CASES AND MATERIALS ON CIVIL PROCEDURE

ATKINSON-CHADBOURN

CASES AND OTHER MATERIALS

ON

CIVIL PROCEDURE

THOMAS E. ATKINSON
Professor of Law, New York University

JAMES H. CHADBOURN
Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania

 $\begin{array}{c} \textbf{Brooklyn} \\ \textbf{THE FOUNDATION PRESS, INC.} \\ \textbf{1948} \end{array}$

COPYRIGHT, 1948
BY
THE FOUNDATION PRESS, INC.
(Introduction to Civil Procedure)

COPYRIGHT, 1948
BY
THE FOUNDATION PRESS, INC.

University Casebook Series

ACCOUNTING-CORPORATION (Temporary Edition, Bound)

Robert Amory, Jr., Professor of Law, Harvard University.

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW, Second Edition

Felix Frankfurter, Associate Justice of the Supreme Court of the United States, and James F. Davison, Professor of Law, George Washington University.

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW, Second Edition

Walter Gellhorn, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

BUSINESS ASSOCIATIONS—CORPORATIONS

E. Merrick Dodd, Jr., Professor of Law, Harvard University, and Ralph J. Baker, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

BUSINESS ORGANIZATION: CORPORATIONS

A. A. Berle, Jr., Professor of Law, Columbia University, and William C. Warren, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

CIVIL PROCEDURE see Procedure

COMMERCIAL AND INVESTMENT PAPER, with Statutory Material

Roscoe T. Steffen, Professor of Law, Yale University.

COMMON LAW ACTIONS—Introduction to Civil Procedure (Forms of Actions) Thomas E. Atkinson, Professor of Law, New York University, and James H. Chadbourn, Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania.

CONFLICT OF LAWS, Second Edition, with 1947 Supplement

Elliott E. Cheatham, Professor of Law, Columbia University; Noel T. Dowling, Professor of Law, Columbia University; Herbert F. Goodrich, formerly Dean of the Law School, University of Pennsylvania, Judge, U. S. Circuit Court of Appeals, Third Circuit; and Erwin N. Griswold, Dean of the Law School, Harvard University.

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW, Third Edition

Noel T. Dowling, Harlan Fiske Stone Professor of Constitutional Law, Columbia University.

CONTRACTS, Second Edition

Harold Shepherd, Dean of the Law School, Duke University.

CONTRACTS, Second Edition

Edwin W. Patterson, Cardozo Professor of Jurisprudence, Columbia University, and George W. Goble, Professor of Law, University of Illinois.

CREDITORS' RIGHTS, Third Edition, 1939, with The Bankruptcy Act of 1898, as Amended, including The Chandler Act of 1938, and Annotated to 1948. John Hanna, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

James Angell MacLachlan, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

CREDITORS' RIGHTS, Fourth Edition, with 1948 Bankruptcy Act Pamphlet. Volume 2, Receivership and Corporate Reorganization available separately John Hanna, Professor of Law, Columbia University, and James Angell MacLachlan, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

CRIMINAL LAW AND ITS ADMINISTRATION

Jerome Michael, Professor of Law, Columbia University, and Herbert Wechsler, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

CRIMINAL LAW AND ITS ENFORCEMENT, Third Edition

John B. Waite, Professor of Law, University of Michigan.

DAMAGES

Charles T. McCormick, Dean of the Law School, University of Texas.

DOMESTIC RELATIONS, Second Edition, with 1947 Supplement

Albert C. Jacobs, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

EQUITY, Second Edition

Zechariah Chafee, Jr., Langdell Professor of Law, Harvard University, and Sidney Post Simpson, Professor of Law, New York University School of Law. In collaboration with John P. Maloney, Vice Dean of Law School, St. John's University.

UNIVERSITY CASEBOOK SERIES—Continued

ETHICS see Legal Profession

EVIDENCE, Second Edition

Edmund M. Morgan, Royall Professor of Law, Harvard University, and John M. Maguire, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

FEDERAL COURTS

Charles T. McCormick, Dean of the Law School, University of Texas, and James H. Chadbourn, Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania.

INSURANCE, Second Edition

Edwin W. Patterson, Cardozo Professor of Jurisprudence, Columbia University.

INTRODUCTION TO LAW

Dowling, Patterson, and Powell's Materials on Legal Method, by Noel T. Dowling, Harlan Fiske Stone Professor of Constitutional Law, Columbia University, Edwin W. Patterson, Cardozo Professor of Jurisprudence, Columbia University, and Richard R. B. Powell, Dwight Professor of Law, Columbia University.

Beardsley and Orman's Legal Bibliography and the Use of Law Books, with Assignments and Problems, Second Edition, by Arthur S. Beardsley, Member of the Seattle Bar and formerly Law Librarian, University of Washington, and Oscar C. Orman, Lecturer in Legal Bibliography and formerly Director of Libraries, Washington University, St. Louis. Solutions to Assignments available.

JURISPRUDENCE (Temporary Edition, Bound)

Lon L. Fuller, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

LABOR LAW

Archibald Cox, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

LABOR LAW, Second Edition, with 1947 Supplement

James M. Landis, formerly Dean of the Law School, Harvard University, and Marcus Manoff, Member of the Massachusetts Bar.

LABOR RELATIONS

Harry Shulman, Professor of Law, Yale University, and Neil Chamberlain, Professor of Economics and Research Director of the Labor Management Center, Yale University.

LEGAL BIBLIOGRAPHY, Second Edition, with Assignments and Problems Arthur S. Beardsley, formerly Professor of Law and Law Librarian, University of Washington, and Oscar C. Orman, formerly Professor of Law and Director of Libraries, Washington University.

