

Macroeconomics

Paul Wonnacott

Macroeconomics

PAUL WONNACOTT

University of Maryland



1974

RICHARD D. IRWIN, INC. Homewood, Illinois 60430
Irwin-Dorsey International London, England WC2H 9NJ
Irwin-Dorsey Limited Georgetown, Ontario L7G 4B3

© Paul Wonnacott, 1974

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

First Printing, March 1974

Second Printing, September 1974

Third Printing, January 1975

Fourth Printing, March 1975

Fifth Printing, August 1975

Sixth Printing, September 1975

ISBN 0-256-01552-X

Library of Congress Catalog Card No. 73-90597

Printed in the United States of America

THE IRWIN SERIES IN ECONOMICS

Consulting Editor LLOYD G. REYNOLDS Yale University

Preface

IN A RECENT review of a new intermediate textbook on Macroeconomics, William Silber observed that there were 16 intermediate Macro books in his bookcase; the work under review was number 17. The question may fairly be raised: Do we need an eighteenth?

The importance of the Macro field is in itself not an adequate answer—although I share the view that Macroeconomics remains at the very center of economic policy. Rather, the justification for yet another Macro text must lie in a substantial innovation. In the present work, I have aimed at a significantly different type of text.

Many of the present texts represent examples of competent scholarship; it is not my contention that I am presenting a “correct” version as contrasted to that of other texts. Rather, the problem with the other texts is one of focus. Their objective usually is to work the student through the basic macroeconomic model, culminating with a detailed description of the IS/LM analysis. There is nothing intrinsically wrong with this approach; indeed, much can be learned both about economic theory and economic policy in such an exercise.

Nevertheless, it does seem to me that something very important is missing. In the stress on the mechanics of the basic model, there is a loss of the sense of excitement over Macroeconomics as a study of big, controversial policy questions. One of the purposes of this book is to focus on the controversial questions at the center of Macroeconomics. What are the relative merits of fiscal and monetary policies as a means of controlling aggregate demand? Which is more effective? What are the practical problems and what are the delays in the operation of fiscal and monetary policies? What are the standards of performance which may reasonably be achieved? To what extent should policy-makers attempt to “fine tune” the economy? What are the strengths and weaknesses of Keynesian theory as an approach to Macroeconomics?

These are not settled questions. Indeed, there is a less clear consensus of the economics profession on these matters than there was a decade ago. Many of the controversial points are, however, very basic and simple. They belong in an intermediate Macro text. One of the major objectives of the present work is to give the flavor of Macroeconomics as an *exciting, controversial, and developing* field. Thus, while there is a development of the standard IS/LM model (Chaps. 3–5), there is also a discussion of some of the weaknesses and limitations of that model (Chap. 6). Likewise, when Keynes' theory of aggregate demand is developed, so is the competing classical-monetary theory, with the strengths and weaknesses of the two approaches being a major topic. Included is a comparison of the Keynesian structural models and the Monetarist single-equation models as a means of predicting aggregate demand (Chap. 10).

Because this text attempts to give the flavor of the major past and present controversies in Macroeconomics, it is less assuredly Keynesian in its assumptions than is the typical Macro text. Given the failure of the real world during the past decade to behave in all respects as Keynesian theory suggests it should have behaved, other competing assumptions and theories deserve their day in court. There is, for example, a detailed review of the controversy over the Phillips Curve and the inflation-unemployment tradeoff in Chapter 11. (The dynamic process of inflation—a topic of obvious current interest, but one which is short-changed in the standard textbook—is discussed in Chapter 12.) Throughout, an effort is made to emphasize a lesson which is essential to an adequate undergraduate training in economics: Students should be made aware of the importance of assumptions, and of the sensitivity of theoretical results to changes in assumptions. Thus, for example, embarrassing questions regarding the assumptions behind the multiplier theory are not avoided; rather, they are addressed explicitly (pp. 127–35). Similarly, an effort is made to leave the student with an open mind regarding the effect of wealth on consumption (pp. 136–38 and Chap. 13). In this, there is a contrast with the typical textbook dismissal of the real-balance effect. (Sometimes, textbooks dismiss the real-balance effect categorically and without explanation on the same page that they describe studies which suggest that wealth is an important determinant of consumption.)

