

**STATISTICAL  
METHOD  
IN  
BIOLOGICAL  
ASSAY**

**D. J. FINNEY, Sc.D.**

# STATISTICAL METHOD IN BIOLOGICAL ASSAY

D. J. FINNEY, M.A., Sc.D.

*Lecturer in the Design and Analysis  
of Scientific Experiment,  
University of Oxford*



CHARLES GRIFFIN & COMPANY LIMITED  
LONDON

*Copyright*  
CHARLES GRIFFIN & COMPANY LIMITED  
42 DRURY LANE, LONDON, W.C.2  
*All rights reserved*

*Published in 1952*

## P R E F A C E

In this book, I have attempted to provide a comprehensive account of designs and statistical analyses for biological assays, both as a textbook for the student of statistics and as a work of reference for the practitioner of bioassay. Simple introductions to the subject are to be found in C. W. Emmens's *Principles of Biological Assay*, and in special chapters of P. György's *Vitamin Methods* and J. H. Burn's *Biological Standardization*. My aim, however, has been to develop the theory and methods as far as seems practicable at this time, and to show the unity of the various aspects of the subject. Although considerations of length have compelled me to assume in my readers a reasonable familiarity with the basic statistical techniques used in scientific research (§ 1.5), I have given detailed explanation and illustration of all matters peculiar to the statistics of assays.

Many experimenters who are not themselves statisticians can, usefully and without undue difficulty, attain sufficient knowledge of statistical techniques to aid their own work. Nevertheless, I make no apology for emphasizing in this book the rôle of the professional statistician rather than that of a particular group of experimental scientists. The proper function of the statistician in scientific research and technology is no longer merely that of analysing and summarizing large bodies of numerical data: he must also be prepared to advise on the plan and economy of each investigation, in the light of its operational efficiency for a particular purpose. The efficiency attainable will depend upon the nature and reliability of existing information. The statistician must therefore be a major contributor to the answering of the question: "In the present state of knowledge about the nature and behaviour of certain materials and subjects of experimentation (or of non-experimental observation), how should the next investigation be planned in order to obtain the most trustworthy information on specified points from limited resources of materials, subjects, or time?" He must later analyse the data from the investigation, report on the information they give for the immediate purpose, and be prepared to integrate this information with that previously existing, as a prelude to the

planning of further investigations on the same or related topics. The cycle of design, analysis, report, and integration recurs frequently in the work of the statistician, and the intimate relationship between its parts is particularly well exemplified in biological assay. A familiarity with the details of assay design and analysis is to-day necessary to many statisticians working as consultants in scientific research; in addition, a study of the manner in which the parts of this cycle interlock may be enlightening even to those whose chief interests have no connexion with bioassay.

I cannot adequately express my gratitude to Dr Eric C. Wood, who has for seven years stimulated my interest in biological assay. His persistent refusal to be satisfied by any incomplete answer to a question has compelled me to examine carefully the statistical techniques needed for assays, an inquiry which naturally disclosed gaps in the theory and practice of a branch of statistics that had scarcely been regarded as a unified whole. I have tried to make my own contribution to the filling of these gaps, but my part has mostly been to develop and express more fully the ideas of the pioneers of the subject—Bliss, Burn, Fieller, Gaddum, Hartley, Irwin, Trevan, to name only a few. Many of my own ideas, especially in connexion with slope ratio assays, originated in discussion with Dr Wood; he has given much thought to the logical basis, validity, and interpretation of assays; he has advised me on details of biological, chemical, and experimental theory and practice with which I am unfamiliar; finally, he has given most generously of his time in reading and criticizing the typescript of this book, and has suggested many improvements in matter and presentation.

In 1947, Professor J. H. Burn asked me to write a chapter on statistical methods for his *Biological Standardization*; in 1949, Professor Gertrude M. Cox invited me to lecture on biological assay in the Summer Session in Statistics at the University of North Carolina. I am grateful to Professor Burn and to Professor Cox for having caused me to put my thoughts on bioassay into logical order, for out of the work then done this book has grown.

