GOVERNANCE AND INVESTMENT OF PUBLIC PENSION ASSETS

Practitioners' Perspectives

		IN THE RESERVE OF THE PARTY OF	
# P.5	1412-11-0.73 V 0.06% 1795-63-849 V 0.05%	778.33 1.34 0.00%	791900
6%	1795 60 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0		1112.11
O 10	1795.63 8.49 \ 0.05\% 1791.97 4.83	9943.87 760	
A Sugar			1787.63
	- 767.89 0.01 ▲ 0.00%	1787.63 8.49 ▲ 0.38%	1791.97
#88.5 g	778.33 1.34 10.17%	1791.97 4.83 A 0.27%	
	4443 97 7 69	1295.09 -0.54 🔻 0.13%	1295.09
	4443.87 7.63 ▲ 0.23%	767.89 0.01 • 0.10%	707.00
5%	2916 .60 -4.89 ▼ 0.16%	700.33 1.34 🛦 0.17%	767.89 700.33
	1112.11 -0.73 🔻 0.05%	443.83 5.63 4 0.23%	
	1787.63 8.49 4 0.38%	416.60 -6.89 ▼ 0.06%	4443.87
	1791.97 4.83 4 0.27%	412.11 -0.73 ▼ 0.15%	2916.60
8%	1295.09 -0.54 ▼ 0.13%	795.63 8.49 ▲ 0.48%	
7%	767.89 0.01 ▲ 0.10%	791 97 4.83 ▲ 0.27%	1112.11
/ /0	767.89 0.01 0.170/	795.09 -0.54 ▼ 0.53%	
	700.33 1.34 4 0.17%	-207 on 101 ▲ 0.00%	
3%	443,83 5.63 A 0.23%	767.69 VA. 778.33 1.34 A 0.17%	1787.63
	MARKET AA C QU W U UU / Y	110.00	1791.97
0%		ee a 0.23%	1295.09
		2443.83 5.63 A 0.23%	1/299.03
7%	412,11 -0.73 ★ 0.48% 795.63 8.49 ★ 0.27%	2443.83 5.63 ▼ 0.06% 2416.60 -6.89 ▼ 0.05%	767.8 ^ç
The same of the sa		and the second s	

Editors

Sudhir Rajkumar Mark C. Dorfman

Governance and Investment of Public Pension Assets

Practitioners' Perspectives





@2011 The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank 1818 H Street NW

Washington DC 20433
Telephone: 202-473-1000
Internet: www.worldbank.org
E-mail: feedback@worldbank.org

All rights reserved 1 2 3 4 13 12 11 10

This volume is a product of the staff of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this volume do not necessarily reflect the views of the Executive Directors of The World Bank or the governments they represent.

The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Rights and Permissions

The material in this publication is copyrighted. Copying and/or transmitting portions or all of this work without permission may be a violation of applicable law. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank encourages dissemination of its work and will normally grant permission to reproduce portions of the work promptly.

For permission to photocopy or reprint any part of this work, please send a request with complete information to the Copyright Clearance Center Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA; telephone: 978-750-8400; fax: 978-750-4470; Internet: www.copyright.com.

All other queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to the Office of the Publisher, The World Bank, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA; fax: 202-522-2422; e-mail: pubrights@worldbank.org.

ISBN: 978-0-8213-8470-1 e-ISBN: 978-0-8213-8471-8 DOI:10.1596/978-0-8213-8470-1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Governance and investment of public pension assets: practitioners' perspectives / Sudhir Rajkumar and Mark C. Dorfman, editors.

p. cm. Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 978-0-8213-8470-1 (alk. paper) — ISBN 978-0-8213-8471-8

Pension trusts. 2. Pension trusts—Investments. 3. Financial crises—21st century.
 Rajkumar, Sudhir. II. Dorfman, Mark C.
 HD7105.4.G68 2011
 332.67'254—dc22

2010044312

Foreword

The global financial crisis of 2008–09 hit pension funds hard, reducing the value of their assets dramatically. Together with increased fiscal pressures and the longer-term aging trend in populations, it has brought the pension funding challenge to the top of the policy agenda in many countries. Much of the solution to this challenge, of course, lies in addressing the scale and structure of promised benefits and burden sharing among different stakeholders. But governance and investment policy—the subjects covered in this volume—also play a crucial role.

