

# **Dominant Political Parties and Democracy**

Concepts, measures, cases and  
comparisons

*Edited by*

**Matthijs Bogaards and  
Françoise Boucek**



Routledge/ECPR Studies in European Political Science

# **Dominant Political Parties and Democracy**

Concepts, measures, cases, and  
comparisons

**Edited by Matthijs Bogaards and  
Françoise Boucek**



First published 2010  
by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada  
by Routledge  
270 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

© Matthijs Bogaards and Françoise Boucek, selection and editorial matter. The contributors for their contributions.

Typeset in Times by  
RefineCatch Limited, Bungay, Suffolk

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Dominant political parties and democracy : concepts, measures, cases and comparisons / edited by Matthijs Bogaards and Françoise Boucek.  
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Political parties. 2. Democracy. I. Bogaards, Matthijs. II. Boucek, Françoise.

JF2011.D65 2010

324.2–dc22

2009049918

ISBN13: 978-0-415-48582-1 (hbk)

ISBN13: 978-0-203-85011-4 (ebk)

# **Dominant Political Parties and Democracy**

This book examines dominant parties in both established democracies and new democracies and explores the relationship between dominant parties and the democratic process.

Bridging existing literatures, the authors analyse dominant parties at national and sub-national, district and intra-party levels and take a fresh look at some of the classic cases of one-party dominance. The book also features methodological advances in the study of dominant parties through contributions that develop new ways of conceptualizing and measuring one-party dominance. Combining theoretical and empirical research and bringing together leading experts in the field – including Hermann Giliomee and Kenneth Greene – this book features comparisons and case studies on Japan, Canada, Germany, Mexico, Italy, France and South Africa.

This book will be of interest to students and scholars of political science, democracy studies, comparative politics, party politics and international studies specialists.

**Matthijs Bogaards** is Associate Professor of Political Science in the School of Humanities and Social Sciences at Jacobs University Bremen, Germany. **Françoise Boucek** is Teaching Fellow in the Department of Politics at Queen Mary University London, UK.

## **Routledge/ECPR Studies in European Political Science**

Edited by Thomas Poguntke, *Ruhr University Bochum, Germany*  
*on behalf of the European Consortium for Political Research*

The Routledge/ECPR Studies in European Political Science series is published in association with the European Consortium for Political Research – the leading organisation concerned with the growth and development of political science in Europe. The series presents high-quality edited volumes on topics at the leading edge of current interest in political science and related fields, with contributions from European scholars and others who have presented work at ECPR workshops or research groups.

