

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

Energy and
Environmental

Law & Policy
Series

The Role of the Judiciary in Environmental Governance

Comparative Perspectives

Edited by Louis J. Kotzé & Alexander R. Paterson



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

The Role of the Judiciary in Environmental Governance

Comparative Perspectives

Edited By

Louis J. Kotzé

B.Com, LLB, LLM, LLD

Professor of Law

North West University

South Africa

and

Alexander R. Paterson

B.Soc.Sci, LLB, LLM

Attorney of the High Court of South Africa

Senior Lecturer

University of Cape Town

South Africa



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN

BOSTON

CHICAGO

NEW YORK

THE NETHERLANDS

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.care@aspenpubl.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-2708-2

© 2009 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA.
Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed in Great Britain.

The Role of the Judiciary in Environmental Governance

**Energy and Environmental Law & Policy Series
Supranational and Comparative Aspects**

VOLUME 4

Editor

Kurt Deketelaere

*Professor of Law, University of Leuven, Belgium,
Honorary Professor of Law, University of Dundee, UK; Chief of Staff,
Flemish Minister for Public Works, Energy, Environment and Nature*

Editorial Board

*Professor Philip Andrews-Speed, University of Dundee
Professor Michael Faure, University of Maastricht
Professor Gunther Händl, Tulane University, New Orleans
Professor Andres Nollkaemper, University of Amsterdam
Professor Oran Young, University of California*

The aim of the Editor and the Editorial Board of this series is to publish works of excellent quality that focus on the study of energy and environmental law and policy.

Through this series the Editor and Editorial Board hope:

- to contribute to the improvement of the quality of energy/environmental law and policy in general and environmental quality and energy efficiency in particular;
- to increase the access to environmental and energy information for students, academics, non-governmental organizations, government institutions, and business;
- to facilitate cooperation between academic and non-academic communities in the field of energy and environmental law and policy throughout the world.

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

The Role of the Judiciary in Environmental Governance

Comparative Perspectives

Edited By

Louis J. Kotzé

B.Com, LLB, LLM, LLD
Professor of Law
North West University
South Africa

and

Alexander R. Paterson

B.Soc.Sci, LLB, LLM
Attorney of the High Court of South Africa
Senior Lecturer
University of Cape Town
South Africa



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Published by:
Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:
Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.care@aspenpubl.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:
Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-2708-2

© 2009 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA.
Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed in Great Britain.

For
Wendy, Ruby and Lucy Paterson
and
Willemien du Plessis

Table of Contents

Preface	23
Foreword	41
Acknowledgements	43
Author Biographies	45
Chapter 1	
The Netherlands	55
<i>Jonathan Verschuuren</i>	
1 Introduction	55
2 Environmental Issues and Environmental Governance Structures	56
2.1 Environmental Issues	56
2.2 Principal Environmental Laws	57
2.3 Institutions and Governance Structures	59
3 Overview of the Court System	59
3.1 Introduction	59
3.2 Procedures before Administrative Courts	60
3.2.1 The Abolishment of the <i>actio popularis</i> : From ‘Anyone’ to ‘Interested Parties’	60
3.2.2 Procedures against Environmental Permit Decisions since 2005	63
3.3 Procedures before Civil Courts	65
3.4 Procedures before Criminal Courts	67
3.5 Non-judicial Procedures	67

4	Significance of the Judiciary: Some Empirical Data	68
4.1	Introduction	68
4.2	Decline in Environmental and Planning Cases	69
4.3	Number of Cases Brought by NGOs and other Parties	70
4.4	Civil Law Cases	70
4.5	Number of Cases Won and Lost by NGOs and Local Citizen Groups	70
5	Analysis of Significant Environmental Judgments	72
5.1	Introduction	72
5.2	Administrative Law Case on EU Habitats Directive	72
5.3	Civil Law Case on EU Nitrates Directive	73
6	Critical Survey	76
7	The Way Forward	79
	Bibliography	79
	Table of Legislation	81
	Table of Cases	82
	Abbreviations	83
	Chapter 2	
	Belgium	85
	<i>Luc Lavrysen</i>	
1	Introduction	85
1.1	The Transformation of Belgium into a Federal State	85
1.2	Federal Government	87
1.3	Regions and Communities	87
2	Environmental Issues and Performance	88
3	Environmental Law Framework	90
3.1	Significant Impact of European Environmental Law	90
3.2	Constitutional Provisions	91
3.3	Federal Environmental Legislation	93
3.4	Regional Environmental Legislation	94
3.5	Legislation through Cooperation Agreements	96
4	The Court System	96
4.1	The Constitutional Court	96
4.2	The Ordinary Courts	97
4.3	The Administrative Courts	98
5	Environmental Jurisdiction	99
5.1	Introduction	99
5.2	Constitutional Jurisdiction	102
5.2.1	Clarification of the Division of Powers	102
5.2.2	Environmental Protection, Property Rights and Freedom of Enterprise	102
5.2.3	Constitutional Right to a Healthy Environment	103
5.2.4	Right of Respect for Private and Family Life	105