LEGAL METHOD

Noel T. Dowling, Harlan Fiske Stone Professor of Constitutional Law. Columbia University; Edwin W. Patterson, Cardozo Professor of Jurisprudence, Columbia University; and Richard R. B. Powell, Dwight Professor of Law, Columbia University.

LEGAL PROFESSION

Elliott E. Cheatham, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

Horace E. Read, Professor of Law, University of Minnesota, and John W. MacDonald, Professor of Law, Cornell Law School,

MUNICIPAL CORPORATIONS, Third Edition

By the late Charles W. Tooke, Professor of Law, New York University, and John A. McIntire, Professor of Law, George Washington University.

NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS see Commercial and Investment Paper

PROCEDURE-CIVIL PROCEDURE

Thomas E. Atkinson, Professor of Law, New York University, and James H. Chadbourn, Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania.

PROCEDURE-CIVIL PROCEDURE

Paul R. Hays, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

PROCEDURE-CIVIL PROCEDURE, Third Edition

Roswell Magill, Professor of Law, Columbia University, and James H. Chadbourn, Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania.

PROCEDURE-The Elements of Legal Controversy: An Introduction to the Study of Adjective Law

ii

Jerome Michael, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

T7204-2r

UNIVERSITY CASEBOOK SERIES—Continued

PROCEDURE—Introduction to Civil Procedure (Forms of Actions)

Thomas E. Atkinson, Professor of Law, New York University, and James H. Chadbourn, Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania.

PROPERTY (Revised Temporary Edition, Bound)

A. James Casner, Professor of Law, Harvard University, and W. Barton Leach, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

PROPERTY, Volume I-REAL, Second Edition

Everett Fraser, Dean Emeritus of the Law School, University of Minnesota.

PROPERTY, Volume 2-PERSONAL AND REAL, Second Edition

Everett Fraser, Dean Emeritus of the Law School, University of Minnesota.

PROPERTY, Volume 3-CONVEYANCES, Second Edition

Marion R. Kirkwood, Professor of Law, Stanford University.

PROPERTY, Volume 4—FUTURE INTERESTS, Second Edition, with 1948 Taxation Supplement

PROPERTY, Volume 5-WILLS AND ADMINISTRATION, Third Edition

Philip Mechem, Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania, and Thomas E. Atkinson, Professor of Law, New York University.

RECEIVERSHIP AND CORPORATE REORGANIZATION see Creditors' Rights
QUASI CONTRACTS AND EQUITY (Rescission, Reformation and Quasi
Contracts)

Edwin W. Patterson, Cardozo Professor of Jurisprudence, Columbia University.

SALES, Second Edition

George G. Bogert, James Parker Hall Professor of Law, University of Chicago, and William E. Britton, Professor of Law, University of Illinois.

SECURITY, Second Edition

John Hanna, Professor of Law, Columbia University, and Reporter on Security, American Law Institute.

TAXATION, Fourth Edition

Roswell Magill, Professor of Law, Columbia University, and John M. Maguire, Professor of Law, Harvard University.

TAXATION, FEDERAL, Second Edition, with 1948 Supplement

Erwin N. Griswold, Dean of the Law School, Harvard University.

TORTS

Harry Shulman, Sterling Professor of Law, Yale University, and Fleming James, Jr., La Fayette S. Foster Professor of Law, Yale University.

TRADE REGULATION, with 1947 Supplement

Milton Handler, Professor of Law, Columbia University.

TRUSTS

George G. Bogert, James Parker Hall Professor of Law, University of Chicago.

WILLS AND ADMINISTRATION see Property, Volume 5

University Casebook Series

EDITORIAL BOARD

EDMUND M. MORGAN

DIRECTING EDITOR

Royall Professor of Law, Harvard University

EVERETT FRASER
Dean of the Law School, University of Minnesota

ERWIN N. GRISWOLD

Dean of the Law School, Harvard University

ALBERT J. HARNO
Dean of the Law School, University of Illinois

MARION R. KIRKWOOD
Professor of Law, Stanford University

ROSWELL MAGILL
Professor of Law, Columbia University

CHARLES T. McCORMICK
Dean of the Law School, University of Texas

HAROLD SHEPHERD

Dean of the Law School, Duke University

HARRY SHULMAN
Professor of Law, Yale University

PREFACE

THE law student, for whom this book is prepared, will soon observe that much of his attention is directed to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure of 1938. He may even wonder why he should study anything else. If these Rules are used in the United States courts and if more and more they are being adopted for use in state courts, why should he turn back to the Field Code of 1848, the Hilary Rules of 1834 and the procedures of eras still more remote?

Let him read in Federal Rule 2 that "there shall be one form of action to be known as 'civil action'". Then let him ask himself: What is a "form of action"? Why is it necessary to say there is only one? If there used to be more than one, why was this—what were they—and what does it mean to say there is only one now? Such matters constitute the principal content of Part I of this book. Should the student be led to despair by its apparent antiquarianism, let him take heart from the assurance that Federal Rule 2 will be meaningful only after he has explored some of these ancient mysteries and that what he is really doing is laying the foundation for comprehension of this most modern of rules.

Part II develops the steps in an action from the original summons through the appeal, and may be considered the heart of the book. So far as this Part is historical, it deals with common-law procedure and the influences of trial by jury. The major emphasis, however, is upon modern problems of jurisdiction, pleading and practice.

Part III segregates those remedies (injunction, specific performance, etc.) and procedures (e. g., discovery, declaratory judgment) which stem from equity as a separate system. In view of the parallels between the forms of action and equitable remedies it may seem that the latter should be included in Part I. It may appear further questionable to separate such mechanisms as discovery from the otherwise comprehensive treatment of modern procedure in Part II. In preferring the present arrangement we are only slightly influenced by the fact that the matters covered in Part III have a common historical origin. Our principal reason is that in our experience earlier introduction of equitable remedies and procedure so complicates the first part of the course as to retard rather than facilitate the student's grasp of the total system.

