Indigenous Heritage and Intellectual Property

Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore

2nd Edition

Edited by Silke von Lewinski

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

Indigenous Heritage and Intellectual Property: Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore

Second Edition

Dr. Silke von Lewinski



Published by:

Kluwer Law International

P.O. Box 316

2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn

The Netherlands

E-mail: sales@kluwerlaw.com Website: http://www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc. 7201 McKinney Circle Frederick, MD 21704 United States of America

Sold and distributed in all other countries by: Turpin Distribution Services Ltd. Stratton Business Park Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ United Kingdom

ISBN 978-90-411-2492-0

© 2008 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011, United States of America. E-mail: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Preface

From the end of the 1990s, intellectual property issues around genetic resources, traditional knowledge and folklore have been discussed in different forums as well as in doctrine and other literature with continued intensity and interest. While the possible defensive and positive protection in this context continues to be a marginal topic within the overall field of intellectual property law, it has gained much profile by itself and an advanced level of understanding among those who are interested in intellectual property and genetic resources, traditional knowledge and folklore; the generally available knowledge is considerably broader and more sophisticated than around ten years ago.

Since the first edition of this book did not contain a preface, the background for this book is illustrated here. Even before the WIPO Intergovernmental Committee was established and had its first meeting in 2001, Professor Dr. Gerhard Schricker, then a director of the Max Planck-Institute, sensed the importance of this topic and asked the undersigned to 'do a project' thereon. In view of the existing literature at the time, she decided that a systematic analysis of the issues involved in intellectual property and indigenous heritage was still lacking and proposed the publication of this book, based on a comprehensive structure so as to show the problems to be solved, possible solutions on the basis of existing law, possible tailor-made solutions, and the position of the involved individual issues in a broader context. In addition, she suggested a brainstorming workshop with selected experts in this very field, in particular, Russel Barsh; it was organized by the Max Planck-Institute in November 2000 at Castle Ringberg. Its results were not recorded or published, but they simply served as a basis for the authors of the book and facilitated their task, which was quite different from dealing with any "classical" intellectual property topic.

From the outset, the book publication was planned as a project of the Max Planck-Institute, so that exclusively staff members of the Institute (as well as Peter Tobias Stoll and Anja von Hahn, then of the Max Planck-Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg) were designated as co-authors.

It seems that this book filled a gap with its approach of a systematic, neutral and as comprehensive as possible discussion of the relevant issues. Indeed, already one and a half years after the publication of the first edition, the publisher approached the undersigned with the idea of elaborating a second edition. When the co-authors began to work on

Preface

updating their contributions, it became clear that major developments within the short time had taken place, in particular regarding the sections on genetic resources, traditional knowledge and folklore (Part III, Sections 1, 2 and 4). At the same time, some of the co-authors of the first edition had changed the focus of their work to pursue their careers in different directions. Therefore, Anja von Hahn did not participate in the second edition, but is still a co-author of Part II, which remains considerably influenced by her work. For Matthias Leistner and Michael Hassemer, a new co-author for the book had to be found – not an easy task, given the limited time left and the considerable effort needed. Finally, the undersigned was very glad that Antony Taubman was ready to take over this task, all the more so since he not only had started out as an academic but, thereafter, for many years has been involved in the topic of genetic resources and traditional knowledge at WIPO; in order to fully bring these contributions up to date, he basically had to rewrite them. This fact alone shows how fast developments have taken place, even if they mainly concern the state of debates rather than the adoption of legal instruments.

We hope that this second edition facilitates users' access to the most recent state of knowledge in the field. At the same time, we note that specialized, in-depth studies that would go beyond the scope of this book remain necessary, in particular as regards issues of customary law and a possible recognition of the legal personality of indigenous and traditional communities. The concept of the book, including its structure, is explained in Part I (Introduction). The manuscripts for most contributions were finalized at the beginning of 2007, while the sections on genetic resources and traditional knowledge were finished in August 2007.

