

Canon Ascendendo p dantesaron. Et sic p totam missam



Kyrie. Aue Kyrie sanctissima clesson maria.

# Early Musical Borrowing

HONEY MECONI



Aff Kyrie. Aue Kyrie sanctissima Kyrie maria.

clesson. Criste. Criste

clesson Criste

# **Early Musical Borrowing**

**Edited by Honey Meconi**

**ROUTLEDGE  
NEW YORK AND LONDON**

**Published in 2004 by**  
Routledge  
29 West 35th Street  
New York, NY 10001

**Published in Great Britain by**  
Routledge  
11 New Fetter Lane  
London EC4P 4EE

**Copyright © 2004 by Honey Meconi**

**Some music examples in this book are © American Institute of Musicology, Inc., Middleton, Wisc., and have been reproduced with permission.**

**Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group.**

**Printed in the United States of America on acid free paper.**

**All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.**

**Cover illustration: Pierre de la Rue, *Missa Ave sanctissima Maria*, Kyrie I, altus and bassus.  
© Brussels, Royal Library of Belgium, MS 15075, fol. 85r. Used with permission.**

**10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1**

**Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available from the Library of Congress**

**ISBN 0-8153-3521-0**

# **Early Musical Borrowing**

## **Criticism and Analysis of Early Music**

Jessie Ann Owens, *series editor*

### **TONAL STRUCTURES IN EARLY MUSIC**

edited by Cristle Collins Judd

### **COUNTERPOINT AND COMPOSITIONAL PROCESS IN THE TIME OF DUFAY**

*Perspectives from German Musicology*

edited and translated by Kevin N. Moll

### **THE LANGUAGE OF THE MODES**

*Studies in the History of Polyphonic Modality*

by Frans Wiering

### **COUNTERPOINT, COMPOSITION, AND *MUSICA FICTA***

by Margaret Bent

### **EARLY MUSICAL BORROWING**

edited by Honey Meconi

# **Series Editor's Foreword**

**JESSIE ANN OWENS**

Recent years have seen a critical reassessment of our approach to early music. Musicians, scholars, and critics have been searching for ways of talking about and reacting to the music that engage it not from the perspectives of later music but rather on its own terms. These new approaches would not be possible without the scholarship of the previous decades. The discovery and cataloguing of musical sources, the preparation of critical editions, and the investigation of archival documents have furnished important information about composers, performers, patrons, and institutions that supported the creation and performance of early music. Building on this work, the editors of these volumes now seek to develop and explore analytical methodologies for the discussion of early music as music.

Analytic methods are not easily found for early music. The theorists of the time had their own agendas, and they do not provide models that suit our purposes. As a consequence, many twentieth-century scholars have chosen approaches that reflect their own beliefs about early music and its relation to later music. While some continue to rely on common practice tonality as a prism through which to view early music, others have begun to explore methods that respect the integrity and self-sufficiency of the languages of early music.

We offer a forum for exploration of particular topics, from both methodological and critical viewpoints. Our premise is that we can best develop new methodologies by encouraging debate. We will explore compositional

procedures, tonal structures, musical borrowing, and other topics, focusing both on individual compositions and on theoretical systems. We seek to encourage critical writing about music that will be useful to performers, listeners, and scholars.

## Acknowledgments

This volume grew out of conversations with series editor Jessie Ann Owens, so my first thanks are to her and to Leo Balk, general editor at the time the book was conceived. Since then first Soo Mee Kwon and more recently current music editor Richard Carlin have been extraordinarily helpful and patient as the project has grown to completion. I would also like to thank Henry Bashwiner and Emily Vail of Routledge for their assistance in the process of publication. All of the authors have my deep appreciation for both their excellent essays and their ready responses to my seemingly unending requests. Murray Steib kindly provided musical examples for his own essay, while Joseph Patrick prepared all others; I gratefully acknowledge both their help and that of Rice University for its financial assistance. I must also thank Paul Ranzini, Angela Wren Wall, Andrew H. Weaver, Cathy Ann Elias, and Jenny Hodgson for contributions of various kinds. Finally, this volume would not have been possible without the support in countless direct and indirect ways of my beloved husband, Michel Godts, and our wonderful son, Yannick.

