# The Capital Needs of Central Banks

Edited by
Sue Milton and Peter Sinclair



First published 2011

by Routledge

2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada

by Routledge

270 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10016

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2011 Selection and editorial matter, Sue Milton and Peter Sinclair; individual chapters, the contributors

Typeset in Times by Wearset Ltd, Boldon, Tyne and Wear

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

The capital needs of central banks/edited by Sue Milton and Peter Sinclair. p. cm.

Consists of papers produced for a conference at the Centre for Central Banking Studies in London, hosted by the Bank of England and concluded

before the events of 2008.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Banks and banking, Central-Congresses. 2. Bank capital-Congresses. 3. Bank management-Congresses. I. Milton, Sue, 1954- II. Sinclair, P.J.N.

HG1811.C37 2010

332.1'1-dc22 2010015658

ISBN: 978-0-415-55328-5 (hbk) ISBN: 978-0-203-84103-7 (ebk)

## **Contributors**

Fabian Amtenbrink is Professor of European Union law at the Erasmus School of Law of the Erasmus University Rotterdam and Visiting Professor at the College of Europe (Bruges). His academic interests include legal issues of (European) economic and monetary integration, as well as institutional and constitutional aspects of EU law. He has published several books and contributed scientific articles in international legal and economics journals and edited volumes on institutional and substantive issues of the EU, as well as on institutional aspects of central banking and financial market regulation. He has presented papers and guest lectures, among others, at the Universities of Oxford and Cambridge, the International Monetary Fund and the Bank of England.

Age Bakker currently is Executive Director at the International Monetary Fund and Professor of Money and Banking at the Vrije Universiteit te Amsterdam. Until 2007, he was Director Financial Markets at De Nederlandsche Bank. Previously he has held various positions at De Nederlandsche Bank and at the IMF (1979–1981). He was actively engaged in preparing the introduction of the euro into the Dutch financial system. His publications range from European monetary cooperation, the international monetary system to the functioning of financial markets. His latest book, edited together with Ingmar van Herpt, was Central Bank Reserve Management (Edward Elgar, 2007).

Alex Cukierman is Professor of Economics at Tel-Aviv University and Research Fellow at the Centre for Economic Policy Research (CEPR). He gained his PhD in Economics at MIT. He is author or co-author of four books and over 100 scientific articles in the areas of macroeconomics, monetary economics, political economy and monetary policy and institutions. In 1998, he was member of a governmental committee appointed to recommend reforms in the 50-year-old Bank of Israel law. He is a former president of the Israeli Economic Association and has been a Research Fellow or a Visiting Professor at many universities across the USA and the EU. In late 2007 he was a visiting research fellow at the ECB. Current work focuses on the global financial crisis and its implications for regulatory reform and central bank policies. Other recent work is on strategic interactions between fiscal policy,

labour market institutions and monetary policy-making institutions in the presence of labour unions, tests and consequences of non-linear Taylor rules, and the impact of the Second World War on redistribution in the USA.

Robin Darbyshire speaks and writes on central bank issues. He is a member of the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales and has been a professional accountant for 30 years, 19 of which he spent at the Bank of England. He was responsible for the Bank's accounts and tax for the majority of this period, during which he was a member of the committee that devised the accounting arrangements for the European System of Central Banks and the European Central Bank. He has worked for the IMF on central bank accounting issues, including implementation of IFRS along with other consultancy work related to central banks. He also has experience outside the central bank sector, in particular of charity accounting, having been the honorary accountant for St Paul's Cathedral Foundation in London for some nine years.

Jan Frait pursued an academic career at the Technical University of Ostrava in the Czech Republic during the first stage of his professional career. In 2002 he was appointed Professor of Economics. In 2002–2003 he also served as the president of the Czech Economics Association. He was appointed member and chief executive director of the Czech National Bank Board for the period 2000–2006. Within the Czech National Bank, he was first responsible for the oversight of payments systems and currency circulation, then for monetary policy. Since 2007 he has been the deputy head of Research and Financial Stability Department of the Czech National Bank. In this capacity, he serves as the head of financial stability and Adviser to the bank board. He also acts as the member of the ECB's Banking Supervision Committee.

