FOURTH **E**DITION

SOCIAL WELFARE

POLITICS AND PUBLIC POLICY

DIANA M. DINITTO

Fourth Edition

Social Welfare

Politics and Public Policy

Diana M. DiNitto

The University of Texas at Austin

For my family and for everyone who has known AIDS

Vice President/Publisher: Susan Badger

Managing Editor: Judy Fifer
Executive Editor: Karen Hanson
Editorial Assistant: Sarah Dunbar

Executive Marketing Manager: Joyce Nilsen Editorial-Production Service: Thomas E. Dorsaneo

Cover Administrator: Linda Knowles Composition Buyer: Linda Cox Manufacturing Buyer: Megan Cochran



Copyright © 1995, 1991, 1987, 1983 by Allyn & Bacon A Simon & Schuster Company Needham Heights, Mass. 02194

All rights reserved. No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without the written permission of the copyright owner.

DiNitto, Diana M.

Social welfare : politics and public policy / Diana M. DiNitto — 4th ed.

p. ch

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-13-063819-6:

1. Public welfare—United States. 2. United States—Social policy. I. Title.

HV95.D56 1995 361.6′13′0973—dc20

94-29493

CIP

Printed in the United States of America

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 99 98 97 96 95 94

Preface

Social Welfare: Politics and Public Policy, Fourth Edition, is intended to introduce students to the major social welfare policies and programs in the United States and to stimulate them to think about major conflicts in social welfare today. The focus of the book is on *issues*, and it emphasizes that social welfare in the United States involves a series of *political* questions about what should be done for groups such as the poor, the near poor, and the nonpoor—or whether anything should be done at all.

Social Welfare: Politics and Public Policy describes the major social welfare programs—their histories, trends, and current problems and prospects. But more importantly, it tackles the difficult conflicts and controversies that surround these programs. Social welfare policy is *not* presented as a series of solutions to social problems. Instead, social policy is portrayed as public conflict over the nature and causes of social welfare problems; over what, if anything, should be done about them; over who should do it; and over who should decide about it.

Some of the major policies and programs covered in this book are

Social Security
Unemployment compensation
Workers' compensation
Supplemental Security Income
Vocational rehabilitation
The Americans with Disabilities Act
Child support enforcement
Aid to Families with Dependent
Children
General Assistance
Food Stamp Program
School lunch and breakfast

programs

Special Supplemental Food Program for Women, Infants, and Children Community action programs
Job Training Partnership Act
Job Opportunities and Basic Skills program
Mental health services
The Older Americans Act
Child protective services
Medicare
Medicaid
Civil rights legislation
Immigration legislation

Although it is impossible to capture all the complexities of social welfare in the United States in a single volume, these policies and programs are described and analyzed, and alternative proposals and "reforms" are considered. Public policies that address gender inequities and the inequities faced by members of various ethnic groups are also addressed.

This book is designed for undergraduate and beginning graduate courses in social welfare policy. It does not require prior knowledge of social welfare, and it may serve as a springboard to further interest in social welfare policies and programs.

Many texts on social policy treat social insurance, public assistance, and social service programs *descriptively*; by so doing, they tend to obscure important conflicts and issues. Other books treat these programs *prescriptively*; by so doing, they imply that there is a "right" way to resolve social problems. *Social Welfare: Politics and Public Policy* views social policy as a *continuing political struggle* over the issues posed by poverty and other social welfare problems in society—different goals and objectives, competing definitions of problems, alternative approaches and strategies, multiple programs and policies, competing proposals for "reform," and different ideas about how decisions should be made in social welfare policy.

I owe a special debt to Professor Thomas R. Dye. Although he no longer appears as a coauthor of the book, without him there would never have been a book at all. I wish to thank the reviewers who commented on previous editions, including reviewers of the Third Edition: Professor Doris Burton, Indiana University; Professor Matthew Kinkley, Lima Technical College; and Professor Lon Johnston, University of Mary Hardin-Baylor. I wish to especially thank two reviewers who provided in-depth comments on this edition: Professor Robert B. Hudson of Boston University, and Professor Lon Johnston of the University of Mary Hardin-Baylor. Comments by Charles Lynn Usher were also helpful in revising the chapter on nutrition policy. I also want to thank Margaret Oakes, Sue Plattsmier, Carol Dodgen, Dorie Martinez, Phyllis Bassole, and Kelly Larson for their assistance in helping me complete this edition. Several users of the book, both faculty and students, have communicated with me about the third edition. I appreciate their interest and look forward to further contacts with readers.

D.M.D.

