

CHURCHILL



A Major New Assessment
of His Life in
Peace and War

Edited by

Robert Blake and
Wm. Roger Louis

CHURCHILL

Edited by Robert Blake and
Wm. Roger Louis



W·W·NORTON & COMPANY
New York London

Copyright © 1993 The Several Contributors (see pages xi through xv)
First American Edition, 1993.

All rights reserved.

Manufacturing by The Courier Companies.

Printed in the United States of America.

ISBN 0-393-03409-7

W. W. Norton & Company, Inc., 500 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10110
W. W. Norton & Company Ltd., 10 Coptic Street, London WC1A 1PU

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

PREFACE

THE time has come to take full measure of that extraordinary man who is perhaps the greatest figure in twentieth-century history. Now that the official biography by Martin Gilbert has been completed and now that most of the archives and collections of private papers of the period are accessible, it is possible to make a reassessment of Churchill's life and career. His reputation has grown to almost mythical proportions. Such is the admiration for him, especially in the United States, that it sometimes seems difficult to separate the legendary figure from the man. Can the subject be demythologized but treated fairly and judiciously? Or, to put it more modestly, what is the result when one takes a fresh look at his career and tries to make balanced judgements?

The opportunity to answer those questions was provided by a conference held at the University of Texas at Austin in March 1991. Each of the participants, most of them historians, spoke as an authority on at least one aspect of Churchill's career. It is unusual, perhaps, that a group of such experience and range could have been assembled. No-one knew what the outcome would be. No-one foresaw the delicate interplay of ideas about Churchill's motives or the controversial exchange of views on his policies. No-one fully anticipated the extent to which the debate would develop into an inquiry that at times was both critical and unflattering. And yet Churchill emerged from the conference as very much the same familiar figure, though with more nuances. In the mind's eye the statue of him did not change. But the features became more finely chiselled. As a historical figure he became more of a human being with remarkable flaws as well as overarching strengths. His achievement seemed greater than ever. These themes are apparent in the book. All in all, the book helps to provide a better understanding of how Churchill came to be, in A. J. P. Taylor's phrase, 'the saviour of his nation'.

The papers presented at the conference have been rewritten to create the book. Some of the participants at the conference did not write chapters but contributed significantly to the conference discussion that made the book possible. These include Winston S. Churchill, MP;

J. Roderick Heller III of Washington, DC; Donald Lamm of New York City; George Macatee of Dallas; Dr Hans Mark, Chancellor of the University of Texas System; Dr Harry Shukman of St Antony's College, Oxford; and Dr Frank Vandiver of Texas A&M. We regret that Martin Gilbert was unable to come to the conference. We are grateful to Dr Elaine Low for serving as the Conference Rapporteur. We thank Richard Ollard and David Reynolds for writing chapters for the book that did not form part of the original plan of the conference.

The principal sponsors of the Conference were the Kerr Chair of English History and Culture at the University of Texas and the Lyndon Baines Johnson Library. We wish to thank the Director of the Library, Harry J. Middleton, and his staff for the conference arrangements. Our especial thanks go to Marjorie Payne, the conference secretary, to Professor William R. Braisted, who assisted us in the preparation of the manuscript, and to Mary Bull, who prepared the index. We warmly thank those who helped to make the conference possible: Dr and Mrs Alfred B. Brady; Mr and Mrs Ollie Brown; Mr and Mrs Sam J. Brown; Mr and Mrs Creekmore Fath; Mr and Mrs Edwin Gale; Mr and Mrs Baine Kerr; Dr Damon Wells; and, above all, the President and staff of the Pennzoil Company. At the University of Texas we gratefully acknowledge support from the College of Liberal Arts; the Chancellor's Council; the Cline Visiting Professorship Endowment; the Macatee Fellowship Fund; the College and Graduate School of Business; the School of Law; the Division of Continuing Education; the LBJ School of Public Affairs; and the Harry Ransom Humanities Research Center.

R.B.
W.R.L.

