



# EVIDENCE

IN

## TRIALS AT COMMON LAW

by  
JOHN HENRY WIGMORE

*In Ten Volumes*

VOLUME 2

Revised by  
JAMES H. CHADBURN  
*Fessenden Professor of Law Emeritus, Harvard University*



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

COPYRIGHT © 1979 JAMES H. CHADBOURN

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. NO PART OF THIS BOOK MAY BE REPRODUCED IN ANY FORM OR BY ANY ELECTRONIC OR MECHANICAL MEANS INCLUDING INFORMATION STORAGE AND RETRIEVAL SYSTEMS WITHOUT PERMISSION IN WRITING FROM THE PUBLISHER, EXCEPT BY A REVIEWER WHO MAY QUOTE BRIEF PASSAGES IN A REVIEW.

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOG CARD NO. 61-10756

ISBN 0-7355-6569-4

ISBN 13 978-0-7355-6569-2

Published by Aspen Publishers  
76 Ninth Avenue, New York, NY 10011  
*Formerly published by Little, Brown and Company*

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

## Preface

In the revision of Volume 3 of *Wigmore on Evidence*, the first of the several Volumes which I have revised, I stated the guidelines which I proposed to follow.\* The revision of the present Volume conforms to these guidelines, except for omission to indicate several variances between the original and the revision. These omissions have occurred when, in my judgment, editorial signaling of the divergence would be of no interest to the reader.

I express my thanks to Marian Tse for her expert Shepardizing of the case citations and to Pewilla Dick and Miriam Marra for their skillful copyediting of the manuscript.

*Harvard Law School*  
*June 1, 1979*

JAMES H. CHADBURN

\* 3 *Wigmore, Evidence* v (Chadbourn rev. 1970).

## Summary of Contents

### VOLUME 2

10. Evidence To Prove Physical or Mental Capacity, Design, or Intent (§§219-242)	1
11. Evidence To Prove Knowledge, Belief, or Consciousness (§§244-263)	47
12. Conduct as Evidence (§§266-293)	95
13. Other Offenses or Similar Acts, as Evidence of Knowledge, Design, or Intent (§§300-373)	235
14. Evidence To Prove Habit, Status, Course of Business, or Custom (§§375-383)	383
15. Evidence To Prove Emotion (Motive, Feeling, Passion) (§§385-406)	415
16. Evidence To Prove Identity (§§410-418)	477
17. Evidence To Prove Facts of External Inanimate Nature (§§430-465)	505
18. Testimonial Evidence (§§475-480)	633
19. Testimonial Qualifications (§§483-488)	641
20. Mental Derangement (§§492-501)	697

## SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

21. Mental Immaturity (Infancy) (§§505-509)	711
22. Moral Depravity (§§515-531)	721
23. Experiential Capacity (§§555-571)	749
24. Interest as a Testimonial Qualification (§§575-587)	799
25. Marital Relationship as a Testimonial Disqualification (§§600-620)	855
26. General Principles of Knowledge (§§650-686)	879

## Table of Contents

### VOLUME 2

*Preface*

v

*Summary of Contents*

vii

#### BOOK I. ADMISSIBILITY (*continued*)

##### *Part I. Relevancy (continued)*

##### Title I. Circumstantial Evidence (*continued*)

##### SUBTITLE II. EVIDENCE TO PROVE A HUMAN QUALITY OR CONDITION (*continued*)

### Chapter 10

#### TOPICS II, III, IV, V: EVIDENCE TO PROVE PHYSICAL OR MENTAL CAPACITY, DESIGN, OR INTENT

##### II. EVIDENCE TO PROVE PHYSICAL CONDITION OR CAPACITY (STRENGTH, SKILL, HEALTH, ETC.)

§219. General principle	2
§220. Power or strength, from instances of conduct exhibiting it	2
§221. Skill or means, from instances of its exercise	3
§222. Age, from appearance; voice, from utterances; sight, from things seen	5
§223. Health or disease, from appearance, occupation, or heredity	6

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§224.	Pecuniary capacity, from borrowing or nonpayment	7
§225.	Prior or subsequent condition	8

### III. EVIDENCE TO PROVE MENTAL CAPACITY

§227.	Modes of evidencing mental capacity circumstantially	9
§228.	(1) Insanity in general, as evidenced by conduct	9
§229.	— Testamentary capacity	16
§230.	— Undue influence	20
§231.	(2) Insanity, as evidenced by predisposing circumstances	21
§232.	— Hereditary insanity	23
§233.	(3) Prior and subsequent insanity	26
§234.	Other principles affecting proof of insanity discriminated	32
§235.	Intoxication	32

