



A WORLD BANK POLICY RESEARCH REPORT

# PRIVATE CAPITAL FLOWS TO DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

THE ROAD TO FINANCIAL INTEGRATION



30804103

0804103

# Private Capital Flows to Developing Countries

The Road to Financial Integration



Published for the World Bank  
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

*Oxford University Press*

OXFORD NEW YORK TORONTO  
DELHI BOMBAY CALCUTTA MADRAS KARACHI  
KUALA LUMPUR SINGAPORE HONG KONG TOKYO  
NAIROBI DAR ES SALAAM CAPE TOWN  
MELBOURNE AUCKLAND

*and associated companies in*

BERLIN IBADAN

© 1997 *The International Bank for Reconstruction  
and Development* / THE WORLD BANK  
1818 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A.

Published by Oxford University Press, Inc.  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10016

*Oxford* is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press.  
All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system,  
or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, record-  
ing, or otherwise, without the prior permission of Oxford University Press.

Manufactured in the United States of America  
First printing April 1997

Cover photographs: clockwise, from top right: Josef Polleross/*The Stock Market*; Nadia  
Mackenzie/Tony Stone Worldwide; Julian Calder/Tony Stone Worldwide; Jane Evelyn  
Atwood/*The Stock Market*; D. Stoecklein/*The Stock Market*

The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this publication and  
accepts no responsibility whatsoever for any consequence of their use.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

*Private capital flows to developing countries : the road to financial  
integration.*

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p. ).

ISBN 0-19-521116-2

1. Investments, Foreign—Developing countries. 2. Capital  
movements—Developing countries. I. World Bank.

HG5993.P747 1997

332.67'3'091724—DC21

97-11785

CIP

ISSN 1020-0851

∞ Text printed on paper that conforms to the American National Standards for Permanence  
of Paper for Printed Library Materials. Z39.48-1984

# Private Capital Flows to Developing Countries

A World Bank Policy Research Report



# Foreword

FINANCIAL MARKETS AROUND THE WORLD ARE RAPIDLY INTEGRATING into a single global marketplace, and developing countries are increasingly part of this process. The process is being driven by advances in communications and information technology, deregulation of financial markets, and the rising importance of institutional investors that are able and willing to invest internationally. The good news is that developing countries are attracting private capital flows by improving macroeconomic policy and by establishing institutions and regulatory regimes that have increased creditworthiness and promise a more stable environment. Moreover, investors are also becoming more sophisticated in differentiating among countries and their economic fundamentals. Finally, after the Mexican crisis of 1994–95, the international community has realized that more should be done to reduce volatility and risks in international financial markets by improving market disclosure and strengthening coordination among national authorities.

Nevertheless, there remain reasons for concern. First, for the twenty or so countries that have been the major recipients, the management of private capital flows has not proved to be easy. It is not just the volume of flows, but the speed at which such investment pours in—and can be withdrawn—that present particular challenges to these economies. Governments need to build the kind of macroeconomic, regulatory, and institutional environments that channel this private capital into broad-based and sustainable growth. Second, the overwhelming majority of developing countries, in particular the smaller low-income economies, still need to create the conditions to attract private capital and must depend on declining official flows.

This report makes a serious and timely contribution to the analysis of these issues. It explores the nature of the changes that are leading to the integration of developing countries in world financial markets, and it analyzes the policy challenges these countries face in attracting and managing private capital flows. It concludes, for example, that countries receiving large capital inflows should avoid using them to finance



large fiscal deficits or consumption booms. The report also includes specific recommendations and warnings on regulatory design that may be useful to developing countries as they seek to maximize the positive contribution of capital inflows while minimizing their potentially disruptive effects.

This book, therefore, will be highly useful to policymakers in developing countries and, more generally, to all development specialists. But it will also be essential reading for members of the global financial community. Investors have seen in recent years how dynamic—and sometimes volatile—emerging markets can be. Understanding these opportunities and challenges is critical for everyone.

The report also comes at an important time for the World Bank. The challenge for the Bank and other development agencies is to create strategies to help developing countries leverage private capital flows so that all benefit. The research presented in this book is an important step in constructing such strategies.

Like previous volumes in the Policy Research Report series, *Private Capital Flows to Developing Countries* is designed for a wide audience. It is a product of the staff of the World Bank; the judgments made in the report do not necessarily reflect the views of the Board of Directors or the governments they represent.