### **1 Regionalist Parties in Western Europe**

*Edited by Lieven de Winter and Huri Türsan*

### **2 Comparing Party System Change**

*Edited by Jan-Erik Lane and Paul Pennings*

### **3 Political Theory and European Union**

*Edited by Albert Weale and Michael Nentwich*

### **4 Politics of Sexuality**

*Edited by Terrell Carver and Véronique Mottier*

### **5 Autonomous Policy Making by International Organizations**

*Edited by Bob Reinalda and Bertjan Verbeek*

### **6 Social Capital and European Democracy**

*Edited by Jan van Deth, Marco Maraffi, Ken Newton and Paul Whiteley*

### **7 Party Elites in Divided Societies**

*Edited by Kurt Richard Luther and Kris Deschouwer*

### **8 Citizenship and Welfare State Reform in Europe**

*Edited by Jet Bussemaker*

**9 Democratic Governance and New Technology**

Technologically mediated innovations in political practice in Western Europe

*Edited by Ivan Horrocks, Jens Hoff and Pieter Tops*

**10 Democracy without Borders**

Transnationalisation and conditionality in new democracies

*Edited by Jean Grugel*

**11 Cultural Theory as Political Science**

*Edited by Michael Thompson, Gunnar Grendstad and Per Selle*

**12 The Transformation of Governance in the European Union**

*Edited by Beate Kohler-Koch and Rainer Eising*

**13 Parliamentary Party Groups in European Democracies**

Political parties behind closed doors

*Edited by Knut Heidar and Ruud Koole*

**14 Survival of the European Welfare State**

*Edited by Stein Kuhnle*

**15 Private Organisations in Global Politics**

*Edited by Karsten Ronit and Volker Schneider*

**16 Federalism and Political Performance**

*Edited by Ute Wachendorfer-Schmidt*

**17 Democratic Innovation**

Deliberation, representation and association

*Edited by Michael Saward*

**18 Public Opinion and the International Use of Force**

*Edited by Philip Everts and Pierangelo Isernia*

**19 Religion and Mass Electoral Behaviour in Europe**

*Edited by David Broughton and Hans-Martien ten Napel*

**20 Estimating the Policy Position of Political Actors**

*Edited by Michael Laver*

**21 Democracy and Political Change in the 'Third World'**

*Edited by Jeff Haynes*

**22 Politicians, Bureaucrats and Administrative Reform**

*Edited by B. Guy Peters and Jon Pierre*

**23 Social Capital and Participation in Everyday Life**

*Edited by Paul Dekker and Eric M. Uslaner*

**24 Development and Democracy**

What do we know and how?

*Edited by Ole Elgström and Goran Hyden*

**25 Do Political Campaigns Matter?**

Campaign effects in elections and referendums

*Edited by David M. Farrell and Rüdiger Schmitt-Beck*

**26 Political Journalism**

New challenges, new practices

*Edited by Raymond Kuhn and Erik Neveu*

**27 Economic Voting**

*Edited by Han Dorussen and Michael Taylor*

**28 Organized Crime and the Challenge to Democracy**

*Edited by Felia Allum and Renate Siebert*

**29 Understanding the European Union's External Relations**

*Edited by Michèle Knodt and Sebastiaan Princen*

**30 Social Democratic Party Policies in Contemporary Europe**

*Edited by Giuliano Bonoli and Martin Powell*

**31 Decision Making Within International Organisations**

*Edited by Bob Reinalda and Bertjan Verbeek*

**32 Comparative Biomedical Policy**

Governing assisted reproductive technologies

*Edited by Ivar Bleiklie, Malcolm L. Goggin and Christine Rothmayr*

**33 Electronic Democracy**

Mobilisation, organisation and participation via new ICTs

*Edited by Rachel K. Gibson, Andrea Römmele and Stephen J. Ward*

**34 Liberal Democracy and Environmentalism**

The end of environmentalism?

*Edited by Marcel Wissenburg and Yoram Levy*

**35 Political Theory and the European Constitution**

*Edited by Lynn Dobson and Andreas Follesdal*

**36 Politics and the European Commission**

Actors, interdependence, legitimacy

*Edited by Andy Smith*

**37 Metropolitan Governance**

Capacity, democracy and the dynamics of place

*Edited by Hubert Heinelt and Daniel Kübler*

**38 Democracy and the Role of Associations**

Political, organizational and social contexts

*Edited by Sigrid Roßteutscher*

**39 The Territorial Politics of Welfare**

*Edited by Nicola McEwen and Luis Moreno*

**40 Health Governance in Europe**

Issues, challenges and theories

*Edited by Monika Steffen*

**41 Republicanism in Theory and Practice**

*Edited by Iseult Honohan and Jeremy Jennings*

**42 Mass Media and Political Communication in New Democracies**

*Edited by Katrin Voltmer*

**43 Delegation in Contemporary Democracies**

*Edited by Dietmar Braun and Fabrizio Gilardi*

**44 Governance and Democracy**

Comparing national, European and international experiences

*Edited by Yannis Papadopoulos and Arthur Benz*

**45 The European Union's Roles in International Politics**

Concepts and analysis

*Edited by Ole Elgström and Michael Smith*

**46 Policy-making Processes and the European Constitution**

A comparative study of member states and accession countries

*Edited by Thomas König and Simon Hug*

**47 Democratic Politics and Party Competition**

*Edited by Judith Bara and Albert Weale*

**48 Participatory Democracy and Political Participation**

Can participatory engineering bring citizens back in?

*Edited by Thomas Zittel and Dieter Fuchs*



**49 Civil Societies and Social Movements**

Potentials and problems

*Edited by Derrick Purdue*

**50 Resources, Governance and Civil Conflict**

*Edited by Magnus Öberg and Kaare Strøm*

**51 Transnational Private Governance and its Limits**

*Edited by Jean-Christophe Graz and Andreas Nölke*

**52 International Organizations and Implementation**

Enforcers, managers, authorities?

