

ENRICHMENT
IN THE LAW
OF UNJUST
ENRICHMENT
AND RESTITUTION

AVM Lodder



• HART •
PUBLISHING

HART STUDIES IN PRIVATE LAW

Published in the United Kingdom by Hart Publishing Ltd
16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530
Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

Published in North America (US and Canada) by
Hart Publishing
c/o International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213-3786
USA

Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
E-mail: orders@isbs.com
Website: <http://www.isbs.com>

© Andrew Lodder 2012

Andrew Lodder has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing Ltd at the address above.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data Available

ISBN: 978-1-84946-329-4

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon
Printed and bound in Great Britain by
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I owe a great debt to the many individuals and organisations that have supported me throughout the writing of *Enrichment in the Law of Unjust Enrichment and Restitution* and the D Phil thesis on which it is based. First and foremost, this book could not have been written without the constant direction and keen interest of my D Phil supervisor, Justice James Edelman, who first introduced me to the law of unjust enrichment and restitution as an undergraduate at the University of Western Australia in 2004 and who has guided my development in the subject ever since. My thanks also to the Rhodes Trust for funding my studies and to Magdalen College for the ongoing support that I received during my time at Oxford. I am extremely grateful to Richard Hart for backing this project and to everyone at Hart Publishing for making it a reality.

A number of people read and commented on various drafts of my manuscript and D Phil thesis. In particular, I benefitted from a most precise and careful proof-reader in Ben Spagnolo, who changed my mind more than once and whose astute comments often saved me from error. Also, I am grateful to my fellow members of the Oxford Obligations Discussion Group, especially Eli Ball, Tatiana Cutts, Andy Dyson, Dave Winterton and Fred Wilmot-Smith, for our regular lively discussions on all aspects of private law and their insightful comments on my work. Thanks to Eric Heenan, who has argued with me about unjust enrichment and restitution since we first encountered the subject and, in one of those many arguments in 2005, helped me reach the view that would form the central thesis of this book.

On a personal level, my thanks to my family, Corrie, Vere and Wil, for their ongoing encouragement throughout this process, and to Giulia, for her love and support.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

BCCA	British Columbia Court of Appeal
BCSC	British Columbia Supreme Court
Cal App	Court of Appeal of California
DCAC	District Court of Appeal of California
FMCA	Federal Magistrates Court of Australia
HCA	High Court of Australia
Idaho App	Court of Appeals of Idaho
MBCA	Manitoba Court of Appeals
MBQB	Manitoba Court of Queen's Bench
NH	New Hampshire Supreme Court
NLCA	Newfoundland and Labrador Court of Appeal
NSWCA	Court of Appeal of Supreme Court of New South Wales
NSWSC	Supreme Court of New South Wales
NZCA	Court of Appeal of New Zealand
NZDC	District Court of New Zealand
NZHC	High Court of New Zealand
ONCA	Court of Appeal for Ontario
ONCJ	Ontario Court of Justice
ONHC	Ontario High Court
ONSC	Ontario Superior Court of Justice
Ont Ch	Ontario Court of Chancery
SASC	South Australian Supreme Court
Sask QB	Saskatchewan Court of Queen's Bench
SCC	Supreme Court of Canada
SCT	Supreme Court of Tasmania
USCC	United States Court of Claims
VSC	Supreme Court of Victoria
WASCA	Court of Appeal of Supreme Court of Western Australia

TABLE OF CASES

ABB Engineering Construction Pty Ltd v Abigroup Contractors Pty Ltd [2003] NSWSC 665.....	81
ABB Power Generation v Chapple [2001] WASCA 412, (2001) 25 WAR 158	95, 174
Abigroup Contractors Pty Ltd v Peninsula Balmain Pty Ltd (No 2) [2001] NSWSC 1016.....	201
Abram Steamship Co Ltd Westville Shipping Co Ltd [1923] AC 773 (HL).....	118
ACT Construction Ltd v E Clarke & Sons (Coaches) Ltd [2002] EWCA Civ 972	81
Adamson v Miller [2008] FMCA 1173	199
Addis v Campbell (1841) 4 Beav 401, 49 ER 394.....	29
Air Jamaica Ltd v Charlton [1999] 1 WLR 1399 (PC)	106, 111
Alati v Kruger (1955) 94 CLR 216 (HCA).....	124, 129, 131, 133
Allcard v Skinner (1887) 36 ChD 145 (CA)	118, 129, 131, 225
Allied Irish Bank plc v Byrne [1995] 1 FCR 430 (Ch)	134
Amertek Inc v Canadian Commercial Corp (2003) 229 DLR (4th) 419 (ONSC) 419	184
AMP Workers' Compensation Services (NSW) Ltd v QBE Insurance Ltd [2001] NSWCA 267, (2001) 53 NSWLR 35.....	101, 184–86
Andrew Shelton & Co v Alpha Healthcare [2002] VSC 248, [2003] 5 VR 577	54, 87, 180
Anfield (UK) Ltd v Bank of Scotland [2010] EWHC 2374 (Ch).....	105
Angelopoulos v Sabatino [1995] 65 SASR 1 (SASC).....	86, 169, 173, 180, 183, 185
Appleby v Myers (1866) 1 CP 615 (CCP); (1867) 2 CP 651 (Ex).....	49, 57, 92
Armagas Ltd v Mundogas SA [1986] AC 717 (HL).....	74
Armory v Delamirie (1722) 1 Str 505, 93 ER 664	94
Atlantic Lines and Navigation Co Inc v Hallam Ltd (The Lucy) [1983] 1 Lloyd's Rep 188 (QB)	129, 130, 131
Attorney General for Hong Kong v Reid [1994] 1 AC 324 (PC)	57
Baker v Courage & Co [1910] 1 KB 56 (KB)	200
Bank of America v Arnell [1999] Lloyd's Rep Bank 399 (QB)	29
Banque Financière de la Cité v Parc (Battersea) Ltd [1999] 1 AC 221 (HL).....	4, 105, 141, 142, 145–47, 150
Barbados Trust Co Ltd v Bank of Zambia [2007] EWCA Civ 148, [2007] 1 Lloyd's Rep 495.....	61
Barclays Bank Ltd v W J Simms & Cooke (Southern) Ltd [1980] QB 677	103
Barnaby v Petersen Estate (1996) 15 ETR (2d) 138 (BCSC).....	14