Joseph E. Stiglitz  
Senior Vice President  
and Chief Economist  
The World Bank

April 1997

# The Report Team

THE REPORT TEAM WAS LED BY AMAR BHATTACHARYA AND comprised Pedro Alba, Swati Ghosh, Leonardo Hernández, Peter Montiel, and Holger Wolf. Substantial background input was also provided by Andrea Anayiotos (chapter 2), Soonhyun Kwon (measurement of financial integration), Maria Soledad Martinez-Peria (chapter 5), and Michael Pomerleano (chapter 6). The main research assistance was provided by Jill Dooley, Matthew Anderson, and Jos Jansen. Bakhodir Atahodjaev, Madeleine Li-Chay-Chung, and Alok Garg also provided research assistance. Deborah Davis edited the first draft of the study, and Anatole Kaletsky provided editorial input on the summary and chapter 1. K. Anna Kim provided logistical and secretarial support for the overall study, and Hong Vo for chapters 2 and 5. The study was initiated by and carried out under the direction of Michael Bruno and Masood Ahmed. Joseph Stiglitz provided guidance in the closing stages of the study.

The editorial production team was led by Anthony Pordes. The team was assisted by Paola Brezny, Amy Brooks, and Audrey Heiligman. Joyce Gates provided production support.

# Acknowledgments

THE REPORT HAS BENEFITED FROM DISCUSSIONS WITH AND comments and contributions from many persons outside and within the World Bank. Special thanks are due to those who have provided guidance and feedback from the inception to the completion of the study. These include Gerard Caprio, Stijn Claessens, Richard Frank, Morris Goldstein, Sarwar Lateef, Diana McNaughton, Gary Perlin, D. C. Rao, Jed Shilling, and Paulo Vieira da Cunha. Special thanks are also due to Mariano Bengoechea, Claudia Morgenstern, Susan Pascocello, Ester Saverson Jr., and Robert Strahota for their extensive feedback on chapter 6. The report also benefited from discussions with Ismail Dalla, Jack Glen, Ross Levine, Millard Long, and Andrew Sheng. We would like to acknowledge support from staff and management of the International Monetary Fund; Sunil Sharma participated in a mission to prepare a background paper, and Donald Mathieson, Anthony Richards, and Michael Spencer provided valuable comments.

The report would not have been possible without the willingness of the private sector to share its perspective on investing in emerging markets. The report has drawn on interviews with many fund managers and pensions funds, information provided by global custodians, and discussions with many others in the financial community. Although they are too numerous to mention, we would like to make special note of the support received from the Frank Russell Company; Citibank, N.A.; the Bank of New York; INTERSEC Research Corporation; and the International Federation of Stock Exchanges (FIBV).

The report drew on background papers or inputs by Reena Aggarwal, Philip Brock, José de Gregorio, Persephone Economou, Ian Giddy, Morris Goldstein, Naoko Kojo, Elizabeth Morrissey, Gabriel Perez-Quiros, Maria Scattaglia, and Charles Seeger. The study has also drawn on a number of country studies that we intend to include in a subsequent volume. The Asian component of the review of country experiences was undertaken collaboratively with the Asian Development Bank (ADB). The study has also benefited from a joint ADB–World



Bank workshop on “Private Capital Flows: Implications for Capital Markets in Asia,” and we would like to thank the participants in that workshop. Many individuals in the International Economics Department provided data needed for the study; we would like to make special acknowledgment of the support received from Punam Chuhan and Himmat Kalsi.

Many Bank staff members provided valuable comments, including Noritaka Akamatsu, Suman Bery, Francis Colaco, Uri Dadush, Asli Demirgüç-Kunt, Cevdet Denizer, Hinh Dinh, Daniela Gressani, Norman Hicks, Akira Iida, Ronald Johannes, Johannes Linn, Will Martin, Vikram Nehru, Ngozi Okonjo-Iweala, Guillermo Perry, Thierry Pujol, Zia Qureshi, Jean-François Rischard, Hemant Shah, Robert Shakotko, C. K. Teng, John Williamson, and Roberto Zaghera. Finally, we have benefited from comments received at a Board seminar on the draft report.

# Data Notes and Abbreviations

## Data Notes

**H**ISTORICAL DATA IN THIS BOOK MAY DIFFER FROM THOSE in other World Bank publications if more reliable data have become available, if a different base year has been used for constant price data, or if countries have been classified differently.

- *Billion* is 1,000 million.
- *Trillion* is 1,000 billion.
- *Dollars* are current U.S. dollars unless otherwise specified.

