



THE WORLD BANK

SOVEREIGN DEBT AND THE **FINANCIAL CRISIS**

**Will
This Time
Be Different?**

Edited by

**Carlos A. Primo Braga
Gallina A. Vincelette**



© 2011 The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank
1818 H Street, NW
Washington, DC 20433
Telephone: 202-473-1000
Internet: www.worldbank.org

All rights reserved
1 2 3 4 14 13 12 11

This volume is a product of the staff of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this volume do not necessarily reflect the views of the Executive Directors of The World Bank or the governments they represent.

The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgement on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Rights and Permissions

The material in this publication is copyrighted. Copying and/or transmitting portions or all of this work without permission may be a violation of applicable law. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank encourages dissemination of its work and will normally grant permission to reproduce portions of the work promptly.

For permission to photocopy or reprint any part of this work, please send a request with complete information to the Copyright Clearance Center Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA; telephone: 978-750-8400; fax: 978-750-4470; Internet: www.copyright.com.

All other queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to the Office of the Publisher, The World Bank, 1818 H Street, NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA; fax: 202-522-2422; e-mail: pubrights@worldbank.org.

ISBN: 978-0-8213-8483-1
eISBN: 978-0-8213-8543-2
DOI: 10.1596/978-0-8213-8483-1

Cover images

Image Source/Getty Images; Benson HE, 2010 Used under license from Shutterstock.com;
Andre Blais, 2010 Used under license from Shutterstock.com

Cover design

Ruth: Edelman Integrated Marketing

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data has been applied for.

Foreword

This volume on managing sovereign debt in the context of the financial crisis is extremely timely. Governments—especially governments in many affluent countries—will be heavily engaged over the next five years in reducing their fiscal deficits and managing large public debt portfolios.

Managers of sovereign debt shoulder enormous responsibilities in securing funding, structuring debt portfolios to best meet cost and risk objectives, and meeting other debt management goals, such as developing an efficient domestic market for government securities and managing the government's contingent liabilities. Government debt managers manage what is usually the largest debt portfolio in the country and the largest liability on the government's balance sheet. These portfolios can contain risky exposures, including significant proportions of foreign currency-linked and short-term debt. Because they represent the government in negotiating, structuring, and executing transactions, debt managers also carry important reputational responsibilities and risk for the government.

Government debt managers have faced many challenges over the past 10 years. Around the middle of the decade, the global economy grew at its most rapid rate in 40 years. Fiscal positions steadily improved; in several advanced countries, government debt managers faced the prospect of managing a contracting stock of public debt and debated the merits of maintaining a sizable and liquid government bond market. Governments in many emerging market countries extended their yield curves, as foreign investors increased their currency and interest rate exposure and domestic institutions invested more in government securities following reforms to the pension and insurance sectors. These governments also increased the maturity of their debt portfolios and reduced the proportion of foreign currency-denominated debt.

The recent financial crisis originated in the advanced countries. It demonstrated how all of the elements that form the Basel II pillars, including market discipline, could fail in a G-7 economy, creating economic instability on a global scale. The crisis markedly increased the complexity of the challenges confronting government debt managers. Fiscal positions rapidly deteriorated, competition for funding dramatically increased, governments

were forced into new roles, and well-established policy frameworks were soon tested by the markets.

Long-serving fiscal management frameworks that were based on medium-term policy settings and nominal anchors—such as golden rules, deficit- and debt-to-GDP targets, and fiscal responsibility legislation—were overwhelmed, as was the carefully designed signaling and transmission architecture that separated fiscal, monetary, financial, and debt management policies. Policy signals started to blur when governments became guarantors and investors of last resort and took on ownership interests outside their traditional risk habitat and risk tolerance. At a time when the funding needs of governments and corporations increased, many emerging market issuers found themselves locked out of the global capital market for extended periods or were able to access the market only for restricted amounts and for short maturities at much higher spreads than before the crisis.

Challenging times lie ahead for government debt managers. Funding costs are likely to increase as the competition for savings intensifies and governments strengthen their banking systems and continue their structural reforms. Many governments have taken over quasi-public and private sector debt obligations and provided a range of guarantees and other contingent undertakings that will need to be monitored and managed by budget teams and government debt managers.

