



Morris Mbondenyi

The African System on Human and Peoples' Rights

Its Promises, Prospects and Pitfalls



LAMBERT
Academic Publishing

Morris Mbondenyi

The African System on Human and Peoples' Rights

Its Promises, Prospects and Pitfalls



LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing

Impressum/Imprint (nur für Deutschland/ only for Germany)

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek: Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

Alle in diesem Buch genannten Marken und Produktnamen unterliegen warenzeichen-, marken- oder patentrechtlichem Schutz bzw. sind Warenzeichen oder eingetragene Warenzeichen der jeweiligen Inhaber. Die Wiedergabe von Marken, Produktnamen, Gebrauchsnamen, Handelsnamen, Warenbezeichnungen u.s.w. in diesem Werk berechtigt auch ohne besondere Kennzeichnung nicht zu der Annahme, dass solche Namen im Sinne der Warenzeichen- und Markenschutzgesetzgebung als frei zu betrachten wären und daher von jedermann benutzt werden dürften.

Coverbild: www.ingimage.com

Verlag: LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing AG & Co. KG
Dudweiler Landstr. 99, 66123 Saarbrücken, Deutschland
Telefon +49 681 3720-310, Telefax +49 681 3720-3109
Email: info@lap-publishing.com

Herstellung in Deutschland:
Schaltungsdienst Lange o.H.G., Berlin
Books on Demand GmbH, Norderstedt
Reha GmbH, Saarbrücken
Amazon Distribution GmbH, Leipzig
ISBN: 978-3-8433-5100-3

Imprint (only for USA, GB)

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek: The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Any brand names and product names mentioned in this book are subject to trademark, brand or patent protection and are trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective holders. The use of brand names, product names, common names, trade names, product descriptions etc. even without a particular marking in this work is in no way to be construed to mean that such names may be regarded as unrestricted in respect of trademark and brand protection legislation and could thus be used by anyone.

Cover image: www.ingimage.com

Publisher: LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing AG & Co. KG
Dudweiler Landstr. 99, 66123 Saarbrücken, Germany
Phone +49 681 3720-310, Fax +49 681 3720-3109
Email: info@lap-publishing.com

Printed in the U.S.A.
Printed in the U.K. by (see last page)
ISBN: 978-3-8433-5100-3

Copyright © 2010 by the author and LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing AG & Co. KG and licensors
All rights reserved. Saarbrücken 2010

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work is to me both a reminder and commemoration of the inputs of many people and institutions. It has taken years of hard work, sacrifice and relentlessness for this book to be compiled. Without the strength and hand of the Almighty God over my life, this work would definitely not have seen the light of the day. I am therefore grateful to my gracious LORD for His mercy, love, strength and care; for protecting me, saving me and guiding me through every stage of this work.

Many chapters of this book were adopted from my Doctor of Laws (LLD) research hosted by the University of South Africa (UNISA) School of Law, under the supervision of Professor André Mbata Betukumesu Mangu. Indeed, Professor Mangu's invaluable comments and inputs at every stage of my doctoral work are highly appreciated and acknowledged. However, while I am grateful for his contribution, shortcomings, errors and omissions in this book are entirely mine. Additionally, I am greatly indebted to UNISA for its permission to adopt and publish materials from my LLD thesis.

Many other institutions have also been a stepping-stone towards the compilation of this book. These include the United Nations International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (UN-ICTR), whose small but resourceful library I was able to consult when working at the institution as a legal researcher. Others are: the University of Witwatersrand (Wits) library in Johannesburg, South Africa; University of Pretoria Library; University of Swaziland (UNISWA) library; and the South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC) library in Johannesburg.

Of equal importance to this achievement are members of my family to whom I attribute a great deal of my success. They did not spare anything to support, nurture and educate me. I am particularly indebted to my mother, Mrs. Lenah Nakijwa Mbondenyi and my late father, Lewis George Mbondenyi, for their parental guidance, assistance and care. Moreover, through the collaborative efforts of my many friends, relatives, teachers and colleagues, this dream has finally become a reality. Because of their optimism and constant encouragement, they will forever be remembered as long as the development and completion of this book is concerned. Special thanks also go to my spiritual

guardians, mentors and pastors for their guidance, advice and ceaseless prayers. They taught me to build on the solid foundation, which is the word of God.

Lastly, I am indebted to those writers, scholars, leaders and activists whose works have been quoted extensively in this book. This study would not have attained its present status and form without the academic resources produced by them. Their efforts and contribution to the human rights agenda of the continent is acknowledged.