Public pension funds are among the largest pools of assets in many countries, and therefore are an important category of long-term institutional investors. At the same time, investment returns on public pension funds in many countries have been below the inflation rate or lagged growth in per capita income, undermining the financial sustainability of these pension systems. Weak governance, susceptibility to political interference, and a low level of transparency and public accountability to often contribute to this troubling outcome, as does the public sector's unwillingness or inability to invest adequately in the human capital and physical infrastructure essential to achieve adequate risk-adjusted returns.

In an effort to address some of these weaknesses in governance and investment capabilities, and contribute to the World Bank's broader development mission, the World Bank Treasury partners with pension funds and other public sector asset managers in our member countries as they build the capacity to address these issues. These partnerships are grounded in the essential cooperative nature of our institution, and build on the Treasury's 60 years of experience in managing assets in global markets across a broad spectrum of asset classes.

Governance and Investment of Public Pension Assets: Practitioners' Perspectives brings together contributions from more than 30 pension fund practitioners, policy makers, regulators, and experts from around the world. It illuminates key issues related to the governance and investment management of pension funds using real-world examples. The editors designed the volume as an accessible guidebook for senior policy makers seeking practical ways to tackle the issues they face in governance and investment of public pension assets.

I believe this book meets a widely acknowledged need for more practitioneroriented information on these issues, and should catalyze further work in this important field.

Kenneth G. Lay Vice President and Treasurer World Bank

Acknowledgments

This book could not have been possible without the contribution and collaboration of a large group of individuals inside and outside the World Bank. More than 30 practitioners who hold leadership positions in public pension funds, and pension policy making and regulatory agencies in different parts of the world, as well as experts in various global and multilateral organizations, took the time from their busy schedules to contribute papers for this book. Their knowledge and experience in the practical aspects of the governance and investment of public pension assets, coupled with their professional insights, will without a doubt be highly useful for governing board members and other officials of public pension funds, as well as government officials responsible for pension policy and regulation.

We are grateful for the insights offered by Jeffrey Carmichael, Chief Executive Officer of Promontory Financial Group Australasia, and Jai Parihar, retired Chief Investment Officer of Alberta Investment Management Corporation, both of whom provided objective and constructive comments as external reviewers on earlier drafts of the book. Jeffrey and Jai's efforts allowed us to fashion the structure, clarify the content, and improve the overall utility of the book.

Within the World Bank, we are indebted to Kenneth G. Lay, Vice President and Treasurer, and Jennifer Johnson-Calari, Director, Sovereign Investment Partnerships, for their institutional leadership and support for this project. Robert Holzmann, Senior Policy Advisor, supported the global pensions symposium held in Bali, Indonesia, in June 2009, where many of the themes addressed in this book were first discussed, in addition to jointly contributing a paper on risk mitigation in national pension systems.

Dana Vorisek rendered excellent professional editing services, providing muchneeded clarity to the body of writing and advising on the organization of the book. Nita Congress provided exceptional design services, and proved adept at copyediting and typesetting and in providing insights on the aesthetics of the book, all under a tight deadline. Tomoko Hirata of the World Bank successfully designed the cover under a rigorous deadline. Our sincere gratitude goes to Dana, Nita, and Tomoko; we were privileged to have them as part of our team.

We would like to express particular thanks to Paola Scalabrin and Mayya Revzina at the World Bank's Office of the Publisher. Paola not only patiently provided

expert guidance throughout the process, but also offered invaluable contributions at every stage and helped us bring this project to a satisfying culmination. Mayya guided us through the maze of legal requirements and handled all issues related to the transfer of copyrights.

