A M E R I C A N C A S E B O O K S E R I E S

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONALISM CASES AND MATERIALS

Second Edition

Norman Dorsen, Michel Rosenfeld, András Sajó, Susanne Baer

WEST

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONALISM CASES AND MATERIALS

Second Edition

Norman Dorsen
Frederick I. and Grace A. Stokes Professor of Law
and Founding Director, Hauser Global Law School Program
New York University School of Law

Michel Rosenfeld
Justice Sidney L. Robins Professor of Human Rights
Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law
and President Energy
International Association of Constant Dual Law

András Sajo University Professor Central European University, Budapest

Susanne Baer

Professor of Public Law and Gender Studies Faculty of Law, Humboldt University, Berlin and James W. Cook Global Law Professor University of Michigan Law School

AMERICAN CASEBOOK SERIES®

WEST®

A Thomson Reuters business

Thomson Reuters created this publication to provide you with accurate and authoritative information concerning the subject matter covered. However, this publication was not necessarily prepared by persons licensed to practice law in a particular jurisdiction. Thomson Reuters does not render legal or other professional advice, and this publication is not a substitute for the advice of an attorney. If you require legal or other expert advice, you should seek the services of a competent attorney or other professional.

American Casebook Series is a trademark registered in the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.

© West, a Thomson business, 2003
© 2010 Thomson Reuters
610 Opperman Drive
St. Paul, MN 55123
1-800-313-9378
Printed in the United States of America

ISBN: 978-0-314-17946-3

West's Law School Advisory Board

JESSE H. CHOPER

Professor of Law and Dean Emeritus, University of California, Berkeley

JOSHUA DRESSLER

Professor of Law, Michael E. Moritz College of Law, The Ohio State University

YALE KAMISAR

Professor of Law, University of San Diego Professor of Law Emeritus, University of Michigan

MARY KAY KANE

Professor of Law, Chancellor and Dean Emeritus, University of California, Hastings College of the Law

LARRY D. KRAMER

Dean and Professor of Law, Stanford Law School

JONATHAN R. MACEY

Professor of Law, Yale Law School

ARTHUR R. MILLER

University Professor, New York University Formerly Bruce Bromley Professor of Law, Harvard University

GRANT S. NELSON

Professor of Law, Pepperdine University Professor of Law Emeritus, University of California, Los Angeles

A. BENJAMIN SPENCER

Professor of Law, Washington & Lee University School of Law

JAMES J. WHITE

Professor of Law, University of Michigan

Preface to the Second Edition

The circumstances and trends that prompted us to prepare the first edition of this book—the vast increase in international movements of people, capital, goods, ideas and information, and the further particularization of human rights—have continued and indeed intensified. There are now more law courses devoted to comparative constitutionalism, more academics entering the field, more scholarly conferences and writing on the subject, and, above all, there is a broader sense of its importance. Further, the *International Journal of Constitutional Law* (I·CON), launched in 2003 after four years of gestation, now provides a needed forum for the exchange of ideas about constitutional law worldwide.

The world we live in is violent and often seems utterly mad. But this does not lessen—indeed, it intensifies—the need for rational governance among nations, including the nurturing of a rule of law that both restrains and liberates the instincts of men and women that are reflected in their governments. Much as the perfect riposte to the notorious Nazi slogan, "I reach for my gun whenever I hear the word 'culture" was "I reach for my culture whenever I hear the word 'gun'," so is the development and dispersion of wise constitutional principles an excellent antidote to the forces of destabilization and conflict.

We have seen that the path of comparative constitutionalism is not always smooth. For example, there is controversy over the degree to which national courts should cite and rely on the decisions of courts in other countries. Justices Antonin Scalia and Stephen Breyer of the United States Supreme Court took this issue public at a widely televised debate held in 2005 at the Washington College of Law at American University, the transcript of which was published in I•CON (July 2005). Despite the thought and energy that the justices brought to the matter, there is no sign that the dispute will be resolved soon; this edition of the casebook presents the opposing viewpoints.

