The International Tax Law Concept of Dividend

Series on International Taxation





Published by: Kluwer Law International PO Box 316 2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn The Netherlands Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:
Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by: Turpin Distribution Services Ltd. Stratton Business Park Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ United Kingdom Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-3206-2

© 2010 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed in Great Britain.

Preface

My doctoral thesis The Dividend Concept in International Tax Law – Dividend Payments between Corporate Entities, was published by Kluwer in 1999. In 2000, the book was awarded the International Fiscal Association Mitchell B. Carrol Price. Almost a decade later, the publisher contacted me with an interesting proposal. Kluwer wanted to publish a second updated edition of my doctoral thesis, which they considered to have become a classic. My first reaction to the publisher's idea was somewhat suspicious because I had never heard about a second edition of a doctoral thesis. After some consultation with Kluwer, I however agreed to publish a second book on the international tax law concept of dividend with Kluwer. In order to make a clear difference between the original doctoral thesis and the new book on the dividend concept, however, I decided not to publish the new book as a second revised edition of the original, but as a separate work with a slightly different title and somewhat different scope.

This second book *The International Tax Law Concept of Dividend* follows the structure and rough outline of the original doctoral thesis. The country specific parts of the book, however, have been replaced with more general parts providing examples of the different domestic law approaches. The core of the new book is in the EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive concept of profit distribution and in the model tax convention concept of dividend. Besides updating the references to the relevant provisions, relevant new case law and new literature have also been considered in this second book.

Marjaana Helminen Helsinki, March 2010

List of Abbreviations

AB Aktiebolag (limited company, Sweden)

ABL Aktiebolagslag (Act on Limited Companies, Sweden)
AG Aktiengesellschaft (public limited company, Germany)
AktG Aktiengesetz (Act on Public Limited Companies,

Germany)

AO Abgabenordnung (Fiscal Code, Germany)

AStG Aussensteuergesetz, Gesetz über die Besteuerung bei

Auslandsbeziehungen (International Tax Act, Germany) Lag om avräkning av utländsk skatt (Act on Foreign Tax

Credit, Sweden)

BFH Bundesfinanzhof (Federal Fiscal Court, Germany)
BGB Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch (Civil Code, Germany)
BMF Bundesministerium der Finanzen (The Ministry of

Finance, Germany)

BStBl Bundessteuerblatt (Official Tax Gazette - laws, cases,

etc., Germany)

CFC Controlled foreign corporation

EC European Community

Avrl.

EC Treaty The Treaty establishing the European Community (the

name of the treaty was changed to The Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union by the Treaty of Lisbon, which was signed on 13.12.2007 and which

entered into force on 1.12.2009)

EEA European Economic Area

EFL Lag om ekonomiska föreningar (Act on Economic

Associations, Sweden)

EFTA European Free Trade Association

List of Abbreviations

EStG Einkommensteuergesetz (Income Tax Act, Germany)

EU European Union

The Court of Justice of the European Union EU Court

EVL Laki elinkeinotulon verottamisesta (Business Income

Tax Act, Finland)

Gesellschaft mit beschränkter Haftung (Limited liability **GmbH**

company, Germany)

Gesetz betreffende die Gesellschaften mit beschränkter **GmbHG**

Haftung (Act on Limited Liability Companies, Germany)

HBI. Lagen om handelsbolaglag och enkla bolag (Act on

Partnerships, Sweden)

HE Hallituksen esitys (Government Bill, Finland) Handelsgesetzbuch (Commercial Code, Germany) HGB International Bureau of Fiscal Documentation **IBFD**

IFA International Fiscal Association

Interest-Royalty Council Directive 2003/49/EC of 3 June 2003 on a Directive Common System of Taxation Applicable to Interest and

Royalty Payments Made between Associated Companies

of Different Member States.

