INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION LAW LIBRARY



EDITED BY LOUKAS A. MISTELIS & STAVROS L. BREKOULAKIS



KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

Arbitrability

International & Comparative Perspectives

Edited by

Loukas A. Mistelis & Stavros L. Brekoulakis



Published by:
Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc. 7201 McKinney Circle Frederick, MD 21704 United States of America

Email: customer.care@aspenpubl.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by: Turpin Distribution Services Ltd. Stratton Business Park Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ United Kingdom

Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-2730-3

© 2009 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands; chapter 10 © 2008 William W. Park

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed in Great Britain.

Arbitrability

International Arbitration Law Library

Series Editor Dr. Julian D.M. Lew QC

In the series *International Arbitration Law Library* this book, *Arbitrability: International & Comparative Perspectives* is the Nineteenth title

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume

FOREWORD

Since the introduction of the New York Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards in 1958, a great deal has been achieved towards the creation of uniform rules and practices relating to international arbitration. There were some areas, however, where uniformity was impossible or, indeed undesired, to achieve, and were reserved for the domain of national laws: most prominently, public policy, mandatory rules and arbitrability. All three topics have received significant attention by scholarly writing, arbitral and judicial practice. One can nowadays safely argue that as far as public policy and mandatory rules of law are concerned, certain international and even transnational standards have been developed and are in the meantime widely accepted.

This is not the case with arbitrability where, despite significant debate, the focus is on national laws and national practices. Arbitrability is a multi-facetted and multi-purpose concept which despite national origins has an international dynamic. It defines the classes of disputes that *may* be removed from the scope of arbitral reference and be placed at the exclusive jurisdiction of given national courts. This does not automatically imply that an arbitration tribunal will be barred from determining whether a particular issue can be adjudicated in arbitration. In other words, national laws typically retain for national courts the determination of limited legal rights; such a jurisdictional retention, however, would not cover all disputes arising out of these rights. It is unclear to what extent one could argue that even in the context of arbitrability there are certain international and even transnational standards.

Several questions relating to arbitrability are pertinent and are explored in this book. More specifically, the book discusses first the notions and rationale of arbitrability in international arbitration, as well as the laws applicable to the issue of arbitrability (Part I), and second, specific national and international substantive rules on arbitrability (Part II).

This volume originates from a conference organised by the Hellenic Arbitration Initiative, the Greek chapter of the alumni of the School of International Arbitration, in September 2005. Seven of the sixteen chapters in this volume were originally presented at the 2005 conference. As these papers were finalised, we thought we had to expand the collection of contributions by inviting leading academics and practitioners from Europe and the United States to write on the arbitrability and addressing aspects of the topic not encompassed by the Athens conference.

We owe a number of debts. First, to our authors: this book could not have been published without the generosity of the contributors who enthusiastically gave their time to prepare their contributions. Second, to the Hellenic Arbitration Initiative: for organising the arbitrability conference and for inviting us and the other speakers to contribute. Third, to John Ribeiro who has assisted with the technical and linguistic editing of this volume.

As always, it has been a pleasure to work with Kluwer Law International.Our publishers, Eleanor Taylor and Vincent Verschoor, have shown patience as deadlines have passed. Their encouragement and support are much appreciated.

Loukas A Mistelis Clive M Schmitthoff Professor of Transpational Law and Arbitration

Stavros L. Brekoulakis Lecturer in International Dispute Resolution

20 DECEMBER 2008

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

INSTITUTIONS, ORGANIZATIONS, RULES AND JOURNALS

AAA American Arbitration Association

ABA American Bar Association

AC Law Reports, House of Lords (Appeal Cases)
ADRLJ Arbitration and Dispute Resolution Law

Journal

Akron L. Rev. Akron Law Review
Alb. L. Rev Albany Law Review
ALI American Law Institute
All ER All England Law Reports

Am. J. Comp. L. American Journal of Comparative Law
Am. J. Int'l L. American Journal of International Law

Am. Rev. Int'l Arb.

American Review of International Arbitration

Ann IDI

Annuaire de l'Institut de droit international

Ann. Rev. Banking L. Annual Review of Banking Law

Arab L. Q. Arab Law Quarterly

Arb. Int'l Arbitration International

Arbitration (Arb.) Arbitration, Journal of the Chartered Institute

of Arbitrators

ASA Swiss Arbitration Association

ASA Bulletin Swiss Arbitration Association Bulletin

Asian DR Asian Dispute Review

L Mistelis & S Brekoulakis (eds), Arbitrability: International & Comparative Perspectives, xvii - xxiv © 2009 Kluwer Law International. Printed in the Netherlands

Asian Pacific Law Review Asian Pac. L. Rev.

Arrêts du Tribunal Fédéral Suisse ATF BC L. Rev. Boston College Law Review

Berkeley Journal of Employment and Labor Berkeley J. Emp. & Lab. L.