## Abbreviations and Acronyms

ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BIS	Bank for International Settlements
C&S	Clearance and settlement (securities)
CPI	Consumer price index
FDI	Foreign direct investment
IFC	International Finance Corporation
IFCI	IFC Emerging Markets Index
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IOSCO	International Organization of Securities Commissions
ISSA	International Society of Securities Administrators
GDP	Gross domestic product
GNP	Gross national product
SRO	Self-regulatory organization

# Contents

Foreword	xi
The Report Team	xiii
Acknowledgments	xv
Data Notes and Abbreviations	xvii
Summary	1
<b>1 The Main Findings</b>	<b>9</b>
A New Age of Global Capital	13
Benefits and Risks of Financial Integration	22
Policy Challenges and Emerging Lessons	32
Notes	72
<b>2 The New International Environment</b>	<b>75</b>
The Structural Character of New Private Capital Flows	80
The Structural Forces Driving Private Capital Flows to Developing Countries	85
The Outcome of Structural Changes: Growing Investment in Emerging Markets	104
The Prospects for Private Capital Flows	111
Volatility Arising from the International Environment	124
Conclusion	140
Annex 2.1. Key Deregulations, Financial Innovations, and Technological Advances	144
Notes	148
<b>3 The Benefits of Financial Integration</b>	<b>153</b>
Integration and Growth	153
Diversification Benefits	166
Conclusion	168
Notes	169

<b>4</b>	<b>Challenges of Macroeconomic Management</b>	<b>171</b>
	Capital Inflows and Overheating: The Country Experience	174
	Policy Regimes and Vulnerability	192
	Macroeconomic Management with Growing Financial Integration	196
	Lessons for Macroeconomic Management	214
	Annex 4.1. Monetary and Fiscal Policies during Capital Inflow Episodes	219
	Annex 4.2. Can Sterilization Be Effective?	223
	Notes	226
<b>5</b>	<b>The Effects of Integration on Domestic Financial Systems</b>	<b>229</b>
	Bank Lending and Macroeconomic Vulnerability	236
	Bank Lending and Financial Sector Vulnerability	249
	Financial Sector Reforms in the Context of Integration: Policy Lessons	257
	Annex 5.1. Capital Inflows, Lending Booms, and Banking Crises: Country Episodes	287
	Annex 5.2. Government Guarantees, High Real Interest Rates, and Banking Sector Fragility	289
	Annex 5.3. Risk-Adjusted Capital-Asset Ratios: The BIS Classification of Risky Assets	293
	Annex 5.4. Crisis Management in a Constrained Setting: The Case of Currency Boards	296
	Notes	298
<b>6</b>	<b>Preparing Capital Markets for Financial Integration</b>	<b>303</b>
	The Main Issues	304
	Capital Markets and Financial Integration	313
	Improving Market Infrastructure	323
	The Regulatory Challenges of Financial Integration	340
	Summary and Conclusions	368
	Annex 6.1. G-30 Recommendations and Suggested ISSA Revisions	376
	Annex 6.2. Market Microstructures	378
	Annex 6.3. Construction of the Emerging Markets Index	382
	Notes	385

## **Bibliography 391**

### **Boxes**

1.1	Measuring Financial Integration	17
-----	---------------------------------	----

1.2	What Is Constraining Foreign Capital Inflows to Sub-Saharan Africa?	34
1.3	Best Practice in Market Infrastructure	56
1.4	Principles of the Self-Regulatory Model	58
1.5	International Regulatory Cooperation and Coordination	64
2.1	Are Private Capital Flows a Cyclical and Temporary Phenomenon? The Early Answers	81
2.2	Are the New Private Capital Flows Cyclical or Structural? Recent Empirical Evidence	82
2.3	Pension Funds in Emerging Markets	108
2.4	Pension Reforms and Their Implications for Investments in Emerging Markets	118
2.5	Defined Contribution Pension Plans and International Diversification	122
2.6	Is the Current Investor Base Prone to Herding?	128
2.7	Do Investors Overreact to Changes in Brady Bond Prices?	132
2.8	The Form in Which Foreign Investors Participate in Emerging Markets Will Vary with the Extent of Financial Integration	134
3.1	The Empirical Link between Integration and Deepening	160
4.1	Capital Controls in Chile, Colombia, and Malaysia	179
4.2	Objectives of Capital Controls and Conditions for Effectiveness	198
4.3	Effectiveness of Capital Controls in Chile, Colombia, and Malaysia	201
4.4	Recent Country Experience with Exchange Rate Bands	204
4.5	The Mexican Tesobono Crisis	213
5.1	The Costs of Banking Crises	234
5.2	International Financial Integration and Boom-Bust Cycles	238
5.3	Excessive Bank Lending Tends to Increase the Current Account Deficit	242
5.4	Excessive Bank Lending Can Lead to Underinvestment and Overconsumption	244
5.5	Bank Lending Booms and Overheating: The Importance of Fiscal Policy	247
5.6	Good Bankers Make a Safe and Sound Banking Industry	264
5.7	Containing the Lending Boom: Taxation	274
5.8	Orthodox versus Heterodox Bank Regulations	279
5.9	Infeasible Policies in Banking Crisis Management	282
6.1	Investors' Viewpoint: Risks and Transaction Costs in Emerging Markets	310
6.2	Corporate Governance in India	318
6.3	Clearance, Settlement, and Depository Functions in Thailand	325
6.4	Developing Capital Market Infrastructure in Asia and Latin America	334

