



OXFORD

# STATE RESPONSIBILITY FOR INTERNATIONAL TERRORISM

Kimberley N. Trapp

OXFORD MONOGRAPHS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

# State Responsibility for International Terrorism

*Problems and Prospects*

KIMBERLEY N. TRAPP



OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.  
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,  
and education by publishing worldwide in

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi  
Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi  
New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece  
Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore  
South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press  
in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States  
by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

© Kimberley N. Trapp, 2011

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

Database right Oxford University Press (marker)

Crown copyright material reproduced under Class Licence

Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI

and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

First published 2011

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,  
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,  
without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press,  
or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate  
reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction  
outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department,  
Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover  
and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Control Number:

2011924624

Typeset by SPI Publisher Services, Pondicherry, India

Printed in Great Britain

on acid-free paper by

CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham, Wiltshire

ISBN 978-0-19-959299-9

1 3 5 7 9 10 8 6 4 2

## *Acknowledgments*

This book is based on my doctoral research at the University of Cambridge. The road to completing a PhD-cum-book is long and there are invariably many people whose support, assistance, or indeed forbearance make the journey easier. My own journey started and ended with the unwavering support of my parents, twin sister, and younger twin brothers, and my debt to them is incalculable. Alex, my partner in life throughout this book project, also smoothed the road considerably. His unfailing love (and excellent espressos) made sitting down to even the likes of footnotes and copy-editing a pleasure.

Throughout my PhD, Girton College proved a warm and inspiring academic environment, and provided generous financial support for my research. This research was also funded by the Canadian Council on International Law, the International Security Research Programme of the Canadian Department of Foreign Affairs and the Faculty of Law, Cambridge. Newnham College has been my home throughout the book project, and I am greatly indebted to the College for its generous research funding, and in particular to Dr Catherine Seville, who is a more kind and supportive colleague than anyone could hope for. I would also like to thank Merel Alstein and Ela Kotkowska at Oxford University Press for their support and guidance.

I am very grateful to Dr Guglielmo Verdirame, whose supervision of my PhD was open, thoughtful, and always challenging. Throughout this project, I had occasion to discuss my research with a number of scholars, and I am indebted to them for helping catalyse my thinking. In particular, discussions with Professor James Crawford assisted me in my early conceptualization of this project, and an insightful examination of the PhD by Judge Christopher Greenwood and Professor Stefan Talmon helped shape its development into a book. My research also benefited from the time I spent at Columbia Law School as a visiting scholar, and I am grateful to Professor José Alvarez for his helpful comments on an early draft of Chapter 4. The year I spent at the International Court of Justice, between the 2nd and 3rd years of the PhD, was one of the most intellectually engaging of my life. I am deeply indebted to Vice-President Al-Khasawneh and Judge Simma for their insights and encouragement, and the example they set of academic excellence. This research also profited immeasurably from discussions with Dr Chris Tooley, Dr Isabelle Van Damme, Dr Douglas Guilfoyle, Dr Daniel Joyce, Dr Marko Milanovic, and Professor Geert De Baere. I am fortunate not only to have found in them colleagues who contributed greatly to the stimulating academic environment of the University of Cambridge and the Faculty of Law, but to count these scholars as my dear friends. The importance of their support and friendship throughout the writing process cannot be overstated.

Kimberley N. Trapp

*March 2011*

## *General Editors' Preface*

The international legal regime governing the relationship between acts of terrorism and States is both complicated and, in almost every case, concerned with covert activity, so that its exact nature and content is very difficult to establish in any given case. While it is rare for States openly to engage in acts of terrorism this does not mean that they should not be held responsible for terrorist acts. Most analyses focus on the question of the attributability of terrorist acts to States, and on the implications thereof for the legality of uses of force in self-defence against States harbouring terrorists. Dr Trapp, in a refreshing approach, takes the question further. Her study focuses on the substantive obligations to prevent and punish acts of international terrorism and the implementation of State responsibility, both judicially and otherwise, in response to the breach of those obligations. It is an important and timely contribution to a debate that brings together two topics which are the subject of intense contemporary academic and public interest—terrorism and State responsibility.

