



Food preservation by pulsed electric fields

From research to application

Edited by H. L. M. Lelieveld, S. Notermans
and S. W. H. de Haan

Food preservation by pulsed electric fields

From research to application

Edited by

**H. L. M. Lelieveld, S. Notermans and
S. W. H. de Haan**



CRC Press

Boca Raton Boston New York Washington, DC

WOODHEAD PUBLISHING LIMITED

Cambridge England

Published by Woodhead Publishing Limited, Abington Hall, Abington,
Cambridge CB21 6AH, England
www.woodheadpublishing.com

Published in North America by CRC Press LLC, 6000 Broken Sound Parkway, NW,
Suite 300, Boca Raton, FL 33487, USA

© 2007, Woodhead Publishing Limited; © 2007, Chapter 12, Larry Keener
Every effort has been made to trace and acknowledge ownership of copyright.
The publishers will be glad to hear from any copyright holders whom it has not
been possible to contact.

The authors have asserted their moral rights.

This book contains information obtained from authentic and highly regarded sources.
Reprinted material is quoted with permission, and sources are indicated. Reasonable
efforts have been made to publish reliable data and information, but the authors and
the publishers cannot assume responsibility for the validity of all materials. Neither
the authors nor the publishers, nor anyone else associated with this publication, shall
be liable for any loss, damage or liability directly or indirectly caused or alleged to
be caused by this book.

Neither this book nor any part may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by
any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, microfilming and
recording, or by any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in
writing from Woodhead Publishing Limited.

The consent of Woodhead Publishing Limited does not extend to copying for
general distribution, for promotion, for creating new works, or for resale. Specific
permission must be obtained in writing from Woodhead Publishing Limited for such
copying.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered
trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation, without intent to
infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

Woodhead Publishing ISBN 978-1-84569-058-8 (book)
Woodhead Publishing ISBN 978-1-84569-383-1 (e-book)
CRC Press ISBN 978-1-4200-4395-2
CRC Press order number WP4395

The publishers' policy is to use permanent paper from mills that operate a
sustainable forestry policy, and which has been manufactured from pulp
which is processed using acid-free and elementary chlorine-free practices.
Furthermore, the publishers ensure that the text paper and cover board used
have met acceptable environmental accreditation standards.

Typeset in India by Replika Press Pvt Ltd.
Printed by TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall, England

Food preservation by pulsed electric fields

Related titles:

Food preservation techniques

(ISBN 978-1-85573-530-9)

Extending the shelf-life of foods whilst maintaining safety and quality is a critical issue for the food industry. As a result there have been major developments in food preservation techniques, which are summarised in this authoritative collection. The first part of the book examines the key issue of maintaining safety as preservation methods become more varied and complex. The rest of the book looks both at individual technologies and how they are combined to achieve the right balance of safety, quality and shelf-life for particular products.

Improving the thermal processing of foods

(ISBN 978-1-85573-730-3)

Thermal technologies must ensure the safety of food without compromising its quality. This important book summarises key research both on improving particular techniques and measuring their effectiveness in preserving food and enhancing its quality.

The microwave processing of foods

(ISBN 978-1-85573-964-2)

The impact of traditional thermal processing on the sensory quality of food has led to an interest in alternative technologies. Amongst these, microwave processing has proved one of the most successful and versatile. It is now widely used in processes such as thawing, dehydration and baking. Edited by two leading authorities in the field, and with a distinguished international team of contributors, this collection reviews both the theory and practice of microwave processing. It covers such key issues as improving modelling and process control to ensure uniform heating in optimising sensory and nutritional quality.

Details of these books and a complete list of Woodhead's titles can be obtained by:

- visiting our website at www.woodheadpublishing.com
- contacting Customer Services (e-mail: sales@woodhead-publishing.com; fax: +44 (0)1223 893694; tel.: +44 (0)1223 891358 ext. 30; address: Woodhead Publishing Ltd, Abington Hall, Abington, Cambridge CB21 6AH, England)

Contributor contact details

(* = main contact)