Barros Mattos Junior v Macdaniels Ltd [2004]	
EWHC 1188 (Ch), [2005] 1 WLR 247	74
Bartholomew v Markwick (1864) 15 CBR 711, 143 ER 964	92, 129
Basten v Butter (1806) 7 East 479, 103 ER 185	81, 154
BBMB v Eda Holdings Ltd [1990] 1 WLR 409 (PC)	91
Bell v Bailey (2001) 203 DLR (4th) 589 (ONCA)	199
Bellamy v Sabine (1857) 1 De G&J 566, 44 ER 842	29
Benedetti v Sawiris [2009] EWHC 1330 (Ch); [2010]	
EWCA Civ 1427	16, 52–54, 76, 152, 153, 159–61, 165, 166–68, 170, 177, 178, 180, 198–200, 202–3, 208
Berkeley Applegate (Investment Consultants)	
Ltd [1989] Ch 32 (Ch)	88, 185
Beverley v Lincoln Gas Light and Coke Co (1837) 6 Ad&E 829, 112 ER 318	98
Birch v Blagrove (1755) Amb 265, 27 ER 176	29
Birmingham Midshires Mortgage Services	
Ltd v Sabherwal (1999) 80 P&CR 256 (CA)	105
Blacklocks v JB Developments (Godalming)	
Ltd [1982] Ch 183 (Ch)	140–41
Blay v Pollard & Morris [1930] 1 KB 628 (CA)	135, 137
Bloor (JS) Ltd v Pavillion Developments Ltd	
[2008] EWHC 724 (TCC)	156–57, 168–69, 172–73
Blue Haven Enterprises Ltd v Tully [2006] UKPC 17	156–57, 172
Boake Allen Ltd v HMRC [2006] EWCA Civ 25	76
Boardman v Phipps [1967] 2 AC 46 (HL)	8
Bodley v Reynolds (1846) 8 QB 779	91
Bolton v Bishop of Carlisle (1793) 2 H Bl 259, 126 ER 540	120
Bonner v Tottenham & Edmonton Permanent	
Investment BS [1899] 1 QB 161 (CA)	184
Bookmakers' Afternoon Greyhound Services Ltd v	
Gilbert [1994] FSR 723 (Ch)	168, 171
Boomer v Muir 24 P (2d) 570 (1933) (DCAC)	176
Boscawen v Bajwa [1996] 1 WLR 328 (CA)	105, 143–44, 148, 221
Boult v Harris (1676) 3 Keb 469	89
Boulton v Jones (1857) 2 H&N 564, 157 ER 232	92, 157, 170, 175
Bowen v Evans (1844) 1 J&Lat 178	29
Box v Barclays Bank plc [1998] Lloyd's Rep Bank 185 (Ch)	29
BP Exploration Co (Libya) Ltd v Hunt (No 2) [1979]	
1 WLR 783 (QB)	46, 48, 53, 69, 79, 80, 82, 86, 87, 90–92, 95, 160, 177, 183, 201, 204
Brenner v First Artists' Management Pty Ltd [1993] 2	
VR 221 (VSC)	14, 41, 54, 87, 88, 167, 169, 171, 174, 180
Bridgewater v Griffiths [2000] 1 WLR 524 (QB)	170, 180
Bristol and West Building Society v Mothew [1998] Ch 1 (CA)	131, 133
British Steel Corp v Cleveland Bridge and	
Engineering Co Ltd [1984] 1 All ER 504 (QB)	79, 174, 204
Brook's Wharf and Bull Wharf Ltd v Goodman	
Bros [1937] 1 KB 534 (CA)	101–2, 184

Brotherton v Aseguradora Cobeguros (No 2) [2003]	
EWCA Civ 705, [2003] 2 All ER (Comm) 298	117, 118
Brown v Brown (1993) 31 NSWLR 582 (NSWCA)	113
Brown v Smitt (1924) 34 CLR 160 (HCA)	122, 124, 131, 134
Buckley v Hann (1850) 5 Ex 43, 155 ER 19	72
Burford (Fareham) Ltd v Christian Vision [2005] EWHC 2533 (Ch)	138
Butler v Rice [1910] 2 Ch 277 (Ch)	143
Butlin's Settlement Trusts, Re [1976] Ch 251 (Ch)	137
Canham v Barry (1855) 15 CB 597, 139 ER 558	132
Capital Finance Co Ltd v Bray [1964] 1 WLR 323 (CA)	179
Car & Universal Finance Co Ltd v Caldwell [1963]	
1 QB 525 (CA)	24, 42, 60, 66, 118, 131, 132
Cave v Cave (1880) 15 ChD 639 (Ch)	65, 131
Chandler v Boswell [1936] 3 All ER 179 (CA)	83
Chartbrook Ltd v Persimmon Homes Ltd [2009]	
UKHL 38, [2009] 1 AC 1101	136, 139
Chase Manhattan Bank NA Ltd v Israel-British Bank	
(London) Ltd [1981] Ch 105 (Ch)	25, 57, 60
Cheese v Thomas [1994] 1 WLR 129 (CA)	118, 122, 123, 124, 129, 131, 134, 195–96
Cheltenham and Gloucester plc v Appleyard [2004] EWCA Civ 291	105
Chetwynd v Allen [1899] 1 Ch 353 (Ch)	145
Chief Constable of Greater Manchester Police v Wigan Athletic	
FC [2008] EWCA Civ 1449, [2009] 1 WLR 1580	41, 54–55, 171, 175, 180
Childers v Childers (1857) 1 De G&J 482, 44 ER 810	29
Chubb Cash Ltd v John Crilley & Son [1983] 1 WLR 599 (CA)	91
Churchward v Ford (1857) 2 H&N 446, 157 ER 184	98
CIBC Mortgages plc v Pitt [1994] 1 AC 200 (HL)	43
Citibank NA v QVT Financial LP [2007] EWCA Civ 11,	
[2007] 1 All ER (Comm) 475	28
Clarke v Dickson (1858) El B&E 148, 120 ER 463	124, 125, 128
Clavering v Clavering (1704) Prec Chan 235, 24 ER 114	120
Cleadon Trust Ltd, Re [1939] Ch 286 (CA)	103
Clough v London and North Western Railway Co	
(1871) 7 Ex 26 (Ex)	117, 124, 131, 132
Coastal Estates v Melevende [1965] VR 433 (VSC)	128
Cockburn v GIO Finance Ltd (No 2) [2001]	
NSWCA 177, (2001) 51 NSWLR 624	101, 184
Collings, Re [1933] Ch 920 (Ch)	75
Commerzbank AG v Price-Jones [2003] EWCA Civ 1663	194
Commission for the New Towns v Cooper	
(Great Britain) Ltd [1995] Ch 259 (CA)	136, 137–38
Commissioner of State Revenue (Victoria) v Royal Insurance	
Australia Ltd (1994) 182 CLR 51 (HCA)	7
Conrad v Feldbar Construction Co Ltd (2004) 70 OR	
(3d) 298 (ONSC)	186