*Edited by Jutta Joachim, Bob Reinalda and Bertjan Verbeek*

**53 New Parties in Government**

*Edited by Kris Deschouwer*

**54 In Pursuit of Sustainable Development**

New governance practices at the sub-national level in Europe

*Edited by Susan Baker and Katarina Eckerberg*

**55 Governments, NGOs and Anti-Corruption**

The new integrity warriors

*Edited by Luís de Sousa, Barry Hindess and Peter Larmour*

**56 Intra-Party Politics and Coalition Governments**

*Edited by Daniela Giannetti and Kenneth Benoit*

**57 Political Parties and Partisanship**

Social identity and individual attitudes

*Edited by John Bartle and Paolo Belucci*

**58 The Future of Political Community**

*Edited by Gideon Baker and Jens Bartelson*

**59 The Discursive Politics of Gender Equality**

Stretching, bending and policy making

*Edited by Emanuela Lombardo, Petra Meier, Mieke Verloo*

**60 Another Europe**

Conceptions and practices of democracy in the European social forums

*Edited by Donatella Della Porta*

**61 European and North American Policy Change**

Drivers and dynamics

*Edited by Giliberto Capano and Michael Howlett*

**62 Referendums and Representative Democracy**  
Responsiveness, accountability and deliberation  
*Edited by Maija Setälä and Theo Schiller*

**63 Education in Political Science**  
Discovering a neglected field  
*Edited by Anja P. Jakobi, Kerstin Martens and Klaus Dieter Wolf*

**64 Religion and Politics in Europe, the Middle East and North Africa**  
*Edited by Jeffrey Haynes*

**65 New Directions in Federalism Studies**  
*Edited by Jan Erk and Wilfried Swenden*

**66 Public Policy and the Media**  
The interplay of mass communication and political decision making  
*Edited by Sigrid Koch-Baumgarten and Katrin Voltmer*

**67 Changing Government Relations in Europe**  
From localism to intergovernmentalism  
*Edited by Michael J. Goldsmith and Edward C. Page*

**68 Political Discussion in Modern Democracies**  
A comparative perspective  
*Edited by Michael R. Wolf, Laura Morales and Ken'ichi Ikeda*

**69 Dominant Political Parties and Democracy**  
Concepts, measures, cases and comparisons  
*Edited by Matthijs Bogaards and Françoise Boucek*

*Also available from Routledge in association with the ECPR:*

**Sex Equality Policy in Western Europe**, *Edited by Frances Gardiner*;  
**Democracy and Green Political Thought**, *Edited by Brian Doherty & Marius de Geus*; **The New Politics of Unemployment**, *Edited by Hugh Compston*;  
**Citizenship, Democracy and Justice in the New Europe**, *Edited by Percy B. Lehning & Albert Weale*; **Private Groups and Public Life**, *Edited by Jan W. van Deth*; **The Political Context of Collective Action**, *Edited by Ricca Edmondson*;  
**Theories of Secession**, *Edited by Percy Lehning*; **Regionalism Across the North/South Divide**, *Edited by Jean Grugel & Wil Hout*.

# Contributors

**Amir Abedi** is Associate Professor of Political Science in the Department of Political Science, Western Washington University.

**Matthijs Bogaards** is Professor of Political Science at Jacobs University Bremen.

**Françoise Boucek** is Teaching Fellow in the Department of Politics, Queen Mary University of London.

**R. Kenneth Carty** is a Professor of Political Science at the University of British Columbia.

**Jean-François Caulier** is a researcher at the Center for Research in Economics at the Facultés Universitaires Saint-Louis Bruxelles.

**Patrick Dumont** is researcher at the Université du Luxembourg and member of the Centre de Science Politique et de Politique Comparée, Université Catholique de Louvain.

**Patrick Dunleavy** is Professor of Political Science and Public Policy in the Government Department at the London School of Economics.

