

# The Design of **Computer- Based Instruction**

---

ELEANOR L. CRISWELL



---

---

# ***The Design of Computer-Based Instruction***

---

---

**Eleanor L. Criswell**

*Science Applications International Corporation  
McLean, Virginia*

**Macmillan Publishing Company**  
NEW YORK

**Collier Macmillan Publishers**  
LONDON

Copyright © 1989, Macmillan Publishing Company,  
a division of Macmillan, Inc.

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or  
transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,  
including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and  
retrieval system, without permission in writing from the Publisher.

Macmillan Publishing Company  
866 Third Avenue, New York, New York 10022  
Collier Macmillan Canada, Inc.

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOGING-IN-PUBLICATION DATA

Criswell, Eleanor L.

The design of computer-based instruction.

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Computer-assisted instruction — Authoring  
programs. I. Title.

LB1028.66.C75 1989

371.3'9445

87-35034

ISBN 0-02-325603-6

Printing: 1 2 3 4 5 6 7      Year: 9 0 1 2 3 4 5

---



---

# Preface

This book approaches the design and evaluation of computer-based instruction (CBI) from psychological and practical perspectives. It emphasizes knowledge from psychology and educational research that is fundamental to CBI design and evaluation. It also describes a systematic design and evaluation process that produces successful courseware if this knowledge is used. These themes are in contrast to writings on CBI which discuss types and examples of CBI, technological advances in the computer industry, and computer code. The book provides the rationale for CBI design and is a “how to” for designers and users, not a CBI description.

This book is based on research from three specialty areas: learning psychology, cognitive science, and human factors. Learning psychology and the functional analysis of behavior offer the principles and processes by which students interact with new material and come to learn. Cognitive science deals with the structure of effective instructional material. Human factors psychology, the study of how people interact with inanimate objects, offers information about student–computer interfaces and advises how to lay out material on a computer screen to maximize student use of the material in an efficient manner. This book emphasizes findings from all these fields.

At the same time, the text is not a literature review. Much of the book consists of practical applications and examples. These examples illustrate the points and serve as a resource for CBI designers. The examples of CBI design and evaluation are based on research on CBI, research on instruction in other media besides the computer, and on professional experiences of CBI designers, including the author.

This book is for student and practicing CBI designers; most CBI de-

signers work in the areas of education, psychology, and computer science. The book is also for the many CBI designers who have found themselves, relatively unprepared, thrust into the field of CBI design by the computer revolution. As the field grows, consumers of CBI will quickly become more discriminating, and soon the marketplace will accept only that CBI which not only really teaches, but also teaches efficiently and pleasurably. This book teaches how to design effective, efficient, pleasurable CBI in any context, based on sound principles.

CBI designers work in diverse fields, from elementary school teachers who produce their own drill and practice programs to those who design innovative CBI for highly technical subject matter. In this book we discuss the teaching function of courseware—determining purposes and content, sequencing topics, increasing productive student interaction—and the evaluation function of courseware designers, writers, and teachers. Examples in the book portray a wide range in subject matter. The reader will be able to use the examples as a resource, given an understanding of the basic concepts. The use of jargon and invented terms has been avoided except in cases where the term has been well defined. This will make easier more general use of the material.

More people purchase and use CBI than design and develop it. CBI users must know about CBI design and evaluation so they will be able to select good courseware for their use. As more high-quality courseware becomes available, teachers will find that purchased software meets their needs, but they must know how to evaluate quality in the courseware marketplace. This book teaches how to evaluate quality: from a fine-grained analysis of any single practice interaction to an evaluation of the cost and training effectiveness of a CBI module.