Cook (W) Builders Pty Ltd (in liquidation) v Lumbers [2007]	
SASC 20, (2007) 96 SASR 406	180
Cooke v Gill (1873) 8 CP 107 (CCP)	72
Cooper v Phibbs (1867) 2 HL 149 (HL)	118, 129, 147, 156
Coshott v Lenin [2007] NSWCA 153	199, 201
Costain Civil Engineering Ltd v Zanen Dredging and Contracting Co Ltd (1996) 85 BLR 77 (QB)	80
Costello v Chief Constable of Derbyshire Constabulary [2001] EWCA Civ 381, [2001] 1 WLR 1437	94
Costello v MacDonald [2011] EWCA Civ 930	80
Countrywide Communications Ltd v ICL Pathway Ltd [2000] CLC 324 (QB)	54
County of Carleton v City of Ottawa [1965] SCR 663 (SCC)	184
Coupar Transport (London) Ltd v Smith's (Acton) Ltd [1959] 1 Lloyd's Rep 369 (QB)	184
Cowen v Truefitt Ltd [1899] 2 Ch 309 (CA)	140
Cox v Young (2005) 6 NZ Conv & Prop Rep 761 (NZHC)	186
Craddock Bros v Hunt [1923] 2 Ch 136 (CA)	140
Crane v Hegeman-Harris Co Inc [1939] 1 All ER 662 (Ch)	135
Crantrave Ltd v Lloyds Bank plc [2000] QB 917 (CA)	103
Craven-Ellis v Canons Ltd [1936] 2 KB 403 (CA)	41–42, 82, 83, 87, 173, 185, 197, 201, 204–5
Criterion Properties plc v Stratford UK Properties LLC [2004] UKHL 28, [2004] 1 WLR 1846	60, 126
Crown House Engineering Ltd v Amec Projects Ltd (1989) 48 BLR 32 (CA)	81
Daly v Sydney Stock Exchange Ltd (1985) 160 CLR 371 (HCA)	129, 133
Damberg v Damberg [2001] NSWCA 87, (2001) 52 NSWLR 492	50, 87
David Securities Pty Ltd v Commonwealth Bank of Australia (1992) 127 CLR 353 (HCA)	124, 199, 222
Davis v Oswell (1837) 7 C&P 804	91
De Bernady v Harding (1853) 8 Ex 822, 155 ER 1586	129
De Gruchy (A) Holdings Ltd v House of Fraser (Stores) Ltd [2001] All ER (D) 361 (QB)	81
De Molestina v Ponton [2002] 1 Lloyd's Rep 271 (QB)	134
De Symonds v Minchwich (1796) 1 Esp 430, 170 ER 409	128
Degelman v Guaranty Trust Co of Canada and Constantineau [1954] SCR 725 (SCC)	173
Deutsche Morgan Grenfell plc v IRC [2005] EWCA Civ 78, [2006] Ch 243; [2006] UKHL 49, [2007] 1 AC 558	1, 76, 222
Dimond v Lovell [2002] 1 AC 384 (HL)	83, 95–96, 98
Dimskal Shipping Co SA v International Transport Workers Federation (The Evia Luck) [1992] 2 AC 152 (HL)	117, 128
Do Carmo v Ford Excavations Pty Ltd (1984) 58 ALJR 287 (HCA)	72
Don King Productions Inc v Warren (No 1) [2000] Ch 291 (CA)	61
Dowell v Custombuilt Homes Pty Ltd [2004] WASCA 171	204
Drake Insurance plc v Provident Insurance plc [2003] EWCA Civ 1834, [2004] QB 601	117, 118

