderick Bagshaw examined the thesis and have continued to provide valuable feedback.

I also collected a wonderful group of friends at Oxford who read numerous drafts and debated this project with me. These include Greg O'Mahoney, Danny Priel, Stephen Daley, Sue Gibbons and Ben Kremer. Thank you also to my college supervisors, Professor Colin Tapper and Katharine Grevling, for their advice throughout my time at Magdalen College.

After Oxford, I worked as an associate to Justice Dyson Heydon AC of the High Court of Australia. Justice Heydon's private law jurisprudence provides a fine example of the standard to which academic scholarship should aspire. I am extremely grateful for his guidance and support.

Others have provided generous assistance along the way. Thank you to Professor Lori Andrews, Jeremy de Beer, Prue Bindon, Marjorie Daley, James Edelman, Justice Robert French, Anne Gaustad, Professor Peter Handford, William Heath, Jonathon Herring, Jane Kaye, Professor Graeme Laurie, Bryan Leach, Kathleen Liddell, Kane Loxley, Roger Magnusson, Professor Paul Matthews, Jackie Milijash, Professor Stephen Munzer, Dianne Nicol, Julia Paolitto, Tina Piper, Eloise Scotford, Professor Loane Skene, Rebecca Skloot, Caroline Spruce, Professor Niall Whitty, Houda Younan and Jennifer Younan.

It has been a pleasure to work with Richard Hart and the staff at Hart Publishing—their professionalism has been evident throughout the publishing process.

Finally, nothing would have been possible without my family. I owe them more than thanks. In particular, my mother and father—Helen and Philip Hardcastle—were and continue to be a constant source of strength and inspiration.

Rohan Hardcastle  
22 August 2007

---

## TABLE OF CASES

---

### Australia

<i>Associated Alloys Pty Ltd v Metropolitan Engineering and Fabrications Pty Ltd</i> (1996) 20 ACSR 205 (FCA).....	136
<i>Australian Broadcasting Corporation v Lenah Game Meats</i> [2001] HCA 63; (2001) 208 CLR 199 (HCA) .....	177
<i>AW v CW</i> [2002] NSWSC 301 (NSW SC).....	28, 30
<i>Burrows v Cramley</i> [2002] WASC 47 (WA SC) .....	28
<i>Carrier v Bonham</i> [2002] 1 Qd R 474 (Qld CA).....	191
<i>Cattanach v Melchoir</i> [2003] HCA 38; (2003) 215 CLR 1 (HCA) .....	173
<i>Coyne v Commercial Equity Corporation Ltd</i> (1998) 20 WAR 109 (WA SC).....	191
<i>Doe (Jane) v Australian Broadcasting Corporation &amp; Ors</i> [2007] VCC 281 (Vic CC) .....	177
<i>Doodeward v Spence</i> (1907) 24 NW (NSW) 189 (NSW SC).....	29
<i>Doodeward v Spence</i> (1908) 6 CLR 406 (HCA) .....	28–33, 37, 39, 83, 129, 132–33, 141
<i>E v Australian Red Cross Society</i> (1991) 27 FCR 310 (FCA) .....	84
<i>E v Australian Red Cross Society</i> (1991) 105 ALR 53 (FC FCA).....	84
<i>Farah Constructions Pty Ltd &amp; Ors v Say-Dee Pty Ltd</i> [2007] HCA 22 (HCA).....	12
<i>Giller v Procopets</i> [2004] VSC 113 (Vic SC).....	194–95
<i>Gimson v Victoria Workcover Authority</i> [1995] 1 VR 209 (Vic SC).....	191
<i>Gray, Re</i> [2001] 2 Qd R 35 (Qld SC) .....	28
<i>Grosse v Purvis</i> [2003] QDC 151 (Qld DC) .....	177
<i>Harriton (by her tutor Harriton) v Stevens</i> [2006] HCA 15; (2006) 226 CLR 52 (HCA) .....	173
<i>Kalaba v Commonwealth of Australia</i> [2004] FCAFC 326 (FC FCA).....	177
<i>Kent v Vessel ‘Maria Luisa’ (No 2)</i> [2003] FCAFC 93; (2003) 130 FCR 12 (FC FCA).....	156
<i>Leeburn v Derndorfer</i> [2004] VSC 172 (Vic SC).....	33, 39, 129
<i>McKeown v Cavalier Yachts Pty Ltd</i> (1988) 13 NSWLR 303 (NSW SC) .....	132
<i>Magill v Magill</i> [2006] HCA 51; (2006) 231 ALR 277 (HCA) .....	191
<i>Moorhouse v Angus and Robertson</i> [1981] 1 NSWLR 700 (NSW CA) .....	159
<i>Pavlovic v Commonwealth Bank of Australia</i> (1991) 56 SASR 587 (SA SC).....	191
<i>Penfold Wines Pty Ltd v Elliott</i> (1946) 74 CLR 204 (HCA) .....	161
<i>PQ v Australian Red Cross Society</i> [1992] 1 VR 19 (Vic SC).....	84
<i>Rendell v Associated Finance Pty Ltd</i> [1957] VR 604 (Vic SC).....	131