The topic sequence of the book is design first, then evaluation. In Chapter 1 we introduce the history and types of CBI. Chapter 2 provides an integrated model of the processes involved in effective CBI design. In Chapters 3 through 7 we discuss CBI design in detail. Chapter 3 presents a 10-step process used to design, produce, and evaluate CBI. Special attention is devoted in Chapter 3 to context analysis, knowledge engineering, stating instructional objectives, communicating with the computer programmer, and programming languages. In Chapter 4 we describe the student–computer interface, especially the frame. This chapter was placed early so that readers would understand important aspects of frame display in the examples in subsequent chapters. In Chapters 5, 6, and 7 we describe sequencing and writing the important elements in CBI. In Chapter 5 we discuss ways to sequence topics. In Chapter 6 we discuss how to construct and intersperse introductions, interactions, remedial branches, reviews, and tests. In Chapter 7 we discuss how to tailor interactions for four stu-

dent performance levels: acquisition, fluency building, generalization, and proficiency maintenance. Courseware evaluation and revision is discussed in Chapter 8. Four types of evaluation are described: structural, functional, user opinion, and cost-effectiveness.

Study questions are provided at the end of every chapter. The questions cover the important points in the chapter. Definition questions require a short answer that comes directly from the text. Discussion questions require a longer answer and some synthesis. Students can answer the questions orally or in writing, alone or in class; instructors should determine how best to use the questions. Periodic review of the questions will help the student maintain mastery of the material.

Many people have encouraged me, pointed me toward literature, inspired me, and critiqued my ideas as I have written this book. I am most indebted to my husband, psychologist Dr. Bruce Wetherby. Bruce reviewed every chapter, discussed issues with me, and stimulated me to consider perspectives I had not yet considered. I am also indebted to the editorial staff at Macmillan and their book reviewers, who have been supportive throughout. Two of my associates provided thoughtful reviews: Dr. Ward Cates of George Mason University in Fairfax, Virginia, and Dr. Robert Hays of the Naval Training Systems Center in Orlando, Florida. In addition, Dr. Dexter Fletcher of Institutes for Defense Analyses in Alexandria, Virginia provided a valuable critique of Chapter 2. Several others graciously provided samples from CBI lessons they had developed which I have used as illustrations throughout the book: Dr. Nadine Hackler, University of Florida, Gainesville; Ms. Bonnie Hobson, U.S. Senate Computer Center, Washington, D.C.; Dr. Joseph Psotka, U.S. Army Research Institute, Alexandria, Virginia; and Ms. Catherine M. Taggart, Merrill Lynch, Training Technology, Plainsboro, New Jersey. Finally, I am appreciative of the support of my colleagues at Science Applications International Corporation.

*E. L. C.*

---

---

# Contents

<b>Chapter 1: Introduction to Computer-Based Instruction</b>	<b>1</b>
Definitions	1
Optimizing the Use of CBI	2
History of CBI	3
Applications in CBI	6
<i>Common Basis for All Applications</i>	7
<i>Tutorials</i>	9
<i>Reinforced Drill and Practice</i>	10
<i>Intelligent CBI</i>	12
<i>Training Simulations</i>	19
<i>Instructional Games</i>	20
<i>Training Simulators</i>	21
<i>Expert Systems</i>	24
<i>Embedded Training</i>	25
<i>Adaptive CBI Testing</i>	26
<i>Computer-Managed Instruction</i>	27
Hardware and Software Considerations in CBI	27
Study Questions	29
 <b>Chapter 2: Structural and Functional Approaches to CBI Design</b>	 <b>31</b>
Introduction	31
The Structural Perspective	33
<i>Basic Paradigm</i>	33
<i>Structure of Human Development</i>	35
<i>Structural CBI Design</i>	36

The Functional Perspective	40
<i>Basic Paradigm</i>	40
<i>Functional View of Human Development</i>	42
<i>Functional CBI Design</i>	43
An Integrated Approach: Structure and Function in CBI Design	47
Study Questions	48