Contents

Preface xi

Politics, Rationalism, and Social Welfare 1
Politics and Social Welfare Policy 1
Scope of Social Welfare Policy 2
Social Welfare Policy: A Rational Approach 4
Social Welfare Policy: A Political Approach 7
Illustration 1-1: Special Tips for the Legislative Process
The Policymaking Process 12
Agenda Setting 13
Nondecisions 13
The Mass Media 14
The Budget 14
Implementation 16
The American Public and Social Welfare 17
Illustration 1-2: How Americans See It 18
America's Capacity for Giving 21
Political Ideology and Social Welfare 22
Illustration 1-3: The Language of Political Ideology 23
PACs and Social Welfare 28
Summary 31
Notes 31
1.8
Government and Social Welfare 35
Historical Perspectives on Social Welfare 35
Elizabethan Poor Law 36
Early Relief in the United States 37

The Great Depression and the New Deal 38	
The Great Society and the War on Poverty 39	
Illustration 2-1: The Revolution No One Noticed 40	
The Expansion of Social Welfare 42	
The Rural-to-Urban Migration 42	
Residency Requirements Eliminated 43	
Welfare Rights 43	
Cost-of-Living Adjustments 44	
The Graying of America 45	
Increase in Single-Parent Families 45	
Finances in the Welfare State 46	
The Legacy of "Reaganomics" 49	
The Supply Side 49	
No New Taxes? 51	
Helping the "Truly Needy" 52	
The States as Laboratories 53	
Privatization 54	
The Reagan-Bush Finale 56	
Clinton's New Covenant 56	
Reining in the Deficit 57	
Stimulating Job Growth 61	
Clinton's Big Three 61	
Summary 62	
Notes 64	
Defining Poverty: Where to Begin? 67	
What Is Poverty? 67	
Poverty as Deprivation 68	
In-kind Benefits: How Much Are They Worth?	72
Who Are the Poor? 73	
Poverty as Inequality 77	
Why Are the Poor, Poor? 79	
Poverty as Culture 81	
Poverty as Exploitation 83	
Poverty as Structure 85	
Poor and Homeless: Not Invisible Anymore 87	
Who Are the Homeless? 87	
Affordable Housing 89	
<i>Illustration 3-1: Poverty at the Martinique</i> 90	
<i>Illustration 3-2: The Homelessness Muddle</i> 92	
Does Welfare Cause Poverty? 94	
Summary 97	
Summary 97	

Preventing Poverty: The Social Insurance Programs 103 Preventing Poverty Through Compulsory Savings The Social Security Act OASDI: Now the Nation's Largest Social Program 106 Even the Best-Laid Plans 108 Illustration 4-1: Social Security—Who Qualifies, and How Much Does Each Receive? 112 Out of the Woods? 113 Achieving Equity in Social Security 114 **Unemployment Compensation** What Is Unemployment, and Who Gets Counted as Unemployed? 120 Reforming Unemployment Insurance Workers' Compensation Summary 125 127 Notes Helping the "Deserving Poor": Aged, Blind, and Disabled 131 Public Assistance for the Deserving Poor SSI: "Federalizing" Public Assistance 133 How SSI Works Disability Determination 135 *Illustration 5-1: Determining SSI Payments for Aged Recipients* 136 Recipients, Payments, and Costs of SSI **Payments** 139 139 Costs Toward the Future of SSI 140 Rehabilitative Services for Individuals with Disabilities 141 The Vocational Rehabilitation Program Creaming 142 The Era of Civil Rights for People with Disabilities 143 Deinstitutionalization and Normalization Illustration 5-2: Neighbors Pull in the Welcome Mats 145 The Independent Living Movement Illustration 5-3: What Is Reasonable Accommodation for People with Disabilities? 148 A New Bill of Rights for People with Disabilities 149 Children with Disabilities 152 Developmental Disabilities Program 152 Mainstreaming 153 Building a Better Policy on Disability 154 A Fair Definition 154 A Fair Policy

General Assistance: The State and Community Response to Welfare Federalism and Social Welfare 159 Summary 162 Notes 164 **Assisting Poor Families: Aid to Families** with Dependent Children 167 The Development of AFDC 167 Mother's Aid 167 Aid to Dependent Children Keeping the Family Together 168 Man-in-the-House Rules Making Parents Pay 170 AFDC and Work Illustration 6-1 What Mothers and Fathers Say About Child Support Enforcement 174 Rehabilitation for Work 177 178 Job Training and WIN Workfare 179 Illustration 6-2: Three Patterns of AFDC Receipt 180 The JOBS Program 183 *Growth of the AFDC Program* 186 Number of Recipients 186 **Increasing Costs** 187 Monthly Payments and the Cost of Living 187 *Illustration 6-3: Applying for AFDC* 191 What Are AFDC Families Like? 194 Illustration 6-4: Rethinking Welfare Ending Welfare as We Know It 197 Nonwelfare Approaches 197 The Conservative's View 199 Can Clinton Succeed? 200 Summary 202 Notes 203 Fighting Hunger: Nutrition Policy and Programs in the United States 207 Malnutrition Amid Plenty 207 Setting Nutritional Policy 209 Commodity Food Distribution 209 A New Food Stamp Program 210 Politics Discovers Hunger 210 Eliminating the Purchase Requirement 211 Politics Rediscovers Hunger 212

