PIERRE-RICHARD AGÉNOR / PETER J. MONTIEL

DEVELOPMENT



MACROECONOMICS

DEVELOPMENT MACROECONOMICS

Pierre-Richard Agénor and Peter J. Montiel

Copyright © 1996 by Princeton University Press

Published by Princeton University Press, 41 William Street,

Princeton, New Jersey 08540

In the United Kingdom: Princeton University Press, Chichester,

West Sussex

All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Agénor, Pierre-Richard.

Development macroeconomics / Pierre-Richard Agénor and Peter J. Montiel.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-691-03413-3 (cloth: alk. paper)

1. Developing countries—Economic conditions. 2. Development economics, 3. Macroeconomics, I, Montiel, Peter, II, Title.

HC59.7.A7422 1996

330.9172'4—dc20

95-2853

This book has been composed in Times Roman

Princeton University Press books are printed on acid-free paper and meet the guidelines for permanence and durability of the Committee on Production Guidelines for Book Longevity of the Council on Library Resources

Printed in the United States of America

10987654321

TO OUR FATHERS,

The late Frédéric, and Pedro, _____

FOR THEIR SUPPORT AND GUIDANCE

Acknowledgments.

THIS BOOK is the product of many years of research in development macroeconomics conducted mostly in the stimulating environment provided by the Research Department of the International Monetary Fund. We owe thanks to many of our colleagues and co-authors in the Fund and elsewhere for commenting on successive chapter drafts and helping to clarify our thinking. We have greatly benefited from comments and discussions over the years with Joshua Aizenman, Carlos Asilis, David Bevan, Jagdeep Bhandari, Eduardo Borensztein, Paul Cashin, José De Gregorio, Sebastián Edwards, Robert Flood, Maxwell Fry, Linda Goldberg, Morris Goldstein, Nadeem Haque, Steven Kamin, Mohsin Khan, Saul Lizondo, Donald Mathieson, Jonathan Ostry, Carmen Reinhart, Julio Santaella, Mark Taylor, Murat Ucer, and Carlos Végh. We are particularly grateful to Joshua Aizenman for reading the complete typescript and suggesting several improvements to preliminary drafts. We would also like to express our appreciation to the publishers of the Handbook of International Macroeconomics, the Journal of Development Economics, the Journal of Macroeconomics, the IMF Staff Papers, and Princeton Essays in International Finance for permission to use material from our published articles.

THIS BOOK on "emerging market" macroeconomics could not be more timely. Around the world, from the transition economies of Europe, Russia, and China to the developing economies of Latin America and Africa, students want to understand, professors want to teach, and policy makers want to address the same kinds of macroeconomic issues. But all too often the answer to their problems is a homegrown refrain: "This country is different, professor. You don't understand."

True, developing economies have market structures and institutions that fundamentally affect the way macroeconomic policies work, and these may in fact make them different. Yet, giving in to the notion that they are different—worse, each uniquely different from any and all others!—throws overboard a vast amount of knowledge and experience that could be brought to bear on solving real problems. The very notion that each country is unique and thus so are its problems is, of course, ridiculous. Major inflation experiences have a vast amount in common, as do stabilization experiences or experiences of trade liberalization or currency overvaluation. In fact, how could one seriously address these problems without looking across the world and asking just how they presented themselves elsewhere? The battle cry "this country is different" is ultimately a scoundrel's plea for protecting outdated interpretations or politicized policy advice from intellectual import competition.

As a guide to the macroeconomics of developing economies, Agénor and Montiel's book uniquely fills the role of bringing together the useful knowledge and evidence of decades of research. It strikes a balance between the recognition that these countries are, in fact, different in interesting and important ways that are relevant to policy making and the recognition that in some deep ways the problems are about the same everywhere. In so doing, the book opens up this area of macroeconomics to an international competition of ideas and professional standards that will enable young researchers, who are willing and able to invest in the requisite skills, to break the control of established pundits who have all too long held a monopoly on interpreting events and mechanisms.

