



# READING CRITICALLY, WRITING WELL

## A Reader and Guide

THIRD EDITION

Rise B. Axelrod

California State University, San Bernardino

Charles R. Cooper

University of California, San Diego

ST. MARTIN'S PRESS NEW YORK Acquisitions editor: Karen Allanson Development editor: Mark Gallaher

Manager, publishing services: Emily Berleth

Project management: Denise Quirk Art director: Sheree L. Goodman Text design: Angela Foote Cover design: Ieheber & Peace

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 90-50039
Copyright © 1993 by St. Martin's Press, Inc.
All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted by any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, except as may be expressly permitted by the applicable copyright statutes or in writing by the Publisher.

Manufactured in the United States of America.

7654
fe

For information, write: St. Martin's Press, Inc. 175 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10010

ISBN: 0-312-05809-8

#### Acknowledgments

Acknowledgments and copyrights are continued at the back of the book on pages 536–37, which constitute an extension of the copyright page.

It is a violation of the law to reproduce these selections by any means whatsoever without the written permission of the copyright holder.

Arguelles, Mary, "Money for Morality." Originally appeared in *Newsweek* magazine, October 28, 1991. Reprinted by permission of the author.

Baker, Russell, "Smooth and Easy." Reprinted from Growing Up, © 1982, by Russell Baker, used with permission of Congdon & Weed, Inc.

Benson, Sheila, "Thelma and Louise: Good Ol' Boys?" Copyright 1991, Los Angeles Times. Reprinted by permission.

Considine, J. D., "Dangerous: A Walk on the Mild Side." Reprinted with permission of the Baltimore Sun.

Csikszentmilhalyi, Mihaly, "The Autotelic Self." From Flow: The Psychology of Optimal Experience, by Mihaly Csikszentmilhalyi, Copyright © 1990 by Mihaly Csikszentmilhalyi. Reprinted by permission of HarperCollins Publishers.

Dillard, Annie, "A Chase." From An American Childhood, by Annie Dillard. Copyright © 1987 by Annie Dillard. Reprinted by permission of HarperCollins Publishers.

Ehrlich, Gretel, "Saddle Bronc Riding at the National Finals." Retitled from "Rules of the Game," from *The Solace of Open Spaces* by Gretel Ehrlich. Copyright © 1985 by Gretel Ehrlich. Used by permission of Viking Penguin, a division of Penguin Books USA, Inc.

Erdrich, Louise, "Preventing Pregnant Alcoholic Women from Drinking." Foreword from *The Broken Cord* by Michael Dorris. Copyright © 1989 by Michael Dorris. Reprinted by permission of HarperCollins Publishers.

Etzioni, Amitai, "Working at McDonald's." Reprinted by permission of the author.

Faludi, Susan, "Speak for Yourself." Copyright © 1988/92 by the New York Times Company. Reprinted by permission.

## **PREFACE**

Like previous editions, this third edition of Reading Critically, Writing Well is more than simply a collection of readings for a college writing course; our goal throughout continues to be to teach students practical strategies for critical reading, thereby enabling them to analyze thoughtfully the readings in this text and in their other college courses. We assume that college students should learn to think and read critically and that as they become better critical readers, they will also become more effective writers. To this instruction in reading, we add comprehensive guidance in writing, helping students to understand and manage the composing process—from invention through planning and drafting to revision.

This text attempts to bring critical reading and writing together in an ideal relationship. After their initial reading of each of the selections included here, students are encouraged to reread and annotate the essay and to write about their responses to its meaning. Then they return to the essay again to annotate, analyze, and write about one or more of its distinctive rhetorical features: here students are offered specific questions for analyzing the major nonfiction genres or kinds of discourse and criteria for evaluating them. Based on these analyses and evaluations, students learn to read each genre with a critical eye and, finally, to practice writing their own essays of that kind.

We believe that if students have specific strategies for reading and careful guidance with writing, they can study seriously and compose confidently the types of discourse written by academics and professionals. Instead of exercises in the conventional modes of writing, this text offers

real-world writing tasks; students read and write the kinds of discourse they will encounter during college and on the job. They practice the forms of critical analysis, inquiry, and knowledge-making central to research and learning in college. In this way, the text introduces them to writing and learning across the college curriculum.