Silke von Lewinski Munich, August 2007

Abbreviations

ACPA Anti-cyber-squatting Consumer Protection Act

ACT Australian Capital Territory

ADNDRC Asian Domain Name Dispute Resolution Centre
AfP Archiv für Presserecht (Archive for Press Law)
AGPS Australian Government Publishing Service

AIATSIS Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander

Studies

AILR Australian Indigenous Law Reporter
AIPO African Intellectual Property Organization

AIPPI Association Internationale pour la Protection de la Propriété

Intellectuelle (International Association for the Protection of

Intellectual Property)

AJIL American Journal of International Law

ALAI Association Littéraire et Artistique Internationale (Interna-

tional Literary and Artistic Association)

ALR Australian Law Reports

Am. Indian L. Rev. American Indian Law Review
Am. University L. Rev. American University Law Review

ARIPO African Regional Intellectual Property Organization

Art., Arts Article, Articles

Arts & Ent. L. Rev. Arts and Entertainment Law Review
ASEAN Association of South East Asian Nations

ATSIC Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission

Aust. Year Book Int'l L. Australian Year Book of International Law

BC Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic

Works

BRAC Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee
B.U. Int'l L. J. Boston University International Law Journal

CA *Cour d'Appel* (Court of Appeal)

Cardozo J. Int'l

& Comp. L. Cardozo Journal of International and Comparative Law

CASRIP Center for Advanced Study on Intellectual Property,

University of Washington School of Law

Cass. (civ.) Cour de cassation

CBD Convention on Biological Diversity

CCIPRS Collective Community Intellectual Property Rights

cf. Compare

CIPR Canadian Intellectual Property Review

CGIAR Consultative Group on International Agricultural Research

CITP Charter of the Indigenous-Tribal Peoples of the Tropical

Forests

CLR Commonwealth Law Reports

COICA Coordinating Body of the Indigenous Peoples of the Amazon

Basin

Colum. J.L. & Arts Columbia Journal of Law and the Arts

COP Conference of the Parties

Cop. Bull. Copyright Bulletin

CPI Code de la Propriété Intellectuelle (Code of Intellectual

Property, France)

CRBL Costa Rican Biodiversity Law, no. 7788 of the Legislative

Assembly of the Republic of Costa Rica

CSE Centre for Science and Environment
CSIR Council of Scientific Research of India

CTMR Community Trademark Regulation

DIAND Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development
DIGERPI Dirección General del Registro de la Propiedad Industrial

(General Directorate of the Registrar of Industrial Property)

doc. Document

EBU European Broadcasting Union

EC European Communities
ECJ European Court of Justice

ECOSOC United Nations Economic and Social Council

ed. Editor
edn Edition
eds Editors

EIPR European Intellectual Property Review

ENB Earth Negotiations Bulletin
EPC European Patent Convention
EPO European Patent Office

et al. et alia et seq. et sequen

EU European Union

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

FAO ITPGRFA FAO International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for

Food and Agriculture

Abbreviations xxi

FAO Undertaking International Undertaking on Plant Genetic Resources for

Food and Agriculture of the Food and Agriculture

Organization of the United Nations

FCR Federal Court Reports (Australia)

FFMs Fact-Finding Missions FLR Federal Law Reports

fn. Footnote

Fordham Intell. Prop.,

Media & Ent. L.J. Fordham Intellectual Property, Media and Entertainment Law

Journal

FTAA Free Trade Area of the Americas

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

Gaz. Pal. Gazette du Palais

GI Geographical Indication

GRTKF Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore

GRULAC Group of Latin American and Caribbean Countries

GRUR Gewerblicher Rechtsschutz und Urheberrecht (Industrial

Property Protection and Copyright)

GRUR Int. Gewerblicher Rechtsschutz und Urheberrecht – Internation-

aler Teil (Industrial Property Protection and Copyright - In-

ternational Issue)