The traditional division between Macroeconomics and Monetary Economics is in part artificial; any comprehensive treatment of macroeconomic questions must deal extensively with money and its effect on the economy. Thus, there is a detailed treatment of money in the present text (Part III). The appropriate design of the Macro course depends

in part on whether students have been exposed previously to a course in Money and Banking. Where they have such exposure, it is feasible to go rather quickly through Part III (especially Chap. 7), and to spend more time on such topics as the Consumption function (Chap. 13) and Investment (Chap. 14).

In the preparation of this text, I have shamelessly accumulated intellectual debts to my undergraduate and graduate students at the University of Maryland, and to an extensive list of colleagues, including Richard Caves, Gail Huh, Paul Meyer, John Neri, Mancur Olson, Lloyd Reynolds, and Ron Wonnacott. I should particularly like to thank Harry Johnson and Dennis Starleaf, who have gone over the entire manuscript and given me their perceptive comments. And, most of all, special thanks should go to Lloyd Atkinson. Indeed, his suggestions and encouragement were so important in the development of this book, particularly in its formative stages, that I am tempted to dispense with the *pro forma* disclaimer and say simply: If you don't like this book, blame Atkinson.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The quotation from *The Space Child's Mother Goose*, by Frederick Winsor and Marian Parry, is reprinted by permission of Simon & Schuster, Inc. © 1959 Frederick Winsor and Marian Parry.

The quotations from *General Theory of Employment, Interest, and Money* by John Maynard Keynes and *The Collected Writings of John Maynard Keynes* are reprinted by permission of Macmillan & Co. Ltd., London, England, and St. Martin's Press, Inc., New York.

February 1974

PAUL WONNACOTT

Contents

part I. INTRODUCTION

1. Economic goals and the performance of the economy 3

Macroeconomics and macroeconomic goals. *Macroeconomic policies and economic goals: The simple case.* *Macroeconomic policies and economic goals: Some complications.* A preview. *The economics of J. M. Keynes.* The economic aggregates: National income definitions. The performance of the U.S. economy.

2. Keynesian and classical economics: Two theories of demand 22

Keynesian economics: A brief outline. Classical economics: A brief outline. *Classical economics: The fundamental equation.* *The fundamental equation and classical theory: The quantity theory of money.* *Classical economics and unemployment.* *Classical economics and fiscal policy.* Fiscal activism and the two theories of demand.

part II. MODELS OF MACROECONOMIC EQUILIBRIUM

3. The simple Keynesian equilibrium system: I. The consumption function, the multiplier, and fiscal policy 43

The simple consumption function. Equilibrium: The simplest form. *Savings and investment: The paradox of thrift.* Equilibrium at less than full employment. The multiplier. *The multiplier: A single injection of government spending.* *The multiplier: A continuing injection of government spending.* *The multiplier: A geometric illustration.* Taxation: The effects on the consumption function. *A lump-sum tax.* *A tax proportional to income.* The balanced budget multiplier. *The balanced budget multiplier: A geometric illustration.* *The relative effectiveness of government spending and tax cuts as economic stimulants.* The multiplier: A more complex economy. The problem of the appropriate measure of fiscal policy: The full-employment budget concept. Appendix: More complex multipliers.

4. The simple Keynesian equilibrium system: II. Investment: The marginal efficiency of investment, the rate of interest, and liquidity preference **81**

The investment demand function: The marginal efficiency of investment. The rate of interest. The simple Keynesian system: Unemployment equilibrium in the face of an increasing supply of money. The logical alternative in static equilibrium theory: Unemployment with flexible wages and prices and a fixed nominal money supply. The unemployment equilibrium: A brief summary.