LIST OF PLATES

between pages 174 and 175 and 366 and 367

1. Blenheim Palace
2. Lord Randolph Churchill
3. Lady Randolph Churchill with her two sons
4. 2nd Lt. Winston Churchill, 4th Hussars
5. Drawing by 'Spy' in *Vanity Fair*
6. During the Boer War
7. 'Mr. Churchill and the Rhinoceros at Simba'
8. Campaigning in Manchester
9. Sidney Street Siege 1911
10. Giving evidence at the Sidney Street inquest
11. Shaking hands with the Kaiser
12. On the eve of war, 1914
13. Drawing of Admiral Fisher and Churchill at the Admiralty
14. With A. J. Balfour
15. With Lloyd George
16. In Egypt with his wife, Gertrude Bell, and T. E. Lawrence
17. As Chancellor of the Exchequer
18. After being hit by a truck in New York City
19. With Lord Halifax
20. As a co-pilot visiting an Auxiliary Air Force Squadron
21. With Anthony Eden on the way to the House of Commons
22. Making his first wartime broadcast, October 1939
23. Portrayed in German propaganda film
24. Cartoon in the *Evening Standard*, November 1939
25. Churchill at the time he became Prime Minister, May 1940
26. Inspecting bomb damage in London
27. Followed by crowds, September 1940
28. Leaving No. 10 Downing St. with the three Labour Members of the War Cabinet
29. Sunday Service on board the *Prince of Wales*, Placentia Bay, 10 August 1941
30. Addressing Congress, 26 December 1941
31. In Cairo with Service Chiefs

32. In the Kremlin with Stalin
33. With Roosevelt in the White House rose garden
34. With Roosevelt and Stalin in Tehran on Churchill's 69th birthday
35. Wartime Poster
36. Inspecting the 101st Airborne Division with Eisenhower
37. Watching enemy planes in Normandy
38. In an observation post on the Italian front
39. With Field Marshal Alexander in the Italian battle zone
40. Accompanying General de Gaulle
41. The V.E. Day broadcast
42. With Nehru
43. Cabinet colleagues listen to Churchill's last Conservative Conference speech
44. Portrait by Graham Sutherland
45. With Lord Randolph as portrayed in the movie 'Young Winston'
46. Portrayed in 'Young Winston'

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

PAUL ADDISON is a Fellow of Edinburgh University and a former Visiting Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford. He is the author of *The Road to 1945: British Politics and the Second World War*; and *Now the War is Over*. He was an assistant to the late Randolph S. Churchill in editing the Churchill papers for publication. His latest book is *Churchill on the Home Front 1900–1955*.

STEPHEN AMBROSE is the Boyd Professor of History at the University of New Orleans. He is an editor of the *Eisenhower Papers*. His biographies include *The Supreme Commander: The War Years of General Dwight D. Eisenhower*; and *Eisenhower: The President*. He has recently published a biography of *Richard M. Nixon*. His other books include *Rise to Globalism*.

LORD BELOFF is Emeritus Professor of Government and Public Administration, and Emeritus Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford. His books include *The Foreign Policy of Soviet Russia*; *Wars and Welfare: Britain, 1914–1945*; and the two volumes of *Imperial Sunset: Britain's Liberal Empire 1897–1921* and *Dream of Commonwealth, 1921–1942*. He is a Fellow of the British Academy.

LORD BLAKE was Editor of the *Dictionary of National Biography* and Provost of Queen's College, Oxford. His books include *Disraeli*; *The Unknown Prime Minister: Bonar Law*; *The Conservative Party from Peel to Thatcher*; *A History of Rhodesia*; and *The Decline of British Power*. He is a former Chairman of the Rhodes Trustees and a Fellow of the British Academy.

DONALD CAMERON WATT is Stevenson Professor of International History at the London School of Economics. He was an editor of the *Survey of International Affairs*. His books include *Personalities and Policies*; *Succeeding John Bull*; and *How War Came*. He is the Official Historian of *The Central Organization of British Defence, 1945–1966*, and a Fellow of the British Academy.