<i>Roche v Douglas</i> (2000) 22 WAR 331 (WA SC).....	28, 83, 87, 95, 127, 146
<i>Yanner v Eaton</i> [1999] HCA 53; (1999) 201 CLR 351 (HCA).....	13–14, 130, 154

## Canada

<i>Boothman v Canada</i> [1993] 3 FC 381 .....	191
<i>Clark v Canada</i> (1994) 20 CCLT 241 (FCTD) .....	191
<i>Edmonds v Armstrong Funeral Home</i> [1931] 1 DLR 676 (Alb SC).....	28, 42–43
<i>Les Editions Vice-Versa Inc v Aubry and Canadian Broadcasting Corporation</i> (1998) 157 DLR (4th) 577 (SCC) .....	177
<i>Mallette v Schullman</i> (1996) 67 DLR (4th) 321 (Ont SC).....	200
<i>Mason v Westside Cemeteries Ltd</i> (1996) 135 DLR (4th) 361 .....	56
<i>Monsanto Canada Inc v Schmeiser</i> [2004] SCC 34; [2004] 1 SCR 902 (SCC).....	164–65
<i>Neeb v Hoffman</i> [1989] OJ No 302 QL (Ont DC).....	168
<i>Popowich v Letweniuk</i> [1972] 1 WWR 641 (Sask DC) .....	168
<i>R v Tessling</i> [2004] SCC 67; (2004) 244 DLR (4th) 541 (SCC) .....	177
<i>Rahemtulla v Vanfed Credit Union</i> (1984) 29 CCLT 78 (BC SC).....	191
<i>Timmermans v Buelow</i> (1984) 38 CCLT 36 (FCTD) .....	191
<i>Tran v Financial Recovery Debt Recovery Ltd</i> (2000) 193 DLR (4th) 168.....	194

## European Court of Human Rights

<i>Botta v Italy</i> (1998) 26 EHRR 241 .....	17
<i>Case of Von Hannover v Germany</i> (2005) 40 EHRR 1.....	17, 176
<i>Costello-Roberts v UK</i> (1993) Series A, No 247-C; (1995) 19 EHRR 112.....	17, 176
<i>Evans v UK</i> (2006) 43 EHRR 21 .....	90
<i>Evans v UK</i> [2007] ECHR 264.....	90
<i>Wainwright v UK</i> [2006] ECHR 807.....	178
<i>X and Y v Netherlands</i> [1985] ECHR 4 .....	59