5. A Keynesian-classical synthesis: A Keynesian view **100**

Savings and investment in the classical system. *Keynes' objection*. A Keynesian-classical synthesis. *Equilibrium in the financial sector: The LM curve. The equilibrium income and interest rate*. Fiscal and monetary policies in the IS/LM framework. *Monetary policy. Combined fiscal and monetary changes: Accommodative monetary policy*. Deflation in the IS/LM framework.

6. A classical rebuttal **117**

The quantity theory and the real-balance effect. *The real-balance effect and the IS/LM analysis. Say's Law and the inconsistency in classical theory*. The multiplier and the real-balance effect. *Wealth and the size of the multiplier: A classical interpretation. Stocks and flows and the problem of the Keynesian equilibrium*. Problems with the Keynesian equilibrium and with the multiplier analysis: Their significance. *Keynesian economics: The long run and the short*.

part III. MONEY AND THE BANKING SYSTEM

7. Central banking and the instruments of monetary policy **141**

Open market operations. *Factors affecting the monetary base. The money supply. Money creation is not magic*. Other instruments of monetary control.

8. The effectiveness of monetary policy **158**

Summary of Keynesian approach to monetary policy. Summary of "classical" approach to monetary policy. Can money be created in a depression? Fast enough? *The excess reserve trap and the liquidity trap: Some distinctions. Rationality for individual bank does not equal rationality for the system*. Can the Federal Reserve control the quantity of money? The discount complication. The marginal efficiency of investment and the availability thesis. *The availability thesis*. The uneven impact of tight money on different sectors: Is tight money discriminatory? *Housing. State and local governments. The impact on housing and other sectors, and the effectiveness of monetary policy. Policies to deal with housing and other sectoral problems*. The effectiveness of monetary policy: Does money creation add to wealth?

The effectiveness of monetary policy: Is the transaction demand for money interest sensitive? The effectiveness of monetary and fiscal policies: The bang for the buck and other criteria. Time lags and the effectiveness of monetary and fiscal policies. *Inside and outside lags. Automatic stabilizers. Executive discretion.* Appendix: A theoretical problem with the liquidity trap.

9. Money misbehaving: The monetary explanation of economic instability 194

The pathology of money: An introduction to monetary dynamics (Wicksell). The pathology of money: Changes in the reserve base. *The real bills doctrine and the "needs of trade."* *A crisis of confidence and withdrawals of deposits. Gold. The pegging of interest rates in the 1940s.* The misbehavior of money and economic instability: Conclusions.

10. The monetarist case: Pro and con 215

The Friedman-Meiselman study. *The Friedman-Meiselman study: Some objections. The problem of a simple test of the Keynesian system. Reverse causation. How does monetary policy work?* The Saint Louis Fed model. The case for a monetary rule. *Lags in the operation of policy. Economic freedom: Rules versus authority.* The case against a monetary rule.

part IV. CONSUMPTION, INVESTMENT, AND AGGREGATE SUPPLY: A CLOSER LOOK

11. Aggregate supply and the price-unemployment dilemma 249

The early Keynesian aggregate supply functions. Price increases with unemployment: Cost-push inflation. *Demand-shift inflation.* The price-unemployment dilemma: The Phillips Curve. *The Phillips Curve and the labor market.* Policies to deal with the Phillips Curve dilemma. *Choose the full-employment objective, and learn to live with inflation. Wage-price guideposts and controls. Changes in government policies affecting specific markets.* Shifts in the Phillips Curve. *Cyclical changes in productivity and the inflation-unemployment dilemma. Changing labor markets and inflation.* Shifts in the Phillips Curve: Does inflation accelerate? The aggregate supply function: Summary and conclusions.

12. Inflation 294

Unanticipated inflation: The redistribution of income and wealth. Anticipated inflation. Adjustment in the capital market: The real rate of interest. Inflation as a contributor to growth: Forced saving. Escalator clauses. *Escalator clauses and a reduction in the rate of inflation. Escalator clauses, the bond market, and the problem of bankruptcies. Escalator clauses: Conclusions.* Cyclical fluctuations and the flexibility of interest rates: Is a bit of secular inflation a good thing? Money and consumers' surplus: Is a bit of deflation a good thing?

