

ASPEN PUBLISHERS

SCHWARTZ  
CORRADA  
BROWN

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW  
A Casebook

*Seventh  
Edition*



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

ASPEN PUBLISHERS

# Administrative Law

A CASEBOOK

Seventh Edition

BERNARD SCHWARTZ

Late Chapman Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of Tulsa College of Law

ROBERTO L. CORRADA

Professor of Law  
University of Denver Sturm College of Law

J. ROBERT BROWN, JR.

Professor of Law  
University of Denver Sturm College of Law



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

© 2010 estate of Bernard Schwartz, Roberto L. Corrada, and J. Robert Brown, Jr.

Published by Aspen Publishers. All Rights Reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission to make copies of any part of this publication should be mailed to:

Aspen Publishers  
Attn: Permissions Department  
76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor  
New York, NY 10011-5201

To contact Customer Care, e-mail [customer.care@aspenpublishers.com](mailto:customer.care@aspenpublishers.com), call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Aspen Publishers  
Attn: Order Department  
PO Box 990  
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-07355-8746-5

#### **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Schwartz, Bernard, 1923–1997.

Administrative law : casebook / Bernard Schwartz, Roberto L. Corrada, J. Robert Brown, Jr.  
—7th ed.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-7355-8746-5 (casebound : alk. paper) 1. Administrative law—United States.  
I. Corrada, Roberto L., 1960- II. Brown, J. Robert (James Robert), 1957- III. Title.

KF5402.S343 2011  
342.73'06—dc22

2010023855

**This book contains paper from well-managed forests to SFI standards.**

# Administrative Law      A CASEBOOK

## EDITORIAL ADVISORS

### **Vicki Been**

Elihu Root Professor of Law  
New York University School of Law

### **Erwin Chemerinsky**

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of California, Irvine, School of Law

### **Richard A. Epstein**

James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law  
University of Chicago Law School  
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow  
The Hoover Institution  
Stanford University

### **Ronald J. Gilson**

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business  
Stanford University  
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business  
Columbia Law School

### **James E. Krier**

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law  
The University of Michigan Law School

### **Richard K. Neumann, Jr.**

Professor of Law  
Hofstra University School of Law

### **Robert H. Sitkoff**

John L. Gray Professor of Law  
Harvard Law School

### **David Alan Sklansky**

Professor of Law  
University of California at Berkeley School of Law

### **Kent D. Syverud**

Dean and Ethan A. H. Shepley University Professor  
Washington University School of Law

### **Elizabeth Warren**

Leo Gottlieb Professor of Law  
Harvard Law School

---

## About Wolters Kluwer Law & Business

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business is a leading provider of research information and workflow solutions in key specialty areas. The strengths of the individual brands of Aspen Publishers, CCH, Kluwer Law International and Loislaw are aligned within Wolters Kluwer Law & Business to provide comprehensive, in-depth solutions and expert-authored content for the legal, professional and education markets.

**CCH** was founded in 1913 and has served more than four generations of business professionals and their clients. The CCH products in the Wolters Kluwer Law & Business group are highly regarded electronic and print resources for legal, securities, antitrust and trade regulation, government contracting, banking, pension, payroll, employment and labor, and health-care reimbursement and compliance professionals.

**Aspen Publishers** is a leading information provider for attorneys, business professionals and law students. Written by preeminent authorities, Aspen products offer analytical and practical information in a range of specialty practice areas from securities law and intellectual property to mergers and acquisitions and pension/benefits. Aspen's trusted legal education resources provide professors and students with high-quality, up-to-date and effective resources for successful instruction and study in all areas of the law.

**Kluwer Law International** supplies the global business community with comprehensive English-language international legal information. Legal practitioners, corporate counsel and business executives around the world rely on the Kluwer Law International journals, loose-leafs, books and electronic products for authoritative information in many areas of international legal practice.

**Loislaw** is a premier provider of digitized legal content to small law firm practitioners of various specializations. Loislaw provides attorneys with the ability to quickly and efficiently find the necessary legal information they need, when and where they need it, by facilitating access to primary law as well as state-specific law, records, forms and treatises.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business, a unit of Wolters Kluwer, is headquartered in New York and Riverwoods, Illinois. Wolters Kluwer is a leading multinational publisher and information services company.