AVL, DS, ST

*Oxford, April 2011*

# Table of Cases

## PERMANENT COURT OF INTERNATIONAL JUSTICE / INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE

<i>Aegean Sea Continental Shelf (Greece v. Turkey)</i> , Judgment, [1978] ICJ Reports 3 .....	136
<i>Aerial Incident of 3 July 1988 (Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America)</i> Application Instituting Proceedings filed in the Registry of the Court on 17 May 1989, Pleadings, Oral Arguments, Documents, Volume I, 3 .....	169
Memorial of the Islamic Republic of Iran, Pleadings, Oral Arguments, Documents, Volume I, 11 .....	169
Observations of the International Civil Aviation Organization, Pleadings, Oral Arguments, Documents, Volume II, 617 .....	168
Preliminary Objections of the United States of America, Pleadings, Oral Arguments, Documents, Volume II, 3 .....	169
Removal from List, Order of 22 February 1996, [1996] ICJ Reports 6 .....	169
<i>Aerial Incident of 10 August 1999 (Pakistan v. India)</i> , Jurisdiction, Judgment, [2000] ICJ Reports 12 .....	135–6
<i>Anglo-Iranian Oil Co. Case (United Kingdom v. Iran)</i> , Jurisdiction, Judgment, [1952] ICJ Reports 93 .....	136
<i>Appeal Relating to the Jurisdiction of the ICAO Council (India v. Pakistan)</i> Judgment, [1972] ICJ Reports 46 .....	226
Memorial Submitted by the Government of India, Pleadings, Oral Arguments, Documents, 25 .....	223–6
<i>Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Burundi)</i> Application Instituting Proceedings filed in the Registry of the Court on 23 June 1999 .....	170
Removal from List, Order of 30 January 2001, [2001] ICJ Reports 3 .....	170
<i>Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Rwanda)</i> , Application Instituting Proceedings filed in the Registry of the Court on 23 June 1999 .....	170
<i>Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Rwanda)</i> (New Application: 2002) Contre-Mémoire de la République Démocratique du Congo .....	170
Jurisdiction and Admissibility, Judgment, [2006] ICJ Reports 6 .....	99, 125, 170, 177
Requête introductive d'instance à la Cour Internationale de Justice de la République Démocratique du Congo contre République du Rwanda (28 mai 2002) .....	170
<i>Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Uganda)</i> Application Instituting Proceedings filed in the Registry of the Court on 23 June 1999 .....	170
Judgment, [2005] ICJ Reports 168 .....	27–8, 31, 47–50, 56, 74, 80–1, 170, 188
<i>Arrest Warrant of 11 April 2000 (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Belgium)</i> , Judgment, [2002] ICJ Reports 3 .....	83–5, 92–4, 96–7, 99
<i>Case Concerning the Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Serbia and Montenegro)</i> Judgment, [2007] ICJ Reports 43 .....	4, 10–11, 32–3, 38–9, 41–4, 46, 65, 67, 69, 70, 72, 76, 80, 124, 133, 136–8, 140–2, 145, 147, 154, 231–2, 268
Preliminary Objections, Judgment, [1996] ICJ Reports 595 .....	140–1, 179, 230
Provisional Measures, Order of 13 September 1993, [1993] ICJ Reports 325 .....	179

