

ENVIRONMENTAL VALUES IN A GLOBALISING WORLD

Nature, justice and governance

EDITED BY JOUNI PAAVOLA AND IAN LOWE

ROUTLEDGE / CHALLENGES OF GLOBALISATION



000
W2
509

Environmental Values in a Globalising World

Nature, justice and governance

**Edited by Jouni Paavola and
Ian Lowe**

First published 2005
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada
by Routledge
270 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10016

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group

© 2005 Jouni Paavola and Ian Lowe for selection and editorial matter;
individual contributors their contributions

Typeset in Baskerville by Taylor & Francis Books

Printed and bound in Great Britain by
MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced
or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means,
now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording,
or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in
writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

A catalog record for this book has been requested

ISBN 0 415 34362 3

Environmental Values in a Globalising World

This multidisciplinary volume presents a refreshing new approach to environmental values in the global age. It investigates the challenges that globalisation poses to traditional environmental values, in general as well as in politics and international environmental affairs, and in environmental governance.

Divided into five parts, the book investigates how environmental values could be reconceived in a globalising world:

Part I explores contemporary environmental values and their implications for a globalising world.

Part II examines the development of Western and Eastern environmental values.

Part III discusses contemporary environmental politics.

Part IV examines how values inform environmental governance and how governance solutions influence which values are realised.

Part V concludes the volume with two different views of the prospects of environmental values in a globalising world.

Environmental Values in a Globalising World will be of interest to students and researchers studying the environment in philosophy, political science, international relations, international environmental law, environmental studies and development studies.

Jouni Paavola is Senior Research Associate at the Centre for Social and Economic Research on the Global Environment (CSERGE), University of East Anglia, and Associate Fellow of the Oxford Centre for the Environment, Ethics and Society (OCEES), Mansfield College, Oxford.

Ian Lowe is Emeritus Professor of Science, Technology and Society at Griffith University in Brisbane, President of Queensland Academy of Arts and Sciences and a former Director of Australia's Commission for the Future.

Routledge/Challenges of Globalisation

Edited by Charles Sampford and Haig Patapan

Griffith University, Australia

This series seeks to make systematic contributions to international debates over two intimately related issues:

The values that should inform the governance of modern states and the globalising world in which they are increasingly enmeshed, in particular whether the liberal democratic values that sought to civilise the sovereign state need to be reconceived as global values.

The institutions that are needed to realise those values, be they local, national, regional, international, transnational or global.

- 1. Globalisation and Equality**
Edited by Keith Horton and Haig Patapan
- 2. Globalisation and the Rule of Law**
Edited by Spencer Zifcak
- 3. Environmental Values in a Globalising World**
Nature, justice and governance
Edited by Jouni Paavola and Ian Lowe
- 4. Globalisation and Citizenship**
Edited by Jon Stokes and Wayne Hudson

This series also includes a collection of books that explore the relevance of liberal Islamic and Western traditions of political theory to contemporary governance reform, set against the background of the need to reconceive governance values in a globalising world:

Liberal Islam and Western Political Theory: Beyond Conflict

Edited by Wayne Hudson and Azyumardi Azra

Griffith University, Australia and State University of Islamic Studies, Indonesia

- 1. Liberal Islam and the Public Good**
Edited by N. A. Fadhil Lubis and A. J. Brown
- 2. Liberal Islam, Democracy and Citizenship**
Edited by Azyumardi Azra and Robyn Lui
- 3. Liberal Islam and Civic Pluralism**
Edited by Wayne Hudson and Bahtiar Effendy

Contributors

Robin Attfield is Professor of Philosophy in the School of English, Communication and Philosophy at Cardiff University.

Andrew Brennan is Chair in Philosophy at the University of Western Australia, Perth, and Visiting Professor of Philosophy at La Trobe University, Melbourne.

Celia Bridgewater is Project Officer at the Centre for Cross-Cultural Research at the Australian National University in Canberra where she works on the interaction of language, culture and landscape.

Peter Bridgewater is Secretary General of the Ramsar Convention on Wetlands. He was previously Secretary of the UNESCO Man and Biosphere Programme, Chief Executive Officer of the Australian Nature Conservation Agency and Chairman of the International Whaling Commission.

