

D950.26 E61

Environmental Liability and Ecological Damage in European Law

Edited by Monika Hinteregger







CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521889971

© Cambridge University Press 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Environmental liability and ecological damage in European law / edited by Monika Hinteregger.

p. cm. - (The common core of European private law) Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-0-521-88997-1

 Liability for environmental damages – Europe. I. Gimpel-Hinteregger, Monika. II. Title. III. Series.
 KJC1715.E58 2008
 344.404'6-dc22

2008018937

ISBN 978-0-521-88997-1 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Environmental Liability and Ecological Damage in European Law

Providing a comprehensive analysis of environmental liability law in Europe, this book offers a general introduction to the status of environmental liability in Europe. It describes the relevant international treaties and the EC Environmental Liability Directive and discusses the conflict of laws issues regarding transfrontier environmental damage. It also contains the results of a comparative project covering fourteen jurisdictions in thirteen European countries (Austria, Belgium, England, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Netherlands, Portugal, Scotland, Spain and Sweden) on the private law aspects of environmental liability. It addresses the main problems of the application of tort law in environmental law, such as the availability of no-fault liability, the establishment of causation, the scope of available remedies and the issue of legal standing. Due to the very limited harmonizing effect of the EC Environmental Liability Directive national tort law will keep its importance in the field of environmental liability.

MONIKA HINTEREGGER is a Professor of Civil Law at the Institute of Civil Law, Foreign and Private International Law, Karl Franzens University of Graz. Her teaching covers topics of European Private Law and Austrian Civil Law. For the past fifteen years she has been a legal advisor to the Austrian Government and Parliament on several topics of tort law.

The Common Core of European Private Law

General Editors

Mauro Bussani, University of Trieste Ugo Mattei, University of Turin and University of California, Hastings College of Law

Honorary Editor Rodolfo Sacco, University of Turin

Editorial Board

James Gordley, Cecil Turner Professor of Law, University of California, Berkeley; Editor in Chief of the American Journal of Comparative Law Antonio Gambaro, Professor of Law, University of Milan; President of the Italian Society of Comparative Law Franz Werro, University of Freiburg and Georgetown University Law Center Rodolfo Sacco, President of the International Association of Legal Science (UNESCO)

For the transnational lawyer the present European situation is equivalent to that of a traveller compelled to cross legal Europe using a number of different local maps. To assist lawyers in the journey beyond their own locality *The Common Core of European Private Law Project* was launched in 1993 at the University of Trento under the auspices of the late Professor Rudolf B. Schlesinger.

The aim of this collective scholarly enterprise is to unearth what is already common to the legal systems of European Union member states. Case studies widely circulated and discussed between lawyers of different traditions are employed to draw at least the main lines of a reliable map of the law of Europe.

Books in the series

Environmental Liability and Ecological Damage in European Law Edited by Monika Hinteregger 978 0 521 88997 1 Hardback

The Enforcement of Competition Law in Europe Edited by Thomas M. J. Möllers and Andreas Heinemann 978 0 521 88110 4 Hardback

Commercial Trusts in European Private Law Edited by Michele Graziadei, Ugo Mattei and Lionel Smith 978 0 521 84919 7 Mistake, Fraud and Duties to Inform in European Contract Law Edited by Ruth Sefton-Green 0 521 84423 1 Hardback

Security Rights in Movable Property in European Private Law Edited by Eva-Maria Kieninger 0 521 83967 X Hardback

Pure Economic Loss in Europe Edited by Mauro Bussani and Vernon Valentine Palmer 0 521 82464 8 Hardback

The Enforceability of Promises in European Contract Law Edited by James Gordley 0 521 79021 2 Hardback

Good Faith in European Contract Law Edited by Reinhard Zimmermann and Simon Whittaker 0 521 77190 0 Hardback



Preface

The notion of environmental damage is a rather recent development in tort law on both a national and an international level. Constant degradation of environmental goods, such as air, water and wildlife, by emissions and old dumpsites and spectacular industrial accidents causing pollution created a new awareness by the public of the environment. National legislation and new international treaties show that tort liability is attributed an increasing role in the protection of the environment by decision-makers. The most recent example is EC Directive 2004/35/EC on Environmental Liability with Regard to the Prevention and Remedying of Environmental Damage (OJ L 143, p. 56, 30 April 2004). The Directive, however, provides for a rather narrow concept of environmental liability. Although Member States are not prevented from maintaining or enacting more stringent provisions, it must be expected that the Directive will only provide for limited harmonisation of Member State laws with regard to the prevention and remediation of environmental damage. National tort law will therefore continue to play a major part in the field of environmental liability.