Fortunately, nations are much better equipped to manage these responsibilities than they were 15 years ago. They have absorbed the lessons from the 1998/99 Asian crisis and subsequent contagion, and they have made impressive progress in strengthening governance arrangements and developing sound debt management strategies that reflect the government's cost and risk preferences. Governments have also improved their monitoring and assessment of risk and performance by investing heavily in the human capital and management information systems needed for sound government debt management. All of this experience will be needed in navigating the path ahead.

Graeme Wheeler
Former Managing Director of Operations and
former Treasurer and Vice President
World Bank
Former Treasurer of the Debt Management Office
Government of New Zealand

Acknowledgments

In addition to the individual authors, this volume benefited from the input and support of many people, to whom we are very grateful. We would especially like to thank Otaviano Canuto, Vice President of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) Network at the World Bank, for his support for this project.

We greatly appreciate the input from the participants and speakers at the Sovereign Debt and Financial Crisis conference held in Tunis, Tunisia, March 29–30, 2010, co-organized by the World Bank and the African Development Bank, as well as the related conference in Washington, DC, held June 9, 2010. We extend our gratitude to the discussants and the chairs of the two events, many of whom contributed to this book. Special thanks go to Nicole P. F. Bollen, Maria Cannata, Jaime Coronado, Carlo Cottarelli, Claire Cheremetinski, E. Whitney Debevoise, Thomas A. Duvall, Anna Gelpern, Indermit Gill, Marcelo Giugale, Garth Greubel, Herve Joly, Jürgen Kaiser, David A. Kihangire, Aart Kraay, Nkosana D. Moyo, Baba Yusuf Musa, Aloysius Uche Ordu, Raphael Otieno, Godfred Awa Eddy Penn, Brian Pinto, Yvonne Quansah, Arindam Roy, Raed Safadi, Marie-Ange Saraka-Yao, Gerry Teeling, Graeme Wheeler, and Donna Yearwood, who provided valuable insights and suggestions during the two conferences.

The editors and the authors would also like to thank Sudharshan Canagarajah, Arindam Chanda, Anna Gelpern, Jan Gottschalk, Ivailo Izvorski, Thor-Jurgen Greve Loberg, Jennifer Keller, Mizuho Kida, Naoko Kojo, Auguste Tano Kouame, Aart Kraay, Eduardo Ley, Anne-Marie Leroy, Otavio Medeiros, Michael Pomerleano, Juan Pradelli, Mona Prasad, Maurizio Ragazzi, Frederico Gil Sander, Raju Singh, Michael Tomz, and Sona Varma for their invaluable comments during the review process of the manuscript for this book.

Duane Chilton, Detre Dyson, Ivana Ticha, and Debbie Sturgess, from the World Bank's Economic Policy and Debt Department, provided superb assistance in organizing the two events on Sovereign Debt and the Financial Crisis. We are also grateful for the excellent cooperation with the

African Development Bank in organizing the conference in Tunis. Barbara Karni, Janet Sasser, Sidra Rehman, and Stephen McGroaty were instrumental in the editing and production of this volume. We would like to acknowledge the financial support of the Debt Management Facility, which was essential in making this book a reality.

This book is dedicated to the memory of Dana Weist, a friend, mentor, and guide to many who contributed to this book and many more besides. We will remember her for her beauty, grace, wisdom, and energy.

Contributors

Faisal Ahmed is an economist in the Monetary and Capital Markets Department at the International Monetary Fund.

Phillip R. D. Anderson is acting director of the Banking and Debt Management Department at the World Bank Treasury.

Luca Bandiera is an economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Dimitri Bellas is an economics student at HEC Paris and ENSAE Paris and a consultant at the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.

Hans J. Blommestein is a head of the Bond Market and Public Debt Management Unit of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.

Mehmet Caner is a professor of economics at North Carolina State University.

Daniel Cohen is a professor of economics at the Ecole Normale Supérieure in Paris and vice president of the Paris School of Economics, which he co-founded.

Jesús Crespo Cuaresma is a professor of economics at the Vienna University of Economics and Business.

Mansoor Dailami is the manager of the Emerging Global Trends Team in the Development Prospects Group at the World Bank.

Udaibir S. Das is an assistant director in the Monetary and Capital Markets Department at the International Monetary Fund.

