

OXFORD

THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

LAW, PRACTICE, AND POLICY

MITSUO MATSUSHITA
THOMAS J. SCHOENBAUM &
PETROS C. MAVROIDIS

THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

Law, Practice, and Policy

Mitsuo Matsushita
Thomas J. Schoenbaum
and
Petros C. Mavroidis

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide in
Oxford New York

Auckland Bangkok Buenos Aires Cape Town Chennai
Dar es Salaam Delhi Hong Kong Istanbul Karachi Kolkata
Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Mumbai Nairobi
São Paulo Shanghai Taipei Tokyo Toronto

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press
in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States
by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

© M Matsushita, T Schoenbaum, and P Mavroidis 2003

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted
Database right Oxford University Press (maker)

First published 2003

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press,
or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate
reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction
outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department,
Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Data available

ISBN 0-19-876472-3

5 7 9 10 8 6 4

Typeset by Kolam Information Services Pvt. Ltd.,
Pondicherry, India
Printed in Great Britain
on acid-free paper by
Biddles Ltd. Guildford and Kings Lynn

PREFACE

This book combines the thinking and scholarship of three academicians, one from Japan, one from North America, and the third from Europe. All three have worked in the field for many years and have extensive experience in developing countries. We have pitched the levels of analysis to appeal not only to specialists in law, political science and economics, but also to intelligent laypersons interested in the phenomenon of “globalism”. We believe that this book will contribute to a better understanding of the important and far-reaching work of one of the most controversial institutions of our time, the World Trade Organization.

The authors would like to acknowledge Sylvia A. Rhodes, Esq. of Bryan Cave, LLP, Washington D.C. for the special part she played in the creation of this book. For over a year, Sylvia was able to join us as co-author. The book was strengthened immeasurably by her input. She bears no responsibility, of course, for any errors or omissions.

Mitsuo Matsushita
Thomas J. Schoenbaum
Petros C. Mavroidis
October, 2002

CONTENTS — SUMMARY

1. The World Trade Organization	1
2. Dispute Settlement	17
3. Sources of Law	53
4. Remedies	77
5. WTO Law and Domestic Law	97
6. Tariffs, Quotas, and Other Barriers to Market Access	111
7. The Most-Favoured-Nation Principle	143
8. The National Treatment Principle	155
9. Safeguards	181
10. Export Controls and National Security	217
11. Trade in Services	227
12. Subsidies and Countervailing Duties	259
13. Antidumping	301
14. Regional Trade Agreements	341
15. Developing Countries	373
16. Intellectual Property	395
17. Environmental Protection and Trade	439
18. Technical Barriers, Standards, Trade and Health	485
19. Trade and Investment	521
20. Competition Policy and Trade	539
21. Future Challenges	589

CONTENTS

<i>Table of WTO and GATT Agreements, Treaties, and other International Instruments</i>	xxvii
<i>Tables of National Laws and Regulations</i>	lvii
<i>Tables of WTO and GATT Decisions</i>	lxv
<i>Tables of Court and Administrative Decisions</i>	lxxxix
<i>Overview</i>	ci
1. The World Trade Organization	1
1. Bretton Woods and the failure of the International Trade Organization	1
2. The GATT becomes an international organization	2
3. A summary of GATT obligations	3
4. The GATT tariff negotiating rounds	5
5. The creation of the WTO	6
6. The WTO: functions and structure	9
6.1 Membership, accession, and withdrawal	11
6.2 Decision-making	12
6.2.1 General-decision making	12
6.2.2 Interpretations	12
6.2.3 Waivers	13
6.2.4 Amendments	13
6.3 The WTO as an international organization	14
7. Suggestions for improving the WTO	14
2. Dispute Settlement	17
1. Introduction	18

Contents

2.	Dispute settlement in the GATT	19
3.	WTO dispute settlement	21
3.1	General considerations	22
3.2	Institutions	22
3.3	Scope of application	23
3.4	The legal effect of panel and Appellate Body reports	25
3.5	Dispute resolution procedures	25
3.5.1	Objectives	25
3.5.2	Initiation: request for consultations	26
3.5.3	Standing to bring claims	26
3.5.4	Good offices, conciliation, and mediation	27
3.5.5	Arbitration	28
3.6	The panel process	28
3.7	The appeal process	29
3.8	Implementation	30
3.8.1	Reasonable period for implementation	30
3.8.2	Compliance and the “sequencing” problem	30
3.9	Compensation for failure to comply and retaliation	32
3.10	Special dispute resolution procedures	33
3.10.1	Non-violation complaints	34
3.10.2	Situation complaints	35
3.11	Adverse inference	35
3.12	<i>Amicus curiae</i>	36
3.13	Burden of proof	38
3.14	Judicial economy	39
3.15	Standard of review	40
3.16	Critique of the DSU	43
4.	Trade retaliation under national laws	44
4.1	The European Union	45
4.2	Japan	46
4.3	The United States	46
4.4	Critique of trade retaliation under national laws	50
3.	Sources of Law	53
1.	Introduction	53
2.	Sources of law	55
2.1	Covered agreements	55
2.2	Reports of prior panels and the Appellate Body	56
2.2.1	Adopted and unadopted panel reports	56