For the past decade, the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund have had the good fortune of having a number of great research directors—Anne Krueger, Stan Fischer, Larry Summers, and Michael Bruno at the Bank and Jacob Frenkel and Michael Mussa at the Fund. They and their colleagues have encouraged active, systematic, and modern research on the macroeconomic problems of developing countries and emerging market

xxii FOREWORD

economies. The need to fill the vacuum was essential both to guide the institutions in their own policy thinking and to make them more effective partners in local dialogue. In doing so, the research departments of the Bank and the Fund have welcomed a talented group of researchers from around the world who have come as senior visitors or brand new staffers. In addition, there is increasingly more research being done in developing economies themselves; returning Ph.D.s as well as students who have not even gone abroad are joining the game. They use modern methods and models to test just what the relationships are, and how important, in fact, special institutions or features turn out to be. In the process, more often than not, they confirm the view that there are striking similarities across borders.

This book takes one step further the progress in cross-border research on developing economies. It systematically integrates the literature and in so doing opens it up to generations of students—both in developing economies and in advanced economies. In using the modern language of formal models, it immediately widens the applicability of an argument across countries, challenges researchers or students to identify their own local counterpart of a variable or structural feature, and highlights the need to adapt or change a particular piece of the model. It thus brings discipline to the question of whether and how a country might differ from a stylized case. Importantly, it shows how opening up, deregulating, or modernizing will change an economy's structural relations, and it specifies where the change will show up.

Of course, the basic question is whether developing economies really are different from the industrialized world. Agénor and Montiel accept the premise that there are at least four important ways in which developing economies differ from stylized advanced countries. First, there is a significant difference in the productive structure. Specifically, the terms of trade play a very important role. That is obvious for a country which is significantly involved in commodity production—Nigeria in oil or Chile in copper, for example. Favorable terms of trade shocks show up as a trade surplus, an income shock for businesses and households, and an improvement in the budget. In principle, the same is true for advanced economies; however, with the exception of oil, no commodity plays a significant enough role to deserve special attention. But maybe even that is wrong—the sharp decline in commodity prices of the past decade may well have played a large role in the relatively painless disinflation among rich countries.

The second special feature of developing economies is the segmentation of markets for capital, labor, and goods. In the capital market, financial repression is the counterpart of a search to control credit and the easily overplayed ability to finance deficits cheaply. In labor markets, the duality of formal and informal markets is a prominent element. In goods markets, protection and the resulting loss of thorough competition are a key feature of price formation. In foreign exchange markets, various forms of exchange control limit market integration and open up the possibility (and often the

FOREWORD XXIII

illusion) of a newfound degree of policy flexibility. These segmentation factors are, indeed, part of the reality of an emerging market. Yet, with the arrival of reform, openness, and deregulation, they are also all on the way out. Even so, there is good reason to pay attention to them, because it will take a while for them to disappear altogether, and the transition itself involves important policy issues. Removing capital controls, deregulating banks, or opening trade cannot be done just as an isolated step; it needs to be part of a more comprehensive macroeconomic package. Trade opening, for example, needs as a countermeasure a real depreciation. Without that, a Mexican- or Chilean-style payments crisis is just a few years off.

Third, the book highlights the open economy aspect of macroeconomics in ways that differ substantially from treatments in the texts written for advanced countries. In the latter, the open economy even today is relegated to a sideshow, despite the fact that it is a key part of what makes up the mechanism and the constraints under which policy operates. Thus, this book might be a more useful guide for students in, say, Spain or Italy than are their usual texts.

Finally, political economy is far more prominent in the macroeconomic operation of developing countries than in established industrial countries. If markets are segemented, the institutional counterpart of that segmentation is often a bureaucracy that benefits from the implicit regulatory power along with economic agents who, by way of factor prices or privileges, enjoy advantages from the status quo. Understanding that link between political economy and structure is the first step in engineering successful reform. It has been said of the Holy Roman Empire that more money was made in the few hundred years of its decline than in the thousands of years of its existence. In a compressed time frame, much the same is strikingly underway in the developing world and in the former socialist countries, as evidenced, for example, by the Mexican billionaires or the appearance of Russia's super rich. If there were nothing special about the macroeconomics of developing and emerging market economies and their transformation, these vast changes in wealth would not have come about.