6.5	The Anatomy of Bolsa de Mexico's Clearance, Settlement, and Depository System	340
6.6	The Regulator and Market Development	345
6.7	Promoting Domestic Institutional Investors	350
6.8	Effective Governance of SROs in the United Kingdom and the United States	362
6.9	The Role of the State in Capital Markets in Asia and Latin America	365
6.10	Developing Local Bond Markets	374

### Text figures

1.1	Private Capital Flows to Developing Countries, 1975–96	10
1.2	Composition of Net Private Capital Flows to Developing Countries, 1980–82 and 1995–96	11
1.3	Concentration of Private Capital Flows, Selected Developing Countries, 1990–95	12
1.4	Composition of Net Overall Private Capital Flows by Region	13
1.5	Large Reversals in Net Private Capital Flows	28
1.6	Sources of Volatility in Emerging Markets	29
1.7	Changes in Volatility of Reserves: 1980–89 and 1992–96	30
1.8	Banks' Share of Financial Intermediation, Selected Developing and Industrial Countries, 1994	46
1.9	Health of Banking Systems	47
1.10	Capital Flows, Lending Booms, and Potential Vulnerability	49
1.11	Official and Private Gross Capital Flows to Low-Income Countries (excluding China and India), 1970–95	67
1.12	Official and Private Gross Capital Flows to the 12 Largest Recipients of Private Capital, 1970–95	69
2.1	Structural Forces Driving Private Capital to Developing Countries	76
2.2	Effects of Policy Reforms in Developing Countries Receiving Large Private Capital Flows	87
2.3	Output and Export Growth, Selected Regions, 1986–90 and 1991–95	88
2.4	Potential Benefits from Portfolio Risk Diversification	90
2.5	Correlations of Returns among Emerging Markets	91
2.6	Institutionalization of Savings	98
2.7	International Diversification of Institutional Investors, Selected Countries, 1990 and 1994	100
2.8	Entry Restrictions for Foreign Investors in Emerging Stock Markets, 1991 and 1994	103
2.9	International and Emerging Market Assets of U.S. Open-End Mutual Funds, 1990–95	107
2.10	Emerging Market Investments of Industrial Country Mutual Funds, 1993–95	108



