## Michael Ball

# HOUSING POLICY AND ECONOMIC POWER

The Political Economy of Owner Occupation

## Michael Ball

# Housing policy and economic power

The political economy of owner occupation

METHUEN London & New York

First published in 1983 by Methuen & Co. Ltd 11 New Fetter Lane, London EC4P 4EE

Published in the USA by Methuen & Co. in association with Methuen, Inc. 733 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

#### © 1983 Michael Ball

Typeset in Great Britain by Scarborough Typesetting Services and printed at the University Press, Cambridge

All rights reserved No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers

#### British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Ball, Michael
Housing policy and economic power.

1. Home ownership — Great Britain —
Social aspects

2. Home ownership — Great Britain —
Political aspects

I. Title

333.3'23'0941 HD7287.8.G7

ISBN 0-416-35280-4

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Ball, Michael.

Housing policy and economic power.
Includes bibliographical references and indexes.

1. Housing policy – Great Britain.
2. Home ownership – Government policy – Great Britain. I. Title.
HD733.A3B25 1983 363.5'8'0941
83–13070
ISBN 0-416-35280-4 (pbk.)

## Preface

Owner occupation increasingly dominates housing provision and housing policy in most advanced capitalist countries. Although this book is specifically about owner occupation in Britain, the original impetus to start the research came from an interest in explaining such tenure shifts and their consequences in general terms. Traditional housing research places emphasis on the situation of housing consumers in different tenures and on state policy towards them. For a number of years I have felt such a narrow focus to be insufficient to explain the enormous changes in housing provision that have taken place over the past thirty years. Its inadequacies are indicated by the slow drying up of housing research and the increasing fragmentation and specialization of what remains during years when housing problems are growing in many countries.

Other researchers have recognized the unnecessary confines of the traditional approach. Two main alternatives have been tried. The first is a comparative one where the situation in different countries is examined over time. This approach has the advantage of demolishing certain accepted wisdoms by highlighting empirical situations in other countries where they do not hold. Yet ultimately, unless they question the consumer-orientation of traditional perspectives, cross-country comparisons just reproduce the early difficulties on a global scale. The problems are even compounded by having more data and questions to answer with no theoretically adequate means of dealing with them.

The second and, I think, more adequate approach is to recognize that housing provision involves more than a relation between the state and consumer households. This has led to studies of financial institutions associated with housing or of the construction industry and landownership. Again, however, there are problems, as it is tempting to focus on one agency alone without integrating it into an overall analysis of developments in housing provision. In this way, each aspect of housing provision ends up in its own isolated box. Analysis becomes a series of distinct chapters, each of which does not depend on the others in a meaningful way. Alternatively, the primacy of one aspect may be asserted, like production, with little or no attempt to justify the assumed primacy.

When looking at owner occupation in Britain I have tried to avoid these pitfalls by concentrating on the dynamic processes of change in housing provision and trying to see the role of different types of social agent in them. Particular relations of economic power in housing provision are argued to be key, but neglected, elements in the understanding of housing issues. A brief outline of the approach is given in chapter 1. Because I wanted to get across an interpretation of a whole series of empirical events associated with owner occupation, this initial theoretical exposition is kept to a minimum. Practical demonstration of its usefulness seemed more important. Instead theoretical issues, of which there are many, are confronted in the text when the need arises.

No attempt is made to deal comprehensively with all issues associated with owner occupation. It is impossible to cover every empirical issue associated with a housing tenure; some selection of topics must be done. Here specific questions are asked related to issues of economic and political change as they are felt to be central to the analysis of changes in housing policy. Similarly emphasis has been put on the more neglected aspects of housing provision to avoid repeating material that already is well known. The most neglected aspects I feel are housebuilding, land development and land-use planning. In doing so the book goes beyond the normal confines of housing studies. I hope people who are interested from a non-housing perspective in those topics will also find the relevant chapters useful and interesting.

Like all written material dealing with social issues, this book is a product of its time. The data and arguments presented in it are influenced by the information available when the final manuscript was written in the second half of 1982. Anyone might reasonably ask what the relevance is for later time periods. A number of points need to be made in reply.

The most obvious point is that the re-election in 1983 of the Thatcher Conservative administration for another five years has reinforced the relevance of the critique of current housing policies. No analysis of housing provision can ignore the disastrous effects of the Thatcher government in the housing sphere and in the related areas of infrastructure expenditure and land-use planning. The immediate effects of that government's policies on housing are discussed in chapter 1 and the consequences for planning and the built environment in chapter 8. Yet, sad to say, the policies of the Thatcher government in these spheres have not been unique. They principally continued and exacerbated trends that had developed throughout the 1970s, as that government's ministers delighted in reminding the Labour opposition in Parliament, most of whose senior members had been ministers in the previous 1974-9 Labour administration.