IARCs International Agricultural Research Centres

ICCs Indigenous Cultural Communities

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural

Rights

IGC Intergovernmental Committee
ICOM International Council of Museums

ICTSD International Center for Trade and Sustainable Development

i.e. id est

IFF Intergovernmental Forum on Forests

IGC WIPO Intergovernmental Committee on Intellectual Property

and Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore

IIC International Review of Industrial Property and Copyright

Law

ILBIndigenous Law BulletinILMInternational Legal MaterialsILOInternational Labour Organization

Int. J. Cult. Prop International Journal of Cultural Property

IPJ Intellectual Property Journal

INDECOPI Instituto National de Defensa de la Competencia y de la

Protección de la Propriedad Intelectual

Ind. Prop. Industrial Property

INN International Non-Proprietary Names

INTERGU Internationale Gesellschaft für Urheberrecht (International

Society for Authors' Rights)

IP Intellectual Property
IPs Indigenous Peoples

IPC International Patent Classification
IPR Intellectual Property Reports (Australia)

IPRs Intellectual Property Rights

ITPGRFPA International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food

and Agriculture

IUCN The World Conservation Union

J. Cop. Soc'y USA Journal of the Copyright Society of the USA

J. Intell. Prop. L.Journal of Intellectual Property LawJ. Intell. Prop. R.Journal of Intellectual Property Rights

J. Marshall Rev. Intell.

Prop. L. The John Marshall Review of Intellectual Property Law

JPO Japanese Patent Office

J. World Intell. Prop. The Journal of World Intellectual Property

LDA Legge 22 aprile 1941 n. 633. Protezione del diritto di autore

e di altri diritti connessi al suo esercizio (Italian Copyright

Law)

LDCs Least Developed Countries

loc. cit. at the quoted place

Ltd Limited

McGill L.J. McGill Law Journal

Media & Arts L. Rev. Media and Arts Law Review
MEP Member of European Parliament

MERCOSUR Mercado Común del Sur MFN (clause) Most Favoured Nation (clause)

Minn. Intell. Prop. Rev. Minnesota Intellectual Property Review

MIRCENs Microbial Research Centres

Mitt. Mitteilungen der Deutschen Patentanwälte

MTAs Material Transfer Agreements

NAFTA North American Free Trade Agreement

NAGPRA Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act

NCIP National Commission on Indigenous Peoples

NGO Non-governmental organization

NIAAA National Indigenous Arts Advocacy Association

No. Number

OJEC Official Journal of the European Communities
OAPI Organisation Africaine de la Propriété Intellectuelle
OAU Organization of African Unity (now African Union)

op. cit. in the work quoted

p. Page para. Paragraph

xxiii

PCT Patent Cooperation Treaty

PGRFA Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture

PIC Prior Informed Consent
PLT Draft Patent Law Treaty

PIPRA Philippine Indigenous Peoples Rights Act

RIDA Revue internationale du droit d'auteur (International Review

of Authors' Rights)

SAARC South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation
SCIT Standing Committee on Information Technologies
SCP Standing Committee on the Law of Patents
SIPO Chinese State Intellectual Property Office

SPLT Substantive Patent Law Treaty

SRISTI Society for Research Initiatives for Sustainable Technologies

Stan. L. & Pol'y Rev.

TCE

Traditional Cultural Expression

TCM

Traditional Chinese Medicine

TGI

Tribunal de grande instance

TK

Traditional Knowledge

TLDs

Top-Level Domains

TMR

Trademarks Reporter

TMs Trademarks

TNCs Transnational Corporations

TRIPS Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property

Rights

U. Balt. Intell. Prop. J. University of Baltimore Intellectual Property Law Journal

UBC University of Berkeley in California Law Review

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UDRP Uniform Dispute Resolution Policy

UK United Kingdom

UNCED United Nations Conference on Earth and Development UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

UNDP United Nations Development Programme
UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural

Organization

UNFCC United Nations Framework Conventional Climate Change

UNIDROIT Institute for the Unification of Private Law

UNSW Law Journal University of New South Wales Law Journal UPOV International Union for the Protection of New Varieties of