2.11	International and Emerging Market Assets of U.S. Pension Funds, 1990–94	110
2.12	Developing and Industrial Countries' Growth, 1980–2005	112
2.13	Demographic Structures of Developing and Industrial Countries, 1995	113
2.14	Elderly Dependency Ratios, Selected Industrial Countries, 1990–2030	114
2.15	Pension Fund Assets and International Diversification, Selected Countries	121
2.16	International Interest Rates and Portfolio Flows to Emerging Markets, 1993–96	127
2.17	Excess Volatility in Emerging Markets, Selected Countries and Years	131
2.18	Impact of the Mexican Crisis on Stock Market Prices in Emerging Markets, 1994–95	138
3.1	Initial Financial Depth and Future Growth	158
3.2	Portfolio Equity and Capital Market Development, Selected Countries	159
3.3	Growth in Domestic Trading in Selected Emerging Equity Markets	162
4.1	Change in the Current Account Deficit and the Real Effective Exchange Rate during Inflow Episodes, Selected Countries	187
4.2	Change in Growth and the Composition of Absorption during Inflow Episodes, Selected Countries	190
4.3	Change in the Composition of Absorption and the Real Effective Exchange Rate during Inflow Episodes, Selected Countries	191
5.1	Bank Lending to the Private Sector during Inflow and Pre-inflow Periods, Selected Countries and Years	240
5.2	Stock Prices during Inflow Periods, Selected Countries	248
5.3	Change in Nonperforming Loans	255
5.4	Change in Foreign Currency Exposure	255
5.5	Change in Net Interest Margin	255
5.6	Change in Capital-Asset Ratios	255
5.7	Change in Loan Loss Provisions	255
5.8	Exposure to Sectoral Risks	255
5.9	Macroeconomic and Financial Sector Vulnerabilities during Capital Inflow Episodes, Selected Countries and Years	258
6.1	Factors Affecting Volatility of Asset Prices in Emerging Markets, 1990s	321
6.2	Excess Volatility and Market Development	322
6.3	Settlement and Postsettlement Efficiency, Selected Emerging and Developed Markets, 1995	336
6.4	Bid-Ask Spreads in Emerging and Industrial Country Equity Markets, 1996	372
6.5	Major Types of Trading Systems	379

## Text tables

1.1	Net Private Capital Inflows to 20 Developing Countries, 1990s	27
1.2	Volatility of Private Capital Flows from the United States, 1980s and 1990s	31
1.3	Volatility of Capital Flows, Selected Countries, 1980s and 1990s	31
1.4	Surges in Private Capital Flows to 20 Countries: Policy Responses and Outcomes	36
1.5	Impact of the Mexican Crisis on Selected Developing Countries	41
2.1	Volatility in Various Stages of Financial Integration	136
3.1	Change in Domestic Activity in Selected Emerging Equity Markets	161
3.2	Bank Operating Ratios, OECD Economies, 1980s	162
3.3	Potential Savings from Adopting Best Practice, Selected EU Countries	163
3.4	Spread between Short-Term and Deposit Rates: France, Germany, and Spain, 1980–89	164
3.5	Cross-correlation of Consumption Growth, Selected Regions, 1960–87	167
4.1	Net Private Capital Inflows to 21 Developing Countries, 1988–95	175
4.2	Main Policy Responses to Surges in Capital Inflows, 1988–95	178
4.3	Disposition of Private Capital Inflows during Inflow Episodes	180
4.4	Macroeconomic Performance during Inflow Episodes	186
4.5	Composition of Absorption during Inflow Episodes	189
4.6	Vulnerability to the Mexican Crisis, Selected Countries, 1988–93	194
5.1	Indicators of Financial Intermediation, Selected Countries	230
5.2	Domestic and External Financial Sector Reform: Policy Recommendations	260
5.3	Containing Lending Booms: Policy Options	268
5.4	Banking Crisis: Policy Options	276
6.1	Stock Market Growth in Selected IFC Index Countries, 1985–96	305
6.2	Estimates of Foreign Presence in Emerging Stock Markets, 1995	306
6.3	Issues of American and Global Depository Receipts, 1989–95	308
6.4	Conformity with the Group of 30 Recommendations	337
6.5	Investment Restrictions in Emerging Equity Markets, 1995	366
6.6	Legal and Regulatory Initiatives in Emerging Markets	368
6.7	Capital Market Development in Emerging Markets, 1995	371



# Summary

THE WORLD'S FINANCIAL MARKETS ARE RAPIDLY integrating into a single global marketplace, and ready or not, developing countries, starting from different points and moving at various speeds, are being drawn into this process. If they have adequate institutions and sound policies, developing countries may proceed smoothly along the road to financial integration and gain the considerable benefits that integration can bring. Most of them, however, lack the prerequisites for a smooth journey, and some may be so ill prepared that they lose more than they gain from financial integration. Developing countries have little choice about whether to follow this path, because advances in communications and new developments in finance have made the course inevitable. They can, however, decide how they wish to travel, choosing policies that benefit the economy and avert potential shocks.

This volume describes the forces that have created and that sustain this road, analyzes the benefits and problems likely to be encountered on it, and examines the experiences of those who are farther along on the journey to see what can be learned from them.

## **The Changing Financial Environment**

While the cyclical downturn in global interest rates provided an important initial impetus for the resumption of private capital flows to developing countries in the 1990s, these flows have now entered a new phase, reflecting structural forces that are leading to progressive financial integration of developing countries into world financial markets. The two primary forces that are driving investor interest in developing