### Chapter 3: *CBI Design, Production, and Evaluation* 50

Introduction	50
Step 1. Conduct Environmental Analysis	51
<i>Proposed Use of Courseware</i>	52
<i>Available Hardware</i>	53
<i>User Attitudes</i>	53
Step 2. Conduct Knowledge Engineering	54
<i>Understanding Course Content</i>	54
<i>Conduct Concept (Topic) or Task Analysis</i>	55
<i>Knowledge Engineering for Intelligent CBI</i>	56
Step 3. Establish Goals and Instructional Objectives	56
<i>Stating Goals</i>	56
<i>Writing Specific Objectives</i>	58
<i>Instructional Objective Taxonomies</i>	59
Step 4. Sequence Topics and Tasks	62
Step 5. Write Courseware	62
Step 6. Design Each Frame	63
Step 7. Program the Computer	65
<i>General Programming Languages</i>	66
<i>Authoring Languages</i>	67
<i>Frame-Based Authoring Packages</i>	69
<i>Evaluating Programming Languages, Authoring Languages, and Packages</i>	70
<i>Problems with Authoring Systems</i>	72
<i>The Future of Authoring Languages</i>	73
Step 8. Produce Accompanying Documents	74
Step 9. Evaluate and Revise the CBI	78
Step 10. Implement and Follow-Up	79
CBI Design–Production as a Collaborative Process	79
Study Questions	79

### Chapter 4: *Design of the Student–Computer Interface* 82

Introduction	82
Special Characteristics of Computer Screens	83



Student–Frame Interface	84	
<i>Frame Functional Areas</i>	84	
<i>Single- versus Multiple-Purpose Frames</i>		87
<i>Displaying Text</i>	88	
<i>Displaying Tables and Figures</i>	99	
Student–Computer Dialogue	102	
<i>Dialogue Characteristics</i>	102	
<i>Menus</i>	104	
<i>Natural Language Dialogue</i>	106	
<i>Menu Versus Natural Language</i>		107
<i>Intelligent Interfaces</i>	108	
Student–Performance Record Interface		108
<i>Performance Record Purpose</i>	108	
<i>Performance Record Design</i>	109	
Study Questions	110	
<b>Chapter 5: Sequencing Topics in CBI Lessons</b>		<b>113</b>
Introduction	113	
Procedures for Concept (Topic) and Task Analysis		114
<i>Concept Defined</i>	114	
<i>Concept Analysis</i>	115	
<i>Task Analysis</i>	119	
Sequencing Topics for Concept Lessons	120	
Sequencing Topics in Procedural Lessons		121
<i>Whole- and Part-Task Training</i>	122	
<i>Forward Chaining</i>	122	
<i>Backward Chaining</i>	123	
Sequencing Simulation Exercises	124	
<i>Difference Between Simulations and Tutorials</i>		124
<i>Sequencing in Simulations</i>	125	
<i>Sequencing in Single-Skill-Level Simulations</i>		125
<i>Sequencing in Multiple-Skill-Level Simulations</i>		126
Learner- versus Program-Controlled Sequences		126
<i>Topic Sequencing</i>	127	
<i>Number of Examples per Rules</i>		127
<i>Program Adaptations</i>	129	
<i>Self-Pacing</i>	129	
<i>Summary of Learner Control of Sequence versus Program Control</i>		130
Study Questions	131	

<b>Chapter 6: <i>Writing Introductions, Interactions, Remedial Branches, Reviews, and Tests</i></b>	<b>132</b>
Introduction	132
Introduction Frames	132
Interaction Frames	133
<i>Learning Principles for Interactions</i>	135
<i>Shaping with Interactions</i>	141
<i>Meaningful Responses in Interactions</i>	144
<i>Response Variety in Interactions</i>	144
<i>Determining the Number of Interactions Needed</i>	147
Remedial Frames	148
<i>Remedial Frames for Single Errors</i>	148
<i>Remedial Frames for Error Patterns</i>	151
Review Frames	151
CBI Tests	152
<i>Purpose</i>	152
<i>Reliability</i>	155
<i>Validity</i>	157
Study Questions	159
<b>Chapter 7: <i>Tailoring CBI Interactions for Specific Performance Levels</i></b>	<b>160</b>
Introduction	160
CBI Techniques for Acquisition	161
<i>Design of Acquisition Level Sequences</i>	161
<i>Introducing Examples and Nonexamples</i>	164
Techniques for Building Fluency	165
Techniques for Generalization	171
<i>Generalization Based on Physical Similarity</i>	172
<i>Generalization Based on Rule Learning</i>	172
<i>Generalization Based on Analogy</i>	173
<i>Generalization Drills, Games, and Simulations</i>	175
Techniques for Proficiency Maintenance	179
Study Questions	180
<b>Chapter 8: <i>Evaluating and Revising CBI</i></b>	<b>182</b>
Introduction	182
Structural Evaluation Using Checklists	183
<i>Structural Evaluation Procedures</i>	184
<i>Categories of Structural Evaluation Items</i>	185

