

ETHICS **IN** **EMERGENCY MEDICINE**

Kenneth V. Iserson

Arthur B. Sanders

Deborah R. Mathieu

Allen E. Buchanan

**with a legal introduction by
Alexander M. Capron**

ETHICS IN EMERGENCY MEDICINE

Kenneth V. Iserson, M.D., F.A.C.E.P.

Associate Professor of Emergency Medicine (Surgery)
Residency Director in Emergency Medicine
University of Arizona College of Medicine, Tucson, Arizona

Arthur B. Sanders, M.D., F.A.C.E.P., F.A.C.P.

Associate Professor of Emergency Medicine (Surgery) and Internal Medicine
University of Arizona College of Medicine, Tucson, Arizona

Deborah R. Mathieu, Ph.D.

Assistant Professor of Political Science
University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona

Allen E. Buchanan, Ph.D.

Professor of Philosophy
University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona

with a legal introduction by

Alexander M. Capron, L.L.B.

Norman Topping Professor of Law, Medicine, and Public Policy
The Law Center
University of Southern California, Los Angeles, California



WILLIAMS & WILKINS

Baltimore • London • Los Angeles • Sydney



Editor: Timothy Grayson
Associate Editor: Carol Eckhart
Copy Editor: Bill Cady
Design: JoAnne Janowiak
Illustration Planning: Wayne Hubbel
Production: Anne G. Seitz

Copyright © 1986
Williams & Wilkins
428 East Preston Street
Baltimore, MD 21202, U.S.A.



All rights reserved. This book is protected by copyright. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or by any means, including photocopying, or utilized by any information storage and retrieval system without written permission from the copyright owner.

Accurate indications, adverse reactions, and dosage schedules for drugs are provided in this book, but it is possible that they may change. The reader is urged to review the package information data of the manufacturers of the medications mentioned.

Printed in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Ethics in emergency medicine.

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Emergency medicine—Moral and ethical aspects. 2. Medical ethics. I. Iserson, Kenneth V.

[DNLM: 1. Emergency Medicine. 2. Emergency Medicine—case studies. 3. Ethics, Medical. WB 105 E84]

RC86.7.E84 1987 174'.2 86-13275

Printed at the
Waverly Press, Inc.

86 87 88 89 90
10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Preface

This case book deals with a wide variety of ethical problems in emergency medicine, problems affecting all health care professionals who deal with that service. It is, therefore, designed to appeal to a broad audience: physicians, nurses, paramedics, lawyers, philosophers, social workers, and hospital administrators. Although we do not claim to have covered the entire range of ethical topics applicable to emergency medicine, we do believe that we have provided a suitable introduction to the field that can be used as a basis for further clarifying important issues and raising new questions. We sincerely hope that our readers will respond to us regarding the success of our efforts. And we hope also that you will send us new cases to discuss.

Whatever success we do have is owed in large measure to our outstanding contributors. Without exception they have offered thorough, thoughtful, responsible case commentaries. We appreciate greatly their participating in this project, and we gratefully acknowledge the excellence of their contributions. We are especially indebted to Alexander Capron for preparing a lucid, accurate, and comprehensive introduction to the legal principles of emergency practice.

There are many others to whom we are in debt. At the top of the list are Maria Felix, Donna Vandenberg, Mary Ellen Benoit, and Sheryl Perry, who prepared the manuscript. Without their conscientious and efficient efforts, we never would have met our deadline. We would also like to thank Mary Lou Iserson, who put up with at least one of us during the preparation of this manuscript. Finally, we gratefully acknowledge the support for research time which was provided to us by the Section of Emergency Medicine and the Department of Philosophy, University of Arizona.

K. V. I.
A. B. S.
D. R. M.
A. E. B.

Contributors

Mary Ann Baily, Ph.D., Adjunct Associate Professor of Economics, The George Washington University, Washington, D. C.

Margaret P. Battin, Ph.D., Associate Professor of Philosophy, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah

Tom L. Beauchamp, Ph.D., Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, Senior Research Scholar, Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University, Washington, D. C.