### IV. EVIDENCE TO PROVE DESIGN OR PLAN

§237.	General principle	36
§238.	Sundry instances (tools, materials, liquor licenses, preparations, journeys, experiments, inquiries, prophecies, and the like)	37
§239.	Explanations of incriminating facts	42
§240.	Similar offenses or other acts to show plan or system	42
§241.	Prior or subsequent design	42

### V. EVIDENCE TO PROVE INTENT

§242.	General principle	42
-------	-------------------	----

## Chapter 11

### TOPIC VI. EVIDENCE TO PROVE KNOWLEDGE, BELIEF, OR CONSCIOUSNESS

#### SUBTOPIC I. EXTERNAL CIRCUMSTANCES AS EVIDENCING KNOWLEDGE, BELIEF, OR CIRCUMSTANCES

§244.	General analysis of the subject	47
§245.	General principle	48
§246.	(1) Defendant in homicide: (a) Reputation of the deceased	50
§247.	— (b) Threats by the deceased	61
§248.	— (c) Violent acts of the deceased	66
§249.	(2) Employer of an incompetent employee: (a) Reputation of the employee	71
§250.	— (b) Acts of an employee	73
§250a.	(3) Parent of minor child using an automobile	75
§251.	(4) Owner of vicious animal	75
§252.	(5) Owner or possessor of a dangerous machine or place	76
§253.	(6) Purchaser from an insolvent or lunatic	82



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§254.	(7) Adverse possessor, receiver of stolen goods, keeper of premises for illegal business, and other dealers with property	84
§255.	(8) Dealer with a partnership	85
§256.	(9) Maker of false representations	86
§257.	(10) Seller or transporter of liquor	86
§258.	(11) Party prosecuting or arresting without probable cause	86
§259.	(12) Utterer of forged or counterfeit paper or money, possessor of stolen goods, etc.	89
§260.	(13) Possessor of a document	89
§261.	(14) Miscellaneous instances of belief or knowledge evidenced by circumstances	90
§262.	(15) Insane belief, as shown by facts told to the party	92
§263.	Disproof of the facts communicated	92

## Chapter 12

### SUBTOPIC II. CONDUCT AS EVIDENCE

§265.	General principle	96
-------	-------------------	----

#### 1. CONDUCT AS EVIDENCE OF KNOWLEDGE OR BELIEF

§266.	Conduct and utterances, as evidence of knowledge or belief, when a fact in issue	97
§266a.	— Insured's knowledge of illness	101
§267.	Conduct as evidence of belief, and thus of the fact believed; general principle	101
§268.	Marriage, as evidenced by conduct, or "habit"	105
§269.	Legitimacy, as evidenced by parents' conduct	107
§270.	Identity, as evidenced by belief and knowledge of personal doings, family history, and the like; identifying by family name	109
§271.	Testamentary execution, as evidenced by the testator's belief and declarations	112
§272.	Sundry inferences from belief to past acts; contracts, appointments to office, etc.	114

#### 2. CONDUCT AS EVIDENCE OF GUILT

§273.	(1) Conduct in general; demeanor when charged or arrested	115
§274.	(2) Demeanor during trial	119
§275.	(3) Refusal to undergo a superstitious test	120
§276.	(4) Flight, escape, resistance, or concealment	122

#### 3. CONDUCT AS EVIDENCE OF CONSCIOUSNESS OF A WEAK CAUSE

§277.	(1) General theory	132
§278.	(2) Falsehood, fraud, fabrication and suppression of evidence, bribery, spoliation, and the like	133

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§279. — Other rules discriminated; confessions, impeachment of witnesses, failure to prove alibi, etc.	141
§280. — Fraud in separate litigation; fraud by agents	142
§281. — Explaining away the suspicious conduct	145
§282. (3) Taking precautions to prevent injury or liability; conveying property	146
§282a. — Carrying insurance against damage or liability	148
§283. (4) Taking measures to remedy injury; repairs of a machine, highway, or the like after an injury	174
§283a. — Offers to assist, or to pay, or to settle	187
§284. (5) Failure to prosecute; failure to make complaint; failure to explain innocence	191

### 4. FAILURE TO PRODUCE EVIDENCE

§285. Failure to produce evidence, as indicating unfavorable tenor of evidence:	
(1) In general	192
§286. — (2) Witnesses not produced: (a) Witnesses unavailable or privileged	199
§287. — (b) Witnesses prejudiced or inferior in value	202
§288. — (c) Witnesses equally available to both parties	204
§289. — (d) Party himself failing to testify	209
§290. — (e) Sundry distinctions: Criminal cases; good character; experts; experiments; depositions; explanations; nature of inference; burden of proof; presumptions	214
§291. (3) Documents or chattels destroyed or not produced	221