<i>Case Concerning the Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination (Georgia v. Russian Federation)</i> , Provisional Measures, Order of 15 October 2008, [2008] ICJ Reports 353.....	175–7
<i>Case Concerning the Payment in Gold of Brazilian Federal Loans Contracted in France (France v. Brazil)</i> , Judgment, PCIJ Series A, No. 20–21 (1929).....	90
<i>Case Concerning the Payment of Various Serbian Loans Issued in France (France v. Serbia)</i> , Judgment, PCIJ Series A, No. 20 (1929).....	90
<i>Certain Criminal Proceedings in France (Republic of the Congo v. France)</i> , Letter from the Minister for Foreign Affairs of the French Republic (Consent to the Jurisdiction of the Court to Entertain the Application Pursuant to Article 38, paragraph 5, of the Rules of Court).....	132
<i>Certain German Interests in Polish Upper Silesia (Germany v. Poland)</i> , Merits, PCIJ Series A, No. 7 (1926).....	199
<i>Certain Phosphate Lands in Nauru (Nauru v. Australia)</i> , Preliminary Objections, Judgment, [1992] ICJ Reports 240.....	136
<i>Certain Questions Concerning Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters (Djibouti v. France)</i> Judgment, [2008] ICJ Reports 177.....	92–5, 97, 159
Letter from the Minister for Foreign Affairs of the French Republic (Consent to the Jurisdiction of the Court to Entertain the Application Pursuant to Article 38, paragraph 5, of the Rules of Court).....	132
<i>Certain Questions Relating to Settlers of German Origin in the Territory Ceded by Germany to Poland</i> , Advisory Opinion, PCIJ Series B, No. 6 (1923).....	22
<i>Corfu Channel Case (United Kingdom v. Albania)</i> , Merits, [1949] ICJ Reports 4.....	64, 66–9, 71
<i>Differences Relating to Immunity from Legal Process of a Special Rapporteur of the Commission on Human Rights</i> , Advisory Opinion, [1999] ICJ Reports 62.....	92
<i>Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada)</i> , Jurisdiction, Judgment, [1998] ICJ Reports 432.....	135–6
<i>Gabčíkovo–Nagymaros Project (Hungary v. Slovakia)</i> , Judgment, [1997] ICJ Report 7.....	4, 90, 137, 189, 192–3, 207, 213, 234
<i>Jurisdictional Immunities of the State (Germany v. Italy)</i> , Application Instituting Proceedings filed in the Registry of the Court on 23 December 2008.....	99
<i>LaGrand Case (Germany v. United States of America)</i> , Judgment, [2001] ICJ Reports 466.....	4
<i>Legal Consequences for States of the Continued Presence of South Africa in Namibia (South West Africa) Notwithstanding Security Council Resolution 276 (1970)</i> , Advisory Opinion, [1971] ICJ Reports 16.....	207
<i>Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory</i> , Advisory Opinion, [2004] ICJ Reports 136.....	46, 49–50, 176
<i>Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons</i> , Advisory Opinion, [1996] ICJ Reports 226 ..	150
<i>Legality of Use of Force (Serbia and Montenegro v. Belgium)</i> , Provisional Measures, Order of 2 June 1999, [1999] ICJ Reports 124.....	136
<i>Legality of Use of Force (Serbia and Montenegro v. Canada)</i> , Provisional Measures, Order of 2 June 1999, [1999] ICJ Reports 259.....	136
<i>Legality of Use of Force (Serbia and Montenegro v. Netherlands)</i> , Provisional Measures, Order of 2 June 1999, [1999] ICJ Reports 542.....	136
<i>Legality of Use of Force (Serbia and Montenegro v. Portugal)</i> , Provisional Measures, Order of 2 June 1999, [1999] ICJ Reports 656.....	136
<i>Legality of Use of Force (Serbia and Montenegro v. United Kingdom)</i> , Provisional Measures, Order of 2 June 1999, [1999] ICJ Reports 826.....	135
<i>Legality of Use of Force (Yugoslavia v. Spain)</i> , Provisional Measures, Order of 2 June 1999, [1999] ICJ Reports 761.....	135–6
<i>Legality of Use of Force (Yugoslavia v. United States)</i> , Provisional Measures, Order of 2 June 1999, [1999] ICJ Reports 916.....	136
<i>Oil Platforms (Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America)</i> , Judgment, [2003] ICJ Reports 161.....	47, 142–3, 169, 175

<i>Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention Arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United Kingdom)</i>	
Application Instituting Proceedings filed in the Registry of the Court on 3 March 1992 . . . . .	88
Counter-Memorial of the United Kingdom . . . . .	251
Preliminary Objections, Judgment, [1998] ICJ Reports 9 . . . . .	174–5
Provisional Measures, Order of 14 April 1992, [1992] ICJ Reports 3 . . . . .	84–5, 89, 174, 252
Removal from List, Order of 10 September 2003, [2003] ICJ Reports 149 . . . . .	175
<i>Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention Arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United States of America)</i>	
Preliminary Objections, Judgment, [1998] ICJ Reports 115 . . . . .	127, 174–5, 177
Provisional Measures, Order of 14 April 1992, [1992] ICJ Reports 114 . . . . .	89
<i>Questions relating to the Obligation to Prosecute or Extradite (Belgium v. Senegal)</i>	
Application Instituting Proceedings by the Kingdom of Belgium against the Republic of Senegal . . . . .	87
Provisional Measures, Order of 28 May 2009 . . . . .	84, 87, 177
<i>Reservations to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, Advisory Opinion, [1951] ICJ Reports 15 . . . . .</i>	
	125, 140
<i>SS Lotus (France v. Turkey)</i> , Judgment, PCIJ Series A, No. 10 (1927) . . . . .	64
<i>United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran (United States of America v. Islamic Republic of Iran)</i>	
Application Instituting Proceedings submitted by the Government of the United States of America, Pleadings, Oral Arguments, Documents, Volume I, 1 . . . . .	173, 181
Judgment, [1980] ICJ Reports 3 . . . . .	37, 54, 68, 72, 159–60, 172–3, 177, 181, 184, 203–5
Memorial of the Government of the United States, Pleadings, Oral Arguments, Documents, Volume I, 123 . . . . .	173, 181
Provisional Measures, Order of 15 December 1979, [1979] ICJ Reports 6 . . . . .	179

#### NUREMBERG / INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE FORMER YUGOSLAVIA / INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA

<i>Akayesu</i> (ICTR-96-4-T), Judgment of the Trial Chamber, 2 September 1998 . . . . .	110, 145, 260
<i>Blaskić</i> (ICTY-95-14-A), Judgment of the Appeals Chamber on the request of the Republic of Croatia for review of the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 18 July 1997, 29 October 1997 . . . . .	94, 97, 99
<i>Delalić et al.</i> (ICTY-96-21-T), Judgment of the Trial Chamber, 16 November 1998 . . . . .	260
<i>Delalić et al.</i> (ICTY-96-21-A), Judgment of the Appeals Chamber, 20 February 2001 . . . . .	41
<i>Kayishema and Ruzindana</i> (ICTR-95-1-T), Judgment of the Trial Chamber, 21 May 1999 . . . . .	145
<i>Krstić</i> (ICTY-98-33-T), Judgment of the Trial Chamber, 2 August 2001 . . . . .	260
<i>Krstić</i> (ICTY-98-33-A), Judgment of the Appeals Chamber, 19 April 2004 . . . . .	145
<i>Musema</i> (ICTR-96-13-A), Judgment of the Appeals Chamber, 27 January 2000 . . . . .	145
<i>Elizaphan Ntakirutimana and Gérard Ntakirutimana</i> (ICTR-96-10-A; ICTR-96-17-A), Judgment of the Appeals Chamber, 13 December 2004 . . . . .	145
International Tribunal for the Trial of Major War Criminals (Nuremberg), Judgment of 1 October 1946 . . . . .	230
<i>Popović et al.</i> (ICTY-05-88), Second Consolidated Amended Indictment, 14 June 2006 . . . . .	10
<i>Semanza</i> (ICTR-97-20-T), Judgment of the Trial Chamber, 15 May 2003 . . . . .	145

#### ARBITRAL AWARDS

<i>Alabama Claims Case (United States of America/Great Britain)</i> (1871), in J.B. Moore, <i>History and Digest of the International Arbitrations to which the United States has been a Party</i> (1898) Volume 1, 495 . . . . .	64, 67, 71
---	------------



<i>Bayindir v. Pakistan</i> , Award, 27 August 2009 (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/29) . . . . .	43
<i>British Property in Spanish Zone of Morocco (United Kingdom/Spain)</i> , II Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1925) 615 . . . . .	46
<i>Caire Case</i> , France and Mexico Mixed Claims Commission, V Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1929) 516 . . . . .	35
<i>Case concerning the Air Service Agreement of 27 March 1946 between the United States of America and France</i> , XVIII Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1978) 417 . . . . .	189
<i>Case concerning the Difference between New Zealand and France concerning the Interpretation or Application of Two Agreements concluded on 9 July 1986 between the Two States and which Related to the Problems arising from the Rainbow Warrior Affair</i> , XX Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1990) 215 . . . . .	137
<i>CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Argentina</i> , Award, 12 May 2005 (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8) . . . . .	90
<i>Cotesworth &amp; Powell Case (Great Britain/Colombia)</i> (1875), in J.B. Moore, <i>History and Digest of the International Arbitrations to which the United States has been a Party</i> (1898) Volume 2, 2050 . . . . .	45
<i>Jamaica Case (Great Britain/United States of America)</i> (1798), in J.B. Moore, <i>History and Digest of the International Arbitrations to which the United States has been a Party</i> (1898) Volume 4, 3983 . . . . .	70
<i>Janes Case</i> , United States and Mexico General Claims Commission, IV Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1926) 82 . . . . .	46
<i>Montijo Case (United States of America/Colombia)</i> (1875), in J.B. Moore, <i>History and Digest of the International Arbitrations to which the United States has been a Party</i> (1898) Volume 2, 1421 . . . . .	71
<i>Neer Case</i> , United States and Mexico General Claims Commission, IV Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1926) 60 . . . . .	64
<i>Petrolane Inc. v. The Government of the Islamic Republic of Iran</i> , 27 Iran–United States Claims Tribunal Reports (1991) 64 . . . . .	35
<i>Poglioli Case (Italy/Venezuela)</i> , X Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1903) 669 . . . . .	45
<i>Saint Albans Raid Case (Great Britain/United States of America)</i> (1873), in J.B. Moore, <i>History and Digest of the International Arbitrations to which the United States has been a Party</i> (1898) Volume 4, 4042 . . . . .	64
<i>Sempra Energy International v. Argentine Republic</i> , Award, 28 September 2007 (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/16) . . . . .	90
United Nations Secretary General, <i>Ruling Pertaining to the Differences between France and New Zealand arising from the Rainbow Warrior Affair</i> , XIX Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1986) 199 . . . . .	36–7, 100, 247
<i>Youmans Case</i> , United States and Mexico General Claims Commission, IV Reports of International Arbitral Awards (1926) 110 . . . . .	35