On the political horizon there is little indication, at present, of potential future alternative governments, such as Labour or the SDP/Liberal Alliance, having radically different policies. All that is likely to change is a reversal of the cuts in state housebuilding and public works programmes when a government finally decides that a little reflation via public investment is desirable. Less likely, there might also be a reform of housing finance, including fiscal changes for owner occupiers such as the abolition of mortgage interest tax relief. Yet one of the key conclusions of this book is that reform of housing finance alone will not solve any of the fundamental problems of owner occupation in Britain. The description given of housing policy towards owner occupation as being essentially passive and aimed, at least nominally, at maintaining the status quo is likely to remain relevant for a number of years to come.

The continuity of trends in housing policy in the midst of differences in detail and party political rhetoric is not accidental. It is the product of a lack of interest by successive governments in altering the social relations of housing provision. Contradictions arising from those social relations as a result have continued to exert paramount influence on the housing policy of the state and have severely constrained the options open to any government. Often those contradictions will appear emplrically in the guise of difficulties over, say, housing finance or levels of output. Lack of adequate analysis has led to a misconception of the causes of housing problems, because attention is concentrated solely on those forms in which immediate difficulties appear. The pattern of housing policy, therefore, is not simply the product of the ineffectiveness of political reformism but also of inadequate theoretical analysis of the nature of housing provision, as later chapters will show.

Chapter 1 presents the most historically specific information as it outlines the growing housing crisis in Britain in the early 1980s. This is done to counteract the complacency which pervades so much mainstream discussion of housing issues. Housing problems frequently are treated as isolated residual difficulties faced by an unfortunate minority. Yet the housing crisis affects everyone because it is a consequence of the way in which all housing gets provided. Data on the rates of new housebuilding, delapidation and improvement are used in chapter 1 as barometers indicating the extent of the housing crisis in the 1980s. In many respects, however, they are only weak indicators of housing trends as they are prone to fluctuate with short-term variations in the economy, thereby obscuring the more fundamental nature of the crisis. Private housing output at the end of 1982 and in early 1983, for example, picked up sharply from the record 30-year low it had reached previously. The upturn, however, does not look as impressive in absolute terms as it does proportionately and was petering out again by April 1983. Output is still well below the levels of the late 1960s and early 1970s and of any realistic assessment of housing need. Also, justification for the rundown of council housing has been based partially on a supposed switch of new output from council housing to private building for owner occupation. To reverse the growing housing shortage and to justify policies towards owner occupation, private housing output has to be higher than the post-war peak levels it reached in the 1960s There seems little prospect of that happening.

Some people have argued that the slump conditions of the early 1980s have made a new owner-occupied housing boom possible, similar in nature to the one which helped to lift the economy in the 1930s out of the depths of the inter-war depression (see chapter 2). Such a position is contrary to the argument presented here. Some similarities to the interwar period do exist in the 1980s. There are regional and class differences in the severity of the slump. They help to create both a market amongst the more affluent for new housing and a cheap and docile workforce to build it from out of the ranks of the underemployed and unemployed. There is also a partial return to the passive planning system of the 1930s. In addition the house price average earnings ratio has dropped to a historically low level, whilst interest rates have begun to fall (although nowhere near to the level of the 2 per cent cheap money era of post-1931). The scenario of such a future owner-occupied housing boom, however, not only ignores the likely escalation of building costs if there is a substantial increase in activity, but also forgets to consider the tenure. in which the better-off households live. In the inter-war period owner

occupation as a housing tenure expanded rapidly from a low level. Many richer households became homeowners for the first time. Now most of them are already owner occupiers. To buy a new house they have to sell their existing one. The market for owner occupation as a whole can expand only by drawing in lower income households from the working class. Failure to do this brought the 1930s' boom to a halt. As the early 1980s' slump has hit those social groups the worst, it hardly seems likely to happen now.

The general point being made in this book is that the problems of housing provision and owner occupation in Britain are structural. They arise from the contradictory effects of the relations between social agents involved in owner-occupied housing provision. So even though there might be a whole series of changes in the contemporary state of the market or possibly even in the characteristics of some of the agencies involved (for example, I increasingly suspect that some building societies and clearing banks would merge if legislation made it possible), the basic structure of owner-occupied housing provision will remain the same. If no attempt is made to deal with the structural problems of owner occupation, along the lines suggested in the final chapter, any future for housing provision in Britain will involve enormous economic and social costs.

One final point to make is that an attempt was made to provide data on the most important aspects of the housing market until the end of 1982. Publication dates of the data did not always make this possible, although information was added until the proof stage of the text. Obviously some of this latest data is not commented on in the text.

