H.W.ARTHURS D.D.CARTER · H.J.GLASBEEK

LABOUR LAW AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS IN CANADA

KLUWER BUTTERWORTHS

Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada

by

Prof. H. W. Arthurs

Prof. D. D. Carter

Prof. H. J. Glasbeek

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International Encyclopaedia for Labour Law and Industrial Relations

1981

KLUWER DEVENTER/BOSTON/LONDON/FRANKFURT/ ANTWERP

BUTTERWORTHS TORONTO/VANCOUVER/LONDON/SEATTLE Distribution in Canada and the USA

Butterworths and Co. Ltd. 2265 Midland Avenue Scarborough, Ontario Canada M1P 4S1

Cover design: Pieter J. van der Sman

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Arthurs, Harry W. 1933-

Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada

Originally published as a monograph in the International Encyclopaedia for Labour Law and Industrial Relations.

Bibliography: p.

- 1. Labor laws and legislation Canada.
- 2. Industrial relations Canada. I. Carter, D. D., joint author. II. Glasbeek, H. J., joint author. III. Title.

KE3109.A76 344.71'01 80-22468

ISBN 90 312 0139 1 (Kluwer) 0-409-81184-X (Butterworths)

D/1981/2664/15

© 1981, Kluwer, Deventer, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the written permission of the publisher.

List o	f Abbreviations	15
Introd	luction	17
I. G	eneral Observations	17
§1	ENERAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION . Geographic Setting A. Size B. Boundaries C. Transportation and Communications D. Physical Resources C. Governmental Structure A. The Constitution B. Federalism C. Formal structure 1. The Legislative Power 2. The Executive 3. Administrative Agencies	18 18 18 18 19 19 20 21 21 21 21
§4	4. The Judiciary and Legal System 3. Informal Political Structures 4. Political Culture 5. The People of Canada A. Generally B. The Work Force C. Income Distribution D. Union Membership	22 23 23 25 25 25 26 26
§1 §2	eneral Notions and Special Definitions . 'Labour Law' Defined . General Notions of Collective Labour Law . Definitions 1. General 2. Arbitration 3. Bargaining Units 4. Boycott 5. Certification 6. Collective Agreement 7. Collective Bargaining	27 27 28 28 28 29 29 29 29 30

8. Conciliation	30
9. Employee/Employer	30
10. Employers' Associations	31
11. Labour Relations Board	31
12. Lockout	31
13. Management	31
14. Mediation	32
15. Picketing	32
16. Strike	32
17. Trade Union	32
18. Unfair Labour Practices	32
19. Union Security	32
20. Voluntary Recognition	33
§4. Explanation of References	33
IV. THE CANADIAN LABOUR MOVEMENT	34
V. THE ROLE OF GOVERNMENT INSTITUTIONS IN THE SHAPING AND	
ADMINISTRATION OF LABOUR LAW AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS POLICY	42
§1. Constitutional Background	42
§2. The Role of Government Institutions	44
A. The Legislature	44
B. The Courts	44
1. The Superior Courts	44
2. The Lower Courts	45
C. The Executive	46
1. The Cabinet	46
2. The Ministry of Labour	46
3. The Ministry of Justice or of the Attorney General	46
4. Other Ministries	46
D. The Labour Relations Board	47
VI. Sources of Labour Law	48
§1. Methods of Legal Analysis	48
§2. Common Law	48
A. General	48
B. Tort	48
C. Contract	49
D. Property	49
E. Judicial Review of Administrative Decisions and Arbitration	
Awards	49
§3. Legislation	49
§4. Subordinate Legislation§5. Administrative Decision-Making	50
§6. Collective Agreements	50
§7. Industrial Custom and Practice	50
§8. Bibliography	51
30. Dionography	52

