

ECOLOGICAL ECONOMICS SERIES

Toward Sustainable Development

An
Ecological Economics
Approach



by
Philip A. Lawn

Toward Sustainable Development

An
Ecological Economics
Approach

by
Philip A. Lawn



LEWIS PUBLISHERS

Boca Raton London New York Washington, D.C.



ISEE

**International
Society for
Ecological
Economics**

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Lawn, Philip A.

Toward sustainable development : an ecological economics approach /

Philip A. Lawn.

p. cm. -- (Ecological economics series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-56670-411-1 (alk. paper)

1. Sustainable development. 2. Environmental economics. I. Title.

II. Ecological economics series (International Society for Ecological Economics)

HD75.6 .L38 2000

338.9'27--dc21

00-039082

This book contains information obtained from authentic and highly regarded sources. Reprinted material is quoted with permission, and sources are indicated. A wide variety of references are listed. Reasonable efforts have been made to publish reliable data and information, but the author and the publisher cannot assume responsibility for the validity of all materials or for the consequences of their use.

Neither this book nor any part may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, microfilming, and recording, or by any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher.

The consent of CRC Press LLC does not extend to copying for general distribution, for promotion, for creating new works, or for resale. Specific permission must be obtained in writing from CRC Press LLC for such copying.

Direct all inquiries to CRC Press LLC, 2000 N.W. Corporate Blvd., Boca Raton, Florida 33431.

Trademark Notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation, without intent to infringe.

© 2001 by CRC Press LLC

Lewis Publishers is an imprint of CRC Press LLC

No claim to original U.S. Government works

International Standard Book Number 1-56670-411-1

Library of Congress Card Number 00-039082

Printed in the United States of America 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

Printed on acid-free paper

Toward Sustainable Development

An
Ecological Economics
Approach

ECOLOGICAL ECONOMICS SERIES

Robert Costanza, *series editor*

Published Titles

An Introduction to Ecological Economics

*Robert Costanza, John Cumberland, Herman Daly,
Robert Goodland, and Richard Norgaard*

Natural Capital and Human Economic Survival, Second Edition

*Thomas Prugh, Robert Costanza, John H. Cumberland, Herman E. Daly,
Robert Goodland, and Richard B. Norgaard*

Privileged Goods: Commoditization and Its Impact on Environment
and Society

Jack P. Manno

Toward Sustainable Development: An Ecological Economics
Approach

Philip Andrew Lawn

Forthcoming Titles

Institutions, Ecosystems, and Sustainability

Robert Costanza, Elinor Ostrom, Bobi Low, and James Wilson

Author

Philip A. Lawn received his Bachelor of Economics in 1991 from the Flinders University of South Australia. Dr. Lawn worked as a tutor at Flinders before embarking on postgraduate studies at Griffith University in Brisbane, Australia. In 1998, he received his Ph.D. in ecological economics and returned to Flinders University to take on a position as a lecturer in environmental and ecological economics.

Dr. Lawn's research interests include the valuation of environmental services, green national accounting, the development of alternative sustainability and welfare indicators, modelling the interaction between economic and environmental systems, and the design of policy instruments and institutional mechanisms to facilitate a transition toward sustainable development. In recent years, he has published a number of articles in the field of ecological economics. He is a member of the International Society for Ecological Economics as well as its Australian and New Zealand branches.

Acknowledgments

This book is the product of a long and continuing intellectual journey that began around 15 years ago. Rarely is a journey undertaken alone or without some guidance and assistance. This journey is no exception. Since this book is a rework of my Ph.D. dissertation, I would like to begin by thanking my Ph.D. supervisors, Aynsley Kellow and John Tisdell, for their constructive comments and advice during my time at Griffith University. I would also like to thank the academic and administrative staff at Griffith University's Faculty of Environmental Sciences and the Office for Research. A Ph.D. scholarship from the Australian Federal Government is also greatly appreciated. Special mention must also be made of the contribution made by Richard Sanders, a fellow Ph.D. student at Griffith University. Not only did Richard help me gather the data I needed for this book, but the book benefited enormously from the many discussions we had over a cup of tea in the Common Room. I also owe a considerable intellectual debt to all my past teachers and the ecological economists who have both educated and inspired me.