Dubai Aluminium v Salaam [2002] UKHL 48, [2003] 2 AC 366	101
Dunbar v Tredennick (1813) 1 B&B 304	29
Dunbar Bank plc v Nadeem [1998] 3 All ER 876 (CA)	117, 118, 123
Dyer v Dyer (1788) 2 Cox 92, 30 ER 42	107
Eastbourne BC v Foster [2001] EWCA Civ 1091, [2001] All ER (D) 135	92
Eastgate, Re [1905] 1 KB 465 (KB)	131
Eddy Lau Constructions Pty Ltd v Transdevelopment Enterprises Pty Ltd [2004] NSWSC 273	82
El Ajou v Dollar Land Holdings plc [1993] 3 All ER 717 (Ch)	108, 109, 131, 133, 200
Electricity Supply Nominees Ltd v Thorn EMI Retail Ltd (1991) 63 P&CR 143 (CA)	103
Enimont Overseas AG v RO Jugotanker Zadar (The Olib) [1991] 2 Lloyd's Rep 108 (QB)	117, 128
ERDC Group Ltd v Brunel University [2006] EWHC 687 (TCC), [2006] BLR 255	80, 81
Erlanger v The New Sombrero Phosphate Co (1878) 3 App Cas 1218 (HL)	96, 119, 122, 124, 219
Esso Bernicia, The see Esso Petroleum Co Ltd v Hall Russell & Co Ltd	
Esso Petroleum Co Ltd v Hall Russell & Co Ltd (The Esso Bernicia) [1989] AC 643 (HL)	101, 102, 186
Euro-Diam Ltd v Bathurst [1990] 1 QB 1 (CA)	184
Evia Luck, The see Dimskal Shipping Co SA v International Transport Workers Federation	
Exall v Partridge (1799) 8 TR 308, 101 ER 1405	73, 99–102, 184
FAI General Insurance Co Ltd v Ocean Marine Mutual Protection and Indemnity Association Ltd (1997) 41 NSWLR 559 (NSWSC)	118, 122
Falcke v Scottish Imperial Insurance Co (1886) 34 ChD 234 (CA)	155
Faraday v Tamworth Union [1917] 86 LJ Ch 436 (Ch)	135, 136
Farah Constructions Pty Ltd v Say-Dee Pty Ltd [2007] HCA 22, (2007) 203 CLR 89	5
Fea v Roberts [2005] EWHC 2186 (Ch)	200
Fensom v Cootamundra Racecourse Reserve Trust [2000] NSWSC 1072	86
Feret v Hill (1854) 15 CB 207, 139 ER 400	132
Ferguson v Carrington (1829) 9 B&C 59, 109 ER 22	128
Fibrosa Spolka Akcyjna v Fairbairn Lawson Combe Barbour Ltd [1943] AC 32 (HL)	34, 73
Filby v Mortgage Express (No 2) Ltd [2004] EWCA Civ 759, [2004] 2 P&CR DG 16	4, 105, 178
Fiona Trust & Holding Corp v Privalov [2007] EWCA Civ 20, [2007] 2 Lloyd's Rep 267	122
Flight v Booth (1834) 1 Bing NC 370, 131 ER 1160	128
Foley v Classique Coaches Ltd [1934] 2 KB 1 (CA)	201
Forman Co Pty Ltd v The Liddesdale [1900] AC 190 (PC)	168

Foskett v McKeown [2001] 1 AC 102 (HL)	56, 59, 191
Fowkes v Pascoe (1875) 10 Ch App 343 (CA)	107
Fowler v Hollins (1872) 7 QB 616 (Ex)	26
Fuller v Happy Shopper Markets Ltd [2001] EWHC 702 (Ch), [2001] 1 WLR 1681	200
Gaba Formwork Contractors Pty Ltd v Turner Corp Ltd (1991) 31 NSWLR 175 (NSWSC)	91
Gareau Estate, Re (1995) 9 ETR (2d) 25 (ONCJ)	189
Garland v Consumers' Gas Co [2004] SCC 25, [2004] 1 SCR 629 (SCC)	14, 46, 153, 222
Gartside v IRC [1968] AC 553 (HL)	28
Gebhardt v Saunders [1892] 2 QB 452 (QB)	102
George v Double D Foods Inc, 155 Cal App 3d 36 (1984)	55
Gertsch v Atsas [1999] NSWSC 898	225
Ghana Commercial Bank v Chandiram [1960] AC 732 (PC)	143
Gibb v Maidstone and Tunbridge Wells NHS Trust [2010] EWCA Civ 678, [2010] IRLR 786	62, 100
Gibson v D'Este (1843) 2 Y&CCC 542, 63 ER 243	129
Gilbert v Knight [1968] 2 All ER 248 (CA)	169, 170
Gillingham Bus Disaster Fund, Re [1958] Ch 300 (Ch)	108, 112–13
Giumelli v Giumelli (1999) 196 CLR 101 (HCA)	148
Goldcorp Exchange, Re [1995] 1 AC 74 (PC)	129
Gollan v Nugent (1988) 166 CLR 18 (HCA)	94
Goodfellow v Robertson (1871) 18 Gr 572 (Ont Ch)	113
Gordon v Chief Commissioner of Metropolitan Police [1910] 2 KB 1080 (CA)	132
Goss v Chilcott [1996] AC 788 (HL)	75
Gough v Wood & Co [1894] 1 QB 713 (CA)	49
Gould v Okeden (1731) 4 Brown 198, 2 ER 135	29
Graves v Graves [2007] EWCA Civ 660, [2007] 3 FCR 26	98
Gray v Hill (1826) Ry&M 420	87
Great Northern Railway Co v Swaffield (1874) 9 Ex 132 (Ex)	185
Greater Pacific Investments Pty Ltd v Australian National Industries Ltd (1996) 39 NSWLR 143 (NSWCA)	124, 131, 133, 134
Greenmast Shipping Co v Jean Lion et Cie (The Saronikos) [1986] 2 Lloyds Rep 277 (QB)	81
Greenwood v Bennett [1973] QB 195 (CA)	48–49, 186–88, 201, 205
Gribbon v Lutton [2001] EWCA Civ 1956, [2002] QB 902	6
Guardian Ocean Cargoes Ltd v Banco do Brasil SA (No 1) [1991] 2 Lloyd's Rep 68 (QB)	103, 198
Guinness Peat Group plc v British Land Co plc [1998] EWCA Civ 1956, [1999] BCC 536	18
Halifax BS v Thomas [1996] Ch 217 (CA)	5
Hall & Tawse South Ltd v Ivory Gate Ltd (1997) 62 Con LR 117 (QB)	80
Halpern v Halpern (No 2) [2007] EWCA Civ 291, [2008] QB 195	117, 124, 125
Hamerton v Stead (1824) 3 B&C 478, 107 ER 811	98
Harbour Assurance Co (UK) v Kansa Ltd [1993] QB 701 (CA)	122