#### HUMAN RIGHTS JUDGMENTS, DECISIONS AND OPINIONS

<i>Belilos v. Switzerland</i> , Judgment of 29 April 1988, European Court of Human Rights, (1988) ECHR A, No. 132 . . . . .	125
<i>Case of Velásquez-Rodríguez v. Honduras</i> , Judgment of 29 July 1988, Inter-American Court of Human Rights, Series C, No. 4 . . . . .	35
<i>Guengueng et al. v. Senegal</i> , Decision of 19 May 2006, Committee against Torture, Communication No. 181/2001, CAT/C/36/D/181/2001 . . . . .	87–9
<i>Ilaşcu v. Moldova and Russia</i> , Judgment of 8 July 2004, European Court of Human Rights, (2005) 40 EHRR 40 . . . . .	75
<i>Kılıç v. Turkey</i> , Judgment of 28 March 2000, European Court of Human Rights, (2001) 33 EHRR 1357 . . . . .	67

<i>Selmouni v. France</i> , Judgment of 28 July 1999, European Court of Human Rights, (2000) 29 EHRR 403 .....	231
UN High Commissioner for Refugees, <i>Advisory Opinion on the Extraterritorial Application of Non-Refoulement Obligations under the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol</i> , 26 January 2007 .....	85–6

## GATT AND WTO REPORTS

GATT, Report of the Panel (adopted on 7 November 1990), <i>Thailand–Restrictions on Importation of and Internal Taxes on Cigarettes</i> , GATT Doc. DS10/R-37S/200 .....	216
GATT, Report of the Panel (unadopted), <i>United States–Trade Measures Affecting Nicaragua</i> , GATT Doc. L/6053 (1986) .....	211, 213
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 20 August 1999), <i>Brazil–Export Financing Programme of Aircraft</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS46/AB/R .....	208
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 17 December 2007), <i>Brazil–Measures Affecting Imports of Retreaded Tyres</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS332/AB/R .....	216
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 12 October 2000), <i>Canada–Terms of Patent Protection</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS170/AB/R .....	208
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 12 March 2001), <i>European Communities–Measures Affecting Asbestos and Products Containing Asbestos</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS135/AB/R .....	216
WTO, Report of the Panel (adopted on 21 November 2006), <i>European Communities–Measures Affecting the Approval and Marketing of Biotech Product</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS293/R .....	208
WTO, Report of the Panel (adopted on 25 September 1997), <i>European Communities–Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS27/R .....	208
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 16 January 1998), <i>India–Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical and Agricultural Chemical Products</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS50/AB/R .....	208
WTO, Report of the Panel (adopted on 22 April 1998), <i>Japan–Measures Affecting Consumer Photographic Film and Paper</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS44/R .....	208
WTO, Report of the Panel (adopted on 19 June 2000), <i>Korea–Measures Affecting Government Procurement</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS163/R .....	208
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 10 January 2001), <i>Korea–Measures Affecting Imports of Fresh, Chilled and Frozen Beef</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS161/AB/R .....	216
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 24 March 2006), <i>Mexico–Tax Measures on Soft Drinks and other Beverages</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS308/AB/R .....	209, 211
WTO, Report of the Panel (adopted on 19 November 1999), <i>Turkey–Restrictions on Imports of Textile and Clothing Products</i> , WTO Doc. WTO/DS34/R .....	208
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 26 September 2000), <i>United States–Anti Dumping Act of 1916</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS136/AB/R .....	208
WTO, Appellate Body Report (adopted on 25 April 1997), <i>United States–Measures Affecting Imports of Woven Wool Shirts and Blouses from India</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS33/AB/R .....	208, 211
WTO, Report of the Panel (adopted on 27 January 2000), <i>United States–Sections 301–310 of the Trade Act of 1974</i> , WTO Doc. WT/DS152/R .....	206

## DOMESTIC JURISPRUDENCE

<i>Affaire Gaddafi</i> , Chambre Criminelle, Cour de Cassation (France), 13 March 2001, 125 International Law Reports 490 .....	93
<i>Attorney General of the Government of Israel v. Adolf Eichmann</i> , Supreme Court of Israel, 29 May 1962, 36 International Law Reports 277 .....	97
<i>Chili Komitee Nederland (CKN, Dutch branch of the Chile Committee) v. Public Prosecutor</i> , Court of Appeal of Amsterdam (the Netherlands), 4 January 1995, 28 Netherlands Yearbook of International Law (1997) 325 .....	88, 90