Agénor and Montiel have done a great job in shaping this book. Development Macroeconomics fills an obvious gap, and it does so in a masterful way. Rather than focusing on formal, self-satisfied theory, the book is centered on the analytical foundations of policy formulation. That makes it especially effective as a teaching instrument and useful as a guide to policy makers and their advisors. For their work and effort, Agénor and Montiel deserve congratulations. They have created a wonderful book and will come away with the satisfaction and reward of great teachers.

Rudiger Dornbusch Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Contents _____

List of Figures	xiv
List of Tables	xvii
Foreword	xxi
Introduction and Overview	3
Overview of the Book	4
Some Methodological Issues	8
One	
Scope of Development Macroeconomics	11
1.1 Monetarism, Structuralism, and Developing Nations	13
1.2 Economic Structure and Macroeconomic Analysis	16
1.2.1 Openness to Trade in Commodities and Assets	16
1.2.2 Long-Run Supply Behavior	22
1.2.3 Short-Run Supply Behavior	22
1.2.4 Financial Markets	23
1.2.5 Characteristics of the Government Budget	26
1.2.6 Characteristics of Private Behavior	29
1.2.7 Stability of Policy Regimes	30
1.3 Development Macroeconomics: Special Topics	32
PART I MACROECONOMIC RELATIONSHIPS	
AND MARKET STRUCTURE	35
Two	
Aggregate Accounts, Production, and Market Structure	37
2.1 A General Accounting Framework	38
2.1.1 The Nonfinancial Private Sector	38
2.1.2 The Public Sector	40
2.1.3 The Commercial Banking System	42
2.1.4 Aggregate Relationships	43
2.2 Production Structure in an Open Economy	44
2.2.1 The Mundell-Fleming Model	44
2.2.2 The "Dependent Economy" Model	48
2.2.3 A Model with Three Goods	52
2.3 The Structure of Labor Markets	55
2.3.1 Functioning of Labor Markets	55
2.3.2 Output and Unemployment	57

viii	CONTENTS

2.3.3 Indexation and Wage Rigidity	60
2.3.4 Labor Market Segmentation	62
2.4 Informal Financial Markets	64
2.4.1 Informal Loan Markets	65
2.4.2 Parallel Markets for Foreign Exchange	67
Three	
Behavioral Functions	73
3.1 Consumption and Saving	73
3.1.1 Consumption Smoothing	77
3.1.2 Length of Planning Horizon	
and Liquidity Constraints	78
3.1.3 Effects of Interest Rate Changes on Savings	79
3.1.4 Public and Private Consumption	80
3.2 Private Investment	81
3.2.1 Specification Issues	81
3.2.2 Determinants of Private Investment: The Evidence	84
3.3 The Demand for Money	86
3.3.1 Conventional Money Demand Models	87
3.3.2 Currency Substitution and the Demand for Money	89
3.4 Aggregate Supply Functions	96
3.4.1 Cross-Regime Tests	97
3.4.2 Within-Regime Tests	98
3.4.3 An Assessment of the Evidence	101
PART II SHORT-RUN MACROECONOMIC POLICIES	103
Four	
Fiscal Deficits, Public Solvency, and the Macroeconomy	105
4.1 The Government Budget Constraint	106
4.1.1 The Consolidated Budget Deficit	106
4.1.2 The Measurement of Fiscal Deficits	109
4.1.3 Seignorage and Inflationary Finance	111
4.2 Policy Consistency and the Solvency Constraint	121
4.2.1 The Intertemporal Solvency Constraint	122
4.2.2 Financing Constraints and Policy Consistency	125
4.3 Macroeconomic Effects of Fiscal Deficits	126
4.3.1 Ricardian Equivalence	127
4.3.2 Deficits, Inflation, and the "Tight Money" Paradox	128
4.3.3 Deficits, Real Interest Rates, and Crowding Out	137
4.3.4 Deficits, the Current Account,	
and the Real Exchange Rate	147

