



ROUTLEDGE

CONTEMPORARY GEOGRAPHIES
OF LEISURE, TOURISM AND MOBILITY



1434514

Political Economy of Tourism

A critical perspective

Edited by Jan Mosedale



First published 2011
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada
by Routledge
270 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2011 Jan Mosedale

The right of Jan Mosedale to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by him in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patent Act 1988.

Typeset in Times New Roman by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, UK
Printed and bound in Great Britain by CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham, Wiltshire

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Political economy of tourism / edited by Jan Mosedale.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Tourism. 2. Tourism—Government policy. I. Mosedale, Jan.

G155.A1P65 2010

338.4791—dc22

2010025336

ISBN: 978-0-415-54802-1 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-0-203-83587-6 (ebk)

Political Economy of Tourism

Political economy, in its various guises and transfigurations, is a research philosophy that presents both social commentary and theoretical progress and is concerned with a number of different topics: politics, regulation and governance, production systems, social relations, inequality and development amongst many others. As a critical theory, political economy seeks to provide an understanding of societies – and of the structures and social relations that form them – in order to evoke social change towards more equitable conditions.

Despite the early influence of critical development studies and political economy on tourism research, political economy has received relatively little attention in tourism research. *Political Economy of Tourism* is the first volume to bring together different theoretical perspectives and discourse in political economy related to tourism. Written by leading scholars, the text is organized into three sequential parts, linked by the principle that ‘the political’ and ‘the economic’ are intimately connected. Part I presents different approaches to political economy, including Marxist political economy, regulation, comparative political economy, commodity chain research and alternative political economies; Part II links key themes of political economy, such as class, gender, labour, development and consumption, to tourism; and Part III examines the political economy at various geographical scales and focuses on the outcomes and processes of the political act of planning and managing tourism production.

This engaging volume provides insights and alternative critical perspectives on political economy theory to expand discussions of tourism development and policy in the future. *Political Economy of Tourism* is a valuable text for students, researchers and academics interested in tourism and related disciplines.

Jan Mosedale is Senior Lecturer in Tourism, Hospitality and Events at the University of Sunderland, UK. His research interests lie in the analysis of multiple forms of economic practices across space, focussing on tourism commodity chains as well as non-capitalist exchanges. Jan is co-editor for the ‘Current Developments in the Geographies of Leisure and Tourism’ book series.

Tourism and Global Environmental Change

Ecological, social, economic and political interrelationships

Edited by Stefan Gössling and C. Michael Hall

Cultural Heritage of Tourism in the Developing World

Dallen J. Timothy and Gyan Nyaupane

Understanding and Managing Tourism Impacts

Michael Hall and Alan Lew

Forthcoming:

An Introduction to Visual Research Methods in Tourism

Tijana Rakic and Donna Chambers

Routledge Studies in Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility is

a forum for innovative new research intended for research students and academics, and the titles will be available in hardback only. Titles include:

Living with Tourism

Negotiating identities in a Turkish village

Hazel Tucker

Tourism, Diasporas and Space

Edited by Tim Coles and Dallen J. Timothy

Tourism and Postcolonialism

Contested discourses, identities and representations

Edited by C. Michael Hall and Hazel Tucker

Tourism, Religion and Spiritual Journeys

Edited by Dallen J. Timothy and Daniel H. Olsen

China's Outbound Tourism

Wolfgang Georg Arlt

Tourism, Power and Space

Edited by Andrew Church and Tim Coles

Tourism, Ethnic Diversity and the City

Edited by Jan Rath

Ecotourism, NGOs and Development

A critical analysis

Jim Butcher

The Study of Tourism

Richard Sharpley

Children's and Families' Holiday Experience

Neil Carr

Tourism and Agriculture

Rebecca Torres and Janet Momsen

Gender and Tourism

Cara Atchinson

Tourism in China

David Airey and King Chong

Real Tourism

Claudio Minca and Tim Oaks

Tourism and Animal Ethics

David A. Fennell

Tourism and National Identity

Elsbeth Frew and Leanne White

Contributors

Julia N. Albrecht is a Lecturer in Tourism Management at the Victoria Management School, Victoria University of Wellington. Her research interests include tourism policy and planning and the relationships of stakeholders in tourism.

Raoul Bianchi is a Principal Lecturer in Tourism and Leisure at the University of East London, UK. He specialises in the sociology of tourism development and the international political economy of tourism. He has also published on the politics of tourism and cultural heritage, including world heritage, with particular emphasis on Spain and the Canary Islands.