Harrison v Owen (1738) 1 Atk 520, 26 ER 328	120
Hartwell Corp v Smith, 107 Idaho 134 (1984) (Idaho App)	55
Haugesund Kommune v Depfa ACS Bank [2010]	
EWHC 227, [2010] 1 All ER 1109	6
Hawes v Wyatt (1790) 2 Cox 263, 30 ER 122	29
Hayes v Ross (No 3) [1919] NZLR 786 (NZHC)	123
Heperu Pty Ltd v Belle [2009] NSWCA 252	199, 223
Hewitt v Court (1983) 149 CLR 639 (HCA)	105, 141
Heyman v Darwins Ltd [1942] AC 356 (HL)	122
Higgins (W) Ltd v Northampton Corp [1927] 1 Ch 128 (Ch)	135, 136
Hobbs v Marlowe [1978] AC 16 (HL)	142
Horsler v Zorro [1975] Ch 302 (Ch)	118
Horton v Jones (No 2) (1939) 35 SR(NSW) 305 (NSWSC)	83
Howley Park Coal v L & NW Ry [1913] AC 11 (HL)	23
Hunter BNZ Finance Ltd v CG Maloney Pty Ltd (1988)	
18 NSWLR 420 (NSWSC)	117, 131, 132
Hurst v Bryk [2002] 1 AC 185 (HL)	118
Huyton SA v Peter Cremer GmbH & Co [1999]	
1 Lloyd's Rep 620 (QB)	93–95, 179
Hyundai Heavy Industries Co Ltd v Papadopoulos	
[1980] 1 WLR 1129 (HL)	85
IBL Ltd v Coussens [1991] 2 All ER 133 (CA)	91
Independent Grocers Co-operative Ltd v Noble	
Lowndes Superannuation Consultants Ltd (1993)	
60 SASR 525 (SASC)	87
Inverugie v Hackett [1995] 1 WLR 713 (PC)	6, 97
Investors Compensation Scheme Ltd v West Bromwich BS	
[1998] 1 WLR 896 (HL)	138
Ionides v Pender (1874) 9 QB 531 (QB)	117
Irons v Wang [2004] DCR 830 (NZDC)	131, 132
James v Isaacs (1852) 12 CB 791, 138 ER 1115	103
James Hardie & Co Pty Ltd v Wyong Shire Council (2000)	
48 NSWLR 679 (NSWCA)	101
Jeffrey Lorne Gold v Primary Developments Ltd [1997] 3 SCR 767 (SCC)	5
Jeffries v Great Western Rail Co (1856) 5 E&B 802, 119 ER 680	94
Jenkins v Tucker (1788) 1 H Bl 90, 126 ER 55	99–100, 155
Johnson v Agnew [1980] AC 367 (HL)	118, 122, 123, 125, 126
Johnson v EBS Pensioner Trustees Ltd [2002] EWCA	
Civ 164, [2002] Lloyd's Rep PN 30	118
Johnson v Royal Mail Steam Packet Co (1866) 3 CP 38 (CCP)	101
Jones & Sons (a firm) (Trustee) v Jones [1997] Ch 159 (CA)	60, 132, 200
Joscelyne v Nissen [1970] 2 QB 86 (CA)	136
Kane Constructions Pty Ltd v Sopov [2005] VSC 237	81
Kelly v Solari (1841) 9 M&W 54, 152 ER 24	4, 38, 73, 74, 164
Khan v Permayer [2001] BPIR 95 (CA)	105
Kingstreet Investments v New Brunswick	
(Department of Finance) [2007] 1 SCR 3 (SCC)	6, 205
Kirwan v Cresvale Far East Ltd [2002] NSWCA 395, (2002) 44 ACSR 21	134

Kleinwort Benson Ltd v Glasgow CC (No 2) [1996] QB 678 (CA).....	82
Kleinwort Benson Ltd v Lincoln CC [1999] 2 AC 349 (HL)	80, 200
Kleinwort Benson Ltd v Sandwell BC [1994] 4 All ER 890 (QB)	22
Kleinwort Benson Ltd v Vaughan [1996] CLC 620 (CA).....	101–2
Koorootang Nominees Pty Ltd v Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd [1998] 3 VR 16 (VSC)	5
Kupchak v Dayson Holdings Co Ltd (1965) 53 DLR (2d) 482 (BCCA)	130
Kuwait Airways Corp v Iraqi Airways Co (Nos 4 and 5) [2002] UKHL 19, [2002] 2 AC 883	91
Kuwait Airways Corp v Iraqi Airways Co (No 6) [2004] EWHC 2603 (Comm).....	158
Lachhani v Destination Canada (UK) Ltd (1996) 13 Const LJ 279 (QB)	80, 81, 82, 176
Lady Hudson's Case (1704) 2 Eq Cas Abr 52, 22 ER 45	120
Lagunas Nitrate Co v Lagunas Syndicate [1899] 2 Ch 392 (CA)	129, 130
Lamare v Dixon (1873) 6 HL 414 (HL)	117
Laserbore Ltd v Morrison Biggs Wall Ltd [1993] CILL 896 (QB).....	81
Latec Investments Ltd v Hotel Terrigal Pty Ltd (1965) 113 CLR 265 (HCA)	131, 133
Leech v Leech (1674) 2 Ch Rep 100, 21 ER 623.....	120
Leigh v Dickeson (1884) 15 QBD 60 (CA)	48, 168
Lewisham LBC v Masterson (2000) 80 P&CR 117 (CA)	98–99, 177
Lexane Pty Ltd v Highfern Pty Ltd [1985] 1 Qd R 446.....	86
Liberty Mutual Insurance Co (UK) Ltd v HSBC Bank plc [2002] EWCA Civ 691	105
Liggett (B) (Liverpool) Ltd v Barclays Bank [1928] 1 KB 48 (KB).....	103
Lindsay Petroleum v Hurd (1874) 5 PC 221 (PC)	124
Lipkin Gorman v Karpnale Ltd [1991] 2 AC 548 (HL)	80
Littlewoods Retail Ltd v HMRC [2010] EWHC 1071 (Ch), [2010] STC 2072	184
Load v Green (1846) 15 M&W 216, 153 ER 828	117, 131, 132
Lodder v Slowey [1904] AC 442 (PC).....	83, 176
Lonrho plc v Fayed (No 2) [1992] 1 WLR 1 (Ch).....	29, 133
Lucy, The see Atlantic Lines and Navigation Co Inc v Hallam Ltd	
Luxor (Eastbourne) Ltd v Cooper [1941] AC 108 (HL).....	83
Macclesfield Corp v Great Central Railway [1911] 2 KB 528 (CA).....	102
Mackender v Feldia AG [1967] 2 QB 590 (CA).....	118, 122
MacKenzie v Thompson [2005] 3 NZLR 285 (NZHC)	54
Macmillan Inc v Bishopsgate Investment Trust Plc (No 3) [1996] 1 WLR 387 (CA)	6, 76–77
Magical Waters Fountains Ltd v City of Sarnia (1990) 74 OR (2d) 682 (ONCJ)	155
Maguire v Makaronis (1998) 188 CLR 449 (HCA).....	118, 124, 128, 133, 134
Maheesan S/O Thambiah v Malaysian Government Officers Co-operative Housing Society [1979] AC 374 (PC)	74, 117
Mahoney v Purnell [1996] 3 All ER 61 (QB).....	130
Mallott v Wilson [1903] 2 Ch 494 (Ch).....	29