Part IV treats the more complicated problems which arise when more than two parties are involved. Thus some of the matters considered earlier are reexamined on a higher level in this Part. Recent developments in this phase of procedure afford an unusual oppor-

PREFACE

tunity for inquiry as to how far historical and technical limitations may be altered to subserve the ends of economy and efficiency.

The editors believe that the subject of procedure is best presented through the medium of cases. They believe further that often the most provocative discussions of timeless problems are found in earlier cases. When this is found to be true, the older case has been chosen, but recent authorities have not, of course, been neglected. Basic and typical statutory materials, including the Federal Rules, necessarily play a prominent part in the book. In addition, the editors have not hesitated to employ text materials in appropriate places, both to shorten the exposition and to lend a helping hand. In the main, the materials denominated "Notes" either suggest some divergence of viewpoint or develop additional applications. Forms are included both in the principal cases and independently to show how procedural steps are actually taken.

Here and there throughout the book tabulations of judicial statistics are included. We have missed our mark, however, if these materials serve only to convey information. Our hope is that the student will find himself able to use this information not only in gaining a sense of the reality of procedural devices in the judicial process but also in evaluating their relative merits as effective and useful tools.

The editors are conscious of their indebtedness to editors of earlier casebooks—Ames, Hinton, Sunderland, Keigwin, Scott and Simpson, and others. As the citations show, much assistance and inspiration have been found in the work of Judge Charles E. Clark whose activities in the field of procedure as teacher, scholar, draftsman, publicist and judge have been unique in modern annals. Particular gratitude is expressed to Professor Roswell Magill for his kind permission to use the materials contained in his casebook on civil procedure, the last edition of which was in joint editorship with Professor Chadbourn. While the present volume represents a fresh undertaking for which the editors are jointly and equally responsible, they have profited from Professor Magill's work, especially from his wise selection of cases. Professor Philip Mechem helped us prepare the textual summary of equity jurisdiction, for which, however, he is absolved of all responsibility. Finally we are indebted to Professor Edmund M. Morgan who, as directing editor of the University Casebook Series, has read the manuscript, offered helpful suggestions and generously encouraged us in our task.

> THOMAS E. ATKINSON JAMES H. CHADBOURN

April 1, 1948

[Cases printed in roman type are the cases reported as the text of this volume. Cases printed in italic type are found in the text notes and footnotes.]

Aaron v. Missouri & Kansas Tel. Co., 499 Abraham v. Superior Court, 522 Acadian Production Corp. of Louisiana v. Land, 579 Adams v. Cline Ice Cream Co., 413 Adams v. Hall and Cootwire, 801 Adams v. Hemmenway, 23 Adelman v. Nordberg, 640 Ader v. Blau, 145, 804, 809 Aetna Life Ins. Co. v. Haworth, 662, Aetna Life Ins. Co. v. Kepler, 579, 580 Akely v. Kinnicutt, 785 Akins v. Texas, 408 Alabama Great Southern R. R. Co. v. Daffron, 498 Alabama Independent Service Station Ass'n v. Shell P. Corp., 804 Albaugh v. Abbott, 818 Allegheny, County of v. Md. Cas. Co., 476 Allen v. Yarborough, 507 Allinger v. McKeown, 255 Allis v. Leonard, 498 American Chemical Paint Co. v. Dow. Chemical Co., 564 American Lead Corporation v. Davis, 821 American League Baseball Club v. Chase, 591 American Machine & Metals v. De Bothezat Impeller Co., 663 American Mills Co. v. American Surety Co., 731 American Motorists Ins. Co. v. Vigen, 839 Ammel v. Noonar, 228 Anderson v. Brady, 551 Anderson v. Case, 117 Anderson v. Gouldberg, 58 Anderson v. Hapler, 34 Anderson v. Hill, 144 Anderson v. Newsome, 478 Andrews v. Hoeslich, 57, 110 Andrews v. McMahan, 672 Anonymous, 27, 78, 89, 90, 95, 289, 343 Armacost v. Lindley, 120

Armentrout v. Virginian Ry. Co., 516 Armstrong v. James & Co., 498 Arndt v. Williams, 593, 737 Asbury Park & S. G. Ry. Co. v. Neptune Twp., 592, 626 Ash v. Childs Dining Hall Co., 107 Aspinwall v. Aspinwall, 671 Associated Press v. United States, 395 Atchison, T. & S. F. R. Co. v. Swarts, 513 Atkins v. Steed, 809 Atkinson v. United Railroads, 248 Atlantic Coast Line R. Co. v. Brackin, Atlantic Metal Products, Inc. v. Minskoff, 716 Auburn & Owasco Canal Co. v. Leitch, Augusta & S. R. Co. v. Lark, 348 Auldridge v. Spraggin, 74 Avery v. Spicer, 110 Ayer v. Wilson, 794 Bach v. Quigan, 329 Bail v. New York, N. H. & H. R. R. Co., 468 Bailey v. Smith, 149, 151 Baker v. Fales, 54 Baker v. Union Stock Yards Nat. Bank, Baldwin v. City of Aberdeen, 366 Baley v. Brauenstein, 611 Ball v. Paramount Pictures, Inc., 639 Ballin v. Los Angeles County Fair, 891 Baltimore Trust Co. v. Interocean Oil Co., 861 Baltimore & Carolina Line, Inc. v. Redman, 465, 466 Baltimore & Ohio Railroad Co. v. Saunders, 843 Banking Corp. v. Lazard-Godchaux Co., Bank Line, Ltd. v. United States, 640 Bank of America Nat. Trust & Savings Ass'n v. McLaughlin, 563 Bank of New Brunswick v. Arrowsmith,