James (Jim) Allen Dator is Director of Hawaii Research Center for Futures Studies (HRCFS) and a professor in the Department of Political Science at the University of Hawaii.

Joyeeta Gupta is Associate Professor and head of the Programme on International Environmental Governance at the Institute for Environmental Studies at Vrije Universiteit in Amsterdam.

Paul G. Harris is Senior Lecturer at London Metropolitan University in the UK and Research Fellow in the Centre for Public Policy Studies and the Centre for Asian Pacific Studies at Lingnan University in Hong Kong.

Bo Kjellén is Chair of the Swedish Research Council on Environment, Agricultural Sciences and Spatial Planning and Advisor for the Swedish Ministry for Environment. He was Chief Negotiator for the Swedish Ministry of Environment between 1990 and 1998 and in charge of climate negotiations 1990–2001, holding various chairmanships in the Rio process.

Ian Lowe is Emeritus Professor of Science, Technology and Society at Griffith University in Brisbane. He directed Australia's Commission for the Future in 1988 and chaired the advisory body which produced his country's first national report on the state of the environment in 1996.

John M. Meyer is Associate Professor in the Department of Government and Politics at Humboldt State University, Arcata, CA.

Jouni Paavola is Senior Research Associate at the Centre for Social and Economic Research on the Global Environment (CSERGE), University of East Anglia, and Associate Fellow of the Oxford Centre for the Environment, Ethics and Society (OCEES), Mansfield College, Oxford.

David Schlosberg is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Northern Arizona University.

Kate Soper is Professor in the Department of Humanities, Arts and Languages and a member of the Institute for the Study of European Transformations at London Metropolitan University.

Julia Tao is the Director of Governance in Asia Research Centre and Associate Professor at the City University of Hong Kong.

Foreword

I am delighted to congratulate the editors of this volume on bringing together a significant contribution to the 'Challenges of Globalisation' series. They and the contributors have laboured long and hard to produce this set of related essays. We all met together for an intensive two-day workshop held in Mansfield College, Oxford to share and hone our own ideas in developing this book. That workshop was thoroughly stimulating and deeply thought-provoking. We hope that the book that has been born of those discussions is similarly stimulating and thought-provoking.

The editors have done a splendid job of indicating the themes and structure of the book in their introduction, I will merely seek to provide some context.

The series

Since the Second World War, the United Nations and other institutions have sought to encourage both the spread of sovereignty and the recognition of universal values (especially human rights) by all sovereign states. This could be dubbed the 'UN project' – every people a sovereign state, every sovereign state a respecter of human rights.

However, a range of recent trends, which are popularly labelled 'globalisation', have rocked the assumption that a world of strong sovereign states was the natural condition to which human societies were evolving. Rather than a process in which distinct geographic areas were politically crystallised as states, the last 300 years could now be interpreted as a relatively brief interlude in the development of political communities and political institutions. Sovereign states are not the end point of constitutional development but a mere transitory phase.

The political and economic forces collectively called 'globalisation' have undermined the assumption of the strong state as the context for political debate about the balancing and realising of liberal democratic values. Both detractors and supporters of globalisation have queried the continuing relevance of state-based theory and values. Liberal democratic values were formed *in* and *for* strong sovereign states. Citizenship, rights, democracy, welfare and community have clear reference to sovereign states but seem to lack apparent application in a larger, more diffuse, global world. The institutions which promote, sustain and

realise most of those values are very much state-based. For example, democracy is realised through citizen participation in the legislatures of states and their federal elements – and has less mileage if the real power and range of choice open to those legislatures is limited. Welfare and welfare rights such as education and health care are currently only realised through the institutions of strong, sovereign (and wealthy) states – and even the capacity of these institutions to fulfil this role is being increasingly questioned.

Some might think that the decline of state institutions is a convenient excuse for limiting or playing down liberal democratic values. Others argue for the protection and bolstering of strong sovereign states on the basis that only they can deliver rights that cost money to provide.

This series is founded on the view that the values of liberal democracy should be rethought rather than abandoned on the excuse of globalisation, or defended by an attempt to recreate the strong states of the recent past.