This book would not have seen the light of day without the outstanding project management leadership provided by Beata D. Debek of the World Bank Treasury. No words can describe the deep appreciation we feel toward Beata, who skillfully managed the myriad interactions with contributors, lawyers, the production team, and the publishers, and who gently reminded us, the editors, of the many deadlines we needed to meet. All of this was done with good humor. In addition, Beata enthusiastically contributed creativity, knowledge, and long hours, to every aspect of this book's conception, editing, and production. Thank you, Beata, for your many contributions!

Contents

	ForewordXiii
	Acknowledgmentsxv
Pa	rt One: Summary and Key Messages
	Governance: Summary Findings
	Investment Management: Key Messages
Pa	rt Two: Key Principles of Governance and Investment Management
	Managing Public Pension Funds: From Principles to Practices
	Lessons for Pension Funds on the Governance of Investments
Ра	rt Three: Governance of Public Pension Assets
1.	Governance Structures and Accountabilities
	Governance Process of the New Zealand Superannuation Fund
	Reforming Governance Structure and Accountabilities:
	The Experience of QSuper50 John Carpendale, Board Member, Queensland Superannuation Fund, Australia
	Governance Reform Proposals for the Republic of Korea's National Pension Service
	Seuran Lee, Director, Ministry of Health, Welfare, and Family Affairs, Republic of Korea
	Governance of the World Bank Staff Retirement Plan and Trust
2.	Qualification, Selection, and Operation of Governing Bodies
	Licensing Requirements and Operating Standards for Pension Fund Trustees in Australia
	Selection, Appointment, and Operating Processes for Board Members: The Case of Canada's AIMCo

3.	Operational Policies and Procedures
	Policies and Procedures Needed to Implement Good Governance83 Anne Maher, former Chief Executive Officer, Pensions Board, Ireland
	Key Ingredients in Developing Operational Policies and Procedures89 Samuel W. Halpern, President, Independent Fiduciary Services, United States
	Effective Policies, Procedures, and Internal Controls: A Regulatory Perspective
4.	Managing Fiscal Pressures in Defined-Benefit Schemes
	Building Sustainable Defined-Benefit Pension Schemes: The Landscape for Reform
	Creating a Sound Funding Framework: The Experience of OMERS in Canada116
	Andrew Fung, Vice President, Ontario Municipal Employees Retirement System, Canada
	Lessons from Defined-Benefit Pension Funds in Japan
5.	Policy Responses to Turbulent Financial Markets
	Adjustments and Risk Mitigation in National Pension Systems
	Key Lessons for Pension Policy Makers: An OECD Perspective
	The Case of the Irish National Pensions Reserve Fund
	Renationalization of Argentina's Pension System
	Thailand's GPF: From the 1997 Asian Crisis to the 2008 Global Financial Crisis
Par	t Four: Investment of Public Pension Assets
۱.	Defining the Investment Policy Framework for Public Pension Funds
	The Investment Policy Process: A Perspective from the World Bank
	Designing Investment Policy to Ensure Long-Term Solvency: The U.N. Joint Staff Pension Fund

	Making Investment Policy Consistent with Overall Pension Plan Design: Japan's GPIF183
	Masaharu Usuki, Member of Investment Committee, Government Pension Investment Fund, Japan
	Linking Risk Tolerance and Pension Liabilities with Investment Strategy: Denmark's ATP192
	Lars Rohde, Chief Executive Officer, ATP, Denmark
2.	Managing Risk for Different Cohorts in Defined-Contribution Schemes
	A Glide-Path Life-Cycle Fund Approach199
	Yvonne Sin, Head of Investment Consulting China, Towers Watson
	A Hybrid Approach to Managing Members' Investment and
	Longevity Risks: Singapore's CPF206
	Liew Heng San, Chief Executive Officer, Central Provident Fund, Singapore
	An Age-Based Multifunds Regulatory Approach for
	Latin American Funds
	Augusto Iglesias, Vice Minister for Social Security, Chile
	Using a Hybrid Pension Product in a Collective Framework to Distribute
	Risk: Denmark's ATP
	Lars Rohde, Chief Executive Officer, ATP, Denmark
3.	An Asset-Liability Approach to Strategic Asset Allocation for Pension
	Funds
	Liability-Driven Investing: Hype or Hope?228
	Arjan B. Berkelaar, Head of Investment Strategy and Risk Management, KAUST Investment Management Company, United States
	Strategic Asset Allocation as a Risk Management Exercise:
	A Perspective from the QIC
	Adriaan Ryder, Managing Director, Queensland Investment Corporation, Australia
	Using Asset-Liability Analysis to Make Consistent Policy Choices:
	The Approach in the Netherlands
	Peter Vlaar, Head of Corporate Asset-Liability Management and Risk Policy, All Pensions Group, the Netherlands
	Determining Investment Strategy from the Liability Structure:
	South Africa's GEPF
	John Oliphant, Head of Investments, Government Employees Pension Fund, South Africa
1.	In-House Investment versus Outsourcing to External Investment Managers
	Evaluating Internal and External Management of Assets:
	New Trends among Pension Funds257
	Jolanta Wysocka, Chief Executive Officer, Mountain Pacific Group, United States
	In-House Investment Management by Public Pension Funds:
	Risks and Risk Mitigation Strategies264
	Adriaan Ryder, Managing Director, Queensland Investment Corporation, Australia