The Food Stamp Program Today

215 Illustration 7-1: Remarks from the Hunger Forum, 1993 Determining Eligibility 216 Participants and Costs 218 Illustration 7-2: A Client's View of the Food Stamp Program Illustration 7-3: How People Survive on Leftovers Nutrition Programs for Younger, Older, and Disabled Americans 222 Meals for School Children 223 WIC 225 227 Nutrition for Older Adults More Nutrition Programs 227 Nutritional Politics 228 In Kind or in Cash? 228 *Illustration 7-4: The Thrifty Food Plan—How Much Is It Worth?* 229 Social Welfare Benefits in the Electronic Age How Much Fraud, Abuse, and Error in Welfare? 234 Who Should Administer Nutrition Programs? 237 238 Summary 238 Notes Improving Health Care: Treating the Nation's Ills 243 Good Health or Medical Attention? Health Care Policy Today Medicaid: Health Care for the Poor Illustration 8-1: Who Can Get Medicaid in Texas? 250 Illustration 8-2: The Medicaid Maze in Texas Medicare: Health Care for Older Americans 254 Medigaps 255 Long-Term Care 256 What Ails Medicine? 258 The Nation's Health Care Bill 259 Diagnosis-Related Groups Controlling Physician Fees 263 Private Health Care—HMOs, PPOs, and Managed Care 265 *Illustration 8-3: A Health Care Glossary* 266 The Politics of Health Care for All The Health Security Act Competing Proposals Health Care—Some Ethical Dilemmas 274 Summary 276 277 Notes Warring on Poverty: Victories, Defeats, and Stalemates The Curative Strategy—The "War on Poverty" 281 **Curative Attempts** 282

Kennedy Initiatives

LBJ and the Economic Opportunity Act

284

Community Action

Youth Education

285 Legal Services More Office of Economic Opportunity Projects 286 The Great Society 287 Politics Overtakes the War on Poverty 287 Illustration 9-1: Middle-Class Demands for Police Likely to Be Legacy of L.A. Riots 290 Can Head Start "Cure" Poverty? 291 **Evaluating Head Start** Political Reaction Years Later 293 Fueling Employment: Make-Work Versus the Real Thing 294 The Job Training Partnership Act 296 The Clinton Agenda The U.S. Employment Service: Matching Jobs and Workers 299 Will the Minimum Wage Get a Raise? 300 **Enterprise and Empowerment Zones** 301 More Enterprising Ideas 302 A National Service Program 302 Summary 303 Notes 305 10 Providing Social Services: Help for Children, the Elderly, and People with Mental Illness 307 Social Services in the United States 307 Who Provides Social Services? 308 The Development of Social Services 310 Social Services for People with Alcohol, Drug, and Mental Health Problems 311 Defining the Problems 311 **Estimating Problems and Services** 312 Finding Better Prevention and Treatment Approaches 314 Community Mental Health Centers A War on Drugs 317 Toward the Future of ADM Services The Rights of Mental Health Consumers 319 Liberty or Neglect? Too Much Access or Too Little? 322 From Deinstitutionalization to Recriminalization Illustration 10-1: Thirty Years of Shame: The Scandalous Neglect of the Homeless Mentally Ill 325 Child Welfare Policy Discovering Child Abuse 327

Illustration 10-2: Little Mary Ellen 329
Extent of Child Maltreatment 330
Services for Abused and Neglected Children 330
Problems with the System 333
Social Services for Older Americans 335
Summary 339
Notes 341