# List of Abbreviations

## Bibliographical Abbreviations

- AIM American Institute of Musicology
- CC *Census-Catalogue of Manuscript Sources of Polyphonic Music, 1400–1550.* 5 vols. Vol. 1 edited by Charles Hamm and Herbert Kellman. Vols. 2–5 edited by Herbert Kellman. Renaissance Manuscript Studies 1. Neuhausen-Stuttgart: Hänsler/AIM, 1979–88.
- CMM *Corpus mensurabilis musicae*
- JAMS *Journal of the American Musicological Society*
- JosCon Edward E. Lowinsky and Bonnie J. Blackburn, eds. *Josquin des Prez: Proceedings of the International Josquin Festival-Conference held at the Juilliard School at Lincoln Center in New York City, 21–25 June 1971.* London, New York, and Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1976.
- JRMA *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*
- New Grove *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians.* Edited by Stanley Sadie. 20 vols. London: Macmillan, 1980.
- New Grove II *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians.* 2nd ed. Edited by Stanley Sadie. 29 vols. London: Macmillan, 2001.
- TVNM *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis*

### Manuscript Sigla

AostaS D19	Aosta, Biblioteca del Seminario Maggiore, MS A <sup>1</sup> D19
BerlS 40608	Berlin, Staatsbibliothek Preussischer Kulturbesitz, MS Mus. 40608
BolC Q19	Bologna, Civico Museo Bibliografico Musicale, MS Q19
BolC Q20	Bologna, Civico Museo Bibliografico Musicale, MS Q20
BolSP 38	Bologna, Archivio Musicale della Fabbriceria di San Petronio, MS A.XXXVIII ( <i>olim</i> CC)
BrusBR 215–16	Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS 215–16
BrusBR 228	Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS 228
BrusBR 5557	Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS 5557
BrusBR 9126	Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS 9126
BrusBR 15075	Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS 15075
BrusBR IV.922	Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS IV.922
CambraiBM 4	Cambrai, Bibliothèque Municipale, MS 4
ChiN C36	Chicago, Newberry Library, Case MS.-VM 2147.C36 (#4)
ChiN M91	Chicago, Newberry Library, Case MS.-VM 1578.M91
CoimU 2	Coimbra, Biblioteca Geral da Universidade, MS M.2
DijBM 517	Dijon, Bibliothèque Municipale, MS 517 ( <i>olim</i> 295)
DresSL Pirna IV	Dresden, Sächsische Landesbibliothek, MS Pirna IV
EscSL V.III.24	Escorial, Real Monasterio de San Lorenzo del Escorial, Biblioteca y Archivo de Música, MS V.III.24
FlorC 2439	Florence, Biblioteca del Conservatorio di Musica Luigi Cherubini, MS Basevi 2439
GranCG 1	Granada, Catedral de Granada, MS 1
GuatC 4	Guatemala City, Catedral, Archivo Capitular, MS 4
's-HerAB 72A	's-Hertogenbosch, Archief van de Illustre Lieve Vrouwe Broederschap, MS 72A
's-HerAB 72B	's-Hertogenbosch, Archief van de Illustre Lieve Vrouwe Broederschap, MS 72B
JenaU 2	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 2
JenaU 3	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 3
JenaU 4	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 4
JenaU 5	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 5
JenaU 7	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 7
JenaU 9	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 9
JenaU 12	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 12
JenaU 21	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 21
JenaU 22	Jena, Universitätsbibliothek, MS 22
LonBL 31922	London, British Library, Add. Ms. 31922
LonBL 70516	London, British Library, Add. Ms. 70516