16

Barclay v. Barclay, 669 Boaz v. Mutual Life Ins. Co. of New Bardwell v. Collins, 180 York, 551 Barham v. Perry, 533 Bohnhoff v. Kennedy, 221 Barnard v. Kandiyohi County, 561 Boley v. Allred, 771 Barnard v. Kruzan, 890 Bonnel v. Fouke, 99 Barnett v. Gitlitz, 552 Booth v. Farmers' & Mechanics' Nat. Barnett v. New England Mut. Life Ins. Bank, 241 Co., 747 Borden v. Borden, 154 Barnsdall v. Waltemeyer, 579 Borman v. Oetzell, 735 Bash v. B. & O. Ry. Co., 433 Boslund v. Abbotsford Lumber Co., 206 Basset v. Thomas, 468 Bossette v. W. B. Conkey Co., 682 Basten v. Butter, 317, 318 Boston India Rubber Factory v. Hoit, 84 Batemore, Inc. v. Standard Brands, Inc., Bothwel v. Boston Elevated Ry., 469 640 Boyd v. Geary, 241, 350 Beach v. Bird & Wells Lumber Co., 531 Boyd v. Portland Elec. Co., 493 Beach v. Hotchkiss, 795 Bradley v. Davis, 31 Beaufort Land & Investment Co. v. New Bradshaw v. Ashley, 74 River Lumber Co., 477 Brand v. Longstreet, 290 Beaunit Mills v. Eday Fabric Sales Brannon v. May, 473 Corp., 746 Brasfield v. U. S., 498 Beck v. Beck, 596, 623 Brenner v. Title Guarantee Trust Co., Bellavance v. Plastic-Craft Novelty Co., 865, 891 Brent v. Chapman, 468 Benbow v. Robbins, 404 Bretton v. Barnet, 78 Benedict v. Seymour, 291 Bright v. Eynon, 514 Bennet v. McFall, 752 Brinley v. Lewis, 270 Benton v. Collins, 804 Bromage v. Genning, 599 Bereslavsky v. Caffey, 560, 731 Brooke v. Brooke, 365 Bereslavsky v. Kloeb, 733 Brooks v. Wheeler, 72 Bergman v. Liverpool & London & Globe Broom v. Davis, 317 Ins. Co., Ltd., 834 Brotherhood of L. Engineers v. Chicago, Berney v. Drexel, 359 M., etc., R. Co., 856, 890 Bertschy v. McLeod, 424 Brown v. Baldwin, 716 Best Foods, Inc. v. General Mills, Inc., Brown v. Beckham, 560 291 Brown v. Cranston, 840 Bills v. Hyde, 116 Brown v. Ellison, 49, 142 Bino v. Veenhuizen, 504 Brown v. Haertel, 839 Bird v. Randall, 289, 468 Black v. Miller, 594, 615 Brown v. Jones, 346 Brown v. Kalamazoo Circuit Judge, 594, Blackmer v. U. S., 164 Blackwell v. Columbia Trust Co., 312 652, 654, 670, 728 Brown v. Saratoga Ry. Co., 361 Blank v. Bitker, 212 Blease v. Garlington, 649 Bruckman v. Hollzer, 723 Bloomfield v. Hancock, 77 Bruffarts v. Ober, 359, 801 Bloss v. Holman, 27 Bruheim v. Stratton, 125 Blum v. Fresh Grown Preserve Corp., Brune v. McDonald, 847 453 Buckin v. Long Island Ry. Co., 581 Blumb v. Getz, 444 Buckley v. Altheimer, 609 Board of Com'rs of Mille Lacs County v. Buffington v. Harvey, 688 Morrison, 402 Bulkley v. Norwich & W. Ry., 351 Board of County Com'rs v. American Bull v. Mathews, 141, 346 Loan & Trust Co., 382 Bulova v. E. L. Barnett, 312 Board of County Com'rs of Atchison Bunnell v. Rosenberg, 441 County v. Challiss, 179 Burdick v. Kenyon, 335, 346 Board of Public Instruction for County Burford v. Birdwell, Okl., 571 of Hernando, State of Florida v. Mere-Burgin v. Richmond & Danville Ry. Co., dith, 391 351

