M. L. Burstein The New Art of Central Banking

The New Art of Central Banking

M. L. Burstein

Professor of Economics

York University, Canada



© M. L. Burstein 1991

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 33–4 Alfred Place, London WC1E 7DP.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

First published 1991

Published by MACMILLAN ACADEMIC AND PROFESSIONAL LTD Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 2XS and London Companies and representatives throughout the world

Printed in Hong Kong

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data Burstein, M. L. (Meyer Louis), 1926— The new art of central banking. 1. Central banking I. Title 332.1'1 ISBN 0-333-52571-X

Preface

This is the book of an American abroad. But the theme of innocents abroad or of American naïveté and European worldliness, à la Henry James, is quite reversed: Americans are sophisticated about federalism and their romance with it was shattered by a bloody civil war. Mine is a cautionary political-economic tale told at the dawn of 1992. The success of American federalism mainly owes, I think, to two factors. One is unique: the character and persona of General Washington. The other is the American Constitution, a machine that runs by itself. Bismarck almost got it right: God looks after fools, drunkards and the United States of America. It is true that America owes nothing to the wisdom of its Congresses or the perspicacity of most of its Presidents. That is its strength: its Constitution protects its people from the unimpeded impetus of its elected 'leaders', who are condemned by the Constitution to jostle against each other. Do Europeans know that?

The bulk of the book concerns the theory of monetary control. It consolidates and expands bridgeheads carved out by my series of books (1986, 1988 and 1989a) breaking out onto a tundra on which financial institutions and substances cannot be distinctly discerned; one after another innovation in theory and praxis has obliterated once-salient monetary landmarks. Nor is it possible to pick up a regular pulse from the flux of inchoate events evolving on the economic tundra. Not surprisingly, then, the new art of central banking culminates in masterly inactivity.

The principles that survive the book's critique are classical or new-classical. I plodded on, and on, seeking what passes for truth in science; and this is what I found. The economic argument is not politically motivated. Nor is it peculiar to private-ownership economies: I recommend it for perestroika anywhere. But there is a point in political economy to be made. I should think that the book's principal results are quite ineluctable for the natural action of a private-ownership economy; while a socialist system must select modalities conforming to the logic controlling the theory. Professor Hayek has deeply probed this point; I leave the reader to her own devices.

xiv Preface

I have never known what a 'monetary economy' is, importantly because there has never been a barter economy; nor am I intrigued by phantasies about barterers emerging from the primaeval slime. And, on reflection, I think the expression tendentiously inept. For the purposes of this book it suffices to say that radical innovation, going so far as to eject money from the economy, is quite consistent with what is called a monetary economy. The upshot is less anodyne for central bankers who must be dramatically affected by disappearance of money-stuff.

* * *

André Malraux called General de Gaulle a man of the day before yesterday and the day after tomorrow. This image readily transmutes into an essential property of classical art, or of science. To be successful, economic theory must *persist* in time and space. The fact that Galiani, Adam Smith, Thornton, Wheatley and Ricardo so inform the theory of monetary innovation bodes well for economics. Indeed the most brilliantly successful official action reported in the book is the open market purchase by the emperor Tiberius in AD 33.

The Right Honourable Nigel Lawson resigned in November 1989, after this book had been made ready for the printer.

M. L. BURSTEIN

Acknowledgements

I owe much to many people at Banca d'Italia and to that splendid institution, which I visited between September and November 1988; also to Banca Commerciale Italiana of Milan and Aalborg University, Denmark.

I especially benefited from the informed, perceptive crticism of Ambrosio Rinaldi and Giuseppe Tullio. And I hope the book adequately reflects my admiration for Franco Modigliani and his work.

This gratefully acknowledges my indebtedness to T. M. Farmiloe, Keith Povey, and Barbara Dochety.

And I am indebted to Kitty Sokoll in a number of important ways. The author and publishers acknowledge with thanks permission from the following to reproduce copyright material: Financial Times, for Figures 3.9–3.11 (22 June 1989); Banca Commerciale Italiana, for Figures 5.1–5.3, 7.1–7.3, from Monetary Trends (February and July 1988) and for Table 5.3, from Monetary Trends (July 1988); Federal Reserve Bulletin, for Tables 7.1–7.4 (December 1988); P. S. King, for the quotations from D. H. Robertson, Banking Policy and the Price Level (1926); and Hogarth Press, for the quotations from M. Finley, The Ancient Economy (1985).

Citations from my own work are often in the form (198-) rather than Burstein (198-).