CONTENTS	ix
Five	
Financial Markets, Capital Mobility, and Monetary Policy	151
5.1 Financial Repression: Macroeconomic Effects	152
5.2 Financial Repression, the Inflation Tax,	
and Capital Controls	153
5.2.1 Financial Repression and Inflationary Finance	154
5.2.2 A General Public-Finance Approach	157
5.3 Capital Mobility: Empirical Evidence	159
5.3.1 The Magnitude of Gross Flows	160
5.3.2 Tests of Interest Parity Conditions	161
5.3.3 Tests of Monetary Autonomy	165
5.3.4 Saving-Investment Correlations	166
5.3.5 Summary	167
5.4 Models of Informal Credit and Foreign Exchange Markets	167
5.4.1 Models of Informal Credit Markets	168
5.4.2 Models of Informal Currency Markets	174
5.5 Monetary Policy with Informal Financial Markets	180
5.5.1 The Analytical Framework	181
5.5.2 Changes in Monetary Policy Instruments	185
Six	400
Exchange-Rate Management I: Credibility and Crises	190
6.1 Evidence on Exchange-Rate Regimes	190
6.2 Credibility and Exchange-Rate Management	195
6.2.1 Time Inconsistency and Exchange-Rate Policy	196
6.2.2 Credibility of a Fixed Exchange Rate	200
6.2.3 Reputation, Signaling, and Exchange-Rate	
Commitment	201
6.2.4 Credibility Effects of Monetary Unions	203
6.3 Speculative Attacks and Balance-of-Payments Crises	207
6.3.1 A Model of Exchange Regime Collapse	208
6.3.2 Extensions to the Basic Framework	213
6.3.3 Evidence on Balance-of-Payments Crises	218
Seven	
Exchange-Rate Management II: Contractionary Devaluation and	202
Real-Exchange-Rate Rules	223
7.1 Contractionary Devaluation	224
7.1.1 Effects on Aggregate Demand	224
7.1.2 Effects on Aggregate Supply	240
7.1.3 Empirical Evidence	248

7.2 Real-Exchange-Rate Targeting	255
7.2.1 The Analytical Framework	25€
7.2.2 Targeting the Real Exchange Rate	258
7.2.3 Effects of Macroeconomic Shocks	260
,	
PART III ANALYSIS OF STABILIZATION PROGRAMS	263
Eight	
An Overview of Stabilization Programs	265
8.1 Populism	267
8.1.1 Chile under Allende (1970–73)	267
8.1.2 Peru under García (1986–90)	269
8.2 Orthodox Money-Based Stabilization	270
8.2.1 Chile (September 1973)	271
8.2.2 Bolivia (August 29, 1985)	272
8.3 Exchange-Rate-Based (Southern Cone)	
Stabilization Programs	275
8.3.1 Chile (February 1978)	275
8.3.2 Uruguay (October 1978)	276
8.3.3 Argentina (December 1978)	280
8.4 Heterodox Programs	282
8.4.1 Argentina (June 14, 1985)	282
8.4.2 Israel (July 1, 1985)	286
8.4.3 Brazil (February 28, 1986)	290
8.4.4 Mexico (December 1987)	293
Nine	
Inflation and Short-Run Dynamics	298
9.1 Models of the Inflationary Process	298
9.1.1 Inflation, Money, and Fiscal Deficits	299
9.1.2 Food Supply, Distribution, and the Wage-Price Cycle	306
9.1.3 A Structuralist-Monetarist Model	311
9.2 Dynamics of Monetary and Exchange-Rate Rules	314
9.2.1 A One-Good Framework	314
9.2.2 A Three-Good Model with Sticky Wages	327
Ten	
Analytical Issues in Disinflation	
Programs	338
10.1 Two Puzzles in Exchange-Rate-Based Programs	338
10.1.1 The Boom-Recession Cycle	339
10.1.2 The Behavior of Real Interest Rates	356

