

Gloria Abernathy-Lear

Alison Bass

Jacqueline Bobo

Aniko Bodroghkozy

Jane D. Brown

Richard Butsch

David Carter-Whitney

Marsha Cassidy

Chong Heup Cho

Danae Clark

Carol J. Clover

Patricia Hill Collins

Julie D'Acci

Gail Dines

Andrea Dworkin

Barbara Ehrenreich

John Fiske

George Gerbner

Evelina Giobbe

Robert Goldman

Herman Gray

Larry Gross

Stuart Hall

bell hooks

Jean M. Humez

Robert Jensen

Sut Jhally

Richard Katula

Jackson Katz

Douglas Kellner

Jean Kilbourne

Annette Kuhn

James Ledbetter

Janet Lee

Jung S. Lee

Minu Lee

Lisa A. Lewis

K

G

M

GENDER, RACE AND CLASS IN MEDIA

A TEXT-READER

EDITED BY

GAIL DINES & JEAN M. HUMEZ

GENDER, RACE AND CLASS IN MEDIA

A TEXT-READER

EDITED BY

GAIL DINES & JEAN M. HUMEZ



SAGE Publications

International Educational and Professional Publisher

Thousand Oaks London New Delhi

Copyright © 1995 by Sage Publications, Inc.

"Ralph, Fred, Archie and Homer" © 1995 by Richard Butsch

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information address:



SAGE Publications, Inc.
2455 Teller Road
Thousand Oaks, California 91320

SAGE Publications Ltd.
6 Bonhill Street
London EC2A 4PU
United Kingdom

SAGE Publications India Pvt. Ltd.
M-32 Market
Greater Kailash I
New Delhi 110 048 India

Printed in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Main entry under title:

Gender, race, and class in media: A text-reader / edited by Gail
Dines, Jean M. Humez.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Partial Contents: pt. 1. A cultural studies approach to gender,
race, and class in media — pt. 2. Advertising — pt. 3. Modes of
sexual representation I : romance novels and slasher films — pt.
4. Modes of sexual representation II : pornography — pt. 5. TV by
day — pt. 6. TV by night — pt. 7. Music videos and rap music :
cultural conflict and control.

ISBN 0-8039-5163-9. — ISBN 0-8039-5164-7 (pbk.)

1. Sex in mass media—United States. 2. Mass media and sex—
United States. 3. Mass media and race relations—United States.
4. Afro-Americans in mass media—United States. 5. Social classes
in mass media—United States. 6. Mass media—Social aspects—United
States. 7. Popular culture—United States. 8. United States—
Social conditions — 1980— I. Dines, Gail. II. Humez, Jean
McMahon, 1944—
P96.S452U64 1994
306.7—dc20

94-22960

95 96 97 98 99 10 9 8 7 6 5 4

Sage Production Editor: Astrid Viriding

Acknowledgments

In shaping this selection of chapters, we received useful suggestions, contacts, bibliographical information, and critical judgments from many colleagues, friends, and students. We gratefully acknowledge in particular the helpful contributions of: Stanley Aronowitz, Bernice Buresch, Richard Butsch, Hazel Carby, Linda Dittmar, John Downing, Stewart Ewen, Fred Feijes, John Fiske, George Gerbner, Richard Goldman, Herman Gray, Sut Jhally, Jackson Katz, Peter Kiang, Doug Kellner, Sarah Kurko, Cheryl Lees, Justin Lewis, Karen Lindsey, Theresa Perry, Jane Rhodes, Ann Russo, Erin Senack, Valerie Smith, Pat Turner, Ellen Wartella, and Mary Helen Washington.

Preface

Goals and Assumptions of This Reader

This reader is intended to introduce undergraduate students to some of the richness, sophistication and diversity that characterizes contemporary media scholarship in a way that is accessible and builds on students' own media experiences and interests. We aim to help demystify the nature of media culture by examining its production, construction and the meaning-making processes by which media imagery or messages help shape our personal, social and political worlds. Our ultimate goal is a more media-literate and activist public.

The editors are both teachers of undergraduate courses in media studies, sociology, literature, and interdisciplinary women's studies. We both have a strong interest in antiracist feminism and progressive social activism. In our own teaching, we have had difficulty finding in one volume the kinds of current articles by media critics and activists that (a) would introduce the most powerful theoretical concepts in contemporary media studies, (b) survey some of the most influential and interesting genres of contemporary media, and (c) focus on issues of gender, class and race from a critical perspective. We designed this volume to do these three things.