Contents

2.3	Custom	64
2.4	Teachings of the most highly qualified publicists	65
2.5	General principles of law	66
2.6	Other International Instruments	67
2.6.1	Agreements referred to in the WTO agreements	67
2.6.2	Agreements between the parties	69
3.	Conflicts of norms	74
4.	Conclusions	75
4.	Remedies	77
1.	The pre-WTO phase	77
1.1	The usual GATT remedy	78
1.2	An alternative remedy: reimbursement and restitution	78
2.	Remedies under the Dispute Settlement Understanding	79
2.1	Violation complaints	80
2.1.1	Recommendations and suggestions	80
2.1.2	Prospective and retrospective remedies	82
2.2	Non-violation and situation complaints	84
2.3	Compensation for failure to comply and retaliation	86
2.3.1	Overview	86
2.3.2	Measuring countermeasures	87
2.3.3	Measuring countermeasures: WTO practice	88
2.3.3.1	The function of countermeasures	90
2.3.3.2	The burden of proof	90
2.3.3.3	The standard of review	91
2.4	Countermeasures: how effective?	92
3.	The case for re-negotiating remedies	94
5.	WTO Law and Domestic Law	97
1.	Introduction	97
2.	The United States	99
2.1	Overview of U.S. law	99
2.2	The relationship between WTO law and U.S. law	100
3.	The European Community	103
3.1	External relations and the EU/EC	103
3.2	The relationship between WTO law and the laws of the EC and its Member States	105

4. Japan	107
4.1 Overview of Japanese law	107
6. Tariffs, Quotas, and Other Barriers to Market Access	111
1. Introduction	112
2. Tariffs and customs rules	113
2.1 The nature of a tariff	113
2.2 Welfare effects of tariffs	113
2.3 Tariff modifications	115
2.4 Reclassification	116
2.5 Valuation	117
2.6 Rules of origin	119
2.7 Customs laws and procedures	121
2.8 Customs fees and formalities	122
2.9 Preshipment inspection (PSI)	122
3. Quotas	123
3.1 The nature of a quota	123
3.2 Welfare effects of quotas	124
3.3 Prohibition on quotas and other measures that restrain trade	124
3.4 Exceptions to the prohibition on quotas and other measures	126
3.5 Licensing	128
4. State-trading enterprises	129
5. Technical barriers to trade	132
6. Sanitary and phytosanitary measures	133
7. Sectoral market access agreements	135
7.1 Agriculture	135
7.1.1 Basic obligations	135
7.1.2 Tariffication	137
7.1.3 Subsidies	138
7.1.4 The Doha Agenda	140
7.2 Textiles and clothing	141
7.3 Information technology	141
7.4 Electronic commerce	142

7. The Most-Favoured-Nation Principle	143
1. What is the most-favoured-nation principle?	143
2. Policy basis	144
3. The MFN principle in customary international law	146
4. MFN treatment in the WTO	146
4.1 The MFN obligation under the GATT	147
4.2 Types of “advantage” covered by the MFN obligation	149
4.3 Like products	150
4.4 Conditional “advantage”	151
4.5 Discrimination between firms	153
5. Exceptions to the MFN obligations	154
 8. The National Treatment Principle	 155
1. What is the national treatment principle?	156
2. National treatment: some key issues	158
2.1 “Like” products	158
2.1.1 Article III:2, first sentence	159
2.1.2 Article III:2, second sentence	159
2.1.3 Article III:4	160
2.1.4 The aim and effects test	161
2.2 The product-process distinction	162
2.3 Technical regulations and sanitary and phytosanitary measures	163
2.4 Application of Article III to state-trading monopolies	164
2.5 Application of Article III national treatment obligations to sub-federal units of WTO Members	165
2.6 The relationship between Article III and Article XI of the GATT	166
3. Taxes	167
3.1 Scope	168
3.2 Border tax adjustment	168
3.3 The non-discrimination principle	169
4. Government regulations	171
5. <i>De Facto</i> discrimination	173