Of my past teachers, I, particularly, would like to thank Stewart Fraser, Richard Damania, and Dick Blandy for their contribution during my time as an undergraduate and Honours student at the Flinders University of South Australia. As for the ecological economists from whom I have learnt so much, the contribution from two of them is worthy of special acknowledgment. The first is that of Robert Costanza. Costanza not only offered a number of useful suggestions to incorporate into this book but was wholly responsible for initiating the contact between Lewis Publishers and myself. The second is the contribution from Herman Daly whom I feel I owe my largest intellectual debt. As anyone familiar with Daly's work will soon appreciate, the impact of Daly on my thinking and this book is significant. I would also like to thank Mick Young and Richard Norgaard for making some helpful comments and suggestions on an earlier draft of this book. However, my greatest debt is owed to my friends and family, in particular my father and mother, Graham and Lesley Lawn. Without their love and support, this book would never have been possible.

*“The significant problems we face cannot
be solved at the same level of thinking we
were at when we created them.”*

— *Albert Einstein*

Contents

1	Introduction.....	1
1.1	The aims and objectives of the book.....	1
1.2	What is ecological economics?.....	3
1.3	Epilogue.....	7
I	An ecological economic view of the sustainable development concept	
2	An overview of the sustainable development concept	11
2.1	An examination of a range of sustainable development concepts	11
2.1.1	A brief look at the process that led to the establishment of the sustainable development concept.....	12
2.1.2	An examination of a range of sustainable development definitions.....	14
2.1.3	The perception of continuous growth as a sustainable development prerequisite	17
2.1.4	Hicksian income and a constant stock of capital as a sustainable development condition	18
2.1.5	Conclusion	20
2.2	An ends-means spectrum as the theoretical foundation for a sustainable development concept.....	21
2.2.1	The movement toward sustainable development as the ecological economic problem.....	25
2.2.2	The interdependent relationship between sustainability and development.....	26
3	What is development?.....	29
3.1	Development: a qualitative rather than quantitative phenomenon	29

3.1.1	Development requires intermediate ends to be appropriately ranked and the ultimate end to be appropriately conceived	30
3.1.2	What is the ultimate end?	32
3.1.3	Development requires the ultimate end to be updated suitably	34
3.2	Establishing a development-based rule of right action.....	35
3.2.1	Human existential balance demands an optimal stock of human-made capital	37
3.2.2	A principle of limitation as a development-based rule of right action.....	39
3.2.3	Development requires the maintenance of moral capital.....	40
3.3	What is development? A summary	41
4	What is sustainability?.....	43
4.1	Does sustainability matter?	43
4.1.1	Sustainability and the higher-order moral principle of intergenerational equity	43
4.1.2	Sustainability as a development prerequisite.....	44
4.1.3	What needs to be sustained?	46
4.2	The instrumental source and sink functions of natural capital.....	48
4.2.1	The complementarity of human-made and natural capital — how much natural capital is needed?.....	49
4.2.2	Sustainability requires the maintenance of the ecosphere's negentropic potential.....	52
4.2.3	Establishing guidelines as precepts for operating sustainably.....	55
4.2.3.1	The source function	55
4.2.3.2	The sink function	58
4.2.3.3	Recycling	60
4.2.4	Sustainability precepts to maintain the ecosphere's source and sink functions.....	60
4.3	The instrumental life-support function of natural capital	61
4.3.1	Biodiversity and the life-support function of natural capital	63
4.3.2	Implications of the need to preserve biodiversity	65
4.4	The intrinsic value of natural capital	66
4.4.1	An obligation to preserve the evolutionary process	67
4.4.2	Implications of a biocentric stance	69
4.5	What is sustainability? A summary	70
5	What is sustainable development?.....	71
5.1	Reconciling sustainability and development	71
5.2	Justifying the concept of sustainable development	73