Morris Kiwinda Mbondenyi

JOHANNESBURG, SOUTH AFRICA, 2008

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACJ	African Court of Justice
ACRWC	African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child
AEC	Economic Community
AHRLJ	African Human Rights Law Journal
AHSG	Assembly of Head of States and Government
AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
AJIL	African Journal of International Law
AM. J	American Journal
APRM	African Peer Review Mechanism
ART	Article
AU	African Union
CAAU	Constitutive Act of the African Union
CAT	Convention against Torture
CE	Council of Europe
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEN-SAD	Community of Sahel-Saharan States
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CILSA	Comparative and International Law Journal of Southern Africa
CIP	Country Issue Paper
CODESTRIA	Council for the Development of Economic and Social Research in Africa
COMESA	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa
COMP.L	Comparative Law
CRM	Country Review Mission
CSAR	Country Self-Assessment Report
CSM	Country Support Mission
CSSDCA	Conference on Security, Stability, Development and Cooperation in Africa

DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DEVAW	Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
EC	Executive Council (of the African Union)
ECCAS	Economic Community of Central African States
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
ED(S)	Editor(s)
ESC	European Social Charter
EU	European Union
FGM	Female Genital Mutilation
GA	General Assembly
GA. Res.	General Assembly Resolution
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HPs	Harmful Practices
HRC	UN Human Rights Committee
HSGIC	Heads of State and Government Implementation Committee
HUM.RTS	Human Rights
IACHR	Inter-American Convention on Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Covenant on the Elimination of all forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IGAD	Intergovernmental Authority for Development
IHRR	International Human Rights Report
ILM	International Legal Material

ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMF	International Monetary Foundation
INTL	International Law
LJ	Law Journal
LLB	Bachelor of Laws
LLD	Doctor of Laws
LLM	Master of Laws
MAP	Millennium Africa Recovery Plan
MDC	Movement for Democratic Change
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NAI	New African Initiative
NEPAD	New Partnership for Africa's Development
NGC	National Governing Council
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
OAS	Organisation of American States
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
ODM	Orange Democratic Movement
OSCE	Organisation for Security & Co-operation in Europe
OSIWA	Open Society Initiative for West African
P.	Page
PARA	Paragraph
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PNU	Party of National Unity
POA	Programme of Action
PP	Pages
PRS	Permanent Representative Committee
RECs	Regional Economic Communities
RSA	Republic of South Africa
SA	South Africa
SADC	Southern African Development Community

SAJHR	South African Journal of Human Rights
SALJ	South African Law Journal
SAP	Structural Adjustment Programme
SAPL	South African Public Law
SAYIL	South African Year Book of International Law
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
STCs	Specialised Technical Committees
UDHR	Universal Declaration on Human Rights
UK	United Kingdom
UMA	<i>Union du Maghreb Arabe</i>
UN	United Nations
UNCRC	United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Education, Science, and Cultural Organisation
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNISA	University of South Africa
UNISWA	University of Swaziland
UNP.	Unpublished
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
US/USA	United States/ United States of America
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republic
V.	Versus
VOL	Volume
WILDAF	Women in Law and Development in Africa
ZANU-PF	Zimbabwe African National Union-Patriotic Front

TABLE OF CASES

Azanian Peoples' Organisation (AZAPO) & others v. President of the Republic of South Africa & others 1996 (4) SA 671 (CC).

Campbell and Cosans v. UK 1982 (4) ECHR.

Communication 1/88, *Frederick Korvah v. Liberia*, Seventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, (Annex IX).

Communication 101/93, *Civil liberties Organisation in Respect of the Nigerian Bar Association v. Nigeria*, Eighth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VI).

Communication 102/93, *Constitutional Rights Project and Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria*, Twelfth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 103/93, *Alhassan Abubakar v. Ghana*, Tenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex X).

Communication 105/93, 128/94, 130/94, 152/96, *Media Rights Agenda, Constitutional Rights Project, Media Rights Agenda and Constitutional Rights Project v. Nigeria*, Twelfth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 11/88, *Henry Kalenga v. Zambia*, ACHPR/LR/A1 (1997).

Communication 12/88, *Mohamed El-Nekheily v. OAU*, Seventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights.

Communication 133/94, *Association pour la Defence des Droits de l'Homme et des Libertés v. Djibouti*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 137/94, 139/94, 154/96 and 161/97, *International Pen, Constitutional Rights Project, Interights on behalf of Ken Saro-Wiwa Jr. and Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria*, Twelfth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 140/94, 141/94, 145/95, *Constitutional Rights Project, Civil Liberties Organisation and Media Rights Agenda v. Nigeria*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 143/95, 150/96, *Constitutional Rights Project and Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 144/95, *William Curson (acting on behalf of Severo Moto) v. Equatorial Guinea*, Eleventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex II).

Communication 147/95, 149/96, *Sir Dawda K Jawara v. The Gambia*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 148/96, *Constitutional Rights Project v. Nigeria*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 151/96, *Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 153/96, *Constitutional Rights Project v. Nigeria*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 155/96, *The Social and Economic Rights Action Centre and the Centre for Economic and Social Rights v. Nigeria*, Fifteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 159/96, *UIDH, FIDH, RADDHO, ONDH, ANDH v. Angola*, Eleventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex II).

Communication 18/88, *El Hadji Boubacare v. Benin*, Law Reports of the African Commission Series A, Volume 1, ACHPR/LR/A1 (1997).