This book provides an analysis of how private law regimes in Europe cope with the problem of damage to the environment. In Part I, there are general introductions to the status of environmental liability in Europe and conflict of laws issues regarding transfrontier environmental damage.

Part II of the book contains the comparative project covering fourteen jurisdictions in thirteen European countries. It concentrates on the private law aspects of environmental liability. Thus, the main problems of the application of tort law in the field of environmental law – such as the availability of no-fault liability, the establishment of causation, the scope of available remedies and the crucial issue of legal standing – are addressed.

The 'Environmental liability and ecological damage in European Law' project was launched in July 2000 at the general meeting of the Common Core project in Trento, where a first draft questionnaire, developed by the editor of this book, was discussed by several scholars of the environmental group of the Trento project. Already at that meeting, the first participants in the project joined in, and, in 2001, again at the general meeting of the Common Core project, the questionnaire was finalised and presented to the members of the tort group of the Common Core project (chaired by Professor Mathias Reimann, University of Michigan Law School), who were very supportive of the idea to engage in a comparative study on environmental liability law. The following years were spent recruiting legal experts from those states that were not yet covered and preparing the responses, which were discussed during several meetings of the project team.

By including fourteen reports from thirteen countries (Austria, Belgium, England, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Ireland, Italy, the Netherlands, Portugal, Scotland, Spain and Sweden), the rather ambitious plan to cover all the (then) fifteen Member States of the European Union was nearly achieved. It was, however, not possible to expand the scope of the project when the enlargement of the European Union to twenty-five Member States took place on 1 May 2004, as the project was already in a very advanced stage at that time. The same applies for the accession of Bulgaria and Romania on 1 January 2007. The challenging and extremely interesting endeavour of a comparative analysis of the environmental liability laws of these jurisdictions must therefore be left to a follow-up project.

Acknowledgments

The editor of and the contributors to this volume wish to thank all those who have made this book possible. First of all, thanks to Ugo Mattei and Mauro Bussani, the general editors of the Common Core project, for including this volume in the Common Core of European Private Law series, and to Franz Werro, the new chairman of the tort group of the Trento project, for reviewing the first draft of the volume and for his helpful comments and suggestions. We are very indebted to all those who so efficiently organised the numerous meetings in Trento during which the project was developed, discussed and finalised, namely, Mrs Carla Boninsegna and her team. Many thanks also go to Cambridge University Press for accepting the volume for publication and all those at Cambridge University Press who helped in the publishing process.

During the long process of writing this book, many persons have helped to bring this project to fruition. I thank Manuela Weissenbacher, Elke Buchwalder and Georg Aichinger for the assistance they have provided throughout the preparation of the project, Monika Lammer for the technical preparation of the manuscript and Rachel Tripp for her help with linguistic matters.

Monika Hinteregger, Graz, 2008

General editors' preface

This is the eighth book in the Common Core of European Private Law series published within Cambridge Studies in International and Comparative Law. The project was launched in 1993 at the University of Trento under the auspices of the late Professor Rudolf B. Schlesinger.

The methodology used in the Trento project is novel. By making use of case studies it goes beyond mere description to detailed inquiry into how most European Union legal systems resolve specific legal questions in practice, and provides a thorough comparison between those systems. It is our hope that these volumes will provide scholars with a valuable tool for research in comparative law and in their own national legal systems. The collection of materials that the Common Core project is offering to the scholarly community is already quite extensive and will become even more so when more volumes are published. The availability of materials attempting a genuine analysis of how things are is, in our opinion, a prerequisite for an intelligent and critical discussion on how they should be. Perhaps in the future European private law will be authoritatively restated or even codified. The analytical work carried on today by the almost 200 scholars involved in the Common Core project is also a precious asset of knowledge and legitimisation for any such normative enterprise.

We must thank the editors of and contributors to these first published results. With a sense of deep gratitude we also wish to recall our late Honorary Editor, Professor Rudolf B. Schlesinger. We are sad that we have not been able to present him with the results of a project in which he believed so firmly.

