

This book integrates legal, economic, and administrative materials about value added tax. Its principal purpose is to provide comprehensive teaching tools – laws, cases, analytical exercises, and questions drawn from the experience of countries and organizations around the world. It also serves as a resource for tax practitioners and government officials that must grapple with issues under their VAT or their prospective VAT. The comparative presentation of this volume offers an analysis of policy issues relating to tax structure and tax base as well as insights into how cases arising out of VAT disputes have been resolved. In the new edition, the authors have expanded the coverage to include new VAT-related developments in Europe, Asia, Africa, and Australia. A new chapter on financial services has been added as well as an analysis of significant new cases.

ALAN SCHENK teaches VAT at Wayne State University and has taught VAT at other universities such as Harvard University, University of Michigan, and the University of San Diego. For the past eight years, Professor Schenk has served as Technical Advisor for the International Monetary Fund, drafting and reviewing legislative proposals for sales and value added tax for several countries in Africa and for emerging economies of Eastern Europe. He is the author of four books and has published many articles on VAT including several involving the taxation of financial services.

OLIVER OLDMAN is Learned Hand Professor of Law, Emeritus, at the Harvard Law School. For twenty-five years until July 1989, he was the Director of the School's International Tax Program. He has been a member of the Law School Faculty since 1955 when he began directing the Tax Program's training activities and was appointed Professor of Law in 1961. He began teaching about value added taxes in his Comparative Tax Policy course in the 1960s and offered his first separate course on the value added tax in 1979. He has taught the course continuously at Harvard Law School since then. Professor Schenk has been a frequent guest lecturer in that course.

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS  
[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

ISBN 0-521-61656-5



9 780521 616560 >

# Value Added Tax

A COMPARATIVE APPROACH

Alan Schenk  
*Wayne State University*

Oliver Oldman  
*Harvard Law School*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521851121](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521851121)

© Alan Schenk and Oliver Oldman 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Schenk, Alan.

Value added tax : a comparative approach / Alan Schenk, Oliver Oldman. – [Rev. ed.].

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-85112-1 (hardback)

ISBN-10: 0-521-85112-2 (hardback)

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-61656-0 (pbk.)

ISBN-10: 0-521-61656-5 (pbk.)

1. Value-added tax – Law and legislation. 2. Spending tax – Law and legislation. 3. Taxation of articles of consumption – Law and legislation. I. Oldman, Oliver. II. Title. K4573.S337 2006

343.05'5 – dc22 2006008216

ISBN-13 978-0-521-85112-1 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-85112-2 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-61656-0 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-61656-5 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Preface to the Revised Edition

Thanks to our students at Wayne State, Harvard, and Michigan law schools for their contributions to the revision of this book. Thanks to Dean Frank Wu and Wayne State University Law School, and to Georgia Clark, Director of the Wayne Law Library, and her staff for the support that made this revision possible. Thanks to our colleague Richard Ainsworth and the two anonymous readers who made helpful suggestions on how we could improve our first attempt at comparative value added tax. Thanks to Karen Kissinger for her very helpful research assistance. Thanks to our faculty assistants, Olive Hyman and Lise Berg, for their assistance with various aspects of the manuscript. Thanks to John Berger, our editor at Cambridge University Press, and Peggy Rote, Laura Lawrie, and Dianne Scent for their help in the process of converting our manuscript to final text.

The cutoff date for this book generally was March 31, 2006, although we have included some material published after that date. In particular, we included some European Court of Justice cases, including those covering the Italian subnational tax (IRAP) and some VAT-abusive transactions. This book is not intended to be exhaustive. It therefore does not include all significant cases in all countries or even all English-speaking countries. It is designed to illustrate, analyze, and explain the principal theoretical and operating features of value added taxes, including their adoption and implementation.

The European Union is in the process of revising its Sixth Directive that includes the principles that all member countries must adopt as part of their value added taxes. The Recast of the Sixth Directive, to enter into force, must be adopted by the EU Council of Ministers by unanimity. That action was not taken by this date. In some parts of the book, we included references not only to the Sixth Directive in its present form but also to the Recast.