Part I. The Individual Employment Relationship	53
Chapter I. Definitions and Concepts	53
§1. The Central Place of the Contract of Employment	53
A. The Ubiquity of the Concept	53
B. Working Definition	54
C. Apprenticeships	55
D. The Service Characteristic	56
§2. Distinguishing the Contract of Employment from other	
Contracts to provide Service	57
A. The Need to Distinguish	57
B. Relationships Which Need to be Distinguished	57
C. The Criteria Used to Make the Distinctions	58
D. Application of the Criteria	59
E. Significance of the Context as a Criterion	61
F. Who is the Employer?	62
§3. Formation of Contracts of Employment	65
A. Types of Contract of Employment	65
B. The Requirement of Writing	66
C. Capacity to Contract	69
1. Minors	69
2. Migrants	70
3. Collective agreements as a restraint on capacity to	, 0
contract	71
D. Purpose of Contract	71
E. Requirements of Fairness in Formation of Contracts of	, 1
Employment	72
1. The Human Rights Statutes	72
2. Investigation and Testing	74
3. Employment Agencies	74
4. Fair Practices and Collective Bargaining	75
4. Fall Fractices and Conective Barganning	13
CHAPTER II. RIGHTS AND DUTIES OF THE PARTIES TO THE EMPLOYMENT	
RELATIONSHIP	76
§1. The Roots of such Rights and Duties	76
§2. The Employer's Duties and Obligations	76
A. The Duty to Pay Remuneration	76
1. The Foundation of the Duty	76
2. When the Obligation to Pay Matures	78
3. The Effect of Illness	79
4. Form of Remuneration	80
5. Legislative Standards in Respect of Remuneration	80
a. Minimum Wage Legislation	80
b. Equal Pay Legislation	81
6. Important Benefits related to Remuneration	83
a. Unemployment insurance	83
b. Pension plans	86
o. I chiston plans	80

D. T. D D I. W. I.	
B. The Duty to Provide Work	89
C. Responsibility for the Employee's Conduct	91
1. Master's Tort Theory	91
2. Vicarious Liability	92
D. Duty to Provide a Safe Work Environment	95
1. The Common Law Duty	95
2. Workers' Compensation Legislation	95
3. Developing Occupational Health and Safety Legislation	97
§3. The Employee's Duties and Obligations	99
A. Introduction	99
B. The Duty to Obey	99
Duty to Obey Commands to Work for a Particular	
Period – the Statutes	101
C. The Duty to Exercise Skill and Care	102
D. The Duty of Good Faith and Fidelity	104
1. Trade Secrets	104
2. Inventions	106
§4. Termination of Employment	107
A. Frustration	107
B. Death	
	108
C. Bankruptcy	108
D. Dissolution of Firms	109
E. Termination by Notice	109
1. Common Law	109
2. Statutes	111
Group Termination	112
F. Termination for Cause	112
§5. Remedies for Breach of Contract	113
A. Employer Remedies	113
1. Summary Dismissal	113
2. Damages	
	114
3. Injunctions and Specific Performance	115
B. Employee Remedies	116
1. Damages	116
2. Quantum Meruit	118
Don't H. Callactive Lobour Deletiere	110
Part II. Collective Labour Relations	119
CHAPTER I. TRADE UNIONS AND THEIR ORGANIZATIONS	119
§1. Trade Union Membership and Characteristics	119
A. Size and Number of Trade Unions	119
B. Internationalism and Nationalism	123
§2. The Canadian Labour Congress	124
§3. Legal Status of Trade Unions	127
A. At Common Law	127
B. Under Collective Bargaining	129