Much of the material on present-day speculative housebuilding in this book was collected during 1979 and 1980 as part of a wider project on the economics of housebuilding undertaken at Birkbeck College. I should like to acknowledge with thanks the financial support for that project of the Social Science Research Council under grant HR5181. Andrew Cullen worked with me on the project during those years. My ideas were greatly improved by discussions with him, and without his efforts this book could not have been written. Originally we had hoped to write it together but the temporary employment conditions faced by university research staff made this a practical impossibility for him. I should like to acknowledge with thanks the importance of his contributions to the production of this book. Other friends and colleagues also commented on drafts, offered much needed advice and support, and helped with its final production. In particular, I should like to thank Ben Fine, Diana Gilhespy, Michael Harloe, Maartje Martens, Doreen Massey, Ron Smith and Marjorie Turton.

\* \* \*

The author and publisher would like to thank the following for permission to reproduce copyright material: The Building Societies Association for data from the BSA Bulletin in Tables 10.1, 10.2, 10.3, 10.4, 10.5, 11.2, 11.4 and Figures 2.1, 4.7, 11.1, 11.3, 11.5; the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office for data in Tables 1.1, 1.3, 3.1, 3.2, 4.1, 4.2, 5.1, 6.1, 8.1, 8.2, 9.1, 9.2, 11.3 and Figures 1.1, 2.1, 2.2, 3.2, 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 4.5, 4.6, 4.8, 4.9, 6.1, 8.1, 9.2, 10.1; The Housebuilder and W. F. Cunter, COFI, London, for Figure 6.3; Ellen Leopold, Bartlett School of Architecture and Planning, University College London, for Table 5.2; the National Federation of Building Trades Employers for data in Figure 6.2; the National House-Building Council for data in Tables 3.3, 3.5 and Figure 3.3; the Nationwide Building Society for data in Tables 4.3, 11.1 and Figure 4.1; the Royal Town Planning Institute for data from The Planner in Table 8.1; Town and Country Planning for data in Table 8.1; the United Nations for data from the United Nations Statistical Yearbook in Table 1.2.

## Contents

List of abbreviations	vii
List of tables	ix
List of figures	xii
Preface	xv
Housing problems and owner	
occupation	1
The origins of mass home ownership	23
The modern speculative housebuilding	
industry	43
•	97
Housing development and land	
102 (102)	126
	156
-	
	193
	243
	272
-	
	295
The unstable housing market	314
	List of tables List of figures Preface  Housing problems and owner occupation The origins of mass home ownership The modern speculative housebuilding industry Building for the new housing market Housing development and land dealing The housing production process and the crisis of production Land-use planning and speculative housebuilding The demise of planning control Owner occupiers: a social category and its consequences Building societies and the changing mortgage market

#### vi Contents

12	The political economy of owner occupation	336	
13	Towards new forms of housing provision	370	
	Appendix: The survey of housebuilding firms and planning authorities: research		÷
	method	392	
	Notes	395	
	References	408	
	Index	418	

# List of abbreviations

**Building Societies Association** 

**BSA** 

CIPFA	Chartered Institute of Public Finance and
	Accountancy
CLNNTC	Coventry, Liverpool, Newcastle and North
	Tyneside Trades Council
CNC	Cost of New Construction (Index)
CPRE	Council for the Protection of Rural England
CSO	Central Statistical Office
DLT	Development Land Tax
DoE	Department of the Environment
EIU	Economist Intelligence Unit
GMC	Greater Manchester Council
HBF	Housebuilders Federation
HCS	Housing and Construction Statistics
HCEC	House of Commons Environment Committee
HPR	Housing Policy Review, 1977
HPCD	Housing Policy - a consultative document
HPTV	e e
I-III	Technical volumes I to III of HPCD
JURUE	Joint Unit for Research on the Urban
	Environment
LBC	London Brick Company
LOSC	Labour only subcontracting

MHLG	Ministry of Housing and Local Government
MLR	Minimum Lending Rate
NHBC	National Housebuilders Council
NFBTE	National Federation of Building Trades
	Employers
NSB	Non-speculative builder
OPI	Output Price Index
<b>PEHW</b>	Political Economy of Housing Workshop
	(Conference of Socialist Economists)
RPI	Retail Prices Index
SHAC	Scottish Housing Advisory Committee
TRG	Training Research Group
WNHC	Workmen's National Housing Council