IRC Internal Revenue Code (the US) IRS Internal Revenue Service (the US)

KapErhStG Gesetz über steuerliche Massnahmen bei Erhöhung des

Nennkapitals aus Gesellschaftsmitteln und bei Überlassung von eigen Aktien an Arbeitnehmer, Kapitalerhöhungsteuergesetz (Act on Tax Measures in Connection with Increases in Nominal Capital out of Company Funds and with Distribution of Stock to

Employees, Germany)

KG Kommanditgesellschaft (limited partnership, Germany) KGaA Kommanditgesellschaft auf Aktien (partnership limited

by shares, Germany)

Korkein hallinto-oikeus (Supreme Administrative Court **KHO**

of Finland)

KL. Kommunalskattelagen (Municipal Tax Act, Sweden) Komitean mietintö (committee report, Finland) KM KStG

Körperschaftsteuergesetz (Corporate Income Tax Act,

Germany)

KStR Körperschaftsteuer-Richtlinie (Corporate Income Tax

Guidelines, Germany)

Kupongskattelag (Withholding Tax Act, Sweden) KupL KVI. Keskusverolautakunta (Central Tax Board, Finland) Laki rajoitetusti verovelvollisen tulon ja varallisuuden LähdeveroL

verottamisesta (Act on Taxation of Income and Wealth

of a Person With Limited Tax Liability, Finland)

MenetelmäL Laki kansainvälisen kaksinkertaisen verotuksen

xii

poistamisesta (Act on Elimination of International

Double Taxation, Finland)

Nordiska skattevetenskapliga forskningsrädet skriftserie **NSFS**

(Series of publications of the Nordic Tax Scientific

Research Board)

Organization for Economic Cooperation and OECD

Development

Model Tax Convention on Income and Capital of the OECD Model

Organization for Economic Cooperation and

Development (17.7.2008)

OHG Offene Handelsgesellschaft (partnership with unlimited

liability, Germany)

osuuskunta (Cooperative Society, Finland) OSK osakeyhtiö (Limited Company, Finland) Oy osakeyhtiölaki (Companies Act, Finland) OYL

P-S Directive Council Directive 90/435/EEC of 23 July 1990 on the

Common System of Taxation Applicable in the Case of Parent Companies and Subsidiaries of Different Member

RSV Riksskatteverkets rapport (Report of the State's Tax

Office, Sweden)

RFH Reichsfinanzhof (Supreme Finance Court, Germany) Regeringsrättens Årsbok (Decision of the Supreme RÅ

Administrative Court, Sweden)

SIL Lagen om statlig inkomstskatt (National Income Tax Act,

Sweden)

Sijoitusrahastolaki (Act on Investment Funds, Finland) SijoitusrahastoL SOU Statens offentliga utredningar (State's public account,

Sweden)

The Treaty on European Union (TEU is used in this book **TEU**

to refer to the Treaty on European Union in the form as amended by the Treaty of Lisbon of 13.12.2007, which

entered into force on 1.12,2009)

The Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union TFEU

(i.e., the EC Treaty as amended and renamed by the Treaty of Lisbon, which was signed on 13.12.2007 and

which entered into force on 1.12.2009)

TVL Tuloverolaki (Income Tax Act, Finland) UN Model

United Nations Model Double Taxation Convention

between Developed and Developing Countries (2001)

US Model US Model Income Tax Convention (15.11.2006)

Valtiovarainvaliokunnan mietintö (Report of the Finance VaVM

Committee of the Parliament, Finland)

VerL Verotuslaki (On 18.12.1995 repealed Taxing Act, Finland) VeroH Verohallitus (The National Board of Taxes, Finland)

List of Abbreviations

Velkakirjalaki (The Promissory Notes Act, Finland)
Valtiovarainministeriön työryhmämuistio (working
group report of the Ministry of Finance, also Ministry of
Finance in general, Finland)
Laki verotusmenettelystä (Taxing Act, Finland)
Varallisuusverolaki (Wealth Tax Act, Finland)
Laki ulkomaisten väliyhteisöjen osakkaiden verotuksesta
(Act on Taxation of Shareholders of Foreign Controlled
Corporations, Finland) **VKL** VM

VML VVL

VäliyhteisöL

Corporations, Finland)

Laki yhtiöveron hyvityksestä (Act on Imputation Credit, YHL

Finland)