**Hermann Giliomee** is Extra-ordinary Professor of History, University of Stellenbosch.

**Kenneth F. Greene** is Associate Professor in Political Science in the Department of Government, University of Texas at Austin. His book *Why Dominant Parties Lose: Mexico's Democratization in Comparative Perspective* (Cambridge University Press, 2007) won the 2008 Best Book Award from the Comparative Democratization Section of the American Political Science Association.

**Jonathan Jones** received his PhD degree in Political Science from the University of Florida. He is currently working as a consultant on democracy and governance.

**Staffan I. Lindberg** is Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science and Center for African Studies, University of Florida.

**James Myburgh** wrote his DPhil in Politics at Oxford University on the African National Congress under Thabo Mbeki. He is currently editor of the South African political website Politicsweb.

**Nicolas Sauger** is researcher at Sciences Po (Center for European Studies), Paris.

**Steffen Schneider** is a researcher at the ‘Transformations of the State’ Research Centre, Universität Bremen.

**Gordon Smith** was Professor Emeritus in the Government Department, London School of Economics until his sudden death in December 2009.

## Series editor's preface

Democrats don't like dominant parties. They block the essential mechanism of democratic accountability, namely alternation in government. Inevitably, this entails serious risks for the quality of democracy. If an incumbent party runs a very low risk of losing power after the next election it will be more tempted to abuse its power. Also, its main office holders have little to fear and may be more susceptible to the temptations of power such as nepotism, corruption, and clientelism. Arguably even more consequential may be the lack of innovation that is likely to be the ugly sister of party dominance. Since, to paraphrase Kenneth Janda, defeat is the mother of invention, a party that is not seriously threatened may stop thinking about programmatic innovation, and it will have fewer incentives to care about the quality of its leadership personnel. After all, leadership turnover is frequently the results of election defeat.

Irrespective of such reasoning grounded in democratic theory and theories of party competition, most party leaders dislike dominant parties for the very simple reason that most parties are not dominant. Hence, there is considerable political energy in most political systems working against one-party dominance. This can materialize in otherwise rather unlikely political alliances which are mainly united by the desire to undermine the dominance of the main opponent. Furthermore, there is considerable pressure in most political systems to make sure that the rules of the game guarantee an equal playing field in order to either prevent one-party dominance, or to make it at least more feasible to work against it.

Yet, the history of democratic party systems is also a history of dominant parties, and even though the arguments sketched out above seem intuitively convincing, they do not always stand the test of reality. In other words, democracy has also thrived in countries where one party has dominated for a considerable period of time, as in Sweden, where Social Democracy ruled for many decades. Similarly, dominant parties can pave the way towards a more balanced party system as was exemplified by post-war Germany where some twenty years of Christian Democratic dominance were superseded by a functioning "two-and-a-half-party system". However, there are less favourable examples, like the Italian Christian Democracy, whose long lasting

dominance ended in the complete collapse of the Italian party system, and after almost two decades of the so-called 2nd republic it still seems doubtful that a more balanced party system is in the making. Similarly, the record of the Japanese LDP is also mixed and there other, even more questionable, examples where dominant parties have played an ambivalent role.

However, party dominance on one level of the political system may coexist with a more balanced party system on other levels, and this may be one important factor in explaining that the empirical evidence for the hypothesized negative effect of one-party dominance on the quality of democracy is somewhat mixed. To some degree, this is also not unrelated to the difficulty in determining what exactly defines a dominant party. In other words, the conceptual problems of clearly defining party dominance are not trivial, and it is one of the strengths of the current volume to assemble a range of approaches. While relative size and duration of dominance remain core criteria, more refined power indices open up new perspectives for comparative research.

On the other hand, one-party dominance may have a more elusive component that is hard to capture with such formal indicators. A party that has dominated a country's politics for a considerable period of time may have succeeded in shifting the parameters of political discourse to a degree that allows her to remain dominant beyond her numerical ascendancy. Clearly, Scandinavian Social Democracy comes to mind here, but the lasting effects of Margret Thatcher's reign could also be interpreted from this angle.

Still, these are examples from consolidated democracies. Clearly, one-party dominance raises more serious questions in transition countries where a dominant party remains in power for a considerable period of time after democratization. Parties like the South African ANC have yet to pass the ultimate test, that is, defeat at the polls. This example highlights the fact that research on dominant parties is not just an exercise in the splendid isolation of the academic ivory tower. Knowledge on the dynamics of one-party dominance also has political relevance, and this book provides important new insights.