10.2	The Role of Credibility in Disinflation Programs	359
	10.2.1 Sources of Credibility Problems	360
	10.2.2 Enhancing the Credibility of Disinflation	
	Programs	365
	10.2.3 Policy Lessons	378
10.3	Disinflation and Nominal Anchors	381
	pendix: Output Effects of Price Controls	385
Eleven		
Stabiliz	ation Policies with Informal Financial Markets	389
11.1	An Integrated Analytical Framework	389
	11.1.1 Structure of the Model	390
	11.1.2 Effects of Interest Rate Liberalization	399
11.2	A General Equilibrium Simulation Model	403
	11.2.1 Structure of the Model	404
	11.2.2 Effects of Stabilization Policies	409
App	pendix: Equations of the Simulation Model	416
PART :	IV GROWTH, DEBT, AND STRUCTURAL REFORMS	419
Twelve		
Models	of Stabilization and Growth	421
12.1	Bank-Fund Models	423
	12.1.1 The IMF Financial Programming Model	423
	12.1.2 The World Bank RMSM Model	425
	12.1.3 A Simple Bank-Fund Model of Stabilization	
	and Growth	426
12.2	"Three-Gap" Models	427
	Macroeconometric Models	431
	12.3.1 Structure of Production	432
	12.3.2 Aggregate Supply	433
	12.3.3 Aggregate Demand	434
12.4	Computable General Equilibrium Models	436
	pendix: The Khan-Knight Monetary Disequilibrium Model	439
Thirte	en	
The De	bt Overhang, Investment, and Growth	442
13.1	Origins of the Debt Crisis	444
	13.1.1 Public Sector Solvency	444
	13.1.2 Application to the Debt Crisis	446
	Policy Response and Macroeconomic Implications	450
13.3	Resolution of the Crisis: The Brady Plan	454
	13.3.1 Outline of the Plan	454
	13.3.2 Macroeconomic Effects: Conceptual Issues	456

xii CONTENTS

App	13.3.3 An Overview of Some Early Brady Plan Deals pendix: Incentive Effects of a Debt Overhang	463 468
Fourte	en	
	Financial, and Exchange-Rate Reforms	472
14.1	Monetary and Financial Liberalization	472
	14.1.1 Monetary Reform	473
	14.1.2 Financial Liberalization	477
14.2	Unification of Foreign Exchange Markets	479
	14.2.1 Short-Run Dynamics of Unification	479
	14.2.2 Longer-Run Effects of Unification	487
	14.2.3 Evidence on Unification Attempts	489
14.3	Macroeconomic Effects of Trade Reforms	491
	14.3.1 Trade Reforms: Some Recent Evidence	492
	14.3.2 Trade Liberalization, Wage Rigidity,	
	and Employment	494
14.4	Sequencing and Speed of Reforms	499
	14.4.1 Sequencing of Reforms	500
	14.4.2 Adjustment Costs, Credibility, and the Speed	
	of Reform	505
PART '	V ENDOGENOUS GROWTH, POLITICAL	
	OMY, AND LABOR MARKETS	509
Fifteen		
	Capital, Financial Intermediation, and Growth	511
	•	
	The Neoclassical Growth Model	513
15.2	Endogenous Growth Theories: A Brief Overview	518
	15.2.1 Externalities and Increasing Returns	519
	15.2.2 Human Capital and Knowledge	520
	15.2.3 Effects of Financial Intermediation	522
15.3	Empirical Evidence and Assessment	527
Sixteen		
The Pol	litical Economy of Stabilization and Adjustment	533
16.1	Politics, Economic Policy, and Adjustment	533
	16.1.1 The Political Economy of Structural Adjustment	534
	16.1.2 Political Instability, Inflation, and Fiscal Deficits	536
16.2	Political Stabilization Cycles	536
	16.2.1 "Opportunistic" Models	537
	16.2.2 Models with Informational Asymmetries	543
16.3	Elections-Induced Economic Cycles: The Evidence	545
	16.3.1 Informal Evidence	546
	16.3.2 Econometric Evidence	547