6. Article XX exceptions	176
7. Government procurement	177
9. Safeguards	181
1. Introduction	182
2. The legal and policy framework for safeguards in the GATT/WTO regime	183
3. GATT Article XIX and the Agreement on Safeguards	184
3.1 GATT Article XIX	184
3.2 The Safeguards Agreement	184
3.3 The relationship between GATT Article XIX and the Safeguards Agreement	185
3.4 Investigation	186
3.5 Provisional application	187
3.6 Determination of increased imports	187
3.7 Unforeseen developments	187
3.8 Determination of injury	189
3.8.1 Serious injury or threat of serious injury	189
3.8.1.1 Serious injury	190
3.8.1.2 Threat of serious injury	190
3.8.1.3 Factors to be considered when determining injury or threat thereof	191
3.8.1.4 Domestic industry	192
3.8.2 Causation	192
3.9 Limits on the application of safeguard measures	194
3.9.1 Parallelism	194
3.9.2 Extent of safeguards	197
3.9.3 Selectivity	198
3.9.4 Developing countries	198
3.9.5 GATT Article XIII	199
3.9.6 Duration and review	199
3.10 Notification and consultation	200
3.11 Compensation	200
3.12 The standard of review for safeguard disputes	202
4. Safeguard measures for balance-of-payment reasons	202
4.1 The GATT	202
4.2 The WTO	206

Contents

5. Safeguard measures in textile and clothing trade	208
6. Prohibition on voluntary export restraints	209
6.1 Prohibition in the Safeguards Agreement	209
6.2 Tension between voluntary export restraints and competition policy	211
6.2.1 The automobile VER case	211
6.2.2 The steel VER case	214
6.2.3 Analysis of the conflict between trade policy and competition policy	215
10. Export Controls and National Security	217
1. Introduction	217
2. Export restraints	218
3. Export taxes	219
4. Security exceptions	220
5. Extraterritorial application of export controls	224
6. Conclusions	226
11. Trade in Services	227
1. Introduction	228
2. Overview of the General Agreement on Trade in Services	229
3. The relationship between GATT and GATS	232
4. The WTO model for liberalization of trade in services	234
4.1 When to negotiate in the context of GATS	234
4.2 The concept of “services”	235
4.3 Modes of supply	236
4.4 Measures “affecting trade in services”	237
4.5 When are GATS commitments binding?	239
4.6 General obligations and specific commitments	239
4.7 Institutional issues	239
5. General obligations under the GATS	240
5.1 The GATS “positive list” approach	240
5.2 The MFN clause	240
5.3 Transparency	242
5.4 Domestic regulation and mutual recognition	243

Contents

5.5	Anticompetitive practices	245
5.6	Subsidies	245
5.7	Safeguards	245
5.8	Developing countries	246
5.9	Exceptions	246
6.	Specific commitments	246
6.1	The limits of general obligations	246
6.2	Market access (Article XVI)	247
6.3	The national treatment obligation (Article XVII)	247
6.4	The relationship between Article XVI and Article XVII	250
6.5	Additional commitments	251
6.6	Modification of schedules	251
7.	Financial services, telecommunications, and maritime transport	252
7.1	What is so special about these agreements?	252
7.2	The Agreement on Financial Services	252
7.3	The Agreement on Telecommunications	254
7.4	The Agreement on Maritime Transport	257
8.	Conclusions	258
12.	Subsidies and Countervailing Duties	259
1.	Introduction	260
2.	The legal framework	263
2.1	Articles XVI and VI of GATT 1994	263
2.2	The SCM Agreement	264
2.3	The SCM Agreement and agricultural subsidies	265
2.4	Institutions and notifications	265
2.5	Developing countries	266
3.	The regulation of subsidies	266
3.1	Definition of subsidy	266
3.1.1	The financial contribution by a government must confer a benefit to the recipient	269
3.1.2	The subsidy must be specific	271
3.1.3	Subsidies are defined by reference to domestic law	271
3.2	The classification of subsidies	272
3.2.1	The “traffic light” approach	272

Contents

3.2.2	Prohibited subsidies	272
3.2.2.1	Who determines whether a subsidy is a prohibited one?	273
3.2.2.2	Remedies against prohibited subsidies	274
3.2.2.3	WTO jurisprudence on prohibited subsidies	274
3.2.2.3.1	Punitive damages in the WTO?	276
3.2.2.3.2	Retroactivity	277
3.2.3	Actionable subsidies	278
3.2.4	Non-actionable subsidies	282
3.2.4.1	Research and development subsidies	282
3.2.4.2	Regional subsidies	283
3.2.4.3	Environmental subsidies	284
3.2.4.4	Who determines whether a subsidy is a non-actionable one?	285
3.2.4.5	Can non-actionable subsidies become actionable?	286
4.	The regulation of countervailing duties	286
4.1	Overview of procedural and substantive obligations	286
4.2	Investigation	287
4.2.1	Initiating an investigation	287
4.2.2	Evidentiary issues	288
4.2.3	The duties of the investigating authority	289
4.3	Provisional application	290
4.4	Determination of subsidy	291
4.5	Determination of injury	291
4.5.1	Domestic industry	293
4.5.2	Causation	293
4.6	The imposition of definitive countervailing duties	294
4.7	Duration and review	295
4.8	Judicial review	295
4.9	Undertakings (suspension of countervailing duty investigations)	296
4.10	Retroactivity	297
4.11	The standard of review for subsidies and countervailing duties disputes	297
5.	Conclusions	298