Most of the readings in this book take an explicitly critical political perspective. They assume, as we do, that Western industrialized societies such as our own are stratified along lines of **race**, **class** and **gender**;¹ that everyone living in such a society "has" race, class and gender as well as other aspects of social identity that help structure our experience; and that economic and other resources, advantages and privileges are distributed in-

equitably in part because of power dynamics involving these categories of experience (as well as others). We believe that one goal of a critical education is to enable people to conceptualize social justice more clearly and work toward it more effectively. For us, greater social justice would mean fairer distribution of our society's cultural and economic resources.

Contemporary (multicultural) cultural studies argues that many dimensions of social stratification influence the unequal distribution of power and resources in our society. **Racism, sexism, classism, heterosexism**, ageism, ableism and others—each system of social domination has its own separate history, dynamic, conditions of existence and material and ideological components. Moreover, each has produced its own social movement in the 20th-century United States—including the labor movement, the civil rights movement, the farmworkers' and Native American rights movements, the women's and gay/lesbian liberation movements and the disability rights movement. Each of these social movements has generated changed consciousness, the desire to change institutions and some real institutional change—although never as much as activists in these movements have sought. To a large extent, moreover, participants in one movement have developed ideology and learned strategy in part from those who have gone before.

Since the 1960s, each of these social movements has criticized media imagery for **stereotyping** and "**symbolic annihilation**" (the latter term, coined by George Gerbner, is used by Larry Gross in "Out of the Mainstream: Sexual Minorities and the Mass Media," Chapter 9) and has worked to change media imagery directly. Through demonstrations, testimony at congressional hearings, press conferences, published critiques and the creation of alternative cultural products, social groups conscious of their cultural marginalization have repeatedly attempted to raise consciousness and influence public opinion and public media policy.

These social movements have also produced educational reform movements within the educational institutions where knowledge is generated and transmitted. In the 1960s and 1970s, faculty and students with changed consciousness influenced college and university curricula in significant ways, through pointing out and resisting former social denigration, stereotyping, exclusion and institutional power imbalances—witness the development of such fields as Black or African American studies, Chicano, Latino, Native American, Asian American, and Third World or ethnic studies, as well as women's studies or feminist studies and labor studies.

In bringing the critical insights of activists into the academy, however, scholars have inevitably transformed the language of activism into academic discourse, for better or for worse. Thus powerful political ideas such as "media stereotyping" have been reconceptualized in ways that incorporate a more complex analysis of how media culture operates within a society characterized by social and economic inequality, as the articles in this reader will demonstrate.

In the 1990s, the insights of those critical groups who are still marginalized in academia are effecting research and teaching beyond the self-contained academic units in which they have been institutionalized (such as

Black studies or women's studies). Although the movement toward a more "multicultural" curriculum has detractors and critics, it is the most recent manifestation in colleges and universities of the impulse to change the paradigms of knowledge in ways that will help promote a more egalitarian society.

Media studies today is a complex, **multidisciplinary** and international field that has both resisted and embraced socially critical perspectives. The social movement to have influenced media studies the most dramatically so far has undoubtedly been the women's movement. Although feminists outside of the field of communications had been publishing important critiques of media imagery of women since Betty Friedan's (1963) analysis of women's magazines, in the *Feminine Mystique*, it was not until the late 1970s that feminists within the field had articles and anthologies that could be used in media education—notably, Gaye Tuchman's (1978) *Hearth and Home* and Butler and Paisley's (1980) *Women and the Mass Media*. But by the mid 1980s, **feminist media theory and criticism** had become a major research and publication area, and it continues to be a central approach today (Kaplan, 1987).

The major tasks of feminist work in media studies so far have been (a) making visible the *patriarchal* domination of media industries, in terms of both ownership and *representation*; (b) critiquing the male biases in the field of study itself; (c) bringing formerly neglected and undervalued "**women's genres**" (cultural entertainment forms targeting women audiences) to the foreground as legitimate areas of study; (d) beginning an examination of women's experiences as consumers of media imagery; and (e) encouraging women media producers to experiment with new approaches and themes.

This feminist work in media studies has not been without its critics—most notably women of color. **Black feminist theorists** in particular have argued that (White) feminist theory has been largely blind to the way that women experience the world, not just as gendered but also as racialized and class-located beings (e.g., Bobo & Seiter, 1991; Hill Collins, 1990; hooks, 1990; see also Gaines, 1988). This is part of a wider critique of media studies by scholars of color, who rightly point out that the field has not adequately grappled with the ways in which the politics of race in the United States have informed the development, production, distribution and consumption of media culture, from the 19th century to the present. In the last several years, however, there has been much exciting work in these issues, covering a range of media forms, both historically and in the present—some of which are represented in this reader.