Chicago & E. Ill. Ry. Co. v. Zapp, 487 Burgoyme v. Ohio Life Insurance & Chicago & N. W. Ry. Co. v. Dunleavy, Trust Co., 794 Burley & Harris v. Harris, 795 Burroughes v. Bayne, 38 Chicago & N. W. Ry. Co. v. McKeigue, Burton v. Farmers', etc., Association, 654 736 Butler v. Ellis, 669 Chidester v. City of Newark, 771 Butler v. Frontier Tel. Co., 68 Childress v. Emory, 49 Byard v. Holmes, 228 Chinoweth v. Haskell, 468 Bynum v. Prudential Life Ins. Co., 742 Christian v. Williams, 203 Byrd v. Rector, 196 Christopherson v. Bare, 290, 346 Cicotte v. Wayne County, 346 Cahill v. Chicago, M. & St. P. Ry. Co., Citizens Bank v. Davis, 360 440 Citizens' Trust Co. v. Tindle, 755 Cain v. Wright, 277, 771 City of New York Ins. Co. v. Tice, 761 Caines v. Fisher & M'Lachlan, 656 City of. See under name of city Cairns v. Fort, 845 Clark v. Carlton, 30 Caldwell v. Fenwick, 51 Clark v. Chicago, M. & St. Paul Ry. Co., Caldwell v. Wells, 517 245, 261 California Apparel Creators v. Wieder Clark v. Hellen, 152 of California, 394, 890 Clark v. Jenkins, 517 California Packing Corp. v. Kelly Stor-Clark v. Skinner, 59 age & Distributing Co., 257 Clark v. Latham, 283 Calinan v. Federal Cash Register Co., Clarke v. Turton, 614 268 Clayton v. Shoemaker, 656 Callan v. Wilson, 406 Clements v. Moore, 620 Callen v. Pennsylvania Ry. Co., 747 Cleo Syrup Co. v. Coca Cola, 579 Camden Safe Deposit & Trust Co. v. Cleveland v. Ward, 602 Clifford v. Dam, 297 Barbour, 832 Campbell v. Bannister, 341 Clough v. Goggins, 355 Caperton v. Schmitt, 74 Coburn v. Travelers' Ins. Co., 233 Capital Fire Ins. Co. v. Langhorne, Cochran v. Whitesides, 109 767 Coe v. Riley, 392 Cogswell v. New York, N. H. & H. R. Cardinal v. University of Rochester, 646 Carilli v. Hersey, 559 Co., 723 Cole v. Forth, 600 Carleton v. Griffin, 468 Colegrove v. Green, 662 Carleton v. Lovejoy, 40 Carrel v. Early, 51 Colegrove v. N. Y. & N. H. R. R. and N. Y. & H. R. R., 418 Carroll v. Pennsylvania R. R. Co., 432 Cartan v. Phelps, 696 Colten v. Ross, 613 Case v. Shepherd, 33, 67 Columbia Digger Sand & Gravel Co. v. Ross Island Sand & Gravel Co., 365 Casey Pure Milk Co. v. Booth Fisheries Co., 813 Columbus Oil Co. v. Moore, 504 Commercial Casualty Ins. Co. v. Con-Castle v. City of Madison, 813, 864 solidated Stone Co., 206 Cassady v. Laughlin, 77 Cassidy v. Sullivan, 401 Comfort v. McCorkle, 93 Commonwealth v. Barry, 498 Castriotis v. Guaranty Trust Co. of N. Y., 196 Comstock v. Johnson, 658 Catanzaritti v. Bianco, 711 Conaughty v. Nichols, 116, 120, 230 Central Transportation Co. v. Pullman's Cone v. W. Va. Pulp & Paper Co., 476 Palace Car Co., 440 Conger v. Johnston, 307 C. F. Simmonin's Sons Inc. v. American Conkling v. Weatherwax, 297 Can Co., 637 Considerant v. Brisbane, 766 Chamberlain v. Hazlewood, 25 Cooper v. Wyman, 157 Chambliss v. Hass, 521 Coppendale v. Bridgen, 468 Chapman v. Potomac Chemical Co., 141 Corbett v. Packington, 88 Chapman & Nelson v. Sloan, 314 Corley v. McElmeel, 402 Corley v. N. Y. & H. R. Co., 521 Chetwood v. State Bank at Elizabeth, 82

Corning v. Corning, 238 Correll v. Granget, 154 Cottrell v. Gerson, 361 Coughlin v. Weeks, 504 County of. See under name of county. Courtney v. Glanvil, 599 Cox v. Hall, 27 Coxhead v. Winsted Hardware Mfg. Co., 765, 865 Cozine v. Graham, 264 Crary v. Goodman, 735 Crease v. Barrett, 582 Creighton v. Kerr, 221 Crocker v. Manhattan Life Ins. Co., 592 Crofts v. Brown, 27 Cromwell v. County of Sac, 136 Cromwell v. Owings, 60 Crone v. Checker Cab & Baggage Co., 803 Crowder v. Fordyce Lumber Co., 113 Crown Co. v. Reilly, 63 Cummings v. Hubbell, 351 Cummings v. People for Use of Jersey County, 794 Cunningham v. Lyness, 299 Curley v. Dean, 230 Curtice Brothers v. Catts, 591 Cushman v. Bonfield, 613, 621 Cushman v. Savage, 283 Daggett v. Gray, 258 Dale v. Colfax Consol. Coal Co., 409

Daley v. Iselin, 221 Dallas Ry. & Terminal Co. v. Sullivan, 490 Dalton v. Favour, 21 Darnell v. Mack, 199 Davis v. Chouteau, 770 Davis v. Cole, 291 Davis v. Dickson, 80 Davis v. Doe, 67 Davis & Fant v. Duncan, 40 Davison v. Baker, 154 Dawson Bank v. Harris, 706, 804 Day v. Edwards, 20, 22 Dearborn Nat. Casualty Co. v. Consumers Petroleum Co., 576 Dechert v. Pratt, 850 Deeley v. Heintz, 440 Delaware, Lackawanna & Western Railroad Company v. Rellstab, 538, 560 De Moss v. Conart Motor Sales, 591 Denison v. Williams, 82 Dennison v. Musgrave, 439 Denton v. Stephens, 752 De Pinna v. Polhill, 300

Deputy v. Strong, 771

De Ran v. Colonial Sav. Bank & Trust Co., 735 De Vall v. De Vall, 532 Devoe v. Lutz, 310 De Waltoff v. Third Ave. R. R. Co., 317 Dewey v. Carey, 769 Dick v. Hyer, 145 Di Menna v. Cooper & Evans Co., 731 Dimick v. Schiedt, 466, 524 Dioguardi v. Durning, 268 Ditcham v. Bond, 24, 141 Dodd v. Reese, 848 Dodson v. Southern Ry. Co., 371 Doe d. Greaves v. Raby, 72 Doe d. Jefferson v. Howell, 72 Doherty & Co. v. Goodman, 182 Doherty v. Moreschi, 183 Dolph v. Ferris, 24 Dooley v. Pease, 579 Doolittle v. Shaw, 45 Dougherty v. Salt, 468 Dowd-Feder, Inc. v. Truesdell, 409 Drakesly v. Roots, 589, 601, 671 Draper v. Brown, 818 Draycot v. Piot, 42 Drittel v. Friedman, 390 Du Cate v. Brighton, 513 Duckworth v. McClelland, 338 Dudley v. Duval, 382 Dunbauld v. Thompson, 504 Duncan v. Landis, 554 Dunklee v. Goodenough, 365 Dunlevy v. Fenton, 368 Dwan v. Massarene, 384 Dwyer v. Shalck, 182 Eames v. Prentice, 36