Editors

H. L. M. Lelieveld
Ensaahlaan 11
3723 HT Bilthoven
The Netherlands

email: huub.lelieveld@inter.nl.net

S. Notermans
Foundation Food Micro and
Innovation
Obrechtlaan 17
3723 KA Bilthoven
The Netherlands

email: s.notermans@wxs.nl

S. W. H. de Haan
Delft University of Technology
Electrical Power Processing Unit
(EPP)
Mekelweg 4
2628 CD Delft
The Netherlands

email: s.w.h.dehaan@tudelft.nl

Chapter 1

S. Notermans
Foundation Food Micro and
Innovation
Obrechtlaan 17
3723 KA Bilthoven
The Netherlands

email: s.notermans@wxs.nl

Chapter 2

S. Toepfl* and V. Heinz
Deutsches Institut für
Lebensmitteltechnik (DIL) e.V.
Professor-von-Klitzing-Str. 7
49610 Quakenbrueck
Germany

email: s.toepfl@dil-ev.de

D. Knorr
Berlin University of Technology
Department of Food Biotechnology
and Food Process Engineering
Koenigin-Luise-Str. 22
14195 Berlin
Germany

Chapter 3

S. W. H. de Haan
Delft University of Technology
Faculty EEMCS / EPP
Mekelweg 4
2628 CD Delft
The Netherlands

email: s.w.h.dehaan@tudelft.nl

Chapter 7

P. H. F Morshuis
Delft University of Technology
Faculty of Electrical Engineering,
Mathematics and Computer
Science
Mekelweg 4
2628 CD Delft
The Netherlands

email: P.H.F.Morshuis@tudelft.nl

Chapter 4

H. F. M. van den Bosch
Schoolstraat 17
5438 AC Gassel
The Netherlands

email: erik.vandenbosch@hetnet.nl

Chapter 8

M. B. Fox
NIZO Food Research
Kernhemseweg 2
6718 ZB Ede
The Netherlands

email: Martijn.Fox@nizo.nl

Chapter 5

B. Roodenburg
Delft University of Technology
Faculty: EWI
Bart Roodenburg
Room LB03-620
Postbus 5031
2600 GA Delft

email: b.roodenburg@ewi.tudelft.nl

Chapter 9

P. C. Wouters
Unilever R&D Vlaardingen
PO Box 114
3130 AC Vlaardingen
The Netherlands

email: Patrick.Wouters@unilever.com

Chapter 6

C. Smit* and W. de Haan
Stork Food & Dairy Systems
Ketelstraat 2
1021 JX Amsterdam
The Netherlands

email: chris.smit@stork.com

G. Saulis

Vytautas Magnus University
Department of Biology
58 K. Donelaicio str.
LT-44248 Kaunas
Lithuania

email: sg@kaunas.omnitel.net

Chapter 10

D. Rodrigo, M. Zúñiga, A. Rivas,
 A. Martínez
 Instituto de Agroquímica y
 Tecnología de Alimentos
 Apartado de Correos 73
 46100 Burjassot
 Valencia
 Spain

S. Notermans*
 Foundation Food Micro and
 Innovation
 Obrechtlaan 17
 3723 KA Bilthoven
 The Netherlands

email: s.notermans@wxs.nl

Chapter 11

I. Álvarez*
 University of Zaragoza
 C/Miguel Servet, 177
 50013, Zaragoza
 Spain

email: iyalvalan@unizar.es

V. Heinz

Deutsches Institut für
 Lebensmitteltechnik
 (DIL) e.V.
 Professor-von-Klitzing-Str. 7
 49610 Quakenbrueck
 Germany

Chapter 12

L. Keener
 International Product Safety
 Consultants, Inc.
 4021 W. Bertona Street
 Seattle 98199-1934
 Washington
 USA
 email: LKeener@aol.com
 Larry.Keener@comcast.net

Chapter 13

A. M. Matser*, H. J. Schuten,
 H. C. Mastwijk
 Food Technology Centre
 Wageningen UR
 PO Box 17
 6700 AA Wageningen
 The Netherlands

email: ariette.matser@wur.nl

A. Lommen
 RIKILT–Institute of Food Safety
 Bornsesteeg 45
 6700 AE Wageningen
 The Netherlands

Chapter 14

P. Elez-Martínez and O. Martín-
 Bellos*
 Department of Food Technology
 Universitat de Lleida
 Av. Alcalde, Rovira Roure, 191
 25198 Lleida
 Spain

email: omartin@tecal.udl.es

D. Rodrigo and F. Sampedro
 Instituto de Agroquímica y
 Tecnología de Alimentos
 Apartado de Correos 73
 46100 Burjassot
 Valencia
 Spain

