

STATE AID AND  
THE EUROPEAN  
ECONOMIC  
CONSTITUTION

---

Francesco de Cecco



• HART •  
PUBLISHING

HART STUDIES IN COMPETITION LAW

# State Aid and the European Economic Constitution

Francesco de Cecco



• H A R T •  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2013

Published in the United Kingdom by Hart Publishing Ltd  
16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW  
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530  
Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710  
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk  
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

Published in North America (US and Canada) by  
Hart Publishing  
c/o International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213-3786  
USA  
Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190  
Fax: +1 503 280 8832  
E-mail: [orders@isbs.com](mailto:orders@isbs.com)  
Website: <http://www.isbs.com>

© Francesco de Cecco 2013

Francesco de Cecco has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing Ltd at the address above.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data  
Data Available

ISBN: 978-1-84946-105-4

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon  
Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall



## **STATE AID AND THE EUROPEAN ECONOMIC CONSTITUTION**

Recent years have seen the rise of EU State aid law as a crucial component of the European economic constitution. To date, however, the literature has neglected the contribution of this area of EU law to the internal market. This book seeks to fill this gap in our understanding of the economic constitution by exploring the significance of State aid law in addressing questions that go to the core of the internal market project. It does so by examining the case law relating to three different activities that Member States engage in: market participation, market regulation, and funding for Services of General Economic Interest. Each of these areas offers insights into fundamental questions surrounding the economic constitution, such as the separation between the State and the market, the scope for Member States to engage in regulatory competition, and the tension between market and nonmarket concerns.

**Volume 2 in the series Hart Studies in Competition Law**

**For Vicky, Julia and Emily**

## *Acknowledgements*

In chronological order, my thanks go to Professor Derrick Wyatt who was my MPhil supervisor at the University of Oxford and offered excellent advice to me in that capacity. This book is—in large part—based on work carried out during my doctoral research funded by the Helena Normanton Research scholarship at the University of Sussex. My supervisor there, Malcolm Ross, provided constant encouragement, moral support and constructive criticism—I have learnt a great deal from him, well beyond the doctorate.

Yuri Borgmann-Prebil and Niamh Nic Shuibhne examined my thesis, and made constructive comments and suggestions, both during and after the viva. I am especially grateful to Niamh Nic Shuibhne who read parts of this book and offered detailed and extremely useful comments. I am greatly indebted to Eleanor Spaventa, not only for reading and commenting on parts of this book at a crucial stage, but also for having been an exceptionally supportive friend throughout these years. I am also grateful to Patrick O’Callaghan for his insightful comments on Chapter two, and to Richard Hart, Rachel Turner, Mel Hamill and their colleagues at Hart Publishing for their patience and valuable assistance.

This book would never have seen the light of the day without the support of my close family: my parents, my brother, my wife, and my two daughters. However, Vicky, little Julia and Emily, have made the greatest sacrifices for this book, and it is right that I should dedicate it to them as a small, but deeply felt, token of gratitude.

