

PURE AND APPLIED MATHEMATICS  
A SERIES OF MONOGRAPHS AND TEXTBOOKS

# ***Invariant Descriptive Set Theory***

***Su Gao***



**CRC Press**

Taylor & Francis Group

A CHAPMAN & HALL BOOK

# Invariant Descriptive Set Theory

**Su Gao**



**CRC Press**

Taylor & Francis Group

Boca Raton London New York

---

CRC Press is an imprint of the  
Taylor & Francis Group, an **informa** business  
A CHAPMAN & HALL BOOK

Chapman & Hall/CRC  
Taylor & Francis Group  
6000 Broken Sound Parkway NW, Suite 300  
Boca Raton, FL 33487-2742

© 2009 by Taylor & Francis Group, LLC  
Chapman & Hall/CRC is an imprint of Taylor & Francis Group, an Informa business

No claim to original U.S. Government works  
Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper  
10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

International Standard Book Number-13: 978-1-58488-793-5 (Hardcover)

This book contains information obtained from authentic and highly regarded sources. Reasonable efforts have been made to publish reliable data and information, but the author and publisher cannot assume responsibility for the validity of all materials or the consequences of their use. The authors and publishers have attempted to trace the copyright holders of all material reproduced in this publication and apologize to copyright holders if permission to publish in this form has not been obtained. If any copyright material has not been acknowledged please write and let us know so we may rectify in any future reprint.

Except as permitted under U.S. Copyright Law, no part of this book may be reprinted, reproduced, transmitted, or utilized in any form by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying, microfilming, and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publishers.

For permission to photocopy or use material electronically from this work, please access [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com) ([http://www.copyright.com/](http://www.copyright.com)) or contact the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, 978-750-8400. CCC is a not-for-profit organization that provides licenses and registration for a variety of users. For organizations that have been granted a photocopy license by the CCC, a separate system of payment has been arranged.

**Trademark Notice:** Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

---

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

---

Gao, Su, 1968-  
Invariant descriptive set theory / Su Gao.  
p. cm. -- (Pure and applied mathematics)  
Includes bibliographical references and index.  
ISBN 978-1-58488-793-5 (alk. paper)  
1. Descriptive set theory. 2. Invariant sets. I. Title.

QA248.G36 2009  
511.3'22--dc22

2008031545

---

Visit the Taylor & Francis Web site at  
<http://www.taylorandfrancis.com>

and the CRC Press Web site at  
<http://www.crcpress.com>

# **Invariant Descriptive Set Theory**

# PURE AND APPLIED MATHEMATICS

A Program of Monographs, Textbooks, and Lecture Notes

## EXECUTIVE EDITORS

Earl J. Taft  
*Rutgers University*  
*Piscataway, New Jersey*

Zuhair Nashed  
*University of Central Florida*  
*Orlando, Florida*

## EDITORIAL BOARD

M. S. Baouendi <i>University of California, San Diego</i>	Anil Nerode <i>Cornell University</i>
Jane Cronin <i>Rutgers University</i>	Freddy van Oystaeyen <i>University of Antwerp, Belgium</i>
Jack K. Hale <i>Georgia Institute of Technology</i>	Donald Passman <i>University of Wisconsin, Madison</i>
S. Kobayashi <i>University of California, Berkeley</i>	Fred S. Roberts <i>Rutgers University</i>
Marvin Marcus <i>University of California, Santa Barbara</i>	David L. Russell <i>Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University</i>
W. S. Massey <i>Yale University</i>	Walter Schempp <i>Universität Siegen</i>