- 13. The consumption function** **323**
- The relative income hypothesis. *The importance of previous behavior: The ratchet effect. The interdependence of consumer wants: Keeping up with the Joneses.* The Permanent Income Hypothesis. *The Permanent Income Hypothesis and short-run time series. The Permanent Income Hypothesis and budget studies.* The Life Cycle Hypothesis. The Three Consumption Hypotheses: Some similarities and differences. *The Permanent Income Hypothesis and the “Habit” Hypothesis: Their mathematical similarity.* Appendix A: The consumption function and secular stagnation. Appendix B: Some additional evidence on the Permanent Income Hypothesis. *The Permanent Income Hypothesis and the distribution income. The Permanent Income Hypothesis and the evidence of occupational groups.*
- 14. Investment and economic stability** **366**
- Keynes’ marginal efficiency of investment: Stocks and flows once again. A simple stock adjustment model: The accelerator. A relaxation of the assumptions of the simple accelerator. *Lags in the response of investment to changes in output: The flexible accelerator. Peaked lags in investment. Variability of the equilibrium capital-output ratio.* Investment and economic stabilization policies. *Accelerated depreciation. The investment tax credit. The effects of fiscal incentives on investment.* Inventory investment. Appendix A: Models of instability: Samuelson’s multiplier-accelerator model and the “razor’s edge” of Harrod. *Samuelson’s multiplier-accelerator model. The Harrod-Domar model. Evaluation.*
- 15. Growth** **410**
- A simple growth equation: The Cobb-Douglas function. The application of growth equations: Is technical change “embodied”? The sources of economic growth: Denison. *Denison’s suggestion for increasing the growth rate by 1 percent.* Should there be a growth objective? *What is a neutral policy? Is the saving decision irrational? Externalities. Population.* The measure of economic welfare.
- 16. The international economy and macroeconomic objectives** **438**
- The mechanism of adjustment: The classical gold standard and relative prices. An alternative price mechanism: Changes in exchange rates. A price mechanism problem: Are elasticities high enough? Elasticity “pessimism”: Some criticisms. Shifts in demand as a function of price: The income mechanism. Conflicts between domestic objectives and balance of payments equilibrium. *Controls, tariffs, and “beggar-my-neighbor” remedies for unemployment. Changes in the domestic mix of policy. Changes in exchange rates: The adjustable peg.* The U.S. dollar and gold. Flexible exchange rates and monetary policy.

part V. THE MEASUREMENT OF ECONOMIC AGGREGATES**17. The national income and product accounts 483**

Selected problems in national income accounting. *Nonmarket transactions included in consumption: Imputations of rent, etc. Excluded final market transactions: Illegal activities. Some debatable cases. Government. Investment.* The GNP price deflator and other price indexes. The significance of the gross national product.

Answers to odd-numbered questions 501**Index 513**

part I

Introduction

I want, so to speak, to raise a dust; because it is only out of the controversy that will arise that what I am saying will be understood.

John Maynard Keynes, in a letter to Roy Harrod

1

Economic goals and the performance of the economy

Economy is the art of making the most out of life.

George Bernard Shaw

SINCE the Industrial Revolution, economic growth has been the most conspicuous feature of the economies of Europe and North America. The total production of goods and services has grown to give us an unprecedented level of economic welfare.

But there have been problems. Periodically, our economies have suffered from recession, with able-bodied men unable to find jobs in spite of their eagerness to work. In 1933, at the depth of the Great Depression, the unemployment rate in the United States rose to 25 percent of the labor force, and the annual unemployment rate never fell below 14 percent during the whole decade from 1931 to 1940. There was a tremendous economic loss: men out of work, producing nothing, while people's basic economic needs went unmet. There was a tremendous social cost: men out of work, feeling useless, in a trap of frustration and despair. And there were unmeasurable, but perhaps even greater, political consequences: the international depression was one of the factors bringing Hitler to power, with his promises of full employment and military conquest.

