
PRODUCTS LIABILITY

Cases, Materials, Problems

Jerry J. Phillips
Nicolas P. Terry
Frank J. Vandall

CONTEMPORARY 
LEGAL EDUCATION SERIES

PRODUCTS LIABILITY

CASES, MATERIALS, PROBLEMS

JERRY J. PHILLIPS

W.P. Toms Professor of Law
University of Tennessee

NICOLAS P. TERRY

Professor of Law
Saint Louis University

FRANK J. VANDALL

Professor of Law
Emory University

THE MICHIE COMPANY
Law Publishers
CHARLOTTESVILLE, VIRGINIA

COPYRIGHT © 1994
BY
THE MICHIE COMPANY

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 93-81071

ISBN 1-55834-136-6

Printed in the United States of America

All rights reserved.

Preface

This book is intended to provide the upper-division student with a comprehensive grounding in modern products liability law.

Products liability has been in the vortex of controversy regarding the so-called torts-insurance crises of the mid-1970s and the 1980s. A number of states have enacted restrictive legislation, and numerous forays in this regard have been made at the federal level. We attempt to cover these developments throughout the book. In addition, we have placed emphasis on the emerging areas of toxic tort and mass tort litigation. We have also emphasized the important policy issues at stake in the products arena.

We have endeavored in our note materials to include issues not covered, or not adequately covered, in the principal cases, while at the same time avoiding stultifying encyclopedic coverage. We trust that the notes are full enough and sufficiently self-explanatory to make further explication unnecessary.

In the problems and hypotheticals contained in the text, we have tried to be gender neutral. Particular choices of gender or gender-related names in the problems are not intended to convey any belief about the characteristics or habits of the gender in question. The names of natural and legal persons used in the problems are not intended to refer to or disparage any specific persons or entities. Any similarity between a real person or entity and a character in a problem is coincidental.

"String" citations and non-quote source citations have been omitted without any note of their omission. We have been liberal in our correction of citations and citation form appearing in cases and materials. Generally, footnotes have been deleted from the cases. Where retained, footnote numbers retain their original numbering. Editorial footnotes are specifically identified as such.

Jerry J. Phillips
Nicolas P. Terry
Frank J. Vandall

October, 1993

Acknowledgments

Jerry J. Phillips extends his thanks to his beloved secretary, Lisa Gutierrez Sellers.

Nicolas P. Terry extends his thanks to his research assistants, including Tracey Litzinger and Alex Giftos, and particularly to Amy Jurevic for her exceptional diligence and good humor. He also thanks Stephanie Haley for her superb secretarial assistance.

Frank J. Vandall extends his thanks to Radine Robinson and gratefully acknowledges her organizational and secretarial contributions, and also thanks Carter Dukes, Jonathan Lipsky, Paul Geller, and Steve Dollinger for their research assistance.

The authors gratefully acknowledge the permission of the American Law Institute to reprint the following sections and comments of the RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS, copyright 1965, 1977, 1979:

§ 522 comment a Tentative Draft No. 10 (1968); § 402A; § 402B; illustration 1 to § 402B; § 395; comment k to § 402A.

THE RESTATEMENT (THIRD) OF TORTS, PRODUCTS LIABILITY (Preliminary Draft, April 20, 1993) § 101; comment g to § 101. THE RESTATEMENT (THIRD) OF TORTS, PRODUCTS LIABILITY (Council Draft, Number 1, September 17, 1993) § 101; comment g to § 101. The April 20, 1993 and September 17, 1993 Drafts do not have the tentative approval of the Council or the American Law Institute.

The authors acknowledge the permission, copyright 1991 by the American Law Institute and the National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws, reprinted with permission of the Permanent Editorial Board for the Uniform Commercial Code to reprint the following sections and comments of the Uniform Commercial Code § 2-313; comment 3 to § 2-313; Alternative A to § 2-318; § 2-314; § 2-316; § 2-719; comment 3 to § 2-719(3); § 2-302.