5.	A Fra	mational Investments and Managing the Resulting Currency Risk mework for Evaluating International Diversification and Optimal ency Exposure269
		Trovik, Assistant Director of Risk Management, Storebrand, Norway
		national Investments: Developing a Strategy to Manage
		Wysocka, Chief Executive Officer, Mountain Pacific Group, United States
	Latin	ging the International Investments of Pension Funds in America
	August	o Iglesias, Vice Minister for Social Security, Chile
		national Diversification and Hedging: The Netherlands'
	Peter V	ensions Group
6.	Alter	native Asset Classes and New Investment Themes
		cteristics, Risks, and Risk Mitigation Approaches for Alternative Classes
		har, retired Chief Investment Officer, Alberta Investment Management Corporation,
	New I	mework for Evaluating Alternative Asset Classes and nvestment Themes
		1 Ryder, Managing Director, Queensland Investment Corporation, Australia
Glossary		ary317
	Contr	ibutors
	Institu	ational Profiles
	Index	
Figu	ıres	
	2.1	Five Critical Factors of Successful Institutional Funds
	3.1	Management Framework of the Guardians of New Zealand Superannuation48
	3.2	Governance Structure of Korea's National Pension System61
	3.3	Outline of Proposed Governance Reform64
	3.4	Current versus Reformed Governance Structure of Korea's National Pension System65
	3.5	Asset Management and Advisory Functions of the World Bank Treasury68
	3.6	World Bank Staff Retirement Plan: Governance Structure69
	3.7	Delegation of Duties to World Bank Staff by Pension Finance Committee
	3.8	Good Governance Mechanisms71
	3.9	Reporting Structure within the World Bank Staff Retirement Plan72

3.10	AIMCo's Key Indicators of Good Governance79
3.11	Selection and Appointment Process of AIMCo Board Members80
3.12	Good Governance: Key Policies and Procedures84
3.13	Processes Ensuring Accountability in Public Pension Schemes85
3.14	Components of Risk Identification, Control, and Monitoring System87
3.15	Mean Variance Optimization Methodology Inputs93
3.16	Best Asset Class Performance, by Economic Environment96
3.17	Governance Risk Assessment in Pension Funds102
3.18	APRA's Supervision Process: Application of a Feedback Loop104
3.19	Conditional Indexation by PFZW109
3.20	Nominal Funded Ratio and Replacement Rate Projections for Various Pension Plans after 40 Years110
3.21	The Governance Structure of OMERS117
3.22	Steps for Arriving at Collaborative, Long-Term Solutions for Pension Plan Funding118
3.23	Pension Plan Management Spectrum121
3.24	Achieving Funding Objectives
3.25	A Collaborative, Long-Term Funding Framework122
3.26	Correlation of Returns of Various Asset Classes127
3.27	Effects of Stress Test Scenarios on GDP Growth and GDP Level134
3.28	Estimated Financing Gap for Mature Pension Systems in Europe and Central Asian Transition Economies137
3.29	Estimated Financing Gap for Young Pension Systems in the Middle East and North Africa138
3.30	Estimated Funded Ratios for Young Pension Systems in the Middle East and North Africa139
3.31	Pension Fund Returns 2008-09146
3.32	Variation in Equity Allocation of Pension Funds in Select OECD Countries, 2001–08147
3.33	Equity Allocation of Public Pension Reserve Funds in Select OECD Countries, 2004–08148
3.34	Estimated Median Surplus/Deficit of Companies' Aggregate Defined-Benefit Obligations, by Country of Domicile149
3.35	Mechanism of Financial Transfers in Argentina's Social Security System157
3.36	Renationalization of the Integrated Argentine Social Security System
3.37	Total Asset Growth of the GPF
3.38	GPF Returns versus Inflation
3.39	Accumulated GPF Returns164
3.40	Reduction in Equity Investments by the GPF
3.41	GPF's Asset Allocation
4.1	Steps in the Investment Policy Process170
4.2	Typical Risk Constraints within a Defined-Benefit Pension Fund172