#### New to This Edition

This third edition of *Reading Critically*, *Writing Well* remains fundamentally the same book in its assumptions about students' learning and its attention to instruction in both reading and writing strategies. It is, nevertheless, a substantially revised book, as the following summary will suggest:

- Chapter 1 has been rewritten to get the course off to a quick start by introducing two basic reading strategies: reading for meaning and reading like a writer. These two strategies are carried through the entire book, providing the basis for each chapter introduction and for the apparatus following each reading.
- The catalog of critical reading strategies that previously opened the book has been moved to an appendix, which students can refer to easily.
- The openings of Chapters 2 through 9 and the apparatus following every reading selection have been redesigned and rewritten.
- Group-inquiry activities and a list of typical academic and workplace writing situations appropriate for each genre have been added to Chapters 2 through 9.
- Many of the Ideas for Your Own Writing that follow each reading selection have been expanded, offering students a wider array of specific essay topics.
- Chapters 2 through 9 each conclude with a summary checklist of the basic features of the genre to aid students in reading their own essays, and those by other writers, critically.
- Thirty-three of the fifty-two essays are new.

Most of these changes are discussed in greater detail below.

### **Noteworthy Features**

Primary focus on fundamental critical reading strategies. The opening chapter of Reading Critically, Writing Well introduces the concept of critical reading through the example of a sample essay that has been annotated twice—first to explore its meaning (reading for meaning), then to analyze its key rhetorical features (reading like a writer)—

followed in each case by a written exploration of the annotations. A second essay in Chapter 1 provides an opportunity for students to practice the same kinds of annotating and writing activities on their own. Chapter 1 in this edition represents a marked departure from that in previous editions, concentrating as it does on the fundamental critical reading strategies of annotating essays and examining their key rhetorical features. (The further critical reading strategies are now introduced as appropriate elsewhere in the book and described in detail in Appendix 1, A Catalog of Critical Reading Strategies.) This new Chapter 1 should provide a more manageable introduction to the concepts and practices that underlie the rest of the book.

Organization based on eight basic types of discourse. As in previous editions, Chapters 2 through 9 then focus on reading and writing particular types of discourse: four types of personal and explanatory discourse (autobiography, observation, reflection, and explanation of concepts) and four types of argumentative discourse (evaluation, analysis of causes or effects, proposal to solve a problem, and arguing a position on a controversial issue). These eight chapters provide students with comprehensive support for reaching the goals stated in our title: reading critically and writing well.

Detailed chapter introductions that guide students in reading each type of discourse closely and critically. Chapters 2 through 9 begin by introducing the rhetorical situation in which each type of discourse is most commonly produced and read. To illustrate the importance of annotating in reading critically, a brief annotated excerpt from one of the chapter's reading selections is presented. Students are then guided through their own detailed annotations and written analyses of a brief representative essay. These analyses, based on the primary goals of reading for meaning and reading like a writer outlined in Chapter 1, help students focus on particular ideas and issues raised in the essay and on basic rhetorical features and writing strategies, so they can learn to analyze, evaluate, and write the type of discourse under discussion.

New to these chapter introductions, in addition to the more detailed guidance in annotation and critical reading, are (1) an outline of three or four professional and academic writing situations, showing students how each particular genre is central to college writing assignments across the disciplines; and (2) a group-inquiry exercise that invites students to rehearse the assignment situation orally before they begin work in the chapter, with the goal of making the genre seem more understandable and approachable. These group-inquiry exercises also provide opportunities for collaborative learning, as can many of the Reading for Meaning and Reading Like a Writer activities.

**Provocative, illustrative readings.** Next in Chapters 2 through 9, five or six readings (including one written by a student) illustrate the range of writing situations and approaches typical to that kind of discourse, each preceded by headnotes that discuss the author and the context in which the selection was written and followed by ideas for students' own writing. Well over half of these readings are new to the third edition, and our goal has been to choose new readings that—in terms of subject matter, rhetorical structure, and representativeness of discourse type—are interesting and provocative and at the same time benefit from close, critical analysis.

Carefully focused apparatus that promotes critical reading and writing. The new apparatus following these readings reflects the more focused and streamlined goals of Chapter 1: instead of the usual list of questions, there are only two clearly defined tasks. Under Reading for Meaning, students are invited to reread, annotate, and write at least a page about the selection, using suggestions based on current research into how readers make meaning for themselves from texts: bringing prior knowledge to bear, starting with what one understands best and then proceeding to what one may not yet understand, reflecting on the experience of trying to find meaning, and responding to specific brief passages. Based on these suggestions, students decide for themselves how to engage the text through rereading, annotating, and writing. We know from class testing that such engagement prepares students for lively discussion; more important, students see more in every essay than is possible after reading it once and answering a few perfunctory questions.

