

REPRODUCTIVE BIOLOGY
RESEARCH FOUNDATION CONFERENCE

Ethical Issues in Sex Therapy and Research

EDITED BY

WILLIAM H. MASTERS M.D.

Co-Director, Reproductive Biology Research Foundation

VIRGINIA E. JOHNSON

Co-Director, Reproductive Biology Research Foundation

ROBERT C. KOLODNY, M.D.

Associate Director, Reproductive Biology Research Foundation



Little, Brown and Company

BOSTON

COPYRIGHT © 1977 BY LITTLE, BROWN AND COMPANY (INC.)
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. NO PART OF THIS BOOK MAY BE REPRODUCED IN ANY FORM OR BY ANY ELECTRONIC OR MECHANICAL MEANS, INCLUDING INFORMATION STORAGE AND RETRIEVAL SYSTEMS, WITHOUT PERMISSION IN WRITING FROM THE PUBLISHER, EXCEPT BY A REVIEWER WHO MAY QUOTE BRIEF PASSAGES IN A REVIEW.

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOG CARD NO. 77-70467

ISBN 0-316-549-835

FIRST EDITION

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

REPRODUCTIVE BIOLOGY
RESEARCH FOUNDATION CONFERENCE

ETHICAL ISSUES IN
SEX THERAPY AND
RESEARCH

A CONFERENCE SPONSORED
BY THE REPRODUCTIVE BIOLOGY RESEARCH
FOUNDATION, ST. LOUIS, MISSOURI

PROGRAM COMMITTEE

WILLIAM H. MASTERS

VIRGINIA E. JOHNSON

ROBERT C. KOLODNY

Conference Coordinator

PARTICIPANTS

J E A N A P P E R S O N , P h . D .

Clinical Psychologist, The University of Michigan Institute for Human Adjustment, Ann Arbor, Michigan. Designated conference representative, American Psychological Association

M A E A . B I G G S , R . N . , B . S . N . , M . S .

Senior Clinical and Research Associate, Reproductive Biology Research Foundation, St. Louis, Missouri

M A R Y S . C A L D E R O N E , M . D . , M . P . H .

President, Sex Information and Education Council of the United States, New York, New York

H E L E N D A R R A G H , M . S . S .

Director, Professional Services, Family and Children's Service, St. Louis, Missouri. Designated conference representative, Family Service Association of America

**H . T R I S T R A M E N G E L H A R D T , J R . ,
P h . D . , M . D .**

Associate Professor, Institute for the Medical Humanities, and Department of Preventive Medicine and Community Health, University of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston, Texas

P A U L H . G E B H A R D , P h . D .

Director, Institute for Sex Research, Indiana University,
Bloomington, Indiana

R O B E R T G O R D I S , P h . D . , D . D .

Professor of Bible and Professor in the Philosophies of Religion,
Jewish Theological Seminary of America,
New York, New York

R I C H A R D G R E E N , M . D .

Founding President, International Academy of Sex Research;
Professor, Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences and
Department of Psychology, State University of New York,
Stony Brook, New York

S E W A R D H I L T N E R , P h . D .

Professor of Theology and Personality, Princeton Theological
Seminary, Princeton, New Jersey

R . C H R I S T I A N J O H N S O N , P h . D .

Office of Population Research, Princeton University,
Princeton, New Jersey

V I R G I N I A E . J O H N S O N

Co-Director, Reproductive Biology Research Foundation,
St. Louis, Missouri

H E L E N S . K A P L A N , M . D . , P h . D .

Clinical Associate Professor of Psychiatry, Cornell University
Medical College; Director of the Sex Education and Therapy Program
of Cornell University, The New York Hospital—Cornell
Medical Center, New York, New York

J A Y K A T Z , M . D .

Professor (Adjunct) of Law and Psychiatry, Yale Law School,
New Haven, Connecticut

MIRIAM F. KELTY, Ph.D.

Psychologist, National Commission for the Protection of Human
Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research,
Bethesda, Maryland

ROBERT C. KOLODNY, M.D.

Associate Director, Reproductive Biology Research Foundation,
St. Louis, Missouri

JUDITH LONG LAWS, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor of Sociology and Psychology, Cornell
University, Ithaca, New York

HAROLD I. LIEF, M.D.

Professor of Psychiatry, Director of the Division of Family
Study, and Director of the Center for the Study of Sex Education in
Medicine, The University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine,
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

RUTH MACKLIN, Ph.D.

Associate Professor of Philosophy, Case Western Reserve
University, Cleveland, Ohio; Staff member, Institute of Society, Ethics and the
Life Sciences, Hastings-on-Hudson, New York

JUDD MARMOR, M.D.