DAVID CANNADINE, formerly a Fellow of Christ's College, Cambridge, is Professor of English History at Columbia University. His books include *Lords and Landlords: The Aristocracy and the Towns*; *The*

Pleasure of the Past; and *The Decline and Fall of the British Aristocracy*. He has recently edited a one-volume anthology of Churchill's speeches.

FIELD MARSHAL LORD CARVER served as British Chief of the Defence Staff, 1973–6. His books include *El Alamein*; *Tobruk*; *Harding of Petherton*; *The Apostles of Mobility*; *War since 1945*; *The Seven Ages of the British Army*; and *Twentieth Century Warriors*.

PETER CLARKE is a Fellow of St John's College, Cambridge, and Professor of Modern British History in the University of Cambridge. His books include *Liberals and Social Democrats*; *The Keynesian Revolution in the Making, 1924–36*; and *A Question of Leadership: Gladstone to Thatcher*. He is a Fellow of the British Academy and a regular contributor to the *Times Literary Supplement*.

GORDON A. CRAIG is J. E. Wallace Sterling Professor of Humanities Emeritus at Stanford University. He is the author of the Oxford history of *Germany: 1866–1945*; *The Germans*; and *Triumph of Liberalism: Zürich in the Golden Age*. He is a former President of the American Historical Association.

ROBIN EDMONDS served in the British Foreign Service and has been a Fellow of the Woodrow Wilson Center as well as a member of the Council of the Royal Institute of International Affairs. His books include *Soviet Foreign Policy*; and *Setting the Mould: The United States and Britain 1945–1950*. His study of Churchill, Roosevelt and Stalin, *The Big Three*, was published in 1991.

SARVEPALLI GOPAL is Emeritus Professor of Contemporary History at the Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi, and Fellow of St Antony's College, Oxford. He is the author of the three-volume biography of *Nehru*. His other books include *The Viceroyalty of Lord Irwin*; *British Policy in India*; and *Modern India*. He is a former President of the India History Congress.

JOHN GRIGG is a biographer of Lloyd George. His volumes on this subject so far are *The Young Lloyd George*; *Lloyd George: the People's Champion*; and *Lloyd George: From Peace to War 1912–1916*. His other books include *1943: The Victory That Never Was*; and *Nancy Astor*. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Literature.

SIR HARRY HINSLEY was Master of St John's College, Cambridge, from 1979 to 1989. His publications include *Command of the Sea*; *Hitler's Strategy*; *Power and the Pursuit of Peace*; and *British Intelligence*

in the Second World War. He is a former Editor of *The Historical Journal* and a Fellow of the British Academy.

SIR MICHAEL HOWARD, formerly Regius Professor of Modern History at Oxford, is now Robert A. Lovett Professor of History at Yale University. He is a Fellow of the British Academy. His books include *The Franco-Prussian War*; *The Mediterranean Strategy in the Second World War*; *The Continental Commitment*; *War and the Liberal Conscience*; and *Clausewitz*.

RONALD HYAM is a Fellow of Magdalene College, Cambridge. His publications include *Elgin and Churchill at the Colonial Office*; *The Failure of South African Expansion*; (with Ged Martin) *Reappraisals in British Imperial History*; and *Britain's Imperial Century 1815-1914: A Study of Empire and Expansion*. He is an Editor of the *British Documents on the End of the Empire*.

LORD JENKINS OF HILLHEAD is Chancellor of Oxford University. He was a Labour MP from 1948 to 1977 and held Cabinet posts as Home Secretary and Chancellor of the Exchequer. He was founder and first Leader of the Social Democratic Party. Among his books are *Mr. Balfour's Poodle*; *Sir Charles Dilke: A Victorian Tragedy*; *Asquith*; *Baldwin*; *Truman*; and *European Diary*.

DOUGLAS JOHNSON is Professor of French History at the University of London. His works include *France and the Dreyfus Affair*; the *Concise History of France*; *The French Revolution*; and *Britain and France: Ten Centuries*. He is a Fellow of the Royal Historical Society.