The authors further acknowledge use of the following with permission of the authors and publishers:

Dolan, *TANSTAAFL* 4 (1971). Reprinted with the permission of Professor E. G. Dolan.

Hardin, *The Tragedy of the Commons*, 162 *SCIENCE* 1243, 1244-45 (1968). Reprinted with the permission of the author and *SCIENCE*, copyright 1968 by the AALS.

Henderson and Twerski, *A Proposed Revision of Section 402A of the Restatement (Second) of Torts*, 77 *CORNELL L. REV.* 1513, 1514 (1992). Reprinted with the permission of Professors Henderson and Twerski, and the Cornell Law Review.

Phillips, *Products Liability for Personal Injury to Minors*, 56 VA. L. REV. 1223, 1225 (1970). Reprinted with the permission of the author, The Virginia Law Review Association, and Fred B. Rothman & Co.

Posner, *Strict Liability: A Comment*, 2 J. LEGAL STUD. 206 (1973). Printed with the permission of the Honorable Richard A. Posner.

Special Project, Article Two Warranties in Commercial Transactions: An Update, 72 CORNELL L. REV. 1159, 1173-83 (1987). Reprinted with the permission of the Cornell Law Review.

Terry, *State of the Art Evidence: From Logical Construct to Judicial Retrenchment*, 20 ANGLO-AM. L. REV. 285, 293, 295-6 (1991). Reprinted with the permission of the author.

Terry, *Stricter Products Liability*, 52 MO. L. REV. 1, 42-43 (1987). Reprinted with the permission of the author and the Missouri Law Review.

Vandall, *Reallocating the Cost of Smoking: The Application of Absolute Liability to Cigarette Manufacturers*, 52 OHIO STATE L.J. 405, 410, 423-424 (1991). Reprinted with the permission of the author.

Vandall, *STRICT LIABILITY: LEGAL AND ECONOMIC ANALYSIS* (1989). Reprinted with the permission of the author.

Summary Table of Contents

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
<i>Table of Contents</i>	xv
—	
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION	
A. The Origins of Products Liability	1
B. The World of Strict Liability	7
CHAPTER 2. CONTRACT AND TORT	17
A. Introduction	17
B. Concept and Theories of Liability	18
C. Bargaining for Safety	28
D. Regulating the Bargaining Process	55
E. Judicial Regulation of Product Safety	73
F. Governmental Regulation	84
G. Multiple Counts	91
CHAPTER 3. MANUFACTURING DEFECTS	99
A. Introduction	99
B. Defectiveness	99
C. Proving Defect and Causation	104
D. Foreseeable Use	133
E. Particular Products	136
CHAPTER 4. DESIGN DEFECTS	163
A. Introduction	163
B. Modern Origins of Liability for Defective Design	163
C. Defectiveness	173
D. Foreseeable Use	203
E. State of the Art	215
F. Patent or Obvious Dangers	225
G. Pleading and Proof	240
H. Particular Products	263
CHAPTER 5. WARNING DEFECTS	297
A. Introduction	297
B. The General Obligation	297
C. Adequacy	304
D. Warning Theory and State of the Art Evidence	323
E. Obvious Dangers	346
F. Intended or Foreseeable Use	363
G. Foreseeable User	382
H. Particular Products	404

	<i>Page</i>
CHAPTER 6. MISREPRESENTATION	453
A. Introduction	453
B. Intentional and Negligent Misstatements	454
C. Strict Liability	466
D. Certifiers, Endorsers and Advertisers	474
E. Misrepresentations as Complementary and Counteractive to Products Claims and Defenses	481
F. Reliance, Consideration, and Foreseeability	489
G. Damages for Pure Economic Loss	492
CHAPTER 7. THE PARTIES	495
A. Introduction	495
B. The Bystander	496
C. The Rescuer	507
D. The Business Seller	511
E. Suppliers in the Chain of Distribution	517
F. Other Suppliers	526
G. Sales vs. Services	546
H. Realty Suppliers	550
I. Employers	559
J. Successor Liability	569
K. The Government as Supplier	575
L. Spoliation	577
M. Indemnity and Contribution	580
CHAPTER 8. PROCESS, PROOF, AND DAMAGES	589
A. Introduction	589
B. Process and Mass Torts	589
C. Causation, Expert Testimony, and Evidence	606
D. Multiple Defendants	639
E. Similar Products and Product History	650
F. Damages	664
G. Insurance	697
CHAPTER 9. COMMON DEFENSES	707
A. Introduction	707
B. Plaintiff Misconduct	707
C. Immunities	742
D. Preemption	762
E. Statutes of Limitation and Repose	783
F. Lack of Jurisdiction	790
G. Disclaimers and Remedy Limitations	802
CHAPTER 10. LEGISLATION AND REGULATION	811
A. Introduction	811
B. Federal Safety Regulation	811
C. Federal Compensation Schemes	869