# List of tables

1.1	Housing stock and tenure, 1914-81	2
1.2	Cross-country comparison of number of	
	houses completed per 1000 population,	
	1955-78	4
1.3	Gross fixed investment in dwellings:	
	United Kingdom: annual averages over	
	selected years, 1899-1981	5
2.1	Building societies, housing costs and	
	the weekly cost of buying, 1930s	33
3.1	Private housing by size of firm, 1978	46
3.2	Private housing: use of trades, 1978	47
3.3	Number of registered housebuilders	
	and average output by size category,	
	1978	54
3.4.	Housing output and ownership of the	
	leading housebuilders, ranked by their	
	1979 output	59
3.5	Speculative housebuilders: firm losses	
	1972-4, firm gains 1974-8, by size of	
	firm	87
3.6	Aggregate financial data for speculative	
	housebuilders 1971-8	92
37	The variability of speculative	

	housebuilders' financial performance,	
÷	1971–8	94
4.1	Additions to the owner-occupied	
	housing stock, 1914-75	102
4.2	Land and housing prices,	
	1970-82	115
4.3	Floor areas of owner-occupied	
	dwellings, 1962, 1970 and 1978	119
5.1	Owner-occupied housing major market	
	sectors	129
5.2	Comparison of space standards and	
	quality in the late 1970s for three-	
	bedroom houses in the public and	
	private sectors	142
6.1	Price increases for selected building	
	materials, 1970-80	184
8.1	Population changes in England and	
	Wales, 1971-81	248
8.2	The rise and fall of production of the	,
	new built environment, 1955-82	251
9.1	Household tenure (%)	273
9.2	Social characteristics of owner	
	occupiers and council tenants,	
	December 1977	274
10.1	Building societies: societies, branches	
	and assets	297
10.2	Competition in the mortgage market,	
	1973-81	301
10.3	Competition in the market for personal	
ð.	liquid assets, 1970–81	304
10.4	Average interest rates (%), 1945-79	305
10.5	Sources of building society mortgage	
	funds, 1977-81	310
11.1	Existing owner occupiers' reasons for	5
	moving, 1981	324
11.2	Money realized by selling a house,	
	1970–81	326
11.3	Average male earnings and first-time	
	purchasers' initial mortgage outgoings,	200
	1972-9	328

11.4 Average house prices, mortgage advances and incomes: first-time buyers and former owner occupiers, 1970-80

331

# List of figures

1.1	Housing completions, Great Britain, 1968-82	6
1.2	The structure of owner-occupied	0
	housing provision	20
2.1	Housebuilding, 1920–82: number of	20
	dwellings completed	04
2.2		24
2.2	Changes in residential land prices, 1890-1981	
2 1		31
3.1	Output expansion and debt financing	65
3.2	Land prices and bank advances to	
	construction firms, 1970-82 (current	
	prices)	70
3.3	Speculative housebuilders: market share	
	by size of firm, Great Britain, 1969-78	85
3.4	Speculative housebuilders: net trading	-
	profits as percentage of sales, 1971-8	91
3.5	Speculative housebuilders: frequency	31
	distributions of profit margins, 1971-8	05
4.1		95
1.1	House prices, average earnings, retail	
	prices and the growth of owner	
ne	occupation, 1970-81	98
1.2	House price changes per cent per	
	annum, 1957-82	00

4.3	Private housing starts and completions,	
	Great Britain, 1964-82, quarterly,	
	seasonally adjusted	104
4.4	Quarterly changes in new house prices	
	and net starts 1970-82	107
4.5	Quarterly changes in new house prices	
	and construction costs, 1970-82	108
4.6	Quarterly changes in net starts and	,
	gross development profitability,	
	1970-82	109
4.7	Price changes of new and existing	
	houses, per cent per annum, 1970-81	111
4.8	Changes in gross development	
	profitability (quarterly) and land prices	
	(biannual), 1970-82	114
4.9	The distribution of new dwelling	192
	prices, 1970-9	118
4.10	Alternative estimates of changes in gross	
	development profitability, 1970-82	123
6.1	Construction employees' earnings and	
	hours, 1948-79	175
6.2	Building workforce availability by	
	trade: quarterly employers' enquiry,	
	December 1977-September 1980	179
6.3	The sequence of erection of platform	
	timber-frame housing	187
8.1	Construction output by type of work	
	(at constant 1975 prices), 1955-82	250
9.1	Household characteristics by tenure	275
9.2	Income distribution by tenure, 1978	276
10.1	Building societies: liquidity ratio,	
	increases in investors' balances, gross	
	advances and net advances, 1970-82,	
	seasonally adjusted (1975 prices)	302
11.1	House prices and average earnings,	
	1956-82	315
11.2	Transactions in the owner-occupied	
	housing market	318
11.3	Building society advances on existing	
	and new dwellings, 1970-81	323

### xiv List of figures

11.4	Average percentage advance by	
	building societies to former owner	
	occupiers, 1970-81	327
11.5	Building society advances to existing	(2)
	and new owner occupiers, 1970-81	334
12.1	The structure of council housing	
	provision	347