Michael Clancy is Associate Professor of Politics and Government at the University of Hartford, Connecticut, USA. His work focuses on tourism and development, commodity chains and nation branding. His most recent book is *Brand New Ireland: Tourism, Development and National Identity in the Irish Republic*.

Scarlett Cornelissen is an Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science at Stellenbosch University in South Africa. She holds a PhD from the University of Glasgow and conducts research on African international relations and the political economy of tourism and sport mega-events. She is the author of a book on South Africa's place in the global tourism system and has co-edited three books on globalization and politics in Africa.

David Timothy Duval is Associate Professor in the Faculty of Business and Economics at the University of Winnipeg.

C. Michael Hall is Professor in the Department of Management, University of Canterbury, New Zealand; Docent in the Department of Geography, University of Oulu, Finland; and Visiting Professor at the Linnaeus University School of Business and Economics, Kalmar, Sweden. He is co-editor of *Current Issues in Tourism* and he has published widely in tourism, gastronomy and environmental history.

Steven F. Illum is currently Tourism Specialist and Professor at Missouri State University, Springfield, Missouri, USA. He holds a PhD in Recreation, Park and Tourism Sciences from Texas A&M University – College Station, Texas and serves on the editorial review board for *Anatolia* and *International Journal of Tourism Policy*. His research interests include marketing and rural heritage tourism.

Stanislav Ivanov is currently Academic Director of International University College in Dobrich, Bulgaria. He holds a PhD in Tourism Economics from the University of Economics – Varna and is the editor-in-chief of the *European Journal of Tourism Research*. His research interests include destination marketing, tourism and economic growth, political issues in tourism, and special interest tourism.

Teresa Leopold is a Senior Lecturer in Tourism and Events Studies at the University of Sunderland. Her research interests span from socio-cultural aspects of events and festivals to the political economy of tourist migration and power relations within the social construction of communities.

Kirsten Lovelock is a Research Fellow at the University of Otago. Her research has focused on the immigration industry, immigrant participation in voluntary associations, migrant participation in nature-based outdoor recreation, the migration of children for adoption and temporary migrant worker schemes in agriculture.

John Macilree is Principal Adviser, Air Services in the Aviation and Security Team at the New Zealand Ministry of Transport.

Kevin Meethan is Senior Lecturer in Sociology at the University of Plymouth. He is the author of *Tourism in Global Society* and *Tourism, Consumption and Representation*, and founding editor of the *Journal of Tourism Consumption and Practice*.

Dorothea Meyer is Senior Lecturer in Tourism at Sheffield Hallam University. Her current research interests include tourism as a tool for poverty reduction; development impacts of foreign direct investment in tourism; and power structures and the political economy of tourism.

Janet Momsen is Emerita Professor of Geography at the University of California, Davis and Senior Research Associate in the International Gender Studies Centre and the Centre for the Environment, Oxford University. She is author or editor of fifteen books and edits a series for Routledge on International Studies of Women and Place.

Jan Mosedale is Senior Lecturer in Tourism and Hospitality at the University of Sunderland. He is primarily concerned with analysing the constitution of 'the economy' as multiple forms of economic practices across space. This involves

research on the capitalist structures of the economy as well as non-capitalist forms of economic exchanges.

Michihiko Nakata studied at Kyoto University (LLB 1963) and subsequently worked with Mitsubishi Corporation for thirty-six years. After retirement he studied Human Geography at the University of California, Davis (MA 2004, PhD candidate 2007). He is interested in Japanese activities in sub-Saharan Africa.

Nicolai Scherle is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Cultural Geography at the Catholic University of Eichstätt-Ingolstadt, Germany. His monograph on the presentation of cultural aspects in German-language travel guides was awarded a research prize by the International Tourism Fair (ITB) in Berlin in 2000.

Craig Webster earned his doctorate from Binghamton University, USA. He has taught at Ithaca College, and the College of Tourism and Hotel Management. He is currently an Associate Professor at the University of Nicosia. His research interests include human rights, comparative foreign policy, tourism politics and public opinion analysis.

Acknowledgements

Numerous people have contributed in various ways to the production of this book. Foremost, I am grateful to the contributors for their enthusiasm in participating in this volume. Their works address critical issues in tourism research and demonstrate the diversity of political economy approaches. I would like to thank Emma Travis, Faye Leerink and Lisa Salonen of Routledge and Michael Hall as book series editor for "Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility". They were excited about the book from its conception and provided valuable assistance during the process. I have also benefitted from stimulating and enjoyable academic environments at the Department of Tourism of the University of Otago and the University of Sunderland and would like to thank colleagues for their support and encouragement.

