MONEY, MEASUREMENT AND COMPUTATION



Michael T. Belongia and Jane M. Binner



Money, Measurement and Computation

Edited by

Michael T. Belongia

and

Jane M. Binner





@ Selection and editorial matter @ Michael T. Belongia and Jane M. Binner 2006 Individual chapters @ contributors 2006

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 4LP.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published in 2006 by PALGRAVE MACMILLAN Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010 Companies and representatives throughout the world.

PALGRAVE MACMILLAN is the global academic imprint of the Palgrave Macmillan division of St. Martin's Press, LLC and of Palgrave Macmillan Ltd. Macmillan is a registered trademark in the United States, United Kingdom and other countries. Palgrave is a registered trademark in the European Union and other countries.

ISBN 13: 978-1-4039-4793-2 ISBN 10: 1-4039-4793-7

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Money, measurement and computation / edited by Michael T. Belongia and Jane M. Binner.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-4039-4793-7 (cloth)

1. Money supply – Mathematical models. I. Belongia, Michael T. II. Binner, Jane M., 1961–

HG226.3.M646 2005 332. 4'14—dc22

2004060628

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 15 14 13 12 11 10 09 08 07 06

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Antony Rowe Ltd, Chippenham and Eastbourne

Notes on the Contributors

William A. Barnett is the originator of Divisia monetary aggregates. He derived the formula for the monetary services' user cost, which he used in establishing the relevancy of aggregation and index number theory to monetary economics. He is editor of the Cambridge University Press journal *Macroeconomic Dynamics* and the Cambridge University Press monograph series International Symposia in Economic Theory and Econometrics. He is a fellow of the American Statistical Association and a fellow of the World Innovation Foundation.

Michael T. Belongia is Otho Smith Professor of Economics and Finance at the University of Mississippi. Prior to this appointment he served as economist and economic adviser at the Federal Reserve Bank of St Louis. Other experiences include service as a visiting scholar in the Research Department in the Swiss National Bank in Zurich and as a consultant to the Austrian National Bank in Vienna and National Commerce Bank Corporation in Memphis.

Jane M. Binner is Reader in Economics at Aston Business School, Birmingham, UK. Previous positions include Senior Lecturer in Finance at the Nottingham Business School and Lecturer in Statistics at the University of Derby. Her research interests primarily include the construction and interpretation of Divisia monetary aggregates and the application of artificial intelligence techniques in business and economics.

John Conlon is Associate Professor at the University of Mississippi. He has published in *Econometrica*, the *Journal of Economic Theory* and the *International Economic Review*, among other journals.

W. Erwin Diewert is Professor of Economics at the University of British Columbia. He has published over 70 papers in journals and over 70 chapters in books. His main areas of research include duality theory, flexible functional forms, index number theory (including the concept of a superlative index number formula), the measurement of productivity and the calculation of excess burdens of taxation. He has acted as a consultant on measurement and regulatory issues for the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank, the US Bureau of Labor Statistics, the Bureau of Economic Analysis, the OECD, the New Zealand Treasury, the Business Roundtable in New Zealand,

Bell Canada, B. C. Telephone, the American Association of Railways, the Victorian Treasury and Industry Canada.

Kieran P. Donaghy is an Associate Professor in Urban and Regional Planning at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, a Senior Research Scientist at the National Center for Supercomputing Applications, and the Director of the University's European Union Center. His recent research has been concerned with regional impacts of climate change and econometric estimation of continuous-time models, including models of intertemporally and interspatially optimizing agents.

Robert E. Dorsey is a founder and Chief Operating Officer of FNC Inc. a company that provides data, analytics and operations software to the mortgage industry. He was previously Associate Professor of Economics at the University of Mississippi, where his research focused on experimental economics, optimization and non-linear modeling.

Thomas C. Elger is currently working on improving non-parametric weak separability tests. This project is funded by the Jan Wallander and Tom Hedelius foundation. Dr Elger has published several empirical papers focused on better measurement and computation in journals such as Advances in Econometrics, Applied Economics, the Journal of Banking and Finance and Topics in Macroeconomics.