Yüksel Görmez studied economics at the Middle East Technical University. He joined the Central Bank of Turkey in 1989. He has been awarded a British Council scholarship in 1994 to have an MBA in Banking and Finance at the University of Exeter, UK. The Central Bank of Turkey awarded him a PhD scholarship in 1998 for the City University Business School, London, UK. He completed his PhD thesis 'Topics in Electronic Money' in 2000. Between April 2000 and September 2000, the Bank of Finland awarded him a research scholarship. After completing his PhD, 'The World Gold Council', London offered him a post-graduate study on digital gold from March 2001 to June 2001. After working at the Markets Department until 2002, he joined the Research Department of the Central Bank of Turkey as an economist. He has been heading the Financial Analysis Division since 2005. His current studies cover the areas of central banking capital adequacy, liquidity operations of central banks, financial market volatilities and monetary analysis. He speaks fluent English and basic German.

Tomáš Holub graduated in economics from the Faculty of Social Sciences, Charles University, Prague, in 1997, where he also gained his PhD in 2001.

He has studied at universities in the USA (Georgetown University) and in the UK (LSE). From 1996 till 2000 he worked as a macroeconomic analyst at Komerčni Banka, Prague, In 2000, he joined the Czech National Bank to become a monetary policy adviser to the former governor. Since May 2004 he has been executive director of the Monetary and Statistics Department of the Czech National Bank. Since 1998, he has lectured on monetary economics and international macroeconomics at Charles University, Prague. He also taught economic policy at the Prague School of Economics between 1997 and 2002. In 2006-2007 he was president of the Czech Economic Society. He publishes articles on monetary policy and macroeconomics in professional journals.

Han van der Hoorn joined the International Monetary Fund in 2009 as a technical assistance adviser, specialising in reserve management and sovereign ALM. Previously, he was a senior economist in the Risk Management Division of the European Central Bank, and held various positions in supervision, and asset and risk management at De Nederlandsche Bank. He started his career at Coopers & Lybrand. He holds degrees in Econometrics from Erasmus University and in Economics from the University of Amsterdam.

Ian Ingram was lately Director Internal Finance at the European Central Bank, with responsibility for the ECB's financial accounting and reporting function and for the coordination of the development of accounting policies and techniques for the ECB and the Eurosystem. He joined the Bank of England from Oxford University in 1966 with a degree in medieval and modern languages, and worked in a wide variety of central banking functions. In 1994 he was appointed Head of the Management Services Division of the newly established European Monetary Institute, with responsibility for the EMI's financial and management accounting functions. He also participated in the preparatory work of the EMI's Working Group on Accounting Issues, which was tasked with the development of proposals for the Eurosystem's accounting framework. In June 1998, on the establishment of the ECB, he was appointed Director Internal Finance, and in 2004 he was appointed Chairman of the Accounting and Monetary Income Committee of the European System of Central Banks, holding both positions until his retirement in March 2009.

J. Ramón Martínez-Resano works for Banco de España where he has dealt from both a practitioner and research perspective with central bank finance and operations as well as with financial stability issues. He is now temporarily serving at the funding department of Spain's Treasury Department.

Sue Milton works in the Bank of England's Centre for Central Banking Studies, where she is an Adviser on central bank governance and is Vice President of Isaca London. She was formerly an IT specialist and holds CGEIT and CISA professional qualifications relating to Information Technology governance and auditing. She also holds a BA degree in business management from the University of London.

Luca Papi is full Professor of Economics at the University of Ancona (Italy). In his previous positions he has been the Director General of the Central Bank of the Republic of San Marino and has served as financial sector specialist in the Governance and Finance Division of the Asian Development Bank (Manila). He has also worked as financial economist in the Financial Sector Development Department of the World Bank (Washington, DC) and as economist in the Research Department of the Bank of Italy (Rome). He has degrees in economics from the University of Bologna (Italy), the University of Glasgow (UK) and holds a PhD in economics from the University of Ancona (Italy). His main research interests focus on banking and financial sector issues.