Dörte Dömeland is a senior economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Edgardo Favaro is a lead economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Eduardo Fernández-Arias is a principal advisor to the Research Department at the Inter-American Development Bank.

Boris Gamarra is a senior economist in the Resource Mobilization Department of the Concessional Finance and Global Partnerships Vice-Presidency of the World Bank.

Sudarshan Gooptu is the sector manager in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Thomas Grennes is a professor of economics at North Carolina State University.

Leonardo Hernández is a lead economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Fritzi Koehler-Geib is an economist in the Economic Policy Group of the Latin American Region at the World Bank.

Ying Li is a consultant in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Yuefen Li is the head of the Debt and Development Finance Branch at the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development.

Lili Liu is a lead economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

William O'Boyle is a consultant in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Rodrigo Olivares-Caminal is a sovereign debt expert in the Debt and Development Finance Branch at the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development.

Ugo Panizza is the chief of the Debt and Finance Analysis Unit in the Division on Globalization and Development Strategies at the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development.

Michael G. Papaioannou is a deputy division chief in the Sovereign Asset and Liability Management Division of the Monetary and Capital Markets Department at the International Monetary Fund.

Christoph G. Paulus is a professor of law at the Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin.

Guilherme Pedras is a technical assistance advisor in the Monetary and Capital Markets Department at the International Monetary Fund.

Iva Petrova is an economist in the Fiscal Affairs Department at the International Monetary Fund.

Juan Pradelli is an economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Abha Prasad is a senior debt specialist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Carlos A. Primo Braga is the director of the Economic Policy and Debt Department in the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Anderson Caputo Silva is a senior debt specialist in the Global Capital Markets Development Department of the Financial and Private Sector Development Vice-Presidency at the World Bank.

Tihomir Stučka is an economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Vivek Suri is a lead economist in the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Sector of the East Asia and Pacific Region at the World Bank.

Jay Surti is an economist in the Monetary and Capital Markets Department at the International Monetary Fund.

Eriko Togo is a senior economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Cécile Valadier is an economist at the Agence Française de Développement.

Ralph Van Doorn is an economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Antonio Velandia-Rubiano is a lead financial officer in the Banking and Debt Management Department at the World Bank Treasury.

Gallina A. Vincelette is a senior economist in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Michael Waibel is a British Academy postdoctoral fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law and Downing College at the University of Cambridge.

Dana Weist was a consultant in the Economic Policy and Debt Department of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank.

Mark L. J. Wright is an assistant professor of economics at the University of California, Los Angeles.

Abbreviations

\$	All dollar amounts are U.S. dollars unless otherwise indicated.
BIS	Bank for International Settlements
BMA	Bayesian model averaging
BOT	Buoni Ordinari del Tesoro
CAC	collective action clause
CAIC	Comisión para la Auditoría Integral del Crédito Público
CARICOM	Caribbean Community
CPI	consumer price index
CPIA	Country Policy and Institutional Assessment
CRC	<i>chambres regionales des comptes</i> (regional chambers of accounts)
DeMPA	Debt Management Performance Assessment
DMF	Debt Management Facility
DMO	debt management office
DRF	Debt Reduction Facility
DSA	Debt Sustainability Analysis
DSF	Debt Sustainability Framework
ECCU	Eastern Caribbean Currency Union
EMBI	Emerging Markets Bond Index
EMBIG	Emerging Markets Bond Index Global
EPFR	Emerging Portfolio Fund Research
EU	European Union
FCL	flexible credit line
FDI	foreign direct investment
GDF	Global Development Finance (database and publication)
GDP	gross domestic product
GNI	gross national income
HIPC	Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (Initiative)
ICSID	International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes
IDA	International Development Association
ILLR	international lender of last resort
IMF	International Monetary Fund

LCU	local currency unit
LLR	lender of last resort
M&A	merger and acquisitions
MDRI	Multilateral Debt Relief Initiative
MFC	most favored creditor
MTDS	Medium-Term Debt Management Strategy
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PIP	posterior inclusion probability
PMG	pooled mean group
PPG	public and publicly guaranteed
PRGF	Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility
QEDS	Quarterly External Debt Statistics
RIC	risk inflation criterion
SAR	Special Administrative Region (China)
S&P	Standard & Poor's
SDR	Special Drawing Rights
SDRM	Sovereign Debt Restructuring Mechanism
SDT	Sovereign Debt Tribunal
TARP	Troubled Asset Relief Program
TIA	Trust Indenture Act
VaR	value at risk
WEO	World Economic Outlook (database and publication)