Functional Evaluation of CBI Using Student Performance Data	193
<i>Functional Evaluation Procedures</i>	194
<i>Four Functional Evaluation Plans</i>	197
<i>Measures of Student Performance</i>	198
<i>Using Data from an Entire Class</i>	200
<i>Using Individual Students</i>	201
User Opinion	203
Evaluating Cost-Effectiveness	204
<i>Step 1: Determining Costs of CBI</i>	204
<i>Step 2: Determining Cost-Effectiveness</i>	207
Making an Overall Decision	209
Revising CBI	209
<i>Making Structural Changes</i>	210
<i>Revising to Improve Function</i>	210
<i>Revising to Improve Opinions</i>	211
<i>Improving Cost-Effectiveness</i>	212
Study Questions	212
 <b>References</b>	 214
<b>Index</b>	220

---

---

## ***List of Figures***

<b>1.1</b>	Steps in instruction.	<b>8</b>
<b>1.2</b>	Reinforced drill and practice format.	<b>11</b>
<b>1.3</b>	Flexible student–computer dialogue in an ICBI module.	<b>16</b>
<b>1.4</b>	ICBI structural components.	<b>18</b>
<b>1.5</b>	Instructional game format.	<b>22</b>
<b>1.6</b>	High-, medium-, and low-physical-fidelity simulators used in Allen, Hays, and Buffardi (1986).	<b>23</b>
<b>1.7</b>	Main menu and embedded training menu.	<b>26</b>
<b>2.1</b>	Model of human information processing.	<b>34</b>
<b>2.2</b>	Increase attention by explaining benefit.	<b>37</b>
<b>2.3</b>	Stimulate curiosity with prequestioning.	<b>37</b>
<b>2.4</b>	Link content together with chronological narrative.	<b>38</b>
<b>2.5</b>	Keep information flow high to prevent boredom. This frame contains only a little information.	<b>38</b>
<b>2.6</b>	This frame contains more information and is less boring than the frame in Figure 2.5.	<b>39</b>
<b>2.7</b>	The use of mnemonics is an aid to memory.	<b>39</b>
<b>2.8</b>	Emphasis on components is important.	<b>40</b>
<b>2.9</b>	Basic learning paradigm.	<b>41</b>
<b>2.10</b>	Instructional events in CBI.	<b>44</b>
<b>2.11</b>	CBI provides frequent opportunities for students to respond.	<b>44</b>