The editors have carefully reviewed the first edition to assure its accuracy and continued relevance, and have prepared significant new and updated material for this second edition. There is a new section containing cases in many jurisdictions on various aspects of the so-called "war on terrorism," including torture. There is also new material on problems relating to pornography, social welfare, and religion. The chapter on dignity and self-determination has been revised to cover such issues as euthanasia and rights of sexual autonomy, including the rights of transsexuals. The political rights material has

likewise been updated to cover voting and party politics in addition to rights of individual citizenship.

The cases are, for the most part, current through 2009. As in the first edition, in order to assure the inclusion of a broad array of opinions on constitutionalism, we have drawn material from more than fifty jurisdictions from all parts of the world. We have tried to present the material in all its complexity to further the understanding of principles that may vary among different regions and legal systems.

We hope that the users of this book will share the enthusiasm and intellectual profit that we have found in preparing it.

NORMAN DORSEN MICHEL ROSENFELD ANDRÁS SAJÓ SUSANNE BAER

March 2010

Acknowledgments

We are deeply indebted to Karen Barrett for acting as managing editor for this edition. With her customary editorial skill, she improved our copy both substantively and stylistically.

We are also grateful to Jeff Tiedrich for his technical proficiency in designing the book and preparing it for production, and to Lisa Nelson for problem-solving throughout the production process.

We acknowledge the valuable research, editorial, and administrative assistance of the following: Chris Kochevar, Jake Spring, Amanda Bakale, Gene Smilansky, Melisa Gerecci, and Juliana Barrett.

Norman Dorsen thanks NYU students Ashish Chugh, Kristin O'Connor, Stephen Dobson, Sophie E. Nevell, Emily Vosgell and Manju Zacharias.

Michel Rosenfeld thanks Elena L. Cohen, a student at Cardozo Law School.

Susanne Baer thanks Nora Markard and the students in her seminar on comparative constitutional law at The University of Michigan Law School.

We jointly thank Dean Richard Revesz and the NYU School of Law for important financial support.

Finally, we lament the recent passing of Professor Thomas M. Franck of NYU Law School, a brilliant international law scholar and a pioneer in the comparative field with his influential casebook, *Comparative Constitutional Processes* (1968).

—The authors

Note on Citations and Glossary of Acronyms

This book cites to cases and secondary authorities from a great number of jurisdictions. It is not always clear what reporter or form of citation is appropriate; thus, although we have striven for accuracy, there may be miscitations or inconsistencies of one kind or another.

Where there is an official or preferred reporter, such as the *U.S. Reports* or the *South Africa Law Reports* (SALR), we have cited to it whenever possible.

When reproducing cases and other authorities, we have retained the spelling and style conventions (American or British) and citation forms used in the original.

Footnotes retained from excerpted material include their original numbering. Footnotes inserted by the editors are indicated by lower case letters. Material that we have omitted from excerpted text or footnotes is indicated by asterisks (* * *), while material we have added is placed in brackets. An ellipsis (...) indicates an omission made by the excerpt's author, quoting from another source.

We have used the following acronyms:

BCCL	Bulletin on Constitutional Case-law
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms $$
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
GCC	German [Federal] Constitutional Court
HCC	Hungarian Constitutional Court
ICC	Italian Constitutional Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ISC	Indian Supreme Court [Supreme Court of India]
RCC	Russian Constitutional Court
SACC	South African Constitutional Court
USSC	United States Supreme Court