Communication 197/1997, *Bah Ould Rabah v. Mauritania*, Seventeenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 198/97, *S.O.S. – Esclaves v. Mauritania*, Twelfth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 204/97, *Mouvement Burkinabé des Droits de l'Homme et des Peuples v. Burkina Faso*, Fourteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 205/97, *Kazeem Aminu v. Nigeria*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 209/97, *Africa Legal Aid v. The Gambia*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 211/98, *Legal Resources Foundation v. Zambia*, Fourteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 212/98, *Amnesty International v. Zambia*, Twelfth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 215/98, *Rights International v. Nigeria*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 218/98, *Civil Liberties Organisation, Legal Defence Centre, Legal Defence and Assistance Project v. Nigeria*, Fourteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 219/98, *Legal Defence Centre v. Gambia*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 220/98, *The Law Offices of Ghazi Suleiman v. Sudan*, Fifteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 222/98 & 229/98, *The Law Offices of Ghazi Suleiman v. Sudan*, Sixteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 224/98, *Media Rights Agenda v. Nigeria*, Fourteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 225/98, *Huri-Laws v. Nigeria*, Fourteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 228/99, *The Law Offices of Ghazi Suleiman v. Sudan*, Sixteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 231/99, *Avocats Sans Frontières (on behalf of Gaëtan Bwampamye) v. Burundi*, Fourteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 232/99, *John D. Ouko v. Kenya*, Fourteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 233/99, *Interights (on behalf of the Pan African Movement and Citizens for Peace in Eritrea) v. Ethiopia*, Sixteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 234/99, *Interights (on behalf of the Pan African Movement and Inter-Africa Group) v. Eritrea*, Sixteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 236/2000, *Curtis Francis Doebbler v. Sudan*, Sixteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 240/2001, *Interights et al (on behalf of Mariette Sonjaleen Bosch) v. Botswana*, Seventeenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 241/2001, *Purohit and Moore v. The Gambia*, Sixteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 242/2001, *Interights, Institute for Human Rights and Development in Africa; Association Mauritanienne des Droits de l'Homme v. Mauritania*, Seventeenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 254/2002, *Mouvement des Réfugiés Mauritanien au Senegal Pour la Defense des Droits de l'Homme v. Senegal*, Sixteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VII).

Communication 255/2002, *Gareth Anver Prince v. South Africa*.

Communication 268/2003, *Ilesanmi v. Nigeria*, Eighteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex III).

Communication 290/ 2004, *Open Society Justice Initiative v. Cameroon*, Twentieth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex IV).

Communication 39/90, *Annette Pagnoulle (on behalf of Abdoulaye Mazou) v. Cameroon*, Tenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex X).

Communication 40/90, *Bob Ngozi v. Egypt*, Eleventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex II).

Communication 44/90, *Peoples' Democratic Organisation for Independence and Socialism v. The Gambia*, Tenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex X).

Communication 57/91, *Tanko Bariga v. Nigeria*, Seventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex IX).

Communication 60/91, *Constitutional Rights Project (in Respect of Sehab Akumu, G Adegade and others) v. Nigeria*, Eighth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VI).

Communication 62/91, *Committee for the Defense of Human Rights (Jennifer Madike) v. Nigeria*, ACHPR/LR/A1 (1997).

Communication 65/92, *Ligue Camerounaise des Droits de l'Homme v. Cameroon*, Tenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex X).

Communication 70/92, *Ibrahim Diomessi, Sekou Kande, Ousmane Kabe v. Guinea*, Seventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex IX); Ninth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VIII).

Communication 71/92, *Rencontre Africaine pour la Defence des Droits de l'Homme v. Zambia*, Tenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex X).

Communication 73/92, *Mohammed Lamine Diakité v. Gabon*, Thirteenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex V).

Communication 74/92, *Commission Nationale des Droits de l'Homme et des Liberties v. Chad*, (1997) 4 IHRR.

Communication 74/92, *Commission Nationale des Droits de l'Homme et des Libertés v. Chad*, Ninth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VIII).

Communication 91/93, *Commission Internationale de Juristes v. Togo*.

Communication 97/93, *John K. Modise v. Botswana*, Tenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex X).

Communications 25/89, 47/90, 56/91 & 100/93, *Free Legal Assistance Group, Lawyers' Committee for Human Rights, Union Inter africaine des Droits de l'Homme, Les Temoins de Jehoveh v. Zaire*, Ninth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VIII).

Communications 27/89, 46/91, 49/91, 99/93, *Organisation Mondiale Contre La Torture and Association Internationale des juristes Democrates) Commission Internationale des Juristes (C.I.J) Union Inter africaine des Droits de l'Homme v. Rwanda*, Tenth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex X).

Communications 53/90 and 53/91, *Alberto T. Capitao v. Tanzania*, Seventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex IX); Eighth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VI).

Communications 64/92, 68/92 and 78/92, *Krishna Achuthan (on behalf of Aleke Banda), Amnesty International (on behalf of Orton and Vera Chirwa v. Malawi*, Seventh Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex IX); Eighth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VI).

Communications 75/92, *Katangese Peoples' Congress v. Zaire*, Eighth Annual Activity Report of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (Annex VI).

CR v UK (1995) 21 EHRR, 363

De Wilde, Ooms and Versyp v. Belgium ECHR (18 June 1971) Ser A 12.

Handyside v UK ECHR (7 December 1976) Ser A 24.