## Germany

BGHZ 1994, 124 (Federal Court of Justice).....	63
--	----

## New Zealand

<i>Hosking v Runting</i> [2004] NZCA 34 (NZCA).....	177
---	-----

## United Kingdom

<i>Airedale NHS Trust v Bland</i> [1993] AC 789 (HL) .....	16–17
<i>Alcock v Chief Constable of South Yorkshire Police</i> [1992] 1 AC 310 (HL) .....	189
<i>Archer v Brown</i> [1985] QB 401 .....	190
<i>Archer v Williams</i> [2003] EWHC 1670; [2003] EMLR 38 .....	182, 196–97
<i>Armory v Delamirie</i> (1722) 1 Stra 505 .....	162
<i>Arrow Shipping Co v Tyne Improvement Commissioners (The Crystal)</i> [1984] AC 508 (HL) .....	159
<i>Aston Cantlow and Wilmcote with Billesley Parochial Church Council v</i> <i>Wallbank</i> [2003] UKHL 37; [2004] 1 AC 546 (HL) .....	184–85
<i>Attorney-General v Blake (Jonathan Cape Ltd Third Party)</i> [2001] 1 AC 268 .....	162
<i>Attorney-General v Guardian Newspapers Ltd (No 2)</i> [1990] 1 AC 109 (HL) .....	179, 181
<i>BBMB Finance (Hong Kong) Ltd v Eda Holdings Ltd</i> [1990] 1 WLR 409 (PC) .....	162
<i>Berley v Poulet</i> (1977) 241 EG 911 (CA) .....	132
<i>Blades v Higgs</i> (1865) 11 HLC 622 .....	154
<i>Blagdon Cemetery, In re</i> [2002] 3 WLR 603 (Arches Ct of Cant) .....	27, 50
<i>Boardman v Phipps</i> [1967] 2 AC 46 (HL) .....	12
<i>Bolitho v City &amp; Hackney Health Authority</i> [1998] AC 232 (HL) .....	19
<i>Borden (UK) Ltd v Scottish Timber Products Ltd</i> [1981] Ch 25 .....	134–35, 137–38, 140–41
<i>Bradley v Newsom</i> [1919] AC 16 (HL) .....	159
<i>Burnett v George</i> [1992] 1 FLR 525 (CA) .....	191
<i>Butler v Board of Trade</i> [1971] Ch 680 .....	179
<i>Cambridge Water Co v Eastern Countries Leather plc</i> [1994] 2 AC 264 (HL) .....	198
<i>Campbell v MGN Ltd</i> [2004] UKHL 22; [2004] 2 AC 457 (HL) .....	178–83
<i>Case of Swans</i> (1592) 7 Co Rep 15b; 77 ER 435 .....	130, 168
<i>Cassell &amp; Co v Broome</i> [1972] AC 1027 (HL) .....	190, 196
<i>Chester v Afshar</i> [2004] UKHL 41; [2005] 1 AC 134 (HL) .....	17, 19, 173, 188
<i>Clerk v London General Omnibus Co Ltd</i> [1906] 2 KB 648 (CA) .....	48
<i>Cochrane v Moore</i> (1890) 25 QBD 57 .....	157
<i>Coco v AN Clark (Engineers) Ltd</i> [1969] RPC 41 .....	181
<i>Cole v Turner</i> (1704) 6 Mod 149; 87 ER 907 .....	19
<i>Collins v Wilcock</i> [1984] 1 WLR 1172 (CA) .....	18, 185
<i>Commissioner of Stamp Duties (Qld) v Livingston</i> [1965] AC 694 .....	150
<i>Consolidated Company v Curtis &amp; Son</i> [1892] 1 QB 495 .....	161
<i>Conway v Dalziel</i> (1901) 3 F 918 .....	57
<i>Costello v Chief Constable of Derbyshire Constabulary</i> [2001] 1 WLR 1437 (CA) .....	161
<i>Crystal, The</i> . See <i>Arrow Shipping Co v Tyne Improvement Commissioners</i>	

<i>Dewar v Dewar</i> [1975] 1 WLR 1532 (CA) .....	157
<i>Dobson v North Tyneside Health Authority</i> [1997] 1 WLR 596 (CA) .....	30–32, 39, 46, 48, 129
<i>Douglas v Hello! Ltd</i> [2001] QB 967 .....	177–78, 182
<i>Douglas v Hello! Ltd (No 3)</i> [2005] EWCA 595; [2006] QB 125 (CA) .....	12, 179, 183
<i>Douglas v Hello! Ltd (No 3)</i> [2007] UKHL 21; [2007] 2 WLR 920 (HL) .....	12, 160, 179–80, 183–84
<i>DPP v Smith</i> [2006] EWHC 94; [2006] 1 WLR 1571 .....	93–94
<i>Drane v Evangelou</i> [1978] 1 WLR 455 (CA) .....	190, 196
<i>Dulieu v White &amp; Sons</i> [1901] 2 KB 669 .....	192
<i>Ellerman Wilson Line v Webster</i> [1952] 1 Lloyd's Reports 179 (CA) .....	159
<i>Evans v Amicus Healthcare Ltd (Evans); Midland Fertility Services v Hadley</i> [2003] EWHC 2161; [2004] 2 WLR 713 (Fam) .....	89–90
<i>Evans v Amicus Healthcare Ltd (Evans CA); Midland Fertility Services v Hadley</i> [2004] EWCA Civ 727; [2005] Fam 1 (CA) .....	89–90, 176
<i>Exelby v Handyside (Handyside's Case)</i> (1749) 2 East PC 652 .....	12, 26
<i>F (Mental Patient: Sterilisation), Re</i> [1990] 2 AC 1 (HL) .....	17–18
<i>Faccenda Chicken v Fowler</i> [1987] Ch 117 .....	179
<i>Foskett v McKeown</i> [2001] 1 AC 102 (HL) .....	131
<i>Foster v Dodd</i> (1867) LR 3 QB 67 .....	27
<i>Fouldes v Willoughby</i> (1841) 8 M & W 540; 151 ER 1153 .....	161
<i>Freeman v Home Office</i> [1984] 1 QB 524 .....	18
<i>General &amp; Finance Facilities v Cook Cars (Romford) Ltd</i> [1963] 1 WLR 644 (CA) .....	162
<i>Glencore International v Metro Trading International</i> [2001] 1 Lloyd's Law Reports 284 (QB) .....	138–40
<i>Gregson v Gilbert</i> (1783) 3 Doug 232; 99 ER 629 .....	64
<i>Hamps v Darby</i> [1946] 2 KB 311 .....	130
<i>Handyside's Case</i> . See <i>Exelby v Handyside</i>	
<i>Haynes's Case</i> (1614) 12 Co Rep 113; 77 ER 1389 .....	26
<i>Hillesden Securities Ltd v Ryjak Ltd</i> [1983] 1 WLR 959 (CA) .....	162
<i>Hollins v Fowler</i> (1875) LR 7 HL 757 .....	161
<i>Howard Perry Ltd v British Railways Board</i> [1980] 1 WLR 1375 (CA) .....	163
<i>Hughes v Robertson</i> 1913 13 SC 394; 1912 SLT 503 (IH) .....	43, 57
<i>Hunter v Canary Wharf Ltd</i> [1997] AC 655 (HL) .....	184, 192–94
<i>IBL Ltd v Coussens</i> [1991] 2 All ER 133 (CA) .....	163
<i>Indian Oil Corporation Ltd v Greenstone Shipping SA (Panama)</i> [1988] 1 QB 345 .....	139
<i>Industrial Furnaces Ltd v Reaves</i> [1970] RPC 605 (Ch) .....	182
<i>Ingall v Moran</i> [1944] KB 160 .....	48
<i>International Banking Corporation v Ferguson, Shaw &amp; Sons</i> 1910 SC 182 .....	136
<i>Jarvis v Swans Tours</i> [1973] QB 233 .....	196
<i>Jenkins v Tucker</i> (1778) 1 Bl H 90; 138 ER 55 .....	48