### 5. SUNDRIES

§292. Silence, as equivalent to an admission	229
§293. Conduct, as evidence of consciousness of innocence (accused's voluntary surrender, refusal to escape, demeanor, etc.)	230

## Chapter 13

### TOPIC VII. OTHER OFFENSES OR SIMILAR ACTS, AS EVIDENCE OF KNOWLEDGE, DESIGN, OR INTENT

#### I. GENERAL PRINCIPLES

§300. Discrimination between various principles	237
§301. Theory of evidencing knowledge	238
§302. Theory of evidencing intent	241
§303. — Anonymous intent	247
§304. Theory of evidencing design or system	249
§305. Criminality of act immaterial; character rule distinguished; discretion to exclude	252
§306. Other evidential purposes discriminated; Statutes and Rules of Court	255
§307. Order of evidence; chief or rebuttal; degree of proof	262

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### 2. FORGERY AND COUNTERFEITING

§309.	General principle; state of the law in the various jurisdictions	264
§310.	Evidence of knowledge; (1) Other utterings	271
§311.	— (2) Other possession	272
§312.	Evidence of intent: (1) Other utterings	272
§313.	— (2) Other possession	272
§314.	The foregoing principles compared	273
§315.	Evidence of design or system	273
§316.	Time of other acts	273
§317.	Sundry limitations	274

### 3. FALSE PRETENSES OR REPRESENTATIONS

§321.	General principle; state of the law in the various jurisdictions	275
-------	--	-----

### 4. KNOWING POSSESSION OR RECEIPT OF STOLEN GOODS

§324.	Other possession of stolen goods; (1) Knowledge principle	285
§325.	— (2) Intent principle	287
§326.	— State of the law in the various jurisdictions	288
§327.	Other modes of evidencing	294

### 5. EMBEZZLEMENT

§329.	General principle	294
§330.	Other principles discriminated	295
§331.	State of the law in the various jurisdictions	295

### 6. FRAUDULENT TRANSFERS

§333.	Transfers in fraud of creditors	299
§334.	State of the law in the various jurisdictions	300
§335.	— Other kinds of evidence	301
§336.	— Other principles discriminated	301
§337.	Fraudulent purchase with intent not to pay	302
§338.	Other fraudulent transfers	302

### 7. SUNDRY FRAUDS; AND FRAUD IN GENERAL

§340.	False claim of a cause of action; fraudulent insurance	302
§341.	Sundry frauds (taxes, mails, measures, etc.)	303
§342.	Perjury	308
§343.	Bribery	309
§344.	Fraud in general; latitude of investigation	312

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### 8. LARCENY AND KIDNAPPING

§346.	Larceny; general principle	312
§347.	— State of the law in the various jurisdictions	313
§348.	— Sundry limitations	318
§349.	Kidnapping and enticement	319

### 9. ROBBERY, BURGLARY, AND EXTORTION

§351.	Robbery and burglary; general principle	320
§352.	Extortion and blackmail (robbery by threatening demands)	329

### 10. ARSON

§354.	General principle; state of the law in the various jurisdictions	331
-------	--	-----

### 11. RAPE, ABORTION, AND OTHER SEXUAL OFFENSES

§357.	Rape; general principle	334
§358.	— Other principles discriminated	342
§359.	Abortion	342
§360.	Indecent exposure, sodomy, bigamy, incest, seduction, adultery, etc.	345

### 12. HOMICIDE AND HOMICIDAL ASSAULT

§363.	Homicide, including murder by poison	350
§364.	Assault with intent; other crimes of personal violence	361
§365.	Other principles discriminated	364

### 13. MISCELLANEOUS OFFENSES

§367.	Riot, trespass, gaming, electoral offenses, etc.	365
§368.	Dealing in liquors or drugs	368
§369.	Treason, sedition	375
§370.	Conspiracy	378

### 14. CIVIL CASES

§371.	In general	378
§372.	Copyright infringement	379
§373.	Contracts (sale, agency, lease, etc.)	381

## Chapter 14

### TOPIC VIII. EVIDENCE TO PROVE HABIT, STATUS, COURSE OF BUSINESS, OR CUSTOM

§375.	General principle	383
§376.	Individual habit; miscellaneous examples	385

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§377. — In contracts (sale, lease, loan, agency, hiring, etc.)	392
§378. — In prescriptive possession; surveys and boundaries evidenced by other lines	399
§379. Custom or usage, in trade and commerce	401
§380. — Customary rights in land	404
§381. — Other principles discriminated	405
§382. Prior or subsequent status (business, possession, ownership, solvency, coverture, speed of vehicle, etc.)	406
§383. Style of handwriting or spelling, as evidenced by specimens	411