II Sustainable development, economic theory, and macro policy goals and instruments	
6 Sustainable development and an optimal macroeconomic scale	77
6.1 What is an optimal macroeconomic scale?	77
6.1.1 Standard economics' glittering anomaly	78
6.1.2 The uncanceled benefits of economic activity	79
6.1.3 The uncanceled costs of economic activity	81
6.1.4 Sustainable net benefits and an optimal macroeconomic scale	81
6.1.5 Electing to operate at the maximum sustainable macroeconomic scale — when the maximum sustainable scale is the optimal scale	84
6.2 Technological progress and an optimal macroeconomic scale	85
6.2.1 Introducing the ecological economic efficiency (EEE) identity	86
6.2.2 Impact of a beneficial shift of the uncanceled benefits (UB) curve	87
6.2.3 Impact of a beneficial shift of the uncanceled cost (UC) curve	89
6.2.4 Increasing efficiency — not always implying a larger optimal scale	91
6.2.5 Efficiency-increasing and throughput-increasing technological progress	93
6.2.6 The ecological economic efficiency identity — breaking the ecological economic problem into manageable yet interdependent subproblems	94
6.3 Additional aspects of an optimal macroeconomic scale	95
6.3.1 Limits to the beneficial shift of the uncanceled benefits and uncanceled costs curves	95
6.3.2 A sustainability buffer — allowing for uncontrollable fluctuations in the ecosystem's long-run carrying capacity	96
6.3.3 A biocentric versus egocentric optimum	97
7 Economic efficiency and policy goals and instruments	99
7.1 Standard versus ecological economic efficiency	99
7.1.1 Recognising trade-offs that contribute to the movement toward sustainable development	100
7.1.2 Ecological and standard economic efficiency	102
7.2 Macro policy goals and instruments	104
7.2.1 The erroneous belief that an efficient allocation solves the throughput problem	106

7.2.2	Price-determined outcomes and price-influencing decisions — addressing the intermediate macro policy goals in the correct order	110
8	Sustainable development and the role of relative prices	113
8.1	What are the main determinants of relative prices?.....	113
8.2	Relative prices — comparing the standard and ecological economic efficiency contexts.....	115
8.2.1	Low entropy resource prices	115
8.2.1.1	Comparing the standard and ecological economic efficiency contexts.....	116
8.2.1.2	Renewable versus nonrenewable resource reliance.....	120
8.2.2	The relative prices of human-made capital	121
8.2.2.1	Comparing the standard and ecological economic efficiency contexts.....	122
8.2.3	Relative price variations — often reflecting disparate efficiency contexts.....	123
9	Sustainable development and the role of the market	125
9.1	What is a market and what is required for it to operate freely and effectively?	125
9.1.1	Why do markets exist?	126
9.1.2	The virtues of the market — a function of the market's institutional setting.....	127
9.2	The conventional view of the market.....	128
9.2.1	The conventional free market view — falsely positing a conflict between freedom and authority	129
9.2.2	The conventional free market view — falsely positing a natural economic order driven by individual self-interest.....	130
9.3	The propensity for the market to erode its own requirements	132
9.3.1	The tendency for competition to be self-eliminating	132
9.3.2	The tendency for the market to deplete moral capital.....	133
9.3.3	The tendency for the market to deplete its natural capital foundations.....	133
9.3.4	The tendency for the market to fail.....	134
9.4	What is an appropriate market domain?.....	135
9.4.1	Rejecting the economic imperialist and minimalist market positions	135
9.4.2	The evolution of a more appropriate market domain.....	136