Peter Sinclair is Professor of Economics at the University of Birmingham's Department of Economics. He moved there from Oxford in 1994, where he had taught for 23 years, and which awarded him his first degree and doctorate. He has also taught as Visiting Professor at UBC and Queen's in Canada, and Witwatersrand in South Africa. His research has been published in numerous academic journals; and with others, or alone, he has written or edited some 15 books on various aspects of economics. At the Bank of England, he has served as director of the Centre for Central Banking Studies, and Houblon Norman research fellow.

Peter Stella is Director of Stellar Consulting LLC (USA). He was formerly an Adviser in the Monetary and Capital Markets Department of the International Monetary Fund. He has held numerous positions in the IMF including Chief of the Central Banking and Monetary and Foreign Exchange Operations Divisions and was the IMF Resident Representative in Bulgaria from 1997 until 2001. He has written numerous papers on the issue of central bank financial strength and on central bank and treasury relations. His current research includes The Federal Reserve System Balance Sheet: What has Happened and Why it Matters and Varieties of Central Bank Recapitalization Experience. Dr Stella received his PhD in economics from Stanford University.

Leonard Zwikker holds a Master's degree in Applied Mathematics from the University of Twente. From 1997 to 2003, he worked as a quantitative analyst in the Financial Engineering Team on the trading floors of Rabobank in London. At the time of the ALM study presented in this book, he was employed as a senior consultant by Cardano in Rotterdam, responsible for financial modelling and IT. In 2008 he founded his own company with the name Valu8, specialising in risk management consultancy and the independent valuation of derivative contracts.

# Acknowledgements

Sue Milton and Peter Sinclair would like to thank the support from colleagues around the world.

#### From the Bank of England:

We very much appreciate the detailed and numerous comments on this volume that were sent to us by the large group of scrutineers and experts at the Bank of England, many of whom wish to remain anonymous. We also thank Professor Mario I Bléjer, whose idea this book was when he was Director of the Bank of England's Centre for Central Banking Studies. For their valuable advice, we are grateful to Roger Clews, Gill Hammond, Chris Shadforth, Andrew Wardlow and Peter Westaway. We thank the staff of the Information Centre and our Research Assistant, Joyce Chan, who worked so hard finding, compiling and checking data for us. For advice and editorial support, our thanks to Shaheen Bhikhu, Emily Bramwell, Maria Fitzpatrick, Sarah Pegg and especially to Hansa Shah for her administrative support.

#### Abroad:

We also thank, most warmly, Don Kohn, the immediate former Vice Chairman of the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, and Wolfgang Schill and Jean-Pierre Vidal, senior officials at the European Central Bank. We thank colleagues in other central banks who kindly co-ordinated the verification of the affiliations data we had collected about them. In addition to those from the Bank of Canada and Central Bank of Turkey, and others who also asked to remain anonymous, these include:

Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas: Antonio B. Cintura, Elnora G. Deus and Ernando S. De Leon; Bank Indonesia: Anni V. L. Herman, Budiman Kostaman, Eko Ariantoro, Gusti Raizal Putra and Netri Yunera Prijono; Bank Negara Malaysia: Fauziah Selamat and Noorzaidah Abu Bakar; Bank of Italy: Maria Dolores Di Baia, Roberto Festa and Francesco Zollino; Bank of Thailand: Arunrat Ngamjaruspong and the Data Management Department; Bank of the Republic (Colombia): Gloria A Masmela Alonso, Fernando Díaz del Castillo Albán and Hernando Herrera Vargas; Central Bank of Brazil: Eduardo Fernandes; Central Bank of

#### xviii Acknowledgements

Chile: Alejandra Rozas and Carla Cruces; Central Bank of Iceland: Stefán Jóhann Stefánsson; Central Bank of the Republic of China (Taiwan): I-Ching Lee, Tzung-Ta Yen and Yeo-Ru Tsai; Central Bank of the Republic of San Marino: Luca Chiaruzzi; Central Bank of the Russian Federation: Olga Girenko; Central Reserve Bank of Peru: Jorge Luis Morales, Jose Rocca, Mario Mesía and Susana Ishisaka; Czech National Bank: Monika Peterková and Tomáš Holub; Deutsche Bundesbank: Ute Nixdorff; European Central Bank: Dijana Zivanovic and Wiktor Krzyżanowski; Federal Reserve Board: Steve Malphrus; Monetary Authority of Singapore: Ng Yi Ping; National Bank of Romania: Anna Prodescu and Mirela Roman; National Bank of Serbia: Bojana Drobnjak, Nikola Bajovic and Lidija Milosavljević; Netherlands Bank: Jan Berndsen and Martine Voortman; Reserve Bank of India: Meera Bharathan and R. Sathish Soyza; Reserve Bank of New Zealand: Clive Thorp; Sveriges Riksbank: Maria Wahl and Mira Barkå.