<i>Ferrini v. Federal Republic of Germany</i> , Corte Suprema di Cassazione (Italy), 11 March 2004, reported at Hague Justice Portal, < <a href="http://www.haguejusticeportal.net">http://www.haguejusticeportal.net</a> > . . . . .	99
<i>Her Majesty's Advocate v. Al-Megrahi</i> , High Court of Justiciary at Camp Zeist (Scotland), 31 January 2001, 2001 G.W.D. 5-177 . . . . .	235
<i>H.S.A. et al. v. S.A. et al.</i> , Cour de Cassation (Belgium), 12 February 2003, 42 International Legal Materials (2003) 596 . . . . .	93
<i>Jones v. Saudi Arabia</i> , House of Lords, 14 June 2006, [2006] UKHL 26 . . . . .	94, 97, 99, 101-2
<i>Propend Finance v. Sing</i> , Court of Appeal (England and Wales), 17 April 1997, 111 International Law Reports 611 . . . . .	95
<i>R. v. Mafart and Prieur</i> , High Court (New Zealand), 22 November 1985, 74 International Law Reports 243 . . . . .	36, 100
<i>R. v. Nezar Nawat Mansour Hazi Hindawi</i> , Court of Appeal (England and Wales), 7 March 1988, 10 Criminal Appeal Reports (S.) 104 . . . . .	201, 233
<i>Re Bo Xilai</i> , Magistrates' Court (Bow Street, London), 8 November 2005, 128 International Law Reports 713 . . . . .	93
<i>Re General Shaul Mofaz</i> , Magistrates' Court (Bow Street, London), 12 February 2004, reported in 53 International and Comparative Law Quarterly (2004) 769 . . . . .	93
<i>Regina v. Bartle and the Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis and Others Ex Parte Pinochet</i> , House of Lords, 24 March 1999, [2000] 1 AC 147 . . . . .	93-5, 99, 101-2
<i>Tatchell v. Mugabe</i> , Magistrates' Court (Bow Street, London), 14 January 2004, reported in 53 International and Comparative Law Quarterly (2004) 769 . . . . .	93
<i>The Parlement Belge</i> , Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division (England), [1880] 5 PD 197 . . . . .	95
<i>The People v. McLeod</i> , 1 Hill (N.Y.) 377 (1841) and 3 Hill (N.Y.) 635 (1841) . . . . .	96

## *Table of Treaties*

Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights ('TRIPS Agreement'), Annex 1C to WTO Agreement, 15 April 1994, 1869 UNTS 299 . . . . .	211
Charter of the United Nations ('UN Charter'), 26 June 1945, 1 UNTS XVI. . . . .	1, 11–13, 25–6, 28, 33, 46–50, 55–6, 59–60, 126–7, 131, 135, 162–3, 178–80, 182, 188, 228, 249, 254, 258, 266
Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment ('Torture Convention'), 10 December 1984, 1465 UNTS 85. . . . .	86–8, 101–3
Convention for the Creation of an International Criminal Court ('League of Nations ICC Convention'), 16 November 1937 (never entered into force), League of Nations C.94. M.47.1938.V. . . . .	253, 256
Convention for the Prevention and Punishment of Terrorism ('League of Nations Terrorism Convention'), 16 November 1937 (never entered into force), League of Nations C.546(I).M.383(I).1937.V. . . . .	82–3, 252–4
Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Civil Aviation (('Montreal Convention'), 23 September 1971, 974 UNTS 177. . . . .	9, 18–19, 21, 65n, 86n, 88–9, 106–7, 137n, 146, 162, 165–72, 174–5, 219–21, 235, 238, 250–1
Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Maritime Navigation (('SUA Convention'), 10 March 1988, IMO Doc. SUA/CONF/15/Rev.1 . . . . .	9, 18–19, 21, 86n, 102, 106–7, 145–6, 162–5
Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Seizure of Aircraft ('Hague Convention'), 16 December 1970, 860 UNTS 105. . . . .	9, 18–19, 21, 65n, 85, 86n, 91, 107, 146, 162, 166–7, 170–2, 194–8, 218n, 223
Convention on International Civil Aviation ('Chicago Convention'), 7 December 1944, ICAO Doc. 7300/9 . . . . .	165–9, 202, 218–20, 223–7
Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of Crimes against Internationally Protected Persons, including Diplomatic Agents ('Internationally Protected Persons Convention'), 14 December 1973, 1035 UNTS 167 . . . . .	9, 18–19, 21, 64–5, 77, 107–8, 122, 127, 139, 143–4, 159–61, 173
Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide ('Genocide Convention'), 9 December 1948, 78 UNTS 277 . . . . .	10, 65, 133, 137–8, 140–2, 144, 147, 154, 268
Convention on the Suppression of Unlawful Acts Relating to International Civil Aviation (('Beijing Convention'), 10 September 2010 (not yet in force), ICAO Document . . . . .	9, 18, 20–1, 86n, 107, 121, 128n, 146–7, 165, 171–2, 174n
General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade ('GATT 1947'), 30 October 1947, 55 UNTS 194 . . . . .	209, 212–14, 216
General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade ('GATT 1994'), 15 April 1994, 1867 UNTS 187. . . . .	206, 209–18
General Agreement on Trade in Services ('GATS'), 15 April 1994, 1869 UNTS 183. . . . .	211
Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field of August 12 1949 ('GCI'), 75 UNTS 31. . . . .	112, 114
Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Conditions of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea of August 12 1949 ('CGII'), 75 UNTS 85. . . . .	112

Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War of August 12 1949 ('GCIV'), 7 UNTS 287 .....	98, 109, 111–12, 117–18
Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War of August 12 1949 ('GCIII'), 75 UNTS 135 .....	112, 152
International Air Services Transit Agreement, 7 December 1944, ICAO Doc. 7500 .....	218, 223–5
Inter-American Treaty of Reciprocal Assistance, 2 September 1947, 21 UNTS 77 .....	53
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 19 December 1996, 999 UNTS 171 .....	86, 125
International Convention against the Taking of Hostages ('Hostages Convention'), 17 December 1979, 1316 UNTS 205 .....	9, 15n, 18–19, 21, 77, 104, 108–15, 122–4, 129, 151n, 153–4, 156
International Convention for the Suppression of Acts of Nuclear Terrorism ('Nuclear Terrorism Convention'), 13 April 2005, UN Doc. A/59/766 (2005) .....	9, 18–19, 21, 86n, 104, 106, 121, 139n, 144–5, 149–53, 155, 157
International Convention for the Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism ('Terrorism Financing Convention'), 9 December 1999, UN Doc. A/RES/54/109 (1997) .....	9, 13n, 19, 21, 76n, 78, 86n, 104, 120, 123–5, 144, 155–6
International Convention on the Suppression of Terrorist Bombings ('Terrorist Bombing Convention'), 15 December 1997, UN Doc. A/RES/52/164 (1997) .....	9, 18, 20–1, 86n, 104, 106, 115–20, 122–3, 125n, 144n, 149–52, 155, 157n
Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization ('WTO Agreement'), 15 April 1994, 1867 UNTS 154 .....	206
Optional Protocol to the Vienna Convention on Consular Relations concerning the Compulsory Settlement of Disputes, 24 April 1963, 596 UNTS 487 .....	160
Optional Protocol to the Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations concerning the Compulsory Settlement of Disputes, 18 April 1961, 500 UNTS 241 .....	160
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts ('API'), 8 June 1977, 1125 UNTS 3 .....	16–17, 105, 108–10, 112–14, 116–20, 122, 129, 148, 151, 154, 161
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts ('APII'), 8 June 1977, 1125 UNTS 609 .....	110, 148
Protocol for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Fixed Platforms Located in the Continental Shelf ('1988 Protocol to the SUA Convention'), 10 March 1988, IMO Doc. SUA/CONF/16/Rev.2 .....	9, 19
Protocol for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts of Violence at Airports Serving International Civil Aviation ('1988 Protocol to the Montreal Convention'), 24 February 1988, ICAO Doc. 9518 .....	9, 18–19, 107, 146, 167n, 171, 199
Protocol Relating to an Amendment to the Convention on International Civil Aviation, 10 May 1984, ICAO Doc. 9436 .....	168
Protocol Supplementary to the Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Seizure of Aircraft ('2010 Protocol to the Hague Convention'), 10 September 2010 (not yet in force), ICAO Document .....	9, 18, 21, 86n, 107, 121, 128n, 146–7, 165, 171–2,
Protocol to the Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Maritime Navigation ('2005 Protocol to the SUA Convention'), 14 October 2005, IMO. Doc. LEG/CONF.15/21 (2005) .....	9, 18, 21, 86n, 107, 121, 128n, 146–7, 165, 171–2
Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court ('Rome Statute'), 17 July 1998, A/CONF.183/9, < <a href="http://www.icc-cpi.int/library/about/officialjournal/Rome_Statute_English.pdf">http://www.icc-cpi.int/library/about/officialjournal/Rome_Statute_English.pdf</a> > .....	98, 231, 256–62
Statute of the International Court of Justice ('ICJ Statute'), 26 June 1945, [1946–47] United Nations Yearbook 843 .....	115, 119, 131–5, 170, 177
Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes ('DSU'), Annex to the WTO Agreement, 15 April 1994, 1869 UNTS 401 .....	206–9, 211

*Table of Treaties*

xvii

Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 24 April 1963, 596 UNTS 261 . . . . .	159–61, 173, 203–6
Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 18 April 1961, 500 UNTS 95 . . . . .	159–61, 173, 203–6
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 22 May 1969, 1155 UNTS 331 . . .	107, 123, 126–7, 139–40, 142–3, 167, 192