III Sustainable development and the co-evolutionary paradigm

10 The neoclassical economic framework as a product of the Newtonian world view	141
10.1 The need to assess the neoclassical paradigm's atomistic-mechanistic foundations.....	141
10.2 Characteristic features of the Newtonian world view and the neoclassical economic paradigm	143
10.2.1 Characteristic features of the Newtonian world view.....	143
10.2.2 The neoclassical economic paradigm as a product of the Newtonian world view	145
10.3 The shortcomings of both the Newtonian world view and the neoclassical economic paradigm	148
10.3.1 The inadequacies of the neoclassical economic paradigm.....	149
10.3.2 Bridging the gap between theory and reality — the need for a paradigm shift	151
11 The development of a co-evolutionary-based conceptual framework	153
11.1 The basic principles underlying a co-evolutionary-based conceptual framework.....	153
11.1.1 What are the basic features of a coevolutionary world view?	153
11.1.2 The global system as one large evolutionary process...	157
11.2 Fundamental aspects of a co-evolutionary-based conceptual framework.....	159
11.2.1 Macro stability and micro chaos — opposing aspects of the principle of self-organisation	159
11.2.2 The principle of co-evolutionary balance.....	160
11.2.2.1 The very short term.....	161
11.2.2.2 The short term.....	162
11.2.2.3 The medium term.....	162
11.2.2.4 The long term	163
11.2.3 The emergence of systemic instability and chaos through bifurcation	164
11.2.3.1 Implications	165
11.2.4 Rapidity and frequency of systemic chaos through bifurcation	165
11.2.4.1 Implications	166
11.2.5 Sources of surprise — risk, uncertainty, and human ignorance	167
11.2.5.1 Risk and uncertainty	167
11.2.5.2 Closed and open ignorance	168
11.2.5.3 Implications	169

11.2.6	Feedback in co-evolutionary processes.....	170
11.2.6.1	Implications	172
11.2.7	Human belief systems as a driving factor in global co-evolutionary processes	173
11.2.7.1	Implications	173
11.2.8	Institutions as the biological equivalent to the gene	174
11.2.9	History matters — chreodic evolutionary pathways	175
11.2.9.1	Implications	175
11.2.10	Path dependency in coevolutionary processes.....	175
11.2.10.1	Implications	176
11.3	Concluding remarks	177
12	The market: a co-evolutionary feedback mechanism	179
12.1	The role of the market in the co-evolutionary process	179
12.1.1	Economic genotypes and phenotypes.....	180
12.1.1.1	The economic macrogenotype.....	180
12.1.1.2	The economic macrophenotype	181
12.1.2	The price-influencing effect of genotypic and phenotypic evolution	182
12.1.2.1	The price-influencing effect of phenotypic evolution.....	182
12.1.2.2	The price-influencing effect of genotypic evolution.....	183
12.1.3	A schematic representation of the co-evolutionary process	184
12.2	The market as a co-evolutionary feedback mechanism	186
12.2.1	Incorporating recursive feedback into the evolutionary economic schema	187
12.2.2	The market as a negative feedback mechanism.....	189
12.2.3	The market as a positive feedback mechanism.....	190
12.3	Further applications of the evolutionary economic schema	192
12.3.1	Human responses to positive feedback effects.....	192
12.3.2	Path-dependency implications for policy implementation	195
12.3.3	Externalities from a co-evolutionary perspective	197
12.4	Concluding remarks	199
IV	Toward sustainable development	
13	Toward sustainable development: a framework for policy setting and national accounting reform.....	203
13.1	Policy setting, national accounting, and the optimal macroeconomic scale	203

13.1.1	The failure of policy — a failure to embrace the notion of an optimal macroeconomic scale.....	203
13.1.2	Co-evolutionary explanations for the perceived growth imperative	204
13.2	A framework for policy setting and national accounting reform.....	206
14	Toward sustainable development: sustainable development indicators	211
14.1	The need for national accounting reform	211
14.2	Reform no. 1: a strong sustainability measure of Hicksian income.....	212
14.2.1	Establishing a strong sustainability measure of Hicksian income	214
14.2.2	A previous attempt at a national measure of Hicksian income	217
14.2.3	Problems with Hicksian income — the need for a sustainable net benefit index	218
14.3	Reform no. 2: a sustainable net benefit index.....	219
14.3.1	Nordhaus and Tobin's measure of economic welfare	219
14.3.2	Zolotas's index of economic aspects of welfare.....	220
14.3.3	Daly and Cobb's index of sustainable economic welfare	221
14.3.4	How useful is the index of sustainable economic welfare?	222
14.3.5	Introducing the sustainable net benefit index.....	224
14.3.6	Account no. 1 — the uncancelled benefit account.....	225
14.3.7	Account no. 2 — the uncancelled cost account.....	229
14.3.8	Calculating the sustainable net benefit index.....	239
14.3.9	Cross-country comparison of the sustainable net benefit index and indexes of sustainable economic welfare	240
14.4	Reform no. 3: a measure of ecological economic efficiency	242
14.4.1	Account no. 3 — the human-made capital account	242
14.4.2	Account no. 4 — the throughput account.....	244
14.4.3	Account no. 5 — the natural capital stock account.....	248
14.4.4	Calculating the ecological economic efficiency (EEE) ratio.....	252
14.4.5	Ratio no. 1 — the service efficiency of human-made capital	252
14.4.6	Ratio no. 2 — the maintenance efficiency of human-made capital	254
14.4.7	Ratio no. 3 — the growth efficiency of natural capital	255