No scholarly project can survive without committed sponsors. The Italian Ministry of Scientific Research is funding the project, having recognised it as a 'research of national interest'. The International

University College of Turin with the Compagnia di San Paolo and the Consiglio Nazionale del Notariato allow us to organise the general meetings. The European Commission has partially sponsored some of our past general meetings, having included them in their High Level Conferences Program. The University of Turin, the University of Trieste, the Fromm Chair in International and Comparative Law at the University of California and the Hastings College of Law, and the Centro Studi di Diritto Comparato of Trieste, have all contributed to the funding of this project. Last but not least, we must thank all those involved in our ongoing projects in contract law, property, tort and other areas, whose results will be the subject of future published volumes.

Our home page on the internet is at http://www.iuctorino.it. There you can follow our progress in mapping the common core of European private law.

General Editors

Mauro Bussani, University of Trieste

Ugo Mattei, University of Turin and University of California,

Hastings College of Law

Honorary Editor Rudolfo Sacco, University of Turin

Late Honorary Editor Rudolf B. Schlesinger, Cornell University and University of California, Hastings

Contributors

- HUBERT BOCKEN, Prof. Dr., Faculty of Law, Department of Civil Law, University of Gent (Belgian report)
- EUGENIA DACORONIA, Attorney-at-Law, Lecturer in Civil Law at Athens University Department of Law (Greek report)
- ALAN DOYLE, LLM (Bruges), LLB (Dublin), Solicitor, Ireland (Irish report)
 PHILLIPPE GUILLOT, Dr iur., hab., Senior Lecturer in Public Law at the
 University of Rouen, First Vice Dean of the Faculty of Law,
 Economics, and Management (French report)
- MONIKA HINTEREGGER, Dr iur., Professor of Civil Law, University of Graz (editor, Austrian report)
- NORMA HIRD, Senior Lecturer, School of Law at the University of Sheffield (English report)
- ERKKI J. HOLLO, Prof. Dr iur., Faculty of Law, Department of Civil Law, University of Helsinki (Finnish report)
- GERAINT HOWELLS, LLB, Barrister, Professor of Law, Lancaster University (English report)
- MARIE-LOUISE LARSSON, LLD, Associate Professor of Civil Law at the Faculty of Law, Stockholm University (Swedish report)
- THOMAS M. J. MÖLLERS, Dr iur., Professor of Civil Law, Economic Law, European Law, Conflict of Law and Comparative Law, Managing Director of European Legal Orders at the University of Augsburg (Germen report)
- WILLIBALD POSCH, Dr iur., Professor of Civil Law and International Private Law, University of Graz
- BARBARA POZZO, Dr iur., Professor of Comparative Private Law, Università dell'Insubria (Italian report)
- ELSPETH REID, Senior Lecturer in Law, University of Edinburgh (Scottish report)

- DOMINIQUE A. J. ROOMBERG, Adelmeijer Hoyng Advocaten, Maastricht (Dutch report)
- PETER ROTT, Dr iur., Junior Professor of Civil Law, specialising in European Private Law, at the University of Bremen, Germany (English report)
- ALBERT RUDA, Observatory of European and Comparative Private Law, Facultat de Dret, Universitat de Girona (Spanish report)
- JOSÉ CUNHAL SENDIM, Assistente de Faculdade de Direito da Universidade de Lisboa (Portuguese report)
- CAROLYN SHELBOURN, Senior lecturer, School of Law, University of Sheffield (English report)

Table of treaties

- European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms of 4 November 1950 95, 585
- Treaty establishing the European Atomic Energy Community of 25 March 1957 23
- Convention on Third Party Liability in the Field of Nuclear Energy of 29 July 1960, as amended by the additional Protocol of 28 January 1964 and by the Protocol of 16 November 1982 5, 23, 28–30, 44, 105, 146, 180, 290–3, 295–8, 300–2, 305–6, 309, 311, 313, 601–2, 637, 640, 643
- Convention of 31 January 1963 Supplementary to the Paris Convention of 29 July 1960, as amended by the additional Protocol of 28 January 1964 and by the Protocol of 16 November 1982 5, 23, 28-9, 105, 296, 305, 637
- Vienna Convention on Civil Liability for Nuclear Damage of 21 May 1963 5, 23, 28–30, 293, 295, 637, 640
- Agreement between the Federal Republic of Germany and Austria concerning the Effects on the Territory of the Federal Republic of Germany of Construction and Operation of the Salzburg Airport of 19 December 1967 48
- Brussels Convention on Jurisdiction and the Enforcement of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters of 27 September 1968 39, 45
- International Convention on Civil Liability for Oil Pollution Damage of 29 November 1969, as amended by the Protocol of 1976 26, 543, 545, 637
- International Convention on the Establishment of an International Fund for Compensation for Oil Pollution Damage of 18 December 1971 26, 28, 545-6, 557, 637