Thomas Poguntke, Series Editor  
Bochum, March 2010

# Contents

<i>List of figures and tables</i>	xiii
<i>List of contributors</i>	xv
<i>Series editor's preface</i>	xvii
<b>1 Introduction: Setting a new agenda for research</b>	<b>1</b>
FRANÇOISE BOUCEK AND MATTHIJS BOGAARDS	
<b>PART I</b>	
<b>Concepts and measures</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>2 Rethinking dominant party systems</b>	<b>23</b>
PATRICK DUNLEAVY	
<b>3 Measuring one-party dominance with voting power indices</b>	<b>45</b>
JEAN-FRANÇOIS CAULIER AND PATRICK DUMONT	
<b>4 District-level dominance and vulnerability under the French Fifth Republic</b>	<b>60</b>
NICOLAS SAUGER	
<b>PART II</b>	
<b>Cases and comparisons</b>	<b>73</b>
<i>i: Sub-national dominance</i>	<i>75</i>
<b>5 Big fish in small ponds: A comparison of dominant parties in the Canadian provinces and German <i>Länder</i></b>	<b>77</b>
AMIR ABEDI AND STEFFEN SCHNEIDER	

<b>6</b>	<b>Hard and soft dominance: Assessing the case of the Bavarian CSU</b>	<b>98</b>
	GORDON SMITH	
<b>ii:</b>	<b><i>The intra-party dimension of dominance</i></b>	<b>109</b>
<b>7</b>	<b>The factional politics of dominant parties: Evidence from Britain, Italy and Japan</b>	<b>117</b>
	FRANÇOISE BOUCEK	
<b>8</b>	<b>Dominance without factions: The Liberal Party of Canada</b>	<b>140</b>
	R. KENNETH CARTY	
<b>iii:</b>	<b><i>Dominance and democracy</i></b>	<b>153</b>
<b>9</b>	<b>A resource theory of single-party dominance: The PRI in Mexico</b>	<b>155</b>
	KENNETH F. GREENE	
<b>10</b>	<b>One-party dominance in South Africa</b>	<b>175</b>
	JAMES MYBURGH AND HERMANN GILIOMEE	
<b>11</b>	<b>Laying a foundation for democracy or undermining it?: Dominant parties in Africa's burgeoning democracies</b>	<b>196</b>
	STAFFAN I. LINDBERG AND JONATHAN JONES	
<b>12</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>219</b>
	FRANÇOISE BOUCEK AND MATTHIJS BOGAARDS	
	<i>Index</i>	<b>231</b>



# Figures and tables

## Figures

2.1	The utility profiles of an individual voter at $V_i$ for two parties with differentiated effectiveness	24
2.2	A simple dominant party system with only two parties, shown in one-dimensional and two-dimensional views	26
2.3	A more complex dominant party system with four viable parties	28
2.4	How a relatively crowded competition space may change to undermine $P_1$ 's dominance	35
3.1	Evolution of ENP, ENRP and M in Sweden, 1970–2006	53
3.2	Evolution of ENP, ENRP and M in Ireland, 1973–2007	55
4.1	Proportion of incumbents re-elected and proportion of winners in the first round of legislative elections	63
4.2	Competition in constituencies: average of the scores of the top two parties across districts for the first round of legislative elections (Nagayama triangle technique)	64
5.1	Kaplan-Meier survival estimates, by country	84
5.2	Kaplan-Meier survival estimates, by CPS	84
7.1	Effective number of factions and pivotal power of the largest faction: Japan's Liberal Democrats 1957–2000	124
7.2	Effective number of factions and factional power: Italian Christian Democratic Party	130

## Tables

2.1	Three strategies open to lower efficacy opposition rivals in competing with a dominant party	29
3.1	Average values of ENP, ENRP and M	53
4.1	Determinants of incumbency success over three elections	67
4.2	Proportion of districts with a dominant incumbent in France (1988–2007)	67
4.3	Determinants of satisfaction with the democratic process (2007)	68