New Articles

ethodological ssues trategi inical esearc

Edited by Alan E. Kazdin

Methodological Issues Strategies in Clinical Research Second Edition

Edited by Alan E. Kazdin Copyright © 1998 by the American Psychological Association. All rights reserved. Except as permitted under the United States Copyright Act of 1976, no part of this publication may be reproduced or distributed in any form or by any means, or stored in a database or retrieval system, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

Published by American Psychological Association 750 First Street, NE Washington, DC 20002

Copies may be ordered from APA Order Department P.O. Box 92984 Washington, DC 20090-2984

In the UK and Europe, copies may be ordered from American Psychological Association 3 Henrietta Street Covent Garden, London WC2E 8LU England

Typeset in Goudy by G&S Typesetters, Inc., Austin, TX

Cover designer: Minker Design, Bethesda, MD Printer: Hamilton Printing Company, Rensselaer, NY Technical/production editor: Ida Audeh

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Methodological issues and strategies in clinical research / Alan E. Kazdin, editor.—2nd ed. p. cm.

Rev. ed. of : Methodological issues & strategies in clinical research. 1st ed. © 1992. Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-55798-481-6 (hardcover : alk. paper). — ISBN 1-55798-482-4 (pbk. : alk. paper).

1. Clinical psychology—Research—Methodology. I. Kazdin, Alan E. II. Title: Methodological issues & strategies in clinical research.

[DNLM: 1. Psychology, Clinical—methods. 2. Research Design. WM 105 M5925 1998]

RC467.8.M48 1998 616.89'0072—dc21 DNLM/DLC for Library of Congress

97–42491 CIP

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data A CIP record is available from the British Library

Printed in the United States of America Second edition, first printing.

Methodological Issues Strategies in Clinical Research Second Edition

CONTRIBUTORS

Michael E. Addis, Department of Psychology, University of Washington David H. Barlow, Department of Psychology, Boston University Alan S. Bellack, Department of Psychiatry, University of Maryland School of Medicine

Daryl J. Bem, Department of Psychology, Cornell University
Peter David Blanck, College of Law, University of Iowa
Stephen J. Ceci, Department of Psychology, Cornell University
Lee Anna Clark, Department of Psychology, University of Iowa
Gregory N. Clarke, Center for Health Research, Portland, Oregon
Jacob Cohen, Department of Psychology, New York University
David A. Cole, Department of Psychology, University of Notre Dame
Michael Cowles, Department of Psychology, York University
Betsy Davis, School of Psychology, University of Oregon
Caroline Davis, Department of Psychology, York University
René V. Dawis, Department of Psychology, University of Minnesota
Mark A. Fine, Department of Psychology, University of Dayton
Robert W. Frick, Department of Psychology, State University of New York
at Stony Brook

Roland H. Good III, School of Psychology, University of Oregon Anthony G. Greenwald, Department of Psychology, University of Washington

Steven C. Hayes, Department of Psychology, University of North Carolina Grayson N. Holmbeck, Department of Psychology, Loyola University of Chicago

Louis M. Hsu, Department of Psychology, Fairleigh Dickinson University Neil S. Jacobson, Department of Psychology, University of Washington Alan E. Kazdin, Department of Psychology, Yale University Gregory A. Kimble, Department of Psychology, Duke University

Kelly Koerner, Department of Psychology, University of Washington Gerald P. Koocher, Department of Psychology, Children's Hospital, Boston Lawrence A. Kurdek, Department of Psychology, Wright State University Wolfgang Linden, Department of Psychology, University of British Columbia Brendan A. Maher, Department of Psychology, Harvard University Alvin R. Mahrer, Department of Psychology, University of Ottawa Scott E. Maxwell, Department of Psychology, University of Notre Dame Samuel Messick, Educational Testing Service, Princeton, New Jersey Mary L. Miers, National Institute of Neurological Disorders and Stroke, Bethesda, Maryland

Dale T. Miller, Department of Psychology, Princeton University
 Douglas G. Mook, Department of Psychology, University of Virginia
 Karla Moras, Department of Psychiatry, University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine

E. R. Oetting, Department of Psychology, Colorado State University Sumie Okazaki, Department of Psychology, University of Wisconsin Deborah A. Prentice, Department of Psychology, Princeton University Robert Rosenthal, Department of Psychology, Harvard University Ralph L. Rosnow, Department of Psychology, Temple University Mary Jane Rotheram-Borus, Division of Social and Community Psychiatry, University of California, Los Angeles Health Sciences Center Frank L. Schmidt, Department of Management and Organizations, University

sity of Iowa

Nina R. Schooler, Department of Psychiatry, University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine

Lee Sechrest, Department of Psychology, University of Arizona

Joan E. Sieber, Department of Psychology, California State University, Hayward

Bradley Smith, Institute for Addictions Research, State University of New York at Buffalo

Stanley Sue, Department of Psychology, University of California, Los Angeles

Leslie A. Telfer, Veterans Administration Center, Palo Alto, California Paula Truax, Department of Psychology, University of Washington Jennifer Waltz, Department of Psychology, University of Washington Bruce E. Wampold, Division of Counseling Psychology, University of Wisconsin

David Watson, Department of Psychology, University of Iowa Frances K. Wen, Department of Psychology, University of British Columbia Allan W. Wicker, Department of Psychology, Claremont Graduate School Brian T. Yates, Department of Psychology, The American University

PREFACE

This book of readings is designed to improve understanding of methodology and research practices in clinical psychology. Students and professionals who are in training or actively involved in research are the intended audience. Although the primary focus is on clinical psychology, many of the articles address issues that span the field of psychology more generally. The issues and methods raised in the readings are particularly relevant to areas of research within psychology (e.g., clinical, counseling, educational, and school psychology) and to other disciplines (e.g., psychiatry and social work). These areas span theory, research, and application and, hence, share many methodological challenges and opportunities.

The emphasis of this book is on the dominant paradigm that characterizes contemporary scientific research. Among the salient characteristics of this paradigm are the focus on theory, systematic assessment, and quantitative analyses of results. Just as scientific research is not the only way of knowing (e.g., deduction, intuition), the current paradigm is not the only way of studying phenomena empirically (e.g., qualitative research, nonstatistical methods of data evaluation). Nevertheless, it is central that students and professionals master and keep abreast of the dominant paradigm, understand the many methodological options and advances, and be alert to the many obstacles and shoals when designing their studies. The goal of this book is to foster greater understanding of the strengths, limitations, and options of methodology in the context of contemporary research practices.

The book includes articles about experimental design; the principles, procedures, and practices that govern research; assessment; sources of artifact and bias; methods of data analyses and interpretation; ethical issues; and publication and communication of the results of research. The organization of the book conveys features of research that follow in approximate logical and temporal order as they arise in the flow of an investigation. Thus, under-

pinnings of research, development of the research idea, and procedures within the study obviously precede data analyses and the write-up of the study. The book includes the following sections:

- Background and Underpinnings of Research
- Methods: Principles and Practices
- Assessment
- Data Analysis, Evaluation, and Interpretation
- Special Topics in Clinical Research
- Ethics in Research
- Publication and Communication of Research

The chapter topics follow the flow and sequence of the research process. Underlying this book and the selection of articles is the view that diverse facets of design are integrally related at the outset, that is, they emerge when the study is conceived. For example, in the planning stage of a study, the theory and rationale are (or at least should be) related to the plans for the data analyses and anticipated interpretations of the results. Typically, at this point investigators are not too concerned with analyses of the results or, of course, with the critical issues that will form the basis of the discussion in any report or write-up of the study. Yet, critical thought about how one is likely to analyze the data and the specific conclusions one wishes to draw greatly influence core features of the design, such as the experimental conditions, the plan for their administration between or within subjects, sample size and composition, and the type and range of measures.

Similarly, limitations of a study are usually discussed at the end of the journal article that describes the study. This is clearly the place to discuss them, and many limitations can be identified only when the study is completed. For example, the reader may learn during the study only that 90% of subjects in the control group went on a group vacation and missed the posttest. Yet, many of the questions that are converted later to limitations can be identified and considered before the first subject is tested. If no effects or no differences are obtained, can this investigation be regarded as a strong and careful test of the hypotheses? Do the conditions of the investigation represent a sample of the conditions to which the investigator wishes to generalize? Do the control or comparison groups permit the investigator to comment specifically on what was responsible for group differences? These, of course, are all questions about methodology.

The quality of a study is usually related to the coherence of its conceptualization (hypotheses, predictions), the procedures to test that conceptualization (sample, measures, conditions, data evaluation), and the interpreta-

¹ The term participants is usually recommended for use in place of the term subjects. In the context of research methods, however, there are many participants in research, including persons who design the study (investigators), implement or carry out the procedures to run the study (experimenters), and provide the data (subjects). The term subjects is retained to maximize clarity of the reference group.

tions the author makes on the basis of these procedures. Methodology is not just a set of practices, such as random assignment and use of control groups, but more fundamentally pertains to correspondence between what the investigator wishes to say about the findings and what he or she is entitled to say on the basis of how the study was designed and conducted. Although the topics of the present book reflect and are organized according to the flow of research, some of the selected articles transcend and blur boundaries and discrete steps of research; they were selected to convey the interdependence of all phases of research in relation to drawing valid conclusions.