14.4.8	Ratio no. 4 — the exploitative efficiency of natural capital	257
14.5	Reform no. 4: supplementary sustainable development indicators	258
14.5.1	Supplementary development indicators.....	261
14.5.2	Supplementary sustainability indicators	266
14.5.3	Ranking the sustainable development performance of different countries.....	270
15	Toward sustainable development: policy conclusions and prescriptions.....	273
15.1	Structure of the chapter	273
15.2	Policy prescriptions to resolve the macro policy goal of allocative efficiency.....	274
15.2.1	Establishing a set of properly defined property rights.....	274
15.2.1.1	Exclusivity.....	275
15.2.1.2	Transferability.....	277
15.2.1.3	Universality.....	277
15.2.2	Minimising transaction costs.....	277
15.2.2.1	The generation and dissemination of information and knowledge	277
15.2.2.2	Removing unnecessary nonprice rules and regulations.....	278
15.2.2.3	Reducing the cost of contract enforcement	279
15.2.3	Establishing and maintaining the contestability status of markets.....	279
15.2.3.1	Dealing with sunk costs	280
15.2.3.2	Dealing with instances where sunk costs cannot be detached from the utilising firm.....	280
15.2.3.3	Market deregulation and the privatisation of government instrumentalities	281
15.2.4	Labour market and corporate reform	282
15.2.5	Ameliorating externalities.....	284
15.2.5.1	Internalising the user cost of nonrenewable resource depletion.....	286
15.2.5.2	Environmental assurance bonds	287
15.3	Policy prescriptions to resolve the macro policy goal of distributional equity	288
15.3.1	Minimum and maximum levels of income and wealth	288
15.3.1.1	Determining minimum and maximum limits on income.....	289
15.3.1.2	Determining maximum limits on wealth	290

15.3.2	Financing a minimum income	291
15.3.3	Other important redistribution mechanisms	293
15.3.3.1	Contestable markets	293
15.3.3.2	Profit-sharing arrangements.....	293
15.3.3.3	The free and universal entitlement to basic rights and privileges	294
15.4	Policy prescriptions to resolve the macro policy goal of ecological sustainability	294
15.4.1	Tradeable resource exaction permits	294
15.4.2	Setting and policing of environmental guidelines.....	297
15.4.3	Sustainable use of agricultural land.....	297
15.4.4	Preservation and restoration of critical ecosystems	298
15.4.5	Transferable birth licenses.....	299
15.4.6	Immigration.....	300
15.5	Policies to establish and maintain the market's moral capital foundations	301
15.5.1	Minimising the depletion of moral capital through functional property rights and a corporate charter.....	301
15.5.2	The need for functional property rights to incorporate both rigidity and flexibility	302
15.5.3	Re-embedding the macroeconomy into the social and ecological spheres.....	302
15.6	International trade policy	303
15.6.1	The arguments for and against free international trade	303
15.6.2	Policies to gain the sustainable net benefits of international trade	307
15.6.2.1	Restoring comparative advantage by restricting the mobility of financial capital.....	308
15.6.2.2	Facilitating efficiency-increasing rather than standards-lowering competition	310
15.7	Additional policy conclusions and prescriptions.....	312
15.7.1	Facilitating efficiency-increasing technological innovation	312
15.7.2	Discounting.....	313
15.7.3	Central bank control of a nation's money supply	315
15.7.4	Severing the GDP-employment link and the GDP-poverty link	317
15.7.4.1	Severing the GDP-employment link	317
15.7.4.2	Severing the GDP-poverty link	319
15.7.5	International consensus on sustainable development issues	319
15.7.6	A timetable to gradually introduce sustainable development policies	320