Indeed, the series contemplates the possibility that globalisation clears the way for the wider application of liberal democratic values. Most of the liberal democratic values proposed since the Enlightenment were claims for all human beings. The Declaration by the French Assembly was of the rights of *man*. The American Declaration of Independence held ‘these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal . . .’ But despite the universality of these claims (after the insertion of the gender-neutral terms), the institutions created by the state were almost exclusively devoted to providing rights to its own citizens. A more globalised political philosophy may allow these values to have global application. The concepts of sovereignty and non-intervention provided the context for the development of liberal democratic values. They also provided protection for these fledgling values from outside interference by more authoritarian regimes, which disliked democracy. However, the walls of sovereignty also acted as a barrier to these values spreading to neighbouring states whose citizens were often much in need of them.

This series aims to contribute to discussion on these issues through a four-stage process:

- 1 An examination of the challenges that globalisation poses to the values of liberal democracy.
- 2 A consideration of how those values might be redefined for a world largely without strong states.
- 3 A consideration of the institutions (local, national and global) that could realise those values.
- 4 An examination of the means by which those values could be built into those institutions through basic design, management, ethics regimes and integrity systems.

We are conscious that liberal democratic values were, are and always should be contentious. Furthermore, they can be cut up in a number of different ways. Some liberal democratic values can be very ‘imperialistic’, with some writers

tending to have expansive definitions of 'democracy', 'human rights' and the 'rule of law' that effectively encompass all the good things they find or would like to find in contemporary society. For the purposes of discussion, here we have divided liberal democratic values into seven areas: liberty, equality, citizenship, democracy, human rights, the rule of law and the environment.

Although this is fairly arbitrary, it does divide liberal democratic values into more 'bite-sized' pieces and allows more focused discussion on the different (and sometimes competing) values of liberal democracy.

Environmental values

Environmental values may seem to fit uneasily with the other values considered in this series. Most such values deal with the relationships between human beings and the institutions they create. In one sense, environmental values are not really different. They are values for human beings – involving a valuing of the environment in which we live and of a valued life within it.

However, there is the possibility of a real tension here. The Enlightenment not only gave rise to liberal democratic values that might civilise despotic states. It also promoted the idea that science and reason might mean that we could move from fear of 'nature' to knowledge, and then to domination of it. However, even in the eighteenth century, some started to fear the manner and consequences of that domination. William Blake decried the 'dark satanic mills' that threatened 'England's green and pleasant land'. A century later Britain's 'National Trust' was established to defend the countryside, providing a national focus for environmental concerns that would seem to be as naturally global as the universal 'rights of man'.

When environmental values moved to the foreground of political debate in the last quarter of the twentieth century, the global nature of environmental concern was almost universally accepted. However, 'action' was 'local' and the most effective regime for protecting the environment national – and sovereign states took radically different views as to the nature, causes, extent and remedies to the problem.

As a consequence, environmental values are indeed faced with the same problem as other liberal democratic values. Sovereign states have been the means by which environmental values could be pursued but are also an impediment to the achievement of those values on a global scale. Just as universal human rights cannot be achieved through geographically limited states, environmental values need to be conceived and ultimately realised globally.

As with all the other values we are seeking to globalise, this raises many value issues and, ultimately, many institutional issues. This volume does not claim to answer all such issues but does seek to make a contribution to the formulation of those issues and the sensible potential responses to them.

And thanks

I would like to acknowledge the support provided to this project by the Australian Research Council and the Harold Hyam Wingate Foundation, which made the workshop and this collection possible. Thanks must also go to OCEES, Mansfield College, the Routledge team, the Key Centre and the Key Centre's Publications Manager, Carmel Connors.

Charles Sampford
Director, Key Centre for Ethics, Law, Justice and Governance,
Griffith University, Australia
President, International Institute for Public Ethics

Preface and acknowledgements

This volume has its origins in a series of seminars initiated by the Key Centre for Ethics, Law, Justice and Governance (KCELJG) of Griffith University on liberal democratic values in the globalising world. The purpose of these seminars has been to reconceive liberal democratic values for the globalising world rather than surrendering them. The seminar that resulted in this volume examined environmental values while other seminars in the series have examined the rule of law, rights, citizenship, democracy, liberty and equality. The volume's theme is important as global environmental change demands timely and concerted international action and yet that action has to mobilise a large proportion of heterogeneous humanity. The contributors have brought the viewpoints of several disciplines and traditions to bear on environmental values in this volume. They make a number of novel arguments which contribute to both scholarship and policy practice in environmental matters.