Brooks F. Bock, M.D., F.A.C.E.P., Associate Professor, Department of Surgery, Wayne State University; Chief, Section of Emergency Medicine, Detroit Receiving Hospital, Detroit, Michigan

Dan W. Brock, Ph.D., Professor and Chairman, Department of Philosophy, Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island

Baruch A. Brody, Ph.D., Leon Jaworski Professor of Biomedical Ethics, Center for Ethics, Medicine, and Public Issues, Baylor College of Medicine; Professor of Philosophy and Director of Legal Studies, Rice University, Houston, Texas

Allen E. Buchanan, Ph.D., Professor of Philosophy, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona

Alexander M. Capron, L.L.B., Norman Topping Professor of Law, Medicine, and Public Policy, The Law Center, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, California

Anne J. Davis, R.N., Ph.D., Professor, Department of Mental Health and Community Nursing, University of California, San Francisco, California

Nancy Davis, Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Philosophy, Associate of the Center for Values and Social Policy, University of Colorado, Boulder, Colorado

Rebecca Dresser, J.D., Assistant Professor, Center for Ethics, Medicine, and Public Issues, Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, Texas

Michael Eliastam, M.D., M.P.P., Associate Professor of Surgery and Medicine, Chief, Division of Emergency Medicine, Stanford University Medical Center, Stanford, California

Ruth Faden, Ph.D., Associate Professor, Department of Health Policy and Management, School of Hygiene and Public Health, The Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland; Senior Research Scholar, Kennedy Institute of Bioethics, Georgetown University, Washington, D. C.

Norman C. Fost, M.D., M.P.H., Professor of Pediatrics, Director of Program in Medical Ethics, Residency Director in Pediatrics, University of Wisconsin Medical School, Madison, Wisconsin

Joel Frader, M.D., Associate Physician in Pediatrics, Children's Hospital, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

Jacek B. Franaszek, M.D., F.A.C.E.P., Director, Department of Emergency Medicine, Rhode Island Hospital, Associate Professor of Surgery, Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island; Chairman, Bioethics Committee, American College of Emergency Physicians

Eli Ginzberg, Ph.D., Hepburn Professor Emeritus of Economics, Director, Center for Conservation of Human Resources, Columbia University, New York, New York

Samuel Gorovitz, Ph.D., Professor of Philosophy, Affiliate Professor of Public Affairs, University of Maryland, College Park, Maryland

Kenneth V. Iserson, M.D., F.A.C.E.P., Associate Professor of Emergency Medicine (Surgery), Residency Director in Emergency Medicine, University of Arizona College of Medicine, Tucson, Arizona

Jody S. Kraus, M.A., Department of Philosophy, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona

Bruce M. Landesman, Ph.D., Associate Professor of Philosophy, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah

Joanne Lynn, M.D., Assistant Clinical Professor, Department of Health Care Sciences, The George Washington University Medical Center, Washington, D. C.

Ruth Macklin, Ph.D., Professor of Bioethics, Department of Epidemiology and Social Medicine, Albert Einstein College of Medicine, Bronx, New York

Heidi Malm, Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Philosophy, University of Nebraska, Lincoln, Nebraska

Deborah R. Mathieu, Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Political Science, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona

Terrance McConnell, Ph.D., Associate Professor of Philosophy, University of North Carolina, Greensboro, North Carolina

Alan Meisel, J.D., Professor of Law and Psychiatry, Schools of Law and Medicine, University of Pittsburgh; Member, Law and Psychiatry Program, Western Psychiatric Institute and Clinic, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

H. Belton P. Meyer, M.D., Chairman, Joint Bioethics Committee, Good Samaritan Medical Center, Phoenix Children's Hospital, Phoenix, Arizona

Ronald D. Milo, Ph.D., Professor of Philosophy, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona

James Rachels, Ph.D., Professor of Philosophy, University of Alabama, Birmingham, Alabama

Tom Regan, Ph.D., Professor of Philosophy, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, North Carolina

Arthur B. Sanders, M.D., F.A.C.E.P., F.A.C.P., Associate Professor of Emergency Medicine (Surgery) and Internal Medicine, University of Arizona College of Medicine, Tucson, Arizona

Holly M. Smith, Ph.D., Associate Professor and Head of Philosophy Department, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona

Tables and Figures

Table 1: Differences between emergency practice and primary care practice	10
Figure 1: Method for ethical decision making	37
Figure 2: A rapid approach to emergency ethical problems	40
Table 2: Elements of consent	45
Table 3: Elements of competence	46
Table 4: Exceptions to the informed consent rule	48
Table 5: Components of decision-making capacity	54
Table 6: Factors distinguishing the cases	56
Table 7: Consent for minors: mistaken assumptions	63
Figure 3: Probable patient acceptance of simultaneous or sequential research trial	85
Figure 4: Probable patient acceptance of controlled research trial	87
Table 8: Reasons for withholding life-preserving intervention	110
Table 9: Possible relevant differences between Mr. Brook and Mrs. Lowell	116
Table 10: Questions affecting treatment decision	125
Table 11: Grounds for determining a patient's "best interests"	131
Table 12: Possible arguments for treating a patient in accordance with his best interests and contrary to his demand for a riskier alternative ...	135
Table 13: Are you morally obligated to risk your life for others? Three views ..	144
Table 14: Sources of risk to the rescuer	146
Table 15: Competing views of the emergency physician's obligations	164
Table 16: Physician attitudes toward patients	191
Table 17: Common methods of escaping from responsible moral decision making	204