Law

Berkeley J. Int'l L Berkeley Journal of International Law

Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch (German Civil Code) **BGB**

Entscheidungen des schweizerischen **BGE**

Bundesgerichts

Sammlung der Entscheidungen des **BGHZ**

Bundesgerichtshofs in Zivilsachen

BIT Bilateral Investment Treaty

Brook, J. Int'l L. Brooklyn Journal of International Law

BU Int'l L. J. Boston University International Law Journal

Boston University Law Review BULR

BYIL British Yearbook of International Law BYU L. Rev. Brigham Young University Law Review

CA Court of Appeal

Cardozo Law Review Cardozo L. Rev.

Cass. Civ. Cour de cassation (civil chamber)

Cass. Com. Cour de cassation (Chambre commerciale et

financière)

CCCode civil, codice civile, civil code Centre for Commercial Law Studies **CCLS**

CCP Code of Civil Procedure

China International Economic and Trade CIETAC

Arbitration Commission

CISG United Nations Convention on the

International Sale Goods

CLR Commonwealth Law Reports Clunet Journal de droit international

Columbia J. Transnat'l L. Columbia Journal of Transnational Law

Con. LR Construction Law Reports

xviii

Cornell Int'l L.J. Cornell International Law Journal

CPR Civil Procedure Rules (England)

CRCICA Cairo Regional Centre For International

Commercial Arbitration

DIS Deutsche Institution für Schiedsgerichtsbarkeit

Disp. Res. J. Dispute Resolution Journal

Duke L. J. Duke Law Journal

EAA English Arbitration Act

EC European Community

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECJ Court of Justice of the European Communities
ECR Report of Cases before the Court of Justice of

the European Communities

EDNY Eastern District of New York

EEC European Economic Community
EHRR European Human Rights Reports
EHRR European Human Rights Reports

Electronic J. Comp. L. Electronic Journal of Comparative Law

ER English Reports
EU European Union

EWCA Civ Neutral citation for England and Wales Court

of Appeal civil division decisions

EWHC High Court of England and Wales
F 2d The Federal Reporter Second Series
F 3d The Federal Reporter Third Series

F Supp Federal Supplement

FAA United States Federal Arbitration Act

FS Festschrift

FSR Fleet Street Reports

Ga. J. Int'l & Comp. L. Georgia Journal of International and

Comparative Law

Gaz. Pal. Gazette du Palais

Geo. Wash. J Int'l L. & Eco. George Washington University Journal of

International Law and Economics

Hague Yearbook of Int'l L. Hague Yearbook of International Law

Hastings Int'l & Comp. L. Hastings International and Comparative Law

Rev. Review

HKHC Hong Kong High Court

HKIAC Hong Kong International Arbitration Centre

HL House of Lords

IBA International Bar Association

IBA Rules on the taking of Evidence in

International Commercial Arbitration, 1999

ICC International Chamber of Commerce
ICC Bulletin International Chamber of Commerce

International Court of Arbitration Bulletin

ICCA International Council for Commercial

Arbitration

ICDR American Arbitration Association

International Center for Dispute Resolution

ICL Rev. International Construction Law Review

ICLQ International and Comparative Law Quarterly.

ICSID International Centre for the Settlement of

Investment Disputes

ICSID Rev-FILJ ICSID Review – Foreign Investment Law

Journal

IECL International Encyclopaedia of Comparative

Law

IFCAI International Federation of Commercial

Arbitration Institutions

ILAInternational Law AssociationILMInternational Legal MaterialsILRInternational Law Reports

InsO InsolvenzOrdnung

Int'l ALR International Arbitration Law Review

Int'l Bus. Law. International Business Lawyer

XX

Int'l Law International Lawyer

IPRax Praxis des internationalen Privat- und

Verfahrensrechts

Iran-US CTR Iran-US Claims Tribunal Reports

IStR Internationales Steuerrecht – Zeitschrift für

europäische und internationale Steuer- und

Wirtschaftsberatung

J. Am. Arb.

Journal of American Arbitration

J. Disp. Res.

Journal on Dispute Resolution

J. Int'l Arb. Journal of International Arbitration.

J. Pat. Off. Soc'y Journal of the Patent and Trademark Office

Society

J. Trans'l. Law & Policy Journal of Transnational Law & Policy

JBL Journal of Business Law

JCAA Japan Commercial Arbitration Association
Law & Policy in Int'l Bus.
LCIA Law & Policy in International Business
LCIA London Court of International Arbitration

Lewis & Clark L. Rev. Lewis & Clark Law Review
LGDJ Librairie Générale de Droit et de

Jurisprudence

Lloyd's Rep. Lloyd's Law Reports

LNTS League of Nations Treaty Series

Louisiana L. Rev Louisiana Law Review

Loy. LA Int'l. & Comp. L.J. Loyola Los Angeles International and

Comparative Law Journal

Managing IP Managing Intellectual Property

Mealey's IAR Mealey's International Arbitration Reports

Miami L. Rev. Miami Law Review

Michigan J. Int'l L. Michigan Journal of International Law

Minn. L. Rev. Minnesota Law Review

Model Law UNCITRAL Model Law on International

Commercial Arbitration adopted 21 June 1985

MR Master of the Rolls

NC J. Int'l L. & Com. Reg. North Carolina Journal of International Law

and Commercial Regulation

NCPC French Code of Civil Procedure (Nouveau

Code de Procedure Civile)