We also thank other colleagues for supplying information and editorial support: Deepak Lalwani, Astaire & Partners Limited; Adele Linderholm, freelance editor; Dr Bojan Markovic, Vice Governor, National Bank of Serbia; and Dr Thomas Renström, University of Durham.

# **Abbreviations**

€ euro

ALM asset liability management
BCCR Banco Central de Costa Rica
BIS Bank of International Settlements

BoJ Bank of Japan BOJam Bank of Jamaica CB central bank

CBCA central bank capital adequacy
CBGA Central Bank Gold Agreement
CBI central bank independence
CBL Central Bank of Liberia
CDs Certificates of Deposit

CEPR Centre for Economic Policy Research

CNB Czech National Bank democratic accountability DA DNB De Nederlandsche Bank EC **European Commission ECB** European Central Bank **EMBI Emerging Market Bond Index EMI** European Monetary Institute Economic and Monetary Union **EMU ESCB** European System of Central Banks

EU European Union GB government bonds

GFECRA Gold and Foreign Exchange Contingency Reserve Account

GDP gross domestic product

IFRS International Financial Reporting Standards

IFS International Financial Statistics
IMF International Monetary Fund
MRO main refinancing operation
NBH National Bank of Hungary
NCBs national central banks

OIN other items net

### xx Abbreviations

OMOs open market operations

P&L profit and loss

RBI Reserve Bank of India

SARB South African Reserve Bank
SDR Special Drawing Rights
SOMA system open market account
TCMB Central Bank of Turkey

VaR Value-at-Risk

WB World Bank

# **Contents**

	List of figures	xi
	List of tables	xii
	Notes on contributors	xiii
	Acknowledgements	xvii
	List of abbreviations	xix
1	Central banks' capital: an introduction	1
	PETER SINCLAIR AND SUE MILTON	
2	Central bank finances and independence: how much capital	
	should a central bank have?	33
	ALEX CUKIERMAN	
3	Central bank financial strength and macroeconomic policy	
	performance	47
	PETER STELLA	
4	Financing the central bank: capital adequacy and financial	
	independence – an accountant's perspective	69
	ROBIN DARBYSHIRE	
5	Securing financial independence in the legal basis of a central bank	83
	FABIAN AMTENBRINK	
6	Central bank capital adequacy for central banks with or	
	without a monetary policy	96
	LUCA PAPI	

## x Contents

7	Exchange rate appreciation and negative central bank capital:	
	is there a problem?	107
	JAN FRAIT AND TOMÁŠ HOLUB	
8	Central bank losses, electronic money and contestable	
	central banking	132
	YÜKSEL GÖRMEZ	
9	Funding models for central banks: the European Central	
	Bank – a special case?	145
	IAN INGRAM	
10	Central bank funding models and their risk-return profile	169
	J. RAMÓN MARTÍNEZ-RESANO	
11	How ALM techniques can help central banks	184
	AGE BAKKER, HAN VAN DER HOORN AND	
	LEONARD ZWIKKER	
	Index	199

# **Figures**

3.1	The impact of volatility on the probability of a recapitalization	51
3.2	Other items net to total assets, 1992	58
3.3	Other items net to total assets, 1997	59
3.4	Other items net to total assets, 2002	59
3.5	Other items net to total assets, 2005 versus 1992	60
7.1	World exchange reserves	108
7.2	Break down of the CNB's profits and losses	116
7.3	Simulation of the CNB's capital	119
7.4	Phase diagram of a central bank's 'capital ratio'	122
7.a.1	Foreign exchange reserves and nominal exchange rate against	
	US\$ or euro	128
8.1	Spectrum of cover	137
10.1	Costa Rica Central Bank: ratio of losses to monetary base	178
11.1	Evolution of capital and reserves	191
11.2	Base model versus FX hedged model	193
113	Rase model versus new dividend policy model	104