## *Table of Cases*

Adria-Wien Pipeline and Wietersdorfer & Peggauer Zementwerke	
(Case C-143/99) [2001] ECR I-8365 .....	89, 98–101, 105
AEM v AEEG (Joined Cases C-128/03 and 129/03) [2005] ECR I-2861 .....	106, 109
Aéroports de Paris v Commission (Case T-128/98) [2000] ECR II-3929 .....	93, 94
Aéroports de Paris v Commission (Case C-82/01P) [2002] ECR I-9297 .....	94
Agrana Zucker v Commission (Case T-187/99) [2001] ECR II-1587.....	49
Air France v Commission (Case T-358/94) [1997] ECR II-2109.....	63, 69, 85
Air Inter (Case T-260/94) [1997] ECR II-997.....	138
AIUFFASS v Commission (Case T-380/94) [1996] ECR II-2265 .....	53
Åklagaren v Percy Mickelsson and Joakim Roos	
(Case C-142/05) [2009] ECR I-4273 .....	21
Alitalia v Commission (Case T-296/97) [2002] ECR II-3871 .....	63–64, 85
Altmark Trans GmbH, Regierungspräsidium Magdeburg v	
Nahverkergesellschaft Altmark GmbH (Case C-280/00)	
[2003] ECR I-7747 .....	5, 142–54, 157–61, 163–64, 167–68
Ambulanz Glöckner (Case C-475/99) [2001] ECR I-8089.....	159
AOK-Bundesverband and others (Joined Cases C-264/01, C-306/01, C-354/01 and C-355/01) [2004] ECR I-2493 .....	155
Azores <i>see</i> Portugal v Commission (Case C-88/03)	
Bachmann v Belgium (Case C-204/90) [1992] ECR I-249.....	107
Banco ExterIOR de España v Ayuntamiento de Valencia	
(Case C-387/92) [1994] ECR I-877 .....	140–41
Banks (Case C-390/98) [2001] ECR I-6117 .....	105
Belgium v Commission (Boch) (Case 40/85) [1986]	
ECR 2321 .....	63, 86
Belgium v Commission (Case C-56/93) [1996] ECR I-723 .....	85
Belgium v Commission (Case C-75/97) [1999] ECR I-3671 .....	98
BFM and EFIM v Commission (Joined Cases T-126/96 and T-127/96)	
[1998] ECR II-3437 .....	64
Boch <i>see</i> Belgium v Commission (Case 40/85)	
Bouygues v Commission (Case T-475/04) [2007] ECR II-2097 .....	106–7
Bouygues SA and Bouygues Télécom SA v Commission	
(Case C-431/07P) [2009] ECR I- 2665 .....	107
British Aggregates Association v Commission	
(Case T-210/02) [2006] ECR II-2789 .....	101–3
British Aggregates Association v Commission	
(Case C-487/06P) [2008] ECR I-10515 .....	102–3
BRT v SABAM (Case 127/73) [1974] ECR 313 .....	153
BUPA v Commission (Case T-289/03) [2008] ECR II-81 .....	137–38, 145–48, 152–53, 156–61, 164
Buy Irish <i>see</i> Commission v Ireland (Case 249/81)	

Capolongo v Azienda Agricola Maya (Case 77/72) [1973] ECR 611 .....	44
Cassa di Risparmio di Firenze (Case C-222/04) [2006] ECR I-289 .....	93
CELF and Ministre de la Culture et de la Communication (Case C-199/06) [2008] ECR I-469 .....	46
CETM <i>see</i> Spain v Commission (Case T-55/99)	
CFI v AGCM (Case C-198/01) [2003] ECR I-8055.....	76
Chronopost and others v UFEX and others (Joined Cases C-83/01P, C-93/01P and C-94/01P) [2003] ECR I-6993.....	82–85, 144–45, 158
CIA Security International v Signalson SA and Securitel SPRL (Case C-194/94) [1996] ECR I-2201 .....	47
Commission and Spain v Government of Gibraltar and UK (Joined Cases C-106/09P and C-107/09P), 11 November 2011, not yet reported.....	104, 121
Commission v France (Joined Cases 6/69 and 11/69)[1969] ECR 523.....	34
Commission v Freistaat Sachsen (Case C-334/07P) [2008] ECR I-9465.....	46
Commission v Germany (Case C-112/05) [2007] ECR I-8995.....	29
Commission v Germany (Case C-271/08) [2010] ECR I-7091.....	25
Commission v Ireland (Buy Irish) (Case 249/81) [1982] ECR 4005.....	38
Commission v Italy (Case 118/85) [1987] ECR-2599 .....	74, 92
Commission v Italy (Case C-35/96) [1998] ECR I-3851 .....	76
Commission v Italy (Trailers) (Case C-110/05) [2009] ECR I-519.....	21
Commission v Italy and Wam SpA (Case C-494/06P) [2009] ECR I-3639 .....	35
Commission v Luxembourg (Case C-473/93) [1996] ECR I-3207 .....	126
Commission v Portugal (Tinted Film) (Case C-265/06) [2008] ECR I-2245 .....	21
Commission v Tetra Laval (Case C-12/03P) [2005] ECR I-987 .....	85
Costa v ENEL (Case 6/64) [1964] ECR 585.....	44
Danske Busvognmænd v Commission (Case T-157/01) [2004] ECR II-917 .....	152–53, 164
Delimitis v Henninger Bräu AG (Case C-234/89) [1991] ECR I-935 .....	33–34
Deufil v Commission (Case 310/85) [1987] ECR 901 .....	45
Deutsche Bahn v Commission (Case T-351/02) [2006] ECR II-1047 .....	59
DMT Transport (Case C-256/97) [1999] ECR I-3913 .....	64, 85, 94–95
EARL Salvat père & fils, Comité interprofessionnel des vins doux naturels et vins de liqueur à appellations contrôlées (CIVDN) and Comité national des interprofessions des vins à appellation d'origine (CNIV) v Commission (Case T-136/05) [2007] ECR II-4063 .....	61
Electricité de France (Case T-156/04) [2009] ECR II-4503.....	90–91, 169
Emission Trading <i>see</i> Netherlands v Commission (Case T-233/04) and (Case C-279/08)	
Enirisorse SpA v Ministero delle Finanze (Joined Cases C-34/01 to C-38/01) [2003] I-14243 .....	137
Enirisorse v Amministrazione delle Finanze (Joined Cases C-34/01 to C-38/01) [2003] ECR I-14243 .....	143
Enirisorse v Sotacarbo (Case C-237/04) [2006] ECR I-2843 .....	111–12
Essent v Netherlands (Case C-206/06) [2008] ECR I-5497 .....	113
Estée Lauder Cosmetics GmbH & Co. OHG v Lancaster Group GmbH (Case C-220/98) [2000] ECR I-117 .....	54
European Commission v Electricité de France and others, 5 June 2012, (Case C-124/10P), 5 June 2012, not yet reported .....	91–92, 94, 169