---

*This book is dedicated*

by Bernard Schwartz to Brian, who persuaded him to  
undertake this casebook

and by Roberto Corrada to Cándido and Vilma, his parents

and by J. Robert Brown, Jr., to Allison Herren Lee,  
his inspiration for all things in life

# Preface to the 7<sup>th</sup> Edition

---

In the preface to the 6th edition, we reported that two events had dramatically affected the landscape of administrative law since the 5th edition of the casebook. The first of these, the bracing attacks on the World Trade Center of September 11, 2001, and the second, the Enron scandal. While these events have had a lasting impact on government regulation, and, indeed on the national psyche, there has been no shortage, since the last edition, of landmark events intertwined with government regulation and administrative law. It is clear now that the next decade will see sweeping change in the way government is perceived and structured. Indeed, as this edition was going to print, parts of the Department of the Interior were being restructured in reaction to a massive oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico off the coast of Louisiana. At the same time, Congress passed an historic financial regulation law right on the heels of an historic health care reform measure. With this kind of change in the offing, the next edition of this casebook may need to be accelerated.

In addition to changes related to 9/11 and Enron, this edition contains new materials in Chapter 7 related to deference and the continuing saga of the *Chevron* doctrine, plus new items in Chapter 4 related to the ever-challenging distinction between legislative and nonlegislative rules. The modern law of due process in Chapter 5 contains several new cases as the law in that area continues to evolve. The biggest change to this edition involves Chapter 1. We have felt over the years that the Chapter 1 material on separation of powers needed to be more comprehensive and structured while retaining its introductory character. Our response was to rework the Chapter along the lines of government accountability thereby previewing the entire span of administrative law rather than just parts of the constitutional framework of administrative agencies as a transition to Chapter 2. The new Chapter 1 expands the discussion of agency authority and accountability. The Chapter looks at the preemptive effect of agency authority, and then systematically traces the oversight function of the President, Congress and the courts. Included as part of the new Chapter 1 are discussions of agency non-acquiescence (the ability of agencies to disregard holdings of federal courts of appeals) and the most recent effort by Congress to create an agency that tests the outer boundaries of the holdings in *Morrison* and *Humphrey's Executor*.



We continue to be guided by Bernard Schwartz's thinking on administrative law, as evidenced by his text and his many articles on the subject. As mentioned in a prior preface, Bernard Schwartz was dedicated to the advancement of administrative law. His text contains bits and pieces of his work in virtually every facet of administrative law, demonstrating his enormous commitment and contribution to the development of the area. While it may not have started as such, his text eventually came to be a showcase for his thinking on administrative law. We have endeavored to preserve the casebook as a legacy and testament to the force of his ideas on this subject. The following tributes to Bernard Schwartz attest to his extraordinary life in the law: Symposium, *The Life and Legacy of Bernard Schwartz*, 34 Tulsa L.J. 651-711 (1999); *In Memoriam: Bernard Schwartz*, 33 Tulsa L.J. 1041-1096 (1998); *Bernard Schwartz*, 73 N.Y.U. L. Rev. 701 (1998).

We are, of course, indebted to a number of people for their advice and assistance in producing this casebook. At Aspen/Wolters-Kluwer thanks to Eric Holt for his very capable, professional oversight of this project. The casebook could not have been finalized without the work of Katy Thompson at Publication Services. At the University of Denver Sturm College of Law, thanks to Alicia Kim and Olawunmi Ogunwo for their outstanding research assistance. Also, thanks to Diane Burkhardt, Faculty Services Librarian, for her dedication and commitment to faculty research, and to Kate Speer, Allison Rich and Steve Baum for their administrative assistance. Roberto thanks his law school administrative law professor, Michael Cozzillio, for his introduction to the Schwartz casebook and for his contagious passion for the subject. Roberto also thanks his family: Theresa, Amelia, and, posthumously, Maximo (1996-2009) for all of their support. We both are indebted to the University of Denver Sturm College of Law, and its Dean Marty Katz and Associate Dean for Faculty Scholarship, Alan Chen, for continuing financial support.