Plants

U.S.C. United States Code

USPTO United States Patent and Trademark Office U.T.Fac. L.Rev. University of Toronto Faculty of Law Review

v. versu

Va. L. Rev. Virginia Law Review

xxiv Abbreviations

VARA Visual Artists' Rights Act

VCH Verlag Chemie

Vol. Volume

Wash UJL & Pol'y Washington University Journal of Law and Policy

WCT WIPO Copyright Treaty

WG-ABS Working Group on Access and Benefit Sharing
WG8J Working Group on Article 8j of the CBD
WGIP Working Group on Indigenous Populations

WHO World Health Organization

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organization
WPPT WIPO Performances and Phonograms Treaty
WSSD World Summit on Sustainable Development

WTO World Trade Organization

Yale Hum. Rts. &

Dev. L.J. Yale Human Rights and Development Law Journal

Notes on Contributors

Anja von Hahn, Dr. iur., LL.M. (New York University), is a former member of German delegations to meetings of the Convention on Biological Diversity and former research assistant at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg. She wrote her doctoral thesis on 'Traditional Knowledge of Indigenous and Local Communities between Intellectual Property Rights and the Public Domain' (in German, English summary). Anja von Hahn is currently working at the legal department of BASF Aktiengesellschaft and mainly specializes in environmental law.

Roland Knaak, Dr. iur. (University of Munich), is Head of Department at the Max-Planck-Institute for Intellectual Property, Competition and Tax Law; attorney at law in Munich; author of books and articles mainly in the law of trademarks, trade names, geographical indications, and unfair competition; lecturer in intellectual property law at the University of Zurich; and president of the German Institute for the Protection of Geographical Indications in Cologne.

Annette Kur, Dr. iur., is Head of Department at the Max-Planck-Institute for Intellectual Property, Competition and Tax Law in Munich; adjunct professor at Munich University and at the Swedish School of Economics, Helsinki (Finland); overseas faculty member of the University of Santa Clara Law School; and associate professor at the University of Stockholm. She was a Hauser Global professor at New York University in fall 2006, and is president of ATRIP (International Association for the Advancement of Teaching and Research in Intellectual Property) 2007–2009.

Matthias Leistner, Prof. Dr. iur., LL.M. (Cambridge), is Professor of Law (Chair for Civil Law, Intellectual Property Law and Competition Law) at the University of Bonn, Member of the Faculty of the Munich Intellectual Property Law Center (MIPLC), and former Head of Department at the Max-Planck-Institute for Intellectual Property, Competition and Tax Law, Munich. His research fields include German and European copyright law, unfair competition law and general civil law. His special interest lies in internet-related law problems. He has published three books and numerous articles on respective issues. His email address is: m.leistner@ip.mpg.de

Silke von Lewinski, Dr. iur., is Head of Department, Max-Planck-Institute for Intellectual Property, Competition and Tax Law (MPI) Munich. She is a frequent copyright expert to the European Commission; delegate at the WIPO Diplomatic Conferences 1996 and 2000 for the EC and Germany, respectively; and legislative expert to governments in European and Asian technical assistance programs. Her recent book publications include: Europäisches Urheberrecht (Vienna, 2001) (with Walter et al.; 2nd edn in English with Oxford University Press (OUP) in preparation); The WIPO Treaties 1996 (London, 2002) (with Reinbothe); and International Copyright Law and Policy (OUP, forthcoming in 2008). She is adjunct Professor at Franklin Pierce Law Center, Concord, NH, US, and at MIPLC and at George Washington University Munich IP Summer Program (with a course on the topic of this book) and has been a visiting professor at numerous universities in France, Canada, at the University of Melbourne and Visiting Scholar at Columbia University, New York. She has represented the MPI at the WIPO IGC on Intellectual Property and Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore since its inception.