<i>Keary v Patterson</i> [1939] 1 KB 471 .....	130
<i>Kebilene, ex parte</i> [2000] 2 AC 326 (HL) .....	59
<i>Khorasandjian v Bush</i> [1993] 1 QB 727 (CA) .....	191–92
<i>Kinlock Damph Ltd v Nordvik Salmon Farms Ltd</i> , unreported, 30 June 1999 (OH) .....	137, 166–68
<i>Kuwait Airways Corporation v Iraqi Airways Co</i> [2001] 3 WLR 1117 (CA) .....	162
<i>Kuwait Airways Corporation v Iraqi Airways Co (Nos 4 and 5)</i> [2002] UKHL 19; [2002] 2 AC 883 (HL) .....	160
<i>Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust v A</i> [2003] EWHC 259; [2003] 1 FLR 1091 (QB) .....	88
<i>McDonald v Provan (of Scotland Street) Ltd</i> (1960) SLT 231 .....	137
<i>McFarlane v Tayside Health Board</i> [2000] 2 AC 59 (HL) .....	17, 175, 186–87
<i>McGruer, Petr</i> (1899) 15 Sh Ct Rep 38 .....	26
<i>McLoughlin v O'Brian</i> [1983] 1 AC 410 (HL) .....	189
<i>Mainstream Properties Ltd v Young</i> [2007] UKHL 21; [2007] 2 WLR 920 .....	12, 160, 179
<i>Malone v Metropolitan Police Commissioner</i> [1979] Ch 334 .....	179, 196
<i>Marq v Christie Manson &amp; Woods Ltd (trading as Christie's)</i> [2004] QB 286 .....	160–61
<i>Michael v Molesworth</i> [1950] 2 <i>British Medical Journal</i> 171 .....	18
<i>Morris v CW Martin &amp; Sons Ltd</i> [1966] 1 QB 716 .....	158
<i>Morrison v Moat</i> (1851) 9 Hare 241; 68 ER 492 .....	179
<i>Mulgrave v Ogden</i> (1591) Cro Eliz 219; 78 ER 475 .....	161
<i>OBG Ltd v Allan</i> [2007] UKHL 21; [2007] 2 WLR 920 .....	12, 160, 179
<i>Organ Retention Group Litigation, Re</i> [2004] EWHC 644; [2005] QB 506 .....	i, 28, 34–40, 42–43, 46, 48–49, 59–61, 115, 129–30, 132–33, 141–42, 149–50, 160, 174, 184–85, 188–89, 198
<i>Page v Smith</i> [1996] 1 AC 155 (HL) .....	190
<i>Peachdart Ltd, Re</i> [1983] 1 Ch 131 .....	135–36, 138
<i>Pollok v Workman</i> (1900) 2 F 354 .....	43, 57, 197
<i>Potter v Price</i> [2004] EWHC 781 .....	193
<i>Powell v Boladz</i> [1998] Lloyd's Rep Med 116 (CA) .....	191
<i>R v Bentham</i> [2003] EWCA Crim 3751; [2004] 1 Cr App R 487 (CA) .....	15
<i>R v Bentham</i> [2005] UKHL 18; [2005] 1 WLR 1057 (HL) .....	15, 64, 127–28, 147
<i>R v Bristol Coroner, ex p Kerr</i> [1974] QB 652 .....	48, 53
<i>R v Broadcasting Standards Commission, ex parte BBC</i> [2001] QB 885 .....	177
<i>R v Brown</i> [1996] AC 543 (HL) .....	96
<i>R v Coleridge</i> (1819) 2 B & Ald 804; 106 ER 559 .....	27
<i>R v Fox</i> (1841) 2 QB 246; 114 ER 95 .....	47–48
<i>R v Herbert</i> [1961] JPLGR 12 .....	13, 93
<i>R v Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority, ex parte Blood</i> [1997] 2 FLR 742 (CA) .....	90