11 Challenging Social Welfare: Racism and Sexism 345

Gender Inequities 345

The Feminization of Poverty 346

The Wage Gap and Comparable Worth 348

Equal Rights for Women 352

Family Care 355

Illustration 11-1: Gender Police, Juvenile Division 356

Sexual Harassment 358

No Consensus on Abortion Rights 360

Domestic Violence 364

Gay Rights 365

Blacks, Hispanics, and Social Welfare 368

Separate But Not Equal 369

The Civil Rights Act 371

Housing and Racial Discrimination 372

Affirmative Action 373

Voting Rights 377

Native Americans and Social Welfare 378

Illustration 11-2: The Reservation Conditions 379

Immigration and Social Welfare 383

Immigration Policy 383

How Much Immigration? 386

Summary 389

Notes 390

12 Implementing and Evaluating Social Welfare Policy: What Happens after a Law Is Passed 395

The Politics of Implementation 395

Communications 396

Resources 398

Attitudes 400

Bureaucracy 400

Evaluating Social Policy 403

Illustration 12-1: Highlights of E.O. No. 12862: "Setting Customer Standards," September 11, 1993 403

Illustration 12-2: Like a New Drug, Social Programs Are Put to the Test: Use of Controls Helps Put the Science into Social Science Policy Evaluation as a Rational Activity Illustration 12-3: Rational Evaluation: What Questions to Ask 409 The Many Faces of Program Evaluation 410 Public Hearings 411 Site Visits Program Measures 411 Comparison with Professional Standards 411 Formal Research Designs Policy Evaluation as a Political Activity Unclear, Ambiguous Program Goals Symbolic Goals 415 Unhappy Findings 415 Program Interference 415 Illustration 12-4: What to Do if Your Agency's Program Receives a Negative Evaluation 416 Usefulness of Evaluations 416 Evaluation by Whom? Threats to Everyone 417 Politics at Work: Evaluating the Guaranteed Annual Income 417 Experiment Illustration 12-5: Principles of Quick Evaluation Summary 421 Illustration 12-6: Studies Find Drug Program Not Effective (yet high-level *supporters argue 'it's better to have it than not have it')* Notes 424

Name Index 426

Subject Index 428

Chapter 1

Politics, Rationalism, and Social Welfare

Politics and Social Welfare Policy

No one is happy with the nation's public assistance system—not the working taxpayers who must support it, not the social welfare professionals who must administer it, and certainly not the poor who must live under it. Even the nation's social insurance system has become a source of controversy. Since the Social Security Act of 1935, the federal government has tried to develop a rational social welfare system for the entire nation. Today a wide variety of federal programs serve people who are aged, poor, disabled, sick, or have other social needs. Income maintenance (social insurance and public assistance) is now the largest single item in the federal budget, easily surpassing national defense. The U.S. Department of Health and Human Services has the largest budget of any department of the federal government, and many additional social welfare programs are administered by other departments. Yet even after sixty years of large-scale, direct federal involvement, social welfare policy remains a central issue in U.S. politics.

Social welfare policy involves a series of *political* issues about what should be done for the poor, the near-poor, and the nonpoor—or whether anything should be done at all. The real problems in social welfare are not problems of organization, administration, or service delivery. Rather, they involve political conflicts over the nature and causes of poverty and inequality, the role of government in society, the burdens to be carried by taxpayers, the appropriate strategies for coping with social problems, the issues posed by specific social insurance and public assistance programs, the relative reliance to be placed on providing cash rather than services to the poor, the need for reform, and the nature of the decision-making process itself. In short, social welfare policy is a continuing

political struggle over the issues posed by poverty and inequality and by other social problems in society.

Policymaking is frequently portrayed as a *rational* process in which policymakers identify social problems, explore all the solutions to a problem, forecast all the benefits and costs of each solution, compare benefits to costs for each solution, and select the best ratio of benefits to costs. In examining social welfare policy, I shall explore both the strengths and weaknesses of this rational model.

More importantly, I portray social welfare policy as a political process—as conflict over the nature and causes of poverty and other social problems and over what, if anything, should be done about them. Social welfare policy is political because of disagreements about the nature of the problems confronting society, about what should be considered "benefits" and "costs," about how to estimate and compare benefits and costs, about the likely consequences of alternative policies, about the importance of one's own needs and aspirations in relation to those of others, and about the ability of government to do anything "rationally." You will see that the political barriers to rational policymaking are indeed very great.

Scope of Social Welfare Policy

Social welfare policy is anything a government chooses to do, or not to do, that affects the quality of life of its people. Broadly conceived, social welfare policy includes nearly everything government does—from taxation, national defense, and energy conservation, to health care, housing, and public assistance. More elaborate definitions of social welfare policy are available; most of these definitions refer to actions of government that have an "impact on the welfare of citizens by providing them with services or income."²

Some scholars have insisted that government activities must have "a goal, objective, or purpose," in order to be labeled a "policy." This definition implies a difference between governmental actions in general and an overall plan of action toward a specific goal. The problem, however, in insisting that government actions must have goals in order to be labeled as "policy" is that we can never be sure what the goal of a particular government action is. We generally assume that if a government chooses to do something there must be a goal, objective, or purpose, but often we find that bureaucrats who helped write the law, lobbyists who pushed for its enactment, and members of Congress who voted for it all had different goals, objectives, and purposes in mind! Multiple goals are not necessarily a bad thing, especially when they mean that more people stand to benefit from a policy, but any of the intentions of a law (stated or not) may also be quite different from what government agencies actually do. All we can really observe is what governments choose to do or not do.