	<i>Page</i>
D. State Products Liability Reform	873
E. Proposed Federal Legislation	901
F. European Community Legislation	913
<i>Table of Cases</i>	923
<i>Index</i>	937

Table of Contents

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
<i>Summary Table of Contents</i>	xi
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION	1
A. The Origins of Products Liability	1
Winterbottom v. Wright	1
Notes	1
Heath v. Sears, Roebuck & Co.	4
Notes	5
B. The World of Strict Liability	7
Anonymous	7
Problem	8
Old Island Fumigation, Inc. v. Barbee	9
Notes	10
Problem	15
CHAPTER 2. CONTRACT AND TORT	17
A. Introduction	17
B. Concept and Theories of Liability	18
Problem	18
Mclaughlin v. Michelin Tire Corp.	18
Notes	26
C. Bargaining for Safety	28
American Safety Equipment Corp. v. Winkler	28
Notes	34
Hauter v. Zogarts	37
Notes	42
Problem	55
D. Regulating the Bargaining Process	55
Problem	55
Uniform Commercial Code § 2-314	55
Notes	56
Problem	59
Gladden v. Cadillac Motor Car Division	59
Notes	67
E. Judicial Regulation of Product Safety	73
Morningstar v. Black & Decker Co.	73
Notes	78
F. Governmental Regulation	84
Kyte v. Philip Morris, Inc.	84
Notes	90

	<i>Page</i>
G. Multiple Counts	91
Bowler v. Stewart-Warner Corp.	91
Notes	98
CHAPTER 3. MANUFACTURING DEFECTS	99
A. Introduction	99
B. Defectiveness	99
Problem	99
Heaton v. Ford Motor Co.	100
Notes	102
C. Proving Defect and Causation	104
Williams v. Smart Chevrolet Co.	104
Notes	107
McFarlane v. Caterpillar, Inc.	109
Notes	113
Problem	113
Orth v. Emerson Electric Co., White-Rodgers Division	114
Notes	117
Rix v. General Motors Corp.	120
Notes	123
Hazelton v. Safeway Stores, Inc.	123
Notes	127
D. Foreseeable Use	133
Fitzgerald Marine Sales v. LeUnes	133
Notes	134
E. Particular Products	136
Parrillo v. Giroux Co.	136
Notes	142
Problem	147
Mexicali Rose v. Superior Court	147
Notes	155
CHAPTER 4. DESIGN DEFECTS	163
A. Introduction	163
B. Modern Origins of Liability for Defective Design	163
Problem	163
Greenman v. Yuba Power Products, Inc.	164
Notes	166
C. Defectiveness	173
Problem	173
Phillips v. Kimwood Machine Co.	174
Notes	177
State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. v. Chrysler Corp.	178
Notes	183
Sperry-New Holland, Division of Sperry Corp. v. Prestage	185
Notes	188
Armentrout v. FMC Corp.	192
Notes	198