4.3	Willingness versus Ability to Take Risk	173
4.4	Historical Performance of U.S. Asset Classes: Maximum and Minimum Returns over Various Holding Periods, 1926–2007	174
4.5	UNJSPF Contributions and Benefit Payments	
4.6	Evolution of UNJSPF's Actuarial Situation Since 1990	
4.7	UNJSPF Stochastic Simulation Model Results	
4.8	Risk-Tolerance Framework within the UNJSPF	179
4.9	UNJSPF Asset Allocation: Current Asset Classes versus Proposed Asset Allocation	
4.10	Overview of Japan's Public Pension System	
4.11	The Benefit Adjustment Rule Used by Japan's Public Pension System	
4.12	Governance Structure of Japan's Public Pension System	187
4.13	ATP's Model for Pension Excellence	
4.14	ATP's Dynamic Risk Budget	195
4.15	ATP's Assets and Liabilities with Hedge Protection	195
4.16	ATP's Neutral Risk Allocation	197
4.17	Allocation to Growth and Safe Assets by Years to Retirement	200
4.18	Long-Term Income Replacement Rates of Various Asset Mixes	201
4.19	Investment Risk Factors to Consider	202
4.20	A Stylized Typology: Members of a Defined-Contribution Plan	203
4.21	A Glide-Path Approach to Steady Reduction of a Member's Investment Risk	204
4.22	Effect of Asset Allocation on Distribution Portfolios	207
4.23	Member Risk at Different Stages in Funded Defined-Contribution Pension Plans	n 213
4.24	Contribution of Different Pension Programs to Retirement Income	
4.25	Pensions from Pay-As-You-Go Defined-Benefit Programs	214
4.26	Ratio of Assets to Earnings Using a Target Date Fund, 1911-2008	216
4.27	Denmark's Pension Pyramid	222
4.28	Contribution of Various Sources of Pension Income by 2045	223
4.29	Conversion of Pension Contributions to Guaranteed Pensions under ATP's New Pension Model	224
4.30	Impact of a Small Difference in Asset Management Cost on Pension Savings Value	226
4.31	Evolution of Value of U.S. Equities and Interest Rates	229
4.32	Evolution of Funded Ratio and Equity Returns for U.S. Pension Funds	
4.33	The Asset-Liability and Asset-Only Efficient Frontiers	
4.34	Factors Determining Pension Funds' Risk Tolerance	
4.35	Asset Allocation of U.S. Pension Funds	
4.36	Illustrative Back Test: Surplus Volatility of an Asset-only versus	222

