

THE CAMBRIDGE
COMPANION TO
ABELARD

Edited by
Jeffrey E. Brower and Kevin Guilfooy

The Cambridge Companion to
ABELARD

Edited by

Jeffrey E. Brower

Purdue University

and

Kevin Guilfooy

University of Akron



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK

40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Trump Medieval 10/13 pt. *System* L^AT_EX 2_ε [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 77247 8 hardback

ISBN 0 521 77596 5 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ABELARD

Each volume of this series of companions to major philosophers contains specially commissioned essays by an international team of scholars, together with a substantial bibliography, and will serve as a reference work for students and non-specialists. One aim of the series is to dispel the intimidation such readers often feel when faced with the work of a difficult and challenging thinker.

Peter Abelard (1079–1142) is one of the greatest philosophers of the medieval period. Although best known for his views about universals and his dramatic love affair with Heloise, he made a number of important contributions in metaphysics, logic, philosophy of language, mind and cognition, philosophical theology, ethics, and literature. The essays in this volume survey the entire range of Abelard's thought, and examine his overall intellectual achievement in its intellectual and historical context. They also trace Abelard's influence on later thought and his relevance to philosophical debates today.

New readers will find this the most convenient, accessible guide to Abelard currently available. Advanced students and specialists will find a conspectus of recent developments in the interpretation of Abelard.

JEFFREY E. BROWER is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Purdue University, Indiana.

KEVIN GUILFOY is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Akron, Ohio.

OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS

AQUINAS *Edited by* NORMAN KRETZMANN *and*

ELEONORE STUMP

HANNAH ARENDT *Edited by* DANA VILLA

ARISTOTLE *Edited by* JONATHAN BARNES

AUGUSTINE *Edited by* ELEONORE STUMP *and*

NORMAN KRETZMANN

BACON *Edited by* MARKKU PELTONEN

SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR *Edited by* CLAUDIA CARD

DARWIN *Edited by* JONATHAN HODGE *and*

GREGORY RADICK

DESCARTES *Edited by* JOHN COTTINGHAM

DUNS SCOTUS *Edited by* THOMAS WILLIAMS

EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. A. LONG

FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* MIRANDA

FRICKER *and* JENNIFER HORNSBY

FOUCAULT *Edited by* GARY GUTTING

FREUD *Edited by* JEROME NEU

GADAMER *Edited by* ROBERT J. DOSTAL

GALILEO *Edited by* PETER MACHAMER

GERMAN IDEALISM *Edited by* KARL AMERIKS

GREEK AND ROMAN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*

DAVID SEDLEY

HABERMAS *Edited by* STEPHEN K. WHITE

HEGEL *Edited by* FREDERICK BEISER

HEIDEGGER *Edited by* CHARLES GUIGNON

HOBBS *Edited by* TOM SORELL

HUME *Edited by* DAVID FATE NORTON

HUSSERL *Edited by* BARRY SMITH *and* DAVID

WOODRUFF SMITH

WILLIAM JAMES *Edited by* RUTH ANNA PUTNAM

KANT *Edited by* PAUL GUYER

KIERKEGAARD *Edited by* ALASTAIR HANNAY *and*

GORDON MARINO

LEIBNIZ *Edited by* NICHOLAS JOLLEY

LEVINAS *Edited by* SIMON CRITCHLEY *and* ROBERT

BERNASCONI

LOCKE *Edited by* VERE CHAPPELL

MALEBRANCHE *Edited by* STEVEN NADLER

MARX *Edited by* TERRELL CARVER
MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. S. MCGRADIE
MEDIEVAL JEWISH PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*
DANIEL H. FRANK *and* OLIVER LEAMAN
MILL *Edited by* JOHN SKORUPSKI
NEWTON *Edited by* I. BERNARD COHEN *and*
GEORGE E. SMITH
NIETZSCHE *Edited by* BERND MAGNUS *and*
KATHLEEN HIGGINS
OCKHAM *Edited by* PAUL VINCENT SPADE
PASCAL *Edited by* NICHOLAS HAMMOND
PLATO *Edited by* RICHARD KRAUT
PLOTINUS *Edited by* LLOYD P. GERSON
RAWLS *Edited by* SAMUEL FREEMAN
THOMAS REID *Edited by* TERENCE CUNEO *and* RENE
VAN WOUDEBERG
ROUSSEAU *Edited by* PATRICK RILEY
BERTRAND RUSSELL *Edited by* NICHOLAS GRIFFIN
SARTRE *Edited by* CHRISTINA HOWELLS
SCHOPENHAUER *Edited by* CHRISTOPHER JANAWAY
THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT *Edited by*
ALEXANDER BROADIE
SPINOZA *Edited by* DON GARRETT
THE STOICS *Edited by* BRAD INWOOD
WITTGENSTEIN *Edited by* HANS SLUGA *and*
DAVID STERN