Contents

Lis	t of Ill	lustrations and Tables	х
Pre	face		xiii
Aci	knowle	edgements	xv
PA	RT I	FOUNDATIONS OF THE NEW ART OF CENTRAL BANKING	
1	Intro	duction	3
	1.1	The strands of analysis	3
	1.2	Capsulation of Chapters 2–5	6
2	The '	Theory of Monetary Standards Applied to	
	Pan-	European Money and Monetary Control	17
	2.1	The theory of monetary standards	17
	2.2	1	
		pan-European monetary authority	22
	2.3		
		intersecting this study	35
3	The A	Modus Operandi of Bank Rate Reconsidered	42
	3.1		42
	3.2	Monetary mechanisms	45
	3.3	Towards a revised theory of Bank rate	51
	3.4	The economic consequences of Mr Lawson	65
	3.5	A reconstruction of (William) Poole's paradigm	70
	3.6	Chapter 3's implications for optimal mixes of	
		fiscal and monetary policy	75
4	Innov	vated Payments Systems	85
	4.1	Foundations	85
	4.2	Selected properties of the schematization	87
	4.3		
		art of central banking in innovated payments	
		systems	90
	4.4	Implications for high macro-economic theory	95
	4.5	Summary of Chapter 4	96

viii Contents

5	A Mo	netary Analysis of Public Debt	101
	5.1	Introduction	101
	5.2	Some stylized history	102
	5.3	Some theory of pseudo-processes	105
	5.4	Effects of changes in real government purchases	
		on capital accumulation in a closed economy	109
	5.5	Descriptive materials	113
PA	RT II	MONEY AND TRADE CYCLES OVER	
		TWO MILLENNIA: RETROSPECTIVE AND	
		PROSPECTIVE VIEWS OF CENTRAL	
		BANKING	
6		ninaries: Physical and Monetary (?) Foundations	105
		clical Actions	125
		Physical background	125
		Monetary background	127
		Introducing the open economy	131
	6.4	Finance and industry: liquidity crises; MA	101
		induction of cycles	131
	6.5	Final remarks	134
		Appendix: Stabilization and Cyclicality	136
7		cations of Empirical Properties of a Hypothetical	
	Open	Economy	140
	7.1	Data changes in an open economy	140
		Potential cyclical action	142
		Study of some data	145
	7.4	Concluding remarks, based on the displayed	
		data	148
8	Some	Theory of Innovated Open Financial Networks	153
		Specializations of the theory	154
	8.2	A précis of the theory	159
	8.3	Exemplifications of the theory	160
	8.4	Some follow-up material	164
	8.5	Final generalizations based on the theory	165
9	Bank	ing Policy and Economic Fluctuations	169
		Preliminary remarks	169
	9.2	Robertson's Banking Policy and the Price Level	
		(1926/1932)	171

	9.3	Supplementary materials for the real	
		foundations of Robertson's theory	185
	9.4	A proposed theory of banking policy and	
		economic fluctuations	188
	9.5	On finance: an instructive episode in	
		Dogmengeschichte	190
	9.6	Another finance problem	193
	9.7	Coda to Chapter 9: from Walter Bagehot to the	
		new art of central banking	197
	9.8	Recapitulation of the book's theory of MA	
		intervention	198
10		Classical Economics: Monetary Features of Trade	
		uations in Ancient Rome	200
		Preliminary remarks	200
		Labour supply	202
	10.3		203
		Absence of an idea of progress	204
	10.5	•	
		empire	206
	10.6		209
	10.7	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
		metal stocks	211
	10.8	Depreciation of the value of money in Roman	
		times	215
11	Conc	lusion	219
	11.1		219
	11.2	Implications of empirical properties of a	
		hypothetical open economy (Chapter 7)	220
	11.3	Some theory of innovated financial networks	
		(Chapter 8)	222
	11.4	Banking policy and economic fluctuations	
		(Chapter 9)	224
	11.5	Monetary features of trade fluctuations in	
		ancient Rome (Chapter 10)	231
Bib	liogra	phy	234
nd	ex of l	Names	235
nd	ex of S	Subjects	248