List of Abbreviations		xi	
Pref	face		xv
Cha	pter 1		
Intr	oduction		1
1.1	Subject		1
1.2	Specific Pu	rpose and Scope of the Study	1 2 8
1.3	Approach a	nd Research Methods	
1.4	Relevance of the Study		9
	1.4.1 Doul	ole Taxation or Non-taxation Caused	
	by D	eifferent Dividend Definitions	9
	1.4.2 The Concept of Dividend and Tax Neutrality		11
1.5	Materials	•	12
1.6	Terminolog	y	14
1.7	Outline of t	he Study	15
	pter 2		
		of the Inter-corporate Cross-Border	
	idends		17
		aw Dividend Taxation Systems	17
2.2	EU Tax La		18
		Parent-Subsidiary Directive	18
		TFEU Treaty	19
		.1 Permanent Establishments	19
		.2 Foreign-Source Dividend of a Resident	20
	2.2.2	.3 Dividend Received by a Non-resident	22

2.3		Treaties	2
2.4		omparison between the Taxation of lend and Other Income	20
	apter 3		
Inte	eractio	n among Different Legal Systems of International Tax Law	3
3.1		ionship among Different Legal Systems	
		ternational Tax Law	3
		Relevance of the Relationship	3
		Domestic Tax Laws of Two States	3
		Tax Treaties and Domestic Tax Law	32
		EU Tax Law and Domestic Tax Law	34
		Tax Treaties and EU Tax Law	31
3.2		Classification Conflicts of International Tax Law	39
	3.2.1	Description of the Problem	39
	3.2.2	Solutions to Classification Conflicts	42
		3.2.2.1 General Solutions	42
		3.2.2.2 Express Definitions in Tax Treaties	46
		3.2.2.3 The Rule of Interpretation in Tax Treaties	47
		3.2.2.4 Double Taxation Relief Articles	49
		3.2.2.5 Mutual Agreement Procedure	51
		3.2.2.6 Solutions in Actual Tax Treaties	52
3.3	Conc	lusions	53
	pter 4		
Diff	erent	Dividend Concepts in International Tax Law	55
4.1		Norms Determining the Tax Law Concept of a Dividend	55
4.2		estic Laws	58
4.3	The I	EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	59
4.4		Freaties	62
		Introduction	62
		The Model Conventions	63
		Actual Tax Treaties	66
4.5	Concl	lusions	67
	pter 5		
Divi	dend-l	Distributing Entities	71
5.1		luction	71
5.2		estic Laws	72
	5.2.1	Different Forms of Doing Business	72
	5.2.2	Entity Classification for Tax Law Purposes	73
	5.2.3	Dividend-Distributing Entities	74
	5.2.4	Inconsistent Classification and the Elimination	
		of Double Taxation	75

5.3	The I	EU Parent	t-Subsidiary Directive	75
	Tax Treaties		77	
	5.4.1	The Mo	odel Conventions	77
	5.4.2	Actual '	Tax Treaties	84
5.5	Conc			87
Cha	ıpter 6			
	_	Stripping	and the Dividend-Generating Relationship	91
6.1		luction		91
6.2	The Basic Relationship		93	
	6.2.1	Domest	ic Tax Laws	93
	6.2.2	The Par	rent-Subsidiary Directive	93
		Tax Tre		96
		6.2.3.1	The Model Conventions	96
		6.2.3.2	Actual Tax Treaties	97
	6.2.4	Conclus	sions	99
6.3	Class	fication of	of Payments under Dividend-Stripping	
		gements	11 0	99
	6.3.1	Proceed	s from the Transfer of Dividend Rights	99
		6.3.1.1	Introduction	99
		6.3.1.2	Domestic Tax Laws	100
		6.3.1.3	The EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	100
			Tax Treaties	101
		6.3.1.5	Conclusions	105
	6.3.2	2 Substitute Payments under Equity Securities Lending		
		Transac	tions	107
			Introduction	107
		6.3.2.2	Domestic Tax Laws The EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	109
		6.3.2.3	The EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	109
		6.3.2.4	Tax Treaties	110
		6.3.2.5	Conclusions	114
	6.3.3 Dividend Equivalent Payments from Derivative Financial			
	Instruments		115	
			Introduction	115
		6.3.3.2	Domestic Tax Laws	122
		6.3.3.3	The Parent-Subsidiary Directive	123
		6.3.3.4	Tax Treaties	123
		6.3.3.5	Conclusions	126
Cha	pter 7			
		tribution	s as a Dividend	127
7.1			of CFC Income	127
	7.1.1 Introduction			127
	7.1.2	Domesti	ic Tax Laws	130
				x = 0