Permissions

- The authors gratefully acknowledge the right to reprint extracts from the following works:
- Ackerman, Bruce A., *The New Separation of Powers*, 113 Harv. L. Rev. 633 (2000). © 2000 by the Harvard Law Review Association.
- _____, The Rise of World Constitutionalism, 83 VA. L. Rev. 771 (1997). Reprinted by permission of the Virginia Law Review.
- Ackerman, Bruce, *The Emergency Constitution*, 30 Yale L. J. 1029 Reprinted by permission of
- Agamben, Giorgio, State of Exception, (Kevin Attell, trans. 2005) 32-40, University Of Chicago Press. Reprinted by permission of
- Amar, Vikram David, and Alan Brownstein, *The Hybrid Nature of Political Rights*, 50 Stan. L. Rev. 915 (1998). Reprinted by permission of the Stanford Law Review.
- Amann, Diane Marie, Harmonic Convergence? Constitutional Criminal Procedure in an International Context, 75 Indiana L.J. 809 (2000). © 2000 by the Trustees of Indiana University. Reprinted with permission.
- Arendt, Hannah, On Revolution (1965), © 1963 by Hannah Arendt. Used by permission of Viking Penguin, a division of Penguin Putnam Inc.
- Baer, Susanne, Constitutional Equality: The Jurisprudence of the German Constitutional Court, 5 Colum. J. Eur. L. 249 (1999). Reprinted by permission of the author.
- Banks, William C., and Alejandro D. Carrió, *Presidential Systems in Stress: Emergency Powers in Argentina and the United States*, 15 Michigan J.
 Int'l L. 1 (1993). Reprinted by permission of the Michigan Journal of International Law.
- Barendt, Eric, An Introduction to Constitutional Law (1998). © 1998 Oxford University Press. Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- ______, Freedom of Speech (Oxford University Press 1987). © Eric Barendt 1985. Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Bartole, Sergio, Regionalism and Federalism in the Italian Constitutional Experience, in Autonomy: Applications and Implications (Markku Suksi ed., 1998). © Kluwer Law International.
- Bassiouni, M. Cherif, Human Rights in the Context of Criminal Justice: Identifying International Procedural Protections and Equivalent Protections in National Constitutions, 3 Duke J. Comp. & Int'l L. 235 (1993). Reprinted by permission of the Duke Journal of Comparative & International Law.

- Beatty, David M., *The Forms and Limits of Constitutional Interpretation*, 49 Am. J. Comp. L. 79 (2001). © American Society of Comparative Law. Reprinted by permission of the American Journal of Comparative Law.
- Beer, Lawrence W., and Hiroshi Itoh, The Constitutional Case Law of Japan, 1970 through 1990 (Univ. Wash. Press, 1996). Reprinted by permission of the University of Washington Press.
- Bell, John, *Devolution French Style*, 6 Eur. Pub. L. 139 (2000). © Kluwer Law International.
- _____, French Constitutional Law (Oxford Univ. Press 1992). © John S. Bell 1992. Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Bork, Robert H., The Tempting of America (Free Press, 1990). © 1990 by Robert H. Bork. Reprinted with the permission of the Free Press, a Division of Simon & Schuster Adult Publishing Group.
- Brown, Nathan J., and Clark B. Lombardi, The Supreme Constitutional Court of Egypt on Islamic Law, Veiling and Civil Rights: An Annotated Translation of Supreme Constitutional Court of Egypt Case No. 8 of Judicial Year 17 (May 18, 1996), 21 Am. U. Int'l. L. Rev. 444 (2006). Reprinted by permission of The American University International Law Review.
- Butler, Judith, Excitable Speech: A Politics of the Performative (1997). © 1997. Reproduced by permission of Routledge, Inc., part of The Taylor & Francis Group.
- Capra, Daniel J., Access to Exculpatory Evidence: Avoiding the Agurs Problems of Prosecutorial Discretion and Retrospective Review, 53 FORDHAM L. Rev. 391 (1984). Reprinted by permission of the Fordham Law Review.
- Cassels, Jamie, Judicial Activism and Public Interest Litigation in India: Attempting the Impossible?, 37 Am. J. Comp. L. 495 (1989). Reprinted by permission of the American Journal of Comparative Law.
- Cepeda-Espinosa, Justice Manuel José, Judicial Activism in a Violent Context: The Origin, Role and Impact of the Colombian Constitutional Court, 3 Wash. U. Global Stud. L. Rev. 529 (2004). Reprinted by permission of the author and the St. Louis Global Studies Law Review.
- Choper, Jesse H., *The Religion Clauses of the First Amendment: Reconciling the Conflict*, 41 U. Pitt. L. Rev. 673 (1980). Reprinted by permission of the University of Pittsburgh Law Review.
- Colino, César, Constitutional Change without Constitutional Reform: Spanish Federalism and the Revision of Catalonia's Statute of Autonomy, 39 Publius 262 (2009). Reprinted by permission of Oxford Journals.
- Coomaraswamy, Radhika, Uses and Usurpation of Constitutional Ideology, in Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World (Douglas Greenberg et al. eds., 1993). © 1993 by Oxford University Press, Inc. Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Cossman, Brenda, and Ratna Kapur, Secularism's Last Sigh?: The Hindu Right, the Courts, and India's Struggle for Democracy, 38 HARVARD INT'L L. J. 113 (1997). Reprinted with permission of the authors.
- Costello, Cathryn, Peoples' Vengeances. Ireland's Nice Referenda, 3 Eur.