Table 18:	Basis of physician's responsibility to notify family of death	209
Table 19:	Fundamental humanitarian concerns	238
Table 20:	Economic guidelines and medical etiquette addressed in medical codes	238

Contents

Preface	v
Contributors	vii
Tables and Figures	ix

SECTION 1. Introduction

CHAPTER 1. General Introduction	3
DEBORAH R. MATHIEU, PH.D.	
CHAPTER 2. Unique Aspects of Ethics in Emergency Medicine.....	9
ARTHUR B. SANDERS, M.D. F.A.C.E.P., F.A.C.P.	
CHAPTER 3. Legal Setting of Emergency Medicine.....	13
ALEXANDER M. CAPRON, L.L.B.	
CHAPTER 4. What Is Ethics?.....	29
ALLEN E. BUCHANAN, PH.D.	
CHAPTER 5. An Approach to Ethical Problems in Emergency Medicine.....	35
KENNETH V. ISERSON, M.D., F.A.C.E.P.	

SECTION 2. Cases and Commentaries

CHAPTER 6. Autonomy and Informed Consent.....	45
PART 1. Informed Participation in Decisions ..	47
DAN W. BROCK, PH.D.	
PART 2. The Question of Competence	52
ALLEN E. BUCHANAN, PH.D.	
PART 3. Suicide.....	56
SAMUEL GOROVITZ, PH.D.	
PART 4. Rights of Minors.....	60
ALAN MEISEL, J.D.	
PART 5. Uncertain Diagnosis and the Uncooperative Patient	65
TOM L. BEAUCHAMP, PH.D.	

	DISCUSSION CASES	
	Impaired Decision Making	68
	Consent (Explicit and Presumed)	69
	Organ Donation.....	70
CHAPTER 7.	Education and Research	71
PART 1.	Practicing Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation (CPR) Procedures	74
	BARUCH A. BRODY, PH.D.	
PART 2.	Role of Emergency Medical Technicians and Paramedics: Observer-Trainees.....	75
	JACEK B. FRANASZEK, M.D., F.A.C.E.P.	
PART 3.	Human Subjects in Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation Research	77
	NORMAN C. FOST, M.D., M.P.H.	
PART 4.	Human Subjects in Trauma Research	82
	KENNETH V. ISERSON, M.D., F.A.C.E.P.	
	DISCUSSION CASES	
	Animal Subjects	88
	“Lone Intern” in the Emergency Department	88
	Practicing Procedures	89
CHAPTER 8.	Privacy and Confidentiality.....	91
PART 1.	Legal Requirements for Notification..	92
	HOLLY M. SMITH, PH.D.	
PART 2.	Answering Questions from “Relatives” on the Phone or in Person	97
	RUTH FADEN, PH.D.	
PART 3.	Security of the Emergency Medical Service System (EMSS) Radio Network.....	99
	JACEK B. FRANASZEK, M.D., F.A.C.E.P.	
	DISCUSSION CASES	
	Police Information.....	101
	Calling to Other Emergency Departments about Suspicious Patients	101
	Exhibiting Wanted Posters in the Emergency Department.....	102

Potential Harm to a Third Party	102
Request for Special Treatment	103
 CHAPTER 9. Life-sustaining Treatment.....	105
PART 1. Resuscitating a Patient with No Vital Signs.....	109
BARUCH A. BRODY, PH.D.	
PART 2. When Not to Resuscitate	115
TERRANCE MCCONNELL, PH.D.	
PART 3. Pediatric Patients—Do We Try Too Hard?	119
RUTH MACKLIN, PH.D.	
PART 4. Are Community Standards for When to Resuscitate Valid?	124
JOANNE LYNN, M.D.	
PART 5. Postmortem Cesarean Section: Removing and Resuscitating a Fetus from a Dead Patient	126
H. BELTON P. MEYER, M.D.	
PART 6. Patient Transfers.....	129
HEIDI MALM, PH.D.	
PART 7. Good Samaritan Behavior and Failure-to-Stop Laws.....	141
NANCY DAVIS, PH.D.	
PART 8. Resuscitation of an AIDS Victim	150
ARTHUR B. SANDERS, M.D., F.A.C.E.P., F.A.C.P.	
 DISCUSSION CASES	
“Walk-through” Resuscitation for the Family	154
“Terminal” Patient Protocols.....	154
Unauthorized Lifesaving Procedures..	154
Disagreement on “Optimal” Treatment via Telemetry	155
Triage: Multiple Patients and One Medic	156
Code 3 (Emergency) Interhospital Transfers.....	156
An Injured Policeman, an Injured As-sailant, and One Intensive Care Bed..	157