<i>R v Hunter</i> [1974] 3 WLR 374 (CA) .....	27
<i>R v Kelly</i> [1999] QB 621 (CA) .....	12, 28, 31–32, 34–35, 37–40, 46, 61, 96, 115, 129, 131–32, 141, 150–52
<i>R v Lynn</i> (1788) 2 TR 733; 100 ER 394 .....	27
<i>R v Price</i> (1884) 12 QB 247 .....	27
<i>R v Rothery</i> [1976] RTR 550 (CA) .....	13, 82–83, 87, 95, 127, 146
<i>R v Scott</i> (1842) 2 QB 248; 114 ER 97 .....	48
<i>R v Sharpe (Sharpe's Case)</i> (1856–1857) Dears & Bell 160; 169 ER 959 .....	27, 32, 47
<i>R v Stewart</i> (1840) 12 Ad & E 773; 113 ER 1007 .....	47–48
<i>R v Vann</i> (1851) 2 Den 325; 169 ER 523 .....	48
<i>R v Welsh</i> [1974] RTR 478 (CA) .....	13, 94–95, 127, 146
<i>R v Young</i> , unreported, (1784) 4 Wentworth Pleadings 219 .....	27
<i>R (Burke) v General Medical Council</i> [2004] EWHC 1879; [2005] QB 424 .....	17, 174
<i>R (Burke) v General Medical Council</i> [2005] EWCA Civ 1003; [2006] QB 273 (CA) .....	17
<i>R (S) v Chief Constable of the South Yorkshire Police; R (Marper) v Chief Constable of the South Yorkshire Police (R (S) CA)</i> [2002] EWCA Civ 1275; [2002] 1 WLR 3223 .....	99–100, 174
<i>R (S) v Chief Constable of the South Yorkshire Police; R (Marper) v Chief Constable of the South Yorkshire Police (R (S) HL)</i> [2004] UKHL 39; [2004] 1 WLR 2196 (HL) .....	97, 99–100, 121, 174–75, 182
<i>Rees v Darlington Memorial Hospital NHS Trust</i> [2002] EWCA Civ 88; [2003] QB 20 (CA) .....	186
<i>Rees v Darlington Memorial Hospital NHS Trust</i> [2003] UKHL 52; [2004] 1 AC 309 (HL) .....	16, 176, 186–88, 200
<i>Richardson v Atkinson</i> (1723) 1 Str 576; 93 ER 710 .....	161
<i>Rolfe, Re</i> (1952) 36 Cr App Rep 4 .....	19
<i>Scroggan v Stewardson</i> (1674) 3 Keb 369; 84 ER 771 .....	93
<i>Sharp v Lush</i> (1879) 10 Ch D 468 (CA) .....	47
<i>Sharpe's Case</i> . See <i>R v Sharpe</i>	
<i>Sidaway v Board of Governors of the Bethlem Royal and the Maudsley Hospital</i> [1985] AC 871 (HL) .....	18–19
<i>Smith</i> (1866) F&F 1066; 176 ER 910 .....	19
<i>Sommersett's Case</i> (1772) Loft 1; 98 ER 499 .....	64
<i>Spectrum Plus Ltd (in liquidation), In re</i> [2005] UKHL 41; [2005] 2 AC 680 (HL) .....	179
<i>Stevens v Yorkhill NHS Trust and Southern General University Hospitals NHS Trust</i> [2006] CSOH 143; 2006 SLT 889 (OH) .....	34, 43, 56–59, 197
<i>Three Rivers v Bank of England (No 3)</i> [2001] UKHL 16; [2003] 2 AC 1 (HL) .....	199
<i>Tucker v Farm and General Investment Trust Ltd</i> [1966] 2 QB 421 (CA) .....	168
<i>United Australia Ltd v Barclays Bank Ltd</i> [1941] AC 1 (HL) .....	162
<i>V-B (Abduction: Custody Right), Re</i> [1999] 2 FLR 192 (CA) .....	50

<i>Victorian Railways Commissioners v Coultas</i> (1888) 13 App Cas 222 (PC) .....	191
<i>Wainwright v Home Office</i> [2001] EWCA Civ 2081; [2002] QB 1334 .....	18, 191
<i>Wainwright v Home Office</i> [2003] UKHL 53; [2004] 2 AC 406 (HL) .....	18, 177–79, 182, 191–94, 196–97
<i>Whiteley v Hill</i> [1918] 2 KB 808 .....	163
<i>Wilkinson v Downton</i> [1897] 2 QB 57 .....	178, 190–92
<i>Williams v Williams</i> (1882) 20 Ch D 659 (CA) .....	47
<i>Wilson v Pringle</i> [1987] 1 QB 237 .....	186
<i>Winkfield, The</i> [1902] P 42 (CA) .....	161
<i>Wong v Parkside Health NHS Trust</i> [2001] EWCA Civ 1721; [2003] 3 All ER 932 (CA) .....	191, 193
<i>YL v Birmingham City Council &amp; Ors</i> [2007] UKHL 27 .....	184–85
<i>Young v Hichens</i> (1844) 6 QB 606 .....	130