- CONST. L. REV. 357, 358 (Cambridge Univ. Press 2005). Reprinted by permission of the author and Cambridge University Press.
- Dalton, Harlon Leigh, *Taking the Right to Appeal (More or Less) Seriously*, 95 Yale L.J. 62 (1985). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal Company and William S. Hein Company.
- Daniel, Krystyna, and W. Cole Durham, Jr., Religious Identity as a Component of National Identity: Implications for Emerging Church—State Relations in the Former Socialist Bloc, in The Law of Religious Identity: Models for Post-Communism (András Sajó and Shlomo Avineri eds., 1999). © Kluwer Law International.
- Dolinko, David, Is there a Rationale for the Privilege Against Self-Incrimination?, 33 UCLA L. Rev. 1063 (1986). Reprinted by permission of the author.
- Dorsen, Norman, A Transatlantic View of Civil Liberties in the United Kingdom, in Civil Liberties (P. Wallington, ed., 1984). © 1984 by Oxford University Press.
- Dorsen, Norman, Flag Desecration in Courts, Congress and Country, 17 Thomas M. Cooley L. Rev. 417 (2000). Reprinted by permission of the Thomas M. Cooley Law Review.
- The relevance of foreign legal materials in U.S. constitutional cases: A conversation between Justice Antonin Scalia and Justice Stephen Breyer, 3 Int'l J. Const. L. (I CON) 519 (2005). Reprinted by permission of Oxford Journals.
- Dworkin, Ronald, *The Forum of Principle*, 56 N.Y.U. L. Rev. 469 (1981). Reprinted by permission of the New York University Law Review.
- Eleftheriadis, Pavlos, *The Idea of a European Constitution*, **27** Oxford J Leg. Stud. 1 (2007). Reprinted by permission of the author and of Oxford University Press.
- Elster, Jon, Constitutional Bootstrapping in Philadelphia and Paris, 14 Car-DOZO L. REV. 3 (1993). Reprinted by permission of the Cardozo Law Review.
- Fallon, Jr., Richard H., A Constructivist Coherence Theory of Constitutional Interpretation, 100 Harv. L. Rev. 1189 (1987). © by the Harvard Law Review Association.
- Favoreu, Louis, Constitutional Review in Europe, in Constitutionalism and Rights: The Influence of the United States Constitution Abroad (Louis Henkin and Albert J. Rosenthal eds., © 1990, Columbia University Press). Reprinted with permission of the publisher.
- Ferrari, Silvio, *The New Wine and the Old Cask: Tolerance, Religion, and the Law in Contemporary Europe, in* The Law of Religious Identity: Models for Post-Communism (András Sajó and Shlomo Avineri eds., 1999). © Kluwer Law International.
- Field, Martha A., *The Differing Federalisms of Canada and the United States*, 55 Law and Contemp. Probs. 107 (1992). © Martha A. Field. Reprinted with permission of the author.