Fachverband der Buch- und Medienwirtschaft v LIBRO	
Handelsgesellschaft mbH (Case C-531/07) [2009] ECR I-3717 .....	21
Fédération française des sociétés d'assurances (FFSA)	
(Case C-244/94) [1995] ECR I-4013 .....	155
Fédération française des sociétés d'assurances (FFSA) v	
Commission (Case T-106/95) [1997] ECR II-229.....	141, 147
Fédération française des sociétés d'assurances (FFSA) v	
Commission (Case T-289/03) [1997] ECR II-229.....	137, 152
FENIN (Case C-205/03P) [2006] ECR I-6295 .....	93, 155
Ferring v ACOSS (Case C-53/00) [2001] ECR I-9067 .....	141–46
FFSA <i>see</i> Fédération française des sociétés d'assurances	
France v Commission (Kimberly Clark) (Case C-241/94)	
[1996] ECR I-4551 .....	89, 96, 98
France v Commission (Stardust Marine) (Case C-482/99) [2002]	
ECR I-4397 .....	60, 62, 64
France v Commission (Terminal Equipment) (Case C-202/88)	
[1991] ECR I-1277 .....	75
France v Ladbroke Racing and Commission (Case C-83/98)	
[2000] ECR I-3271 .....	109
France v Ministère de l'Economie, des Finances et de l'Industrie	
(Case C-442/02) [2004] ECR I-8961 .....	18
France, France Télécom SA, Bouygues SA and Bouygues Télécom SA and	
Association française des opérateurs de réseaux et services de telecommunications	
(AFORS Télécom) v European Commission (Joined Cases T-425/04, T-444/04,	
T-450/04 and T-456/04) [2010] ECR II-2099 .....	78–79
France, Italy and United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern	
Ireland v Commission (Joined Cases 188/80 to 190/80) [1982] ECR-2545 .....	69
Fred Olsen (Case T-17/02) [2005] ECR II-2031 .....	137, 147
Freskot (Case C-355/00) [2003] ECR I-5263 .....	93
Gaston Schul Douane Expediteur BV v Inspecteur der Invoerrechten	
en Accijnen, Roosendaal (Case 15/81) [1982] ECR 1409.....	38
GB-INNO-BM v ATAB (Case 13/77) [1977] ECR 2115 .....	76
GB-INNO-BM v Confédération du commerce luxembourgeois	
(Casse 362/88) [1990] ECR I-667.....	75–76
Germany v Commission (Case 248/84) [1987] ECR 4013 .....	53, 98
Germany v Commission (Case C-156/98) [2000] ECR I-6857 .....	115
Germany v Commission (Case C-334/99) [2003] ECR I-1139 .....	75
Germany v Parliament and Council (Case C-376/98) [2000] ECR I-8419 .....	36, 160
Gibraltar v Commission (Joined Cases T-211/04 and T-215/04)	
[2008] II-03745 .....	104, 121, 123
GIL Insurance (Case C-308/01) [2004] ECR I-4777.....	106, 110
GlaxoSmithKline Services Unlimited v Commission	
(Joined Cases C-501/06P, C-513/06P, C-515/06P and	
C-519/06P) [2009] ECR I-09291 .....	51
Heiser (Case C-172/03) [2005] ECR I-1627 .....	93
Hotel Cipriani Spa (Joined Cases T-254/00, T-270/00 and	
T-277/00) [2008] ECR II-3269 .....	34
Hünermund and others (Case C-292/92) [1993] ECR I-6787 .....	18