Malory Enterprises Ltd v Cheshire Homes (UK) Ltd [2002] EWCA Civ 151, [2002] Ch 216	140
Manila, The see Proctor & Gamble Philippine Manufacturing Corp v Peter Cremer GmbH	
Marsh v Keating (1834) 1 Bing NC 198, 131 ER 1094	189
Marston Construction Co Ltd v Kigass Ltd (1989) 46 BLR 109 (QB).....	187
Martin v Martin (1959) 110 CLR 297 (HCA)	107
Mason v Welland (1728) Skin 238, 90 ER 109	98
May v Platt [1900] 1 Ch 616 (Ch).....	137, 139
Mayor of Thetford v Tyler (1845) 8 QB 95, 115 ER 810	98
McAllister v Richmond Brewing Co (NSW) Pty Ltd (1942) 42 SR(NSW) 187 (NSWSC).....	123
McCarthy v Kenny [1939] 3 DLR 556 (ONHC)	129, 130
McDonald v Coys of Kensington [2004] EWCA Civ 47, [2004] 1 WLR 2775.....	25, 93, 157, 159, 178–79, 180, 181, 183, 187, 207–8
McDonald v Dennys Lascelles Ltd (1933) 48 CLR 457 (HCA)	118
McFarlane v Tayside Health Board [2000] 2 AC 59 (HL)	158
McKenzie v McDonald [1927] VLR 134 (VSC)	130
McKeown v Cavalier Yachts Pty Ltd (1998) 13 NSWLR 303 (NSWSC)	186
Merchants Express Co v Morton (1868) 15 Gr 274 (Ont Ch).....	108
Metals & Ropes Co v Tattersall [1966] 2 Lloyd's Rep 166 (CA)	179
Mihaljevic v Eiffel Tower Motors Pty Ltd and General Credits Ltd [1973] VR 545 (VSC).....	129
Miles v Wakefield MDC [1987] AC 539 (HL)	50, 168
Miller v Race (1758) 1 Burr 452, 97 ER 398	75
Ministry of Defence v Ashman (1993) 66 P&CR 195 (CA).....	53, 97, 157–59, 162, 164, 166, 190–91, 225
Ministry of Defence v Thompson (1993) 25 HLR 552 (CA)	53, 157, 159, 164, 167, 225
Mohamed v Alaga & Co [2000] 1 WLR 1815 (CA).....	169, 172, 177
Morrison Shipping Co Ltd (in liquidation) v R (1924) 20 Lloyd's L Rep 283 (HL).....	83
Moses v Macferlan (1760) 2 Burr 1005, 97 ER 676	72
Moule v Garrett (1872) 7 Ex 101 (Ex)	99, 101, 184
MSM Consulting Ltd v Tanzania [2009] EWHC 121 (QB).....	171
Munro v Butt (1858) 7 E&B 739, 120 ER 275.....	168
Munro v Willmott [1949] 1 KB 295 (KB).....	186
Murray v Parker (1854) 19 Beav 305, 52 ER 367.....	135, 136, 138, 139, 140
Myers v Macmillan Press Ltd (Unreported QBD, 3 March 1998).....	84
Nai Genova, The [1984] 1 Lloyd's Rep 353 (CA)	135
National Commercial Banking Corp of Australia v Batty (1986) 160 CLR 251 (HCA)	189
National Provincial Bank v Ainsworth [1965] AC 1175 (HL).....	131
Nelson v Nelson (1995) 184 CLR 538 (HCA)	111
Newbigging v Adam (1886) 34 ChD 582 (CA)	117, 122, 123, 129

Nightingall v Devisme (1770) 2 Wm Bl 684, 96 ER 401	50
Nile Rhapsody, The [1994] 1 Lloyd's Rep 382 (CA).....	135
Niru Battery Manufacturing Co v Milestone Trading Ltd (No 2) [2004] EWCA Civ 487, [2004] 2 Lloyd's Rep 319	105
O'Sullivan v Management Agency and Music Ltd [1985] QB 428 (CA)	81, 118, 119, 130–31, 133, 134
Olib, The see Enimont Overseas AG v RO Jugotanker Zadar	
Oliver v Lakeside Property Trust Pty Ltd [2005] NSWSC 1040	168
OLL Ltd v Secretary of State for the Home Department [1997] 3 All ER 897 (QB)	184
Orakpo v Manson Investments Ltd [1978] AC 95 (HL)	142
Ormes v Beadel (1860) 2 Giff 166, 66 ER 70	130
Osborne v Rogers (1669) 1 Wms Saund 264, 85 ER 318	99
OTV Birwelco Ltd v Technical & General Guarantee Co Ltd [2002] EWHC 2240 (TCC), [2002] 4 All ER 668	135
Oxendale v Wetherell (1829) 9 B&C 386, 109 ER 143	91
Pacific Acceptance Corp Ltd v Mirror Motors Pty Ltd (1961) 61 SR(NSW) 548 (NSWSC)	91
Pacific National Investments Ltd v City of Victoria [2004] SCC 75, [2004] 3 SCR 545 (SCC)	14, 153, 174, 222
Pavey & Matthews v Paul (1987) 162 CLR 221 (HCA).....	4, 80, 82, 83, 173, 174, 176, 201–2
Pearce v Brain [1929] 2 KB 310 (KB).....	69
Peel (Regional Municipality) v Canada [1992] 3 SCR 762 (SCC).....	14, 50, 155, 183–85
Peet Ltd v Richmond [2009] VSC 130	86
Penner (J&J) Construction Ltd v Cringan (1994) 93 Man R (2d) 252 (MBQB)	201
Perpetual Trustees v Perkins (1989) Aust Torts Rep ¶80–295 (SCT).....	94
Perpetual Trustees Victoria Ltd v Ford [2008] NSWSC 29, (2008) 70 NSWLR 611	178
Perrin v Morgan [1943] AC 399 (HL)	75
Perrott v Perrott (1811) 14 East 423, 104 ER 665	120
Peter v Beblow [1993] 1 SCR 980 (SCC)	14, 153, 199
Petrotrade Inc v Smith [2000] 1 Lloyd's Rep 486 (QB)	74
Phillips v Phillips (1861) 4 De GF&J 208, 45 ER 1164	29, 65, 131
Planché v Colburn (1831) 5 C&P 58, 172 ER 876.....	84–87, 129, 154–55, 173
Portman BS v Hamlyn Taylor Neck [1998] 4 All ER 202 (CA)	4, 40, 125, 198
Premium Nafta Product Ltd v Fili Shipping Co Ltd [2007] UKHL 40, [2007] 4 All ER 951	122
Proctor & Gamble Philippine Manufacturing Corp v Peter Cremer GmbH (The Manila) [1988] 3 All ER 843 (QB)	183
Prenn v Simmonds [1971] 1 WLR 1381 (HL).....	138
Prickett v Badger (1856) 1 CBNS 296, 140 ER 123	129