## United States of America

<i>Balkowitsch v Minneapolis War Memorial Blood Bank</i> 123 NW 2d 805 (Minn SC 1965) .....	85
<i>Banks v Fritsch</i> 39 SW 3d 481 (Ky CA 2001) .....	194
<i>Bauer v North Fulton Medical Center</i> 527 SE 2d 240 (Geo CA 1999) .....	41
<i>Biro v Hartman Funeral Home</i> 669 NE 2d 65 (Ohio App 1995) .....	52
<i>Board of Regents of State Colleges v Roth</i> 408 US 564; 92 S Ct 2701 (1972) .....	41
<i>Brotherton v Cleveland</i> 923 F 2d 477 (6th Cir 1991) .....	41–42
<i>Brown v Mathews Mortuary</i> 801 P 2d 371 (Idaho SC 1990) .....	52
<i>Carney v Knollwood Cemetery Association</i> 514 NE 2d 430 (Ohio App 1986) .....	52–53, 55–56
<i>Carter v Inter-Faith Hospital of Queens</i> 304 NYS 2d 97 (NY SC 1969) .....	86
<i>Christensen v Superior Court</i> 820 P 2d 181 (Cal SC 1990) .....	194
<i>Colavito v New York Organ Donor Network Inc</i> 356 F Supp 2d 237 (EDNY 2005) .....	44
<i>Colavito v New York Organ Donor Network Inc</i> 438 F 3d 214 (2nd Cir 2006) .....	44–45, 150
<i>Colavito v New York Organ Donor Network Inc</i> 6 NY 3d 820 (NY CA 2006) .....	45
<i>Colavito v New York Organ Donor Network Inc</i> 8 NY 3d 43 (NY CA 2006) .....	i, 45–46
<i>Colavito v New York Organ Donor Network Inc</i> 486 F 3d 78 (2nd Cir 2007) .....	46, 150
<i>Community Blood Bank Inc v Russell</i> 196 So 2d 115 (Flo Sup 1967) .....	85–86
<i>Crocker v Pleasant</i> 778 So 2d 978 (Fla App 2001) .....	41
<i>Culpepper v Pearl Street Building Inc</i> 877 P 2d 877 (Colo SC 1999) .....	41, 52
<i>Cunningham v MacNeal Memorial Hospital</i> 266 NE 2d 897 (Ill SC 1970) .....	85
<i>Dampier v Wayne County</i> 592 NW 2d 809 (Mich App 1999) .....	41