Next, the Reading Like a Writer activity following each selection focuses on a single rhetorical feature or writing strategy that is different for each reading in the chapter. By focusing on a single rhetorical feature at a time, students are able to examine how and why writers construct their texts in particular ways. They see the role convention plays in writing and the many imaginative ways writers may use—and may also resist—convention. As with the Reading for Meaning activity, once students have reread and annotated the selection, they are asked to write about what they have learned.

In addition, following two selections in Chapters 2 through 9, a further critical strategy for reading for meaning or reading like a writer is added. Described in detail in Appendix 1, A Catalog of Critical Reading Strategies, each of these represents a particular approach to annotating and analyzing a text. Unlike previous editions, where students were introduced to all these reading strategies in Chapter 1, this edition gradually introduces students to these strategies as each is useful for analyzing a particular reading.

Comprehensive guide to writing each type of discourse. As in previous editions, Chapters 2 through 9 conclude with a brief but comprehensive guide to writing that helps students through each stage of the writing process for that particular genre—from finding a topic to revising for readability. These guides to writing are each followed by a new summary of basic features to help students revise their own work and to analyze and evaluate the work of other writers, professionals and peers alike.

Complete catalog of critical reading strategies. Appendix 1, A Catalog of Critical Reading Strategies, offers a variety of proven reading strategies including previewing, outlining and summarizing, exploring the significance of figurative language, looking for patterns of opposition, evaluating an argument, and comparing and contrasting related readings—along with three new strategies growing out of current reading research: contextualizing, questioning to understand and remember, and reflecting on challenges to your beliefs and values. An excerpt from the famous "Letter from Birmingham Jail" by Martin Luther King, Jr., is annotated and analyzed according to these strategies, and the full text of the letter concludes the appendix to allow further reading and analysis.

Brief guide to research and documentation. A final appendix discusses library and field research. It includes MLA and APA guidelines for documenting sources, and it offers advice to help students integrate research materials into their own writing.

Thorough instructor's manual. An Instructor's Resource Manual outlines various course plans for using this text and offers suggestions for presenting each reading. It includes, as well, discussion of general teaching strategies that became central to our work as we taught previous editions and an annotated bibliography of recent research and theory on learning from text, sources that influenced our choice of critical reading strategies.

### Acknowledgments

We first want to thank our students. Students in the Third College Writing Program at the University of California, San Diego, and at California State University, San Bernardino, have been generous and frank with their advice, and some of them contributed essays to this text. Their instructors also have had a major role in shaping the book. A special thanks to Kathryn O'Rourke, Sherrie Innes, Peg Syverson, and their students for trying out new material, and to Kris Hawkinson for her excellent work on the *Instructor's Resource Manual*.

We owe a debt of gratitude to the many reviewers and questionnaire respondents who made suggestions for the revision. They include Ronald Ballard, Hagerstown Junior College; Gerri Black, Stockton State College; Marilyn Button, Lincoln University; Cynthia Cawthra, Walla Walla College; Brad Comann, University of North Carolina at Greensboro; Reinhold J. Dooley, North Park College; Ellen M. Bommarito, University of Michigan-Flint; Ardyce Chidester, American River College; Diane Ewing, Golden West College; Candice Favilla, Sul Ross State University; Terrence E. Fischer, University of Maryland—College Park; Joan Gilson, University of Missouri-Kansas City; David Good, Kings River Community College; Linda Maureen Gordon, Christopher Newport College; Stephen L. Hughes, Bartlesville Wesleyan College; Richard Jones, South Suburban College; Julie Keener, Ohlone College; Joan Kopperud, Concordia College; Kathy B. Kory, Durham Technical Community College; Teresa LaRocco, University of Findlay; Russ Larson, Eastern Michigan University; Jane Lindskold, Lynchburg College; James Livingston, Northern Michigan University; Patricia Lorimer Lundberg, Indiana University Northwest; Wendy Hall Maloney, Brooklyn College, CUNY; Ann McCluskey, Champlain College; James C. McDonald, University of Southwestern Louisiana; Pat Miller, Valdosta State College; Paralee Norman, Northwestern State University; Nicholas A. Petit, Kentucky State University; Karen Regal, Kirkwood Community College; Terri Shanahan, Grand Valley State University; Dean Stover, Arizona State University; Leigh Streff, Des Moines Area Community College; Mary K. Taylor, McLennon Community College; Anna B. Young, Trenton State College; and John Zoppi, Union County College.

To the crew at St. Martin's Press, we wish to convey our deepest appreciation. We especially want to thank Mark Gallaher, editor par excellence. We are grateful to Denise Quirk for her sharp eye and deft pencil, and to Emily Berleth for her smooth coordination.