LonBLE 3307	London, British Library, MS Egerton 3307
LucAS 238	Lucca, Archivio di Stato, Biblioteca Manoscritti, MS 238
LucBC 601	Lucca, Biblioteca capitolare, MS 601
MechAS s.s.	Mechelen, Archief en Stadsbibliotheek, MS s.s.
MilA 46	Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, MS E. 46. Inf.
MilD 2	Milan, Archivio della Veneranda Fabbrica del Duomo, Sezione Musicale, Librone 2 ( <i>olim</i> 2268)
MilD 3	Milan, Archivio della Veneranda Fabbrica del Duomo, Sezione Musicale, Librone 3 ( <i>olim</i> 2267)
ModE M.1.13	Modena, Biblioteca Estense e Universitaria, MS α.M.1.13
MontsM 750	Montserrat, Biblioteca del Monestir, MS 750
MontsM 766	Montserrat, Biblioteca del Monestir, MS 766
MontsM 773	Montserrat, Biblioteca del Monestir, MS 773
MunBS 7	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS 7
MunBS 26	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS 26
MunBS 33	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS 33
MunBS 37	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS 37
MunBS 39	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS 39
MunBS 47	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS 47
MunBS 3154	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS 3154
MunBS F	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS F
NapBN 40	Naples, Biblioteca Nazionale, MS VI E 40
ParisBN 57	Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Département de la Musique, MS Rés. Vmc. 57
ParisBNL 8884	Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Département des Manuscrits, Fonds Latin, MS 8884
PueblaC 1	Puebla (Mexico), Archivo de Música Sacra de la Catedral, MS I
RomeC 2856	Rome, Biblioteca Casanatense, MS 2856 ( <i>olim</i> O.V. 208)
SensBM 6	Sens, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 6
SienBC K.I.2	Siena, Biblioteca Comunale degli Intronati, MS K.I.2
StuttL 44	Stuttgart, Württembergische Landesbibliothek, MS Musica folio I 44

StuttL 46	Stuttgart, Württembergische Landesbibliothek, MS Musica folio I 46
SubA 248	Subiaco, Monumento Nazionale dell'Abbazia di Santa Scolastica, Biblioteca Statale, MS 248
SuttonO 4	Sutton Coldfield, Oscott College, Old Library, MS Case B No. 4
ToleF 23	Toledo, Catedral, Obra y Fabrica, MS Reservado 23
TrentC 87	Trent, Museo Provinciale d'Arte, Castello del Buon Consiglio, MS 87
TrentC 88	Trent, Museo Provinciale d'Arte, Castello del Buon Consiglio, MS 88
TrentC 89	Trent, Museo Provinciale d'Arte, Castello del Buon Consiglio, MS 89
TrentC 90	Trent, Museo Provinciale d'Arte, Castello del Buon Consiglio, MS 90
TrentC 91	Trent, Museo Provinciale d'Arte, Castello del Buon Consiglio, MS 91
TrentC 92	Trent, Museo Provinciale d'Arte, Castello del Buon Consiglio, MS 92
TurBN I.27	Turin, Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria, MS Riserva musicale I.27 ( <i>olim</i> Regia Biblioteca dell'Università, q <sup>m</sup> III.59)
UppsU 76b	Uppsala, Universitetsbiblioteket, MS Vokalmusik i Handschrift 76b
UppsU 76c	Uppsala, Universitetsbiblioteket, MS Vokalmusik i Handschrift 76c
VatC 234	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Chigi C.VIII.234
VatP 1976–79	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MSS Palatini Latini 1976–1979
VatP 1982	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Palatini Latini 1982
VatRE 2049	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Reginenses Latini 2049
VatS 5	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 5
VatS 12	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 12
VatS 14	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 14
VatS 16	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 16