Finally, I am grateful to W. W. Norton & Company, Inc. for kindly granting permission to use the table Political Economic Systems from *Essentials of Comparative Politics*, Second Edition, by Patrick O'Neil. Copyright © 2007, 2004.

Tourism and the Consumption of Wildlife

Hunting, shooting and sport fishing

Edited by Brent Lovelock

Tourism, Creativity and Development

Edited by Greg Richards and Julie Wilson

Tourism at the Grassroots

Edited by John Connell and Barbara Rugendyke

Tourism and Innovation

Michael Hall and Allan Williams

World Tourism Cities

Developing tourism off the beaten track

Edited by Robert Maitland and Peter Newman

Tourism and National Parks

International perspectives on development, histories and change

Edited by Warwick Frost and C. Michael Hall

Tourism, Performance and the Everyday

Consuming the Orient

Michael Haldrup and Jonas Larsen

Tourism and Change in Polar Regions

C. Michael Hall and Jarkko Saarinen

Fieldwork in Tourism

Methods, issues and reflections

Edited by C. Michael Hall

Tourism and India

A critical introduction

Kevin Hannam and Anya Diekmann

Political Economy of Tourism

A critical perspective

Edited by Jan Mosedale

Forthcoming:

Volunteer Tourism

Angela Benson

Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility

Series Editor: C. Michael Hall, Professor at the Department of Management, College of Business and Economics, University of Canterbury, Private Bag 4800, Christchurch, New Zealand

The aim of this series is to explore and communicate the intersections and relationships between leisure, tourism and human mobility within the social sciences.

It will incorporate both traditional and new perspectives on leisure and tourism from contemporary geography, e.g. notions of identity, representation and culture, while also providing for perspectives from cognate areas such as anthropology, cultural studies, gastronomy and food studies, marketing, policy studies and political economy, regional and urban planning, and sociology, within the development of an integrated field of leisure and tourism studies.

Also, increasingly, tourism and leisure are regarded as steps in a continuum of human mobility. Inclusion of mobility in the series offers the prospect to examine the relationship between tourism and migration, the sojourner, educational travel, and second home and retirement travel phenomena.

The series comprises two strands:

Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility aims to address the needs of students and academics, and the titles will be published in hardback and paperback. Titles include:

The Moralisation of Tourism

Sun, sand . . . and saving the world?

Jim Butcher

The Ethics of Tourism Development

Mick Smith and Rosaleen Duffy

Tourism in the Caribbean

Trends, development, prospects

Edited by David Timothy Duval

Qualitative Research in Tourism

Ontologies, epistemologies and methodologies

Edited by Jenny Phillimore and Lisa Goodson

The Media and the Tourist Imagination

Converging cultures

Edited by David Crouch, Rhona Jackson and Felix Thompson

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	xvii
<i>List of contributors</i>	xix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xxiii
1 Re-introducing tourism to political economy	1
JAN MOSEDALE	
<i>Political economy approaches</i>	3
<i>Structure of the book</i>	7
<i>References</i>	10
PART I	
Approaches to political economy in tourism	15
2 Tourism, capitalism and Marxist political economy	17
RAOUL V. BIANCHI	
<i>The principles of Marxist political economy</i>	17
<i>Marxist political economy and tourism</i>	21
<i>Tourism, capitalism and globalization</i>	22
<i>Tourism, work and labour relations in the global economy</i>	26
<i>What future for Marxist political economy and tourism?</i>	31
<i>Notes</i>	32
<i>References</i>	32
3 Regulation theory and its evolution and limitations in tourism studies	39
SCARLETT CORNELISSEN	
<i>Classical formulations of the regulation approach</i>	40
<i>The regulation school and tourism scholarship</i>	44
<i>Conclusion</i>	51
<i>References</i>	52