<b>2.12</b>	Progression from beginner- to generalization-level responses.	<b>45</b>
<b>2.13</b>	Contrived and natural positive reinforcers.	<b>46</b>
<b>2.14</b>	Harsh error messages can be devastating, not at all funny.	<b>47</b>
<b>3.1</b>	Schematic for a lesson, topic, and subtopic.	<b>64</b>
<b>3.2</b>	Sample storyboard for simple branching CBI lesson.	<b>66</b>
<b>3.3</b>	Designer's screen from "Instructional Design Environment."	<b>75</b>
<b>3.4</b>	Page from student handbook accompanying CBI lesson "Know Your Man-Made Fibers."	<b>77</b>
<b>4.1</b>	Sample layout of functional areas within a single frame.	<b>85</b>
<b>4.2</b>	Sample screen with important screen elements.	<b>86</b>
<b>4.3</b>	Screen format used in a lesson teaching word processing.	<b>86</b>
<b>4.4</b>	Interaction contained on a single frame.	<b>88</b>
<b>4.5A</b>	Functional areas should remain consistent from frame to frame.	<b>89</b>
<b>4.5B</b>	This frame's functional areas are consistent with Figure 4.5A.	<b>90</b>
<b>4.5C</b>	This frame's functional areas are not consistent with the two preceding frames.	<b>90</b>
<b>4.6</b>	High-resolution graphics in CBI lesson on how to use LOTUS 1-2-3.	<b>92</b>
<b>4.7</b>	A cluttered-looking frame.	<b>93</b>
<b>4.8</b>	Frame in Figure 4.7 redesigned.	<b>94</b>
<b>4.9</b>	Windows used to accomplish complex dialogue.	<b>95</b>
<b>4.10</b>	Pull-down window can be used to request a summary student status report.	<b>96</b>
<b>4.11</b>	Illustration of a highlighting technique called "blocking."	<b>97</b>
<b>4.12</b>	Example of repeated figure in a frame sequence.	<b>101</b>
<b>4.13</b>	Frame sequence illustrating display of text, tables, and dialogue.	<b>103</b>
<b>4.14</b>	Menu format showing student instructions and list of options.	<b>106</b>
<b>4.15</b>	Sample student progress record displayed during CBI lesson, at instructor workstation.	<b>110</b>
<b>4.16</b>	Sample student performance record for one session.	<b>111</b>
<b>5.1</b>	Key terms that become interaction topics.	<b>116</b>

<b>5.2</b>	Prerequisite concepts for lesson on communication in gulls.	<b>117</b>
<b>5.3</b>	Critical and variable attributes of a concept.	<b>118</b>
<b>5.4</b>	Task analysis for connecting battery to volt-ohmmeter (VTM) and turning on VTM power.	<b>119</b>
<b>6.1</b>	Introduction frames for a lesson.	<b>134</b>
<b>6.2</b>	Interaction frame, text present, multiple choices given, to shape a copy skill.	<b>142</b>
<b>6.3</b>	Interaction frame, text present, no answer choices given, to shape a copy skill.	<b>142</b>
<b>6.4</b>	Interaction frame, text absent, answer choices given, to shape a difficult copy skill.	<b>143</b>
<b>6.5</b>	Interaction frame, text absent, no answer choices given, to shape a difficult copy skill.	<b>143</b>
<b>6.6A</b>	A copy or "overcued" frame.	<b>145</b>
<b>6.6B</b>	Query that gets the student to apply the new definition.	<b>145</b>
<b>6.6C</b>	Query that gets the student to apply the new definition.	<b>146</b>
<b>6.7</b>	Review sequence before a lesson test.	<b>152</b>
<b>6.8</b>	Quiz problem from CBI to teach LOTUS 1-2-3.	<b>154</b>
<b>6.9</b>	Paper test incorporated into CBI lesson to teach word processing.	<b>156</b>
<b>7.1</b>	Performance quality increases with time and practice.	<b>161</b>
<b>7.2</b>	Antecedent events and queries in acquisition sequences.	<b>162</b>
<b>7.3</b>	Acquisition-level sequence in concept teaching.	<b>165</b>
<b>7.4</b>	Drill game format for fluency building.	<b>169</b>
<b>7.5</b>	Exercise to foster primary stimulus generalization.	<b>173</b>
<b>7.6</b>	Exercise to foster recombinative generalization.	<b>174</b>
<b>7.7</b>	Exercise to foster generalization by stimulus equivalence or analogy.	<b>174</b>
<b>7.8</b>	Simulation activity for generalization practice of material already learned.	<b>176</b>
<b>7.9</b>	New event introduced into a static simulation used for generalization practice.	<b>180</b>
<b>8.1</b>	Decision diagram for evaluating the relative effectiveness and cost of two instructional methods.	<b>210</b>

---

# Introduction to Computer-Based Instruction

*The main topics in this chapter are:*

- *Definitions of terms in computer-based instruction (CBI)*
- *Optimizing the use of CBI*
- *History of CBI*
- *Scope of CBI applications*
- *Importance of hardware and software in CBI*

## Definitions

---

The term *computer-based instruction* (CBI) refers to any use of a computer to present instructional material, provide for active participation of the student, and respond to student action. Very simply, the goal of CBI is to teach. The term “computer-based instruction” is used in this book; the terms “computer-assisted instruction” and “computer-aided learning” express the same concepts.