# MONOGRAPHS AND TEXTBOOKS IN PURE AND APPLIED MATHEMATICS

## Recent Titles

- Walter Ferrer and Alvaro Rittatore*, Actions and Invariants of Algebraic Groups (2005)
- Christof Eck, Jiri Jarusek, and Miroslav Krbeč*, Unilateral Contact Problems: Variational Methods and Existence Theorems (2005)
- M. M. Rao*, Conditional Measures and Applications, Second Edition (2005)
- A. B. Kharazishvili*, Strange Functions in Real Analysis, Second Edition (2006)
- Vincenzo Ancona and Bernard Gaveau*, Differential Forms on Singular Varieties: De Rham and Hodge Theory Simplified (2005)
- Santiago Alves Tavares*, Generation of Multivariate Hermite Interpolating Polynomials (2005)
- Sergio Macías*, Topics on Continua (2005)
- Mircea Sofonea, Weimin Han, and Meir Shillor*, Analysis and Approximation of Contact Problems with Adhesion or Damage (2006)
- Marwan Moubachir and Jean-Paul Zolésio*, Moving Shape Analysis and Control: Applications to Fluid Structure Interactions (2006)
- Alfred Geroldinger and Franz Halter-Koch*, Non-Unique Factorizations: Algebraic, Combinatorial and Analytic Theory (2006)
- Kevin J. Hastings*, Introduction to the Mathematics of Operations Research with *Mathematica*®, Second Edition (2006)
- Robert Carlson*, A Concrete Introduction to Real Analysis (2006)
- John Dauns and Yiqiang Zhou*, Classes of Modules (2006)
- N. K. Govil, H. N. Mhaskar, Ram N. Mohapatra, Zuhair Nashed, and J. Szabados*, Frontiers in Interpolation and Approximation (2006)
- Luca Lorenzi and Marcello Bertoldi*, Analytical Methods for Markov Semigroups (2006)
- M. A. Al-Gwaiz and S. A. Elsanousi*, Elements of Real Analysis (2006)
- Theodore G. Faticoni*, Direct Sum Decompositions of Torsion-Free Finite Rank Groups (2007)
- R. Sivaramakrishnan*, Certain Number-Theoretic Episodes in Algebra (2006)
- Aderemi Kuku*, Representation Theory and Higher Algebraic K-Theory (2006)
- Robert Piziak and P. L. Odell*, Matrix Theory: From Generalized Inverses to Jordan Form (2007)
- Norman L. Johnson, Vikram Jha, and Mauro Biliotti*, Handbook of Finite Translation Planes (2007)
- Lieven Le Bruyn*, Noncommutative Geometry and Cayley-smooth Orders (2008)
- Fritz Schwarz*, Algorithmic Lie Theory for Solving Ordinary Differential Equations (2008)
- Jane Cronin*, Ordinary Differential Equations: Introduction and Qualitative Theory, Third Edition (2008)
- Su Gao*, Invariant Descriptive Set Theory (2009)

---

*To Shuang, Alvin, and Tony, with love*

---

# *Preface*

My intention in writing this book is to bring into one place the basics of invariant descriptive set theory, also known as the descriptive set theory of definable equivalence relations. Invariant descriptive set theory has been an active field of research for about 20 years. Many researchers and students are impressed by its fast development and its relevance to other fields of mathematics, and would like to be better acquainted with the theory. I have tried to make this book as self-contained as possible, and at the same time covered what I believe to be the essential concepts, methods, and results.

The book is designed as a graduate text suitable for a year-long course. I have kept the sections short so that they can be used as lecture notes, and most of the sections are followed by a number of exercise problems. Many exercises are propositions and even theorems needed later in the book. So the student is urged to make a serious effort to work them out.

Ideally, the student should have some experience with classical and effective descriptive set theory before reading this book. But since this is most likely not the case, I have only assumed that the student knows some general topology. In the first chapter a review of classical and effective descriptive set theory is given, and throughout the book results are recalled as they become necessary. I can imagine that it is hard, but possible, for a student who has never seen any descriptive set theory to get started on the subject, but I believe that, with patience and diligence, the obstacles will be overcome eventually.

I have to remark, primarily for the experts in the field, that the book is not intended to be a comprehensive account of all aspects of invariant descriptive set theory. A reader who is familiar with the materials of the book and who is interested in further developments should have no problem following the current literature on many topics and applications. The selection of topics contained in this book was greatly influenced by the book of Becker and Kechris [8] and some unpublished notes of Kechris.

I would like to thank Julia Knight for inviting me to give a short course on invariant descriptive set theory at the University of Notre Dame in 2005. The first ideas for this book came from the notes for that short course. I would also like to thank the participants of the short course for typing the notes and for conversations on the topic. I am grateful to Dave Marker and Peter Cholak for the encouragement to write a graduate textbook on the subject. Special thanks are due to Longyun Ding and Vincent Kieftenbeld for comments and suggestions on the manuscript.