<i>Del Zio v Columbia Presbyterian Hospital</i> , unreported, US Dist SDNY No 14 (1978) .....	92
<i>Dibblee v Dr WH Groves Latter-Day Saints Hospital</i> 364 P 2d 1085 (Ut SC 1961) .....	85
<i>Enos v Snyder</i> 63 P 170 (Cal SC 1900) .....	28, 51–52
<i>Folz v State</i> 797 P 2d 246 (NW SC 1990) .....	194
<i>Georgia Lions Eye Bank Inc v Lavant</i> 335 SE 2d 127 (Ga SC 1985) .....	41
<i>Goddard v Watters</i> 82 SE 304 (Geo CA 1914) .....	191
<i>Great Atlantic &amp; Pacific Tea Co v Roch</i> 153 A 22 (Md CA 1930) .....	191
<i>Green v Commissioner</i> 74 TC 1229 (US Tax Ct 1980) .....	86–87
<i>Greenberg v Miami Children’s Hospital Research Institute</i> 264 F Supp 2d 1064 (US DC Florida 2003) .....	71–73, 75–76, 78, 100, 125, 146
<i>Hainey v Parrott</i> (Oh US DC 2005) .....	41
<i>Hecht v Superior Court</i> 20 Cal Rptr 2d 275 (Cal CA 1993) .....	91–92
<i>Hinkley v Baker</i> 122 F Supp 2d 57 (US DC 2000) .....	194
<i>Hively v Higgs</i> 253 P 363 (Or SC 1927) .....	185
<i>International News Service v Associated Press</i> 248 US 215; 39 S Ct 68 (1918) .....	52
<i>Jaynes v Strong-Thorne Mortuary Inc</i> 954 P 2d 45 (NM SC 1997) .....	194
<i>Johnson v Sampson</i> 208 NW 814 (Minn SC 1926) .....	191
<i>Larson v Chase</i> 50 NW 238 (Minn SC 1891) .....	51
<i>Lincoln Bank &amp; Trust Co v Netter</i> 253 SW 2d 260 (Ky CA 1952) .....	132
<i>Martin v Kim</i> (Ind US DC 2005) .....	41
<i>Meek v State</i> 185 NE 899 (Ind SC 1933) .....	52
<i>Miles v Scripps</i> 810 F Supp 1091 (Cal DC 1993) .....	87
<i>Mohr v Williams</i> 104 NW 12 (Minn SC 1905) .....	185
<i>Moore v Regents of the University of California (Moore CA)</i> 249 Cal Rptr 494 (Cal App 1988) .....	65–67, 69, 71, 75, 125
<i>Moore v Regents of the University of California (Moore SC)</i> 793 P 2d 479 (Cal SC 1990) .....	65–73, 75, 78, 87, 100, 125, 146, 165, 171
<i>Newman v Sathyavaglswaran</i> 287 F 3d 786 (9th Cir 2002) .....	41
<i>O’Donnell v Slack</i> 55 P 906 (Cal SC 1899) .....	28
<i>Parrat v Taylor</i> 451 US 527; 101 S Ct 1908 (1981) .....	40
<i>Penn Centre Transport Co v New York City</i> 438 US 104 (1978) .....	42
<i>Perlmutter v Beth David Hospital</i> 123 NE 2d 792 (NY App 1954) .....	85–86
<i>Pettigrew v Pettigrew</i> 56 A 878 (Pa SC 1904) .....	52
<i>Phillips v Washington Legal Foundation</i> 524 US 156; 118 S Ct 1925 (1998) .....	13
<i>Pierce v Goddard</i> 39 Mass 559 (Mass SC 1839) .....	138
<i>Pierce v Proprietors of Swan Point Cemetery</i> 14 Am Rep 465 (RI SC 1881) .....	51, 53
<i>Pierson v Post</i> 2 Am Dec 264 (NY SC 1805) .....	130, 154
<i>Ramirez v Health Partners of S Ariz</i> 972 P 2d 658 (Ariz App 1998) .....	56
<i>Reilly v King County Central Blood Bank</i> 492 P 2d 246 (Wash App 1972) .....	85
<i>Reinihan v Wright</i> 25 NE 822 (Ind SC 1890) .....	53
<i>Roberts v Suburban Hospital Association Inc</i> 532 A 2d 1081 (Md AC 1987) .....	85
<i>Scarpaci v Milwaukee County</i> 292 NW 2d 816 (Wis SC 1980) .....	52, 55–56

<i>Schloendorff v Society of New York v Hospital</i> 211 NY 125 (NY CA 1914) .....	18
<i>Silbury v McCoon</i> 3 NY 379 (NY CA 1850) .....	133, 138
<i>Snyder v Holy Cross Hospital</i> 352 A 2d 334 (Md App 1976) .....	51
<i>State v Edwards</i> 137 SW 2d 447 (Mo SC 1940) .....	158
<i>US v Arora</i> 806 F Supp 1091 (Md DC 1994) .....	87–88, 163, 165
<i>US v Cox</i> 428 F 2d 683 (7th Cir 1970) .....	94, 151, 159
<i>US v Garber</i> 607 F 2d 92 (5th Cir 1979) .....	86–87
<i>US v General Motors</i> 323 US 373; 65 S Ct 357 (1945) .....	13
<i>Venner v State of Maryland</i> 554 A 2d 483 (Md App 1976) .....	66, 95, 159
<i>Voss v Bolzenius</i> 128 SW 1 (Miss CA 1910) .....	191
<i>Washington University v Catalona (Catalona)</i> 437 F Supp 2d 985 (US DC Ed Mo 2006) .....	71, 73–78, 100, 146, 158
<i>Washington University v Catalona (Catalona CA)</i> 2007 WL 1758268; 490 F 3d 667 (8th Cir 2007) .....	i, 71, 77, 100, 125, 146, 157, 158
<i>Whaley v County of Tuscola</i> 58 F 3d 1111 (6th Cir 1995) .....	41–42
<i>Whitehair v Highland Memory Gardens</i> 327 SE 2d 438 (WVa SC 1985) .....	51–52