4	The paradigms of political economy and tourism policy: national tourism organizations and state policy	55
	CRAIG WEBSTER, STANISLAV IVANOV AND STEVEN F. ILLUM	
	<i>Political economies and their paradigms</i>	56
	<i>States' political regimes and their responses to tourism</i>	60
	<i>Regimes and their responses to tourism</i>	68
	<i>Conclusions: the paradigms and future studies</i>	68
	<i>Notes</i>	72
	<i>References</i>	72
5	Global commodity chains and tourism: past research and future directions	75
	MICHAEL CLANCY	
	<i>Development, globalization and global commodity chains</i>	76
	<i>Global commodity chains and tourism</i>	79
	<i>GCCs and global tourism: conclusions and future prospects</i>	88
	<i>Notes</i>	89
	<i>References</i>	89
6	Thinking outside the box: alternative political economies in tourism	93
	JAN MOSEDALE	
	<i>The cultural turn</i>	94
	<i>Cultural political economy</i>	98
	<i>Alternative political economies</i>	102
	<i>Conclusion: alternative political economies</i>	104
	<i>References</i>	105
PART II		
	Tourism and key themes in political economy	109
7	Yes, Virginia, there is a tourism class: why class still matters in tourism analysis	111
	C. MICHAEL HALL	
	<i>Power</i>	113
	<i>Categories of class</i>	114
	<i>Class and structural determination</i>	117
	<i>Classes as representative groupings</i>	117
	<i>Structure and agency in class formation and reproduction</i>	120
	<i>Conclusions</i>	122
	<i>References</i>	123

8	Gender and tourism: gender, age and mountain tourism in Japan	127
	JANET MOMSEN AND MICHIIHIKO NAKATA	
	<i>Tourism on the development agenda</i>	129
	<i>Mountain tourism in Japan</i>	130
	<i>References</i>	135
9	The political economy of temporary migration: Seasonal workers, tourists and sustaining New Zealand's labour force	139
	KIRSTEN LOVELOCK AND TERESA LEOPOLD	
	<i>The political economy of labour migration to New Zealand</i>	141
	<i>Local responses to global economic change</i>	142
	<i>Temporary migration schemes</i>	144
	<i>Tourism, agriculture and seasonal labour demands</i>	144
	<i>More recent temporary labour migration schemes</i>	146
	<i>The Working Holiday Maker scheme</i>	147
	<i>Conclusion</i>	149
	<i>The future of WHM schemes, the recession and rising unemployment in New Zealand</i>	151
	<i>References</i>	152
10	Changing power relations: foreign direct investment in Zanzibar	157
	DOROTHEA MEYER	
	<i>The political economy of foreign direct investment (FDI) in tourism</i>	158
	<i>Methodology</i>	160
	<i>The case study: Zanzibar</i>	160
	<i>Foreign direct investment in Zanzibar</i>	162
	<i>Do these ownership patterns matter?</i>	163
	<i>Procurement and linkages</i>	166
	<i>Employment and labour relations</i>	168
	<i>Conclusion</i>	170
	<i>References</i>	172
11	Dubai: 'An exotic destination with a cosmopolitan lifestyle'	175
	KEVIN MEETHAN	
	<i>Contemporary tourism</i>	175
	<i>Economic development in the United Arab Emirates and Dubai</i>	177
	<i>Workforce and population</i>	179
	<i>Tourism development in Dubai</i>	181
	<i>Conclusions</i>	184
	<i>Notes</i>	185
	<i>References</i>	186

PART III

Tourism and spatial contexts of political economy 189

12 Negotiating business interests and a community's 'greater good': community-based tourism planning and stakeholder involvement in the Catlins, New Zealand 191

JULIA N. ALBRECHT

Political economy and tourism planning 191

SMTE stakeholders in community-based tourism planning 192

The project and case study 193

Shared community goals? 194

Perceptions of the role of businesses 196

Personal status and power as a motivation 197

Too much concern for the 'greater good'? Another perspective on 'vested interests' 197

Vested interests in tourism strategy implementation by volunteers 198

Collaboratively achieving the greater community good? 200

A wider political economy perspective 202

References 204

13 Tourism, neoliberal policy and competitiveness in the developing world: the case of the Master Plan of Marrakech 207

NICOLAI SCHERLE

Morocco's economic structures between rent capitalism and neoliberalism 208

Morocco's tourism policies in the context of the Master Plan of Marrakech 211

The development of tourism in Morocco in the light of the Master Plan of Marrakech 215

Discussion and conclusion 219

References 221

14 The political economy of trade in international air transport services 225

DAVID TIMOTHY DUVAL AND JOHN MACILREE

Legal and political parameters: the basis of aeropolitics 226

The elements of air services agreements 227

'Open skies' versus quantitative economic regulation: where to strike the balance? 232

Exchanges of rights: two states 234

Exchange of rights: three states 235

Exchange of rights: four states 237

Conclusion: the politics of air services 238

Note 239

References 239

15 Tourism regulation and relational geography: the global, local and everything in between 243

JAN MOSEDALE AND JULIA N. ALBRECHT

Governance and tourism regulation 243

Spatialities of political economy 246

Networks traversing spatial scales 249

Spatial discourse and imaginaries 250

Conclusion: researching relational geographies in tourism 252

References 253

Index 257