Eccles v. Peoples Bank of Lakewood Village, 666 Eddy v. Brady, 283 Edgcomb v. Dee, 98 Eldon v. Doe d. Wynn, 74 Elmer v. Copeland, 770 Ellenwood v. Marietta Chair Co., 128 Elliott v. Lawhead, 204 Elsee v. Smith, 27 Emerson v. Universal Products Co., 637 Emery v. Pacific Employers Ins. Co., 790 Emery v. Pease, 712 Employers' Fire Ins. Co. v. Cotton, 61 Engelman v. Traeger, 394 Engels v. Lubeck, 603 English v. Dalbrow, 57 Ensley v. Coolbaugh, 74 Eppinger & Russell v. Trembly, 394 Epstein v. National Transportation Co.,

Fraser v. Doing, 689 Escherick v. Traver, 736 Eskridge & Wife v. Ditmars & Co., 338 Fraser v. Geist, 723 Frechette v. Ravin, 129 Estabrook v. Butte, A. & P. Ry., 516 Etiwan Fertilizer Co. v. Johns, 374 Frey & Horgan Corp. v. Superior Court Ettleson v. Metropolitan Life Insurance of the City & County of San Francis-Co., 732, 744, 747 co. 168 Friedman v. Harris, 861 Fahey, Ex parte, 560 Friend v. Childs Dining Hall Co., 108 Fairfield v. Southport National Bank, Fruit Growers Co-op. v. California Pie & 818 Baking Co., 845 Fairmount Glass Works v. Cub Fork Fulton County Gas & Electric Co. v. Hudson River Tel. Co., 368 Coal Co., 475 Fall v. Eastin, 601 Furman v. Tuxbury L. & T. Co., 125 Farmers Grain & Supply Co. v. Atchison, Gable v. Bingler, 801 T. & S. F. Ry. Co., 801 Gale v. Grannis, 589, 695 Farron v. Sherwood, 241 Gale v. Hines, 69 Fawcett v. Atherton, 546, 594 Galloway v. U. S., 455 Fechheimer Bros. Co. v. Barnwasser, 790 Feder v. Midland Cas. Co., 233 Galpin v. Page, 542 Galveston, H. & S. A. Ry. Co. v. Temple-Federal Housing Administrator v. Christon, 418 tianson, 804 Gannon v. Laclede Gaslight Co., 444 Federal Life Ins. Co. v. Rumpel, 440 Garabettian v. Garabettian, 159 Feldmann v. Conn. Mut. Life Ins. Co., Gardner v. Clark, 286 513 Felt v. Williams, 51 Gardner v. Turner, 408 Garfein v. McInnis, 672 Ferrier v. McCabe. 351 Gartside v. Nixon, 57 Finney v. Guy, 356 First National Bank v. Peck, 509 Gasoline Products Co. v. Champlin Re-First National Bank v. Reynolds, 832 fining Co., 466 First National Bank v. White, 167 Gates v. Miles, 22 First National Bank of Florence v. Ed-Gellens v. 11 W. 42d St., 754 wards, 878 George v. Benjamin, 865 First National Bank of Pittsburgh v. Gephart v. Taylor, 351 Stallo, 239, 262 Germofert Mfg. Co. v. Castles, 377 Fisher v. Pacific Mut. Life Ins. Co., 603 Gibbons v. Cannaven, 573 Fisher, Sons & Co. v. Crowley, 217 Gibbons v. Pepper, 291 Fitzhugh v. Reid, 159 Gila Valley Electric, Gas & Water Co. v. Flanagan v. Camden Mut. Ins. Co., 78 Arizona Trust & Savings Bank, 538 Fleischer v. Detroit Cadillac Motor Car Gilbert v. Burnstine, 164 Co., 136 Gill v. Pelkey, 744 Fleming v. Palmer, 579 Gilmer v. Felhour, 627 Fleming v. Van Der Loo, 534 Gins v. Mauser Plumbing Supply Co., Fleming to use of De Bolle v. Ins. Co. of 128, 147 Pa., 428 Girard Trust Co. v. Vance, 833 Flesher v. Hasler, 275 Glasser v. Wessel, 835 Flexner v. Farson, 183 Globe Liquor Co. v. San Roman, 480 Folkner v. Hopkins, 507 Godby v. Chambers, 159 Ford v. C. E. Wilson & Co., 723 Golob v. Pasinsky, 255 Ford Motor Co. v. Vanover, 519 Gompers v. Buck's Stove & Range Co., Foster v. Hill, 154, 543 670, 677, 681, 682 Fowle v. Common Council of Alexandria, Good Health Dairy Products Corp. v. Emery, 137 Francis v. Humphrey, 245 Goodman v. Henry Caplan Inc., 591 Franklin v. Dorsey-Jackson Chevrolet Goodright d. Balch v. Rich, 73 Co., 852 Goodwin v. Monds, 156 Goodwin v. Smith, 587, 590, 607 Franklin Fire Ins. Co. v. Massey, 78