Roberto L. Corrada  
J. Robert Brown, Jr.

June 2010

# Summary of Contents

---

Contents		xi
Preface		xxi
CHAPTER 1	<i>Administrative Agencies and Administrative Law</i>	1
CHAPTER 2	<i>Delegation of Powers</i>	63
CHAPTER 3	<i>Investigations and Privacy</i>	155
CHAPTER 4	<i>Rules and Rulemaking</i>	251
CHAPTER 5	<i>Right to Be Heard</i>	385
CHAPTER 6	<i>Evidentiary Hearings and Decisions</i>	495
CHAPTER 7	<i>Judicial Review</i>	653
APPENDIX	<i>Federal Administrative Procedure Act</i>	833
Table of Cases		847
Index		855

# Contents

---

Preface	xxi
<b>CHAPTER 1 <i>Administrative Agencies and Administrative Law</i></b>	<b>1</b>
A. What Is Administrative Law?	1
<i>Gilmore v. Lujan</i>	1
Notes	4
Warren, Administrative Law in the Political System	4
Notes	4
B. Administrative Agencies	6
Federal Administrative Procedure Act	6
Notes	6
<i>Wyeth v. Levine</i>	6
Notes	11
C. Types of Agencies	13
Notes	13
Warren, Administrative Law in the Political System	14
Regulatory Program of the United States Government	14
Table 1-1. James Q. Wilson's Four Periods of Bureaucratic Growth	15
Notes	16
D. Agencies and Accountability	17
Agency Accountability and Congress	18
<i>Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha</i>	18
Notes	24
5 U.S.C §801	25
5 U.S.C §804	27
Notes	27
Jerry Brito and Veronique de Rugy, Midnight Regulations and Regulatory Review	28
Notes	30
Agency Accountability and the Courts	30
<i>Johnson v. United States Railroad Retirement Board</i>	30
	<b>xi</b>

Notes	39
Agency Accountability and the President	40
<i>Humphrey's Executor v. United States</i>	40
Notes	42
<i>Morrison v. Olson</i>	43
Notes	51
<i>Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight Board</i>	55
Notes	60
 <b>CHAPTER 2    <i>Delegation of Powers</i></b>	 <b>63</b>
A. Legislative Power	64
1. Separation and Delegation	66
2. <i>Panama and Schechter Cases</i>	68
3. Post-1935 Federal Cases	70
<i>Mistretta v. United States</i>	76
Notes	85
4. Federal Delegation: A Caveat	86
<i>American Trucking Ass'ns. v. EPA</i>	86
Notes	92
<i>Whitman v. American Trucking Ass'ns.</i>	93
Notes	97
5. Individual Rights and Liberties	97
Notes	97
6. State Delegation	99
<i>State v. All Pro Paint &amp; Body Shop</i>	99
Notes	108
7. Delegation and Standards: Coda	109
B. Judicial Power	111
1. The United States Constitution and Judicial Power	111
Debate on Federal Trade Commission Act	111
Notes	112
<i>Thomas v. Union Carbide Agricultural Products Co.</i>	113
Notes	115
<i>Granfinanciera S.A. v. Nordberg</i>	118
Notes	123
2. State Constitutions and Judicial Power	124
<i>McHugh v. Santa Monica Rent Control Board</i>	124
Notes	131
<i>State v. Davis</i>	131
Notes	135
3. Remedies and Penalties	136
a. Remedies	136
<i>Vainio v. Brookshire</i>	136
Notes	139
<i>In re Investigation of Lauricella</i>	141
Notes	144

b. Penalties and Fines	146
<i>Texas Association of Business v. Texas Air Control Board</i>	146
Notes	149
Chapter 2 Problem	152