13. Antidumping	301
1. What is dumping?	302
1.1 Dumping as sales below cost	303
1.2 Dumping as international price discrimination	304
1.3 Duration	305
1.4 Cost analysis	305
1.5 Welfare effects	306
1.6 Measures to counteract dumping	306
2. The regulation of antidumping duties	307
2.1 The legal framework of antidumping in the GATT/WTO regime	307
2.1.1 GATT Article VI	308
2.1.2 The Antidumping Agreement	308
2.1.3 Institutions and notifications	309
2.1.4 Developing countries	309
2.2 Investigation	309
2.2.1 Initiating an investigation	309
2.2.2 Evidentiary issues	310
2.2.3 The duties of the investigating authority	312
2.3 Determination of dumping	312
2.3.1 Like product	313
2.3.2 Comparison of third-country prices	315
2.3.3 Constructed value	315
2.3.4 Arm's-length transactions and transactions between affiliated parties	317
2.3.5 Sales below cost	318
2.3.6 Fair price comparisons	319
2.3.7 Averaging	320
2.3.8 Zeroing	321
2.4 Determination of injury	323
2.4.1 Material injury or threat of material injury	323
2.4.2 Factors to be considered when determining injury	324
2.4.3 Factors to be considered when determining threat	324
2.4.4 Cumulation of injuries	325
2.4.5 Causation	325
2.5 Domestic industry	327
2.6 The imposition of antidumping measures	328

Contents

2.6.1	Provisional measures	328
2.6.2	Definitive measures	328
2.6.3	Retroactivity	329
2.6.4	Duration and review	329
2.7	Price undertakings (suspension of antidumping duty investigations)	329
2.8	Anti-circumvention	330
2.9	Dispute settlement	331
3.	Criminal penalties and private remedies	333
3.1	The U.S. 1916 Antidumping Act	333
3.2	Future implications of the panel and the Appellate Report on the 1916 Act case	335
4.	Conclusions	336
14.	Regional Trade Agreements	341
1.	Introduction	342
2.	Must preferential trade agreements (PTAs) cover both goods and services in the WTO era?	345
3.	When is a PTA compatible with WTO rules?	347
3.1	The GATT test	347
3.2	The obligation to notify	348
3.2.1	From GATT working parties to the Committee on Regional Trade Agreements (CRTA): just a cosmetic change?	348
3.2.2	The timing of the notification	349
3.2.3	The powers of the CRTA	350
3.2.4	The CRTA in the context of the GATS	351
3.3	The external trade requirement	351
3.3.1	Free-trade areas	351
3.3.2	Customs unions	352
3.3.3	PTAs in the GATS context	356
3.4	The internal trade requirement	356
3.4.1	Substantially all the trade	356
3.4.1.1	The ordinary meaning of the terms	357
3.4.1.2	The context	357
3.4.1.3	The object and purpose of the agreement	358
3.4.1.4	Subsequent decisions	358

Contents

3.4.1.5	Subsequent practice	359
3.4.1.6	Preparatory work	360
3.4.1.7	Conclusion	360
3.4.2	“Other restrictive regulations of commerce”	360
3.4.2.1	The context	361
3.4.2.2	Subsequent practice	361
3.4.2.3	Preparatory work	363
3.4.2.4	Conclusion	363
4.	The GATS regime	364
5.	The WTO: less tolerance for PTAs?	365
5.1	Dispute settlement	365
5.2	How will PTAs fare in the WTO?	369
15.	Developing Countries	373
1.	The developing world	373
2.	A bit of history	375
3.	GATT Article XX(h)	380
4.	GATT Article XVIII	380
5.	Part IV of the GATT	382
6.	The generalized system of preferences	383
7.	The Global System of Trade Preferences	385
8.	Special and differential treatment provisions for developing countries in the Uruguay Round	385
9.	Trade and economic development	388
10.	Trade and the right to development	389
11.	Enhancing market access	390
12.	New initiatives	391
16.	Intellectual Property	395
1.	Introduction	396
2.	Types of intellectual property rights addressed in the TRIPS Agreement	399
3.	Overview of the TRIPS Agreement	404