## Chapter 15

### TOPIC IX. EVIDENCE TO PROVE EMOTION (MOTIVE, FEELING, PASSION)

§385. Theory of motive	415
§386. Discriminations between motive and intent or design or character	416
§387. Kinds of inference	416

#### A. CIRCUMSTANCES TENDING TO EXCITE AN EMOTION

§389. General principle; knowledge of the circumstances	416
§390. Motives for murder	419
§391. Motive for other deeds	428
§392. Pecuniary circumstances as creating a motive (poverty, to show a crime or negative a loan; market value, to show a sale price)	430
§393. Legal duty or liability as creating a motive	436

#### B. CONDUCT EXHIBITING AN EMOTION

§394. General principle	437
-------------------------	-----

#### C. PRIOR AND SUBSEQUENT EMOTION

§395. General principle	438
§396. Hostility in general; feeling at other times	439
§397. — Hostility to wife or paramour	443
§398. Sexual passion at other times	445
§399. — General principles	458
§400. — Discriminations in regard to adultery and incest	461
§401. — Discriminations in regard to seduction, bastardy, breach of promise, and alienation of affections	461
§402. — Discriminations in regard to rape	462
§403. Defamation: Other utterances as evidencing malice	463
§404. — Principle of relevancy	464
§405. — Principle of auxiliary policy	466
§406. — State of the law in the various jurisdictions	469

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Chapter 16

#### TOPIC X. EVIDENCE TO PROVE IDENTITY

§410. Other principles discriminated	477
§411. General principle of identity evidence	478
§412. Test of admissibility	479
§413. Circumstances identifying a person	480
§414. — Fingerprints	482
§414a. — Other principles discriminated	487
§415. — Foot marks, boot marks	488
§416. — Criminality of act immaterial	489
§417. Circumstances identifying a chattel, document, or other external object	494
§417a. — Bullet marks; firearms identification	495
§417b. — Automobile tire marks; modern police science in general	499
§418. Utterances used to identify time or place	501

### Chapter 17

#### SUBTITLE III. EVIDENCE TO PROVE FACTS OF EXTERNAL INANIMATE NATURE

##### INTRODUCTORY

§430. Distinction between this and the preceding subjects	506
§431. General principles of relevancy	508
§432. Division of topics	508
§433. — Combination of different inferences	508

#### TOPIC I. IDENTITY

§434. Identity of one object with another	509
---	-----

#### TOPIC II. OCCURRENCE OF AN EVENT

§435. Scope of the subject	509
§436. Occurrence of an event, as evidenced from cause or effect	510

#### TOPIC III. EXISTENCE OR PERSISTENCE IN TIME

§437. (1) Existence, from prior or subsequent existence; general principle, applied in sundry instances (highways, machines, buildings, railway tracks, etc.)	513
§438. (2) Existence, from concurrent existence; the whole evidenced by the parts, etc. (highways, railway tracks, premises, etc.)	519
§439. — Samples as evidence of an entire lot	522
§440. — Sample copies of printed matter	523

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### TOPIC IV. TENDENCY, CAPACITY, QUALITY, CAUSE, OR EFFECT

#### 1. GENERAL PRINCIPLES

§441. Scope of the subject	523
§442. Principle of probative value (relevancy)	524
§443. Principle of auxiliary policy	528
§444. Discretion of the trial court	531
§445. Distinction between experiment and observation	532
§446. Distinction between possibility, capacity, tendency, and cause, as the object of evidence; evidencing a possibility	537
§447. Number of instances required	538
§448. Negative and affirmative instances; evidencing an impossibility	539
§449. Explaining away the proponent's instances	542

#### 2. PRECEDENTS ARRANGED BY SUBJECTS

§450. Principle of classification	543
-----------------------------------	-----

##### A. INSTANCES OF MATERIAL EFFECTS, AS EVIDENCE

§451. Miscellaneous instances (factories, railroads, floods, gases, land, machinery, tools, apparatus, weapons, etc.)	543
§452. Sparks and fires, as evidencing the cause of a fire; general principle	554
§453. — Discriminations	555
§454. — (1) Cause of the fire, as evidenced by other spark emissions (a) by the same locomotive	555
§455. — (1) Cause of the fire, as evidenced by other spark emissions (b) by other locomotives	557
§456. — (2) Defective construction, as an element of negligence, evidenced by other spark emissions	562