Dennis Fixler is Chief Statistician of the US Bureau of Economic Analysis and is primarily responsible for statistical quality including source data, methods and leading selected research efforts. Prior to joining BEA in June 2001, Dr Fixler was at the Bureau of Labor Statistics, most recently serving as Chief of the Division of Price and Index Number Research, which was the position he held at the time of writing this article. Previous positions were at the Federal Trade Commission and the University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee. He has written articles on index number theory and construction, with particular attention to the development and implementation of service price indexes, and articles on other economic measurement issues.

Melvin J. Hinich is a Research Scientist at the Applied Research Laboratories of the University of Texas at Austin. He began his academic career with the Graduate School of Industrial Administration at Carnegie Institute of Technology in 1963. He has published papers in at least four fields: statistics, signal processing, economics and political science. One of his PhD students, Lawrence Cahoon, developed a metric multidimensional scaling methodology and this methodology was further developed by Hinich over many years and is now called the Cahoon-Hinich MAP method. He is a fellow of the Institute of Mathematical Statistics, the American Statistical Association and the Public Choice Society.

Barry E. Jones is Assistant Professor in the Department of Economics at the State University of New York at Binghamton. He has been a visiting scholar at the Federal Reserve Bank of St Louis. His research focus is in monetary economics.

Milka Kirova is an economist with the Economic Research and Consulting unit of Swiss Re in New York. She received a Ph.D. in economics from Washington University in St Louis in 1996.

Lisbeth la Cour is Assistant Professor in the Copenhagen Business School Department of Economics. Her teaching interests are within macroeconomics and applied econometrics. Her research interests are within the fields of monetary aggregation and money demand, within high frequency data in finance and in applied econometrics more generally. Using multivariate cointegration techniques she has published papers within applied exchange rates theory (with Professor Ronald MacDonald, Strathclyde University. Glasgow) and applied industrial economics (with Professor H.P. Moelgaard, Copenhagen Business School). She has published papers in Econometric Theory, Journal of Business and Economic Statistics, Neural Network World and the European Journal of Law and Economics.

Walter Mayer works at the University of Mississippi. His research covers topics in applied and theoretical econometrics, including semi-parametric methods for disequilibrium models and binary choice panel data models with sample selection, and applications of genetic algorithms. He has published in Journal of Econometrics, Journal of Business and Economic Statistics, Journal of Forecasting, Economics Letters and Computational Economics.

Travis D. Nesmith is an economist at the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System. Prior to coming to the Board in 1999, he spent a year at the Bureau of Labor Statistics and was a visiting scholar at the Federal Reserve Bank of St Louis for three years. Along with R.G. Anderson and B.E. Jones, he constructed the US Monetary Services Indexes maintained by FRB St Louis and continues to serve on their MSI Advisory Panel. He has been a member of several international central bank workgroups under the auspices of the G-10's Committee on Payment and Settlement Systems. His published and continuing research focuses on monetary and payments related topics in economics and finance, dynamic modelling, and nonlinear time series analysis.

Meenakshi Pasupathy is Assistant Professor in the Department of Economics and Finance at Baruch College of the City University of New York. She received her PhD in Economics from Washington University in St Louis in 1996.

Douglas M. Patterson is Professor in the Department of Finance at Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University. He has also held a faculty position at the Graduate School of Business, University of Michigan. His research interests focus on theoretical and empirical aspects of the dynamic behaviour of the capital markets, and on nonlinear time series detection methods.

Denis M. Richard is an economist and development expert with extensive research and policy experience in international organizations, including the International Monetary Fund at the World Bank, Mr. Richard has also held chief economist positions with the Italian and French Treasuries and lectureships with LUISS in Rome and the Ecole Nationale Administration in Paris.

Saranna R. Thornton is Associate Professor in the Economics Department at Hampden-Sydney College in Virginia. Her research interests are predominantly in the fields of monetary economics and employment discrimination. She is a member of the American Association of University Professors' Committee on the Economic Status of the Profession

T.J. Wales is Professor Emeritus of Economics at the University of British Columbia. He has published extensively in journals and books. His research interests are primarily in the areas of applied consumer and producer demand analysis. In particular they focus on the myriad of econometric issues that arise in applying the appropriate standard economic theory to the data, including the introduction of demographics, use of flexible functional forms and the imposition of curvature conditions required by the theory.