I would like to acknowledge the financial support of the National Science Foundation and the University of North Texas for the composition of this book and for related research. It would be impossible for me to write this book without the faculty developmental leave granted by the University of North Texas. Many thanks to all at CRC/Taylor & Francis for their untiring work to make this book a reality.

I am indebted to Greg Hjorth for leading me into the field and to Alekos Kechris for many years of advice and support. It is a privilege for me to be acquainted with many colleagues and experts in the field, too numerous to list (see the References and Index), whose research results shaped this book. I benefited a great deal from communications with them and from their contributions to the literature. I present this book to them with gratitude and pride.

Su Gao  
Denton, Texas

---

# Contents

Preface	xiii
<b>I Polish Group Actions</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Preliminaries</b>	<b>3</b>
1.1 Polish spaces . . . . .	4
1.2 The universal Urysohn space . . . . .	8
1.3 Borel sets and Borel functions . . . . .	13
1.4 Standard Borel spaces . . . . .	18
1.5 The effective hierarchy . . . . .	23
1.6 Analytic sets and $\Sigma_1^1$ sets . . . . .	29
1.7 Coanalytic sets and $\Pi_1^1$ sets . . . . .	33
1.8 The Gandy–Harrington topology . . . . .	36
<b>2 Polish Groups</b>	<b>39</b>
2.1 Metrics on topological groups . . . . .	40
2.2 Polish groups . . . . .	44
2.3 Continuity of homomorphisms . . . . .	51
2.4 The permutation group $S_\infty$ . . . . .	54
2.5 Universal Polish groups . . . . .	59
2.6 The Graev metric groups . . . . .	62
<b>3 Polish Group Actions</b>	<b>71</b>
3.1 Polish $G$ -spaces . . . . .	71
3.2 The Vaught transforms . . . . .	75
3.3 Borel $G$ -spaces . . . . .	81
3.4 Orbit equivalence relations . . . . .	85
3.5 Extensions of Polish group actions . . . . .	89
3.6 The logic actions . . . . .	92
<b>4 Finer Polish Topologies</b>	<b>97</b>
4.1 Strong Choquet spaces . . . . .	97
4.2 Change of topology . . . . .	102
4.3 Finer topologies on Polish $G$ -spaces . . . . .	105
4.4 Topological realization of Borel $G$ -spaces . . . . .	109

<b>II</b>	<b>Theory of Equivalence Relations</b>	<b>115</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Borel Reducibility</b>	<b>117</b>
5.1	Borel reductions . . . . .	117
5.2	Faithful Borel reductions . . . . .	121
5.3	Perfect set theorems for equivalence relations . . . . .	124
5.4	Smooth equivalence relations . . . . .	128
<b>6</b>	<b>The Glimm–Effros Dichotomy</b>	<b>133</b>
6.1	The equivalence relation $E_0$ . . . . .	133
6.2	Orbit equivalence relations embedding $E_0$ . . . . .	137
6.3	The Harrington–Kechris–Louveau theorem . . . . .	141
6.4	Consequences of the Glimm–Effros dichotomy . . . . .	147
6.5	Actions of cli Polish groups . . . . .	151
<b>7</b>	<b>Countable Borel Equivalence Relations</b>	<b>157</b>
7.1	Generalities of countable Borel equivalence relations . . . . .	157
7.2	Hyperfinite equivalence relations . . . . .	160
7.3	Universal countable Borel equivalence relations . . . . .	165
7.4	Amenable groups and amenable equivalence relations . . . . .	168
7.5	Actions of locally compact Polish groups . . . . .	174
<b>8</b>	<b>Borel Equivalence Relations</b>	<b>179</b>
8.1	Hypersmooth equivalence relations . . . . .	179
8.2	Borel orbit equivalence relations . . . . .	184
8.3	A jump operator for Borel equivalence relations . . . . .	187
8.4	Examples of $F_\sigma$ equivalence relations . . . . .	193
8.5	Examples of $\Pi_3^0$ equivalence relations . . . . .	196
<b>9</b>	<b>Analytic Equivalence Relations</b>	<b>201</b>
9.1	The Burgess trichotomy theorem . . . . .	201
9.2	Definable reductions among analytic equivalence relations . . . . .	206
9.3	Actions of standard Borel groups . . . . .	210
9.4	Wild Polish groups . . . . .	213
9.5	The topological Vaught conjecture . . . . .	219
<b>10</b>	<b>Turbulent Actions of Polish Groups</b>	<b>223</b>
10.1	Homomorphisms and generic ergodicity . . . . .	223
10.2	Local orbits of Polish group actions . . . . .	227
10.3	Turbulent and generically turbulent actions . . . . .	230
10.4	The Hjorth turbulence theorem . . . . .	235
10.5	Examples of turbulence . . . . .	239
10.6	Orbit equivalence relations and $E_1$ . . . . .	241