C. Representative Actions	131
D. Legal Status and Democratic Rule in Trade Unions	132
1. The Need for Democracy and the Conceptual	
Difficulty	132
2. The Local-Parent Relationship	132
3. The Right to Belong to a Trade Union	134
4. The Right to Remain in a Trade Union	135
Judges as Contract Interpreters	136
Requirement of Good Faith	136
Natural Justice	137
Status as a Tool	138
5. Fair Representation	138
a. Common Law	139
Bargaining	139
Grievance Process	140
b. Statute	140
Discrimination and Bad Faith	141
Arbitrariness	141
Procedure	141
Remedies	142
c. Natural Justice Again	142
CHAPTER II. THE RIGHT TO ORGANIZE §1. The Need for Statutory Protection §2. Protection of the Rights of Individual Employees §3. Protection of Trade Union Rights §4. Reconciling Employee, Employer and Trade Union Rights	144 144 146 147 149
§5. Remedies	151
A. Representation Proceedings	151
B. Administrative Sanctions	152
C. Criminal Prosecution	154
D. Other Remedies	155
E. Self-Help	155
,	
CHAPTER III. LEGAL RECOGNITION OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING RIGHTS	156
§1. The Source of Collective Bargaining Rights	156
§2. Acquisition of Collective Bargaining Rights	156
A. Eligible Employees	156
1. Dependent Contractors	157
2. Managerial Employees	158
3. Confidential Employees	159
4. Public Employees	160
5. Professional Employees	160
6. Students	161
7. Other Exclusions	161

B. Eligible Trade Unions	162
1. Arm's Length Relationship	162
2. Collective Bargaining Purpose	163
3. Formal Structure	164
4. Restrictions on Membership	164
5. Discrimination	166
6. Presence within jurisdiction	167
7. Councils of Trade Unions	167
C. Method of Acquisition	167
1. Degree of Formality	168
2. Proof of Representativeness	169
a. Membership Evidence	169
b. Petitions	169
c. Votes	170
d. Proof of Representativeness Impaired by Employer	
Action	171
3. Timeliness of Application	171
4. Others Bars to Certification Applications	172
5. The Fluctuating Work Force	172
§3. The Shape of the Collective Bargaining Structure	172
A. The Collective Bargaining Constituency	173
1. Ability to Organize	174
2. Viability of Bargaining Structure	174
3. Craft Bargaining Units	175
4. Agreed-Upon Bargaining Units	176
5. Geographic Proximity	177
6. Plant and Office Bargaining Units	177
7. Part-Time Employees and Students	177
8. Professional Employees	178
9. Supervisory Employees	178
10. Dependent Contractors	178
11. Security Guards	179
B. Defining the Employer	179
1. Identifying the Employer	179
2. Related Employers	180
3. Sale or Transfer of Business	181 181
a. The Ingredients of a Sale or Transfer b. Problems of Proof	182
c. Intermingling of Employees	182
d. Redefinition of Bargaining Rights	182
e. Change in Character of Business	183
4. Multi-Employer Bargaining	183
§4. Transfer and Termination of Bargaining Rights	184
A. Transfer of Bargaining Rights	184
B. Termination of Bargaining Rights	184
1. Decertification	185
2. Displacement	185

3. Union Inactivity	186
a. Statutory Provisions	186
b. Abandonment	186
4. Fraud	187
CHAPTER IV. THE COLLECTIVE BARGAINING PROCESS	187
§1. The Union's Exclusive Authority to Bargain	188
A. Exclusion of Individual Bargains	188
B. Prohibition Against Bargaining Collectively with Others	189
C. The Right to Bargain for Union Security Provisions	189
§2. The Statutory Freeze	190
§3. Dispute Settlement Procedures	191
A. Conciliation	192
1. The Conciliation Board	192
2. The Conciliation Officer	193
B. Strike Votes	194
C. Arbitration	194
1. Voluntary Arbitration	195
2. First-Agreement Arbitration	196
3. Ad Hoc Intervention	197
§4. Conduct of Negotiations	197
A. Commencement of Bargaining	197
1. Notice to Bargain	198
2. Wage Re-Openers	199
3. Bargaining Over Technological Change	199
4. Bargaining Over Wage Rollbacks	200
B. The Duty to Bargain in Good Faith	200
1. Duty to meet	201 202
2. Circumvention of Bargaining Agent	
3. Requirement of Full Discussion	203
4. Duty to Supply Information	203
5. Untimely Use of Economic Sanctions	204
6. Duty to Complete the Negotiations	204 204
7. Supervision of the Content of Bargaining	204
8. Compulsory Provisions 9. Duration of the Duty to Person in Good Faith	206
 Duration of the Duty to Bargain in Good Faith Remedies 	207
CHAPTER V. INDUSTRIAL CONFLICT	207
§1. The Role of Conflict in the Canadian System of Industrial	20-
Relations	207
§2. Forms of Conflict	210
A. The Strike	210
B. The Lock-Out	212
C. Picketing	212
D. Boycott	213