	7.1.3 EU Law		130
	7.1.3.1 The TFE	EU Treaty	130
		Parent-Subsidiary Directive	132
	7.1.4 Tax Treaties	2 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4	134
	7.1.5 Conclusions		140
7.2		ares	141
–	7.2.1 Introduction		141
	7.2.2 Domestic Tax Lav	nws	142
	7.2.3 The EU Parent-Su		142
	7.2.4 Tax Treaties	,	144
	7.2.5 Conclusions		147
Cha	apter 8		
Cla	ssification of Economic B	Benefits from Corporations to	
	ir Shareholders in the Fo	orm of Transfer Prices	149
	Introduction		149
	Domestic Laws		152
8.3	EU Tax Law		153
	8.3.1 The TFEU Treaty		153
0.4	8.3.2 The Parent-Subsic	diary Directive	154
	Tax Treaties		156
8.5	Conclusions		161
	apter 9		
	ssification of Return on D	Debt-Equity Hybrids	163
	Introduction		163
9.2	General Approaches		165
		ristics of Debt and Equity	165
	9.2.2 Domestic Tax Lav		168
	9.2.3 The EU Parent-Su	ubsidiary Directive	170
	9.2.4 Tax Treaties		174
	9.2.4.1 The Mod		174
^ ^	9.2.4.2 Actual Ta		179
9.3	2	or Perpetual Debt	180
	9.3.1 Introduction		180
	9.3.2 Domestic Tax Lav		182
	9.3.3 The EU Parent-Su	ubsidiary Directive	182
o 1	9.3.4 Tax Treaties		183
9.4	Interest on Profit-Particip	pating Debt Instruments	185
	9.4.1 Introduction		185
	9.4.2 Domestic Tax Lav		186
	9.4.3 The EU Parent-Su	ubsidiary Directive	187
	9.4.4 Tax Treaties		187

viii

9.5	Interest on Convertible Debt Instruments	190
	9.5.1 Introduction	190
	9.5.2 Domestic Tax Laws	192
	9.5.3 The Parent-Subsidiary Directive	192
	9.5.4 Tax Treaties	193
9.6	Interest on Subordinated Debt Instruments	195
	9.6.1 Introduction	195
	9.6.2 Domestic Tax Laws	196
	9.6.3 The EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	196
	9.6.4 Tax Treaties	197
9.7	Classification of the Return on Preferred Shares	198
	9.7.1 Introduction	198
	9.7.2 Domestic Tax Laws	200
	9.7.3 The EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	201
	9.7.4 Tax Treaties	202
9.8	Conclusions	204
	pter 10	
	sification of Interest in Thin Capitalization Situations	207
	Introduction	207
10.2	Non-discrimination	209
	10.2.1 Tax Treaties	209
	10.2.2 The TFEU Treaty	210
	The EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	211
	Tax Treaties	215
10.5	Conclusions	221
	pter 11	
	sification of Liquidation Distributions	223
	Introduction	223
	Domestic Tax Laws	225
	The EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	226
11.4	Tax Treaties	230
	11.4.1 The Model Treaties	230
	11.4.2 Actual Treaties	237
11.5	Conclusions	238
	pter 12	
	cluding Remarks	239
	General	239
	Dividend-Distributing Entities	239
12.3	Dividend-Stripping and the Dividend-Generating	
	Relationship	241
	12.3.1 The Resic Pelationship	2.41

12.3.2 Dividend-Stripping Arrangements	242
12.3.2.1 Transfer of Dividend Rights	242
12.3.2.2 Equity Securities Lending Transactions	243
12.3.2.3 Derivative Financial Instruments	244
12.4 Fictive Distributions	244
12.4.1 CFC Income	244
12.4.2 Bonus Shares	245
12.5 Economic Benefits in the Form of Transfer Prices	246
12.6 Return on Debt-Equity Hybrids	246
12.7 Thin Capitalization Interest	247
12.8 Liquidation Distributions	248
12.9 Final Conclusions	249
Bibliography	251
Index	279

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 SUBJECT

Classification of corporate distributions is a major problem facing tax authorities and tax practitioners. Internationally, capital moves at a breakneck speed and the value of cross-border inter-corporate investments and finance has grown rapidly. The instruments used for finance and investment both in national and international relations have become numerous and complex. There are many forms in which profits of a corporate entity resident in one state may be distributed to a corporate entity resident in another state. The fact that these different forms may be taxed very differently produces substantial tax planning opportunities for multinational enterprises. Due to the increasing amount and complexity of the possible intercorporate cross-border transactions, it has become more and more difficult to keep abreast of them and to give them a name in order for the proper tax assessments to be made.