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Contributors</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xxv</i>

Introduction	1
<i>Carlos A. Primo Braga and Gallina A. Vincelette</i>	

Part I: A New Wave of Sovereign Debt Crises?	13
---	-----------

1	The Sovereign Debt Crisis That Was Not	15
	<i>Daniel Cohen and Cécile Valadier</i>	
2	Unpleasant Surprises: Determinants and Risks of Sovereign Default	45
	<i>Luca Bandiera, Jesús Crespo Cuaresma, and Gallina A. Vincelette</i>	
3	Finding the Tipping Point: When Sovereign Debt Turns Bad	63
	<i>Mehmet Caner, Thomas Grennes, and Fritzi Koehler-Geib</i>	
4	Determinants of Emerging Market Sovereign Bond Spreads	77
	<i>Dimitri Bellas, Michael G. Papaioannou, and Iva Petrova</i>	
5	Sovereign Debt Distress and Corporate Spillover Impacts	101
	<i>Mansoor Dailami</i>	

Part II: The Effects of the Crisis on Debt	127
6 Debt Sustainability and Debt Distress in the Wake of the Ongoing Financial Crisis: The Case of IDA-Only African Countries <i>Leonardo Hernández and Boris Gamarra</i>	129
7 Do Middle-Income Countries Still Have the Ability to Deal with the Global Financial Crisis? <i>Ralph Van Doorn, Vivek Suri, and Sudarshan Gooptu</i>	173
8 Small States, the Financial Crisis, and the Aftermath <i>Edgardo Favaro, Dörte Dömeland, William O'Boyle, and Tihomir Stučka</i>	195
9 Europe's Crisis: Origins and Policy Challenges <i>Edgardo Favaro, Ying Li, Juan Pradelli, and Ralph Van Doorn</i>	221
Part III: Debt Restructuring Mechanisms: Lessons and Beyond	241
10 Avoiding Avoidable Debt Crises: Lessons from Recent Defaults <i>Yuefen Li, Rodrigo Olivares-Caminal, and Ugo Panizza</i>	243
11 Managing Subnational Credit and Default Risks <i>Lili Liu and Michael Waibel</i>	273
12 Restructuring Sovereign Debts with Private Sector Creditors: Theory and Practice <i>Mark L. J. Wright</i>	295
13 A Standing Arbitral Tribunal as a Procedural Solution for Sovereign Debt Restructurings <i>Christoph G. Paulus</i>	317

14	International Lending of Last Resort and Sovereign Debt Restructuring <i>Eduardo Fernández-Arias</i>	331
Part IV: Managing Public Debt in Crises: How Experiences Differ		355
15	Managing Public Debt and Its Financial Stability Implications <i>Udaibir S. Das, Michael G. Papaioannou, Guilherme Pedras, Jay Surti, and Faisal Ahmed</i>	357
16	Public Debt Management in Emerging Market Economies: Has This Time Been Different? <i>Phillip R. D. Anderson, Anderson Caputo Silva, and Antonio Velandia-Rubiano</i>	383
17	Crisis Preparedness and Debt Management in Low-Income Countries: Strengthening Institutions and Policy Frameworks <i>Dana Weist, Eriko Togo, Abha Prasad, and William O'Boyle</i>	413
18	Public Debt Management and Sovereign Risk during the Worst Financial Crisis on Record: Experiences and Lessons from the OECD Area <i>Hans J. Blommestein</i>	449
	Index	467
Boxes		
7.1	The Index of Macroeconomic Space	178
11.1	Subnational Debt Crisis and Reforms in Brazil	277
Figures		
1.1	Number of Defaults per Country, 1970–2007	17
1.2	Number of Defaults per Year, 1970–2007	18
1.3	Number of Defaults per Country Using Modified Definition of Default, 1970–2007	20
1.4	Number of Defaults per Year Using Modified Definition of Default, 1970–2007	21
1.5	Number of Currency Crises per Year, 1970–2007	22