Gordon v. Bruner, 100

Franz Corp. v. Fifer, 490

Hammans v. Powell Myers Lumber Co., Gordon v. Harper, 29, 110 Gordon v. Hostetter, 42 Hancock v. Blackwell, 747 Gossard v. Gossard, 351 Hancock National Bank v. Ellis, 355 Goulet v. Asseler, 110 Hancock Oil Co. v. Independent Dis-Graham v. Grigg, 84 tributing Co., 829 Graham v. Peat, 32 Grandin v. LeRoy & Smyth, 616 Hanke v. Milwaukee Electric Ry. & Grannis v. Ordean, 196 Transport Co., 646 Grant v. Kellogg Co., 212 Hanley v. Donoghue, 358 Grant v. Phoenix Mut. Life Ins. Co., Hanley's Estate, In re, 569 Hanna v. Stedman, 837 Grauman v. City Company of New York, Hansberry v. Lee, 873 Harlan v. Murrell, 589, 656 Graves v. Harrington, 803 Harris v. Avery, 143 Harris v. Balk, 187 Gray v. First National Bank of Chicago, Hart v. Langfitt, 80 Hart v. Skinner, 45 Gray v. Givins, 771 Hartray v. Chicago Rys. Co., 351 Grazebrook v. McCreedie, 603 Harvey-Watts Co. v. Worcester Um-Great Northern Telegraph Co. v. Yokobrella Co., 696 hama Specie Bank, 809 Haut v. Gunderson, 321 Green v. Creighton, 363 Hawk v. Thorn, 145 Green v. Horne, 87 Hawn v. Norris, 74 Greenfield v. Blumenthal, 620 Hays v. Hogan, 508 Greenleaf v. Huntingdon & B. T. M. R. Hays v. Younglove, 26 & Coal Co., 845 Hazel-Atlas Glass Company v. Hart-Greenleaf v. Safeway Trails, Inc., 791 ford Empire Co., 689 Gregory v. Woodworth, 244 Heath v. Rydley, 593, 599 Grier v. Ferrant, 802 Heidritter v. Elizabeth Oil-Cloth Co., 178 Grimes v. French, 596, 611 Heiser v. Loomis, 238 Grossman v. United States, 627 Helfer v. Corona Products, 596, 650 Guille v. Swan, 24 Hellams v. Switzer, 778 Gulbenkian v. Gulbenkian, 720 Henderson v. Chaires, 620 Gulf, C. & S. F. R. Co. v. Guin, 513 Hendrickson, In re, 156, 160 Gulf Refining Co. v. Fetschan, 513 Hepburn v. Sewell, 47 Gumperz v. Hofman, 159 Herbert v. Wortendyke, 202 Gunder v. New York Times, 382 Heron v. Gaylor, 297 Gunning v. Cooley, 444 Hersey v. Northern Assur. Co., 78 Gurley v. O'Dwyer, 508 Hess v. Oregon German Baking Co., 500 Guth v. Texas Co., 773 Hess v. Pawloski, 180 Gutowitz v. Pennsylvania R. Co., 861 Heydon and Smith's Case, 30 Guynn v. McDaneld, 159 Hickman v. Taylor, 629, 635, 641, 646 Hicks v. Southwestern Settlement & Hackett v. Hackett, 535 Devel. Corp., 771 Haffner v. First Nat'l Bank of Seiling, Hill v. City Cab & Transfer Co., 542, 228 594 Hagerott v. Adams, 689 Hill v. Hawes, 573 Hague v. Warren, 637 Hill v. S. S. Kresge Co., 244 Himes v. Schmehl, 771 Hahl v. Sugo, 727 Haithcock v. Haithcock, 477 Hines v. Allen, 61 Hall v. Dean, 42 Hodges v. Easton, 512 Hall v. Fearnley, 291 Hoffman v. City of Maysville, 346 Hall v. Pickard, 30 Hoffman v. Knollman, 568 Hall v. Weare, 475 Holiday v. Hicks, 42 Hallock's Estate, In re, 720 Hollingsworth v. General Petroleum Corporation, 747 Halsey v. Carpenter, 265 Hamilton v. Hamilton, 401 Holstun v. Embry, 394

Home Ins. Co. of New York v. Tydal Co., Home Owners' Loan Corp., v. Huffman, 479 Hopkins v. Clark, 433 Hopwood v. Patterson, 286 Horne v. Richards, 100 Houghton v. Myer, 655 Houston v. Sledge, 336 Howe v. M'Kernan, 593, 596, 618, 638 Hower v. Roberts, 491 Hoy v. Hoy, 79 Hudson v. The Wabash Western Ry. Co., Huffstutler v. Louisville Packing Co., Hughes v. Hughes, 433 Hume v. Bowie, 475 Humphreys v. Irvine, 752 Hunter, Appeal of, 361 Hurd v. Case, 626 Hurwitz v. Hurwitz, 577, 723

Imhoff v. Chicago & M. Ry. Co., 493 Indiana Railway Co. v. Maurer, 492 Interchemical Corp. v. Mirabelli, 183 Intermountain Lumber Co. v. Radetsky, 358 International Ladies Garment W. U. v. Donnelly Garment Co., 124 International Photo Recording chines, Inc. v. Microstat Corporation, 716 International Shoe Co. v. State of Washington, 168 Inyo Chemical Co. v. Los Angeles, 580 Irwin v. Taubman, 382 Isham v. Miller, 614 Ivy v. Kekewick, 597, 634

Jack v. Hudnall, 801 Jackson v. Anderson, 42 Jackson v. Hansard, 478 Jackson v. Strong, 714, 716 Jackson v. Williamson, 522 Jackson d. Loux v. Buel, 71 Jackson d. Murray v. Hazen, 74 Jackson d. Saxton v. May, 71 Jacobs v. Vaill, 373 Jasper v. Wabash Ry. Co., 244 Jefferson Standard Life Ins. Co. v. Keeton, 731 Jennings v. Beach, 801 Jennings v. Parr, 124 Jeub v. B/G Foods Inc., 845 Jewell v. Parr, 468