New York Convention 1958 New York Convention on the

Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign

Arbitral Awards

NILR Netherlands International Law Review

NW. J. Int'l L. & Bus. Northwestern Journal of International Law &

Business

NY New York

NY. L. Sch. J. Int'l & Comp. New York Law School Journal of

L. International and Comparative Law

NYAD New York Appellate Division

NYLJ New York Law Journal
NZLR New Zealand Law Review

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and

Development

Ohio St. J. Disp. Res. Ohio State Journal on Dispute Resolution

OJ Official Journal of the European Communities

OLG Oberlandesgericht

PC Privy Council

PCA Permanent Court of Arbitration (The Hague)

PECL Principles of European Contract Law

Pepperdine Disp. Res. L.J. Pepperdine Dispute Resolution Law Journal

PILA (Swiss) Private International Law

OBD Oueen's Bench Division

RCADI Recueil des Cours de l'Académie de Droit

International de la Haye / Collected Courses of

the Hague Academy of International Law

RCJB Revue Critique de Jurisprudence Belge

RDAI/IBLJ Revue de droit des affaires internationales /

International Business Law Journal

Rep Report

xxii

Rev. Arb. Revue de l'arbitrage

Rev. Brasileira Arb. Revista Brasileira de Arbitragem

Rev. Crit. Dip. Revue critique de droit international privé

Rome Convention EC (Rome) Convention on the Law

Applicable to Contractual Obligations 1980

S Ct Supreme Court

S. Tex. L. Rev. South Texas Law Review

SCC Stockholm Chamber of Commerce Arbitration

Institute

SchiedsVZ Zeitschrift für Schiedsverfahren – German

Arbitration Law Journal

SDNY Southern District of New York

SIA School of International Arbitration, Queen

Mary University of London

SIAC Singapore International Arbitration Centre

Stanford J. Int'l L. Stanford Journal of International Law

Stockholm Int'l Arb. Rev. Stockholm International Arbitration Review

Suffolk U. L. Rev. Suffolk University Law Review

Syracuse L. Rev. Syracuse Law Review
Tex. L. Rev. Texas Law Review

Texas Int'l L.J. Texas International Law Journal
Tul. Int'l & Comp. L. Tulane Journal of International and

Comparative Law

Tul. L. Rev. Tulane Law Review

Tul. Mar. L.J.

Tulane Maritime Law Journal
Tulsa J. Comp. & Int'l L.

Tulsa Journal of Comparative and

International Law

U. Cin. L. Rev. University of Cincinnati Law Review
U. Ill. L. Rev. University of Illinois Law Review

UKHL United Kingdom House of Lords Decisions
UKPC Neutral citation for decisions of the Privy

Council

UNCITRAL United Nations Commission for International

Trade Law

UNCITRAL Notes UNCITRAL Notes on Organizing Arbitral

Proceedings

UNIDROIT International Institute for the Unification of

Private Law

Unif L. Rev. Uniform Law Review

UNTS United Nations Treaty Series

Va. J. Int'l L. Virginia Journal of International Law

Va. L. Rev Virginia Law Review

Vand. J. Transnat'l L. Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law

Vanderbilt L. Rev. Vanderbilt Law Review

Vienna Austrian Federal Economic Chamber in

Vienna

WAMR World Arbitration and Mediation Report

Washington Convention Washington Convention on the Settlement of

Investment Disputes between States and

Nationals of other States 1965

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organisation

WIPO Expedited Rules WIPO Expedited Rules

WL Westlaw

WLR The Weekly Law Reports

WTAM World Trade and Arbitration Materials

Yale LJ Yale Law Journal

YBCA Yearbook of Commercial Arbitration
YJIL Yale Journal of International Law

ZPO German Code of Civil Procedure (ZPO)

PART I FUNDAMENTAL OBSERVATIONS AND APPLICABLE LAW

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	V
Table Contents	vii
Table of Abbreviations	xvii
PART I: FUNDAMENTAL OBSERVATIONS AND APPLICABLE LAW	
Chapter 1	
Arbitrability – International and Comparative Perspectives.	4
Is Arbitrability a National or an International Law Issue? Loukas A. Mistelis	1
1. Introduction	1
2. The Notion and Rationale of Arbitrability	3
2.1. The Notion(s) of Arbitrability	5 8
2.2. The Rationale of Arbitrability	9
3. Law Applicable to the Issue of Arbitrability 4. National and International Substantive Rules of Arbitrability	15
4. National and international Substantive Rules of Arbitrability	13
Chapter 2	
On Arbitrability: Persisting Misconceptions And New Areas Of Concern Stavros L. Brekoulakis	19
1. Introduction	19
2. The Rationale behind Inarbitrability	21
2.1. The Limited Polevance of Public Policy	21

L Mistelis & S Brekoulakis (eds), Arbitrability: International & Comparative Perspectives, vii-xv © 2009 Kluwer Law International. Printed in the Netherlands