Many scholars who are particularly interested in race and gender have been attracted in recent years to what is called the British "cultural studies" approach or paradigm, because of its progressive politics; because it offers a broader and more democratic definition of **culture** than was used in humanistic areas such as literary criticism in the past; and because of its research methodology, which is more flexible than that of the largely empirical social-scientific research of traditional U.S. communications studies. This book largely reflects this new cultural studies orientation, which the editors find congenial with their own critical perspective. (For a more extended

history and definition of cultural studies, see Chapter 1, by Douglas Kellner, a leading proponent of this approach.)

Although there are now dozens of books and hundreds of journal articles available that take a cultural studies approach to media, the great majority of these are written with graduate students or other scholars in mind. We believe in developing broad-based media literacy at all levels in our society. Therefore, we have taken it as our task to attempt to convey the most powerful insights of this complex new work in as brief and clear a way as possible, in an effort to make it accessible to undergraduate students, including those in introductory media courses.

For the purposes of this book, our subject is a selection of modern U.S. popular cultural forms as conveyed by a variety of mass media technologies, including print (e.g., advertising images in magazines, pornographic pictures or romance novels) and broadcasting/cablecasting technology (e.g., talk shows, soap operas, sitcoms, MTV videos and rap music). We selected forms of **media culture** that we know to be heavily consumed and highly influential among our student populations—although, of course, because of space limitations we could not include everything that falls into this category. Although at the outset we had hoped to be as comprehensive as possible, we ultimately decided to sacrifice some breadth for greater depth in selected areas. Thus, regretfully, we have dropped chapters once planned on film and news—topics that we think are comparatively well covered in other media anthologies and in many excellent individual books—to do more with less well covered forms that we know produce animated discussions among our own students.

This collection of essays includes published journal articles, selections from recent books and several new essays commissioned for this book. Most of the published pieces have been edited by us for length. When editing, we tried to emphasize the essential arguments made in each piece. Readers should be aware, however, that in some cases we have taken just a portion, or highly edited excerpts, of the original, long essay or book chapter, as appropriate for our purposes.

Despite our best efforts, we realize that gender and race are still better represented in our book than is class. Although the British cultural studies orientation reflects the strong emphasis on class of **Marxism**—not surprisingly, given its historical debt to the thinking of Karl Marx—in U.S. academic analysis, in contrast, the concept of class has tended to be “invisible” since the 1950s for complex historical reasons. These include the eclipse of the labor movement, the anti-Communist climate created by House Un-American Activities Committee work of the early 1950s, the Cold War of the last several decades and the primacy of race as the category of social analysis acknowledged by U.S. social science.

We also acknowledge that writings from and about the perspectives of African Americans and White Americans constitute the dominant treatment of “race,” with only a few contributions from other non-White perspectives. So far as we could determine from our bibliographic research, it is primarily in contemporary film studies that sophisticated analyses of racialized media imagery are reaching beyond the White-Black dichotomy, which still largely

characterizes much of U.S. critical writing on race and TV. Similarly, with regard to gender, film studies has seen a wonderful efflorescence of work on gay and lesbian imagery and artists in the last few years (see bibliographies), but the attention to other media forms from this perspective has lagged somewhat behind. Thus the collection is also less comprehensive on heterosexism than on sexism.

Inevitably, any selection of readings reflects the perspectives, values, knowledge and limitations of knowledge of its editors. We welcome comments by users of this book about our selections, about what worked well in the classroom and what did not. And we especially invite suggested articles for future editions.

NOTE

1. For all boldfaced terms encountered in our introductory essays, please see the glossary for more extended definitions.

REFERENCES

- Bobo, J., & Seiter, E. (1991, Fall). Black feminism and media criticism: *The Women of Brewster Place*. *Screen*, 32, 286-302.
- Butler, M., & Paisley, W. (1980). *Women and the mass media: Sourcebook for research and action*. New York: Human Sciences Press.
- Friedan, B. (1963). *The feminist mystique*. New York: Dell.
- Gaines, J. (1988, Winter). White privilege and looking relations: Race and gender in feminist film theory. *Screen*, 29.
- Hill Collins, P. (1990). *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment*. London: Harper Collins.
- hooks, b. (1990). *Yearning: Race, gender and cultural politics*. Boston: South End Press.
- Kaplan, E. A. (1987). Feminist criticism and television. In R. C. Allen (Ed.), *Channels of discourse: Television and contemporary criticism*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Tuchman, G., et al. (Eds.). (1978). *Hearth and home: Images of women in the mass media*. New York: Oxford University Press