# **Tables**

1.1	Relative interest rates in basis points	14-15
1.2	Regression results	16
1.a.1	Appendix: the data	23–8
3.1	United States: consolidated Federal Reserve System selected	
	balance sheet and profit and loss accounts	52
3.2	Bank of Canada	53
3.3	European Central Bank	54
3.4	Inflation performance and financial strength	61
4.1	Hypothetical central bank balance sheet	73
4.2	Central bank balance sheet analysis by function	74
4.3	Central bank income statement by function	75
6.1	Factors affecting central bank capital	101
7.1	Factors behind the CNB's profits and losses	114
7.2	Selected indicators as ratio to currency	118
7.a.1	Selected indicators as ratio to currency or total assets	126
7.a.2	Exchange reserves relative to various variables	127
8.1	Core balance sheet	134
8.2	Bank of Turkey profit and loss accounts, main items	140
9.1	Net equity of the ESCB, end 2004	155
9.2	Equity/asset ratios of the ESCB, end 2004	155
9.3	Simplified balance sheet of the ECB 2003–2008	157
9.4	ECB's profit and loss account 2001–2008	158
9.5	NCBs' income from the ECB	159
11.1	Stylized DNB balance sheet	187
11.2	Key parameters of the ALM model	188
11.3	Results for hedged FX exposure	193
11.4	Results for new dividend policy	195

# 1 Central banks' capital

## An introduction

Peter Sinclair and Sue Milton<sup>1</sup>

#### 1 Introduction

How much capital does the central bank need? What contingencies does it need capital for, and why? What determines the size of its income flow, and the uncertainty that surrounds it? What proportion of the profits – or the losses – should be received (or borne) by the bank itself? Can central banks survive with negative capital?

These are pressing questions, and never more so than in the financial turbulence that has swamped the world in 2008 and 2009; recent research highlights the critical role of balance sheet effects on private sector financial institutions,<sup>2</sup> and prompts one to wonder about central bank balance sheets in this context too.

However, this volume is not concerned with the crisis that emerged in 2008. Instead, it aims to provide a comprehensive and historical analysis of the issues of central bank capital and of the questions posed above. The book that we are introducing here consists of papers produced for a conference at the Centre for Central Banking Studies in London, hosted by the Bank of England and concluded before the events of 2008. It encompasses a wide and impressive range of international experts. Some are accountants, others legal professionals, and yet others bring specialized economic knowledge to the issues. They all have current or recent central banking experience, with distinguished service for, or respected links with, no less than nine central banking institutions around the world.

After this introduction, the present chapter offers seven further sections. Section 2 probes lessons from the history of the central bank. In Section 3 we present three views about its need for capital: that it is irrelevant, that we can derive it from first principles and that we can learn about it from evidence. After concluding that the irrelevance view is erroneous, we proceed to explore the second view in Section 4, and judge it appealing in general but very hard to apply. Section 5 presents and examines evidence about the capital of 39 central banks, both at or soon after their foundation, and in 2007, as well as a range of other relevant data.

The 2007 statistics reveal enormous and bewildering variation here. These result from the patterns of shocks and drifts, and occasional recapitalizations. But our data for banks' capital at inception permit us to say something much

more concrete. The capital with which a central bank starts out is best expressed as a ratio to annual national income; this ratio declines as real national income rises, with an elasticity of almost one-third; the ratio tends to drift downward; it is higher for currency board central banks, central banks founded before 1900 and those with a particular credibility-building need, or fresh memories of national war with neighbours, but lower in countries well endowed with oil, or recently regaining autonomy from a foreign power. After Section 6, which provides some important qualifications, we then pick out, in Section 7, some of the main features and findings of the ten chapters that follow, and conclude briefly with some questions in Section 8.