Alan Schenk, Detroit, Michigan  
Oliver Oldman, Cambridge, Massachusetts  
June 1, 2006

# Contents

<i>List of Tables, Figures, and Charts</i>	page xxiii
<i>List of Cases</i>	xxv
<i>Preface to the Revised Edition</i>	xxxiii
1 SURVEY OF TAXES ON CONSUMPTION AND INCOME, AND INTRODUCTION TO VALUE ADDED TAX	1
I. Introduction	1
II. Development of Taxes on Consumption – A Brief Review of History	2
III. Direct and Indirect Taxes on an Income or Consumption Base	5
A. Direct and Indirect Taxes	5
B. Income and Consumption Base for Tax	8
IV. Tax Structures in Developed and Developing Economies	13
V. Broadening the Base of a Tax System	16
VI. The Value Added Tax	16
VII. The Proliferation of VATs	17
VIII. Glossary of VAT Terms	19
IX. Outline of Issues Pertaining to Consumption Taxes	23
X. Discussion Questions	24
APPENDIX A: DEVELOPMENT TAXATION	25
I. Introduction	25
II. The Reform of Indirect Taxation	27

III. Taxing Imports	27
IV. Taxing Exports	28
2 FORMS OF CONSUMPTION-BASED TAXES AND ALTERING THE TAX BASE	30
I. Forms of Consumption-Based Taxes	30
A. Introduction	30
B. Consumption-Based Direct Tax on Individuals	30
C. Single and Multistage Sales Taxes	33
II. Overview of the Value Added Tax	33
A. In General	33
B. Jurisdictional Reach of the Tax	35
C. Inclusion of VAT in Tax Base	35
D. Inclusion of Capital Goods in Tax Base	36
III. Methods of Calculating VAT Liability	38
A. Credit-Invoice VAT	38
B. Credit-Subtraction VAT That Does Not Rely on VAT Invoices	41
C. Sales-Subtraction VAT	42
D. Addition-Method VAT	43
IV. Methods of Altering the Tax Base	46
A. Entity Exemptions	48
B. Zero Rating	50
C. Transaction Exemption	52
D. Alteration of Base by Granting or Denying Credits	54
E. Multiple Rates	54
V. Discussion Questions	55
3 VARIETIES OF VAT IN USE	58
I. Introduction	58
II. European Union: A Mature VAT Resistant to Change	59
A. VAT in the European Community	59
B. European Court of Justice	63
C. Application of the EU Sixth VAT Directive	64
1. History and proposal for recodification	64
2. When is a tax on consumption not a turnover tax or VAT in violation of the sixth directive?	64

III. Japanese Consumption Tax	67
1. Credit-subtraction VAT without invoices	67
2. Movement toward invoice-method VAT	68
IV. New Zealand Goods and Services Tax	69
A. Broad Tax Base	69
B. Taxation of Government Services	69
C. Taxation of Casualty and Other Nonlife Insurance	70
D. Global Reach of the New Zealand GST	70
V. African Experience Expanding Base to Tax Financial Services	71
VI. Commonlaw and Civil Law Approaches	71
4 REGISTRATION, TAXPAYER, AND TAXABLE BUSINESS ACTIVITY	73
I. Introduction	73
II. Registration	73
A. In General	73
B. Mandatory Registration	74
1. General rules	74
2. Promoters of public entertainment	75
3. Registration regardless of turnover	76
C. Registration Threshold and the Small Business Exemption	77
1. In general	77
2. What is the business?	80
3. Splitting a business and the related person rules	81
4. Severing value from the business	84
D. Voluntary Registration	86
E. Cancellation of Registration	87
F. Transition to Registration and Cancellation of Registration	88
G. Registration of Branches and Group of Companies	88
H. Electronic Commerce	89
I. Telecommunication Services	91
III. Person Liable for Tax	93
A. General Principles	93
B. Person Treated as Seller	94
1. In general	94
2. Electronic commerce and telecommunication services rendered by nonresidents	95
3. Auctions	96
4. Other sales by nonowners	96
5. Local government services	97
C. Tax Collectible from Third Persons	98