R. V. JONES was one of Churchill's principal scientific advisers. He is Professor of Natural Philosophy Emeritus at the University of Aberdeen. In the 1939-45 war he served as Assistant Director of Intelligence. In the post-war Churchill government he was Director of Scientific Intelligence. His publications include *Most Secret War* and *Reflections on Intelligence*.

JOHN KEEGAN is Defence Editor of the *Daily Telegraph*. His books include *Six Armies in Normandy*; *The Face of Battle*; *The Mask of Command*; *The Nature of War*; *The Second World War*; and *The Price of Admiralty*. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Literature.

WARREN F. KIMBALL is Professor of History at Rutgers University. He is the author of *The Juggler: Franklin Roosevelt as Wartime Statesman* (1991); *The Most Unsordid Act: Lend-Lease; Swords or*

Plowshares?; and is the editor of *Churchill & Roosevelt: The Complete Correspondence*. He was the 1988–9 Pitt Professor of American History at Cambridge University.

WILLIAM ROGER LOUIS is Kerr Professor of English History and Culture at the University of Texas, and Fellow of St Antony's College, Oxford. His books include *Imperialism at Bay*; *The British Empire in the Middle East*; and *Leo Amery and the British Empire in the Age of Churchill*. In 1992 he received the Liberal Arts Student Council Award for Outstanding Undergraduate Teaching at the University of Texas.

RICHARD OLLARD has taught at the Royal Naval College, Greenwich, and for many years was a senior editor at William Collins. He is a past Vice-President of the Navy Records Society. His books include *Pepys: A Biography*; *Clarendon and His Friends*; *An English Education: A Perspective of Eton*; and *Fisher and Cunningham: A Study in the Personalities of the Churchill Era*.

ROBERT O'NEILL is Chichele Professor of the History of War and a Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford. He was Director of the International Institute for Strategic Studies from 1982 to 1987. His books include *The German Army and the Nazi Party 1933–39*; *Vietnam Task*; and *Australia in the Korean War*. He is the Armed Services Editor of the *Australian Dictionary of Biography*.

HENRY PELLING is a Fellow of St John's College, Cambridge. His publications include *Origins of the Labour Party*; *America and the British Left*; *The British Communist Party*; *Britain and the Second World War*; and *The Labour Governments 1945–51*. His biography of *Winston Churchill* was published in 1974. He holds an honorary degree from the New School for Social Research.

DAVID REYNOLDS is a Fellow of Christ's College, Cambridge. His publications include *The Creation of the Anglo-American Alliance, 1937–1941* (awarded the Bernath Prize, 1982); *An Ocean Apart: The Relationship between Britain and America in the Twentieth Century* (co-author); and *Britannia Overruled: British Policy and World Power in the Twentieth Century*.

SIR ROBERT RHODES JAMES was Conservative Member of Parliament for Cambridge, 1976–1992. He is a former Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford, and a present Fellow at Wolfson College, Cambridge. His biographies include *Lord Randolph Churchill*; *Lord Rosebery*; *Anthony*

Eden; and *Churchill: A Study in Failure 1900–1939*. He is the Chairman of the History of Parliament Trust.

NORMAN ROSE holds the Chaim Weizmann Chair of International Relations at the Hebrew University, Jerusalem. His books include *Vansittart: Study of a Diplomat*; *The Gentile Zionists*; *Lewis Namier and Zionism*; and *Chaim Weizmann: A Biography*. A Fellow of the Royal Historical Society, he is writing a one-volume biography of Churchill.

D. J. WENDEN was a Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford. He died in 1992. His books include *The Birth of the Movies* and *Battleship Potemkin: Film and Reality*. He was associate Editor of *The Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television*. He was at work on a book on *Political Cinema in Britain, France and Germany*.

PHILIP ZIEGLER served in the British Foreign Service and as Editor-in-Chief at William Collins. His books include *Diana Cooper* and *The Sixth Great Power: Baring's*, as well as official biographies of King Edward VIII and Earl Mountbatten of Burma. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society for Literature and the Royal Historical Society.