Contents

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xv
PREFACE: Goals and Assumptions of This Reader	xvii

PART I:	A Cultural Studies Approach to Gender, Race and Class in the Media	1
----------------	---	----------

Introduction

1. Cultural Studies, Multiculturalism and Media Culture	5
DOUGLAS KELLNER	

Ideology and Race

2. The Whites of Their Eyes: Racist Ideologies and the Media	18
STUART HALL	

Representation and the Social Construction of Race

3. White Negroes	23
JAN NEDERVEEN PIETERSE	

<i>Race, Gender and Textual Analysis</i>	
4. Madonna: Plantation Mistress or Soul Sister?	28
BELL HOOKS	
<i>History of Racism in Media Representation and Ownership</i>	
5. The Visibility of Race and Media History	33
JANE RHODES	
<i>Defining the Working Class</i>	
6. The Silenced Majority: Why the Average Working Person Has Disappeared From American Media and Culture	40
BARBARA EHRENREICH	
<i>Social Class, Television and the Consumer</i>	
7. The Meaning of Memory: Family, Class and Ethnicity in Early Network Television	43
GEORGE LIPSITZ	
<i>Encoding/Decoding Model and Race</i>	
8. <i>The Color Purple</i> : Black Women as Cultural Readers	52
JACQUELINE BOBO	
<i>Symbolic Annihilation and Gays and Lesbians as Audiences</i>	
9. Out of the Mainstream: Sexual Minorities and the Mass Media	61
LARRY GROSS	
PART II: Advertising	71
<i>Consumer Culture and the Image</i>	
10. Image-Based Culture: Advertising and Popular Culture	77
SUT JHALLY	
<i>Selling the Female Audience to Advertisers</i>	
11. Constructing and Addressing the Audience as Commodity	88
ROBERT GOLDMAN	

African American Ownership in the Advertising Industry

12. The Black Experience in Advertising: An Interview
With Thomas J. Burrell 93
MARSHA CASSIDY
RICHARD KATULA

Racist "Stereotyping" in Television Advertisements

13. Different Children, Different Dreams:
Racial Representation in Advertising 99
ELLEN SEITER

Targeting African Americans

14. Separate, But Not Equal: Racial Segmentation in
Cigarette Advertising 109
RICHARD W. POLLAY
JUNG S. LEE
DAVID CARTER-WHITNEY

Advertising and the Corporate Control of Women's Magazines

15. Sex, Lies and Advertising 112
GLORIA STEINEM

Images of Femininity in Advertising

16. Beauty and the Beast of Advertising 121
JEAN KILBOURNE

Textual Analysis of Advertisements

17. Reading Images Critically:
Toward a Postmodern Pedagogy 126
DOUGLAS KELLNER

Representations of Masculinity in Advertising

18. Advertising and the Construction of Violent
White Masculinity 133
JACKSON KATZ

Targeting the Gay and Lesbian Reader and Consumer

19. Commodity Lesbianism 142
DANAE CLARK

<i>Selling to the Working-Class Home TV Viewer</i>	
20. Watching the Girls Go Buy: Shop-at-Home Television	152
MIMI WHITE	

PART III:	Modes of Sexual Representation 1— Romance Novels and Slasher Films	161
------------------	---	------------

<i>Textual Analysis of Slasher Movies</i>	
21. Her Body, Himself: Gender in the Slasher Film	169
CAROL J. CLOVER	
<i>Public Concern Over Slasher Movies</i>	
22. Do Slasher Films Breed Real-Life Violence?	185
ALISON BASS	
<i>Textual Analysis of Romance Novels</i>	
23. Mass Market Romance: Pornography for Women Is Different	190
ANN BARR SNITOW	
<i>Reader Reception of Romance Novels</i>	
24. Women Read the Romance: The Interaction of Text and Context	202
JANICE A. RADWAY	
<i>The Romance Novel Formula Explained to Would-Be Writers</i>	
25. The Traditional Romance Formula	215
MARILYN M. LOWERY	
<i>The Working Conditions of Harlequin Romance Writers</i>	
26. What's in a Pseudonym: Romance Slaves of Harlequin	223
RICHARD POLLAK	

Radical Feminist Analysis of Pornography

27. Pornography and Male Supremacy 237

ANDREA DWORKIN

The Anti-Anti-Pornography Position

28. Misguided, Dangerous and Wrong: An Analysis
of Anti-Pornography Politics 244

GAYLE RUBIN

Cultural Production and Pornography

29. "I Buy It for the Articles": *Playboy* Magazine and the
Sexualization of Consumerism 254