1.6	Number of Banking Crises per Year, 1970–2007	23
4.1	Determinants of EMBI Spreads	87
5.1	Private Corporate Foreign Debt Issuance in Emerging Markets, 1998–2009	103
5.2	Gross Emerging Market Debt, by Sector, 1995–2009	104
5.3	Emerging Market Bond Issuance, by Sector, 1998–2009	105
5.4	Private Corporate Bond Issuance in Emerging Markets, 1995–2009	106
5.5	Projected Emerging Corporate Bond Market Refinancing Needs, 2010–13	107
5.6	Simulation Results for Corporate Bond Prices and Probability of Sovereign Default	111
5.7	Probability Distribution of Project Cash Flow under Two Sovereign Default Scenarios	112
6.1	Quarterly Growth in Goods Exports, March 2007–March 2010	130
6.2	Commodity Prices, January 2006–July 2010	131
6.3	Net Private Capital Flows to Developing Countries, 2000–09	131
6.4	Growth in Remittances to Developing Countries, 2005–11	132
6A.1	Present Value of Debt to GDP Ratio Given 20 Percent Export Shock	159
6A.2	Present Value of Debt to Exports Ratio Given 20 Percent Export Shock	160
6A.3	Present Value of Debt to Revenues Ratio Given 20 Percent Export Shock	161
6A.4	Debt Service to Government Revenues Ratio Given 20 Percent Export Shock	162
6A.5	Debt Service to Exports Ratio Given 20 Percent Export Shock	163
6B.1	Number of Episodes above Threshold	164
6B.2	Sum of Country Averages above Threshold	166
6B.3	Sum of Country Maximum above Threshold	168
7.1	Contributions to Changes in Public Debt to GDP Ratio, 2002–07	176
7.2	Changes in Total External Debt to GDP Ratio, 2002–07	177
7.3	Index of Macroeconomic Space for Selected Countries, End-2007	180
7.4	Changes in Gross Reserves, Exchange Rates, and Spreads over U.S. Treasury Bills between January–August 2008 (Precrisis) and September–December 2008 (during Crisis)	181
7.5	Real GDP Growth, 2007–09	182

7.6	Cyclically Adjusted Primary (Noninterest) Balances, 2007 and 2009	183
7.7	Contributions to Changes in Public Debt to GDP Ratio, 2007–09	183
7.8	Macroeconomic Space Index, End-2007 and End-2009	185
7.9	Gross Public Debt to GDP Ratio, End-2009 and End-2020	188
7.10	Primary Balance Adjustment Required Relative to Historical Primary Balance under Scenarios 1 and 2	189
7.11	Primary Balance Adjustment Required Relative to Historical Primary Balance under Scenarios 1 and 3	190
8.1	Actual and Projected Debt Stock Indicators in Small States, 1990–2014	208
8.2	Actual and Projected Debt Stock Indicators in Small States That Did Not Receive HIPC Initiative Relief, 1990–2014	209
8.3	Actual and Projected Debt Stock Indicators in Small States in Sub-Saharan Africa, 1990–2014	210
8.4	Actual and Projected Debt Stock Indicators in Small States in Latin America and the Caribbean, 1990–2014	210
8.5	Actual and Projected Debt Stock Indicators in Small States in Europe and Central Asia, 1990–2014	211
8.6	Actual and Projected Debt Stock Indicators in Small States in East Asia and Pacific, 1990–2014	212
8.7	Actual and Projected Debt Stock Indicators in Small States in Bhutan and Maldives, 1990–2014	212
8.8	Public Debt to GDP Ratio in Selected Small Countries, 2007–09	213
9.1	Current Account Balances of Euro Area Countries	222
9.2	Foreign Banks' Claims on Assets of Selected European Countries, 1999–2009	223
9.3	Current Account, Savings, and Investment in Selected Euro Area Countries, 1999–2009	224
9.4	Exports by Germany, 1998–2009	226
9.5	Competitiveness of Selected Euro Area Countries, 1999–2009	227
9.6	Net Income Inflows in the Current Account, 1999–2008	228
9.7	Number and Duration of Deflationary Episodes between 1980 and 2008	232
9.8	Cumulative Deflation per Episode	233
9.9	Inflation and Growth in the CFA Zone, 1981–2005	234
9.10	Inflation and Growth in Argentina, 1995–2009	235
9A.1	Decomposition of Growth by Sources of Aggregate Demand in Selected Euro Area Countries	237