IV. Business Activity Subject to VAT	98
A. Taxable Activity	98
B. Personal Sales	102
C. When Does a Business Begin?	106
D. Employee Not Engaged in Taxable Activity	108
V. Discussion Questions	109
5 TAXABLE SUPPLIES OF GOODS AND SERVICES, AND TAX INVOICES	111
I. Introduction	111
II. Sales of Goods and Services	111
A. What Is a Sale or Supply?	112
1. Nonsupplies or supplies other than in the course of taxable activity	113
2. Sales for consideration	116
3. Transactions or transfers deemed to be supplies for VAT purposes	122
a. <i>Cease to conduct taxable transactions</i>	122
b. <i>Diversion of business assets to personal or employee use</i>	123
c. <i>Change in the use of goods or services</i>	124
d. <i>Repossession of goods sold in a taxable transaction</i>	124
B. Goods or Services	124
C. Supply of Goods	125
D. Supply of Services	126
E. What Is “the” Supply for VAT Purposes? – Single, Mixed, and Composite Supplies	130
F. Vouchers	137
III. The Tax or VAT Invoice	138
A. Role of VAT Invoice	138
B. Who Receives VAT Invoices?	139
C. Contents of Required VAT Invoices	139
D. Waiver of Required VAT Invoices	140
IV. Discussion Questions	140
6 THE TAX CREDIT MECHANISM	141
I. Tax Credit for Purchases	141
A. Basic Input Tax Credit Rules	141
1. Allowance of credit – general rules	141
2. Credit for input VAT on capital goods	143
3. Conditions to claim credit for input VAT	144
4. Credit denied on purchases for exempt and other nontaxable transactions	149



B. Impact of Subsidies on Allowable Input Credits	158
C. Pre-opening Expenses and Posteconomic Activity	159
D. De Minimis Rule	161
E. Transactions Involving Shares and Debt	161
F. Bad Debts	166
II. Treatment of Excess Input Credits – Carry Forward, Offset, or Refund	167
III. Impact of Change from Exempt to Taxable Status	171
IV. Used Property	172
A. Business-to-Business Sales of Used Property	172
B. Sales of Used Property in Nontaxable Transactions	172
V. Postsale Price Adjustments and Refunds	175
A. In General	175
B. Returns and Allowances – Credit and Debit Notes	175
C. Postsale Rebate by Pre-retail Registered Business to Final Consumer	176
VI. Casual Sales by Consumers	176
VII. Japan's System to Calculate Input Credits	177
VIII. Calculation of Tax Liability and Special Schemes	178
IX. Discussion Questions	179
7 INTRODUCTION TO CROSS-BORDER ASPECTS OF VAT	180
I. Introduction to International Trade	180
II. Vocabulary of Interjurisdictional (Cross-Border) Aspects of VAT	181
III. Taxonomy of Broad-Based Sales Taxes on International Trade	181
IV. Origin Versus Destination Principle	182
A. In General	182
B. Double Taxation of Consumer-to-Consumer Imports	184
V. Place of Supply Rules in International Trade	188
A. Basic Rules on the Place of a Supply of Goods and Services	188
B. Recent Developments in the EU on the Place of Supply	195
C. Territorial Versus Global Reach of a VAT	195
VI. Imports	202
A. Imports of Goods	202
B. Imports of Services	203

VII. Exports	205
A. Exports of Goods	205
B. Exports of Services	205
VIII. Telecommunications, Electronically Supplied Services, and E-Commerce	209
A. Introduction	209
B. Place of Supply of Services Involving Telecommunications, Electronically Supplied Services, and E-Commerce	210
1. Telecommunications services	210
2. Radio, television, and electronically supplied services	212
3. Electronic commerce	216
IX. International Transportation Services	219
X. Proposals to Fund Relief of Disaster Victims or Poverty with an International Tax	220
A. Introduction	220
B. Professor Kaneko's Proposal to Fund Disaster Relief with an International Humanitarian Tax	220
C. Proposals by President Chirac and Others to Fund Poverty Relief Efforts, the Fight against AIDs, or Development Projects with a Dedicated Tax	222
XI. Discussion Questions	223
8 TIMING AND VALUATION RULES	224
I. The Timing Rules	224
A. Accrual, Invoice, and Cash Methods – in General	224
1. Imports	226
2. Accrual method	227
3. Invoice method	234
4. Cash method	235
B. Effects of Length of Taxable Period	236
1. Taxable period – in general	236
2. Variations in length of period	237
3. Time to file returns and pay tax	238
4. Cash-flow effects	238
C. Special Rules for Certain Sales	239
1. Installment or deferred payment sales	239
2. Goods diverted to personal use	241
3. Other special cases	241
II. Transition Rules	241
A. Introduction	241