Agnès Lucas-Schloetter, *Docteur en droit* (University of Paris I, Panthéon-Sorbonne), is a former Senior Researcher at the Max-Planck-Institute for Intellectual Property, Competition and Tax Law, Munich. She is now Lecturer at the Ludwig-Maximilian University, Munich. Author of *Droit moral et droits de la personnalité. Etude de droit comparé français et allemand* (Presses Universitaires d'Aix-Marseille, 2002); and (with H. Beverley-Smith and A. Ohly) of *Privacy, Property and Personality: Civil law Perspectives on Commercial Appropriation* (Cambridge University Press, 2005).

Peter-Tobias Stoll, Dr. iur., Professor of Law, Georg August University of Göttingen; Head, Department on International Economic Law and Environmental Law of the Institute of International and European Law of the University. He is a former member of German delegations to meetings of the Convention on Biological Diversity and a former senior research fellow, Max-Planck-Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg. His research topics include international economic and environmental law, biodiversity and biotechnology.

Antony Taubman is currently Director (a/g), Global IP Issues Division (including Traditional Knowledge and Life Sciences programs), World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO). He contributes in a personal capacity to this volume; no views expressed should be attributed to WIPO, its Secretariat or its Member States. He has held a range of academic, diplomatic and official posts in the field of IP, and more generally in international relations, and practiced as a patent attorney in the 1980s. His tertiary education has included science, philosophy, classical Greek, international relations and IP law. The chapters he has authored for this volume draw extensively on research undertaken at the College of Law, Australian National University and the Australian Centre for Intellectual Property in Agriculture (ACIPA).

Table of Contents

Abbreviati	ons	xix
Notes on (Contributors	XXV
Part I.	Introduction Silke von Lewinski	1
Part II.	Indigenous Peoples, Indigenous Knowledge and Indigenous Resources in International Law Peter-Tobias Stoll and Anja von Hahn	7
Section 1.	Indigenous Peoples in International Law	7
Section 2.	Indigenous Peoples: Definition IssuesI. The Term 'Indigenous': An ApproximationII. The Recognition of Indigenous Peoples as 'Peoples'	10 11 15
Section 3.	Some Essential Characteristics of Indigenous Cultures I. Collective Rights II. Indigenous Peoples and Their Land III. Indigenous Heritage: Indigenous and Traditional Resources	17 17 18 19
Section 4.	Relevant Human Rights Norms in the Context of Indigenous Knowledge and Indigenous Resources I. General Human Rights Norms Relevant to the Protection of Indigenous Knowledge and Indigenous Resources	21 21
	 Human Rights Standards for the Protection of Intellectual Property Other Relevant Standards in the Context of Indigenous 	21
	Resources and Traditional Knowledge II. Specific Human Rights Instruments for the Protection of	23
	Indigenous Peoples	24
	1. ILO Convention No. 169	25

	 Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples The Proposed American Declaration 	26 29
Section 5.	Indigenous Peoples in International Environmental Law I. The Convention on Biological Diversity 1. 'Indigenous and Local Communities' 2. The General Concept (a) Dependence of Indigenous and Local Communities on Biological Resources (b) The Concept of Benefit-Sharing 3. Art. 8(j) of the CBD as the Key Operative Provision (a) Art. 8(j) in Context: in situ Conservation of Biological Diversity as a State Obligation and the National Law Limitation (b) Subject and Contents	30 31 32 32 32 32 33 34 34
Section 6.	Ongoing Discussions: Recent Developments in International Forums Regarding Indigenous Resources and Traditional Knowledge I. The World Intellectual Property Organization II. Traditional Knowledge in the Context of the WTO III. The Convention on Biological Diversity IV. The Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations: The International Undertaking on Plant Genetic Resources and the Concept of Farmers' Rights 1. 'Farmers' Rights' and Indigenous Peoples 2. The Concept of Farmers' Rights 3. Farmers' Rights, Traditional Knowledge and Intellectual Property V. The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development VI. The World Health Organization	35 36 37 38 41 42 43 44 45
Section 7.	Recent Developments at the Regional and National Levels with Regard to the Protection of Indigenous Resources and Traditional Knowledge	45
Section 8.	Statements, Declarations, Charters, Resolutions, and Recommendations by Indigenous Peoples	
Section 9. Bibliograph	Conclusion	52 52
Part III.	Analysis of Different Areas of Indigenous Resources	59
Section 1.	Traditional Knowledge Antony Taubman and Matthias Leistner I. Findings at the Factual Level	59 59
	 Recognizing the Characteristics of Traditional Knowledge Sources of Factual Information 	59 64