The disasters of the interwar period laid the foundation for modern macroeconomics. "Never again" was the determination of the economic scholar, the politician, and the man on the street alike. This determination was clearly reflected in the Employment Act of 1946, in which the Congress declared that "it is the continuing responsibility of the Federal Government to use all practicable means . . . to promote maxi-

mun employment, production, and purchasing power.” And politicians and economic scholars have worked together to see that the 30s did not happen again: Economic problems in the postwar period have been mild compared to those of the prewar decade.

But, in spite of successes, problems have remained. After the successful conversion to a peacetime economy in the immediate postwar years, the economy suffered a pause in 1949, and the unemployment rate rose to 5.9 percent (compared to the average of about 4 percent in the preceding three years). Again in 1954, there was a pause, with a 5.5 percent unemployment rate. Then, during the late 50s and early 60s, there was an extended period of softness in the economy, with annual unemployment rising almost to 7 percent in 1958, and never falling below 5.5 percent until the Vietnam war began to escalate in 1964–65. During this six-year period of slack from 1958 to 1963, the economy lost an estimated total of \$200 billion in output foregone (measured at 1958 prices); \$200 billion more could have been produced if men and machines had been kept working at high employment levels. More recently, in 1971, the unemployment was again high by postwar standards, rising to 5.9 percent for the year.

MACROECONOMICS AND MACROECONOMIC GOALS

Economics is divided into two basic categories: macroeconomics and microeconomics. *Macroeconomics* is the study of economic aggregates: the total amount of employment, the level of aggregate output, the growth of aggregate output, and changes in the average level of prices. *Microeconomics*, on the other hand, deals with the detailed behavior of individual economic units. How does a business firm maximize its profits? What forces determine the prices of individual goods? What determines the amount of a particular good which will be produced?

The division between macroeconomics and microeconomics is particularly significant because the overall response of the economy may differ quite sharply from the response of individual units. For example, when the wages paid by an individual firm decline, then the firm is likely to expand output and add to its labor force. But not necessarily so for the economy as a whole: If the general level of wages falls, the level of incomes and the consumption of the labor force will also decline. Thus, producing units will face conflicting forces: a reduction in their costs, which should encourage them to expand; and a reduction in the demand for their products, which discourages production. Which of these

forces is stronger is not immediately clear (and, indeed, this question was the source of considerable controversy during the Great Depression). The important point: One cannot argue that the response of the economy as a whole to an economic change is necessarily the same as the response of an individual unit; to do so is to commit *the fallacy of composition*. Macroeconomics—the study of economic aggregates—does not constitute a simple set of deductions from microeconomics.

As they deal with different levels of aggregation, macroeconomics and microeconomics naturally focus on different economic objectives. Macroeconomic policy objectives are *full employment, stable prices, and a satisfactory rate of economic growth*. The key microeconomic objective is the efficient use of productive resources.

Macroeconomic policies and economic goals: The simple case

*For extreme illnesses, extreme treatments are most fitting.*¹

Hippocrates

At times, the economy falls so short of an important objective that policy makers should clearly concentrate on that objective. This was most obviously the case during the 1930s, when the economy was operating far short of capacity output, and men and machines were idle. It has also been the case in countries suffering from hyperinflation (very rapid rates of inflation), such as Germany in the early 1920s.

The central policy message of macroeconomics is that *changes in aggregate demand are the key* to dealing with these pathological conditions. If the economy is suffering from a 1930s-type depression, then demand should be expanded, and quickly! Large-scale unemployment was a sign that there was insufficient total demand; an increase in the demand for goods and services was needed to put men back to work. On the other extreme, the hyperinflation in Germany in the 20s was a result of a rise in aggregate demand which was much too rapid. Too much demand was chasing too few goods. The appropriate policy in those circumstances: Cut down the rate of growth of aggregate demand.

Two major policy levers are available to the authorities to control aggregate demand:

1. *Fiscal policy* involves changes in government spending or in taxa-

¹ From *Aphorisms*.