Primlake Ltd (in liquidation) v Matthews Associates [2006] EWHC 1227 (Ch), [2007] 1 BCLC 666	105
R v Saddlers' Co (1863) 10 HLC 303, 11 ER 217	132
R v W (1670) in Baker and Milsom, <i>Sources of English Legal History: Private Law to 1750</i> (Butterworths, 1986) 474–75	154
Rathwell v Rathwell (1978) 83 DLR (3d) 289 (SCC)	112
Read v Brown (1888) 22 QBD 128 (CA)	72
Read v Hutchinson (1813) 3 Camp 352, 170 ER 1408	128
Read v Rann (1830) 10 B&C 438, 109 ER 513	179
Reading v Attorney General [1951] AC 507 (HL)	8, 74
Receiver for Metropolitan Police District v Croydon Corp [1956] 1 WLR 1113 (QB)	185
Redgrave v Hurd (1881) 20 ChD 1 (CA)	123, 129
Rees v De Bernardy [1896] 2 Ch 427 (Ch)	130
Reese River Silver Mining Co v Smith (1869) 4 HL 64	118
Renard Constructions v Minister for Works (1992) 26 NSWLR 234 (NSWCA)	81, 176
Reynolds v Ashby & Son [1904] AC 466 (HL)	49
Rhodes, Re (1890) 44 ChD 94 (CA)	185
Rhodian River, The [1984] 1 Lloyd's Rep 373 (QB)	135
Roberts (A) & Co Ltd v Leicestershire CC [1961] Ch 555 (Ch)	135, 136, 137
Rogers v Head (1610) Cro Jac 262, 79 ER 226	79
Rolte v Sharp (1626) Cro Car 77, 79 ER 668	87
Rover International v Cannon Film Sales (No 3) [1989] 1 WLR 912 (CA)	83, 173, 177
Rowe v Vale of White Horse DC [2003] EWHC 388 (Admin), [2003] 1 Lloyd's Rep 418	4, 41, 42, 55, 79, 87, 170, 171, 180
Rowe, Re [1904] 2 KB 483 (CA)	103
Roxborough v Rothmans of Pall Mall Australia Ltd [2001] HCA 68, (2001) 208 CLR 516	4, 7
Royal Bank of Scotland v Etridge (No 2) [2001] UKHL 44, [2002] 2 AC 773	43
Royal Brunei Airlines Sdn Bhd v Tan [1995] 2 AC 378 (PC)	5
Royle v Bagshaw (1589) Cro Eliz 149, 78 ER 407	90, 91
RTS Flexible Systems Ltd v Molkerei Alois Müller GmbH [2010] UKSC 14, [2010] 1 WLR 753	80, 83
Russell v Bell (1842) 10 M&W 340, 152 ER 500	73
Ryall v Ryall (1739) 1 Atk 59, 26 ER 39	108, 110
Saunders v Vautier (1841) 4 Beav 115, 49 ER 482	28
Scarisbrick v Parkinson (1869) 20 LT 175 (Ex)	83
Scott v Pattison [1923] 2 KB 723 (KB)	83
Selway v Fogg (1839) 5 M&W 83, 151 ER 36	128
Sempre Metals Ltd v IRC [2007] UKHL 34, [2008] 1 AC 561	6, 8, 18, 42, 51, 52, 74, 76–77, 80, 96, 98, 128, 129, 158, 160, 172, 190, 197, 198–99, 222, 224
Senanayake v Cheng [1966] AC 63 (PC)	129