Norman K. Womer serves as Dean of the College of Business Administration and Professor of Logistics and Operations Management at the University of Missouri-St Louis. He has previously served as Director of the Hearin Center for Enterprise Science and in other administrative positions at the University of Mississippi. Prior to that time he was Professor of Economics and Professor of Management at Clemson University. He has also served on the faculty of the Air Force Institute of Technology and the Naval Postgraduate School. Dr Womer has also served as a visiting faculty member at East China Textile University and at the University of Torino. He has been principal investigator for several research projects funded by the Office of Naval Research. Dr Womer has written extensively in the area of cost estimation and project management in the public sector. His book The Economics of Made-to-Order Production: Theory with Applications Related to the Airframe Industry, coauthored with Thomas Gulledge, summarizes early work in this area. He is editor of the INFORMS book series Topics in Operations Research and Associate Editor of Military Operations Research.

Kim Zieschang is Chief of the Data Dissemination Standards Division of the International Monetary Fund's Statistics Department. He was a Senior Economist of the Statistics Department's Real Sector Division when this paper was presented. Prior positions include Associate Commissioner for Compensation and Working Conditions, and Chief, Division of Price and Index Number Research at the Bureau of Labor Statistics. His research interests are financial services price and volume measurement, international trade price and volume measurement, international and interarea price and volume comparisons, measuring quality change, product coding standards, and modelling statistical metadata.

Contents

List	of Figures	vii
List	of Tables	ix
Note	es on the Contributors	хi
	oduction e M. Binner and Thomas C. Elger	1
Par	rt I Models of the Supply and Demand for Monetary Assets in the USA	
1	The Nonlinear Skeletons in the Closet William A. Barnett, Barry E. Jones, Milka Kirova, Travis D. Nesmith and Meenakshi Pasupathy	9
2	A Flexible Generalization of the CES Functional Form, with Applications to Monetary Data and a Test for Separability <i>John R. Conlon, Robert E. Dorsey and Norman K. Womer</i>	43
Par	rt II New Approaches to Hypothesis Testing and Data Analysis	
3	Detecting Epochs of Transient Dependence in White Noise Melvin J. Hinich and Douglas M. Patterson	61
4	Estimating a Regular Continuous-Time System of Demand for World Monies with Divisia Data Kieran P. Donaghy and Denis M. Richard	76
5	A 'New' Approach to the Smoothing Problem W.E. Diewert and T.J. Wales	104
6	Tests for a Global Maximum Robert E. Dorsey and Walter J. Mayer	145
7	Economic Statistics and the Transmission of Monetary Policy to the Real Economy Dennis Fixler and Kim Zieschang	156

Part III Index Numbers for the Financial Sector

8	The Problem of Measuring 'Money': Results from an Analysis of Divisia Monetary Aggregates for Denmark Lisbeth F. la Cour	185
9	Simple-Sum versus Divisia Measures of Money as Policy Instruments in an Adaptive Monetary Rule Saranna R. Thornton	211
10	The Neglected Price Dual of Monetary Quantity Aggregates Michael T. Belongia	239
Inde	ex	255