#### 2 The lessons from history: the genesis of the central bank

When money was mostly specie, and banks only rented out safety deposit facilities, all the state needed was a mint. And all the country needed was a state that forswore temptations to debase its coins.

Two novelties were to change that. One was paper money. The other was the fractional reserve. Both offered the prospect of great savings on real resources. But both had their dark side. Debasing paper was a much easier trick to keep playing on holders, than shrinking or clipping the little discs of silver or gold. And the retail bank would work fine, so long as numerous depositors never sought to liquidate at the same time. You could never say "Don't liquidate"; so a bank was a living violation of the categorical imperative, "Never do what would be harmful if everyone did it". The bank was a test of the law of large numbers, a gamble that correlations would stay imperfect in that dimension, as in others. But, unlike a pyramid scheme, at least the gamble would not depend on business growing indefinitely!

But how to reap the benefits of paper money, while safeguarding the currency's buying power in goods? How to keep banks stable, while harvesting the gains – and not the risks – from all the extra credit that should flow?

Both novelties spread slowly. So it took much time for the opportunities and the threats they posed to be perceived. Many well meant but rather uncompelling answers appeared. Ban usury, for example. Regulate and restrict trade through fairs. Conjoin the monopoly rights to trade and its finance, and sell them to the highest bidder or — worse — grant them to a key political ally or court favourite. As the great debaucher of currency was war, simply keep the peace.

Eventually, and more by accident, or trial and error, than design, a better idea suggested itself. This was the central bank. It would be at arm's length from the treasury; sometimes a formal part of the state's machinery, and sometimes not; but always founded with some official imprimatur. It would act as banker to the state. It would arrange its loans as needed. It would usually come to hold its reserves safe from the fingers of less altruistic politicians. It would steer a politic middle course between the Banking School and the Currency School,<sup>4</sup> and thus serve the needs of trade for cash and credit, but also sedulously aim to prevent runaway inflation. It might lend to others in emergency, while aiming to guard

the banks from the possible turpitude, or folly, of some of its commercial and merchant bankers.

In due course every central bank would have some of these functions, and some would have all. To provide these services, the institution must be remunerated. But how? Where will it get its income from, and how much does it need? Equally important, when we move from flows to stocks, how much capital should the central bank have?

The present volume is concerned with the question of the central bank's financing arrangements - both what they are in practice, and also what they should be - and above all with its capital base. If Basel rules have enjoined commercial banks to adhere to a minimum 8 per cent capital rule, why not central banks too? Should they not lead by example? Or as Cukierman suggests at the start of his chapter in this volume, are central banks so different from commercial banks that that answer is naive and inappropriate? If so, why?

Three different viewpoints can be discerned on the issue of how much capital a central bank should have. One is that it is an irrelevance, at least for a central bank wholly owned by the state. The second is that one should be able to derive the result from first principles. And the third is that we should inspect evidence, and infer that financing arrangements for central banks are "correct", at least on average. We shall discuss each in turn, beginning with the first.

#### 3 Examining the case for thinking that central bank capital is irrelevant

Start with the first view. One argument in favour of this runs as follows. Really no department of central government has "capital" as an accounting entity, in the sense of a credit item, notional or real, that is added to the total for its liabilities to match the (higher) value of its assets. This is for the good reason that the state's liabilities are not normally disaggregated by department. Assets, possibly. But liabilities are usually pooled. Most general government bonds have no specific departmental tag attached to them. And if they do, the tag is rather arbitrary. Flows of departmental revenue and outgoings are the norm: but there is generally little, if anything, about the stocks. Income and expenditure statements, yes,5 balance sheets, no.

But there is a counterargument to this: even when fully state owned, as nearly all now are, the central bank is not quite a department of government. A closer parallel for the central bank would be with a nationalized industry. And nationalized industries do keep full accounts, which are not just mere records of flows of income and expenditure. Furthermore, nationalized industries do have capital in the sense that accountants use the term, even if its definitions are apt to be imprecise and often idiosyncratic in practice.

The main reason those definitions are rather woolly is that the real capital of the state-owned central bank - what Bagehot would have called efficient capital as opposed to dignified capital - is the government's power to levy taxes. Extra tax revenue could then make good any loss the central bank might incur. A small