Research design is dynamic and cumulative; methods of design, assessment, and evaluation continually evolve and emerge. Thus, the book can only sample the available articles to address relevant domains to aid the researcher. Articles were selected to address core topics, including generating and testing hypotheses, selecting the sample, developing or selecting measures, designing studies that are statistically powerful, presenting the data, and communicating the results. Several articles from the first edition were retained because they still reflect classic statements on key topics.

In the second edition, articles were added to expand on core concepts, to reflect contemporary issues in research, and to elaborate ethical responsibilities in relation to research participants and to science more generally. Examples include articles on mediators and moderators, methods for studying efficacy and effectiveness of psychotherapy, making research relevant to clinical practice and policy, criteria used by review boards to evaluate scientific and ethical practices in research, and key features of preparing empirical and review papers for publication. Furthermore, since the first edition, the Ethical Principles of Psychologists and Code of Conduct that guide research (and other professional activities) have been revised and expanded (American Psychological Association, 1992). Salient topics central to the design and execution of research are discussed, including ethical issues, oversight of research by committees that review scientific merit and ethical practices, and standards of scientific conduct more generally.

A book of readings on methodology has a great potential for missing the best-seller list. (Moreover, I regret to report that as I prepare this Preface, the movie rights for this book have still not been decided.) Articles in edited volumes are notoriously uneven in quality and level. The topic of methodology adds to the risk by being viewed as dry, technical, and difficult competition against alternatives for Saturday night entertainment. However, I attempted to steer sharply away from the shoals of checkered quality and tedium.

To that end, three considerations guided the selection of articles. First, articles were designed to cover several steps or stages that emerge in planning and executing research. Key stages in the research process include developing

²References cited in this section and in sections that introduce remaining portions of the book appear in a single reference section at the end of the book.

the research idea; selecting methods, procedures, and assessment devices; analvzing and interpreting the data; and preparing a written report to communicate what was accomplished and why. Second, articles were selected not only to improve our understanding of research methods but also to provide concrete recommendations and practices to guide the design of an investigation. Thus, many of the articles include suggestions that can be readily applied to improve an investigator's research. Finally, an effort was made to identify highly readable articles. Hundreds of articles on methodology and research design within the past several years were identified and evaluated. From these, articles were selected that eschewed technical jargon, extensive formula, and related features that might engender insomnia among the most vigilant. Each of the articles has been published previously. An advantage is they have traversed the review and publication process and hence their merit already has been favorably evaluated in advance of inclusion in this volume. In many cases, the articles are considered to be classics because of the message and clarity of presentation.

The rationale for selecting readable articles extends beyond the obvious. Technical writings and coverage of individual topics are critical to the development of research acumen. At the same time, such writings often require detailed discussion and dialogue to establish the core concepts and to cull their implications. The process of selection in the present book was designed to identify articles whose critical points could be readily gleaned from the articles themselves. Consequently, the book can be used on its own, particularly for graduate and advanced undergraduate courses, or as a supplement to other texts (e.g., Kazdin, 1998; Rosenthal & Rosnow, 1991).

Several persons have contributed to the development of the book. The contributors whose articles are included are gratefully acknowledged not only for their articles but also for the special contribution their work makes to psychology. Gary R. VandenBos, Julia Frank-McNeil, and Ted Baroody of the American Psychological Association provided valuable support. Colleagues (faculty and students) in the Department of Psychology at Yale University provide in an ongoing way a very special environment for deliberating, discussing, and dissecting research issues and hence served as an important impetus for the present book. In addition, many students have commented on the specific articles that are included in the book and thus helped to screen their final selection. While this book was prepared, I received support from a Research Scientist Award (MH00353) from the National Institute of Mental Health and by the John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation Research Network on Psychopathology and Development, I am extremely grateful for the support and the learning opportunities these grants provided.

Alan E. Kazdin

CONTENTS

List of Contrib	outors	xi
Preface		xiii
Introduction .		3
I. Background	and Underpinnings of Research	13
Underpinnings	s and Tenets of Research	17
Chapter 1.	Psychology From the Standpoint of a Generalist Gregory A. Kimble	19
Developing Research Ideas		37
Chapter 2.	Getting Out of Our Conceptual Ruts: Strategies for Expanding Conceptual Frameworks	39
Chapter 3.	Discovery-Oriented Psychotherapy Research: Rationale, Aims, and Methods	59
Conceptualizin	ng Independent Variables	81
Chapter 4.	Toward Terminological, Conceptual, and Statistical Clarity in the Study of Mediators and Moderators: Examples From the Child-Clinical	
	and Pediatric Psychology Literatures	83