President, American Psychiatric Association; Franz Alexander
Professor of Psychiatry, University of Southern California School
of Medicine, Los Angeles, California

WILLIAM H. MASTERS, M.D.

Co-Director, Reproductive Biology Research Foundation,
St. Louis, Missouri

JOHN MONEY, Ph.D.

President, Society for Scientific Study of Sex;
Professor of Medical Psychology and Pediatrics, The Johns Hopkins
University School of Medicine,
Baltimore, Maryland

EMILY HARTSHORNE MUDD, P h . D .

Member of Board of Directors, Reproductive Biology
Research Foundation; Emeritus Professor of Family Study in Psychiatry
and Consultant in Behavioral Sciences, Department of Obstetrics and
Gynecology, The University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine,
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

FRITZ REDLICH, M.D.

Professor of Psychiatry, Yale University School of Medicine,
New Haven, Connecticut

CHARLES REMBAR, L.L.B.

Lawyer specializing in First Amendment issues; tried and argued
the cases on *Lady Chatterley's Lover*, *Tropic of Cancer*, and *Fanny Hill*
(U.S. Supreme Court); author of *The End of Obscenity* (1968),
Perspective (1975); New York, New York

SALLIE SCHUMACHER, P h . D .

Associate Professor of Clinical Psychiatry and Director, Center
for Study of Human Sexual Behavior, Department of Psychiatry,
The University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine, Pittsburgh,
Pennsylvania

PEPPER SCHWARTZ, P h . D .

Assistant Professor of Sociology, University of Washington,
Seattle, Washington

MARY JANE SHERFEY, M.D.

Psychiatrist, Cornell University Medical College, New York,
New York

CARL S. SHULTZ, M.D.

President, American Association of Sex Educators and
Counselors; Director, Office of Population Affairs,
Department of Health, Education, and Welfare,
Washington, D.C.

ALAN A. STONE, M.D.

Professor of Law and Psychiatry in the Faculty of Law and the
Faculty of Medicine, Harvard University, Cambridge,
Massachusetts

ROBERT L. STUBBLEFIELD, M.D.

Member of the American Medical Association Council on Mental Health;
Medical Director, Silver Hill Foundation,
New Canaan, Connecticut

JACK WIENER, M.A.

Social Problems Research Consultant, National Institute of
Mental Health, Rockville, Maryland

JEROME F. WILKERSON,

M.D i v . , P h . D .

Director, Newman Center, Washington University Medical
Campus, St. Louis, Missouri

P R E F A C E

The recent past has witnessed a remarkable upsurge of interest in sex therapy and research among both professionals and the public. The burgeoning number of health-care professionals treating sexual problems today contrasts sharply with the relative handful practicing a decade ago, and there has also been a quieter but significant surge of activity in the scientific investigation of human sexuality. As in many other scientific fields, the initial rapid growth of a new discipline has been accompanied by problems of public acceptance. Since sexuality is so central to human identity, public scrutiny has been justifiably intense. Our awareness of the need for public accountability precipitated plans for a conference to discuss the ethical concerns of sex therapy and research.

Years ago, when our private discussions of ethical responsibilities began, we hoped that an established national organization would organize such a meeting. Because this responsibility was not accepted at the national level and because public awareness of ethical issues in sciences generally has been mounting rapidly—apparently more rapidly than corresponding awareness in many professional groups—the Reproductive Biology Research Foundation decided to organize and sponsor a conference, which was held January 22–23, 1976.

Early in the planning stages, it was decided that the aims of this

conference should be restricted to identifying and discussing the fundamental ethical issues in therapeutic and investigative approaches to human sexuality. It was also agreed that the participants should include responsible representatives of all the health-care sciences, theologians, philosophers, and lawyers, in an attempt to achieve the broadest possible perspective.

We had no illusions that this initial meeting could generate meaningful guidelines or rules for ethical conduct. However, we did—and continue to—believe that, once problems have been identified and the recorded discussion of them has been widely disseminated to concerned professionals and the general public, it will be possible to take the further steps necessary to formulate a cohesive and responsible set of ethical guidelines for this field. Toward this goal, a subsequent meeting of broader scope is currently planned for January, 1978.

W. H. M.
V. E. J.
R. C. K.

St. Louis

A C K N O W L E D G M E N T S

We are deeply indebted to the many individuals who participated in this endeavor in a variety of ways. Those who attended the conference generated an exciting interchange of ideas in a friendly and professional atmosphere. The thoughtful contributions of Raymond Waggoner, Emily Mudd, Fritz Redlich, and Richard Hedrich to the planning of this meeting deserve special mention.

