

Allan D. Windt

Insurance Claims And Disputes

Representation of Insureds & Insurers

INSURANCE CLAIMS AND DISPUTES: Representation of Insurance Companies and Insureds

Allan D. Windt

Spector Cohen Gadon & Rosen
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Member of the Pennsylvania,
Florida, District of Columbia
and North Carolina Bars

SHEPARD'S/McGRAW-HILL

P.O. Box 1235
Colorado Springs, Colorado 80901

McGRAW-HILL BOOK COMPANY

New York • St. Louis • San Francisco • Colorado Springs
Auckland • Bogota • Hamburg • Johannesburg • London
Madrid • Mexico • Montreal • New Delhi • Panama
Paris • São Paulo • Singapore • Sydney • Tokyo • Toronto

Copyright © 1982 by McGraw-Hill, Inc. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America. Except as permitted under the Copyright Act of 1976, no part of this publication may be reproduced or distributed in any form or by any means, or stored in a data base or retrieval system, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

12345678910 SHHA 8921098765432

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Windt, Allan D.

Insurance claims and disputes.

Includes index.

1. Insurance law—United States. 2. Insurance—United States—Adjustment of claims. 3. Actions and defenses—United States. I. Title.

KF1164.W56 346.73'086 81-21338
347.30686

ISBN 0-07-070971-8

To Our Friends:

Kathleen Byrne-Dugan and Daniel J. Dugan

Preface

As a practicing attorney specializing in insurance law, I soon found that there was no source to which one could turn in formulating answers to the plethora of practical problems that routinely arise in the context of insurance disputes. The existing references, for the most part, provided assistance only in the interpretation of policy language. It is the purpose of this book, therefore, to fill that void. It is a reference to which attorneys and insurance companies can turn in formulating litigation strategies and in determining the rights, obligations and potential liabilities of insurers and insureds once a claim is filed pursuant to any type of insurance policy.

I want to thank my friends at Hogan & Hartson, who supported my efforts to write this book through the use of their library. Also, a special thanks to the attorneys at Spector Cohen Gadon & Rosen, whose patience and belief in this book enabled me to complete it. And finally, I want to express my appreciation to Cathy Warder and Fee Southerland for their assistance in the preparation of the manuscript.

Allan Windt

Contents

Summary

Preface

- 1 Notice of Claim**
- 2 Obligations of Insurer Following Notice of Claim**
- 3 Obligations of Insured Following Notice of Claim**
- 4 Duty to Defend**
- 5 Duty to Settle**
- 6 Duty to Indemnify**
- 7 Rights and Duties as Between Insurers**
- 8 Declaratory Judgment Actions**
- 9 Coverage Actions**
- 10 Contribution, Subrogation, and Indemnity**
 - Tables**
 - Index**

Detailed

Preface

- 1 Notice of Claim**
 - §1.01 Notice Requirement**

- §1.02 Circumstances Under Which Failure to Comply with Notice Requirement Will Be Excused
- §1.03 Notice to Excess Insurers
- §1.04 Effect of Unexcused Delay
- §1.05 To Whom Notice Must Be Given
- §1.06 Notice Received from Source Other Than the Insured
- §1.07 Notice Under a Claims-Made Policy
- 2 Obligations of Insurer Following Notice of Claim
 - §2.01 In General
 - §2.02 Failure Promptly to Respond to Notice of Claim—Estoppel to Deny Coverage
 - §2.03 —Insurer’s Loss of Rights
 - §2.04 Investigation of Claim Prior to Notifying Insured of Coverage Position
 - §2.05 Notification of Insurer’s Preliminary Coverage Position Under Policy Containing Duty to Defend Provision—Reservation of Rights Letter
 - §2.06 Necessity of Reservation of Rights Letter Prior to Institution of a Lawsuit Against Insured
 - §2.07 Insurer Precluded from Denying Coverage Because of Failure to Issue a Reservation of Rights Letter—In General
 - §2.08 Insurer Estopped from Denying Coverage Because of Failure to Issue a Reservation of Rights Letter
 - §2.09 —Absence of Control of Insured’s Defense
 - §2.10 —Absence of Conflict of Interest
 - §2.11 —Existence of Demonstrable Prejudice