##### B. INSTANCES OF CORPORAL EFFECTS, AS EVIDENCE

§457. Corporal effects and symptoms; miscellaneous instances (proximity, caliber, or direction of a weapon inflicting a wound; operation of a drug, liquor, poison, food, or disease, on human beings or on animals)	567
§458. Similar injuries to other persons at the same machine, highway, railroad, or building	572

##### C. INSTANCES OF MENTAL AND MORAL EFFECTS, AS EVIDENCE

§459. General principle	585
§460. Measures of time, space, light, sound, difficulty, or capacity, as evidenced by human sensations and conduct (noises heard, objects seen, distances walked, trains stopped, work performed, etc.)	586

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§461. Measure of negligence, danger, insufficiency, unreasonableness, cruelty, unskillfulness, or their opposites, as evidenced by similar conduct or practices of other persons or animals (horses' fright, passengers' behavior, safeguards for railroads, highways, and machines, commercial customs, malpractice, etc.)	592
§462. Business patronage, as evidencing the quality of a place or article	608
§463. — Value or sales of similar land, chattels, or services	609
§464. — Other principles discriminated	630
§465. Measure of literary or intellectual propriety (other persons' utterances in libel or sedition)	631

## Chapter 18

### TITLE II. TESTIMONIAL EVIDENCE

#### INTRODUCTORY: GENERAL THEORY OF TESTIMONIAL EVIDENCE

§475. In theory a question of relevancy is involved	633
§476. Method of argument; inductive or deductive	634
§477. Three general groups of rules; testimonial qualifications, impeachment, and rehabilitation	634
§478. Analysis of elements of a testimonial assertion: observation, recollection, narration	636
§479. Any assertion, whether made in court or not, may be testimonial evidence	640
§480. Order of topics	640

## Chapter 19

### SUBTITLE I. TESTIMONIAL QUALIFICATIONS

#### INTRODUCTORY: GENERAL RULES AFFECTING TESTIMONIAL QUALIFICATIONS

§483. Time of qualifications	641
§484. Burden of proof of qualifications	641
§485. Mode of proof of qualifications	642
§486. Time of objecting to qualifications	643
§487. Judge, not jury, to determine qualifications	644
§488. Statutes affecting qualifications	647

## Chapter 20

### TOPIC I. ORGANIC CAPACITY

#### SUBTOPIC A. MENTAL DERANGEMENT

§492. General principle of capacity	697
§493. Capacity of observation	700
§494. Capacity of recollection	701



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

§495.	Capacity of communication	702
§496.	Standard of intelligence is in trial court's discretion	702
§497.	Capacity presumed; methods of ascertainment; judge and jury	703
§498.	Feeble-minded; mental defectives; deaf-mutes	706
§499.	Intoxication	707
§500.	Disease, blindness, etc.	708
§501.	Policy of abolishing disqualification through mental derangement	709

## Chapter 21

### SUBTOPIC B. MENTAL IMMATURITY (INFANCY)

§505.	General principle	711
§506.	Capacity of observation, recollection, and communication	712
§507.	Standard of intelligence; discretion of trial court	714
§508.	Whether capacity presumed; method of ascertainment	718
§509.	Policy of abolishing disqualification by infancy	719

## Chapter 22

### SUBTOPIC C. MORAL DEPRAVITY

§515.	General principle	721
§516.	(1) Alienage, race, or color	722
§517.	(2) Sex	725
§518.	(3) Religion	725
§519.	(4) Infamy, by conviction of crime; history and general policy	725
§520.	— Kind of crime that disqualifies	729
§521.	— Judgment, not guilt, disqualifies	731
§522.	— Conviction in another jurisdiction	732
§523.	— Disqualification removed by (1) Reversal of judgment; (2) Pardon; (3) Serving of sentence	733
§524.	— Statutory changes	734
§525.	(5) <i>Allegans turpitudinem suam</i> ; general principle	735
§526.	— Accomplice, as disqualified by his guilt	736
§527.	— Witness retracting former perjured testimony	737
§528.	— Attesting witness contradicting his attestation	739
§529.	— Invalidating one's own instrument; rule in <i>Walton v. Shelly</i>	739
§530.	— Official contradicting his own certificate	745
§531.	— <i>Allegans turpitudinem suam</i> , as a general maxim	746

## Chapter 23

### TOPIC II. EXPERIENTIAL CAPACITY

#### 1. GENERAL PRINCIPLES

§555.	General theory of experiential capacity; expertness is relative to the particular topic	749
§556.	Different kinds of experiential capacity	750