CONTENTS	xiii
Seventeen Macroeconomic Adjustment with Segmented Labor Markets	556
17.1 A Partial-Equilibrium Framework	556
17.2 A Macroeconomic Model with Segmented Labor Markets	559
17.2.1 Output and the Labor Market	559
17.2.2 Consumption and the Market for Nontraded Goods	562
17.2.3 The Government	563
17.2.4 Labor Market Adjustment	563
17.3 Government Spending, Real Wages, and Employment 17.4 Labor Heterogeneity, Minimum Wages,	564
and Unemployment	567
Epilogue	571
Notes	575
References	625
Index of Names	661
Index of Subjects	671

List of Figures _____

1.1	Distribution of World Output, 1993	12
1.2	World Commodity Prices	19
1.3	Developing Countries: Terms of Trade and Nonfuel Commodity Prices	20
1.4	Inflation and Seignorage in Industrial and Developing Countries	30
2.1	Internal and External Balance in the Mundell-Fleming Model	47
2.2	Classical Equilibrium in the Dependent-Economy Model	51
2.3	Effects of a Negative Terms-of-Trade Shock in the Three-Good Model	54
2.4	Output and Unemployment in Developing Countries	58
2.5	Real Wages and Unemployment in Developing Countries	61
2.6	Korea: Formal and Informal Interest Rates	66
2.7	Parallel Market Premiums in Developing Countries	69
2.8	Exchange Rate and Price Variability in Developing Countries	71
3.1	Foreign-Currency Deposits Held in Domestic Banks	90
3.2	Foreign-Currency Deposits Held Abroad	92
4.1	Mexico: Public Sector Fiscal Balance	109
4.2	Inflation and Revenue from Inflationary Finance	114
4.3	Inflation, Inflationary Finance, and Total Tax Revenue	117
4.4	Inflation and Fiscal Deficits	129
4.5	Steady-State Equilibrium with Constant Conventional Deficit	135
4.6	Dynamics with Constant Conventional Deficit	136
4.7	Fiscal Deficits and Real Interest Rates	138
4.8	Steady-State Equilibrium with Zero Capital Mobility	144
4.9	Permanent and Temporary Increases in Government Spending with Zero Capital Mobility	145
5.1	Seignorage, Reserve Ratio, and the Inflation Tax	155
5.2	Determination of Output and the Informal Interest Rate in van Wijnbergen's Model	172

LIST	OF FIGURES	XV
5.3	Devaluation, Underinvoicing, and the Current Account	178
6.1	Credibility and Commitment: Alternative Equilibria	199
6.2	The Process of a Balance-of-Payments Crisis	212
7.1	Equilibrium under a Real-Exchange-Rate Rule	259
7.2	Effect of an Improvement in the Terms of Trade	261
8.1	Inflation and Price Controls in Brazil, 1984-90	294
9.1	Seignorage and Dual Inflation Equilibria	300
9.2	Fiscal Deficits and Inflation with Gradual Adjustment of the Money Market	304
9.3	Equilibrium in the New Structuralist Model	308
9.4	The Wage-Price Cycle in the New Structuralist Model	310
9.5	Equilibrium with Money and Food Subsidies in the New Structuralist Model	313
9.6	Steady-State Equilibrium in the One-Good Model	322
9.7	Reduction in the Devaluation Rate in the One-Good Model	324
10.1	Real Interest Rates in the Tablita Experiments	340
10.2	Real Interest Rates in Heterodox Experiments	341
10.3	Equilibrium and Adjustment in the Rodríguez Model	343
10.4	Dynamics of the Calvo-Végh "Temporariness" Model with Imperfect Credibility	350
10.5	Price Controls under Competitive and Monopolistic Markets	386
11.1	Steady-State Equilibrium with Constant Reserves	402
11.2	Increase in Interest Rates on Bank Deposits	403
12.1	The Polak Model	425
12.2	The Three-Gap Model	430
12.3	Logical Structure of the Khan-Knight Model	440
13.1	Growth and Real Interest Rates in Highly Indebted Developing Countries	447
14.1	Steady-State Equilibrium Prior to Reform	482
14.2	Dynamics upon Unification: Case I	484
14.3	Dynamics upon Unification: Case II	485
14.4	Chile: Trade Volumes and the Real Exchange Rate	495
15.1	Growth and Initial Per-Capita Income in Developing Countries	518