For Janice and Margaret

CONTRIBUTORS

JEFFREY E. BROWER is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Purdue University. He is editor of a special issue of *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* devoted to Peter Abelard, and author of several publications on medieval philosophy and philosophy of religion. His recent articles include "Medieval theories of relations" in the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* and "Anselm's ethics" in *The Cambridge Companion to Anselm*.

KEVIN GUILFOY is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Akron. He is the author of several articles on Abelard's logic and ethics, as well as the entries on John of Salisbury and William of Champeaux in the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

YUKIO IWAKUMA is Professor in the Center for Arts and Sciences, Fukui Prefectural University, Japan. He has written widely on issues in twelfth-century logic and his many articles include "Twelfth century Nominales: the posthumous school of Peter Abelard," "Vocales, or early Nominalists," and "Pierre Abelard et Guillaume de Champeaux dans les premières années du XIIe siècle: une etude préliminaire."

KLAUS JACOBI is Professor of Philosophy (emeritus), Albert-Ludwig University of Freiburg. He has written widely on issues in medieval philosophy, language, and logic and is co-editor (with Christian Strub) of the forthcoming critical edition of Abelard's *Logica "ingredientibus"* commentary on Aristotle's *De Interpretatione*.

PETER KING is Professor of Philosophy and of Medieval Studies at the University of Toronto. He is translator of *John Buridan's Logic: The Treatise on Supposition, The Treatise on Consequences* and of

Augustine: Against the Academics and The Teacher and has written extensively on topics in medieval philosophy. His recent articles include contributions to the *Cambridge Companions* to Duns Scotus and Ockham.

WILLIAM E. MANN is Marsh Professor of Intellectual and Moral Philosophy at the University of Vermont. He has written extensively on topics in medieval philosophy and the philosophy of religion. His recent articles include "Augustine on evil and original sin" in *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* and "Duns Scotus on natural and supernatural knowledge of God" in *The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus*.

JOHN MARENBO is Tutorial Fellow and Lecturer in the History of Philosophy, Trinity College, University of Cambridge. He is the author of *The Philosophy of Peter Abelard* and *From the Circle of Alcuin to the School of Auxerre*, both published by Cambridge University Press, and is editor of *The Routledge History of Philosophy*, vol. III: *The Middle Ages*. He has also written numerous articles on medieval philosophy, especially concerning the development of the medieval Aristotelian logical tradition.

CHRISTOPHER J. MARTIN is Associate Professor in Philosophy at the University of Auckland, New Zealand. He is author of a number of articles in medieval philosophy and logic, including "The logic of the Nominales," "Boethius and the logic of negation," and "William's machine."

WINTHROP WETHERBEE is Avalon Foundation Professor in the Humanities at Cornell University. He is translator of Bernardus Silvestris's *Cosmographia* and author of *Platonism and Poetry in the Twelfth Century*. He has written extensively on Chaucer, Dante, Middle English, classical and medieval Latin, Old French poetry, and medieval literary criticism. His recent articles include "Philosophy, commentary, and mythic narrative in twelfth-century France" and "Dante Alighieri" in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

THOMAS WILLIAMS is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. He is translator of Augustine's *On Free Choice of the Will* and Anselm's *Monologion* and *Proslogion* and *Three*

Philosophical Dialogues: On Truth, On Freedom of Choice, On the Fall of the Devil. He is also editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus* and his recent articles include contributions to the *Cambridge Companions* to Augustine, Anselm, and Medieval Philosophy.

METHOD OF CITATION AND ABBREVIATIONS

With the exception of manuscripts and texts of Abelard, the complete bibliographical information for each of the works cited may be found in the list of references at the end of this volume. In the case of manuscripts, full details are given in the notes of particular chapters. In the case of Abelard's works, full details are given in the list of his writings in the appendix at the end of the volume.