List of Figures

2.1	first quarter, 1982	51
2.2	Predicted versus actual shares to demand deposits, quarterly	0.1
<i>L.L</i>	since first quarter, 1982	52
2.3	Predicted versus actual shares to savings deposits, quarterly	
,	since first quarter, 1982	52
3.1(a)	Time series plot of the probability level of the test statistics	
	of each window for Coca-Cola during 1983: C statistic	69
3.1(b)	Time series plot of the probability level of the test statistics	
(-)	of each window for Coca-Cola during 1983: H statistic	69
3.2	Plot of the sum of the absolute values of $z(k-1)z(k-2)$,	
	z(k-1)z(k-3), $z(k-1)z(k-4)$, $z(k-2)z(k-3)$, $z(k-2)z(k-4)$,	
	and $z(k-3)z(k-4)$, versus $z(k)$ over three consecutive days	
	where the H statistic was significant: McDonald's Corp.,	
	Thursday, Friday, and Monday, March 27, 28, 31, 1980	70
3.3	A second plot of the sum of absolute values of lagged cross	
	products of $z(k)$ versus $z(k)$ when the H statistic is not	
	significant: McDonald's Corp., Monday, Tuesday, and	
	Wednesday, March 10, 11, and 12, 1980	71
3.4(a)	Time series plot of the probability level of the test statistics	
` ,	of each window using the binary data: shown is Coca-Cola	
	for 1983: C statistic	73
3.4(b)	Time series plot of the probability level of the test statistics	
	of each window using the binary data: shown is Coca-Cola	
	for 1983: H statistic	73
4.1	Observed vs. estimated shares	88
4.2	Expenditure elasticity of demand	92
4.3	Own price elasticity of demand	93
4.4	Cross price elasticity of demand	94
4.5	Own elasticity of substitution	95
4.6(a)	Cross elasticity of substitution	96
4.6(b)	Cross elasticity of substitution	97
4.7	World Divisia aggregate of broad monies	98
5.1	Predicted (dashed) and actual (solid) mortality rates	
	(predicted based on no break points)	122
5.2	Predicted (dashed) and actual (solid) mortality rates	
	(predicted based on four break points)	124

viii List of Figures

5.3	Means of smoothed (solid) and unsmoothed (dashed) data	
	(with no endpoint corrections)	126
5.4	Means of smoothed (solid) and unsmoothed (dashed) data	
	(with three endpoint corrections)	126
5.5	Underlying nonstochastic function (dashed) and means of	
	smoothed data (solid)	127
5.6	Means of smoothed data and two standard deviations on	
	either side of the means	128
6.1	Objective function as β varies	151
6.2	Error surface for $T = 1000$	152
6.3	Error surface for $T = 100$	153
7.1	Comparison of BEA imputation of interest received with	
	rough SNA93 FISIM	172
7.2	Percentage change in gross output index for financial services	173
7.3	Financial service quantity index weights	174
7.4	Monetary policy and relative change in asset component	
	of output	175
7.5	Boschen–Mills monetary policy indicator (-2 means that	
	monetary policy strongly emphasized reducing inflation;	
	2 indicates policy strongly emphasized growth)	175
8.1	Danish monetary aggregates	188
8.A1	The data	204
8.A2	Divisia-M2 equation	205
8.A3	Sum-M2 equation	206
9.1	GDP growth path: simple-sum M2 rule in a	
	Four-variable VAR	223
9.2	GDP growth path: Divisia M2 in a Four-variable VAR	223
9.3	GDP growth path: monetary base in a Four-variable VAR	224
9.4	GDP growth path: a Divisia M2 rule that targets GDP	
	growth rates (Four-variable VAR)	228
10.1(a		242
10.1(b	•	242
10.2(a		
	monetary quantity aggregate (data are growth rates)	245
10.2(b) Difference between Divisia and simple-sum price duals	245

List of Tables

3.1	Estimated 5% and 1% sizes of the C and H statistics from 6000	
	replications of gaussian, exponential, and uniform innovations	64
3.2	Estimated power of the <i>H</i> statistic from 1000 replications of the	
	nonlinear AR model $x(k) = ax(k-2)x(k-1) + \epsilon(k)$ using	
	gaussian, exponential, and uniform $\{ \in (k) \}$, and three values of	
	the scale coefficient, a	65
3.3	Summary statistics of the eight stocks	66
3.4	Correlations of statistics for significant windows using a	
	threshold of 0.1%	67
3.5	Estimated 5% and 1% sizes of the C and H statistics from 6000	
	replications of binary GARCH(1,1) variates	72
3.6	Number of significant windows for the eight binary series at	
	0.1% level	72
4.1	Estimates of structural parameters	89
4.2	Estimates of disequilibrium adjustment parameters	90
4.3	Mean estimated elasticities of demand and substitution	91
5.1	US mortality rates, 1979–81	121
5.2	Goodness-of-fit statistics for US mortality data	123
5.3	Runs statistics for US mortality data	124
5.4	Monte Carlo results	129
6.1	Mean value of objective function (single-dimension problem)	151
6.2	Rejections of the candidate solution by three tests	151
6.3	Mean values of objective function for local solutions for	
	two-dimensional problem	153
6.4	Rejections of candidate solutions by three tests	154
7.1	Asset liability items in US banking data	158
7.2	Financial services quantity and price indexes	170
8.1	Deciding on the cointegration rank	196
8.2	Results of hypothesis H_{42}^0	198
8.3	Results of hypothesis $H_{4,3}^{0}$	199
8.4	The residual correlation matrix	200
8.A1	Univariate statistics	207