## *List of Abbreviations*

AB	Appellate Body (WTO)
CAT	Committee against Torture
CTC	Counter-Terrorism Committee
CTITF	Counter-Terrorism Implementation Task Force
DSB	Dispute Settlement Body (WTO)
EC	European Community
ECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
ILC	International Law Commission
IMO	International Maritime Organization
INTERPOL	International Criminal Police Organization
NAM	Non-Aligned Movement
OAS	Organization of American States
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OIC	Organization of the Islamic Conference
SWGCA	Special Working Group on the Crime of Aggression (ICC)
TSC	Terrorism Suppression Convention
UN	United Nations
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNIIC	United Nations International Independent Investigation Commission
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSG	United Nations Secretary-General
WTO	World Trade Organization

# *Table of Contents*

<i>Table of Cases</i>	ix
<i>Table of Treaties</i>	xv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xix
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 The framework of state responsibility	3
1.2 The international legal regimes applicable to terrorism	8
1.2.1 Regimes of accountability applicable to international terrorism	8
1.2.2 Regimes of substantive law applicable to international terrorism	14
1.3 Defining international terrorism	14
1.3.1 The self-determination debate as a question of regime interaction	15
1.3.2 An emerging definition of 'international terrorism'?	18
<b>2. The prohibition of state terrorism and questions of attribution</b>	<b>24</b>
2.1 The prohibition of state terrorism	25
2.1.1 The prohibition of aggression	25
2.1.2 The prohibition of the use of force	28
2.1.3 Non-intervention in the domestic affairs of another state	30
2.1.4 Conclusion	33
2.2 Attribution	34
2.2.1 Organs of the state	34
2.2.2 Instructions, direction or control	37
2.2.3 Complicity revisited	45
2.3 Conclusion	61
<b>3. Obligations to prevent and punish acts of international terrorism</b>	<b>63</b>
3.1 The obligation to prevent acts of international terrorism	64
3.1.1 Knowledge	66
3.1.2 Capacity	70
3.1.3 Effect of 9/11 on due diligence obligations as they relate to terrorism	75
3.2 The obligation to extradite or submit for prosecution	82
3.2.1 The substance of the <i>aut dedere aut judicare</i> obligation	84
3.2.2 Immunity of state officials from foreign criminal proceedings	91
3.3 The self-determination debate and the scope of the TSCs	104
3.3.1 Exclusion of acts committed in furtherance of a people's right of self-determination from the scope of the TSCs	105
3.3.2 Reservations to the TSCs	121
3.4 Conclusion	127



<b>4. The ICJ's jurisdiction over disputes relating to state responsibility for international terrorism</b>	<b>131</b>
4.1 Optional clause declarations	133
4.2 The Terrorism Suppression Conventions	136
4.2.1 Application of the <i>Bosnia Genocide Case</i> analysis to the TSCs	144
4.2.2 Exclusion from the scope of the TSCs	147
4.3 The existence of a dispute as to the interpretation or application of a TSC	173
4.4 TSC compromissory clauses: conditions of seisin and reservations	176
4.5 Security Council enforcement of ICJ decisions	178
4.6 Conclusion	180
<b>5. Measures adopted in response to international terrorism</b>	<b>182</b>
5.1 The adoption of measures in response to international terrorism under general international law	183
5.1.1 Acts of retorsion	184
5.1.2 Countermeasures	185
5.1.3 Necessity as a circumstance precluding wrongfulness	192
5.1.4 State practice	193
5.2 The adoption of measures in response to international terrorism under sub-systems of international law	203
5.2.1 Diplomatic law	203
5.2.2 World Trade Organization	206
5.2.3 International Civil Aviation Organization	218
5.3 Conclusion	227
<b>6. The relationship between individual criminal responsibility and state responsibility in the terrorism context</b>	<b>230</b>
6.1 Determinations of individual criminal responsibility as a catalyst	232
6.2 Determinations of individual criminal responsibility as pressure	233
6.2.1 Lockerbie bombing	235
6.2.2 'La Belle' disco bombing	236
6.2.3 UTA 722	238
6.2.4 Rainbow Warrior	239
6.2.5 Ongoing criminal law enforcement processes	239
6.3 Determinations of individual criminal responsibility as satisfaction	245
6.3.1 The state must be responsible for an internationally wrongful act	246
6.3.2 The wrongdoing state must be the prosecuting state	247
6.3.3 No independent obligation to punish	248
6.4 An international criminal jurisdiction for terrorist offences	251
6.4.1 The League of Nations Terrorism Convention	252
6.4.2 Draft Code of Offences against the Peace and Security of Mankind	254
6.4.3 International Criminal Court	256
6.5 Conclusion	263
<b>7. Conclusions</b>	<b>264</b>
<i>Bibliography</i>	269
<i>Index</i>	291