Chapter 15

L. Frewer* and A. Fischer
 Social Sciences Group
 Wageningen UR
 Bode 87
 Postbus 8130
 6700 EW Wageningen
 The Netherlands

email: lynn.frewer@wur.nl

Chapter 16

H. Hoogland*
Unilever R&D Vlaardingen
PO Box 114
3130 AC Vlaardingen
The Netherlands

email: hans.hoogland@unilever.com

H. C. Mastwijk

Food Technology Centre
Wageningen UR
Postbus 9101
6700 HB Wageningen
The Netherlands

email: Hennie.Mastwijk@wur.nl

W. de Haan

Stork Food & Dairy Systems
Ketelstraat 2
1021 JX Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Chapter 17

B. Altunakar, S. R. Gurram and
G. V. Barbosa-Cánovas*
Center for Nonthermal Processing
of Food
Pullman
WA 99164-6120
USA

email: barbosa@wsu.edu

Chapter 19

S. W. H. de Haan*
Delft University of Technology
Electrical Power Processing Unit
(EPP)
Mekelweg 4
2628 CD Delft
The Netherlands

email: S.W.H.deHaan@ tudelft.nl

H. L. M. Lelieveld
Ensahlaan 11
3723 HT Bilthoven
The Netherlands

email: huub.lelieveld@inter.nl.net

Chapter 18

H. L. M. Lelieveld*
Ensahlaan 11
3723 HT Bilthoven
The Netherlands

email: huub.lelieveld@inter.nl.net

H. F. M. van den Bosch
Schoolstraat 17
5438 AC Gassel
The Netherlands

email: erik.vandenbosch@hetnet.nl

Chapter 20

H. C. Mastwijk* and P. V. Bartels
Food Technology Centre
Wageningen UR
Postbus 9101
6700 HB Wageningen
The Netherlands

email: Hennie.Mastwijk@wur.nl

Chapter 21

H. C. Mastwijk,* K. Gulfo-van
Beusekom, I. E. Pol-Hofstad,
H. Schutten, M. Boonman and
P. V. Bartels
Food Technology Centre
Wageningen UR
Postbus 9101
6700 HB Wageningen
The Netherlands

email: Hennie.Mastwijk@wur.nl

Chapter 22

H. F. M. van den Bosch
Schoolstraat 17
5438 AC Gassel
The Netherlands

email: erik.vandenbosch@hetnet.nl

Chapter 23

M. Smith
Director Toxicological Risk
Assessment and Communication
PMI R&D
Quai Jeanrenaud 56
2000 Neuchâtel
Switzerland

email: Maurice.Smith@pmintl.com

Preface

Pulsed electric field (PEF) processing seems to be an ideal and relatively simple solution to the problem of producing shelf stable food products that retain the characteristics of fresh food. Preservation by pulsed electric fields destroys the microorganisms in the food, but colour, flavour and levels of vitamins and antioxidants are unaffected. The technology was conceived almost 100 years ago,¹ but was not pursued seriously until the 1960s. At that time, commercial application was far off and even scaling up of the technology must have seemed close to impossible. In the 1980s, however, when consumers started to question the quality of canned and other foods preserved by thermal methods, novel preservation technologies gradually received more attention from several research groups. Early results tempted Maxwell Technologies in the USA (through a subsidiary named 'PurePulse Technologies') to market PEF equipment for the preservation of food. It transpired, though, that this move was premature. The inactivation of microorganisms by PEF was more complex than envisaged and results of pilot plant studies were disappointing. Maxwell closed down PurePulse Technologies in 2002. In particular, the influence of the equipment on the microbiological results had been greatly underestimated. Attempting to meet consumer demands in Europe and military requirements in the USA, governments supported further research in collaboration with the food industry. In the Netherlands, a large research and development consortium was established, consisting of several research institutes and R&D departments of multinational food companies. They worked in co-operation with engineers from the High-Voltage Laboratory of the Technological University of Delft, who were to deal with the electrotechnical challenges involved in PEF preservation of food. The project resulted in the development and testing of a fairly large scale pilot plant and the establishment of rules for scale-up to production size.