International Transport Workers' Federation and Finnish Seamen's Union (Case C-438/05) [2007] ECR I-10779.....	22
Italian Textiles <i>see</i> Italy v Commission (Case 173/73)	
Italy v Commission (Italian Textiles) (Case 173/73) [1974] ECR 709.....	89, 98, 99, 105, 109, 163
Italy v Commission (Case C-303/88) [1991] ECR I-1433.....	60, 69
Italy v Commission (Case C-261/89) [1991] ECR I-4437.....	69
Italy v Commission (Case C-305/89) [1991] ECR I-1603.....	64
Italy v Commission (Case C-6/97) [1999] ECR I-2981.....	34
Italy v Commission (Case C-372/97) [2004] ECR I-3679.....	34, 45
Italy v Commission (Case C-298/00P) [2004] ECR I-40107.....	34
Italy and SIM 2 Multimedia SpA v Commission (Joined Cases C-328/99 and C-399/00) [2003] ECR I-4035.....	63, 85
Italy and Wam SpA v Commission (Joined Cases T-304/04 and T-316/04) [2006] ECR II-64 .....	34
Kadi and El Bakarat v Council and Commission (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P) [2008] ECR I-6351.....	37
Kattner Stahlbau (Case C-350/07) [2009] ECR I-1513 .....	93
Keck and Mithouard (Joined Cases C-267/91 and C-268/91) [1993] ECR I-6097 .....	21
Kimberly Clark <i>see</i> France v Commission (Case C-241/94)	
Kirsammer-Hack (Petra) v Nurhan Sidal (Case C-189/91) [1993] ECR I-6185 .....	110, 112
Krankenheim Ruhesitz am Wannsee-Seniorenheimstatt (Case C-157/07) [2008] ECR I-8061 .....	108
Kuipers (Case C-283/03) [2005] ECR I-4255.....	162
Kwekerij Gebroeders van der Kooy BV and others v Commission of the European Communities (Joined Cases 67/85, 68/85 and 70/85) [1988] ECR 219.....	60
Laboratoires Boiron (Case C-526/04) [2006] ECR I-7529 .....	144
Ladbroke Racing Ltd v Commission (Case C-241/94) [1998] ECR II-1 .....	96
Laval un Partneri Ltd v Svenska Byggnadsarbetareförbundet and others (Case C-341/05) [2007] ECR I-11767 .....	3, 5, 22, 24, 27-28, 46
Leitner v TUI Deutschland GmbH (Case C-168/00) [2002] ECR I-2631 .....	36-37
Lenzing (Case T-36/99) [2004] ECR II-3597 .....	85
Linde v Commission (Case T-98/00) [2002] ECR II-396.....	64
Lorenz v Germany Case 120/73) [1973] ECR 1471.....	47
Mangold (Case C-144/04) [2005] ECR I-9981 .....	46
Manninen (Case C-19/02) [2004] ECR I-7477 .....	107-8
Matra v Commission (Case C-225/91) [1993] ECR I-3203 .....	32
Meca-Medina (David) and Majcen (Igor) v Commission (Case C-519/04P) [2006] ECR I-6991 .....	93
Meilike (Case C-262/09), 30 June 2011 .....	46
Meng (Criminal Proceedings against) (Case C-2/91) [1993] ECR I-5751 .....	76
Michaniki AE v Ethniko Simvoulion Radiotileorasis (Case C-213/07) [2008] ECR I-9999 .....	24, 126