VatS 34	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 34
VatS 35	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 35
VatS 36	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 36
VatS 41	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 41
VatS 45	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 45
VatS 51	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 51
VatS 55	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 55
VatS 63	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 63
VatS 160	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 160
VatSP B80	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS San Pietro B 80
VenMC 1602	Venice, Museo Civico Correr, Biblioteca d'Arte e Storia Veneziana, MS Cicogna 1602
VerBC 756	Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare, MS DCCLVI
VerBC 760	Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare, MS DCCLX
VerBC 761	Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare, MS DCCLXI
VienNB 1783	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Handschriften- und Inkunabelsammlung, MS 1783 ( <i>olim</i> Theol. 34; VII.A.16)
VienNB 4809	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Handschriften- und Inkunabelsammlung, MS 4809 ( <i>olim</i> Theol. 35; VIII.A.1)
VienNB 11778	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Handschriften- und Inkunabelsammlung, MS 11778 ( <i>olim</i> Theol. 37; VIII.A.3)
VienNB Mus. 15495	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, MS Mus. 15495 ( <i>olim</i> Kunsthistorisches Staatsmuseum, Sammlung für Plastik und Kunstgewerbe, MS 5248; <i>olim</i> Series nova 2660)
VienNB Mus. 15496	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, MS Mus. 15496 ( <i>olim</i> Kunsthistorisches Staatsmuseum, Sammlung für Plastik und Kunstgewerbe, MS 5261; <i>olim</i> Series nova 2661)

VienNB Mus. 18745	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, MS Mus. 18745 ( <i>olim</i> A.N.35.E.127)
VienNB Mus. 18832	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, MS Mus. 18832 ( <i>olim</i> A.N.35.H.27)
WeimB A	Weimar, Bibliothek der Evangelisch-Lutherischen Kirchengemeinde. MS A
WolfA 287	Wolfenbuttel, Herzog August Bibliothek. MS <i>Guelferbytanus</i> 287 <i>Extravagantum</i>
WorcC F. 160	Worcester Cathedral, Codex F. 160

### Print Sigla

1504 <sup>1</sup>	<i>Motetti C</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1504)
1504 <sup>3</sup>	<i>Canti C</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1504 mod. st.)
1505 <sup>1</sup>	<i>Fragmenta missarum</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1505)
1509 <sup>2</sup>	<i>Frottole libro nono</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1509 mod. st.)
1516 <sup>1</sup>	<i>Liber quindecim missarum . . .</i> (Rome: Antico, 1516)
1534 <sup>5</sup>	<i>Liber tertius . . . motetos</i> (Paris: Attaingnant, 1534)
1534 <sup>9</sup>	<i>Liber septimus . . . modulus</i> (Paris: Attaingnant, 1534)
1538 <sup>9</sup>	<i>Trium vocum carmina</i> (Nuremberg: Formschneider, 1538)
1539 <sup>1</sup>	<i>Liber quindecim missarum à praestantissimis . . .</i> (Nuremberg: J. Petreius, 1539)
1539 <sup>10</sup>	<i>Tertius liber cum quatuor vocibus. Motetti del fiore</i> (Lyons: Moderne, 1539)
1539 <sup>13</sup>	<i>Primus liber cum quatuor vocibus. Motetti del frutto a quattro</i> (Venice: Gardane, 1539)
1541 <sup>1</sup>	<i>Opus decem missarum quatuor vocum . . .</i> (Wittenberg: G. Rhaw, 1541)
1543 <sup>16</sup>	<i>Premier livre des chansons a quatre parties . . .</i> (Antwerp: Susato, 1543)
1544 <sup>10</sup>	<i>Le second livre des chansons a quatre parties . . .</i> (Antwerp: Susato, 1544)
1545 <sup>6</sup>	<i>Bicinia gallica, latina . . .</i> (Wittenberg: G. Rhaw, 1545)
1545 <sup>14</sup>	<i>Le sixiesme livre . . . chansons nouvelles a cinq et a six parties . . .</i> (Antwerp: Susato, 1545)
1546 <sup>9</sup>	<i>Moralis hispani . . . musica cum vocibus quatuor . . .</i> (Venice: A. Gardane, 1546)
1547 <sup>5</sup>	<i>Liber tertius sacrarum cantionum, quatuor vocum . . .</i> (Antwerp: Susato, 1547)
1554 <sup>3</sup>	<i>Liber tertius cantionum sacrarum . . . quinque et sex vocum . . .</i> (Louvain: P. Phalèse, 1554)