5.3 Access to Courts	106
5.3.1 Ordinary Courts	106
5.3.2 Council of State	108
5.4 Penal Enforcement	110
6 The Way Forward	114
Bibliography	116
Table of Legislation	119
Table of Cases	120
Table of International Instruments	122
Abbreviations	122

Chapter 3

Germany 123

Eckard Reh binder

1 Introduction	123
2 Principal Environmental Laws	124
3 Institutional and Governance Structures	125
4 Overview over the Judiciary	126
5 Access to the Judiciary in Environmental Matters	128
5.1 Standing of Individuals	128
5.1.1 The Basic Rights-Oriented Standing Concept	128
5.1.2 Third Party Standing	129
5.1.3 Standing in Special Areas of Environmental Protection	129
5.2 Standing of Associations and Municipalities	131
5.2.1 The Principle of Inadmissibility of Collective Suits	131
5.2.2 Statutory Association Standing	132
5.2.3 Standing of Local Governments	133
5.3 Grounds, Scope and Depth of Judicial Review	133
5.3.1 Grounds for Judicial Review	133
5.3.2 Scope of Judicial Review: The Impact of the Protective Law Theory	134
5.3.3 Depth of Judicial Review	135
5.4 Interim Judicial Protection	135
6 The Wealth of Case Law: Some Illustrative Judicial Decisions	136
7 Judicial Contribution to Environmental Governance	139
7.1 Introduction	139
7.1.1 Shortcomings of the Rights-Based Approach	139
7.1.2 Broadening the Judicial Perspective	140
7.2 Contribution to the Interpretation and Development of Environmental Law	141
7.2.1 Law Making Role of the Courts	141
7.2.2 Controlling National Implementation of EU Directives	142

7.2.3	Controlling the Functioning of the Administration and Beyond	144
7.2.4	Fast-Tracking Court Proceedings and Judicial Protection	145
8	Future Perspectives	145
	Bibliography	146
	Table of Legislation	147
	Table of Cases	148
	Table of International Instruments	149
	Abbreviations	149
Chapter 4		151
United Kingdom		
<i>Karen Morrow</i>		
1	Introduction	151
1.1	Environmental Issues	151
1.2	Principal Environmental Laws	152
1.2.1	Pollution Control	152
1.2.2	Nature, Habitat and Landscape Conservation	153
1.2.3	Contextual Provisions	154
1.3	Institutions and Governance Structures	155
1.3.1	Policy Matters	155
1.3.2	Operational Matters	156
2	Overview of the Court System	157
2.1	Historical Development of the Judiciary	157
2.2	Court Structure and Hierarchy	159
3	Analysis of Significant Environmental Judgments	160
3.1	Private Law (Law of Torts)	160
3.2	Judicial Review	162
3.3	Statutory Interpretation	165
3.4	Human Rights Act Cases	168
4	Critical Survey	170
5	The Way Forward	171
5.1	Key Challenges	171
5.2	Key Opportunities	172
	Bibliography	174
	Table of Legislation	176
	Table of Cases	177
	Table of International Instruments	178
	Abbreviations	179
Chapter 5		181
United States of America		
<i>Nicholas Robinson</i>		
1	Introduction	181

Table of Contents

2	Main Environmental Issues and Laws	183
3	Overview of the USA Judiciary	187
3.1	Introduction	187
3.2	The Courts and Environmental Issues (General Observations)	189
3.3	Legal Foundations for Judicial Decisions	190
3.4	Administrative Law and Judicial Review	194
4	Analysis of Significant Environmental Judgments	196
4.1	Introduction	196
4.2	Burdens of Proof: Observing the Land Ethic	197
4.3	'Technology Forcing': Reversing Degrading Practices	199
4.4	Safeguarding the Natural Integrity of Wild Forests	200
4.5	Critical Survey	202
5	The Way Forward	203
	Bibliography	204
	Table of Legislation	207
	Table of Cases	207
	Table of International Instruments	208
	Abbreviations	208
Chapter 6		209
Canada		
	<i>Jamie Benidickson and Heather McLeod-Kilmurray</i>	
1	Introduction	209
1.1	Environmental Issues	209
1.2	Role of Courts	210
1.3	Principal Environmental Laws	212
1.4	Institutions and Governance Structures	213
2	Overview of the Court System	214
2.1	Historical Development of the Judiciary	214
2.2	Court Structure and Hierarchy of Courts	215
2.3	Applicable Law	217
3	Analysis of Significant Environmental Judgments	218
4	Critical Survey	223
4.1	Fundamental Environmental Values	223
4.2	Federalism and the Environment	225
4.3	Strengthening Environmental Legislation	227
4.4	Procedural Innovations to Facilitate Environmental Litigation	228
4.5	Reconciling Environmental and Aboriginal Rights	231
4.6	Creative Environmental Sentencing	233
4.7	Missed Opportunities: Toxic Torts	234
5	Conclusion: Next Steps, Key Challenges and Key Opportunities	237
	Bibliography	240
	Table of Legislation	245
	Table of Cases	246
	Abbreviations	248