Tr1.1 -	- £	Canadanada
гаріе	o_{I}	Contents

٠	
	v
	Λ

	3.	Terms and Definitions	68
		(a) Choice of Terminology	69
		(aa) General	69
		(bb) Addressing Indigenous Knowledge in Particular	69
		(b) Subject Matter to be Covered: Characterizing	
		Traditional Knowledge	71
		(aa) Holistic Approach	71
		(bb) Diversity	72
		(cc) Self-Referential Aspect of Defining TK	73
		(dd) The Role of a Definition of TK	74
		(ee) Linkage with Traditional Community and	
		Dynamic, Intergenerational Quality	77
		(c) Scope of Legally Protected TK	78
	4.	TK and IP Protection in an Holistic Context	81
	5. Needs and Expectations for the Protection of Traditional		
		Knowledge	82
		(a) Positive Protection	83
		(b) Defensive Protection	85
	6.	The Focus on the Point of Access	87
		(a) General	87
		(b) Initiatives for Documentation Measures –	
		Advantages and Disadvantages	87
	7.	The Role of Customary Law	89
	8.	Use of Certification and Collective Marks and	
		Geographical Indications	90
II.		isting Legal Provisions Regarding the Protection of	
	Tra	aditional Knowledge	92
	1.	TK as Subject Matter for Intellectual Property Rights	92
		(a) International Level	92
		(aa) Patents	93
		(1) Positive Protection of TK Innovations	
		through the Patent System	95
		(i) TK as Inherent Subject Matter for	۰.
		Patent Protection	95
		(ii) Cultural and Legal Constraints on	
		Use of Patent System	0.7
		by TK Holders	97
		(iii) Inventorship in a Traditional	07
		Context	97
		(iv) Application of Patentability	
		Standards in the Context of	100
		TK Systems	100

		(2) Defensive Protection in the Patent	
		System: the PCT	
		and IPC	104
		(i) Recognition of TK in the Patent	
		System	104
		(ii) International Patent Classification	104
		(iii) Patent Cooperation Treaty	104
		(iv) WIPO Recommendations on the	
		Recognition of TK	105
		(v) The Dilemma of Pyrrhic	
		Protection	106
	(bb)	Geographical Indications and Certification	
		Marks	107
	(cc)	Suppression of Unfair Competition	109
	(dd)	Sui Generis Protection	111
(b)	Regio	onal Level	113
	(aa)	Andean Community	113
	(bb)	European Patent Convention	114
		(1) Novelty and Inventive Step under	
		the EPC	114
		(2) Cases on Patenting TK-Related Inventions	115
	(cc)	Regional Models for Protection	120
	(dd)	Bilateral Agreements	120
(c)	Natio	onal Level	121
	(aa)	Patent Law	121
		(1) General Considerations and Some	
		Cases: TK under	
		National Patent Law	121
		(2) Positive Protection of TK under	
		National Law	123
		(3) Defensive Protection of TK against	
		Illegitimate Patenting	124
		(i) Per se Exclusions of TK from	
		Patentability under National Law	124
		(ii) Enhanced Disclosure Mechanisms	
		under National Law	126
	(bb)	Trademarks, Public Certification Systems	
		and Geographical Indications	127
		(1) Collective Marks and Certification	
		Marks (Annette Kur)	12
		(2) Public Certification Systems	
		(Annette Kur)	129