Finally, we want to thank our families for their enduring love and support. Rise dedicates this book to the memory of Bea Borenstein—and to Greg and Mort, who must carry on without her.

Rise B. Axelrod Charles R. Cooper

# **CONTENTS**

Chapter 1	INTRODUCTION	1
READING CI	RITICALLY	3
Reading for M	eaning	3
Annotating	4	
Katrin	NNOTATED SAMPLE: FIRST READING of Foley and Sheila Moreland, The Dirty Secret of States of the State	
Exploratory	Writing 6	
Reading Like	a Writer	8
Annotating	9	
Katrin	NNOTATED SAMPLE: SECOND READING of Foley and Sheila Moreland, The Dirty Secret of Sternity Drinking Songs 9	
Exploratory	Writing 11	
–Robert	t C. Noble, There Is No Safe Sex 13	
WRITING W	ELL	18
Invention		20
Drafting		20
Revising		21
		xi

Chapter 2	AUTOBIOGRAPHY	23
	1 Writing Situations 24	
Group Inquiry:	Autobiography 25	
A Guide to Re	ading Autobiography	26
Audre L	orde, That Summer I Left Childhood Was White	27
Annie Dillard •	A Chase	35
	ited poet and essayist remembers, with strange affec- uildhood prank and its scary consequences.	
Russell Baker •	Smooth and Easy	41
	known newspaper columnist recalls with humor his nitiation as an Air Force pilot.	
Richard Rodrigi	uez • My Parents	47
	f Mexican immigrants explores the mingled pride and not with which his parents regarded his early academic	
Monica Sone •	Camp Harmony	53
endured o	l psychologist remembers what she and her family during their imprisonment in a World War II intern- up for Japanese Americans.	
	Beauty: When the Other Dancer Is the Self√	62
A promir disfigurin	nent novelist and essayist examines the influence a g childhood accident has had on her life.	
Brad Benioff •	Rick (student essay)	71
	freshman looks back at his complex relationship manding, sometimes abusive high-school coach.	
A Guide to Au	tobiographical Writing	76
INVENTION		76

Contents	• xiii
DRAFTING	79
REVISING	80
Reading Autobiographical Writing: A Summary	82
Chapter 3 OBSERVATION	83
Observational Writing Situations 84 Group Inquiry: Observation 85	
A Guide to Reading Observational Writing	86
Tracy Kidder, Teaching Celery 87	
The New Yorker • Soup	94
A restaurateur—a temperamental master of the art of soup making—is profiled along with his tiny storefront soup kitchen.	
Gretel Ehrlich • Saddle Bronc Riding at the National Finals	99
A Wyoming writer and rancher observes the rodeo's wildest contest.	
Michael Lydon • Subway Orpheus	103
A journalist and musician explores the "underground harmony" of New York City's program to bring music to its public transportation system.	
John McPhee • The New York Pickpocket Academy	110
A preeminent writer of "the literature of fact" observes pick- pockets and their victims at an open-air produce market.	
Craig Elsten • Dead Air (student essay)	117
A college freshman profiles a wacky campus radio station that exists as a world of its own.	

A Guide to Observational Writing	122
INVENTION	122
DRAFTING	124
REVISING	126
Reading Observational Writing: A Summary	128
Chapter 4 REFLECTION	129
Reflective Writing Situations 130	
Group Inquiry: Reflection 131	
A Guide to Reading Reflective Writing	132
Jerry Rockwood, Life Intrudes 134	
Brent Staples • Black Men and Public Space	141
A member of the <i>New York Times</i> editorial board notes how his presence on a city street triggers defensive reactions in white passersby and addresses the "alienation that comes of being ever the suspect."	
Susan Faludi • Speak for Yourself	146
An outspoken analyst of gender roles explores how she came to terms with the widely shared fear of public speaking.	
Mary Arguelles • Money for Morality	151
A free-lance writer offers her reflections on what she regards as a socially dangerous trend: rewarding students by paying them for basic good behavior.	
Ishmael Reed • What's American about America?	156
An African-American novelist, essayist, and activist reflects on the mosaic of cultural diversity that he sees as a hallmark of contemporary American life.	