Despite the significant progress made this decade, which is due to the co-

¹ A.K. Anderson and R. Finkelstein, Electro-Pure process of treating milk, *Journal of Dairy Science* 2 (1919), 374–407.

operation of many scientists, engineers and technologists, in particular in Europe and the USA, application is still very limited. It is hoped that this book will show that the technology is maturing rapidly and that it will help industry to overcome its hesitations regarding preservation of food by pulsed electric fields.

For a new food preservation technology to be introduced, insight is not only required into the effects of the technology on the inactivation of microorganisms and enzymes and on product nutritional and organoleptic characteristics; this book therefore also covers occupational safety, toxicological aspects, consumer acceptance, regulatory requirements and the promising economic aspects of PEF technology. Combining the technology with other preservation methods has not been forgotten and last, but not least, we have included a chapter discussing the potential future developments of PEF technology, which may include the preservation of food by PEF after packaging.

Huub Lelieveld, Servé Notermans and Sjoerd de Haan

Contents

<i>Contributor contact details</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xix</i>
1 Preservation of food by pulsed electric fields: An introduction.....	1
<i>S. Notermans, Foundation Food Micro and Innovation, The Netherlands</i>	
1.1 The need to preserve food	1
1.2 Major preservation technologies	3
1.3 Current developments and demands	5
1.4 Current needs	5
1.5 References	7
2 History of pulsed electric field treatment	9
<i>S. Toepfl, V. Heinz, Deutsches Institut für Lebensmitteltechnik (DIL) e.V., Germany, and D. Knorr, Berlin University of Technology, Germany</i>	
2.1 Introduction	9
2.2 The evolution of PEF techniques	10
2.3 Research work on PEF applications from 1980s to 2004	19
2.4 Applications of PEF in food and bio-processing	24
2.5 Present situation and future industrial exploitation	28
2.6 Outlook and conclusions	30
2.7 References	31
Part I Technology	
3 Circuitry and pulse shapes in pulsed electric field treatment of food	43
<i>S. W. H. de Haan, Delft University of Technology, The Netherlands</i>	
3.1 Introduction	43
3.2 Requirements	44

3.3	Pulse shapes	47
3.4	Circuitry	48
3.5	Switches	57
3.6	Other components	60
3.7	Examples of applied systems	61
3.8	Miscellaneous	63
3.9	Trends in pulsed power technology	66
3.10	Sources of further information	67
3.11	References	67
4	Chamber design and process conditions for pulsed electric field treatment of food	70
<i>H. F. M. van den Bosch (formerly Delft University of Technology), The Netherlands</i>		
4.1	Introduction	70
4.2	Chamber geometries	70
4.3	Electric field calculations	75
4.4	Residence time distribution	78
4.5	Wall temperature	79
4.6	Experimental set-up	84
4.7	Temperature measurements	85
4.8	Other experimental results	89
4.9	Conclusions and future trends	91
4.10	References	92
5	Electrochemistry in pulsed electric field treatment chambers	94
<i>B. Roodenburg, Delft University of Technology, The Netherlands</i>		
5.1	Introduction	94
5.2	Theory	95
5.3	Experiments	100
5.4	Treatment chamber lifetime	105
5.5	Legislation	105
5.6	Conclusions	106
5.7	References	106
6	Hygienic design for pulsed electric field installations	108
<i>C. Smit and W. de Haan, Stork Food & Dairy Systems, The Netherlands</i>		
6.1	Introduction	108
6.2	Hygienic demands	109
6.3	Construction elements	109
6.4	Process aspects	110
6.5	Conclusions	117
6.6	References	117

7 Technical and occupational safety requirements when treating foods by pulsed electric fields	118
<i>P. H. F. Morshuis, Delft University of Technology, The Netherlands</i>	
7.1 Introduction	118
7.2 Potential safety hazards	118
7.3 Technical safety requirements	120
7.4 Occupational safety requirements	121
7.5 Food safety	122
7.6 Conclusions	123
7.7 References	123
Part II Product safety and quality	
8 Microbial inactivation kinetics of pulsed electric field treatment	127
<i>M. B. Fox, NIZO Food Research, The Netherlands</i>	
8.1 Introduction	127
8.2 Factors affecting inactivation kinetics	127
8.3 Kinetic models	130
8.4 Discussion	133
8.5 Sources of further information	133
8.6 References	134
9 Probable mechanisms of microorganism inactivation by pulsed electric fields	138
<i>G. Saulis, Vytautas Magnus University, Lithuania, and P. C. Wouters, Unilever Research & Development Vlaardingen, The Netherlands</i>	
9.1 Introduction	138
9.2 Models used for the description of inactivation kinetics	139
9.3 Mechanisms of microorganism inactivation by PEF	140
9.4 Discussion	148
9.5 Future trends	150
9.6 Sources of further information	150
9.7 Acknowledgements	151
9.8 References	151
10 Adaptation potential of microorganisms treated by pulsed electric fields	156
<i>D. Rodrigo, M. Zúñiga, A. Rivas and A. Martínez, Instituto de Agroquímica y Tecnología de Alimentos, Spain, and S. Notermans, Foundation Food Micro and Innovation, The Netherlands</i>	
10.1 Introduction	156
10.2 Pulsed electric field technology	157