---

# TABLE OF LEGISLATION, RULES, EUROPEAN INSTRUMENTS AND TREATIES

---

## Australia

Health Records and Information Privacy Act 2002 (NSW)	
s 5(2) .....	98
Human Reproductive Technology Act 1991 (WA)	
ss 25–26 .....	91
Human Tissue Act 1982 (Vic)	
s 3(1) .....	81
s 5 .....	91
s 7 .....	81
ss 9–10 .....	81
ss 25–27 .....	53
s 38 .....	79
Human Tissue Act 1983 (NSW)	
s 4(1) .....	81
ss 6–7 .....	81
s 9 .....	81
s 12 .....	81
ss 23–25 .....	53
s 32 .....	79
s 32(1)–(2) .....	79, 113
s 34(1)(b) .....	81, 101, 108, 121
s 34(1)(b1) .....	81
Human Tissue Act 1985 (Tas)	
s 3(1) .....	81
s 5 .....	91
s 7 .....	81
s 9 .....	81
s 14 .....	81
ss 23–25 .....	53
s 27(2) .....	79, 113
Human Tissue and Anatomy Legislation Amendment Act 2003 (NSW) .....	81, 108
Human Tissue Transplant Act 1979 (NT)	
s 4(1) .....	81
s 6 .....	91

s 8 .....	81
ss 10–11 .....	81
ss 18–20 .....	53
s 24 .....	79
s 24(4) .....	79, 113
<b>Human Tissue and Transplant Act 1982 (WA)</b>	
s 3(1) .....	81
s 6 .....	91
s 8 .....	81
s 15 .....	81
ss 25–27 .....	53
s 29 .....	79
<b>Infertility (Medical Procedures) Act 1984 (Vic)</b>	
ss 12–14 .....	91
<b>Information Privacy Act 2000 (Vic)</b>	
s 3 .....	98
<b>Inheritance (Family and Dependants Provision) Act 1972 (WA)</b>	
s 7(1)(c) .....	83
<b>Privacy Legislation Amendment Act 2006 (Cth)</b>	
s 3 .....	98
Sch 2 .....	98
<b>Privacy and Personal Information Act 1998 (NSW)</b>	
s 4(2) .....	98
<b>Reproductive Technology Act 1988 (SA)</b>	
s 10 .....	91
<b>Supreme Court Rules 1971 (WA)</b>	
Ord 52, r 3(1) .....	83
<b>Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth)</b>	
s 71 .....	84
s 74 .....	84
<b>Transplantation and Anatomy Act 1978 (ACT)</b>	
s 4(1) .....	81
s 6 .....	91
s 8 .....	81
s 10 .....	81
s 15 .....	81
s 44 .....	79
s 44(2) .....	79, 113
<b>Transplantation and Anatomy Act 1979 (Qld)</b>	
s 5(1) .....	81
s 7 .....	91
s 10 .....	81
ss 12–13 .....	81
s 40 .....	79

Transplantation and Anatomy Act 1983 (SA)	
s 5(1) .....	81
s 7 .....	91
s 9 .....	81
s 15 .....	81
s 35 .....	79
s 35(3) .....	79, 113

## Canada

Patents Act .....	165
-------------------	-----

## Denmark

Act on Protection of Personal Data 2000 .....	97
§ 1(2) .....	97
§ 3(3) .....	97

## European Union

### *Conventions*

European Convention on Human Rights	
Art 8 .....	17, 59–60, 90, 99, 174, 176, 178, 181, 184–85, 197
Art 8(1) .....	59–60, 99, 176, 184
Art 8(2) .....	60, 99, 178, 184
Art 10 .....	181
Art 14 .....	99
European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Dignity of the Human Being with regard to the Application of Biology and Medicine 1997	
Art 21 .....	116

### *Directives*

Council Directive (EC) 95/46 on the Protection of Individuals with Regard to the Processing of Personal Data and on the Free Movement of such Data (Personal Data Directive) [1995] OJ L281/31 .....	96–97
Council Directive (EC) 98/44 on the Legal Protection of Biotechnological Inventions (Biotech Directive) [1998] OJ L213/13	
Recital 26 .....	80



Council Directive (EC) 2004/23 on Setting Standards of Quality and Safety of the Donation, Procurement, Testing, Processing, Preservation, Storage and Distribution of Human Tissues and Cells (Tissue Directive) [2004] OJ L102/48	
Art 13 .....	80
Recital 9 .....	80
Recitals 18–19.....	80

## Germany

Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch (BGB) (Civil Code)	
§ 90.....	63, 145
Grundgesetz (GG) (Constitution)	
Art 1 .....	176
Strafgesetzbuch (StGB) (Criminal Code)	
§ 242.....	63, 145

## Iceland

Act on Biobanks, No 110/2000 .....	6
Act on a Health Sector Database, No 139/1998 .....	6–7

## International

Charter of the United Nations 1945	
Preamble.....	16
Universal Declaration of Human Rights 1948 .....	16

## United Kingdom

### *Statutes*

Act on the banning of the African slave trade 1807 .....	64
Act prohibiting ownership of living persons as property 1834 .....	64
Administration of Estates Act 1925	
s 9 .....	48
Anatomy Act 1832 .....	27
Anatomy Act 1932 .....	32
Anatomy Act 1984 .....	27, 104, 112
Coroners Act 1988 .....	53–54
s 8(1) .....	35, 53