- Finnis, John, On the Practical Meaning of Secularism, 73 Notre Dame L. Rev. 491 (1998). Reprinted with permission. © by Notre Dame Law Review, University of Notre Dame.
- Fiss, Owen M., Liberalism Divided: Freedom of Speech and the Many Uses of State Power (1996). © by Westview Press. Reprinted by permission of Westview Press, a member of Perseus Books, L.L.C.
- Fleiner, Thomas, Switzerland: Constitution of the Federal State and the Cantons, in Federalism and Multiethnic States: The Case of Switzerland (Lidija R. Basta Fleiner and Thomas Fleiner eds., 2d ed. 2000). Reprinted by permission of the author.
- Frase, Richard S., The Search for the Whole Truth About American and European Criminal Justice, 3 Buff. Crim. L. Rev. 785 (2000). Used by permission of the Buffalo Criminal Law Review.
- Frase, Richard S., and Thomas Weigend, German Criminal Justice as a Guide to American Law Reform * * * 18 Bost. Coll. Int'l & Comp. L. Rev. 317 (1995). Reprinted by permission of the Boston College International and Comparative Law Review.
- Ferreres Comella, Victor, The Rise of Constitutional Courts, in Constitutional Courts and Democratic Values (Yale Univ. Press 2009). Reprinted by permission of Yale University Press.
- Garlicki, Leszek Lech, The Democratic Limits to Authoritarianism in Democracy (When the State Knows Better What is Good for the People), in Out of and Into Authoritarian Law (András Sajó ed., 2002). © Kluwer Law International.
- Ginsburg, Ruth Bader, and Deborah Jones Merrit, Affirmative Action: An International Human Rights Dialogue, 21 Cardozo L. Rev. 253 (1999). Reprinted by permission of the Cardozo Law Review.
- Gold, Daniel, Organized Hinduisms: From Vedic Truth to Hindu Nation, in Fundamentalisms Observed (Martin E. Marty and R. Scott Appleby eds., University of Chicago Press, 1991). © 1991 by the University of Chicago. All rights reserved.
- Grimm, Dieter, *Does Europe Need a Constitution?*, 1 Eur. L. J. 282 (1995). Reprinted with the permission of Blackwell Publishing.
- Gross, Owen, Chaos and Rules: Should Responses to Violent Crises Always Be Constitutional? 112 Yale L.J. 1022 (2003). Reprinted by permission of the Yale Law Journal.
- Gunlicks, Arthur, German Federalism Reform: Part One, 8(1) GERM. L.J. 111 (2007). Reprinted by permission of the author.
- Habermas, Jürgen, Remarks on Dieter Grimm's "Does Europe Need a Constitution?", 1 Eur. L. J. 303 (1995). Reprinted with the permission of Blackwell Publishing.
- Halberstam, Daniel, and Roderick M. Hills, Jr., State Autonomy in Germany and the United States 574 Annals 173 (2001). Reprinted by permission of Sage Publications.
- Hall, Alison C., To Die with Dignity: Comparing Physician-Assisted Suicide

- in the United States, Japan, and the Netherlands, 74 WASH. U. L.Q. 803 (1996). Reprinted by permission of the author.
- Headscarf Ludin Case, 2003. © Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft and the Federal Constitutional Court. Reprinted by permission, with the following disclaimer: The translations prepared by the Federal Constitutional Court are intended for information purposes only; the official German originals are the sole authoritative versions. The translations were prepared with the utmost care; however, no representation as to the accuracy and completeness of the translations is made by the Federal Constitutional Court.
- Henkin, Louis, A New Birth of Constitutionalism: Genetic Influences and Genetic Defects, in Constitutionalism, Identity, Difference and Legitimacy: Theoretical Perspectives (Michel Rosenfeld ed., Duke University Press, 1994). © 1994, Duke University Press. All rights reserved. Used by permission of the Publisher.
- Hogg, Peter W., Constitutional Law of Canada (4th ed. 1997). Reproduced with permission of Carswell Publishing, through the Canadian © Licensing Agency (CANCOPY).
- Holmes, Stephen, and Cass Sunstein, *The Politics of Constitutional Revision in Eastern Europe*, in Responding to Imperfection: The Theory and Practice of Constitutional Amendment (Sanford Levinson ed. 1995). © 1995 by Princeton University Press. Reprinted by permission of Princeton University Press.
- Ingber, Stanley, *The Marketplace of Ideas: A Legitimizing Myth*, 33 Duke L. J. 1 (1984). Reprinted by permission of the Duke Law Journal.\
- Jackson, Vicki C., Constitutional Comparisons: Convergence, Resistance, Engagement, 119 HARV. L. REV. 109 (2005). Reprinted by permission of the author.
- Jackson, Vicki C., Narratives of Federalism: Of Continuities and Comparative Constitutional Experience, 51 Duke L.J. 223 (2001). Reprinted by permission of the Duke Law Journal.
- Jörg, Nico, Stewart Field, and Chrisje Brants, Are Inquisitorial and Adversarial Systems Converging?, in Criminal Justice in Europe (Christopher Harding, Phil Fennell, Nico Jörg, and Bert Stewart eds., Oxford/Clarendon 1995). Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Karst, Kenneth L., Paths to Belonging: The Constitution and Cultural Identity, 64 N.C. L. Rev. 303 (1986). Reprinted by permission of the North Carolina Law Review.
- Keir, D. L., and F. H. Lawson, Cases in Constitutional Law (5th ed., Oxford Univ. Press, 1967). Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Kelsen, Hans, General Theory Of Law And State (Anders Wedberg trans., 1945). Reprinted by permission of the Hans Kelsen Institute.
- Kingsbury, Benedict, Reconciling Five Competing Conceptual Structures of Indigenous People's Claims in International and Comparative Law, 34 N.Y.U. J. INT'L L. & P. 189 (2001). © Benedict Kingsbury. Reprinted by permission of the author.