	<i>Page</i>
D. Foreseeable Use	203
Jurado v. Western Gear Works	203
Notes	208
E. State of the Art	215
Lenhardt v. Ford Motor Co.	215
Notes	218
F. Patent or Obvious Dangers	225
Koske v. Townsend Engineering Co.	225
Notes	228
Problem	239
G. Pleading and Proof	240
Chaulk v. Volkswagen of America, Inc.	240
Notes	243
Shetterly v. Crown Controls Corp.	249
Notes	258
Problem	263
H. Particular Products	263
Problem	263
Shipp v. General Motors Corp.	264
Notes	265
Tafoya v. Sears Roebuck & Co.	268
Notes	273
Kelley v. R.G. Industries	276
Notes	278
Shanks v. The Upjohn Co.	284
Notes	289
Problem	296
CHAPTER 5. WARNING DEFECTS	297
A. Introduction	297
B. The General Obligation	297
Problem	297
Ross Laboratories v. Thies	298
Notes	299
Problem	304
C. Adequacy	304
Karns v. Emerson Electric Co.	304
Notes	306
Ayers v. Johnson & Johnson Baby Products Co.	309
Notes	315
D. Warning Theory and State of the Art Evidence	323
Beshada v. Johns-Manville Products Corp.	323
Notes	325
Problem	328
Anderson v. Owens-Corning Fiberglas Corp.	329
Notes	335
Problem	338
Shanks v. The Upjohn Co.	340

	<i>Page</i>
Notes	343
E. Obvious Dangers	346
Problem	346
Glittenberg v. Doughboy Recreational Industries	346
Notes	352
Prince v. Parachutes, Inc.	355
Notes	358
F. Intended or Foreseeable Use	363
Uloth v. City Tank Corp.	363
Notes	365
Allen v. Chance Manufacturing Co.	366
Notes	368
Kelly v. M. Trigg Enterprises	372
Notes	374
G. Foreseeable User	382
Problem	382
Ramirez v. Plough	382
Notes	389
Problem	390
Smith v. Walter C. Best, Inc.	390
Notes	394
Adelman-Tremblay v. Jewel Cos.	397
Notes	400
Problem	403
H. Particular Products	404
Problem	404
Brown v. Superior Court	404
Notes	411
Frye v. Medicare-Glaser Corp.	412
Notes	416
Mazur v. Merck & Co.	422
Notes	434
MacDonald v. Ortho Pharmaceutical Corp.	435
Notes	438
Problem	443
Brune v. Brown Forman Corp.	443
Notes	446
Problem	451
CHAPTER 6. MISREPRESENTATION	453
A. Introduction	453
B. Intentional and Negligent Misstatements	454
Gillham v. The Admiral Corp.	454
Notes	458
Cunningham v. C.R. Pease House Furnishing Co.	460
Notes	463
C. Strict Liability	466
Baxter v. Ford Motor Co.	466

	<i>Page</i>
Notes	467
Problem	468
Crocker v. Winthrop Laboratories, Division of Sterling Drug, Inc.	469
Notes	472
D. Certifiers, Endorsers and Advertisers	474
Problem	474
Hempstead v. General Fire Extinguisher Corp.	474
Notes	476
E. Misrepresentations as Complementary and Counteractive to Products Claims and Defenses	481
Leichtamer v. American Motors Corp.	481
Notes	484
Maize v. Atlantic Refining Co.	485
Notes	487
F. Reliance, Consideration, and Foreseeability	489
Hon v. Stroh Brewery Co.	489
Notes	490
G. Damages for Pure Economic Loss	492
Problem	492
CHAPTER 7. THE PARTIES	495
A. Introduction	495
B. The Bystander	496
Problem	496
McCarthy v. Department of Social & Health Services	496
Notes	500
Culbert v. Sampson's Supermarkets, Inc.	502
Notes	506
C. The Rescuer	507
Bobka v. Cook County Hospital	507
Notes	509
D. The Business Seller	511
Problem	512
Stiles v. Batavia Atomic Horseshoes, Inc.	512
Notes	514
E. Suppliers in the Chain of Distribution	517
Flippo v. Mode O'Day Frock Shops of Hollywood	518
Notes	520
Caporale v. Raleigh Industries of America, Inc.	523
Notes	524
F. Other Suppliers	526
Wilson v. Dover Skating Center, Ltd.	526
Notes	530
Problem	532
Torres v. Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co.	533
Notes	538
King v. National Spa & Pool Institute, Inc.	541