We have become indebted to a number of people and organisations in the course of producing this volume. First and foremost, we want to express our gratitude to the Harold Hyam Wingate Foundation and to the Key Centre for Ethics, Law, Justice and Governance for financial support which made it possible for the contributors to convene in the Oxford Centre for the Environment, Ethics and Society (OCEES) at Mansfield College, Oxford. Our Reconceiving Environmental Values in a Globalising World seminar took place on 11–12 July 2002. Jouni Paavola also gratefully acknowledges the support of the UK's Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) for the Programme on Environmental Decision Making (PEDM) at the Centre for Social and Economic Research on the Global Environment (CSERGE), University of East Anglia, of which his work for this volume forms a part.

We also present our sincere thanks to Charles Sampford, Director of the Key Centre for Ethics, Law, Justice and Governance of Griffith University, and Neil Summerton, Director of the Oxford Centre for the Environment, Ethics and Society of Mansfield College. They helped us make the event and the book a reality.

Jouni Paavola
Ian Lowe
May 2004

eBooks

eBooks – at www.eBookstore.tandf.co.uk

A library at your fingertips!

eBooks are electronic versions of printed books. You can store them on your PC/laptop or browse them online.

They have advantages for anyone needing rapid access to a wide variety of published, copyright information.

eBooks can help your research by enabling you to bookmark chapters, annotate text and use instant searches to find specific words or phrases. Several eBook files would fit on even a small laptop or PDA.

NEW: Save money by eSubscribing: cheap, online access to any eBook for as long as you need it.

Annual subscription packages

We now offer special low-cost bulk subscriptions to packages of eBooks in certain subject areas. These are available to libraries or to individuals.

For more information please contact
webmaster.ebooks@tandf.co.uk

We're continually developing the eBook concept, so keep up to date by visiting the website.

www.eBookstore.tandf.co.uk

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	viii
<i>Notes on contributors</i>	ix
<i>Foreword</i>	xi
<i>Preface and acknowledgements</i>	xv
 PART I	
Introduction	1
 1 Environmental values in a globalising world	3
IAN LOWE AND JOUNI PAAVOLA	
 PART II	
Environmental values and the nation state	15
 2 Globalisation and the environment: endgame or a ‘new Renaissance’?	17
ANDREW BRENNAN	
 3 Environmental values, nationalism, global citizenship and the common heritage of humanity	38
ROBIN ATTFIELD	
 4 The enchantments and disenchantments of nature: implications for consumption in a globalised world	51
KATE SOPER	
 5 Relational resonance with nature: the Confucian vision	66
JULIA TAO	

PART III

Globalisation, values and environmental politics 81

- 6 Global liberalism, environmentalism and the changing boundaries of the political: Karl Polanyi's insights** 83

JOHN M. MEYER

- 7 Reconceiving environmental justice: global movements and political theories** 102

DAVID SCHLOSBERG

- 8 Environmental values in a globalising world: the case of China** 123

PAUL G. HARRIS

PART IV

Environmental governance and values 141

- 9 Interdependence, pluralism and globalisation: implications for environmental governance** 143

JOUNI PAAVOLA

- 10 The climate change regime: de jure and de facto commitment to sustainable development** 159

JOYEETA GUPTA

- 11 Diplomacy and governance for sustainability in a partially globalised world** 179

BO KJELLÉN

- 12 International environmental governance: the story so far** 197

PETER BRIDGEWATER AND CELIA BRIDGEWATER

PART V

Conclusions 213

- 13 Assuming 'responsibility for our rose'** 215

JIM DATOR

14 Environmental values in the globalising world: grounds for cautious optimism	236
IAN LOWE	
<i>Index</i>	246

Illustrations

Figures

11.1	Elements of sustainability	184
11.2	National preparation and multilateral negotiations	188
11.3	The cycle of sustainability	193

Tables

9.1	Main physical resource attributes	145
11.1	Enabling conditions of the new sustainability paradigm	190