## CHAPTER 3 *Investigations and Privacy* **155**

A. Investigations	156
1. Voluntary Disclosure	157
In re Qwest Communications Int'l, Securities Litigation	157
Notes	162
2. Compulsory Disclosure	163
a. Inspections, Examinations, and Searches	163
<i>Camara v. Municipal Court of the City and County</i>	
<i>of San Francisco</i>	164
Notes	165
<i>Safford Unified School District #1 v. Redding</i>	166
Notes	169
<i>Platteville Area Apartment Assn., et al. v. City of Platteville</i>	169
Notes	174
<i>New York v. Burger</i>	176
Notes	182
b. Subpoenas	184
<i>FTC v. American Tobacco Co.</i>	187
Notes	188
<i>Texas Lawyers Insurance Exchange v. Resolution Trust Corp.</i>	190
Notes	194
<i>Cuomo v. The Clearing House Association</i>	195
Notes	199
Notes: Administrative Procedure Act	200
<i>Shapiro v. United States</i>	201
Notes	203
<i>United States v. Hubbell</i>	203
Notes	208
B. Privacy and Access to Information	209
1. Privacy and the Freedom of Information Act	210
§552. Public Information; Agency Rules, Opinions, Orders,	
Records, and Proceedings	210
Notes	218
Comments	219
<i>National Archives and Records Administration v. Favish</i>	220
Notes	225
Development of EFOIA	226
2. The Privacy Act	229
5 U.S.C. §552a. Records Maintained on Individuals	230
<i>Doe v. Chao</i>	232
Notes	236

3. Privacy and the U.S. Constitution	237
<i>Whalen v. Roe</i>	237
<i>Doe v. Delie</i>	239
Notes	242
C. Sunshine Laws	244
Government in the Sunshine Act	244
Notes	247
Chapter 3 Problem	248

## CHAPTER 4 *Rules and Rulemaking* 251

A. Terminology and Rulemaking	251
Schwartz, Administrative Terminology and the Administrative Procedure Act	251
Warren, Administrative Law in the Political System	255
<i>Paralyzed Veterans of America v. Secretary of Veteran Affairs</i>	256
<i>Cordero v. Corbisiero</i>	259
Notes	260
B. Rules	262
1. Substantive/Legislative Rules	262
<i>In re Permanent Surface Mining Regulation Litigation</i>	262
Notes	266
2. Other Types of Rules/Nonlegislative Rules	268
Anthony, Interpretive Rules, Policy Statements, Guidances, Manuals, and the Like—Should Federal Agencies Use Them to Bind the Public?	268
Comments	271
C. Legal Effect	275
1. Substantive/Legislative Rules	275
<i>Reuters Ltd. v. FCC</i>	275
Notes	279
<i>Bowen v. Georgetown University Hospital</i>	279
Notes	285
2. Other Types of Rules/Nonlegislative Rules	285
<i>Devon Energy Corp. v. Secretary of the Interior</i>	285
Notes	291
D. Cost-Benefit Analysis	294
Executive Order 12291	294
Notes	296
<i>American Textile Manufacturers Inst. v. Donovan</i>	296
Notes	302
E. Publication	304
<i>Federal Crop Insurance Corp. v. Merrill</i>	304
Notes	306
F. Excursus on Estoppel	307
<i>Office of Personnel Management v. Richmond</i>	308
Notes	315

G. Rulemaking Procedure	317
Federal Administrative Procedure Act	317
Notes	318
<i>Jifry v. FAA</i>	323
Notes	328
<i>Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. Natural Resources</i>	
<i>Defense Council</i>	329
Notes	335
<i>United States v. Florida East Coast Railway</i>	336
Notes	344
<i>Association of National Advertisers v. FTC</i>	346
Notes	350
Additional Procedures: Reg-Flex	352
<i>U.S. Telecom Assn. v. FCC</i>	352
Notes	354
H. Rules Versus Orders	355
<i>NLRB v. Wyman-Gordon Co.</i>	355
Notes	363
I. Negotiated Rulemaking	366
<i>USA Group Loan Services v. Riley</i>	366
Coglianese, Assessing Consensus: The Promise and	
Performance of Negotiated Rulemaking	371
Harter, Fear of Commitment: An Affliction of Adolescents	372
J. Rulemaking and the Internet	374
Section 206 of the E Government Act of 2002	374
Noveck, The Electronic Revolution in Rulemaking	375
Chapter 4 Problem	382