Serck Controls Ltd v Drake & Scull Engineering Ltd (2000)	
73 Con LR 100 (QB)	78, 81, 82
Shalson v Russo [2003] EWHC 1637 (Ch), [2005] Ch 281	29, 133
Sharab v Salfiti [1996] EWCA Civ 1189	202
Sharjade Pty Ltd v RAAF [2008] NSWSC 1003	199
Sharwood & Co v Municipal Financial Corp (2001) 197	
DLR (4th) 477 (ONCA)	155
Shepherd v Edwards (1615) Cro Jac 370, 79 ER 317	79
Shi v Jiangsu Native Produce Import & Export Corp [2010]	
EWCA Civ 1582	158
Shipton v Casson (1826) 5 B&C 378, 108 ER 141	91
Shogun Finance Ltd v Hudson [2003] UKHL 62, [2004] 1 AC 919	92, 121
Sibley v Grosvenor (1916) 21 CLR 469 (HCA)	123, 130, 131
Siggers v Evans (1855) 5 E&B 367, 119 ER 518	29
Single v Macharski Estate [1996] 3 WWR 23 (MBCA)	14
Six Carpenters' Case see Vaux v Newman	
Slack v Sharpe (1838) 8 Ad&E 366, 112 ER 876	99
Slade's Case (1602) 4 Co Rep 92b	71–72
Small v Atwood (1832) You 407, 159 ER 1051	29, 129
Smith v Cox [1940] 2 KB 558 (KB)	103
Smith v Jones [1954] 1 WLR 1089 (Ch)	136, 140
Smith v Wheeler (1671) 1 Lev 279, 83 ER 406	29
Sopov v Kane Constructions Pty Ltd (No 2) [2009]	
VSCA 141, (2009) 257 ALR 182	78, 80, 81, 177
Spence v Crawford [1939] 3 All ER 271 (HL)	118, 119, 123, 124, 129
Spencer v S Franes Ltd [2011] EWHC 1269 (QB)	54
Stack v Dowden [2007] UKHL 17, [2007] 2 AC 243	107, 108
Stait v Fenner [1912] 2 Ch 504 (Ch)	140
Stanhope v Stanhope (1998) 166 Sask R 293 (Sask QB)	14
Steven v Bromley & Son [1919] 2 KB 722 (CA)	80, 91
Stocznia Gdanska SA v Latvian Shipping Co [1998] 1 WLR 574 (HL)	85
Strand Electric and Engineering Co Ltd v Bristol	
Entertainments Ltd [1952] 2 QB 246 (CA)	6
Strutt v Smith (1834) 1 CM&R 312, 149 ER 1099	128
Suffell v Bank of England (1882) 9 QBD 555 (CA)	75
Sumpter v Hedges [1898] 1 QB 673 (CA)	50, 87, 168
Swainland Builders Ltd v Freehold Properties Ltd [2002]	
EWCA Civ 560, [2002] 2 EGLR 71	136
Sydney CC v Woodward [2000] NSWCA 201	201
Taitapu Gold Estates Ltd v Prouse [1916] NZLR 825 (NZHC)	140
Taylor v Chester (1869) 4 QB 309 (QB)	132
Taylor v Laird (1856) 25 LJ Ex 329 (Ex)	155, 168
Taylor v Motability Finance Ltd [2004] EWHC 2619 (Comm)	176, 178
Taylor v Streicher [2007] NSWSC 1006	86
Test Claimants in the FII Group Litigation v IRC [2010]	
EWCA Civ 103	62–63

Thomas Bates & Son Ltd v Wyndham's (Lingerie)	
Ltd [1981] 1 WLR 505 (CA).....	137
Thompson v Hickman [1907] 1 Ch 550 (Ch).....	139
Tilley v Bowman [1910] 1 KB 745 (KB).....	131
Tottenham v Green (1863) 32 LJ Ch(NS) 201.....	131
Transpower New Zealand Ltd v Meridian Energy Ltd	
[2001] 3 NZLR 700 (NZHC).....	55
TSB Bank plc v Camfield [1995] 1 WLR 430 (CA).....	134
Turner v Nelethropp (1531) KB 27/1078, m 66.....	90
Turner v York Motors Pty Ltd (1951) 85 CLR 55 (HCA).....	98
Twinsectra v Yardley [1999] Lloyd's Rep Bank 438 (CA);	
[2002] UKHL 12, [2002] 2 AC 164.....	29, 106, 108–9, 111, 131, 133
United Australia Ltd v Barclays Bank Ltd [1941] AC 1 (HL).....	6
Universe Sentinel, The see Universe Tankships Inc of	
Monrovia v International Transport Workers Federation	
Universe Tankships Inc of Monrovia v International Transport	
Workers Federation (The Universe Sentinel) [1983] 1 AC 366 (HL).....	132
Upjay Pty Ltd v MJK Pty Ltd [2001] SASC 62, (2001) 79 SASR 32.....	54
Upton-on-Severn RDC v Powell [1942] 1 All ER 220 (CA).....	170–71, 185
Vadaz v Pioneer Concete (SA) Pty Ltd (1995) 184 CLR 102 (HCA).....	134
Van Den Berg v Giles [1979] 2 NZLR 111 (NZHC).....	86, 180
Vandervell v IRC [1967] 2 AC 291 (HL).....	60, 108, 112–14
Vandervell's Trust (No 2), Re [1974] Ch 269 (CA).....	107, 112
Vanesse v Seguin [2009] ONCA 595, (2009) 96 OR (3d) 321.....	199
Vaux v Newman (The Six Carpenters' Case) (1610) 8 Co	
Rep 146, 77 ER 695.....	79, 87
Vedatech Corp v Crystal Decisions (UK) Ltd	
[2002] EWHC 818 (Ch).....	54, 174, 202
Vee Networks v Econet Wireless International Ltd [2004]	
EWHC 2909 (Comm), [2005] 1 Lloyd's Rep 192.....	122
Venture, The (1908) P 218 (CA).....	107
Vinogradoff, Re [1935] WN 68 (Ch).....	29, 113, 115
Warbrook v Griffin (1609) 2 Brownl 254, 123 ER 927.....	79
Way v Latilla [1937] 3 All ER 759 (HL).....	54, 202–4
Way's Trust, Re (1864) 2 De GJ&S 365, 46 ER 416.....	120
Weatherby v Banham (1832) 5 C&P 228, 172 ER 950.....	90, 92, 179, 180
Webb v Moore (1691) 2 Vent 279.....	89
Webb v Webb [1994] 3 WLR 801 (ECJ).....	28
Wessex Regional HA v John Laing Construction Ltd (1994)	
39 Con LR 56 (QB).....	184
West of England Fire Insurance Co v Isaacs [1897] 1 QB 226 (CA).....	184
Westdeutsche Landesbank Girozentrale v Islington LBC	
[1996] AC 669 (HL).....	6, 7, 28–29, 111–12
Western Bank of Scotland v Addie (1866–69) 1 Sc 145 (HL Sc).....	124, 125
Whelpdale's Case (1605) 5 Co Rep 119a, 77 ER 239.....	117
Whittaker v Campbell [1984] QB 318 (DC).....	105, 116, 119, 124