<b>III</b>	<b>Countable Model Theory</b>	<b>245</b>
<b>11</b>	<b>Polish Topologies of Infinitary Logic</b>	<b>247</b>
11.1	A review of first-order logic . . . . .	247
11.2	Model theory of infinitary logic . . . . .	252
11.3	Invariant Borel classes of countable models . . . . .	256
11.4	Polish topologies generated by countable fragments . . . . .	262
11.5	Atomic models and $G_\delta$ orbits . . . . .	266
<b>12</b>	<b>The Scott Analysis</b>	<b>273</b>
12.1	Elements of the Scott analysis . . . . .	273
12.2	Borel approximations of isomorphism relations . . . . .	279
12.3	The Scott rank and computable ordinals . . . . .	283
12.4	A topological variation of the Scott analysis . . . . .	286
12.5	Sharp analysis of $S_\infty$ -orbits . . . . .	292
<b>13</b>	<b>Natural Classes of Countable Models</b>	<b>299</b>
13.1	Countable graphs . . . . .	299
13.2	Countable trees . . . . .	304
13.3	Countable linear orderings . . . . .	310
13.4	Countable groups . . . . .	314
<b>IV</b>	<b>Applications to Classification Problems</b>	<b>321</b>
<b>14</b>	<b>Classification by Example: Polish Metric Spaces</b>	<b>323</b>
14.1	Standard Borel structures on hyperspaces . . . . .	323
14.2	Classification versus nonclassification . . . . .	329
14.3	Measurement of complexity . . . . .	334
14.4	Classification notions . . . . .	339
<b>15</b>	<b>Summary of Benchmark Equivalence Relations</b>	<b>345</b>
15.1	Classification problems up to essential countability . . . . .	345
15.2	A roadmap of Borel equivalence relations . . . . .	348
15.3	Orbit equivalence relations . . . . .	350
15.4	General $\Sigma_1^1$ equivalence relations . . . . .	352
15.5	Beyond analyticity . . . . .	353
<b>A</b>	<b>Proofs about the Gandy–Harrington Topology</b>	<b>355</b>
A.1	The Gandy basis theorem . . . . .	355
A.2	The Gandy–Harrington topology on $X_{\text{low}}$ . . . . .	358
	<b>References</b>	<b>361</b>
	<b>Index</b>	<b>373</b>

## **Part I**

# **Polish Group Actions**



# Chapter 1

---

## *Preliminaries*

This chapter reviews the concepts and results of classical and effective descriptive set theory that will be used in this book. Classical descriptive set theory was founded by Baire, Borel, Lebesgue, Luzin, Suslin, Sierpinski, and others in the first two decades of the twentieth century. The theory studies the *descriptive complexity* of sets of real numbers arising in ordinary mathematics, mostly in topology and analysis. The most striking achievements of this theory are the proofs of regularity properties of low-level definable sets of reals.

Effective descriptive set theory was created later in the century by introducing into the classical theory the new and powerful tools developed from recursion theory (now called computability theory). Computability theory came about from completely different motivations and was invented by another group of great minds such as Gödel, Church, Turing, Kleene, and others. It provided a framework to understand the structural and computational complexity of sets and functions (mostly pertaining to natural numbers). The classical theory is much better understood from the perspective of the effective theory.

In this chapter we review the basic concepts and results of both classical and effective theory that are relevant to the remainder of the book. Readers unfamiliar with these topics should be able to get a working idea about the content and the flavor of the theory by reading this chapter alone, and especially if they are diligent enough to work out the exercise problems in this chapter. Later in the book there will be more specific concepts and results being reviewed as they become necessary tools. In addition, some proofs are given in the appendix. The reader can probably get by with these reviews without ever systematically studying the classical and effective descriptive set theory, but an understanding of the comprehensive theory will be hugely advantageous.