## **CHAPTER 5 *Right to Be Heard* 385**

A. Legislative Versus Judicial Functions	385
<i>Bi-Metallic Investment Co. v. Colorado</i>	385
Notes	387
<i>Hollinrake v. Law Enforcement Academy</i>	390
Notes	391
<i>In re Appeal of Stratton Corp.</i>	394
Notes	398
B. Privileges	399
<i>Smith v. Liquor Control Commission</i>	399
Notes	401
C. Entitlements	406
1. The Due Process Revolution	406
<i>Goldberg v. Kelly</i>	406
Brennan, Reason, Passion and “The Progress of the Law”	411
Notes	413
<i>Brookpark Entertainment, Inc. v. Taft</i>	417
Notes	420

	Friendly, Some Kind of Hearing	421
	Notes	422
	<i>Goss v. Lopez</i>	423
	Notes	429
	<i>Mathews v. Eldridge</i>	429
	Notes	438
	Schwartz, A Decade of Administrative Law: 1987-1996	440
	<i>Hamdi v. Rumsfeld</i>	442
	Notes	453
2.	The Narrowing Scope of Property and Liberty Interests	455
a.	Property Interests	455
	<i>Cushman v. Shinseki</i>	455
	<i>Town of Castle Rock v. Gonzales</i>	458
	Notes	461
b.	Liberty Interests	463
	<i>Hedrich v. Board of Regents</i>	463
	<i>Marion v. Columbia Correctional Institution</i>	466
	Notes	469
3.	Waiver	470
	<i>National Independent Coal Operator's Assn. v. Kleppe</i>	470
	Notes	472
4.	Postponed Hearings	474
	<i>Haskell v. Department of Agriculture</i>	474
	Notes	475
5.	Emergency Cases	477
	<i>FDIC v. Mallen</i>	477
	Notes	481
D.	Flexible Due Process	483
	<i>Gray Panthers v. Schweiker</i>	483
	Notes	489
	Chapter 5 Problem	493
 <b>CHAPTER 6 Evidentiary Hearings and Decisions</b>		<b>495</b>
	Warren, Administrative Law in the Political System	495
A.	Parties in Interest and Intervention	496
	<i>Office of Communication v. FCC</i>	496
	Notes	503
	<i>Sarasota County Public Hospital v. Department of Health</i>	505
	Notes	507
B.	Notice and Pleadings	508
	Comments	508
	<i>Yellow Freight System v. Martin</i>	510
	Notes	513
C.	Nature of Hearing	516
	<i>Johnson Newspaper Corp. v. Melino</i>	516
	Notes	520



D. Counsel	522
Comments	522
E. From Examiners to Administrative Law Judges	524
<i>Guerrero v. New Jersey</i>	524
Notes	526
Federal Administrative Procedure Act	527
Notes	527
Notice of Change of Title	528
Notes	529
Administrative Conference of the United States, Federal	
Administrative Law Judge Hearings	530
Administrative Conference of the United States, The	
Federal Administrative Judiciary (Draft)	531
Notes	532
F. Bias	534
<i>Gibson v. Berryhill</i>	534
Notes	536
<i>Bird v. Bland County School Board</i>	537
<i>1616 Second Ave. v. State Liquor Authority</i>	541
Notes	545
<i>Rosa v. Bowen</i>	547
Notes	550
G. Combination of Functions	552
<i>Withrow v. Larkin</i>	552
Notes	557
<i>Beer Garden v. State Liquor Authority</i>	558
Notes	561
Statement of Administrative Policy on Separations	
of Functions	564
H. Evidence	569
Comments	569
<i>Wagstaff v. Department of Employment Security</i>	571
Notes	573
<i>Richardson v. Perales</i>	574
Notes	582
I. Burden of Proof	584
<i>Director, Office of Workers' Compensation Programs v.</i>	
<i>Greenwich Collieries</i>	584
Notes	591
J. Illegal Evidence	593
<i>Powell v. Secretary of State</i>	593
Notes	595
K. Exclusiveness of Record	597
Comments	597
<i>Gearan v. Department of Health and Human Services</i>	598
Notes	600
<i>Banegas v. Heckler</i>	601
Notes	602