CHAPTER 10. Availability of Health Care	159
PART 1. Manipulative Patient, Irresponsible Family, and Nursing Home “Dump”..	161
MARGARET P. BATTIN, PH.D.	
PART 2. Allocation of Resources: Social and Political Factors	169
TOM REGAN, PH.D.	
PART 3. Allocation of Resources: Economic Factors.....	173
ELI GINZBERG, PH.D.	
PART 4. Fee-for-Service System of Care	175
MARY ANN BAILY, PH.D.	
PART 5. Increased Charges for Third-Party Pay Patients	176
MARY ANN BAILY, PH.D.	
PART 6. No Payment—Adult or Child.....	178
MARY ANN BAILY, PH.D.	
PART 7. “Gatekeeper’s” Role.....	180
MICHAEL ELIASTAM, M.D., M.P.P.	
DISCUSSION CASES	
Good Medical Care and the Decision to Admit	183
Freestanding Emergency Centers and Transfers.....	184
Free Drug Samples and Prescribing Patterns.....	184
Not Filling Prescriptions for an Indigent Sick Child or Adult	185
Advertising.....	185
Should Economic Considerations Play a Role in Physicians’ Decisions?.....	186
Responsibility for Unauthorized Transfer	186
Prepaid Health Plan and Emergency Treatment.....	186
CHAPTER 11. Quality of Care	189
PART 1. Physician Attitudes toward Patients ..	190
BRUCE M. LANDESMAN, PH.D.	

PART 2.	Responsibilities for Monitoring and Maintaining Quality of Care—Mistakes	196
	JAMES RACHELS, PH.D.	
PART 3.	Physician's Quality of Life versus Quality of Patient Care	200
	BROOKS F. BOCK, M.D., F.A.C.E.P.	
PART 4.	Physician Calls concerning DNR Orders.....	202
	RONALD D. MILO, PH.D.	
PART 5.	Delegating the Notification of Death to Others.....	208
	REBECCA DRESSER, J.D.	
PART 6.	Denial of Antipregnancy Prophylaxis to a Rape Victim.....	211
	DEBORAH R. MATHIEU, PH.D.	
PART 7.	Referral Back to a Poor Primary Health Care Provider	215
	JOEL FRADER, M.D.	
PART 8.	Conscientious Objections (Bad Orders).....	217
	REBECCA DRESSER, J.D.	
PART 9.	Solo Nurse in the Emergency Department	220
	ANNE J. DAVIS, R.N., PH.D.	
PART 10.	Telephone Consultations to Families and Other Health Care Providers	223
	JODY S. KRAUS, M.A.	
PART 11.	Telephone Orders from a Local Physician	228
	ANNE J. DAVIS, R.N., PH.D.	
DISCUSSION CASES		
	Same Standard of Patient Care, Day or Night?.....	229
	Treating What One Is Not Comfortable or Competent to Treat.....	230
	Disregarding "Inappropriate" Consultant's Advice	230
	Referral to Specialist at Another Hospital.....	231
	Care of Burn Patient	231

Request for a "Specialist"	232
Patient-requested Laboratory Tests ...	233
DRG Creep	233

SECTION 3. **Ethical Statements Pertaining to Medical Care**

American Medical Association Principles of Medical Ethics (Also Adopted by the American College of Emergency Physicians)	240
Hippocratic Oath	241
American Hospital Association Patient's Bill of Rights	242
World Medical Association International Code of Medical Ethics	244
Declaration of Geneva	245
Oath of Maimonides	246
International Council of Nurses Code for Nurses	247
American Nurses' Association Code for Nurses	248
Emergency Nurses Association (ENA) Standards of Emergency Nursing Practice	249
Emergency Medicine Residents' Association Principles of Medical Ethics	250
Emergency Medical Technician's Oath	251
Emergency Medical Technician's Code of Ethics	252
Nuremberg Code	254
Declaration of Helsinki	255
American Medical Association Ethical Guidelines for Clinical Investigation..	258
Regulations of the Department of Health and Human Services on the Protection of Human Subjects (Selected Portions of Code 45 CFR 46)	260

Glossary	263
Bibliography	269
Index	279

SECTION 1

Introduction

CHAPTER 1
General Introduction

CHAPTER 2
Unique Aspects of Ethics in Emergency Medicine

CHAPTER 3
Legal Setting of Emergency Medicine

CHAPTER 4
What is Ethics?

CHAPTER 5
*An Approach to Ethical Problems in
Emergency Medicine*