- Kirby, Michael, Law and Sexuality: The Contrasting Case of Australia, 12 STAN. L. & Pol. Rev. 103 (2001). Reprinted by permision of the Stanford Law & Policy Review.
- Kommers, Donald P., The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany (2d ed. 1997). © 1997 Duke University Press. All rights reserved. Used by permission of the publisher.
- Kretzmer, David, Freedom of Speech and Racism, 8 CARDOZO L. REV. 445 (1987). Reprinted by permission of the Cardozo Law Review.
- Krug, Peter, Civil Defamation Law and the Press in Russia: Private and Public Interests, the 1995 Civil Code, and the Constitution, Part One, 13 CARDOZO ARTS & ENT. L. J. 847 (1995); Part Two, 14 CARDOZO ARTS & ENT. L. J. 297 (1996). Used by permission of the Cardozo Arts & Entertainment Law Journal.
- Kübler, Friedrich, How Much Freedom for Racist Speech?: Transnational Aspects of a Conflict of Human Rights, 27 Hop. L. Rev. 335 (1998). Reprinted by permission of the Hofstra Law Review Association.
- Kuo, Joyce, Excluded, Segregated and Forgotten: A Historical View of the Discrimination of Chinese Americans in Public Schools, 5 ASIAN L.J. 181 (1998). Reprinted by permission of the Asian Law Journal.
- Kymlicka, Will, Politics in the Vernacular: Minority Nationalism and Multination Federalism (2001). © 2001 by Oxford University Press, Inc. Used by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Lessig, Lawrence, and Cass R. Sunstein, *The President and the Administration*, 94 Colum. L. Rev. 1 (1994). Reprinted by permission of the Columbia Law Review.
- Lev, Daniel S., Social Movements, Constitutionalism and Human Rights: Comments from the Malaysian and Indonesian Experiences, in Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World (Douglas Greenberg et al., 1993). © 1993 by Oxford University Press, Inc. Used by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Levinson, Sanford, Book Review, Regulating Campaign Activity: The New Road to Contradiction, 83 Mich. L. Rev. 939 (1985). © Sanford Levinson. Reprinted with permission of Princeton University Press.
- Lombardi, Clark, B. and Nathan J. Brown, Do Constitutions Requiring Adherence to Shari'a Threaten Human Rights?, 21 Am. U. INT'L. L. REV. 379 (2006). Reprinted by permission of The American University International Law Review.
- Ludwikowski, Rett R., Constitution-Making in the Region of Former Soviet Dominance (Duke Univ. Press, 1996). © 1996, Duke University Press. All rights reserved. Used by permission of the publisher.
- Lutz, Donald, Towards a Theory of Constitutional Amendment, in Responding to Imperfection: The Theory and Practice of Constitutional Amendment (Sanford Levinson ed, 1995). © 1995 by Princeton University Press. Reprinted by permission of Princeton University Press.
- MacKinnon, Catharine A., Reflections on Sex Equality under Law, 100 YALE