- §2.12 Contents of Reservation of Rights Letter**
- §2.13 Effect of Error in Reservation of Rights Letter**
- §2.14 Supplemental Reservation of Rights Letter**
- §2.15 Consent by Insured to Defense Offered Subject to a Reservation of Rights**
- §2.16 —Refusal to Accept Reservations When Defense Offered is Inadequate**
- §2.17 The Nonwaiver Agreement**
- §2.18 Notification of Preliminary Coverage Position When Insurer Does Not Provide a Defense**
- §2.19 Duty Promptly to Pay Undisputed Claims**
- §2.20 Duty to Pay That Portion of a Claim That is Undisputed**
- §2.21 Declination of Coverage**
- §2.22 Contents of Declination of Coverage Letter—Estoppel from Asserting Unmentioned Policy Defenses**
- §2.23 —Waiver of Unmentioned Policy Defenses**
- §2.24 Rescinding Policy—Based on Misrepresentations in Application**
- §2.25 —Based on Concealment of Material Information Not Encompassed by Application**
- §2.26 —Based on Failure to Supplement Answers Given in Application**
- §2.27 Insurer Estopped from Asserting Right to Rescind**
- §2.28 Insurer Deemed to Have Waived Right to Rescind**
- §2.29 —Action by Insurer Inconsistent with Rescission**

§2.30 Incontestability Clauses

3 Obligations of Insured Following Notice of Claim

§3.01 In General

§3.02 Duty to Cooperate

§3.03 Proof of Loss Clauses

**§3.04 Access to Books and Records, and
Submission to Examinations**

**§3.05 Forwarding of Demand Letters and
Suit Papers**

**§3.06 Duty Not to Commit Fraud or Swear
Falsely**

§3.07 Duty Not to Release Wrongdoer

**§3.08 —Insurer's Duty to Consent to
Release**

**§3.09 Duty Not to Enter into Unauthorized
Settlements with Injured Party**

**§3.10 Relief of Insured from Obligations
Under Insurance Contract—After
Insurer Denies Coverage**

§3.11 —Under Other Circumstances

4 Duty to Defend

§4.01 Existence of Duty

§4.02 Resolution of Doubts and Ambiguities

**§4.03 Extrinsic Evidence Giving Rise to
Duty**

**§4.04 Insurer's Refusal to Defend Based on
Existence of Extrinsic Facts**

**§4.05 Extrinsic Facts to Prove That the
Person Claiming Coverage is Not an
Insured**

**§4.06 Insurer's Duty to Investigate Prior to
Refusing to Defend**

**§4.07 Circumstances When Duty is
Absolute**

**§4.08 Duty Following Insurer's Justified
Refusal to Defend**

- §4.09 Insurer's Agreement to Defend Following Unjustified Refusal to Defend**
- §4.10 Duty When Another Insurer is Defending**
- §4.11 Excess Insurer's Duty to Defend**
- §4.12 Scope of Insurer's Duty to Defend**
- §4.13 Provision of Partial Defense**
- §4.14 Duty to Defend Suit Seeking Injunctive Relief**
- §4.15 Duty to Appeal Adverse Judgments**
- §4.16 Insured's Duty to Hire Own Counsel If Insurer Refuses to Defend**
- §4.17 Allegiance of Defense Counsel Hired for Insured by Insurer**
- §4.18 Conflict of Interest between Insured and Insurer**
- §4.19 —Ethical Considerations**
- §4.20 —Satisfying Duty to Defend**
- §4.21 Conflict of Interest between Two Insureds**
- §4.22 —Satisfying Duty to Defend**
- §4.23 Insured's Refusal to Accept Defense Offered by Insurer**
- §4.24 —Defense Offered Subject to a Reservation of Rights**
- §4.25 —Effect**
- §4.26 Insurer's Withdrawal of Defense of Insured**
- §4.27 —Reservation of Right to Withdraw**
- §4.28 —Loss of Right to Withdraw Defense of Insured**
- §4.29 —Effect of Withdrawal Where Insurer Precluded from Doing So**
- §4.30 Existence of Duty to Defend After Indemnity Duty Has Been Satisfied**
- §4.31 Unjustified Refusal by Insurer to Defend—Damages**

- §4.32 —Consequential Damages**
- §4.33 —Attorneys' Fees**
- §4.34 —Damages Beyond Policy Limits**
- §4.35 —Estoppel to Deny Coverage**
- §4.36 —Practical Disadvantages**
- §4.37 Insurer's Inadequate Defense—
Failure to Provide Appropriate
Counsel in a Conflict of Interest
Situation**
- §4.38 —Negligence of Insured's Defense
Counsel**
- §4.39 Failure to Assert Compulsory
Counterclaim on Behalf of Insured**
- §4.40 Unethical Conduct by Counsel Hired
by Insurer to Defend Insured**
- §4.41 Intervention by Insurer in Lawsuit
Filed against Insured**