List of Illustrations and Tables

Illustrations

2.1	Admissible prices of gold and silver	26
3.1	A change in the monetary régime confronting price	
	inertia	44
3.2	The CC/LL construction à la Metzler and Patinkin	53
3.3	Deposit rate and non-monetary yields chase each	
	other until disequilibrium is resolved by a lower	
	inflation rate subsequent to slower money growth	53
3.4	LM is vertical but we do not know where it is!	57
3.5	A soft landing after some overshooting	67
3.6	Higher Bank rate leads to higher inflation if the MA	
	dwells in twilight	69
3.7	Build-up of excessive liquidity pressure when	
	elasticities of substitution are high	76
3.8	The scenario is rewritten when elasticities of	
	substitution are low	76
3.9	Money and inflation	79
3.10	RPI inflation	80
3.11	Sterling against the DM	80
5.1	Public debt of the main OECD countries	114
5.2	Public debt and financial assets (Italy, 1970-87)	115
5.3	Trend of Italian public finances: provisional figures	
	for 1987 and forecasts for 1988 compared with	
	projections contained in the Government plan for	
	1987–9	117
7.1	Bank deposits as a ratio of GDP: an international	
	comparison	149
7.2	Ratio of bank deposits to financial assets: an	
	international comparison	150
7.3	Money (M2) and bank loans in relation to total	
	financial flows (Italy, 1970–86)	151

List of Illustrations and Table	List	of	Illustrations	and	Table	es
---------------------------------	------	----	---------------	-----	-------	----

Tables

хi

5.1	Illusory savings rate differentials	107
5.2	Partial tax finance of government transfers and	
	purchases	108
5.3	Ratio of public debt to total financial assets	116
7.1	US money stock, bank assets and GNP (December	
	1987)	145
7.2	Funds raised in US credit markets	146
7.3	Direct and indirect sources of funds to credit	
	markets	147
7.4	US international transactions	147

Part I Foundations of the New Art of Central Banking

1 Introduction

The new art of central banking pivots on a reformed (tabular) monetary standard, 'securitization' beyond the banking principle and other innovations in praxis, including debt-discharge (clearing) mechanisms. Its field of action is constricted by virtual convertibility; the transform of a central bank must operate in real space, the only space left; the 'monetary' authority must operate with real assets. What is more, intermediaries surviving beyond the banking principle (see Burstein, 1988) must back their liabilities with real assets; and public debt will also become virtually convertible into real assets – see Chapters 2 and 5 below.

The theory is woven from several strands developed disjointedly over some years before being integrated in 1988–9.

1.1 THE STRANDS OF ANALYSIS

The tabular standard exercises influence in two channels. In the first it reveals that much economic theory hinges on choice of measure – the inflation perplex is an example; and stability properties of difference equations typically depend on arbitrarily selected time dimensions (in economic applications). In the second channel, money-stuff loses its aura of immutability and is sucked into the mass of variably-priced substances.

When the analytic content of the theory of tabular standards is assembled, and then applied to the European currency debate, striking results are obtained. Desirable properties of monetary unity require neither Authority nor deliberate coordination. And virtual convertibility of government debt is imposed by the theory's innovated ECU standard: governments become committed to make virtually real payments. The set of constraints imposed by the theory's liberal régime is like the pre-1914 one; and works more stringently than constraints implicit in the Delors proposal. At national level prospects for *dirigisme* are dismal; pan-European authority proposals, when properly understood, are a retreat by anti-liberals to a final redoubt.

Interest on money leads to certainty that the LM curve is vertical. But then it cannot be located. So it must be discarded. (There is no

LM curve in nature; I refer to a conceptualization of ISLM theory – and implicitly invoke the work of Immanuel Kant.)

Competitively determined interest on money makes intermediaries' spreads pivotally important. And it greatly simplifies properties of effects of liquidity-preference vibration: pressure is absorbed by transient changes in spreads; and the laws of motion of effects of monetary policy action are surprisingly intricate.

It is not adequately understood that vibration of liquidity preference is substantially accommodated by covariant fluctuation in the scale of financial intermediation. Intermediaries simply exchange their paper for others' paper; their profits flow from their spreads. Misperception of this point is central for flawed monetary theories of trade cycles and may infect the work of Wicksell, as it surely does that of the Wicksellians (see Part II, especially Chapter 9).

So we come upon another strand, Wicksell's cumulative process—which I explored in Burstein (1988). Wicksell's theory, properly understood, concerns money supply and prices relative to a quantity theory hypothesis. And it suffers from a lacuna that should be filled in: Wicksell supplies no motivation to hold the paper generated by the cumulative process. I try to repair this fault in (1988) and in Chapters 3 and 9 below.

Wicksell's cumulative process unfolds against an autonomously evolving own rate of return on physical capital. Wicksell's is not a monetary theory of the real rate of interest. But Wicksellian economics, especially when given a Keynesian twist, is intensely committed to monetary theories of real rates of interest, as are the City and Wall Street.