- L.J. 1281 (1991). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal Company and William S. Hein Company.
- Mahmud, Tayyab, Freedom of Religion and Religious Minorities in Pakistan: A Study of Judicial Practice, 19 Fordham Int'l L. J. 40 (1995). Reprinted by permission of the Fordham International Law Journal.
- Mancini, Susanna, and de Witte, Bruno, Language Rights as Cultural Rights—A European Perspective, in Cultural Human Rights (Francesco Francioni and Martin Scheinin, eds., 2008). Reprinted by permission of Brill NL.
- Brokdorf Case 69 BVerfGE 315 (1985) (Raymond Youngs, transl. 1999). © Sir Basil Markesinis. Reprinted with permission.
- Matsuda, Mari J., Public Response to Racist Speech: Considering the Victim's Story, 87 Mich. L. Rev. 2320 (1989). The article appeared in final form in Words that Wound (Matsuda et al. eds., Westview Press 1993). Used by permission of the author.
- Mayer, Ann Elizabeth, *Universal Versus Islamic Human Rights: A Clash of Cultures or a Clash with a Construct?*, 15 Mich. J. Int'l L. 307 (1994). Used by permission of the Michigan Journal of International Law.
- Morton, F. L., *Judicial Review in France: A Comparative Analysis*, 36 American J. Comp. L. 89 (1988). Reprinted by permission of the American Journal of Comparative Law.
- Muni, S.D., Ethnic Conflict, Federalism and Democracy in India, in Ethnicity AND Power in the Contemporary World (Kumar Rupesinghe and Valery A. Tishkov eds., United Nations University Press 1996). Used by permission of the publisher.
- Munro, Colin R., Studies in Constitutional Law (2d ed. 1999). Reproduced by permission of The Butterworth Division of Reed Elsevier (UK) Ltd.
- Murphy, Walter F., Merlin's Memory: The Past and Future Imperfect of the Once and Future Polity, in Responding to Imperfection: The Theory and Practice of Constitutional Amendment (Sanford Levinson ed., Princeton University Press, 1995). © 1995 by Princeton University Press. Reprinted by permission of Princeton University Press.
- Nimmer, Melville B., The Right to Speak from Times to Time: First Amendment Theory Applied to Libel and Misapplied to Privacy, 56 Cal. L. Rev. 935 (1968). © 1968 by the California Law Review, Inc. Reprinted from California Law Review by permission of the Regents of the University of California.
- Nino, Carlos, Radical Evil on Trial (Yale University Press, 1996). © 1996 by Yale University Press. Reprinted by the permission of the Journal of Law & Religion.
- O'Connell, Rory, *Theories of Religious Education in Ireland* 14 J. L. & Relig. 433 (1999–2000). Reprinted by permission of the Journal.
- Olowofoyeku, Abimbola A., Devolution: Conceptual and Implementational Problems, 29 Anglo-Am. L. Rev., 137 (2000). Reprinted with permission of Vathek Publishing.

- Parikh, Sunita, and Barry R. Weingast, *A Comparative Theory of Federalism: India* 83 Va. L. Rev. 1593 (1994). Used by permission of the Virginia Law Review.
- Posner, Richard A., Foreword: A Political Court, Richard A. Posner, 11/1/2005, 31, 84–89 Harv. L. Rev. Reprinted with permission of the Harvard Law Review Association.
- Preuss, Ulrich K., Patterns of Constitutional Evolution and Change in Eastern Europe, in Constitutional Policy and Change in Europe (Joachim J. Hesse and Nevil Johnson eds., Oxford Univ. Press, 1995). © 1995. Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press.
- ______, Constitutional Powermaking for the New Polity: Some Deliberations on the Relation Between Constituent Power and the Constitution, in Constitutionalism, Identity, Difference and Legitimacy: Theoretical Perspectives (Michel Rosenfeld ed., Duke Univ. Press, 1994). © 1999, Duke University Press. All rights reserved. Used by the permission of the publisher.
- Quint, Peter E., Free Speech and Private Law in German Constitutional Theory, $48\,\mathrm{Mp}$. L. Rev. $247\,(1989)$. © Peter E. Quint. Reprinted by permission of the author.
- Rapaczynski, Andrzej, Bibliographical Essay: *The Influence of U.S. Constitutionalism Abroad*, in Constitutionalism and Rights: The Influence of the United States Constitution Abroad (Louis Henkin and Albert J. Rosenthal eds. © 1990, Columbia University Press). Reprinted with permission of the publisher.
- Reich, Charles, *The New Property*, 73 Yale L.J. 733 (1964). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal Company and William S. Hein Company.
- Resnik, Judith, *Due Process: A Public Dimension*, 39 U. Fl. L. Rev. 405 (1987). Reprinted with permission of the Florida Law Review. © 1987.
- Rosenfeld, Michel, *The Rule of Law and the Legitimacy of Constitutional Democracy*, 74 So. Cal. L. Rev. 1307 (2001). Reprinted by permission of the Southern California Law Review.
- ______, Pragmatism, Pluralism and Legal Interpretation: Posner's and Rorty's Justice Without Metaphysics Meets Hate Speech, 18 Cardozo L. Rev. 97 (1996). Reprinted with permission of the Cardozo Law Review.
- ______, Towards a Reconstruction of Constitutional Equality, in Western Rights? Post-Communist Application (András Sajó ed., 1996). © Kluwer Law International.
- _____, Affirmative Action and Justice: A Philosophical and Constitutional Inquiry (Yale Univ. Press, 1991). Reprinted with permission of the publisher.
- ______, The Identity Of The Constitutional Subject (Routledge, 2009) Reprinted with permission of the publisher and author.
- Rosenfeld, Michel, Judicial Balancing in Times of Stress, Comparing the American, British and Israeli Approaches to the War on Terror, 27 Car-