x List of Tables

9.1	Statistical summaries of the money control error vectors	
	(measurements in quarterly logarithmic units)	220
9.2	Correlation coefficients: GDP shocks and money control errors	220
9.3	GDP RMSEs (λ 0.25 and 4-year moving average	
	velocity growth rate)	221
9.4	Mean absolute per cent change in money and real GDP:	
	1964:Q2–1997:Q4 (annualized rates of change)	227
9.5	GDP simulations with rules that incorporate data revision	
	problems	230
10.1	Estimates of a money demand function (the US)	247
10.2	Significance levels for <i>F</i> -statistics from bi-variate causality tests	249

Introduction

Jane M. Binner and Thomas C. Elger

The present book is a collection of papers by leading applied and theoretical micro-economists, macro-economists and econometricians from a variety of institutions and universities. A common feature of the papers included in this book is that they all have better measurement or computation as their central theme. A majority of the contributions are based on a framework for monetary aggregation pioneered by Barnett (1978, 1980).

Several surveys of the theory of monetary aggregation exist. See, for example, Anderson *et al.* (1997a,b,c), Barnett *et al.* (1992) and Fisher *et al.* (1993). Some of the most important papers in this field can be found in Barnett and Serletis (eds), *The Theory of Monetary Aggregation*. Serletis (2001) provides a textbook treatment of the theory.

We begin exploring issues related to money, measurement and computation by introducing some of the more central concepts in monetary aggregation theory. Readers familiar with the topic may safely skip ahead. Readers desiring a more in-depth knowledge about the field should definitely consult the sources mentioned above.

Monetary aggregation theory

Monetary aggregation theory is founded on microeconomic aggregation theory and index number theory. Empirical studies are often based on data that has been aggregated across consumers. Assume that there are n+l=h arguments in a (representative) consumer's utility function u that can be partitioned into $\mathbf{x}_t = (\mathbf{m}_t, \mathbf{c}_t)$, where $\mathbf{m}_t = (\mathbf{m}_{1t}, \ldots, \mathbf{m}_{nt})$ and $\mathbf{c}_t = (\mathbf{c}_{1t}, \ldots, \mathbf{c}_{lt})$. The fundamental existence condition for an economic aggregate over the goods in \mathbf{m}_t is that the consumer's preferences are weakly separable such that we can write u in this following weakly separable form:

$$u(\mathbf{x}_t) \equiv u_1(\mu(\mathbf{m}_t), \mathbf{c}_t) \tag{1}$$

where u is a category sub-utility function. Weak separability implies that the marginal rates of substitution between goods inside u are independent of changes in quantities in goods outside μ . Under weak separability, it is possible to consider the consumer's allocation problem over goods in u alone. i.e. it is possible to only consider the problem: max $\mu(\mathbf{m}_t)$ subject to a budget constraint. We let m_i^* denote the quantities that solve the consumer's constrained maximization problem. If μ is homothetic, then $M_t^A = \mu(m_t^*)$ is an economic quantity aggregate, which behaves as if it were the quantity of an elementary good. If u is not homothetic, then the quantity aggregate is the distance function. In both cases, the correct dual price aggregate is given by the expenditure function.² One question that arises at this point is whether it is possible, assuming separability and homotheticity, to determine a value for M^A given only data on quantities and prices. The answer to this question is yes – in theory. The sub-utility (aggregator) function can indeed be tracked without error by the Divisia index. This index is defined (in log change form) as $d \ln(M_t^A) = \sum_n \varsigma_{it} d \ln(m_{it}^*)$, where ς_{it} is the expenditure share of good i at time t. Real world data is, however, only observed at discrete points in time. This means that the researcher observes Δm and not dm and, therefore, must choose some method to approximate M^A . Two main routes are available:

- 1. Specify a particular functional form for μ , derive demand functions, estimate and restore M^A . This route suffers from two main deficiencies. Firstly, the resulting M^A will depend on what functional form is used. Secondly, the choice of estimation method will affect M^A .
- 2. Approximate M^A using index numbers. Index numbers are parameter and estimation free in the sense that they only require knowledge about prices and quantities. Diewert (1976) denotes index numbers that are consistent with specific functional forms exact. A class of exact index numbers, termed superlative by Diewert, are exact for a flexible functional form. A flexible functional form provides a second-order approximation to any unknown functional form of μ .

Now consider the case when the *m*-goods are monetary assets optimally chosen by a consumer. Under the assumption that these assets form a homothetic weakly separable group, the stage is completely set for the construction of an aggregate monetary services good based on index numbers.

Barnett (1978) derives an expression for calculating discrete time user costs for monetary assets under the assumption that all interest rates paid on monetary asset holdings at the end of each period t are known with certainty at the beginning of each period, and Barnett (1980) demonstrates how aggregate monetary series indices (MSIs) can be constructed using superlative index numbers. More formally, let:

$$\pi_{it} = \frac{R_t - r_{it}}{1 + R_t} \tag{2}$$

be the period t discrete time real user cost associated with the nominal monetary asset i. 3 R_t is the period t nominal benchmark rate and r_{it} is the own rate of monetary asset i for period t. The benchmark rate is the rate of the return on an asset that provides no monetary services whatsoever. It is held solely for the purpose of transferring wealth intertemporally. The own-rate, assumed known at the *beginning* of period t, fully captures the investment services provided by a specific monetary asset. The user cost may subsequently be viewed as the (discounted) opportunity cost for holding a pound's worth of a monetary asset. Diewert (2000) discusses user costs for monetary assets and how they relate to rental prices commonly calculated for other types of durable goods. He notes that statistical agencies generally are opposed to constructing rental prices/user costs for durable goods. The reason is that they are not objective or reproducible in the sense that the resulting prices will depend on choices of interest rates, etc. He notes, however, that common problems associated with calculating depreciation rates for durable goods, such as accounting for wear and tear, are not relevant for monetary assets.

Given user costs, we are ready to construct an aggregate nominal monetary services index. For this purpose, Barnett (1980) advocates using a chained Törnqvist Theil discrete time approximation of the Divisia index. This index is superlative and has a functional form that is easy to interpret. The latter becomes particularly evident when considering the index in log-change form. Define period t total expenditure on monetary services as $Y_t = \sum_n \pi_{it} m_{it}^*$ and define the period t expenditure share for monetary asset i as $\varsigma_{it} = \pi_{it} m_{it}^* / Y_t$. Average expenditure shares for monetary assets are given by $\zeta a_{it} = [\zeta_{it} + \zeta_{it-1}]/2$. The Törnqvist Theil discrete time monetary services index (M_t^T) is, in log change form, defined as:

$$\Delta \ln(M_t^T) = \sum_{n} \varsigma a_{it} \Delta \ln(m_{it}^*)$$
 (3)

As is evident in (3), the growth-rate of the index is simply a weighted sum of growth rates of the components of the index. Having obtained the aggregate nominal quantity index M_t^T , we can also calculate a real user cost index, P_t^D that is dual to the quantity index in the sense that:

$$P_t^D = \frac{Y_t}{M_t^T} \tag{4}$$

Key findings and implications

Some of the chapters in this book address the problems associated with measuring money, and point, in particular, to the advantages of the Divisia index. The Divisia index is found to be more stable than the simple sum alternative and bears more ready economic interpretation. In the final chapter, for example, Belongia illustrates how Diewert's (1976, 1978) work on aggregation permits direct measurement of the own-price of