5 Duty to Settle

- §5.01 Insurer's Duty to Settle Claims
Brought Against Insured in General**
- §5.02 Necessity of Opportunity to Settle**
- §5.03 Insurer's Duty When Insured Directs
It Not to Settle**
- §5.04 Settlement Entered into Without
Insured's Consent**
- §5.05 Insurer's Duty to Settle When It
Erroneously Believes That There is No
Coverage**
- §5.06 Necessity of an Obligation by Insurer
to Control Insured's Defense**
- §5.07 Insurer's Duty to Settle When
Settlement Offer is in Excess of
Policy Limits**
- §5.08 Insurer's Duty to Settle When There
Are Multiple Claims Against Insured**
- §5.09 Insurer's Duty to Settle When There
Are Claims Against More Than One
Insured**

- §5.10 Insurer's Duty to Settle When There is Coverage for Only Some of the Allegations Made Against Insured**
- §5.11 Necessity of Proving That Insurer Acted in Bad Faith**
- §5.12 Determining Whether Insurer is Guilty of Bad Faith Breach of Duty to Settle**
- §5.13 Good Faith Breach by Insurer of Duty to Settle**
- §5.14 Significance of Bad Faith Investigation**
- §5.15 Circumstances Under Which Insured May Enter into an Unauthorized Settlement**
- §5.16 Insurer's Liability for Settlement in Excess of Policy Limits Following Breach of Duty to Settle**
- §5.17 Effect of a Judgment or Settlement in Excess of Policy Limits Encompassing Both Covered and Noncovered Acts**
- §5.18 Effect of Insured's Financial Responsibility**
- §5.19 Damages for Insurer's Bad Faith Breach of Duty to Settle**
- §5.20 Insured's Duty to Settle**
- §5.21 —Duty Owed to Excess Insurer**
- §5.22 Actions That Can Be Taken by Insurer, Insured, and Injured Party to Protect and Advance Their Interests**

6 Duty to Indemnify

- §6.01 Existence of a Duty in General**
- §6.02 Contract Interpretation**
- §6.03 Reasonable Expectations Rule**
- §6.04 Implied Warranty of Fitness for Intended Purpose**
- §6.05 Liability to Others Under Liability Insurance Policies**

- §6.06 Causation**
- §6.07 Coverage When Excluded Risk is Not Causally Connected to Loss**
- §6.08 Change in Coverage Afforded by a Renewal Policy**
- §6.09 Effect of Duty to Defend on Duty to Indemnify**
- §6.10 “Other Insurance” Clauses—In General**
- §6.11 —Anti-Stacking Clauses in One-Insurer Cases**
- §6.12 —When the Other Insurance is Uncollectible**
- §6.13 Prohibitions Against Other Insurance**
- §6.14 Breaches by Insured of Promissory Warranties**
- §6.15 Prejudgment Interest Taxed Against Insured**
- §6.16 Postjudgment Interest Taxed Against Insured**
- §6.17 Punitive Damage Awards Against Insured**
- §6.18 Indemnification of Attorneys’ Fees**
- §6.19 Binding Effect on Insurer of a Judgment Against Insured in the Underlying Action—Collateral Estoppel**
- §6.20 —Policy Language**
- §6.21 —Collusion**
- §6.22 —Summary**
- §6.23 Determining Whether Grounds for Judgment Were Outside Policy Coverage—Evidentiary Issues**
- §6.24 —Burden of Proof**
- §6.25 Settlements Entered into by Insured with Injured Party**
- §6.26 Amount of Loss to Insured Who Forgoes Claim as Part of a Settlement**

- §6.27 Determining Whether Grounds for Settlement Were Outside Policy Coverage
- §6.28 Effect of a Settlement with One Insurer on Another Insurer's Liability
- §6.29 Coverage Through Estoppel
- §6.30 —Improper Applications of Theory
- §6.31 Coverage Through Waiver
- §6.32 Coverage Under Insurance Binders
- §6.33 —Existence
- §6.34 Satisfaction of Duty Under Liability Insurance Policies
- §6.35 Damages in the Event of Breach by Insurer—Contract
- §6.36 —Tort
- §6.37 Restitution of Payments
- 7 Rights and Duties as Between Insurers
 - §7.01 Conflicting "Other Insurance" Clauses
 - §7.02 —Recommended Approach
 - §7.03 Resolving Conflicting Clauses
 - §7.04 Proration—Between Insurers That Provide Indemnity Coverage at the Same Level
 - §7.05 —Between Primary Insurers When There is Excess Insurance
 - §7.06 —Between Insurers of Defense Costs
 - §7.07 Liability of One Insurer for Another Insurer's Deductible
 - §7.08 Duty to Settle Owed to Excess Insurer
 - §7.09 —Effect of Settlement by Primary Insurer for Amount Less Than Its Policy Limits
- 8 Declaratory Judgment Actions
 - §8.01 In General