Chapter 7	249
Brazil	
<i>Ingo Sarlet and Tiago Fensterseifer</i>	
1 Introduction	249
2 Main Environmental Issues	250
3 Principal Environmental Laws	251
4 Constitutionalization of Environmental Protection in Brazil	251
5 Structure and Main Functions of Brazilian Courts	255
6 Analysis of Significant Environmental Judgments	257
6.1 Property Right Limitations and Private Agents' Environmental Protection Duty	257
6.2 Cruelty to Animals	258
6.3 Environmental Sanitation: The Constitutional Warranty of a Minimum Standard of Environmental Quality and the State's Protective Duty	259
7 Critical Evaluation	262
Bibliography	264
Table of Legislation	265
Table of Cases	266
Table of International Instruments	266
Abbreviations	266
Chapter 8	269
Argentina	
<i>Juan Carballo</i>	
1 Introduction	269
2 Main Environmental Issues	270
3 Environmental Institutions and Governance Structures	272
4 Principal Environmental Laws	274
5 The Judicial System in Argentina	276
6 Analysis of Significant Environmental Judgments	278
6.1 Inferior Courts	279
6.2 Supreme Court	282
7 Critical Evaluation and Way Forward	286
Bibliography	288
Table of Legislation	291
Table of Cases	291
Table of Treaties and International Instruments	292
Abbreviations	293
Chapter 9	295
Paraguay	
<i>Sheila Abed</i>	
1 Introduction	295

<i>Table of Contents</i>	13
--------------------------	----

2	Environmental Issues	296
2.1	Location and Size	296
2.2	Population	297
2.3	Economy	297
2.4	Main Environmental Issues	298
3	Principal Environmental Laws	299
3.1	Constitutional Provisions	299
3.2	Regional Cooperation and Instruments	300
3.3	Environmental Impact Assessment	301
3.4	Agriculture	302
3.5	General Provisions	303
4	Institutions and Governance Structures	303
4.1	Institutional Framework Established by the Constitution	303
4.2	Environmental Governance Institutions	305
5	Overview of the Court System	306
6	Procedures Giving Rise to Frequent Litigation	307
7	Criminal Prosecution	309
8	Significant Court Judgments of Environmental Relevance	312
9	Critical Survey	314
10	The Way Forward	315
	Bibliography	316
	Table of Legislation	317
	Table of Cases	317
	Table of Regional and International Instruments	318
	Abbreviations	318

Chapter 10	
Australia	321
<i>Linda Pearson</i>	

1	Introduction	321
1.1	Environmental Issues	321
1.2	Principal Environmental Laws	323
1.3	Institutions and Governance Structures	327
2	The Court System	329
2.1	Historical Development of the Judiciary	329
2.2	Court Structure and Hierarchy of Courts	330
2.2.1	Federal Courts and Tribunals	330
2.2.2	State Courts and Tribunals	332
3	Significant Court Judgments of Environmental Relevance	334
3.1	Establishing the Limits of the Common Law	334
3.2	Establishing the Extent of National Responsibility for Environmental Governance	335
3.3	Interpretation of Environmental and other Legislation	337
3.4	Public Participation and Enforcement	340
4	Critical Survey	342

5 The Way Forward	344
5.1 Key Challenges	344
5.2 Key Opportunities	345
Bibliography	346
Table of Legislation	348
Table of Cases	351
Abbreviations	353

Chapter 11

New Zealand

Klaus Bosselmann

1 Introduction	355
2 Environmental Issues	356
3 Principal Environmental Laws	357
3.1 Resource Management Act 1991	358
3.2 Energy Efficiency and Conservation Act 2000	360
3.3 Hazardous Substances and New Organisms Act 1996	360
3.4 Fisheries Act 1996	361
3.5 Crown Minerals Act 1991	361
3.6 Forests Act 1949	361
3.7 Environment Act 1986	362
3.8 Conservation Act 1987	362
4 Institutions and Governance Structures	362
4.1 Central Government	363
4.2 Local Government	364
5 The Courts	365
5.1 History of the Courts	365
5.2 Hierarchy of the Courts	366
5.3 Environment Court	367
6 Judgments of Environmental Relevance	367
7 Critical Survey and Future Perspectives	374
Bibliography	376
Table of Legislation	378
Table of Cases	379
Table of International Instruments	380
Abbreviations	380

Chapter 12

Pakistan

Parvez Hassan and Jawad Hassan

1 Introduction	381
2 Environmental Issues	382
3 Principal Environmental Laws	382