J. H. Day Co. v. Mountain City Milling Co., 635 John Doig's Case, 90 Johnson v. C. & N. W. Sand & Gravel Johnson v. Metropolitan Life Ins. Co., 334 Johnson v. Nichels, 728 Johnson v. Pate, 373 Johnson v. Pensacola & Perdido R. Co., Johnson v. Rudolph, 800 Johnston v. Reily, 561 Jones v. Chapman, 301 Jones v. Dowle, 51 Jones v. Hoar, 100 Jones v. Lofton, 72 Jones v. Puckett, 770 Jones v. Spencer, 442 Jones v. Winsor, 114 Jordahl v. Berry, 137 Jordan v. U. S., 498 J. R. v. M. P., 593

Kasishke v. Baker, 690 Katz Underwear v. United States, 579 Kay Ferer, Inc., v. Hulen, 560 Kearney v. Andrews, 592, 608 Keary v. Mutural Reserve Ass'n, 775 Keay v. Goodwin, 346 Kellems v. California CIO Council, 535 Kelly v. Lett, 23 Kelly-Springfield Tire Co. v. Lotta Miles Tire Co., 635 Kemmish v. McCoid, 433 Kenlee Corp. v. Isolantite, Inc., 16 Kennedy v. Empire State Underwriters of Watertown, 148 Kennedy v. Lamb, 193 Kennon v. Gilmer, 531 Kentucky Natural Gas Corporation v. Duggins, 772 Keokuk & Hamilton Bridge Co. v. Witzel, 277 Kerna v. Trucking, Inc., 762 King v. Boston, 318 King v. Burr, 587, 597 King v. Standish, 600 King v. Williams, 49 Kingsley v. Gilman, 292 Kingsnorth v. Baker, 74 Kirby v. Gilliam, 770 Kirkpatrick v. Parker, 766 Kirschbaum v. Eschmann, 621 Klitzke v. Herm, 647 Kluska v. Yeomans, 248 Kraft v. Smith, 809

Kramer v. Kansas City Power & Light Lowe v. Western Express Co., 182 Lowman & Co. v. Ballard, 154 Co., 251, 363 Lucas v. Gansler, 56 Kramer v. Kister, 502 Luddington v. Goodnow, 238 Kraushaar v. Leschin, 351 Lufkin v. Harvey, 239 Lyman v. U. S., 479 La Bowe v. Balthazor, 404 Lady Shandois v. Simpson, 79 Lytton v. Lytton, 689 Lamb v. Cramer, 682 McAlister v. Clark, 368, 568 Lamb v. Schmitt, 159 McAlpine v. Fidelity & Casualty Co. of Landwehr v. Gillette, 538 Lane v. Thompson, 34 New York, 314 McArthur v. Moffet, 145 Langley v. Metropolitan Life Ins. Co., McBride v. Des Moines City Ry. Co., 495 360 McBryde v. Burnett, 773 Lansing v. M'Killip, 230 McCall v. Price, 794 La Plant v. Implement Dealers Mut. McCaughey v. Schuette, 259, 346 Fire Ins. Co., 647 McClelland v. Climax Hosiery Mills, 370, L. A. Thompson Scenic Ry. Co. v. Young, 655McCown v. Muldrow, 440 Lawe v. Hyde, 368 McCoy v. Moore, 756 Leach v. Rhodes, 239, 255 McCullough v. Cosgrave, 651 Leame v. Bray, 21, 22, 24 McDermott v. Travelers Ins. Co., 747 Leary, Matter of, 398 McDonald v. Mabee, 178 Lee v. Troy Citizens' Gas-Light Co., 245 McDonald v. Metropolitan St. Ry. Co., Leeds Music Corporation v. Jones, 861 Lesh v. Johnston Furniture Co., 580 McDonald v. Pless, 521 Lewis v. Coulter, 292 Macedonia Baptist Church v. City of Libbey-Owens Ford Glass Co. v. Sylvania Industrial Corporation, 568 Columbia, 477 McFarlane v. Ray, 341 Liberty Oil Co. v. Condon National McGanahan v. The East St. Louis and Bank, 738 Lindsey v. Bird, 589, 596, 697 Carondelet Ry. Co., 255 Lineberger v. City of Gastonia, 818 McGovern v. Eckhart, 582 McGuire v. Blount, 74 Little v. Fossett, 31 Little Schuylkill Nav. Ry. & Coal Co. v. McIlvaine Patent Corp., v. Walgreen Co., 476 Richards, 818 Livingston v. Ruff, 259 McIntosh v. Leisk, 579 Local Federal Savings & Loan Ass'n v. Mackay v. Benjamin Franklin Co., 42 Carlock, 832 McKenney v. Minahan, 767 Local Federal Savings & Loan Ass'n v. McKenzie v. L'Amoureux, 863 Stokes, 832 McKinstry v. Pennoyer, 283 Logansport, City of, v. Kihm, 255 McKyring v. Bull, 293 Lombard v. Cowham, 736 McLennan v. Church, 716 Long v. Cassiero, 522 McManus v. Cassidy, 102 Longueville v. Thistleworth, 275 McNulty v. Kuser, 507 Lopez v. Townsend, 803 McPherson v. Klemin, 323 Lord Portarlington v. Soulby, 615 McRal v. Lois Grunow Memorial Clinic, Los Angeles Brush Mfg. Corp. v. James, 720 733 McRanie v. Palmer, 773, 800 Losee v. Krieger, 238 Macurda v. Lewiston Journal Co., 344 Lotan v. Cross, 30 McWhirter v. Otis Elevator Co., 759 Louis E. Bower, Inc. v. Silverstein, 552 Maggs v. Ames, 291 Louisville, H. & St. L. Ry. Co. v. Schwab, Magin v. Lamb, 544, 594 408 Mahoney v. Bostwick, 658 Louisville N. R. Co. v. Paynter's Adm'x, Mails v. Kansas City Public Service Co., Loving v. First Nat. Bank, 152 Maisonnaire v. Keating, 201 Low v. Mumford, 795 Major v. Shaver, 773