'Dividend' in its economic sense is the return on an equity investment in a corporate entity. Dividend distribution is a transaction in which corporate profits are distributed to the owners of the corporate entity without the corporate entity's expectation of receiving anything in return. As a result, the assets of the corporate entity decrease and the assets of the owners increase. A dividend distribution based upon the decision of the owners at a formally recognized meeting is the basic form of such a transaction. It is, however, only one of the forms in which corporate profits may legally be distributed to the owners of a corporate entity without any equivalent value or benefit in exchange or in which an investor may enjoy a return on an equity investment.

The question is to what extent do these other transactions, where corporate profits are transferred to the owners of the corporate entity, constitute a dividend and to what extent do they constitute some other type of income for tax purposes. From an economic perspective, it seems natural to tax all forms of return on equity

Chapter 1

investments in the same way. From a company law perspective, however, a distinction between the different possible forms may be made. It may be difficult to distinguish between a remuneration that actually constitutes a return on equity capital, and a payment from a corporate entity to its owners, that constitutes another form of a remuneration or repayment of capital.

The solutions to the classification problems are not necessarily the same for different states. The tax treatment of the different forms in which an owner may benefit from corporate profits is often different, not only in one state, but particularly in the cross-border situations where two different states are involved. The tax laws of two states may define the concept of 'dividend' differently. Therefore, in cross-border situations, classification conflicts may and do emerge. Certain transactions may be regarded as constituting a dividend in the view of the tax authorities of one state but not in the view of the tax authorities of another state. Such inconsistent classification may lead to either international double taxation or non-taxation. Therefore, it is important to draw the line between a dividend and other transactions similar in nature to a dividend, especially in cross-border situations.

This study covers different types of inter-corporate cross-border arrangements where an investor may receive a 'dividend equivalent return' directly from a corporation or indirectly through a third party. The topics covered will include:

- the extent to which these constitute a dividend for the purposes of the different legal systems of international tax law;
- the extent to which inconsistent income classification with respect to the covered arrangements lead or may lead to conflicts that further lead or may lead to international double taxation or non-taxation; and finally
- whether and by what means such conflicts are or may be resolved in practice.

1.2 SPECIFIC PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE STUDY

In order for proper tax assessment to be carried out, four basic determinations must be made:

- (1) Who is the right tax subject?
- (2) What is the tax object?
- (3) What is the tax rate to be applied in connection with the tax subject and tax object?
- (4) What is the amount of the tax when the tax rate is applied to the tax object?¹

In cross-border situations, this inquiry also includes determining which state or states have taxing rights with respect to a specific tax subject and tax object, and to what extent. In cross-border interactions, the answers to these questions depend upon the different legal systems of international tax law, that is, the domestic tax

^{1.} See for these steps, for example, Tikka (1972), 30-46.

law of each state concerned, upon any applicable tax treaty, and, with respect to the Member States of the European Union, upon EU tax law.

In this study, the focus is on determining the tax object. The purpose is to determine under what conditions different cross-border arrangements produce income that is or that may be taxed as a dividend and thereby to clarify and define the concept of 'dividend' in international tax law. The tax law term 'dividend' is defined with respect to different possible arrangements between parties resident in two different states. For the purposes of this study, it is irrelevant who the right tax subject is for a dividend, and what the actual tax burden is on the dividend.

In general, a dividend means a profit distribution from a corporate entity to its owners by virtue of the owner's status as such. Dividend distribution is a transaction by which the assets of the distributing corporate entity decrease and the assets of the receiving owner increase. Dividend distribution is a transfer of an economic benefit from a corporate entity to its owner for no equivalent value or benefit in exchange or, in the case that there might be some return value or benefit, it does not fully correspond to the economic benefit received. This general definition of 'dividend' may be broken down further.