§3.	Lawful Economic Sanctions	214
Ü	A. The Right to Strike	214
	B. The Effect of a Lawful Strike on Employment Status and	
	Benefits	215
	1. Employment Status	215
	2. The Right to Hire Replacements	215
	3. The Striker's Right to His Job	216
	4. Employment Benefits During Strikes	217
	5. Employee Obligations During a Strike	218
	6. The Duration of the Employment Relationship	219
	C. Ancillary Tactics in Support of Lawful Strikes	220
	1. The Legal Rules Governing Picketing	220
	2. Timeliness	222
	3. Behaviour on the Picket Line	222
	a. Personal Security	223
	b. Property Rights	223
	c. Reputation	224
	d. Picketing as the Exercise of Fundamental Civil	224
	Liberties	224
	4. The Scope of Ancillary Activities: Secondary Pressure	225
	a. Definition	225
	b. The Legality of Secondary Picketing and Boycotts	226
	c. Problems of Characterization: Primary versus	220
	Secondary	227
84	Unlawful Industrial Action	228
8	A. Generally	228
	B. Strikes for Union Bargaining Rights	229
	C. Industrial Action During a Collective Agreement	230
	D. Industrial Action for Improper Purposes	232
	E. Compliance with Notice and Strike Vote Procedure	233
	F. Boycotts	234
85	Remedies for Unlawful Industrial Action	234
85.	A. Employer Self-Help	234
	B. Administrative Remedies	235
	1. Declaration	235
	2. Investigation and Settlement	235
	3. Cease and Desist Orders	236
	C. Criminal and Quasi-Criminal Sanctions	236
	1. Criminal Code	236
	2. Labour Relations Acts	236
	D. Civil Remedies	237
	1. General	237
	2. Problems of Suing Unions	238
	a. Union Responsibilityb. The Juridical Status of Unions	238
	3. Common Law Actions to Enforce Collective	238
	Agreements	230
	AVICENIENIS	/ 14

4. Damages	240
a. Compensatory Damages	240
b. Punitive or Exemplary Damages	240
c. Mitigation or Diminution of Damages	241
d. Extended Liability	241
5. Injunctions	241
a. General	241
b. Procedural Problems	242
c. The Scope of Injunctions: Conduct and Persons	243
d. Enforcement	245
e. Law Reform	245
E. Arbitration	246
CHAPTER VI. COLLECTIVE AGREEMENTS	247
§1. The Collective Agreement	247
A. Legal Requirements	247
B. Unique Legal Effect	248
1. Contractual Effect	248
2. Normative Effect	250
3. Exclusion of Common Law Principles	250
4. Limited Standing in the Courts to Enforce the Collective	
Agreement	251
5. Potential Legal Vacuum Upon Expiry of the Collective	
Agreement	251
6. Status of the Collective Agreement in the Courts	252
a. Standing of Trade Unions in the Courts	252
b. Unenforceability of the Collective Agreement at	
Common Law	253
§2. Administration and Enforcement of the Collective Agreement	254
A. Grievance Procedures	254
B. Grievance Arbitration	255
1. Nature of the Process	255
a. Constitution of the Arbitration Tribunal	256
b. Costs of Proceedings	256
c. Openness to Public	256
d. The Problem of Bias	257
e. Conduct of Hearings	257
f. Sources of Arbitral Standards	258
g. Remedial Authority	260
2. Arbitrability of Grievances	262
a. Submission to Arbitration	263
b. Carriage of the Grievance	263
c. Timeliness	264
d. Settlement, Withdrawal and Abandonment	265
3. Discharge and Discipline	265
a. Resignation	266