- §8.02 Actions by Insurer Against Insured—
Whether Insurer Has Duty to Defend
- §8.03 —Whether Insurer Provides
Coverage
- §8.04 —Resolution of Factual and Legal
Issues Pertinent to Underlying
Action Against Insured
- §8.05 —Following a Denial of Coverage
- §8.06 Actions by Insured Against Insurer
- §8.07 Actions by Insurer Against Injured
Party
- §8.08 Actions by Injured Party Against
Insurer
- §8.09 Actions Between Insurers
- §8.10 —Providing Insured an Interim
Defense
- §8.11 —Insured as Necessary Party
- §8.12 —Insured as Indispensable Party
- §8.13 Burden of Proof
- §8.14 Attorney's Fees Awards
- 9 Coverage Actions
 - §9.01 Burden of Proof
 - §9.02 Statute of Limitations
 - §9.03 Contractual Limitations Clause
 - §9.04 —Enforceability Following Insurer's
Breach of Contract
 - §9.05 —Waiver and Estoppel
 - §9.06 —Tolling
 - §9.07 —Applicability to Tort Actions
 - §9.08 —Excuse for Breach
 - §9.09 Third-Party Complaint by Insured
Against Insurer
 - §9.10 Direct Action Statutes
 - §9.11 Actions by Injured Party Against
Insurer—Policy Benefits
 - §9.12 —Payments in Excess of Policy Limits

- §9.13 —Suit in Capacity of Judgment Creditor
- §9.14 Effect on Injured Person's Rights of Judgment for Insurer Against Insured—Garnishment Actions
- §9.15 —Suit as Assignee
- §9.16 —Suit as Third-Party Beneficiary
- §9.17 —Suit as Beneficiary of Statutory Cause of Action
- §9.18 —Injured Person as Indispensable Party
- §9.19 Discovery of Insurer's Claims File—Work Product Privilege
- §9.20 —Substantial Need Doctrine
- §9.21 —Attorney-Client Privilege
- §9.22 Prejudgment Interest Awards
- §9.23 —Computation of Amount of Award
- §9.24 Attorney's Fees Awards
- §9.25 Recovery of Penalties
- §9.26 Punitive Damages Awards
- §9.27 —Liability for Acts of Agents
- §9.28 Reformation of Policy
- §9.29 Arbitration—In General
- §9.30 —Waiver by Insurer of Right to Compel
- §9.31 —Effect of Insurer's Denial of Coverage on Right to Compel
- §9.32 Appraisal Requirements
- 10 Contribution, Subrogation, and Indemnity**
 - §10.01 Contribution in General
 - §10.02 Insurer's Right to Reimbursement for Costs Incurred in Fulfilling Duty to Defend—In General
 - §10.03 —Primary Insurer's Right to Contribution from Another Primary Insurer

- §10.04 —Primary Insurer's Right to Contribution from Excess Insurer
- §10.05 Subrogation—In General
- §10.06 —Pro Tanto
- §10.07 —From Wrongdoer
- §10.08 —Based on Insured's Claim for Indemnity or Contribution from Joint or Severally Liable Tortfeasor
- §10.09 —Insurer as Partial Subrogee in Action Filed in Name of Insured
- §10.10 —Insurer's Right as Affected by Volunteer Doctrine
- §10.11 Indemnity in General
- §10.12 Right of Insurer to Indemnity or Subrogation from Another Insurer That Was Solely Liable
- §10.13 Right of Excess Insurer to Indemnity or Subrogation from Primary Insurer—Costs Incurred in Fulfilling Duty to Indemnify
- §10.14 —Costs Incurred in Fulfilling Duty to Defend
- §10.15 Effect of Joint Payment by Insurers Subject to Reservation of Rights to Assert Claims for Contribution and Indemnity
- §10.16 Statute of Limitations in Actions for Contribution, Indemnity, and Subrogation
- §10.17 Use of Loan Receipt Agreement When Recovery Sought from Another Insurer
- §10.18 —Between Injured Party and Party's Insurer When Recovery Sought from Wrongdoer
- §10.19 —Between Injured Party and Wrongdoer's Insurer When