Ministère de l'Économie, des Finances et de l'Industrie v GEMO SA (Case C-126/01) [2003] ECR I-13769 .....	98, 143, 152–53
Netherlands v Commission (Case C-159/01) [2004] ECR I-4461 .....	105
Netherlands v Commission (Emission Trading) (Case T-233/04) [2008] ECR II-591 .....	103–4, 106, 109, 115
Netherlands v Commission (Emission Trading) (Case C-279/08), 8 September 2011, not yet reported .....	104, 106, 115
Norddeutsches Vieh- und Fleischkontor Will and others v BALM (Joined Cases 213/81 to 215/81) [1982] ECR 3583.....	110
Omega (Case C-36/02) [2004] ECR I-9609 .....	27, 127
Oude Luttkhuis and others v Commission (Case C-399/93) [1995] ECR I-4515 .....	33
P&O European Ferries (Vizcaya) SA and Diputación Foral de Vizcaya v Commission (Joined Cases T-116/01 and T-118/01) [2003] ECR II-2957 .....	66
P&O European Ferries (Vizcaya) SA and Diputación Foral de Vizcaya v Commission (Case C-442/03P) [2006] ECR I-4845.....	66
Paint Graphos (Case C-80/08), 8 September 2011, not yet reported .....	34, 89
Pearle and others (Case C-345/02) [2004] ECR I-7139 .....	61–62
Philip Morris v Commission (Case 730/79) [1980] ECR 2671 .....	33, 52–53
Piaggio (Case C-295/97) [1999] ECR I-3735 .....	98
Portugal v Commission (Azores) (Case C-88/03) [2006] ECR I-7115 .....	5, 105, 120–28, 133–34, 167, 170
Poucet and Pistre (Joined Cases C-159/91 and C-160/91) [1993] ECR I-637 .....	155
Presidente del Consiglio dei Ministri v Regione Sardegna (Case C-169/08) [2009] ECR I-10821 .....	108
PreussenElektra (Case C-379/98) [2001] ECR I-2099 .....	111, 113–15
Procureur de la République v Association de défense des brûleurs d'huiles usages (Case 240/83) [1985] ECR 531 .....	141–42
R (on the application of Watts) v Bedford Primary Care Trust (Case C-372/04) [2006] ECR I-4325 .....	160
Reiff (Case C-185/91) [1993] ECR I-5801.....	76
RJB Mining v Commission (T-156/98) [2001] ECR II-337 .....	32
Ryanair (Case T-196/04) [2009] ECR II-3643 .....	89–90, 92, 94, 169
Santos Palhota and others (Case C-515/08), 7 October 2010 .....	25–26
Sayn-Wittgenstein (Case C-208/09) .....	24, 127
Schmidberger v Austria (Case C-112/00) [2003] ECR I-5659 .....	22
SFEI v La Poste (Case C-39/94) [1996] ECR I-3547 .....	45, 63
SIC-Sociedade Indipendente de Comunicação v Commission (Case T-46/97) [2000] ECR II-2125 .....	141
Sloman Neptun (Joined Cases C-72/91 and C-73/91) [1993] ECR I-887 .....	110, 112–15
Société Internationale de Diffusion et d'édition (SIDE) v Commission of the European Communities (Case T-49/93) [1995] ECR II-2501 .....	32
Spain v Commission (Joined Cases C-278/92 to C-280/92) [1994] ECR I-4103 .....	74–75
Spain v Commission (Tubacex) (Case C-342/96) [1999] ECR I-2459 .....	63–64