<i>Contents</i>	xiii
B. Transition Rules Applicable to Repealed Sales Tax	242
C. Timing Differences between Sales Tax and VAT and Supplies Straddling the VAT Effective Date	243
D. Pre-effective Date Contracts Not Specifying VAT	246
<b>III. Valuation Rules</b>	246
A. Taxable Amount or Value of a Supply – General Rule	246
B. Sales Free of Charge or for a Nominal Charge	251
C. Discounts, Rebates, and Price Allowances	252
D. Pledged Goods and Repossessions	254
E. Postsale Adjustments	254
F. Related Party Transactions	256
G. Margin Schemes	257
H. Sales to Door-to-Door Sellers and Similar Independent Contractors	258
I. Self-Supply Transactions	259
J. Taxable Amount – Imports	260
1. General rule	260
2. Imports placed in a bonded warehouse	260
3. Imports of previously exported articles	261
4. Imports from unregistered persons	261
<b>IV. Discussion Questions</b>	262
<b>9 ZERO RATING AND EXEMPTIONS AND GOVERNMENT ENTITIES AND NONPROFIT ORGANIZATIONS</b>	263
I. Introduction	263
II. Zero-Rated Sales	263
A. In General	263
B. Zero-Rated Exports	266
C. Authority to Zero Rate Other Transactions	267
III. Exempt Sales	268
IV. Allocation of a Single Price between Supplies with Different Tax Consequences	279
V. A-B-C Transactions	280
VI. Governmental Entities and Nonprofit Organizations	282
A. Introduction	282
B. Various Approaches to the Taxation of Governments and NPOs	285
C. Taxation in New Zealand	289
D. Taxation in the European Union	290

VII. Special Treatment for Diplomats, Embassies, and International Organizations	298
VIII. Discussion Questions	299
10 GAMBLING AND FINANCIAL SERVICES (OTHER THAN INSURANCE)	301
I. General Introduction	301
II. Gambling, Lotteries, and Other Games of Chance	301
III. Financial Services Involving Money and Financial Products (Other than Insurance)	304
A. Introduction	304
B. Variety of Transactions Involving Financial Services	305
C. Financial Intermediation Services	306
D. Principles to Guide the Taxation of Financial Services	313
E. Interest Paid on Credit Sales to Consumers	314
F. Exemption for Financial Intermediation Services as Implemented in the EU	314
1. Introduction	314
2. Exemption for financial services in the EU followed elsewhere	315
3. Effects of exemption at an intermediate or retail stage	317
G. Vertical Integration and Outsourcing	317
H. Input Tax Credits and the Allocation of the Credits Between Taxable and Exempt Activities	324
1. Introduction	324
2. Methods of allocating disallowed credits	325
3. Credit denied for VAT on purchases by consumers: credit when purchase is made for investment	327
I. Departures from EU in the Taxation of Financial Services	327
1. Introduction	327
2. Israel and Argentina	328
3. South Africa	329
4. Singapore, New Zealand, and Australia	331
a. <i>Singapore's zero rating of financial services rendered to taxable                     customers</i>	331
b. <i>New Zealand zero rates some financial services rendered by                     financial service providers</i>	331
c. <i>Australia's treatment of financial services</i>	333
5. Italy's subtraction-method IRAP imposed at the subnational level	335