4.3/	Government Bonds, 1980–2009	233
4.38	LDI: Liability Hedging and Return Generation	234
4.39	Impact of Derivatives on the Surplus Efficient Frontier	
4.40	Illustrative Back Test: Surplus Volatility of an Asset-Only versus LDI (with Derivatives Overlay) Pension Portfolio	
4.41	Risk Themes for Pension Funds	
4.42	An Illustrative Asset-Only Portfolio with Unmanaged Liability Risks	
4.43	An Illustrative Risk-Managed Asset and Liability Portfolio	
4.44	Illustrative Results for Dutch Pension Funds' Swap Strategies over a 15-Year Horizon	
4.45	Impact of Swap Strategies on Pension Result over Time: Probability of Pension Result ≥ 90%	
4.46	Evolution of Pension Products and Strategies	.249
4.47	GEPF's LDI Exercise: Strategy Overview	
4.48	GEPF's Liability Estimations	.251
4.49	GEPF's Projected Cash Flows, 2007–82	.252
4.50	GEPF's Current Portfolio Allocation versus Alternative Allocations	.253
4.51	Recommended Asset Allocations for GEPF under Different Scenarios	.254
4.52	Investment Strategies Typically Managed Internally and Externally within Large Pension Plans	
4.53	Requirements for Effective Management of Internal and External Managers	
4.54	Internal Investment Management in the Face of a Wealth of	.265
4.55	Effect of Investment Diversification over Different Time Periods and in Different Equity Markets (Local Currency)	.271
4.56	Long-Term Trends in Currency Values and Equity and Fixed-Income Returns	
4.57	Hedge Ratio versus Home Allocation	
4.58	Rewards and Risks of International Investments	
4.59	Cumulative Returns Relative to U.S. Dollars, 1997–2009	
4.60	The Spectrum of Currency Regimes	
4.61	Korean Won versus U.S. Dollar	
4.62	APG Portfolio's Regional Asset Mix	
4.63	ALM Analysis: Impact of U.S. Dollar Exposure	
4.64	Share of Private Equity Market by Fund Type	
4.65	Investment Risks: Infrastructure	308
4.66	Timberland: Assets under Management	
4.67	Framework for Analysis of Investment in Alternative Assets	
Tables		-
2.1	Governance Success Factors	.38

3.1	Committee Structure of the New Zealand Superannuation Fund47
3.2	Global Best Practice in Investment Governance52
3.3	Current QSuper Investment Governance Framework53
3.4	QSuper Governance Responsibilities prior to Reform54
3.5	QSuper Governance Responsibilities after Reform55
3.6	Accountability and Ownership Changes within QSuper56
3.7	QSuper Delegation of Investment Functions57
3.8	QSuper Investment Committee Example Agenda Plan58
3.9	2010 Risk and Return Assumptions for a Range of Asset Classes (%) 95
3.10	APRA's Assessment of Supervisory Concerns104
3.11	Pros and Cons of Two Methodologies for the Strategic Asset Allocation Revision125
3.12	Examples of Investment Beliefs to Be Communicated to Stakeholders
3.13	Peak-to-Trough Changes during Severe Financial Crisis133
3.14	Policy Actions in Response to the Financial Crisis (as of January 1, 2010)142
3.15	GPF Investment Profile163
4.1	UNJSPF Asset Classes and Risk-Return Statistics (%)181
4.2	Items Periodically Disclosed by the GPIF189
4.3	Interest Earned by CPF Members208
4.4	Age-Based Allocation Strategies in Selected Latin American Pension Funds218
4.5	Roles and Accountabilities of Pension Funds' Governing Body, Staff, and Consultants261
4.6	Annualized Equity Market Volatility, 1975–2009 (Local Currency)270
4.7	Simultaneous Optimization Results for Portfolios Assuming Varying Numbers of Foreign Markets in the Investment Universe.273
4.8	Currency and Equity Index Correlations275
4.9	Annualized Volatility for Selected Currencies Relative to the U.S. Dollar, January 1998–September 2008 (%)280
4.10	Percentage of Foreign Exchange Trading Volume286
4.11	Construction of Active Currency Mandates288
4.12	Foreign Investment Limits for Pension Funds in Selected Countries
4.13	Levels of Local and Foreign Investment of Pension Funds in Selected Countries
1.14	Correlations among Various Asset Classes 304

PART ONE

Summary and Key Messages

Governance: Summary Findings

Investment Management: Key Messages