Spain v Commission (Case C-351/98) [2002] ECR I-8031 .....	34, 105
Spain v Commission (Case C-480/98) [2000] ECR I-8717 .....	64
Spain v Commission (CETM) (Case T-55/99) [2000] ECR II-3207 .....	89, 98, 109
Spain v Commission (Case C-501/00) [2004] ECR I-6717 .....	89
Spain v Commission (Case C-276/02) [2004] ECR I-8091 .....	64–65, 95
Spain v Lenzing (Case C-525/04P) [2007] ECR I-9947 .....	85
Staatssecretaris van Fianaciën v B.G.M. Verkooijen (Case C-35/98) [2000] ECR I-4071 .....	107
Stardust Marine <i>see</i> France v Commission (Case C-482/99)	
Steenkolenmijnen v High Authority (Case 30/59) [1961] ECR 1 .....	89
Steinike und Weinlig v Federal Republic of Germany (Case 78/76) [1977] ECR 595.....	44
Terminal Equipment <i>see</i> France v Commission (Case C-202/88)	
Terrapin v Terranova (Case 119/75) [1976] ECR 1039.....	70
Tiercé Ladbroke v Commission (Case C-353/95P) [1997] ECR I-7007 .....	105
Tinted Film <i>see</i> Commission v Portugal (Case C-265/06)	
T-Mobile Netherlands BV, KPN Mobile NV, Orange Nederland NV and Vodafone Libertel NV v Raad van bestuur van de Nederlandse Mededingingsautoriteit (Case C-8/08) [2009] ECR I-4529 .....	51
Tobacco Advertising <i>see</i> Germany v Parliament and Council (Case C-376/98)	
Trailers <i>see</i> Commission v Italy (Case C-110/05)	
Transalpine Ölleitung in Österreich (Case C-368/04) [2006] ECR I-9957 .....	46
Tubacex <i>see</i> Spain v Commission (Case C-342/96)	
UFEX and others v Commission (Case T-613/97) [2000] ECR II-1531 .....	82–84
UGT-Rioja <i>see</i> Unión General de Trabajadores de La Rioja (UGT-Rioja) v Juntas Generales del Territorio Histórico de Vizcaya (Joined Cases C-428/06 to C-434/06)	
Umweltanwalt von Kärnten v Kärntner Landesregierung (Case C-205/08) [2009] ECR I-11525 .....	126
Unilever Italia (Case C-443/98) [2000] ECR I-7535 .....	47
Unión General de Trabajadores de La Rioja (UGT-Rioja) v Juntas Generales del Territorio Histórico de Vizcaya (Joined Cases C-428/06 to C-434/06) [2008] ECR I-6747 .....	24, 121–23, 125–26
Valmont Nederland BV v Commission (Case T-274/01) [2004] ECR II-3145 .....	65
van Calster and others (Joined Cases C-261/01 and C-262/01) [2003] ECR I-12249.....	45
Van Eycck (Pascal) v ASPA NV (Case 267/86) [1988] ECR 4769.....	76
Van der Kooy (Joined Cases C-67/85, C-68/85 and C-70/85) [1988] ECR 219.....	110
Van Tiggele (Case 82/77) [1978] ECR 25.....	110
Vereniging van Vlaamse Reisbureaus v ASBL (Case 311/85) [1987] ECR 3801.....	76
Viking Line (Case C-438/05) [2007] ECR I-10779 .....	3, 5, 22, 24, 27–28, 46
Viscido and others v Ente Poste Italiane (Joined Cases C-52/97 to C-54/97) [1998] ECR I-2629 .....	97, 110
Vlaamse Gewest v Commission (T-214/95) [1998] ECR II-717.....	49

Vodafone Ltd and others v Secretary of State for Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform (Case C-58/08) [2010] ECR I-4999.....	37
Volk v Vervaecke (Case 5/69) [1969] ECR 295 .....	33
Westdeutsche Landesbank Girozentrale v Commission (Joined Cases T-228/99 and T-233/99) [2003] ECR II-435.....	64, 69–73, 81, 86–87

# *Table of Legislation*

## **Treaties**

Amsterdam Treaty	
Art 16 .....	14
Declaration 37 .....	72
Charter of Fundamental Rights .....	28, 156
Art 31 .....	26
Art 36 .....	139
EC Treaty	
Art 10 .....	76
Art 14 .....	14
Art 60 .....	37
Art 92(1) .....	101
Art 95 .....	37
Art 152 .....	153
Art 301 .....	37
Art 308 .....	37
Lisbon Treaty .....	8, 15, 20, 25–26, 28, 122, 156, 164
Rome (EEC) Treaty .....	13, 18, 136
Art 2 .....	14
Art 130a–e .....	14
Art 130f–q .....	14
Art 130r–t .....	14
Single European Act	
Art 13 .....	14
Treaty on European Union	
Art 3 .....	156
(3) .....	7, 24–27
Art 4(2) .....	7, 24, 26–27, 30, 122, 126–28, 169
Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union	
Title VII Chap 1 .....	32, 96
Chap 3 .....	96
Preamble .....	15
Art 4(2) .....	23
Art 6 .....	102
Art 9 .....	25
Art 14 .....	15, 139–40, 147, 156–57, 161
Art 21 .....	24
Art 34 .....	19, 113
Art 37 .....	67
Art 49 .....	22