My understanding of bioassay has gained immeasurably from conversations and correspondence with many other friends. I want to thank especially Dr Joseph Berkson, whose ideas on quantal responses have greatly influenced the argument of this book (though possibly not always in the way he would wish), and Dr. N. K. Jerne,

## PREFACE

who, with Dr Wood, first formulated the ideas in Chapter 15. I am also glad to acknowledge my gratitude to Professor P. A. P. Moran, to my father, and to my wife, for reading the typescript of this book and commenting on style and content; to Miss M. Callow, for a final checking of almost all the calculations and for drawing the diagrams; to Mr A. L. Bacharach, for the many occasions on which he has drawn my attention to interesting problems in analysis and for permission to publish the data in Tables 12.1 and 14.2; to Dr W. F. J. Cuthbertson, for permission to publish the data in Table 16.1; to Professor R. A. Fisher, Dr F. Yates, and Messrs Oliver and Boyd, Ltd, for permission to publish full or abridged versions of Tables III, V, V<sub>1</sub>, IV, and XII from their *Statistical Tables for Biological, Agricultural and Medical Research* as Appendix Tables I, II, III, IV, and XI; and to the Cambridge University Press for permission to publish Tables III and IV from my *Probit Analysis* as Appendix Tables VI and VII.

D. J. FINNEY

OXFORD,

April, 1951

## S C H E M E S   O F   S T U D Y

The arrangement of this book has been planned to give a comprehensive account of the subject for a student of statistical science who is already fairly familiar with less specialized techniques of analysis and with the principles of experimental design. The reader well grounded in the methods of statistical science should encounter little difficulty in a systematic study of the whole book, except, perhaps, in a few sections (such as §§ 2.7, 3.13, 14.3, 17.5, 19.3). Nevertheless, at his first trial he would be wise not to read each chapter fully, but rather should select the more important sections.

Many regular practitioners of biological assay, however, would be reluctant to regard themselves as statisticians, primarily because they lack formal mathematical training. Some understanding of the statistical principles and techniques on which bioassay depends is necessary to them; I am convinced that they can attain a good working knowledge without burdening themselves unduly with mathematical theory. Although this book has not been written for them, judicious choice of sections for study may enable them to gain something useful from it.

In order to guide those who do not propose to read the whole book consecutively, I have prepared suggestions for a first reading  
\* by four different categories of readers. These are :—

- (A) *The professional statistician desiring a short course in biological assay.* Unless he is already experienced in applications of statistical methods to biological experimentation, he ought first to read one or two of the general accounts of bioassay mentioned in § 1.2, in order to appreciate better the background. This course of study might form part of the programme of instruction for a graduate in mathematics who is beginning to specialize in statistical science.
- (B) *The non-mathematical user of biological assays.* He will find much of this book beyond him unless he knows something of the normal,  $t$ ,  $\chi^2$ , and variance ratio distributions,

significance tests, the analysis of variance, and the elements of experimental design. He ought first to study these in one of the textbooks mentioned in § 1.5; he may find his understanding of the present book further helped by reading either Emmens (1948) or Chapter III of Burn *et al.* (1950).

- (C) *The reader, whether statistician, biologist, or chemist, who requires a general survey of the function of statistical science in biological assay.* The sections suggested for him are those which outline the main features of methods and give simple numerical examples, without much emphasis on details of argument or calculation.
- (D) *The reader whose interest lies almost entirely in assays based on quantal responses.* Though he will wish to give most of his attention to the theory and practice of probit analysis and related techniques, he ought at least to read enough of sections from chapters other than 17-21 to enable him to relate these topics to the general theory of bioassay.

The table that follows lists the sections recommended to readers in each of these classes. In general, I would advise that they be read in the order of the book, but in some respects alterations could reasonably be made; for example, all or part of Chapter 15 could be read immediately after Chapter 8, or Chapters 7 and 8 could be deferred until any later stage that seemed convenient. The reader in class B may find that §§ 4.13-4.18 are more easily understood after §§ 5.1 and 5.3. Of course, the sections listed are not necessarily completely self-contained: when the reader encounters references to other sections, he should pursue such of these as seem important to his interest.