In order to answer the question as to what items of income qualify as a dividend, a determination must be made as to what entities qualify as dividend-distributing entities under the different legal systems of international tax law. Not all transfers of benefits from a qualifying entity to another entity constitute a dividend; a certain relationship must exist between the parties and the benefit must be transferred because of this special relationship. In addition, the question of which part of the benefit transferred is to be taxed as dividend must be answered. Finally, in order to arrive at the actual taxing consequence, it must be determined who the right tax subject is with respect to the dividend received. All these determinations must be made both in the state where the distributing entity is a resident and in the state where the income recipient is a resident. The answers to these questions depend upon domestic tax law, upon any applicable tax treaties, and, with respect to EU Member States, upon EU tax law.

Identifying the dividend-distributing entity, the dividend-generating relationship and the amount of taxable dividend determines the international tax law concept of 'dividend'. These, then, are the relevant features of this study. The questions concerning the right taxpayer of the dividend received and the actual tax rate do not, strictly speaking, determine the concept of 'dividend', but rather only give some indication of how a dividend is taxed and as whose income a dividend is recognized. These questions, therefore, are not covered by this study.

^{2.} International tax law is a branch of tax law, traditionally considered to cover all tax provisions concerning situations involving the territory of more than one state. In other words, the term is used to refer to all tax provisions regulating the so-called 'cross-border situations'. See, for example, Vogel et al. (1997), 10, Schaumburg (1998), 1-3, Helminen (2009), 1, Helminen (2009a), 1, Helminen (2010), Ch. 3 and Rohatgi (2005), 1. See for a discussion on the term from the time when the meaning was not yet quite clear in Bühler (1964), 3 and Knechtle (1979), 11-16.

^{3.} See for these general characteristics of a dividend, for example, Sandström (1962), 3.

Chapter 1

The actual tax treatment of the income that is regarded as constituting a dividend is covered in this study only to the extent that it illustrates the importance of distinguishing a dividend from other income.⁴

Questions concerning valuation or timing are not covered in this study, although these questions, to a certain extent, are meaningful in determining the concept of a dividend. Valuation problems would require a separate study even by limiting a review of them to those that arise in connection with dividend taxation. These difficult problems are widely covered in numerous studies concerning constructive dividends and transfer pricing and, therefore, are excluded from the scope of this study. For the purposes of this study, the assumption made is that the value of distributed assets, which is taken into account for tax purposes, is clear. The question concerning the moment when a dividend is paid and realized as taxable income is also not covered.

One important objective of this study is to identify and systemize the international tax law issues relating to the question of distinguishing transactions constituting a dividend from other transactions. As a result, this study systematically covers the most important issues relating to distinguishing inter-corporate dividend transactions from other inter-corporate transactions for the purposes of international tax law. By systematically studying the cases in which the line between a dividend and some other types of income is hazy, this study provides an answer to the question of what transactions constitute dividend in international tax law.

This study evaluates the question of what entities qualify as dividend-distributing entities. It considers the typical domestic law forms of business organizations in evaluating which of these forms are regarded as dividend-distributing entities for the purposes of the different legal systems of international tax law. Both incorporated and unincorporated business enterprises are discussed. Different non-business or non-profit entities are, however, beyond the scope of this study, regardless of whether or not they appear in a form available for business organizations.

Investment funds, as a special group of entities, are, in principle, of interest in determining what entities qualify as a dividend-distributing entity. Through an investment fund, an investor may indirectly invest in the equity capital of a dividend-distributing entity. Under the domestic tax law of different states, it varies whether investment funds themselves are treated as separate taxable entities and as

^{4.} This study excludes also the issue of beneficial ownership despite the fact that especially the availability of tax treaty benefits in the source state depends on who the beneficial owner of the dividend is. See for the beneficial owner concept, for example, Doernberg and van Raad (1997), 84–85 and 106, Hinnekens (1989), 359, paras 12–12.2 of the Commentaries to Art. 10(2) of the OECD Model, para. 8 of the Commentaries to Art. 11(2) of the OECD Model and para. 4 of the Commentaries to Art. 12(1) of the OECD Model, OECD (1987a), 93, Vogel et al. (1997), 562–563, International Fiscal Association (2000), Helminen (2002), 434–460, Helminen (2009), 40 and 141, Helminen (2009a), 71, Helminen (2010), Ch. 4, Todellinen omistaja, Ryynänen (2003), 345–366, Rohatgi (2005), 147, Du Toit (1999) and Wheeler (2005), 478–482. See Wheeler (2007), 17–58 about conflicts in the attribution of income to a person.