	<i>Page</i>
Notes	545
G. Sales vs. Services	546
Problem	550
H. Realty Suppliers	550
Lempke v. Dagenais	551
Notes	555
I. Employers	559
Callender v. Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co.	559
Notes	565
Problem	569
J. Successor Liability	569
Conway v. White Trucks, Division of White Motor Corp.	569
Notes	571
Problem	575
K. The Government as Supplier	575
Problem	576
L. Spoliation	577
Wilson v. Beloit Corp.	577
Notes	578
M. Indemnity and Contribution	580
Jones v. Aero-Chem Corp.	580
Notes	584
Problem	588
CHAPTER 8. PROCESS, PROOF, AND DAMAGES	589
A. Introduction	589
B. Process and Mass Torts	589
Malcolm v. National Gypsum Co.	589
Notes	597
C. Causation, Expert Testimony, and Evidence	606
Thomas v. Hoffman-Laroche, Inc.	606
Notes	612
Problem	620
Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.	620
Notes	626
Problem	634
Most v. Tulane Medical Center	635
Notes	637
Problem	639
D. Multiple Defendants	639
Hymowitz v. Eli Lilly & Co.	641
Notes	647
Problem	649
E. Similar Products and Product History	650
Easterly v. Advance Stores Co.	650
Notes	651
Robbins v. Farmers Union Grain Terminal Ass'n	657
Notes	661

	<i>Page</i>
Problem	664
F. Damages	664
Pope v. Rollins Protective Services Co.	664
Notes	669
United Air Lines, Inc. v. Cei Industries of Illinois	673
Notes	677
Glasscock v. Armstrong Cork Co.	683
Notes	689
Problem	696
G. Insurance	697
J.H. France Refractories Co. v. Allstate Insurance Co.	697
Notes	703
CHAPTER 9. COMMON DEFENSES	707
A. Introduction	707
B. Plaintiff Misconduct	707
Coney v. J.L.G. Industries	707
Notes	713
Problem	715
Green v. Sterling Extruder Corp.	715
Notes	720
Problem	726
Milwaukee Electrical Tool Corp. v. Superior Court	727
Notes	737
C. Immunities	742
Kotecki v. Cyclops Welding Corp.	742
Notes	747
Boyle v. United Technologies Corp.	750
Notes	760
Problem	762
D. Preemption	762
Cipollone v. Liggett Group, Inc.	762
Notes	780
Problem	783
E. Statutes of Limitation and Repose	783
S.J.D. v. Mentor Corp.	783
Notes	787
F. Lack of Jurisdiction	790
Demoss v. City Market, Inc.	790
Notes	796
Problem	801
G. Disclaimers and Remedy Limitations	802
Southland Farms, Inc. v. Ciba-Geigy Corp.	802
Notes	806
Problem	808
CHAPTER 10. LEGISLATION AND REGULATION	811
A. Introduction	811

	<i>Page</i>
B. Federal Safety Regulation	811
Consumer Product Safety Act	811
Notes	831
Problem	832
Infant Cushions and Pillows	832
Gulf South Insulation v. CPSC	837
Notes	845
All-Terrain Vehicles	850
Notes	858
3550 Stevens Creek Associates v. Barclays Bank	861
Notes	863
Problem	869
C. Federal Compensation Schemes	869
Hasler v. United States	869
Notes	871
D. State Products Liability Reform	873
Ohio Revised Code, §§ 2307.71-.80	873
Revised Code of Washington, §§ 7.72.10-.060	881
Indiana Code, §§ 33-1-1, 5-1 to -7	886
Notes	889
Problem	889
Heath v. Sears, Roebuck & Co.	889
Notes	895
Problem	900
E. Proposed Federal Legislation	901
Product Liability Fairness Act	901
Notes	912
F. European Community Legislation	913
Council Directive of 25 July 1985	913
Notes	917
<i>Table of Cases</i>	923
<i>Index</i>	937