- DOZO L. REV. 2079 (2006). Reprinted by permission of the author and Cardozo Law Review.
- Rosenn, Keith S., Federalism in the Americas in Comparative Perspective, 26 U. Miami Inter-Am. L. Rev. 1 (1994). Reprinted with permission of the University of Miami Inter-American Law Review.
- Rothstein, Lawrence E., *Privacy or Dignity?: Electronic Monitoring in the Workplace*, 19 N. Y. L. Sch. J. Int'l & Comp. L. 379 (2000). Reprinted with permission of the New York Law School Journal of International & Comparative Law.
- Rousseau, Dominique, *The Constitutional Judge: Master or Slave of the Constitution?*, in Constitutionalism, Identity, Difference and Legitimacy, 1994). © 1994 Duke Univ. Press. All rights reserved. Used by permission of the publisher.
- Sajó, András, Limiting Government: An Introduction to Constitutionalism (1999). © Andras Sajó and Central European University Press. Used by permission of Central European University Press.
- ______, How the Rule of Law Killed Hungarian Welfare Reform, 5 East Eur. Const. Rev., 31 (1996). Used by permission of the East European Constitutional Review.
- ______, Preferred Generations: A Paradox of Restoration Constitutions, in Constitutionalism, Identity, Difference and Legitimacy: Theoretical Perspectives 335 (Michel Rosenfeld ed., © Duke Univ. Press, 1994). All rights reserved. Used by permission of the publisher.
- Sapir, Gidon, Religion and State in Israel: The Case for Reevaluation and Constitutional Entrenchment, 22 Hastings Int'l & Comp. L. Rev. 617 (1999).
 © 1999 by University of California, Hastings College of Law. Reprinted by permission.
- Sartori, Giovanni, Constitutionalism: A Preliminary Discussion, 56 Am. Pol. Sci. Rev. 853 (1962). Reprinted with permission of Cambridge University Press.
- Schauer, Frederick, Easy Cases, 58 So. Cal. L. Rev. 399 (1985). Reprinted by permission of the Southern California Law Review.
- ______, Free Speech: A Philosophical Inquiry Cambridge Univ. Press, 1982).

 Reprinted with permission of Cambridge University Press.
- Schmitt, Carl, Political Theology, (George Schwab trans. 2006) © copyright George Schwab. Reprinted by permission of the translator.
- Schuck, Peter H., The Perceived Values of Diversity, Then and Now, 22 Carbozo L. Rev. 1915 (2001). Reprinted by permission of the Cardozo Law Review.
- Schulhofer, Stephen J., Miranda's Practical Effect: Substantial Benefits and Vanishingly Small Social Costs, 90 NW. U. L. Rev. 500 (1996). Reprinted by permission of Northwestern University Law Review.
- Shiffrin, Steven H., Defamatory Non-Media Speech and First Amendment Methodology, 25 UCLA L. Rev. 915 (1978). Reprinted by permission of the author.