IV. Proposals to Tax Financial Intermediation Services	335
A. Introduction	335
B. Canadian Flirtation with Taxation of Intermediation Services	335
C. Proposals in the United States	336
D. The Poddar-English Proposal	337
E. Zee's Modified Reverse-Charging Approach	339
V. Discussion Questions	341
11 INSURANCE	343
I. Introduction	343
A. International Insurance Services	344
B. Domestic Insurance Services	344
II. Broad-Based Tax on Casualty Insurance	345
III. Exemption for Insurance Other than Life Insurance	346
IV. New Zealand Taxation of Insurance	348
A. Application of the N.Z. Taxation of Casualty Insurance to Policyholders in Business	351
B. Application of the N.Z. Taxation of Casualty Insurance to Policyholders Who Are Consumers	353
C. Are Warranties "Insurance" in New Zealand?	354
V. Australia's Taxation of Insurance	355
VI. A U.S. Proposal – The Nunn-Domenici USA Tax System	356
VII. Discussion Questions	356
12 INTERJURISDICTIONAL ASPECTS OF VAT IN FEDERAL COUNTRIES AND COMMON MARKETS	358
I. Introduction	358
II. EU's Commitment to Intra-Union Borderless Trade	361
A. Introduction	361
B. Selected Provisions of the Treaty Establishing the European Community	362
C. Timetable to Move Toward a Definitive VAT Regime	364
D. EU Required Exchange of Tax Information	364
III. EU Member States Limited to One VAT	365
Letter to the President of the European Court of Justice Concerning the Italian IRAP and the European VAT	367

IV. EU Commitment to an Origin VAT: Its Problems and Proposals	373
1. In general and early proposals	373
2. The Keen and Smith VIVAT for intra-EU trade	374
V. Canadian VATs and the Bird/Gendron Dual VAT	376
A. Introduction	376
B. Variety of Canadian Sales and Value Added Taxes	376
C. Bird and Gendron Dual VAT Proposal	378
D. Application of Dual VAT Concept to the EU	380
VI. Brazil and the Varsano "Little Boat Model"	381
A. Brazil's Tax Structure in General	381
B. Varsano's "Little Boat Model"	382
C. McLure's CVAT Modification of Varsano Proposal	384
D. Comparison of the Features of the CVAT, VIVAT, and Dual VAT Proposals	388
VII. Subnational VATs in India	390
A. Enacted State-Level VATs	390
B. Prepaid VAT Proposed for India by Poddar and Hutton	392
VIII. Origin-Based Business Value Tax (BVT) to Finance Subnational Government	393
IX. Reform of Subnational Taxes in the United States	395
A. Coexistence of Federal VAT and State Retail Sales Tax	397
B. Subnational VATs in Use and Proposed for the United States	398
1. Michigan single business tax	400
2. West Virginia's proposed single business tax	401
3. New Hampshire business enterprise tax	403
C. Streamlined Sales and Use Tax	404
D. Ainsworth's Digital VAT	405
X. Discussion Questions	406
13 REAL PROPERTY	408
I. Introduction	408
II. Array of VAT Treatment of Real (or Immovable) Property	408
III. EU Approach to the Taxation of Real (or Immovable) Property	411
A. In General	411
B. Exemption for Leasing and Terminating a Lease	412
1. What is a "lease" or "letting" of immovable property?	412
2. Disposition or transfer of a lease	417

C. Mixed Business–Personal Use	425
D. Tax-Motivated Transactions	428
IV. Proposals for the Taxation of Real Property	429
V. Discussion Questions	431
14 PROPOSALS FOR U.S. TAX ON CONSUMPTION	433
I. Introduction	433
II. President Bush’s Advisory Panel on Tax Reform	435
A. Introduction	435
B. Value Added Tax Considered	436
C. The Growth and Investment Tax Plan	437
III. Gibbons and Graetz VATs Replacing Most Income Tax	440
IV. The USA Tax System: Coordinated Consumption-Based Individual and Business Taxes	442
A. Introduction	442
B. The Business Tax	443
C. The Income Tax	445
V. The Flat Tax	448
A. Hall-Rabushka Flat Tax	449
B. Shelby Flat Tax	449
VI. National Retail Sales Tax	451
A. Introduction	451
B. The Chambliss Bill	452
1. Basic framework and scope of the tax base	452
2. Special treatment for government entities and nonprofit organizations	453
3. RST credits	454
4. Rebate to low-income households	455
5. Taxation of financial intermediation services	455
6. Timing rules	456
7. State authority to collect tax and federal support	456
VII. Elective Flat Rate Income Taxes	457
VIII. Discussion Question	458
APPENDIXES	459
Appendix A VATs Worldwide	459
Appendix B Commonwealth of New Vatopia Value Added Tax Act	463
Part I. Preliminary	463