ABBREVIATIONS

ADM	Admiralty Papers
BM	British Museum
CAB	Cabinet Papers
FO	Foreign Office Papers
HO	Home Office Papers
PREM	Papers of the Prime Minister's Office
PRO	Public Record Office
T	Treasury Papers

The official biography of Churchill (Randolph S. Churchill and Martin Gilbert, 8 vols., plus companion volumes), is referred to in the following way:

- R. S. Churchill, *Churchill* **Randolph S. Churchill**, *Winston S. Churchill* (London, 1966–7), i: *Youth, 1874–1900* (1966); ii: *The Young Statesman, 1901–1914* (1967); companion vol. ii (1969).
- Gilbert, *Churchill* **Martin Gilbert**, *Winston S. Churchill* (London, 1971–88), iii: *1914–16* (1971); companion vol. iii (1973); iv: *1917–22* (1975); companion vol. iv (1977); v: *1922–39* (1976); companion vol. v (1982); vi: *The Finest Hour* (1983); vii: *The Road to Victory* (1986); viii: *Never Despair, 1945–65* (1988).

Citations will take the following forms: R. S Churchill, *Churchill*, ii.32; Gilbert, *Churchill*, iii. 49; Gilbert, *Churchill*, companion vol. iii, part 2, pp. 36–7.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Plates</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
Introduction	I
1. Churchill and the Pitfalls of Family Piety <i>David Cannadine</i>	9
2. Churchill and Germany <i>Gordon A. Craig</i>	21
3. Churchill and France <i>Douglas Johnson</i>	41
4. Churchill and Social Reform <i>Paul Addison</i>	57
5. Churchill's Economic Ideas, 1900–1930 <i>Peter Clarke</i>	79
6. Churchill and Lloyd George <i>John Grigg</i>	97
7. Churchill and the Labour Movement <i>Henry Pelling</i>	113
8. Churchill and the First World War <i>Michael Howard</i>	129
9. Churchill and Zionism <i>Norman Rose</i>	147
10. Churchill and the British Empire <i>Ronald Hyam</i>	167
11. Churchill and the Monarchy <i>Philip Ziegler</i>	187
12. Churchill and Appeasement <i>Donald Cameron Watt</i>	199
13. Churchill, Radio, and Cinema <i>D. J. Wenden</i>	215
14. Churchill in 1940: The Worst and Finest Hour <i>David Reynolds</i>	241

15.	How Churchill Became Prime Minister	
	<i>Robert Blake</i>	257
16.	Churchill, Japan, and British Security in the Pacific: 1904–1942	
	<i>Robert O'Neill</i>	275
17.	Wheel Within a Wheel: Churchill, Roosevelt, and the Special Relationship	
	<i>Warren F. Kimball</i>	291
18.	Churchill and Stalin	
	<i>Robin Edmonds</i>	309
19.	Churchill's Strategy	
	<i>John Keegan</i>	327
20.	Churchill and the Defence Chiefs	
	<i>Michael Carver</i>	353
21.	Churchill and the Navy	
	<i>Richard Ollard</i>	375
22.	Churchill and Eisenhower in the Second World War	
	<i>Stephen E. Ambrose</i>	397
23.	Churchill and the Use of Special Intelligence	
	<i>F. H. Hinsley</i>	407
24.	Churchill and Science	
	<i>R. V. Jones</i>	427
25.	Churchill and Europe	
	<i>Max Beloff</i>	443
26.	Churchill and India	
	<i>Sarvepalli Gopal</i>	457
27.	Churchill and Egypt 1946–1956	
	<i>Wm. Roger Louis</i>	473
28.	Churchill: The Government of 1951–1955	
	<i>Roy Jenkins</i>	491
29.	Churchill the Parliamentarian, Orator, and Statesman	
	<i>Robert Rhodes James</i>	503
	<i>Notes</i>	519
	<i>Index</i>	565