10.3	Sub-lethal damage from PEF	157
10.4	Possibility of transformation	159
10.5	Assessment of the risk of transforming <i>Lact. casei</i> by PEF treatment	160
10.6	Results and discussion	161
10.7	Conclusions	163
10.8	References	163
11	Hurdle technology and the preservation of food by pulsed electric fields	165
<i>I. Álvarez, University of Zaragoza, Spain, and V. Heinz, Deutsches Institut für Lebensmitteltechnik (DIL) e.V., Germany</i>		
11.1	Introduction	165
11.2	Combination of PEF and temperature	167
11.3	Combination of PEF and pH	169
11.4	Combination of PEF and antimicrobials	170
11.5	Combination of PEF and high pressure	172
11.6	Combination of PEF and ultrasound	173
11.7	Future trends	174
11.8	Sources of further information	174
11.9	References	175
12	Validating the safety of foods treated by pulsed electric fields	178
<i>L. Keener, International Product Safety Consultants, Inc, USA</i>		
12.1	Introduction	178
12.2	Regulatory considerations	179
12.3	General principles of process validation	182
12.4	Validating PEF-treated products	185
12.5	Validating the process performance	190
12.6	Future trends	195
12.7	Conclusions	196
12.8	Summary	198
12.9	References	198
12.10	Bibliography	200
13	Toxicological aspects of preservation of food by pulsed electric fields	201
<i>A. M. Matser, H. J. Schutten, H. C. Mastwijk, Food Technology Centre Wageningen UR, The Netherlands, and A. Lommen, RIKILT–Institute of Food Safety, The Netherlands</i>		
13.1	Introduction	201
13.2	Sources of possible toxicological hazards	202
13.3	Metal release by electrode degradation	203
13.4	Electrochemistry	204
13.5	Possible changes in PEF-treated products: Substantial equivalence study	205

13.6	Conclusions and future trends	209
13.7	Acknowledgement	210
13.8	References	210
14	Impact of pulsed electric fields on food enzymes and shelf-life	212
<i>P. Elez-Martínez, O. Martín-Belloso, Universitat de Lleida, Spain and D. Rodrigo, F. Sampedro, Instituto de Agroquímica y Tecnología de Alimentos, Spain</i>		
14.1	Introduction	212
14.2	Enzyme inactivation by PEF	212
14.3	Shelf-life of food processed by PEF	227
14.4	Future trends	241
14.5	Nomenclature	242
14.6	References	242
Part III Applications		
15	Public acceptance of pulsed electric field processing	249
<i>L. Frewer and A. Fischer, Social Sciences Group Wageningen UR, The Netherlands</i>		
15.1	Introduction	249
15.2	A historical perspective on risk communication	250
15.3	The psychology of risk	252
15.4	The introduction of GM foods in Europe	253
15.5	Consumer perceptions of risk management	253
15.6	Other issues of relevance to the introduction of PEF technology	254
15.7	References	254
16	Economic aspects of pulsed electric field treatment of food	257
<i>H. Hoogland, Unilever Research & Development Vlaardingen, The Netherlands, and W. de Haan, Stork Food & Dairy Systems, The Netherlands</i>		
16.1	Introduction	257
16.2	PEF for pasteurisation	258
16.3	PEF as a processing aid	262
16.4	Quality	263
16.5	Conclusions	264
16.6	Acknowledgements	264
16.7	References	265
17	Applications of pulsed electric fields for food preservation	266
<i>B. Altunakar, S. R. Gurram and G. V. Barbosa-Cánovas, Washington State University, USA</i>		
17.1	Introduction	266
17.2	Historical overview	267