Katherine Haines • Whose Body Is This? (student essay)	
A college freshman considers society's obsession with the perfect body—especially the perfect female body—and the negative pressures this obsession creates.	
A Guide to Reflective Writing	167
INVENTION	167
DRAFTING	170
REVISING	
Reading Reflective Writing: A Summary	173
Chapter 5 EXPLAINING CONCEPTS	175
Writing Situations for Explaining Concepts 177 Group Inquiry: Explaining Concepts 178	
A Guide to Reading Explanations of Concepts	179
David Quammen, Parthenogenesis 180	
Stephen K. Reed • The Influence of Prior Knowledge on Comprehension	191
A professor of psychology introduces college students to the concept that what readers already know influences what they can learn and expect from an unfamiliar text.	
John P. Hewitt and Myrna Livingston Hewitt • Participant Observation	200
Two sociologists describe a study of the used-car business in order to explain a research method in sociology and anthropology: acting as a participant in the group being observed.	
Mihaly Csikszentmilhalyi • The Autotelic Self	207
In an excerpt from his best-selling self-help book, a distin- guished psychologist explains the personal characteristics that lead to success and inner satisfaction.	

Perry Nodelman • Reading against Texts	213
A literary critic looks at several well-known children's books in order to explain the concept of reading against texts: uncovering assumptions about social hierarchies, gender, and race rather than accepting them unknowingly.	
Melissa McCool • Reincarnation (student essay)	221
A college freshman explains a defining belief of several major Asian religions and the history of this belief among Ameri- cans.	
A Guide to Writing Explanations of Concepts	228
INVENTION	228
DRAFTING	233
REVISING	235
Reading Explanations of Concepts: A Summary	236
Chapter 6 EVALUATION	237
Evaluative Writing Situations 239	
Evaluative Writing Situations 239 Group Inquiry: Evaluative Criteria 240	
	240
Group Inquiry: Evaluative Criteria 240	240
Group Inquiry: Evaluative Criteria 240  A Guide to Reading Evaluative Writing	240
Group Inquiry: Evaluative Criteria 240  A Guide to Reading Evaluative Writing  Amitai Etzioni, Working at McDonald's 241	
A Guide to Reading Evaluative Writing  Amitai Etzioni, Working at McDonald's 241  Sheila Benson • Thelma and Louise: Good Ol' Boys?  A film critic for the Los Angeles Times offers a scathing review of the portrayal of women in a popular but controversial re-	

J. D. Considine • Dangerous: A Walk on the Mild Side	261
The pop music critic for the <i>Baltimore Sun</i> finds little to praise in Michael Jackson's heavily hyped 1991 album.	
Alice Walker • The Civil Rights Movement: What Good Was It?	267
In a famous 1967 essay, the celebrated writer evaluates the impact of the civil rights movement on African-American consciousness.	
Ilene Wolf • Buzzworm: The Superior Magazine (student essay)	275
A college freshman compares a new environmental publication with the well-known <i>Sierra</i> in order to suggest the overall superiority of the former.	
A Guide to Evaluative Writing	280
INVENTION	280
DRAFTING	283
REVISING	284
Reading Evaluative Writing: A Summary	286
Chapter 7 ANALYSIS OF CAUSES OR EFFECTS	287
Cause or Effect Writing Situations 289	
Group Inquiry: Analyzing Causes or Effects 289	
A Guide to Reading an Analysis of Causes or Effects	290
Stephen King, Why We Crave Horror Movies 291	
Abigail Thernstrom • Out-Classed	299
A journalist who specializes in social issues suggests some reasons why parochial schools seem to outperform public schools in the United States.	

Justin Lewis and Sut Jhally • The Cosby Show: A Too Comforting Image	
Two communications professors consider some factors underlying the increasingly common misperception that the gap in economic opportunity between blacks and whites has closed.	
Jonathan Kozol • The Human Cost of an Illiterate Society	310
Asking whether "Americans possess the character and courage to address a problem which so many nations, poorer than our own, have found it natural to correct," an educational reformer looks at the disturbing consequences of illiteracy.	
Steven Waldman • The Tyranny of Choice	318
A Newsweek correspondent takes a partly humorous look at the effects of facing so many choices in our daily lives—begin- ning with the three hundred varieties of men's socks he dis- covers at a local specialty store.	
Reese Mason • Basketball and the Urban Poor (student essay)	326
A college freshman tries to make sense of the on-court death of college basketball star Hank Gathers: why Gathers continued to play when he knew it put his life in jeopardy.	
A Guide to Writing an Analysis of Causes or Effects	331
INVENTION	331
DRAFTING	334
REVISING	336
Reading an Analysis of Causes or Effects: A Summary	338
Chapter 8 PROPOSAL TO SOLVE A PROBLEM	339

Writing Situations for Proposing Solutions to Problems 341 Group Inquiry: Proposing Solutions to Problems 342