INTRODUCTION

WINSTON LEONARD SPENCER CHURCHILL was born on 30 November 1874 at Blenheim Palace, the elder of the two sons of Lord Randolph Churchill, who was the third son of the of the seventh Duke of Marlborough. Winston's mother was Jennie Jerome, daughter of Leonard Jerome of New York. Lord Randolph, after a brilliant early political career, made the fatal error of tangling with his leader, the Conservative Prime Minister Lord Salisbury, and resigned from the Chancellorship of the Exchequer in 1886, dying in 1895 from a disease of the brain. He regarded his son as useless, and Lady Randolph was equally unsympathetic. Such affection as Winston received came from his nanny, Mrs Anne Everest, to whom he was devoted. He was sent to Harrow, where he was unhappy, though his academic performance was not as bad as he later claimed. He was put in the 'army class', the dumping ground for less intelligent boys, and got into Sandhurst on the third attempt. He was commissioned in 1895 in the 4th Queen's Own Hussars, just after his father's death.

Money was a problem. Cavalry officers were supposed to have private means: Lord Randolph left only debts. The young Winston, perhaps because of the indifference shown by a father whom he adored, was intensely ambitious and anxious to prove himself. He needed fortune as well as fame and a political career was always his goal. At an early age he acquired a remarkable command of the English language, written and spoken. Eight months after he was commissioned he went as an observer of the Spanish-American war in Cuba and wrote modestly remunerated accounts of it for the *Daily Graphic*. For the next four years he combined, whenever he could, the role of serving officer and war correspondent, pulling every string with his family connections to get himself posted to the places that mattered: the North-West Frontier in 1897; and the Sudan in 1898, when he took part at Omdurman in one of the last cavalry charges in the history of the British army. In 1899 he resigned his commission and stood unsuccessfully for Parliament as a Conservative in a by-election at Oldham. Later that year he went out to South Africa as the *Daily Telegraph's* military correspondent. He was taken prisoner by the Boers after the derailment

of the armoured train in which he was travelling near Colenso. He then made a dramatic escape that hit the headlines all over the world. Four books emerged from his military experiences, written in a style that blended Gibbon and Macaulay, whose works he had read avidly during his spare time in India. By writing and lecturing he had accumulated £10,000 by 1901—a sum worth having in those non-inflationary days.

He stood again for Parliament at Oldham in the general election of 1900. This time he succeeded, though he soon became uneasy about his party's policy. He may have been influenced by writing the life of his father, whose papers revealed how badly he believed he had been treated by the Conservative hierarchy. The party's split over free trade and protection gave Winston the occasion to move over to the other side in 1904. His name and fame made him certain of office in a Liberal government. He was appointed Parliamentary Under-Secretary at the Colonial Office in December 1905—a post all the more important since the Colonial Secretary, Lord Elgin, was in the House of Lords. In 1908 H. H. Asquith, who had succeeded Sir Henry Campbell-Bannerman as Prime Minister, offered him the position of First Lord of the Admiralty—a glittering prize which Churchill refused only because his uncle-by-marriage, Lord Tweedmouth, was the sitting tenant. He became President of the Board of Trade and was supported by David Lloyd George, the new Chancellor of the Exchequer. They struck up a close alliance and promoted a vigorous policy of social reform. Earlier that year he married Clementine Hozier by whom he had a son and four daughters, one of whom died as a child. It was a marriage of intense loyalty on both sides, occasionally interrupted by tiffs and rows: he could be inconsiderate and she was always worried by his extravagance, his passion for gambling, and his consumption of alcohol, which has been exaggerated but was in any view considerable.

In 1910 he became Home Secretary. His tenure was brief but marked by two episodes of some celebrity—the 'Siege of Sidney Street', when he appeared to be personally supervising the massive over-kill of a gang of anarchists in a house off the Mile End Road in London, and the dispersal of rioting Welsh miners on strike at Tonypany in the Rhondda Valley, alleged forever afterwards to have involved the army, though it was in fact achieved by unarmed police.

In 1911 Asquith invited him for the second time to take on the Admiralty. It was a crucial moment in the 'Naval Race' with Germany. It was also the end of a major political crisis over the position of the House of Lords. Churchill had been almost as virulent as Lloyd