II. Methods: Pr	rinciples and Practices	113
Sampling Subje Chapter 5.	Equivalence of Contrasted Groups in Psychotherapy Outcome Research	117 119
Chapter 6.	Louis M. Hsu Stimulus Sampling in Clinical Research: Representative Design Reviewed Brendan A. Maher	135
Design Options	and Approaches	143
Chapter 7.	In Defense of External Invalidity	145
Chapter 8.	When Small Effects Are Impressive Deborah A. Prentice Dale T. Miller	163
Chapter 9.	Within-Subjects Designs: To Use or Not to Use?	175
III. Assessment	t	187
Designing and E	Evaluating Measures	191
	Scale Construction	193
Chapter 11.	Constructing Validity: Basic Issues in Objective Scale Development	215
Chapter 12.	Validity of Psychological Assessment: Validation of Inferences From Persons' Responses and Performances as Scientific Inquiry Into Score Meaning Samuel Messick	241

Measurement A	Among Different Samples	261
Chapter 13.	Methodological Issues in Assessment Research With Ethnic Minorities Sumie Okazaki Stanley Sue	263
IV. Data Analy	rsis, Evaluation, and Interpretation	283
Background and	d Underpinnings of Data Analyses	289
Chapter 14.	On the Origins of the .05 Level of Statistical Significance	291
Chapter 15.	Hypothesis Validity of Clinical Research Bruce E. Wampold Betsy Davis Roland H. Good III	301
Chapter 16.	Things I Have Learned (So Far)	319
Null Hypothese Chapter 17.	A Power Primer	337 339
Chapter 18.	Statistical Significance Testing and Cumulative Knowledge in Psychology: Implications for Training of Researchers	. 349
Chapter 19.	The Appropriate Use of Null Hypothesis Testing	373
V. Special Topic	cs in Clinical Research	393
Case Study and	Small Sample Research	401
Chapter 20.	Drawing Valid Inferences From Case Studies Alan E. Kazdin	403

Chapter 21.	Single Case Experimental Design and Empirical Clinical Practice	419
Chapter 22.	Efficacy and Specific Effects Data on New Treatments: A Case Study Strategy With Mixed Anxiety-Depression Karla Moras Leslie A. Telfer David H. Barlow	451
Evaluating Trea	atment or Other Interventions	469
Chapter 23.	Testing the Integrity of a Psychotherapy Protocol: Assessment of Adherence and Competence Jennifer Waltz Michael E. Addis Kelly Koerner Neil S. Jacobson	471
Chapter 24.	Treatment of Aptitude × Treatment Interactions	495
Chapter 25.	Clinical Significance: A Statistical Approach to Defining Meaningful Change in Psychotherapy Research Neil S. Jacobson Paula Truax	521
Designing Resea	arch to Be Relevant for Practice and Policy	539
Chapter 26.	Improving the Transition From Basic Efficacy Research to Effectiveness Studies: Methodological Issues and Procedures Gregory N. Clarke	541
Chapter 27.	Therapy Outcome Research, Health Care Policy, and the Continuing Lack of Accumulated Knowledge Wolfgang Linden Frances K. Wen	561

Chapter 28.	Toward the Incorporation of Costs, Cost-Effectiveness Analysis, and Cost- Benefit Analysis Into Clinical Research Brian T. Yates	577
VI. Ethics in R	desearch	595
Guidelines and	Codes	601
Chapter 29.	Ethical Principles of Psychologists and Code of Conduct	603
Chapter 30.	Will the New Code Help Researchers to Be More Ethical?	639
Chapter 31.	Scientific Rewards and Conflicts of Ethical Choices in Human Subjects Research	655
Special Topics a	and Issues	671
Chapter 32.	The Institutional Review Board as a Mirror of Scientific and Ethical Standards	673
Chapter 33.	Current NIH Perspectives on Misconduct in Science	687
Chapter 34.	Reflections on Determining Authorship Credit and Authorship Order on Faculty— Student Collaborations	695

VII. Publication and Communication of Research		711
Chapter 35.	Preparing and Evaluating Research Reports Alan E. Kazdin	715
Chapter 36.	Writing a Review Article for Psychological Bulletin Daryl J. Bem	737
Chapter 37.	Tips for Writing (and Reading) Methodological Articles	753
Chapter 38.	Writing Meta-Analytic Reviews	767
Chapter 39.	Ten Fatal Mistakes in Grant Writing E. R. Oetting	791
References		801
Index		805
About the Edito	or	825

Methodological Issues Strategies in Clinical Research Second Edition