Valuable suggestions and partial financial support were received from the National Science Foundation and the National Institute of Mental Health, under contract number 278-76-0004 (ER). The views expressed at this conference are those of the individual participants and do not represent the positions of participating federal agencies.

Able secretarial services were cheerfully provided by Wanda Bowen, Anne Bibbo, Chris Busby, and Lynn Strenkofsky throughout thousands of hours of letter-writing, transcription, and editing. Editorial work was competently assisted by Nancy Kolodny.

CONTENTS

PARTICIPANTS	vii
PREFACE	xiii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xv
1. The Historical Background of Ethical Considerations in Sex Research and Sex Therapy	1
<i>Emily Hartshorne Mudd</i>	
DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: Paul H. Gebhard	11
GENERAL DISCUSSION: R. Christian Johnson (Chairperson), Wiener, Sherfey, Mudd, Macklin, Lief, Schwartz, Rembar, Gebhard	
2. Theological Perspectives on the Ethics of Scientific Investigation and Treatment of Human Sexuality	20
<i>Seward Hiltner</i>	
DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: Robert Gordis	32
DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: Jerome F. Wilkerson	38
GENERAL DISCUSSION: Mary S. Calderone (Chairperson), Lief, Schwartz, Hiltner, Gordis, Wilkerson, Shultz, Johnson, Stubblefield, Rembar	46

3. Ethical Requirements for Sex Research in Humans: Informed Consent and General Principles	52
<i>Robert C. Kolodny</i>	
DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: Ruth Macklin	69
GENERAL DISCUSSION: Charles Rembar (Chairperson), R. C. Johnson, Macklin, Engelhardt, Kaplan, Gordis, Stone, Masters, V. E. Johnson, Shultz, Kolodny, Lief, Wiener, Money, Stubblefield, Schwartz, Green	74
4. Ethical Issues and Requirements for Sex Research with Humans: Confidentiality	84
<i>Miriam F. Kelty</i>	
DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: Richard Green	106
GENERAL DISCUSSION: Pepper Schwartz (Chairperson), Stone, Rembar, Lief, Kolodny, Calderone, Wiener	114
5. Issues and Attitudes in Research and Treatment of Variant Forms of Human Sexual Behavior	119
<i>John Money</i>	
DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr.	132
GENERAL DISCUSSION: Alan A. Stone (Chairperson), R. C. Johnson, Money, Kolodny, V. E. Johnson, Stone, Engelhardt, Gordis, Lief, Stubblefield, Katz, Darragh, Calderone	137
6. The Ethics of Sex Therapy	143
<i>Fritz Redlich</i>	
DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: Judd Marmor	157
DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: Jay Katz	161
GENERAL DISCUSSION: Virginia E. Johnson (Chairperson); Rembar, Money, Kaplan, Redlich, Kolodny, R. C. Johnson, Green, Engelhardt, Wiener, Schwartz, Masters, Calderone, Laws, Marmor, Apperson, Katz, Lief, Hiltner, Stone	165

7. Training of Sex Therapists 182

Helen S. Kaplan

DESIGNATED DISCUSSION: Carl S. Shultz 189

GENERAL DISCUSSION: Harold I. Lief (Chairperson),
Biggs, Kolodny, Stubblefield, Kaplan, Schwartz, Green, Mudd,
Marmor, Calderone, Shultz, Schumacher, Darragh,
V. E. Johnson, Masters 193

8. Summary and Future Considerations 206

William H. Masters

INDEX 221

THE HISTORICAL
BACKGROUND OF ETHICAL
CONSIDERATIONS IN
SEX RESEARCH AND
SEX THERAPY

EMILY HARTSHORNE MUDD

Every culture prescribes for its population rules of conduct. Members of the group who deviate from the accepted regulations are subject to a variety of possible chastisements: social, moral, and legal. Exploration of the ethical issues in sex research and sex therapy in the United States implicit in this conference is timely, of great potential usefulness, and should undoubtedly be provocative.

How do we define ethical consideration? *Dorland's Medical Dictionary* states that ethics is "the science of right conduct, also the rules or principles governing the professional conduct of medical practitioners." *The American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language* defines ethics as "the study of the general nature of morals and of the specific moral choices to be made by the individual in his relationship with others."

The incidents in my professional experience that I will touch on illustrate attitudes and reactions to the moral quality of a course of action as it may interrelate with the rules or principles governing the professional conduct of practitioners. In sharing these episodes with you, I ask that you forgive me if my present sense of distance introduces humor to a subject that deserves, and indeed demands, serious and dignified consideration. I identify with Jacob Bronowski [1] when he tells us, "History is not events but people. And it is