Political scientists Heinz Eulau and Kenneth Prewitt supply still another definition of public policy: "Policy is defined as a 'standing decision' characterized by behavioral consistency and repetitiveness on the part of those who make it and those who abide by it." It might be a wonderful thing if government activities were characterized by "consistency and repetitiveness"—that they seem

to have "rhyme and reason"—but it is doubtful that we would ever find a public policy in government if we insisted on these criteria. As you shall see, much of what government does is neither consistent nor repetitive.

Note that I will focus not only on government action but also on government *in*action—that is, on what governments choose *not* to do. Government inaction can have just as important an impact on society as government action.

For practical purposes, I will limit much of the discussion to the policies of government that directly affect the income, services, and opportunities available to people who are aged, poor, disabled, ill, or otherwise vulnerable. I discourage lengthy discussions of the definition of social welfare policy. These discussions are often futile, even exasperating, since few people can agree on a single definition of social welfare policy. Moreover, these discussions divert attention away from the study of specific social welfare policies.

The boundaries of social welfare policy are indeed fuzzy, but clarifying subjects of concern and interest can be viewed as a challenge, not an obstacle. Specifically, this book addresses major government programs in

Income maintenance

Social Security

Unemployment compensation

Workers' compensation

Supplemental Security Income (SSI)

Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC)

General Assistance

Nutrition

Food stamps

School lunches and breakfasts

Special Supplemental Food Program for Women, Infants, and Children (WIC)

Congregate meals

Meals-on-wheels

Health

Medicaid

Medicare

Public health

Social services

Child protective services

Family preservation services

Community mental health services

Day care and preschool education for children

Employment services

Job training

Independent living and long-term care services for persons who are elderly or disabled

Vocational rehabilitation

Some of these social welfare programs are called public assistance because people must be poor (according to legal standards) in order to receive benefits; benefits are paid out of general-revenue funds. Public assistance programs (what most people simply call "welfare") include AFDC, food stamps, Medicaid, SSL school lunches and breakfasts, and General Assistance. Other social welfare programs are called **social insurance** because they are designed to prevent poverty. Workers, as well as their employers, pay into these programs; then, upon retirement or disability, these former workers are entitled to benefits, regardless of their wealth. Social insurance programs include Social Security, Medicare, unemplayment compensation, and workers' compensation. Still other social welfare programs are labeled social services because they provide care, counseling, education, or other forms of assistance to children, elderly individuals, those with disabilities, and others with particular needs. Child protective services, day care, early education, homemaker services, job training, mental health care, and vocational rehabilitation are all examples of social services. I shall also consider a number of issues that affect the provision of social welfare services, such as civil rights legislation, the status of women and certain ethnic or racial groups in society, and the influx of immigrants to the United States.

This book seeks, first of all, to describe the country's major social welfare programs. But it is also concerned with the causes of social welfare policy—why policy is what it is. In order to understand contemporary social welfare policy, it is necessary to learn about some of the social, economic, and political forces that have shaped social welfare policy in America. This book is concerned with how social welfare policies have developed and changed over time. It is also concerned with the consequences of social welfare policies—their effects on target groups and on society in general. Furthermore, the chapters that follow consider some alternative policies—possible changes, "reforms," improvements, or phaseouts. Finally, this book is concerned with political conflict over the nature and causes of poverty and other social problems—and conflict over what, if anything, should be done about them.

Social Welfare Policy: A Rational Approach

Ideally, social welfare policy ought to be rational. A policy is rational if the ratio between the values it achieves and the values it sacrifices is positive and higher than any other policy alternative. Although this might be viewed as a strictly economic (cost–benefit) approach, we should not measure benefits and costs only in a narrow dollar-and-cents framework while ignoring basic social values. The idea of rationalism involves the calculation of *all* social, political, and economic values sacrificed or achieved by a public policy, not just those that can be measured in dollars.

Rationalism has been proposed as an "ideal" approach to both studying and making public policy.⁵ Indeed, it has been argued that rationalism provides a single "model of choice" that can be applied to all kinds of problems, large and small, public and private.⁶ Most government policies are far from being entirely