# SCHEMES OF STUDY

Chapter	Sections to be read			
	A	B	C	D
1	All	All	1-5, 9	All
2	1-5, 9-11, 14, 15	1-5, 9-11, 14, 15	1-3, 9, 11, 14, 15	1-5, 9-11, 14, 15
3	1-6, 9-12, 14-16	1-5, 9, 11, 14-16	1-5, 14-16	All
4	1-18, 21, 22	1-13, 15-18, 21, 22	1-12, 21, 22	1-12, 21, 22
5	1-5	1, 3-10	1, 9, 10	—
6	All	1-8, 10, 11	1-8, 11	1-8, 11
7	1-10	1-6, 9, 10, 13	1-6	—
8	1-4, 6	1, 2, 4, 6	1, 4, 6	—
9	1-6, 8, 9	1-4, 8	1-4, 8	—
10	1-4	1-3, 7	1, 2, 4, 7	—
11	1, 2	1, 2	1, 6	—
12	1-4, 6	1, 6	1, 6	—
13	1	1, 4	1, 4	—
14	1, 4	4	—	—
15	All	1-5	All	1-5
16	—	—	—	—
17	1-8, 10, 11, 15	1-4	1-4	All
18	1-3, 6	1, 2, 6	1, 2	All
19	1-3, 5, 8	1, 2, 5, 7	1, 2, 5, 7, 8	All
20	1-3, 5, 6, 12	1, 2, 12	1, 2, 12	All
21	5	—	—	All
22	All	1-3	1, 2, 4	All

# C O N T E N T S

*Page*

v

Preface

Schemes of study

xvii

## 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1	The purpose of biological assay	1
1.2	The history of biological assay	3
1.3	The structure of a biological assay	5
1.4	International standards	6
1.5	Statistical science and biological assay	8
1.6	The scope of this book	10
1.7	Computation	12
1.8	Statistical tables	13
1.9	Terminology and notation	14

## 2 DIRECT ASSAYS

2.1	Types of biological assay	21
2.2	The nature of direct assays	21
2.3	An assay of strophanthus	22
2.4	Precision of estimates	24
2.5	Fieller's theorem	27
2.6	The Behrens-Fisher distribution	29
2.7	Two analogues of Fieller's theorem	32
2.8	Fiducial limits in the strophanthus assay	35
2.9	Dilution assays	37
2.10	Revised computations for the strophanthus assay	41
2.11	Adjustment for body weight	43
2.12	A direct assay with covariance	44
2.13	Efficiency and utility of concomitant measurements	54
2.14	The design of direct assays	56
2.15	A criticism of direct assays	57

## 3 QUANTITATIVE DOSE-RESPONSE RELATIONSHIPS

3.1	Indirect assays	58
3.2	The dose-response regression	59
3.3	The condition of similarity	59
3.4	Assay validity	61
3.5	Preliminary regression investigation	63
3.6	The condition of monotony	64

# CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
3.7 Linearizing transformations	66
3.8 Non-linear regressions	69
3.9 The line test for vitamin D	70
3.10 Heterogeneity of variance	75
3.11 Scedasticity transformation of line test scores	77
3.12 The method of maximum likelihood	80
3.13 Estimation of the parameters of regression equations	83
3.14 Standard curve estimation	91
3.15 Standard slope estimation	92
3.16 Simultaneous trial estimation	96
 4 PARALLEL LINE ASSAYS	
4.1 Unsymmetrical designs	99
4.2 Data for an unsymmetrical assay	99
4.3 The dose-response diagram	101
4.4 Analysis of variance	103
4.5 Scedasticity	106
4.6 Linearity	107
4.7 The difference in preparations	108
4.8 Parallelism	108
4.9 Regression	109
4.10 Significance levels	109
4.11 Potency estimation	113
4.12 Fiducial limits	114
4.13 Data for a 4-point assay	117
4.14 Missing values	119
4.15 The dose-response diagram	121
4.16 Analysis of variance	122
4.17 Validity tests	125
4.18 Potency estimation and precision	125
4.19 Exact analysis for missing entries	127
4.20 Approximate analysis for missing entries	133
4.21 Constraints of design	134
4.22 Heterogeneous deviations from linearity	136
 5 SYMMETRICAL DESIGNS FOR PARALLEL LINE ASSAYS	
5.1 A 6-point assay	139
5.2 The symmetrical $2k$ -point design	145
5.3 The 4-point design	148
5.4 The 6-point design	153
5.5 The 8-point design	154
5.6 Streamlined computations	155

# CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
5.7 Nomographic analysis	157
5.8 Mechanical aids to analysis	158
5.9 Range estimation for standard deviations	159
5.10 Control charts	161
5.11 Quadratic regression and the 4-point design	162
<b>6 EFFICIENCY, RELIABILITY, AND SENSITIVITY</b>	
6.1 The purpose of an assay	164
6.2 Validity	165
6.3 The economics of design	166
6.4 Pilot investigations	168
6.5 Symmetry	168
6.6 The cost of statistical analysis	169
6.7 Randomization	171
6.8 Parallel line assays	174
6.9 Symmetrical $2k$ -point designs	178
6.10 The choice of $k$	183
6.11 The comparison of assay techniques	184
<b>7 SLOPE RATIO ASSAYS</b>	
7.1 The power dose metameter	187
7.2 The multiple regression equation	188
7.3 Data for an unsymmetrical slope ratio assay	189
7.4 Analysis of variance	192
7.5 Validity tests	193
7.6 Potency estimation	197
7.7 General formulae	199
7.8 The symmetrical $(2k + 1)$ -point design	200
7.9 The 3-point design	202
7.10 The 5-point design	203
7.11 Other $(2k + 1)$ -point designs	208
7.12 The symmetrical $2k$ -point design	210
7.13 Routine assays	211
<b>8 EFFICIENCY IN SLOPE RATIO ASSAYS</b>	
8.1 General principles	214
8.2 Symmetrical $(2k + 1)$ -point designs	217
8.3 The unsymmetrical 3-point design	220
8.4 The choice of $k$	223
8.5 Symmetrical $2k$ -point designs	224
8.6 The comparison of assay techniques	227

# CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<b>9 INCOMPLETE BLOCK DESIGNS</b>	
9.1 Complex designs	228
9.2 Confounding	229
9.3 An incomplete block assay of vitamin A	231
9.4 Criticism of the design for the assay of vitamin A	236
9.5 A balanced incomplete block assay of vitamin A	237
9.6 The statistical analysis of balanced incomplete block designs	248
9.7 Catalogue of balanced incomplete block designs	250
9.8 An alternative scheme of confounding for the assay of vitamin A	255
9.9 Catalogue of confounded designs	258
9.10 Blocks of unequal size	263
<b>10 CROSS-OVER DESIGNS</b>	
10.1 The cross-over principle	265
10.2 The twin cross-over design	266
10.3 A twin cross-over assay of insulin	267
10.4 The efficiency of cross-over designs	272
10.5 Catalogue of cross-over designs	273
10.6 A cross-over assay of a parathyroid extract	286
10.7 Single subject assays	291
10.8 Exact analysis with one subject missing	295
<b>11 MULTIPLE ASSAYS</b>	
11.1 The economy of multiple assays	300
11.2 An assay of two tuberculins	301
11.3 A multiple assay of streptomycin	306
11.4 Multiple slope ratio assays	316
11.5 Designs for multiple assays	316
11.6 The distribution of responses between preparations	318
<b>12 THE USE OF CONCOMITANT INFORMATION</b>	
12.1 The combination of measurements	323
12.2 An assay of prolactin	325
12.3 Adjustment by proportionality	327
12.4 Adjustment by covariance analysis	328
12.5 An assay of parathyroid extract	338
12.6 The economics of covariance adjustment	353
<b>13 COMPOSITE RESPONSES</b>	
13.1 The discriminant problem	355
13.2 An example of an assay using a discriminant function	357

# CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
13.3 Discriminants and concomitants	363
13.4 The economics of discriminant analysis	364
<b>14 THE COMBINATION OF ESTIMATES</b>	
14.1 Weighted means	365
14.2 Examples of weighted means	367
14.3 The combination of parallel line assays	370
14.4 Replication within blocks	375
14.5 Two assays of vitamin D <sub>3</sub>	382
14.6 A series of cross-over assays	388
14.7 The combination of slope ratio assays	390
<b>15 VALIDITY AND THE CHOICE OF METAMETERS</b>	
15.1 Fundamental validity	392
15.2 The validity of 4-point assays	395
15.3 Statistical validity	395
15.4 Comments on the conditions of statistical validity	398
15.5 The objectivity of statistical analysis	403
15.6 The comparison of alternative metametric transformations	407
<b>16 THE 'GENERAL' METHOD</b>	
16.1 Curvature and heteroscedasticity	419
16.2 Unweighted analysis of an assay of <i>dl</i> -tryptophan	420
16.3 Weighted analysis of the assay of <i>dl</i> -tryptophan	426
16.4 Criticism of the design of the tryptophan assay	434
<b>17 QUANTAL RESPONSES AND THE TOLERANCE DISTRIBUTION</b>	
17.1 The use of quantal responses	437
17.2 The minimal effective dose	439
17.3 The median effective dose	439
17.4 The equivalent deviate transformation	441
17.5 Estimation of the two parameters	443
17.6 The test of homogeneity	449
17.7 The variances of estimates	450
17.8 Normal distribution	451
17.9 Rectangular distribution	453
17.10 Logistic distribution	454
17.11 Angle distribution	456
17.12 Cauchy distribution	457
17.13 Wilson-Worcester distribution	457
17.14 Comparisons between transformations	458
17.15 Choice of a transformation	465

# CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<b>18 ASSAYS BASED ON QUANTAL RESPONSES</b>	
18.1 The computational scheme	468
18.2 An assay of insulin	474
18.3 Speed of convergence	479
18.4 Calculations based on scores	482
18.5 Calculations based on empirical weights	483
18.6 An example of the angle transformation	488
<b>19 THE DESIGN OF ASSAYS BASED ON QUANTAL RESPONSES</b>	
19.1 General principles of good design	491
19.2 The choice of doses	494
19.3 Block restrictions	500
19.4 Cross-over designs	504
19.5 Multiple assays	505
19.6 Sequential procedures	505
19.7 Quality control	508
19.8 The comparison of assay techniques	509
<b>20 ALTERNATIVE METHODS OF ANALYSIS FOR QUANTAL RESPONSES</b>	
20.1 The characteristic curve	512
20.2 Graphical and semi-graphical methods	516
20.3 Estimation by minimum $\chi^2$	520
20.4 Estimation by least squares	522
20.5 Estimation of equivalent doses	523
20.6 The Spearman-Kärber method	524
20.7 The method of extreme effective doses	530
20.8 The Reed-Muench method	533
20.9 The Dragstedt-Behrens method	535
20.10 The moving average method	537
20.11 Comparison of methods	540
20.12 Recommendations on the choice of method	551
<b>21 SPECIAL PROBLEMS WITH QUANTAL RESPONSES</b>	
21.1 Concomitant variation	554
21.2 The combination of estimates	554
21.3 Natural response rates	561
21.4 Assays with unknown numbers of subjects tested	566
21.5 Dilution series	570
<b>22 TIME AS A RESPONSE</b>	
22.1 Time responses	586
22.2 Incomplete records	586
22.3 An assay of a virus	587
22.4 The complete analysis	595

# CONTENTS

REFERENCES	Page 598
APPENDIX TABLES	618
I The distribution of $t$	619
II The distribution of the variance ratio	620
III The Behrens-Fisher distribution	621
IV The distribution of $\chi^2$	623
V The probit transformation	624
VI Minimum and maximum working probits, range, and weighting coefficient	625
VII Working probits	626
VIII The logit transformation	636
IX Minimum and maximum working logits, range, and weighting coefficient	637
X Working logits	638
XI The angle transformation	640
XII Minimum and maximum working angles and range	641
XIII Working angles	643
XIV Transformation of angles to probits	645
XV Transformation of angles to logits	645
XVI The loglog transformation	646
XVII Minimum and maximum working loglog deviates, range, and weighting coefficient	647
INDEX OF AUTHORS	651
INDEX OF SUBJECTS	654



INTRODUCTION

---

**1.1 The purpose of biological assay**

Biological assays are methods for the estimation of the nature, constitution, or potency of a material (or of a process) by means of the reaction that follows its application to living matter. For example, a substance might be identified by means of a characteristic reaction produced in a particular species of organism. Qualitative assays of this type, however, do not present any statistical problems. Quantitative assays, with which this book is concerned, are similar to methods of physical measurement or of quantitative chemical analysis in that their function is to provide numerical assessment of some property of the material to be assayed ; an essential part in this assessment is played by measurement of growth or other changes in animals, plants, animal tissue, micro-organisms, or some other form of living matter. An assay is thus a form of biological experiment, but the interest lies in comparing the potencies of treatments on an agreed scale instead of in comparing the magnitudes of effects of different treatments. The experimental technique may be the same as is used in a purely comparative experiment, but the difference in purpose will affect the optimal experimental design and the statistical analysis. An investigation into the effects of different samples of insulin on the blood sugar of rabbits is not necessarily a biological assay ; it becomes one if the experimenter's interest lies not simply in the changes in blood sugar but in their use for the estimation of the potencies of the samples on a scale of standard units of insulin. Again, a field trial of the responses of potatoes to various phosphatic fertilizers would not generally be regarded as an assay ; nevertheless, if the yields of potatoes are to be used in assessing the potency of a natural rock phosphate relative to a standard superphosphate, and perhaps even in estimating the availability of phosphorus in the rock phosphate, the experiment is an assay within the terms of the description here given.