For a complete treatment of these topics the reader can consult the standard references. For classical descriptive set theory the standard textbook is [97]

A. S. Kechris, *Classical Descriptive Set Theory*. Graduate Texts in Mathematics 156. Springer-Verlag, New York, 1995.

And for effective descriptive set theory our standard source is [126]

Y. N. Moschovakis, *Descriptive Set Theory*. Studies in Logic and

Foundations of Mathematics 100. North-Holland, Amsterdam, New York, 1980.

In addition, there are more concise treatments of the subject which provide efficient inroads to the theory and can be used as alternatives for or in conjunction with the standard texts: [148] by Srivastava, [125] by Martin and Kechris, [116] by Mansfield and Weitkamp, and [133] by Sacks. Thus in this chapter our review will be pragmatic and sketchy. Many facts, even theorems, are given without proof. Also we have left out important aspects of the theory just to get the reader quickly prepared to deal with the main topics of the book starting in Chapter 2.

Let the story begin.

## 1.1 Polish spaces

### **Definition 1.1.1**

A topological space is **Polish** if it is separable and completely metrizable.

Some basic properties of Polish spaces are gathered in the following proposition.

### **Proposition 1.1.2**

- (a) Any Polish space is second countable and normal.
- (b) Any Polish space is Baire. (Recall that a topological space is **Baire** if the intersection of countable many dense open sets is dense.)
- (c) A finite or countable product of Polish spaces is Polish.
- (d) A subspace  $Y$  of a Polish space  $X$  is Polish iff  $Y$  is  $G_\delta$  in  $X$ , that is,  $Y$  is the intersection of countably many open sets in  $X$ .
- (e) A quotient space of a Polish space is not necessarily Polish.

Clause (b) in the proposition is a direct consequence of the **Baire category theorem**, which says that a complete metric space is Baire. Examples of Polish spaces are abundant in mathematics. Some of the most familiar examples are listed below.

### **Example 1.1.3**

- (1) All countable spaces with the discrete topology are Polish. These include



the following spaces:

$$\mathbb{N} = \omega = \{0, 1, 2, \dots\},$$

$$\mathbb{N}_+ = \mathbb{N} - \{0\} = \{1, 2, \dots\},$$

$$\mathbb{Z} = \{\dots, -2, -1, 0, 1, 2, \dots\}.$$

Throughout this book we use  $\mathbb{N}$  and  $\omega$  interchangeably.

- (2)  $\mathbb{R}^n$  with the usual topology for  $1 \leq n \leq \omega$  are Polish.
- (3) The Baire space  $\mathcal{N} = \omega^\omega$  is Polish. A complete metric on  $\mathcal{N}$  is defined by

$$d(x, y) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } x = y, \\ 2^{-n-1}, & \text{if } n \in \omega \text{ is the least such that } x(n) \neq y(n). \end{cases}$$

- (4) The Cantor space  $2^\omega$  is a closed subspace of  $\mathcal{N}$ , hence is Polish.
- (5) All separable Banach spaces, such as  $c_0$  and  $\ell_p$  ( $1 \leq p < \infty$ ), are Polish. Note that  $\ell_\infty$  is not separable and therefore not a Polish space.
- (6) All compact metrizable spaces are Polish (see Exercise 1.1.1).

Some nontrivial examples of Polish spaces involve hyperspaces of sets or functions. We examine two such examples below.

Let  $d$  be a compatible metric on a Polish space  $X$ . Then we can define a compatible metric  $d'$  on  $X$  with the property that  $d' \leq 1$  as follows:

$$d'(x, y) = \frac{d(x, y)}{1 + d(x, y)}.$$

Moreover, if  $d$  is complete then so is  $d'$ . If  $x \in X$  and  $A \subseteq X$ , then we denote

$$d(x, A) = d(A, x) = \inf\{d(x, y) : y \in A\}.$$

Let  $X$  be a Polish space. Let  $K(X)$  denote the space of all compact subsets of  $X$  equipped with the **Vietoris topology** generated by subbasic open sets of the following form:

$$\{K \in K(X) : K \subseteq U\}, \text{ or}$$

$$\{K \in K(X) : K \cap U \neq \emptyset\},$$

for  $U$  open in  $X$ . Then  $K(X)$  is Polish. An explicit compatible metric on  $K(X)$  is known as the **Hausdorff metric**. To define it, let  $d$  be a compatible