*Learning* is the relatively permanent change in the student’s state of knowledge or skill. Learning is a process. Learning progresses from an initial level of poor knowledge and performance to levels of increased knowledge and much better performance, when and only when something or someone, such as a computer teacher, supports a student’s progress.

*Teaching* consists of the teacher (human or computer) support activities that cause a student to learn. These activities include presenting new instructional challenges, providing enough practice, reviewing when necessary, informing the student about the correctness of his or her responses, allowing the student to discover for himself or herself when learning certain skills, and keeping track

of the student's progress. The understanding that learning progresses as a function of teaching activities is fundamental to designing CBI.

Teaching in CBI is accomplished by the use of a computer (hardware), programs to make the computer operate (software), and a program designed especially to administer the instruction (courseware). This book focuses on the design and evaluation of courseware.

*Hardware* includes the physical, electronic, and electromechanical components of computers. CBI may be designed for use on a variety of computers, from large mainframes that support individual student stations, to small home or personal computers. Effective CBI can be designed for a computer of any size.

Two types of *software* are involved in CBI. *Delivery system software* interfaces the student with the computer, and *authoring system software* interfaces the coursewriter with the computer (Bunderson, 1981).

*Courseware* refers, in a narrow sense, to programs that administer instruction (Futrell & Geisert, 1984), and in a broad sense, to those programs in addition to all handbooks and performance aids, and so on, which are the course material (Bunderson, 1981).

CBI in and of itself seldom constitutes an entire course. Usually, CBI is an adjunct to human instruction and is integrated into a course with other means of instruction. For example, course material might be presented by lecture, textbook review, or film, and by practice in the skill, provided by the computer. In some cases, CBI simulations provide advanced practice that would not be available in a classroom. Adjunct CBI can be used to present material and provide practice, and ancillary textbook reading may be assigned.

## Optimizing the Use of CBI

---

CBI has been found to compare favorably with traditional instruction. A review of 51 studies conducted with sixth- through twelfth-grade students found that students in CBI classes scored in the 63rd percentile on final examinations, and students in conventional classes scored in the 50th percentile (Kulik, Bangert, & Williams, 1983). The effects of CBI tend to be greater for low achievers than for high achievers, and greater at the secondary level than at the college level, but this finding was not statistically significant in the review. The same review also found that students developed positive attitudes toward their CBI courses. As for a particular subject, CBI has been found to be more effective than traditional



methods in teaching elementary and high school mathematics, for example (Kulik et al., 1983). College-level CBI has been found more effective than traditional methods in teaching physics, anesthesiology, and Russian (Chambers & Sprecher, 1980).

When can CBI be used effectively?

- When the subject matter does not change significantly over time, because changes in the topic require reprogramming.
- When repeated presentations of the same course are needed, because computers are excellent at repeating courses over and over without a decrease in proficiency due to fatigue.
- When actual practice of the skill being learned is important, because students using CBI can practice skills that would otherwise not be possible.
- When human teachers thereby spared the teaching time may productively engage in other important instructional activities. CBI does not replace teachers, but it permits teachers to perform other activities.

Perhaps the greatest danger in using CBI occurs when it is not integrated properly into the total curriculum. CBI must be examined carefully by the teacher to determine exactly what the CBI teaches. For example, many CBI programs provide practice but do not present and teach the material. A student given a CBI practice program without being prepared for it may well flounder and despair. In other cases, some CBI is given to students as a time filler without regard to its place in the curriculum. Instructional games can be misused in this way—given to students unprepared to play them, or given to students in the hope that something (anything) useful will be taught, without analyzing the game to see if anything really valuable is being taught. Proper integration of CBI into the total curriculum is a key to its success.

## History of CBI

---

The rapid development and spread of CBI has been encouraged by society's pressures to educate large numbers of people, our knowledge about the psychological principles of teaching and learning, and the availability of the computer. Large-scale demands for education are nothing new in the United States, but our solutions