Primary sources are cited in as abbreviated a form as will allow readers to locate passages readily in the original Latin and (where available) English translations. Such references are often given as in-text citations to standard internal divisions of primary sources, but where a more precise location is needed – as in the case of most references to Abelard – page and line numbers of the relevant Latin edition are also included. All other references are given (in chapter notes) by author and date. (NB: references to the English translations of Abelard in Spade 1994 and 1995, which are included wherever possible, are given by paragraph rather than by page number throughout.)

References to Abelard are given according to the following abbreviations:

<i>ad Ast.</i>	<i>Carmen ad Astralabium</i>
<i>Apol.</i>	<i>Apologia contra Bernardum</i>
<i>Coll.</i>	<i>Collationes</i>
<i>Comm. cant.</i>	<i>Commentarius cantabrigiensis in Epistolas Pauli</i>
<i>Comm. Rom.</i>	<i>Commentaria in Epistolam Pauli ad Romanos</i>

<i>Dial.</i>	<i>Dialectica</i>
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistola</i>
<i>HC</i>	<i>Historia calamitatum</i>
<i>Hex.</i>	<i>Expositio in Hexameron</i>
<i>IP (Isag., Cat., De in., De. Div., Top.)</i>	<i>Introductiones parvulorum</i> (or literal glosses on Porphyry's <i>Isagoge</i> , Aristotle's <i>Categories</i> and <i>De interpretatione</i> , and Boethius's <i>De divisione</i> and <i>De topicis differentiis</i>)
<i>LI (Isag., Cat., De in., Top.)</i>	<i>Logica "ingredientibus"</i> (glosses on Porphyry's <i>Isagoge</i> , Aristotle's <i>Categories</i> and <i>De interpretatione</i> , and Boethius's <i>De topicis differentiis</i> . References prefixed by a "G" or "MP" refer, respectively, to the editions in Geyer 1927 and Minio-Paluello 1956)
<i>LNPS</i>	<i>Logica "nostrorum petiti sociorum"</i>
<i>Problemata</i>	<i>Problemata Heloisae cum Petri Abaelardi Solutionibus</i>
<i>Sc.</i>	<i>Scito te Ipsum (= Ethica)</i>
<i>Secundum mag. Petrum.</i>	<i>Secundum magistrum Petrum sententie</i>
<i>Sent. Flor.</i>	<i>Sententie Florianenses</i>
<i>Sent. Herm.</i>	<i>Sententie Hermanni (= Sententie Abaelardi)</i>
<i>Sent. magistri Petri</i>	<i>Sententie magistri Petri</i>
<i>Sent. Par.</i>	<i>Sententie Parisienses</i>
<i>Serm.</i>	<i>Sermones</i>
<i>TC</i>	<i>Theologia Christiana</i>
<i>TSB</i>	<i>Theologia "summi boni"</i>
<i>TSch</i>	<i>Theologia "scholarium"</i>
<i>TI</i>	<i>Tractatus de intellectibus</i>

References to Aristotle are given according to the following abbreviations:

<i>Cat.</i>	<i>Categories</i> (references prefixed by "ed. comp." refer to the medieval Latin translation of the <i>Categories</i> known as "composite edition," edited in Minio-Paluello 1961)
<i>De in.</i>	<i>De interpretatione (= Peri hermeneias)</i>
<i>Metaph.</i>	<i>Metaphysics</i>

<i>Pr. An.</i>	<i>Prior Analytics</i>
<i>Post. An.</i>	<i>Posterior Analytics</i>
<i>Top.</i>	<i>Topics</i>

References to Boethius are given according to the following abbreviations:

<i>Cons.</i>	<i>De consolatione philosophiae</i>
<i>De div.</i>	<i>De divisione</i>
<i>De hyp. syll.</i>	<i>De syllogismis hypotheticis</i>
<i>De inst. arith.</i>	<i>De institutione arithmetica</i>
<i>De top. diff.</i>	<i>De topicis differentiis</i>
<i>De Trin.</i>	<i>De Trinitate</i>
<i>In Cat.</i>	<i>In Categorias Aristotelis libri quattuor</i>
<i>In Cic. Top.</i>	<i>In Topica Ciceronis commentariorum libri sex</i>
<i>In De in. maior</i>	<i>In De interpretatione Aristotelis commentarius maior</i>
<i>In De in. minor</i>	<i>In De interpretatione Aristotelis commentarius minor</i>
<i>In Isag. maior</i>	<i>In Isagogen Porphyrii commentarius maior</i>
<i>In Isag. minor</i>	<i>In Isagogen Porphyrii commentarius minor</i>

Finally, references to the works of certain other authors are given according to the following abbreviations:

<i>De civ. Dei</i>	Augustine, <i>De civitate Dei</i>
<i>Inst.</i>	Priscian, <i>Institutiones grammaticae</i>
<i>Isag.</i>	Porphyry, <i>Isagoge</i>
<i>ST</i>	Aquinas, <i>Summa Theologiae</i>

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

It is a pleasure to acknowledge the help, encouragement, and advice that we have received from a number of friends and colleagues in the course of preparing this volume. To begin, we want to thank three individuals who were especially helpful at the beginning stages of this project: the late Norman Kretzmann, who offered invaluable suggestions on an early draft of our prospectus; Eleonore Stump, who showed us how to improve it immensely; and Scott MacDonald, who has given us expert advice and support at every step of the way.

We are also very grateful for the encouragement and expert advice given to us by Susan Brower-Toland, Jean Field, Terry Foreman, Hilary Gaskin, Peter King, John Marenbon, Robert Pasnau, Paul Spade, and Thomas Williams. Without the help of these people, this volume would never have reached completion.

Finally, we want to thank the two people whose friendship and support we cherish the most – our wives, Janice and Margaret. It is to you that this volume is dedicated.

CHRONOLOGY

- 1079 Born of minor nobility at La Pallet (near Nantes).
- 1092–1099 Studies with Roscelin sometime during this period (either immediately before 1092, when Roscelin is tried for heresy, or some time later in the 1090s, or during both periods).
- 1100 Arrives at Paris to study logic with William of Champeaux.
- 1102–1104 Establishes school of logic at Melun, then transfers it to Corbeil; perhaps writes series of commentaries known as the *Introductiones parvulorum*.
- 1108–1110 Studies rhetoric at Paris with William of Champeaux; defeats William in disputation over universals; teaches briefly at school of Notre Dame.
- 1110–1112 Reestablishes school at Melun, then transfers it to Mont Ste. Geneviève.
- 1113 Studies theology with Anselm of Laon.
- 1114 Teaches at Notre Dame (until 1117); perhaps begins writing his most famous logical works, *Logica “ingredientibus”* and *Dialectica* (between 1114 and 1121).
- 1115/1116 Begins affair with Heloise.
- 1117 Secretly marries Heloise (after the discovery of her pregnancy); Astralabe’s birth; Abelard’s castration.
- 1118 Enters monastery at St. Denis; implores Heloise to become a nun.
- 1121–1122 First version of *Theologia* (“*summi boni*”) condemned at Soissons.

- 1126/1128 Appointed Abbot of St. Gildas; retires from public teaching.
- 1133 Resumes teaching at Paris (until 1140/1141); around this time writes his major ethical treatises, *Scito te ipsum* and *Collationes*.
- 1140/1141 Revised version of *Theologia* ("scholarium") condemned at Council of Sens; Abelard and his followers excommunicated.
- 1141 Stops at Cluny on his way to Rome to appeal the sentence at Sens; excommunication is revoked.
- 1142 21 April, dies at Cluny.

CONTENTS

<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>Method of citation and abbreviations</i>	xiv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
<i>Chronology</i>	xviii
Introduction	I
JEFFREY E. BROWER AND KEVIN GUILFOY	
1 Life, milieu, and intellectual contexts	13
JOHN MARENBOON	
2 Literary works	45
WINTHROP WETHERBEE	
3 Metaphysics	65
PETER KING	
4 Philosophy of language	126
KLAUS JACOBI	
5 Logic	158
CHRISTOPHER J. MARTIN	
6 Mind and cognition	200
KEVIN GUILFOY	
7 Trinity	223
JEFFREY E. BROWER	
8 Sin, grace, and redemption	258
THOMAS WILLIAMS	