GAIL DINES

*Reading Images of Women's Bodies in Advertising
and Pornography*

30. Towards a Feminist Erotica 263

KATHY MYERS

Deconstructing the Pornographic Text (Still Photos)

31. Lawless Seeing 271

ANNETTE KUHN

Pornography and the Construction of African-American Femininity

32. Pornography and Black Women's Bodies 279

PATRICIA HILL COLLINS

A Content Analysis of Pornographic Books and Videos

33. Racism in Pornography 287

ALICE MAYALL and DIANA E. H. RUSSELL

A New Look at Effects Research

34. Pornography and the Limits of Experimental Research 298

ROBERT JENSEN

<i>Pornography: A Consumer's Testimony</i>	
35. Confessions of a Feminist Porn Watcher	307
SCOTT MACDONALD	

<i>Pornography: An Anti-Pornography Activist's Testimony</i>	
36. Surviving Commercial Sexual Exploitation	314
EVELINA GIOBBE	

PART V: TV by Day	319
--------------------------	------------

<i>Feminist Critique of Soap Operas</i>	
37. Daze of Our Lives: The Soap Opera as Feminine Text	325
DEBORAH D. ROGERS	

<i>Reading Race, Sexuality, and Class in Soap Operas</i>	
38. Race, Sexuality and Class in Soapland	332
KAREN LINDSEY	

<i>Gender and Television Genres: Soap Opera as Feminine TV</i>	
39. Gendered Television: Femininity	340
JOHN FISKE	

<i>Textual Analysis of Soaps</i>	
40. The Search for Tomorrow in Today's Soap Operas	348
TANIA MODLESKI	

<i>Audience-Based Research on Soaps</i>	
41. Women Watching Together: An Ethnographic Study of Korean Soap Opera Fans in the United States	355
MINU LEE	
CHONG HEUP CHO	

Family Viewing TV Research

42. Home, Home on the Remote: Does Fascination
With TV Technology Create Male-Dominated
Family Entertainment? 362

Reading Geraldo

43. Constellation of Voices: How Talkshows Work 367
WAYNE MUNSON

Textual Analysis of the Afternoon Talk Show

44. Daytime Inquiries 377
ELAYNE RAPPING

Reading an African American Secondary Text of Soap Operas

45. His Name Was Not on the List: The Soap Opera Updates
of Ti-Rone as Resistance to Symbolic Annihilation 383
GLORIA ABERNATHY-LEAR

PART VI: TV by Night

395

Television Production and Social Class

46. Ralph, Fred, Archie and Homer: Why Television Keeps
Recreating the White Male Working-Class Buffoon 403
RICHARD BUTSCH

Race and Audience Reception

- † 47. Is This What You Mean by Color TV? Race, Gender,
and Contested Meanings in NBC's *Julia* 413
ANIKO BODROGHKOZY

Representation of African American Women on Television

48. Television's Realist Portrayal of African-American
Women and the Case of *L.A. Law* 424
JANE RHODES

Representation of African American Men on Television

49. Television, Black Americans and the American Dream 430
HERMAN GRAY

<i>Race and the Potential Polysemic Text</i>	
50. Laughing Across the Color Barrier: <i>In Living Color</i>	438
NORMA MIRIAM SCHULMAN	
<i>Women as a Target Audience for Social Issue Drama</i>	
51. The Movie of the Week	445
ELAYNE RAPPING	
<i>The Politics of Production and Gender as an Unstable Category</i>	
52. Defining Women: The Case of <i>Cagney and Lacey</i>	454
JULIE D'ACCI	
<i>Reading a TV Sitcom as Feminist Text</i>	
53. Subversive Sitcoms: <i>Roseanne</i> as Inspiration for Feminist Resistance	469
JANET LEE	
<i>A Lesbian Reads a Family Sitcom</i>	
54. Confessions of a Sitcom Junkie	476
SARAH SCHUYLER	

MUSIC VIDEOS AND RAP MUSIC:	479
PART VII: Cultural Conflict and Control in the Age of the Image	

<i>MTV and the Dominance of the Image</i>	
55. A Post-Modernist Moment: 1980s Commercial Culture and the Founding of MTV	488
JOHN PETTEGREW	
<i>Textual Analysis of Music Videos</i>	
56. Form and Female Authorship in Music Video	499
LISA A. LEWIS	
<i>Audiences Reading Madonna Videos</i>	
57. The Effects of Race, Gender, and Fandom on Audience Interpretations of Madonna's Music Videos	508
JANE D. BROWN	
LAURIE SCHULZE	