xx TABLE OF LEGISLATION

Art 53 .....	22
Art 56 .....	93
Art 63 .....	29
Art 93 .....	136
Art 101 .....	32–33, 47–48, 51, 53–54, 93
(1) .....	48, 51
(2) .....	48
(3) .....	48, 50–54
Art 102 .....	33, 93
Art 103(2)(b) .....	48
Art 106 .....	67, 75, 157
(1) .....	75
(2) .....	76, 136–38, 140–42, 144–47, 149–50, ..... 153, 156, 158–61
(3) .....	75–76
Art 107 .....	44–45, 49, 96, 112–13, 122, 141, 157
(1) .....	1, 7, 32–33, 35–37, 41, 44–45, 55, ..... 59, 62, 78, 82, 88, 93, 96–97, 99, 103, 110–13, 121, ..... 132–34, 141, 146, 151, 154, 161–64, 166, 168–69
(2) .....	47, 168
(e) .....	49
(3) .....	47, 52, 82, 140, 154, 168
(a) .....	52
(b) .....	53
(c) .....	53
(d) .....	52–53
Arts 107–9 .....	89, 131
Art 108 .....	36, 48, 141
(3) .....	45–47
Art 109 .....	48
Art 114 .....	5, 36–38
(2) .....	130
Arts 114–17 .....	99
Arts 114–18 .....	96
Art 115 .....	130
Art 116 .....	96
Art 117 .....	96
Art 167 .....	53
Art 168(1) .....	147
(5) .....	147
Art 263 .....	45
Art 296 .....	35
Art 345 .....	62, 67, 69–72, 84
Protocol 26 on Services of General Interest .....	15
Art 2 .....	140
Protocol 27 on the Internal Market and Competition .....	15

**EU Regulations**

Reg 17/62 .....	47
Reg 1191/69 [1969] OJ L156 .....	136
Reg 1107/70 [1970] OJ L130 .....	136
Reg 994/98 [1998] OJ L142/1 .....	49
Reg 69/2001 [2001] OJ L10/30 .....	34
Reg 881/2002 [2002] OJ L139/2 .....	37
Reg 1/2003 [2003] OJ L1/1 .....	47, 51
Reg 1998/2006 [2006] OJ L379/5 .....	34
Reg 1370/2007 [2007] OJ L315 .....	136
Reg 800/2008 [2008] OJ L214/3 .....	49
Reg 182/2011 [2011] OJ L55/13 Art 4 .....	49

**EU Directives**

Dir 75/439 [1975] OJ L194/23.....	141
Dir 80/723 [1980] OJ L195/35.....	68–69, 92
Dir 80/987 [1980] OJ L282/23.....	64
Dir 83/189 [1983] OJ L109.....	46–47
Dir 92/81 [1992] OJ L316/2.....	59–60
Dir 2005/81 [2005] OJ L312/47.....	149–50
Dir 2006/111 [2006] OJ L318/17.....	149
Dir 2006/123 [2006] OJ L376/36 Art 2(2)(a).....	139

**EU Decisions**

Dec 2004/393 [2004] OJ L137/1.....	89–90
Dec 2005/145 [2005] OJ L49/9.....	91
Dec 2005/261 [2005] OJ L85/1.....	104
Dec 2005/842 [2005] OJ L312/67.....	149
Dec 2006/621 [2006] OJ L257/11.....	78

# *Contents*

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	vii
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xi
<i>Table of Legislation</i> .....	xix

1. Introduction .....	1
-----------------------	---

## **PART I**

2. The Constitutional Framework .....	11
1. The Concept of a European Economic Constitution .....	11
A. Ordo-liberalism and the <i>European Economic Constitution</i> .....	13
B. The Continuing Relevance of the Concept of Economic Constitution .....	15
2. The Economic Orientation of the Internal Market Case Law.....	17
A. The Role of Economic Liberalism.....	18
B. The Balance between Internal Market and Social Rights.....	20
3. The Limits of Constitutional Adjudication.....	23
A. National Identity and the Social Market Economy in the Court.....	24
B. Varieties of Capitalism and Market Integration .....	27
4. Conclusion .....	30
3. The Distinctive Nature of State Aid Law .....	31
1. Family Resemblances.....	32
A. State Aid and Antitrust .....	32
B. State Aid and Free Movement .....	38
C. Competition Between States.....	40
2. Centralisation and its Rationale.....	43
A. Direct Effect, Centralised and Decentralised Enforcement .....	44
B. Administrative Rule-Making.....	48
3. Discretion.....	50
A. Economic and Non-Economic Considerations.....	50
B. Discretion and the European Interest .....	52
4. Conclusion .....	54

## **PART II**

4. The State as Market Participant.....	59
1. State Attribution .....	59
2. The Market Operator Principle and its Ramifications .....	63
A. Questioning the Market Operator Principle .....	66
B. From Neutrality to Substantive Equality .....	67
C. The Limits of the Market Paradigm.....	81
D. Legal Certainty .....	85
3. Conclusion .....	86