Part II. Administration	463
Part III. Imposition of Tax	463
Part IV. Registration	463
Part V. Tax Period, Returns, and Calculation of Tax Payable	464
Part VI. Payment, Collection and Recovery	464
Part VII. Refund of Tax and Tax Relief	464
Part VIII. Assessments	464
Part IX. Objections and Appeals	464
Part X. Representatives and Special Cases of Taxable Persons	464
Part XI. Records and Investigation Powers	465
Part XII. Offences and Penalties	465
Division I: Criminal Offences	465
Division II: Civil Penalties	465
Part XIII. Miscellaneous	465
<b>SCHEDULES</b>	465
<b>BILL FOR AN ACT TO PROVIDE FOR THE IMPOSITION AND COLLECTION OF VALUE ADDED TAX</b>	466
<b>Part I. Preliminary</b>	466
1. Short Title and Commencement	466
2. Interpretation	466
3. Meaning of "Fair Market Value"	470
4. Meaning of "Supply"	471
5. Taxable Activity	473
6. Meaning of "Taxable Person"	473
<b>Part II. Administration</b>	473
7. Powers and Duties of Commissioner	473
8. Secrecy	474
<b>Part III. Imposition of Tax</b>	475
9. Imposition of Tax and Persons Liable	475
10. Time of Supply	475
11. Time of Import	476
12. Place of Supply	476
13. Value of Supply	477
14. Value of Import	478
15. Zero Rating	479
16. Exempt Supply	479
17. Exempt Import	479
18. Import Declaration and Payment of Tax for Importation of Goods	479
19. Import Declaration and Payment of Tax for Importation of Services	480



<b>Part IV. Registration</b>	<b>481</b>
20. Registration	481
21. Registration Procedure	482
22. Cancellation of Registration	483
<b>Part V Tax Period, Returns, and Calculation of Tax Payable</b>	<b>484</b>
23. Tax Period	484
24. Returns	484
25. Extension of Time	485
26. Calculation of Tax Payable for Tax Period	485
27. Input Tax Deduction	485
28. Input Tax Deduction Allocation and Disallowance Rules	487
29. Postsale Adjustments	488
30. Bad Debt	489
31. Interest on Unpaid Tax	490
32. Tax Invoices and Sales Invoices	490
33. Tax Credit and Debit Notes	491
<b>Part VI. Payment, Collection, and Recovery</b>	<b>491</b>
34. Due Date for Payment of Tax	491
35. Allocation of Payments among Tax, Interest, and Penalties	492
36. Recovery of Tax as Debt Due	492
37. Recovery of Tax from Persons Leaving Vatopia	493
38. Security	493
39. Preferential Claim to Assets	493
40. Seizure of Goods and Vehicles	494
41. Distress Proceedings	495
42. Recovery of Tax from Recipient of Supply	495
43. Recovery of Tax from Third Parties	496
44. Duties of Receivers	496
<b>Part VII. Refund of Tax and Tax Relief</b>	<b>497</b>
45. Carry Forward of Excess Deductions and Refund of Tax	497
46. Interest on Overpayment	499
47. Others Eligible for Tax Refund	499
<b>Part VIII. Assessments</b>	<b>500</b>
48. Assessments	500
49. General Provisions Relating to Assessments	501
<b>Part IX. Objections and Appeals</b>	<b>501</b>
50. Objections	501
51. Appeal to Commissioner of Appeals	502
52. Appeal to High Court	503
53. Burden of Proof	503