- Brussels Convention Relating to Civil Liability in the Field of Maritime Carriage of Nuclear Material of 17 December 1971 23, 641
- EC Draft Convention on the Law Applicable to Contractual and Non-Contractual Obligations of 1972 38–40
- International Convention for the Prevention of Marine Pollution from Ships of 1973, as modified by the Protocol of 1978 relating thereto 44
- Convention on the Law Applicable to Products Liability of 2 October 1973 43
- Convention on Limitation of Liability for Maritime Claims of 19 November 1976 21, 25, 639
- Rome Convention on the Law Applicable to Contractual Obligations of 19 June 1980 38
- United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea of 7 October 1982 540, 547
- Strasbourg Convention on Limitation of Liability in Inland Navigation of 1988 21, 25, 640
- Joint Protocol relating to the Application of the Vienna Convention and the Paris Convention of 21 September 1988 28
- Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movement of Hazardous Wastes and Their Disposal of 22 March 1989 31, 638
- Convention on Civil Liability for Damage Caused During Carriage of Dangerous Goods by Road, Rail and Inland Navigation Vessels of 10 October 1989 23, 641
- Convention on the Rights of the Child of 20 November 1989 95
- Treaty on European Union of 7 February 1992 25, 39, 127
- Helsinki Convention on the Protection and the Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes of 17 March 1992 31, 638
- Helsinki Convention on the Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents of 17 March 1992 31, 638
- Convention on Biological Diversity of 5 June 1992 14
- Lugano Convention on Civil Liability for Damage Resulting from Activities Dangerous to the Environment of 21 June 1993 3-5, 154, 638
- International Convention on Liability and Compensation for Damage in Connection with the Carriage of Hazardous and Noxious Substances by Sea of 3 May 1996 23
- Convention on Supplementary Compensation for Nuclear Damage of 12 September 1997 28–9, 293, 297, 637

- Protocol to amend the Vienna Convention on Civil Liability for Nuclear Damage of 12 September 1997 28
- Treaty of Amsterdam amending the Treaty on European Union, the Treaties establishing the European Communities and certain related acts of 2 October 1997 39
- Aarhus Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters of 25 June 1998 24, 641
- Protocol on Liability and Compensation for Damage resulting from Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and Their Disposal of 10 December 1999 31, 638
- Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety to the Convention on Biological Diversity of 29 January 2000 25, 32, 638
- International Convention on Civil Liability for Bunker Oil Pollution Damage of 23 March 2001 26, 637, 641
- Protocol on Civil Liability and Compensation for Damage Caused by the Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents on Transboundary Waters to the 1992 Convention on the Protection and the Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes and to the 1992 Convention on the Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents of 21 May 2003 31
- Protocol of 12 February 2004 to amend the Convention of 31 January 1963 Supplementary to the Paris Convention of 29 July 1960 on Third Party Liability in the Field of Nuclear Energy, as amended by the additional Protocol of 28 January 1964, by the Protocol of 16 November 1982 637
- Protocol of 12 February 2004 to amend the Convention on Third Party Liability in the Field of Nuclear Energy of 29 July 1960, as amended by the additional Protocol of 28 January 1964, by the Protocol of 16 November 1982 29

Table of legislation

Austria

Federal legislation

Abfallwirtschaftsgesetz 2002 (AWG), Waste Management Act, BGBl I 2002/102, as amended by BGBl I 2007/16 443, 279

Allgemeines Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch (ABGB), Austrian Civil Code

```
§ 364 81-2, 84
```

§§ 1036 et seq. 528, 533, 634

§ 1042 439, 443, 480, 528, 533, 624, 634

§ 1295 80

§ 1301 397

§ 1302 395, 397, 414, 615

§ 1304 165, 168-9, 591

§ 1315 80

§ 1323 442, 480-1

§ 1324 442-3, 574

§ 1325 377, 563-4

§ 1326 561, 563, 617

§ 1327 564

§ 1409 331

§ 1489 328, 330, 607

Allgemeines Sozialversicherungsgesetz (ASVG), General Social Security Insurance Act, BGBl 1955/189, as amended by BGBl I 2004/179

§ 332 377

Amtshaftungsgesetz (AHG), Official Liability Act, BGBl 1949/20, as amended by BGBl I 1999/194 253, 443

xxvii

^{§ 364}a 69, 81-4