B4643	Antoine Brumel, <i>Misse</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1503)
D3416	Baldassare Donato, <i>Il primo libro de motetti a cinque, a sei, et otto voci</i> (Venice: Angelo Gardano, 1599)
G58	<i>Concerti di Andrea, et di Gio: Gabrieli...</i> (Venice: Angelo Gardano, 1597)
J666	<i>Liber primus missarum Josquin</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1502)
J670	<i>Missarum Josquin liber secundus</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1505)
L718	Petrus de la Rue, <i>Misse</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1503)
L795	Orlando di Lasso, <i>Sacrae cantiones... liber tertius</i> (Venice: Antonio Gardano, 1566)
M269	Pierre de Manchicourt, <i>Liber decimus quartus XIX musicas cantiones</i> (Paris: Attaingnant & Jullet, 1539)
M1270	Tiburtio Massaini, <i>Sacri cantus quinque paribus vocibus... liber secundus</i> (Venice: Angelo Gardano, 1580)
M4015	Jean Mouton, <i>Missarum... liber primus</i> (Fossombrone: Petrucci, 1515)
P664	Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina, <i>Missarum liber tertius</i> (Rome: Dorico, 1570)
P689	Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina, <i>Motecta festorum... liber primus</i> (Venice: Antonio Gardano, 1564)
P5181	Costanzo Porta, <i>Liber quinquaginta duorum motectorum...</i> (Venice: Angelo Gardano, 1580)
R3061	Vincenzo Ruffo, <i>Messe a cinque voci...</i> (Brescia: Vincenzo Sabbio, 1580)
V1006	Orazio Vecchi, <i>Sacrarum cantionum... liber secundus</i> (Venice: Angelo Gardano, 1597)
V1354	Ludovico da Viadana, <i>Motecta festorum... opera X</i> (Venice: Ricciardo Amadino, 1598)
V1421	Tomás Luis de Victoria, <i>Motecta, que partim quaternis...</i> (Venice: sons of Antonio Gardano, 1572)
W1108	Adrian Willaert, <i>Motetti... libro secondo a quattro voci</i> (Venice: Scotto, 1539)
W1110	Adrian Willaert, <i>Musica quinque vocum... liber primus</i> (Venice: Scotto, 1539)

# Contents

Series Editor's Foreword	vii
Acknowledgments	ix
List of Abbreviations	xi
Introduction: Borrowing and Early Music <i>Honey Meconi</i>	
1. A Cultural Context for the Chanson Mass <i>M. Jennifer Bloxam</i>	7
2. Ockeghem and Intertextuality: A Composer Interprets Himself <i>Murray Stein</i>	37
3. The Illusion of Allusion <i>Jenny Hodgson</i>	65
4. Interpreting and Dating Josquin's <i>Missa Hercules dux ferrariae</i> <i>Christopher Reynolds</i>	91
5. Habsburg-Burgundian Manuscripts, Borrowed Material, and the Practice of Naming <i>Honey Meconi</i>	111
6. Aspects of Musical Borrowing in the Polyphonic <i>Missa de feria</i> of the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries <i>Andrew H. Weaver</i>	125

**vi • Contents**

7. Mid-Sixteenth-Century Chanson Masses: A Kaleidoscopic Process <i>Cathy Ann Elias</i>	149
8. Melodic Citation in the Sixteenth-Century Motet <i>Michele Fromson</i>	179
<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>207</b>
<b>Contributors</b>	<b>219</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>221</b>