b. Retirement	266
c. Probationary Employees	267
d. Loss of Seniority	267
e. Demotions	268
f. Onus and Standard of Proof	268
g. Alteration of Grounds	269
h. Culminating Incident	269
i. Insubordination	269
j. Misconduct outside the Work Place	270
k. The Appropriate Penalty	271
4. Seniority	271
a. Types of Seniority Provisions	271
b. Scope of Arbitral Review	272
c. Job Posting	273
5. Assignment of Work	273
a. Bargaining Unit Work	273
b. Classification Structure	274
c. Overtime	274
6. Monetary Grievances	275
7. Union Rights and Liabilities Under the Collective	
Agreement	275
a. Enforcement of Union Security Provisions	275
b. Special Position of Union Officials	276
c. Union Obligations	277
d. Obligations of Union Officials	277
§3. The Limited Role of the Courts	278
A. Judicial Review	278
B. Enforcement of Arbitration Awards	279
§4. The Expanding Role of Labour Boards	279
A. Direct Jurisdiction	280
B. Review Jurisdiction	280
C. Concurrent Jurisdiction	281
Index	283

Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada

by Prof. H. W. Arthurs Prof. D. D. Carter Prof. H. J. Glasbeek

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International Encyclopaedia for Labour Law and Industrial Relations

1981

KLUWER DEVENTER/BOSTON/LONDON/FRANKFURT/ ANTWERP

BUTTERWORTHS TORONTO/VANCOUVER/LONDON/SEATTLE Distribution in Canada and the USA

Butterworths and Co. Ltd. 2265 Midland Avenue Scarborough, Ontario Canada M1P 4S1

Cover design: Pieter J. van der Sman

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Arthurs, Harry W. 1933-

Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada

Originally published as a monograph in the International Encyclopaedia for Labour Law and Industrial Relations.

Bibliography: p.

- 1. Labor laws and legislation Canada.
- 2. Industrial relations Canada. I. Carter, D. D., joint author. II. Glasbeek, H. J., joint author. III. Title.

KE3109.A76 344.71'01 80-22468

ISBN 90 312 0139 1 (Kluwer) 0-409-81184-X (Butterworths)

D/1981/2664/15

© 1981, Kluwer, Deventer, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the written permission of the publisher.

Foreword

This text is one of a collection of national monographs which have appeared under the aegis of the International Encyclopaedia for Labour Law and Industrial Relations. The Encyclopaedia, taken as a whole, will provide intellectual stimulus and a wealth of detailed information for scholars and practitioners seeking a comparative and transnational perspective on problems of labour law and industrial relations. However, it is a reference publication, rather than one which is likely to be within easy reach of those who seek knowledge about their own domestic system.

Because no broad, up-to-date general survey of Canadian labour law presently exists the authors, with the co-operation of the editor-in-chief, Professor R. Blanpain, and the publisher, Messrs. Kluwer, have decided to make this Canadian monograph available as a separate volume. We hope that it will provide advocates and administrators, management and labour, and especially students, with an overview of all aspects of Canadian labour law, and, to some extent, of its social, economic and political context.

At the same time, we urge readers to regard this work as the starting point for their reading, rather than as a final destination. The law of labour is becoming, for better or worse, infinitely and regressively complex. We do not claim that we have been able to reproduce each detail of the law as it stood at the moment we laid down our pens (roughly August, 1979) let alone to foretell subsequent developments with infallible accuracy.

H. W. Arthurs D. D. Carter H. J. Glasbeek