It is explained in Chapter 3 that monetary theories of real rates of interest (attacked from a number of directions in this book) have exerted influence along two distinct lines of development. Keynes centres on monetary aggregates in the *General Theory* – save for the Appendix to Chapter 14, which is not integrated into the core argument. (But Keynes may be the creator of the Wicksellian line of development, in his *Treatise*.) Keynes readily acknowledges the mercantilist origin of the idea that the equilibrium real rate of interest is a decreasing function of the nominal quantity of money.

In Wicksell's model, the monetary authority (MA) announces it will deal in paper at a decreed 'paper yield on paper' without limit. Say that this administered rate lies below that consistent with the equilibrium of a competitive banking industry. (The bizarre script is

influenced by effects of usury laws and other artificial constraints analysed by Ricardo, 1817.)

The financial press takes a Wicksellian (but not Wicksell's) tack. It reports that the MA takes decisions, day by day, on a spectrum of real rates of interest; and that the Phillips curve explains inflation effects – the MA's ploy supplies real stimulus to the economy, perhaps causing it to overheat, so that inflation spurts (the topic is pursued in Chapter 3, section 3.4).

Wicksell's theory is not Wicksellian. In Wicksell's theory the real rate of return on physical capital is autonomous for monetary analysis. When modified to accommodate portfolio equilibrium, his theory runs along the following lines.

Since competitive interest is paid on bank accounts in Wicksell's system, if the real running yield on bank paper is to fall, portfolio equilibrium requires its shadow convenience yield to increase accordingly. And this determines the real quantity of claims on banks in equilibrium. So long as the MA insists on real yields of bank loans below the own rate of return on capital, it pays to borrow from banks and redeposit the proceeds (to take round trips): the controlling arbitrage condition assures that the total marginal return on bank balances equals that on physical capital – in principle, the process can evolve in a hermetically-sealed monetary circuit. The rate at which bank paper depreciates against goods depends on how rapidly its stock expands: the largesse of the banks would typically be constrained by quantitative controls on bank credit - the script is bottomed on dirigiste intervention. In a purely competitive banking industry, rates at which banks deal key on Thornton's mercantile rate of profit; bank spreads transiently vibrate sympathetically with fluctuations in liquidity preference; the vibration's frequency depends on the open-ness of the economy, partially determining the elasticity of supply of liquidity.

Interpolation

Such dealing is partitioned from evaluation of credit risks and marrying suppliers and absorbers of real resources, i.e. from merchant banking. *Circa* 1790, Thomas Jefferson proposed a comparable partition for American finance. Jefferson (and President Andrew Jackson) opposed *issue*, not financial intermediation.

The last strand, innovations leading to liquidity saturation, culminates the theory. Liquidity premia are to disappear. And they ought

to disappear, since liquidity can now be created costlessly. See Beyond the Banking Principle (1988, inspired by securitization prospects; and see Chapter 4 below). In a moneyless monetary economy, the liquidity properties of a very wide spectrum of assets are undifferentiated.

The spontaneous evolution of monetary modalities leads to the own rate of return on physical capital ruling the roost. Samuelson (1947/1983) anticipates this result. Wallace (1983) builds on Samuelson's deep conjecture. And Ricardo (1817) set the table.

The argument is sent into a classical domain of economic thought: an economy saturated with liquidity, as Pareto optimality demands, behaves like the hypothetical non-monetary economy of general equilibrium theory. In particular, the Keynesian theory of interest evaporates: monetary assets cease to be unique; vacua do not rule roosts. So there is no sensible way to contemplate plans being made to divert flows from the income—expenditure stream towards paper assets: paper assets will be wanted only as evidence of claims to real ones.

1.2 CAPSULATION OF CHAPTERS 2-5

Chapters 2-5 are to be capsulated so that their contents are keyed to the strands of analysis.

1.2.1 Chapter 2: The Theory of Monetary Standards Applied to Pan-European Money and Monetary Control

Study of the pure theory of monetary standards leads to sharp conclusions about the ECU, the EMS and pan-European monetary authority proposals: viz. the ECU concept should be promoted, after being reformulated; and the pan-European monetary authority idea should be jettisoned; while the purposes of the EMS are better served without its serpent.

The idea of tabular monetary standards contains the seed of these conclusions, but my way has been roundabout. For years, I went backwards from *symmetallism*, studying properties of notional metallic systems, instead of forward into the domain of its ultimate extension, a full tabular standard. True, retrogression continues: this book goes back to the *electrum stater* of Cyzicus in ancient Asia Minor.